City Council directed staff to undertake a planning analysis of restaurant and bar uses in Kensington Market and to report back on the feasibility of amending the Zoning By-law with respect to implementing restrictions on restaurant and bar uses in Kensington Market. The study scope has been expanded to include an analysis of the commercial-retail mix in the study area. At this time, amendments to the Zoning By-law to implement restrictions on restaurant and bar uses is not being recommended because current zoning restrictions permit a maximum restaurant size of 200 m² which is significantly less than most other areas of the city. The current average size of restaurants in Kensington Market is approximately 100 square metres.

Given the existing strict restrictions on restaurant size in Kensington Market, staff are investigating two other areas to help preserve the scale and character of Kensington:

1) Considering opportunities and tools to support locally-owned, small business enterprises in Kensington Market; and
2) Co-ordinating final study recommendations with the Kensington Market Heritage Conservation District Study which will provide a more detailed analysis of the character and heritage of the area.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council request the Director of Community Planning, Toronto and East York District, in consultation with Economic, Development and Culture Division to report back on opportunities and tools to support small business enterprises in Kensington Market, including opportunities to work with the Kensington Market Business Improvement Association to develop marketing and promotion strategies to support small businesses in Kensington Market.

2. City Council request the Director of Community Planning, Toronto and East York to report on any further analysis and recommendations to protect the scale, mix of uses and character of Kensington Market in co-ordination with the timing of the results of the Kensington Market Heritage Conservation District Study in the second quarter of 2016.

Financial Impact
The recommendations in this report have no financial impact.

DECISION HISTORY
On July 16, 17, 18 and 19, 2013 City Council adopted a motion directing staff to report to the Toronto and East York Community Council on the feasibility of amending the Zoning By-law with respect to implementing restrictions on restaurant and bar uses in Kensington Market. A preliminary staff report which outlined the proposed study work plan and community consultation process was submitted to the October 2013 Toronto East York Community Council; a link to that report may be found here: http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2013/te/bgrd/backgroundfile-63129.pdf

ISSUE BACKGROUND

Site and Surrounding Area
Since the Council motion requested a focus on bars and restaurants, staff have focused the study on properties that are designated Mixed Use Areas in the Official Plan and are zoned Commercial Residential in the Zoning By-law. This includes Augusta Avenue, Nassau Street, Kensington Avenue and St. Andrew Street.
Official Plan

The Mixed Use Areas designation provides for a broad range of commercial, residential and institutional uses subject to a number of development criteria as identified in chapter 4.5. Namely Policy 2a) requires that in Mixed Use Areas development will create a balance of high quality commercial, residential, institutional and open space uses that reduce automobile dependency and meet the needs of the local community. Development in Mixed Use Areas that are adjacent to or close to Neighbourhoods are also required to be compatible with those Neighbourhoods. These are considered physically stable areas made up of residential uses in lower scale buildings. There are small pockets within the Study Area designated Neighbourhoods which are located along the laneways south of St. Andrew Street on the east and west sides of Kensington Avenue. In Chapter Four, Neighbourhoods, it is noted that a key objective of the Plan is that new development respect and reinforce the general physical pattern in a Neighbourhood.

The Study Area generally follows the boundary of Area Specific Policy 197 in the Official Plan. This policy requires that any public or private development and works should be consistent with the special characteristics of Kensington Market, including:

a. Low scale buildings with retail at grade;
b. Minimal setbacks; and
c. Open air display of goods on the boulevard.

Zoning Exception for Restaurant Uses

The study area falls under restriction 12 (2) 240 under Zoning By-law number 438 – 86 (Attachment 1). This is an exception which is carried over under the new harmonized City-wide By-law 569-2013 which places a maximum of 200 square metres non-residential gross floor area on the following uses: a bakeshop, a caterer's shop, a club, a place of amusement, a place of assembly, a restaurant, or a take-out restaurant. None of these uses may be located above the first story above grade and only one of these uses may be located in any one building. Additionally, these uses must be located on a lot as such lot existed on July 9, 1991.

