



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property and Authority to Amend Existing Heritage Easement Agreement – 178 St. George Street

Date:	August 10, 2015
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto-East York Community Council
From:	Director, Urban Design, City Planning
Wards:	20 - Trinity-Spadina
Reference Number:	P:\2015\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE15089

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the proposed alterations to the designated heritage property at 178 St. George Street and give authority for the City Solicitor to amend the existing Heritage Easement Agreement with the owner. The property at 178 St. George Street is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

City Council's approval of the proposed alterations to the heritage property and authority to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement is required under the Ontario Heritage Act.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 178 St. George Street, in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, substantially in accordance with plans and drawings dated July 27, 2015, prepared by ERA Architects Inc., date-stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services July 27, 2015, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated June 30, 2015 and date-stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services July 2, 2015, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the following additional conditions:

- a. That prior to the issuance of any heritage permit for the alterations as set out in the report from the Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division, dated August 10, 2015, at 178 St. George Street, including a heritage permit or building permit, but excluding permits for repairs and maintenance and usual and minor works for the existing heritage building as are acceptable to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the owner shall:
 - i. Amend the existing Heritage Easement Agreement (HEA) for the property at 178 St. George Street in accordance with plans and drawings dated July 27, 2015, prepared by ERA Architects Inc., date-stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services July 27, 2015, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and with the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated June 30, 2015 and date-stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services July 2, 2015, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - ii. Provide full building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and a qualified heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
2. City Council require the owner be required to provide replacement HEA photographs for the amended HEA to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services within ninety (90) days of the completion of the alterations as set out in the report dated August 10, 2015 from the Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division.
3. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to amend the existing Heritage Easement Agreement, registered on the title for the heritage property at 178 St. George Street, Instrument No. CT632346 dated November 23, 1983 and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
4. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce any necessary bill in Council to amend the Heritage Easement Agreement.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The property located at 178 St. George Street was listed on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register on July 2, 1974. On January 10, 1983, Toronto City Council designated the property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The property is also subject to a

Heritage Easement Agreement (HEA) with the City dated November 23, 1983 (Instrument No. CT632346).

BACKGROUND

Development Proposal

The application proposes to alter the three-storey brick and stone structure by constructing a rear addition which includes a LULA (limited use, limited application) elevator, a re-located egress stair, the expansion of a unit on the second floor, and a new rear balcony on the third floor. The new addition will replace an addition that was previously added to the west façade of the existing building.

Policy Framework

Provincial Policy Statement and Planning Act

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. The key objectives include building strong communities, wise use and management of resources, and protecting public health and safety. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province and include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 reads "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved".

Official Plan

Amendment No. 199 to the Official Plan provides the City's policy framework for heritage conservation in the City. OPA 199, Policy 4 states that, "Properties on the Heritage Register will be *conserved* and maintained consistent with the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*, as revised from time to time and as adopted by Council". OPA 199, Policy 5 states that, "Proposed *alterations*, development, and/or public works on or *adjacent* to, a property on the Heritage Register will ensure that the *integrity* of the heritage property's cultural heritage value and attributes will be retained, prior to work commencing on the property and to the satisfaction of the City".

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

In 2008 Toronto City Council adopted the *Parks Canada Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* as the official document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City of Toronto. The General Standards (1-9) and Standards for Rehabilitation (10-13) apply to this project.

Heritage Resource

The property at 178 St. George Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value. The heritage attributes identified in Schedule B of Heritage Easement Agreement no. CT632346 are:

- East (front) and south (side) elevation, showing special fenestration with exceptional details in carved stone, stone patterns, brickwork, conical roof which together form a tower at Prince Arthur Avenue and George Street
- Main (south) entrance porch, showing polished granite columns, carved capitals and relieving arch in stone-work. Also, stone carving in window mullion
- North (side) elevation, showing unusual detailing of chimney, stone, brick, and terracotta tile, and a variety of styles in the fenestration of the gable and two floors below
- Rear (west) elevation, showing gable with terra-cotta tile and semi-circular window feature, and stone masonry wall

COMMENTS

Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) has reviewed the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by ERA Architects Inc. for the alterations to 178 St. George Street. The HIA finds that the proposed alterations have a minimal impact on the described heritage attributes of the property, with appropriate material selection and the visibility of the addition as proposed.

HPS has considered the application in the context of the Planning Act, the heritage policies of the Provincial Policy Statement 2014 (PPS), the heritage policies of the City of Toronto Official Plan, the heritage policies of the Council-adopted amendments to the City of Toronto Official Plan (OPA 199), and the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada.

The new addition will replace an existing addition that includes modified window and door openings, a new hipped roof at the stair enclosure, a new exit landing and stairs on the south elevation, and a roof extension at the second storey. There are no impacts on the main (east) elevation as the new addition will not be visible along St. George Street. The new addition will be set back 2.3m from the north elevation of the existing house, which will allow for the preservation of the existing northwest corner chimney identified in the HEA and will reduce visibility of the addition from Prince Arthur Avenue. As a result of

the setback, one window on the west elevation, which is not identified in the HEA, will be removed and filled in to accommodate the north wall of the new addition.

An existing dormer on the west elevation, which is not identified in the HEA, will be removed to accommodate the new addition. The semi-circular wood window frame on the west elevation will remain but will be extended to create a new door opening with a wood door onto the new third-floor balcony. The roofline of the new addition will screen the third-floor balcony space and new door opening from street view.

The main entrance porch on the south elevation is identified within the existing HEA. The proposal includes a new covered porch that connects to the existing porch but with a lower roof that is pulled back from the edge of the existing roof to reduce visibility. This porch extension will allow access from the existing porch steps at the front of the property through to the newly created addition which includes the LULA elevator.

The applicant is proposing to use horizontal grey zinc panels to complement the brick and stone of the existing building and be legible, and to break up the massing of the addition.

CONCLUSION

Staff agree with the findings of the HIA and have determined that the proposed alterations will not have a negative impact on the heritage character of 178 St. George Street. It is recommended that City Council approve the proposed alterations to 178 St. George Street. As a result, the existing HEA must be amended to include the permitted alterations. Upon completion of the proposed work, the applicant will be required to submit replacement HEA photos to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

CONTACT

Sherry Pedersen, Preservation Co-ordinator
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-338-1089
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Location Map: 178 St. George Street
Attachment 2 – Photographs: 178 St. George Street
Attachment 3 – Site Plan: 178 St. George Street
Attachment 4 – Elevations: 178 St. George Street
Attachment 5 – 3D Model: 178 St. George Street