Under this zoning exception, which is restrictive, an application for a restaurant use for a lot size which changed after July 9, 1991 would not be permitted. In addition, a development application for a restaurant use greater than 200 square metres would need to be processed through a Committee of Adjustment or rezoning application. In certain circumstances washrooms or other accessory use such as storage space and other accessory uses may not be included in the gross floor area calculation.

Zoning By-law 438-86

The majority of the properties in the study area are zoned CR T2.0 C2.0 R1.5 under former City of Toronto Zoning By-law 438-86. The 'CR' zoning classification permits a variety of uses including residential, parks, community services, institutional uses,
commercial and retail (which includes restaurants) and office with a total permitted density of 2.0 times the area of the lot. Of this total density, 2.0 times the area of the lot is permitted to be commercial and 1.5 times residential. The maximum permitted height is 12 m (approximately 4 storeys). The exceptions are the properties zoned Residential (R) which are the same properties designated Neighbourhoods in the Official Plan. This use category permits a variety of low-density house forms.

Zoning By-law 438-86 defines restaurants as a "building or portion of a building used for the preparation and cooking of meals and the sale of food and beverages to the public while they are seated for consumption on the premises" and permits a number of accessory uses. Additionally, rear yard and rooftop patios associated with restaurants are permitted so long as the CR lot on which they are located is at least 10 metres from the nearest R lot. There is no separate definition of 'bar' in the Zoning By-law. Entertainment facilities, which includes nightclubs, are not permitted in the CR zone.

Zoning By-law 569-2013
Under the Harmonized By-law 569-2013 enacted in May 2013, the majority of the study area is zoned commercial residential and follows the same boundaries as Zoning By-law 438-86. The Commercial Residential properties are also located within Development Standard Set 2 (SS2), a designation typically assigned to main streets outside of the immediate downtown.

By-law 569-2013 includes restaurants and bars under the definition of eating establishments with the following definition: "premises where food or beverages are prepared and offered for sale to patrons for immediate consumption on the premises while they are seated, and which may include an incidental take-out service". The By-law exempts areas for associated offices, storage rooms, and staff rooms located in the basement or on a different storey than the eating establishment from the GFA calculation of the eating establishment. Outdoor patios associated with eating establishments are restricted to a maximum size of 30 square metres or 30% of the interior floor area of the premises, whichever is greater, and must be set back at least 30 metres from any Residential lot. Additionally, an outdoor patio located above the first storey must be at least 40 metres from any Residential lot. Zoning By-law 569-2013 also does not include a separate definition for 'bar'. Entertainment facilities, which includes nightclubs, are not permitted in the CR zone.

Heritage Conservation Study
Kensington Market was recognized in 2005 as a National Historic Site. In 2014 the BIA nominated the broader area of Kensington Market – including the residential Neighbourhoods and the Mixed Use Areas – for a Heritage Conservation District study. In February 2015, City Council authorized Kensington Market for study as a potential Heritage Conservation District and the study is anticipated to begin in the last quarter of 2015. The staff report on Heritage Conservation Districts may be found at the link below: http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2015/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-76141.pdf
Municipal Interests in Liquor Licensing

Municipal Licensing and Standards (ML&S) is leading a City-wide initiative to review community nuisance concerns related to liquor licensing of restaurants, bars and entertainment establishments. Earlier this year City Council approved a governance model made up of a Steering Committee, Regulatory Working Group and Hospitality Working Group to assess the current processes, City By-laws, and opportunities to improve the compliance and enforcement of these By-laws to address the public interest and concerns.

The Steering Committee is comprised of staff from Municipal Licensing and Standards (ML&S), the Alcohol Gaming Commission of Ontario (AGCO) and Toronto Police Service (TPS). The objective of the committee is to review current programs and processes related to the role of the City of Toronto in the issuance of liquor licences and permits by the AGCO; to develop recommendations to assist restaurants, bars and entertainment establishments with liquor licences to achieve better compliance with City By-laws; and to identify processes, policy and/or any necessary By-law or statutory amendments.

The Regulatory Working Group is comprised of staff from ML&S, Legal Services, Toronto Building, AGCO and TPS. The objectives of the Regulatory Working Group are to bring together municipal and provincial regulatory authorities to review the City of Toronto's role in the issuance of liquor licenses and permits by the AGCO; and to identify policy and/or legislative gaps to ensure community nuisance issues are appropriately addressed.

The Hospitality Industry Working Group is comprised of staff from a number of City Divisions, AGCO, TPS, Ontario Restaurant Hotel and Motel Association (ORHMA), Toronto Association of Business Improvement Areas (TABIA) and representatives of the night club/entertainment establishment industry. The objective of the Hospitality Industry Working Group is to bring together industry stakeholders and relevant City divisions to identify and discuss issues related to restaurants, bars and entertainment establishments, including but not limited to the process for obtaining liquor licences, other alcohol-related matters and the impacts on the neighbourhoods where they locate.

City Council also established a Liquor Licence Task Force composed of six Councillors, (including the Chair of the Licensing and Standards Committee as Chair) to advise staff on processes, policies and by-laws with respect to liquor licensing. The Task Force is scheduled to meet on October 30, 2015.

While restaurants, bars, and night clubs that sell alcohol contribute to the cultural and economic vibrancy of the City, there are some whose operations have a negative impact on surrounding communities due to issues related to noise, litter and public safety. There are also concerns that venues licensed as restaurants are operating as late night drinking establishments or night clubs and not following the prescribed regulations.
The AGCO is responsible for the regulation of alcohol sales in the Province of Ontario, including licensing. The AGCO applies a risk-based assessment in their application review process to identify applicants, businesses or business locations that may pose a potential risk to public safety or public interest.

Municipal Licensing and Standards (ML&S) uses the regulatory tools enshrined in the Toronto Municipal Code to address the impact of various types of businesses including those with liquor licences.

The City requires that establishments such as restaurants, bars and night clubs obtain a business licence, pursuant to Toronto Municipal Code, Chapter 545, Licensing. ML&S utilizes the Provincial Offences system to bring appropriate charges before the courts, and further has the ability to bring non-compliant establishments before the Toronto Licensing Tribunal.

**Boulevard Café’s and Marketing**

ML&S is currently undertaking a comprehensive review of the existing By-laws, processes and policies related to boulevard cafés and marketing displays and is expecting to report on its findings to the Licensing and Standards Committee later this year. The Public Realm Section of Transportation Services is also in the process of developing outdoor café guidelines.

**Collaborating for Competitiveness: A Strategic Plan to Accelerate Economic Growth and Job Creation in Toronto**

In accordance with Council's adoption of "Collaborating for Competitiveness: A Strategic Plan to Accelerate Economic Growth and Job Creation in Toronto", City Council on February 20 and 21, 2013 directed the General Manager of Economic Development and Culture to "Request the Ontario Minister of Finance to consult with the City of Toronto and MPAC to assess the impacts of valuing commercial and industrial properties in areas of rapid development at highest and best use, rather than on current use, and to identify legislative or regulatory options that support and are consistent with the City's competitiveness and business retention objectives." If implemented this would further assist small business.

A link to that report and Council decision may be found here: [http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.ED19.4](http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.ED19.4)
COMMENTS

Preliminary Study Findings

Study Understanding and Scope

Through observation and the consultation process, staff have come to the view that a unifying area of concern is more about protecting the unique character of Kensington Market than restaurant and bar use per se. This character includes an eclectic mix of small and predominantly independent, local businesses which dates back to the first waves of immigrants into the area and the transformation of the ground floor of residential buildings to accommodate commercial uses to create the market. Notably, Site and Area Specific Policy 197 (and past Planning reports) in the Official Plan supports and reflects the historic small scale commercial-retail uses of the Market.

Related to this retail character is an underlying concern among residents and some business operators that commercial lease and rent rates, real estate prices, and property tax rates have increased at a rate that outstrips the capacity of a typical small business to keep up with the cost of locating in Kensington Market. This concern is not unique to Kensington Market and has been expressed in other gentrifying main street areas of the City. In addition, a general concern is the perception that within the small business category, food related businesses such as green grocers/produce/raw food vendors are all in decline; however, an organic produce vendor and a butcher both recently expanded in size and a new fish store opened.

While planning policy and regulatory change can only go so far to influence and shape market forces, staff have broadened the study analysis to include, at a high level, an understanding of the broader retail-commercial mix and scale in Kensington Market. The following sections highlight the key findings.

Retail Mix

Kensington Market is a unique commercial cluster in the City of Toronto. An analysis of the changing retail mix between 2002 and 2012 in Kensington Market revealed the following:

- In 2012 there were 280 businesses compared to 267 businesses in 2002.
- The number of retail merchandise stores has remained consistent at a total of 92 businesses in both years.
- The overall vacancy rate declined from 33 to 23 businesses, meaning that there are 12% more businesses in 2012 than in 2002
- The number of businesses offering "services" (as opposed to retail product) increased from 35 to 42.
- Food related businesses (excluding restaurants but including supermarkets, grocers, specialty food stores) declined from 61 to 42 businesses.
- Food services (restaurants and "drinking places" as reported by JC Williams, 2014) increased from 35 to 63 businesses. Of these, 9 were classified as "drinking places" specifically in 2002 and 7 were identified in 2012. However, it is important to note that under provincial liquor licensing regulations, any restaurant or business may apply for a liquor license.

Source: JC Williams, 2014 and Centre for the Study of Commercial Activity at Ryerson University.

A comparison of the retail mix (which was commissioned by the City) of Kensington Market to a typical main street which caters to a local neighbourhood was completed by JC Williams consultants in 2014. The comparison indicates that the retail commercial mix in the Market meets the daily needs of the surrounding neighbourhood:

- A balanced pedestrian shopping area in terms of the retail mix and diversity of businesses is generally considered to be 30% retail merchandise, 15% to 20% convenience, 20% food services and 20% other services.
- In Kensington market, retail merchandise comprises 33%, convenience retail including food related businesses such as grocers, butchers, cheese shops etc. comprises 18%, food services including restaurants comprises 23%, and other services comprise 15%.
- At 23% of market share in food services (i.e. restaurants and take out places), the critical mass of restaurants in Kensington Market is currently within the same range in terms of retail mix as a typical main street in the former City.
- By comparison, restaurants in Bloor-Annex comprise 43% market share; 29% in Little Korea; 37% in Little Italy; and 21% on Queen West from Spadina to Bathurst.

More information may be found in the Retail Study by JC Williams at the link below:

Scale of Retail Commercial Uses, Excluding Restaurants

The existing buildings are generally built on small lots with narrow frontages consistent with the older built form fabric of Toronto's original residential neighbourhoods. The
Official Plan policies and the zoning by-laws require the ground floor in commercial retail / mixed use areas to be non-residential and therefore the size of a business generally corresponds to the footprint of the ground floor and basement.

The scale of retail commercial uses varies within each category of retail or service use according to an inventory conducted by urbanMetrics in 2012: of approximately 280 businesses recorded, the 39 convenience and specialty food stores averaged approximately 85 square metres and the two supermarkets averaged 240 square metres; the non-food store retailers ranged between approximately 115 to 155 square metres; and the service uses ranged from 50 to 260 square metres. This range in scale is considered to be within the category of small-scale retail (Source: urbanMetrics, Residual Retail Market Demand and Impact Analysis, 2013).

Restaurant Use

An analysis of the current zoning permissions for restaurant use compared to the existing size of restaurants in Kensington Market revealed that the average size of the 79 restaurants in Kensington in 2012 was about 100 square metres, whereas the Zoning By-law permits a maximum restaurant size of 200 square metres. At that time, approximately 6 restaurants greater than 200 square metres had been approved through the application process, ranging from approximately 250 to 285 square metres (Source: urbanMetrics, Residual Retail Market Demand and Impact Analysis, 2013).

Staff have also reviewed the results of restaurant studies recently completed by Community Planning:

a) Queen Street West Roncesvalles to Dufferin (2013)
b) Queen Street West Gladstone to Dovercourt (2009)
c) Ossington Avenue Restaurant Study (2009)

The Queen West Roncesvalles to Dufferin study is a pilot project to cap the number of restaurants per area; the results of the By-law and its enforcement will need to be assessed over a greater length of time before any conclusions may be drawn as to the appropriateness of using similar By-law restrictions elsewhere in the City. The Gladstone to Dovercourt study resulted in a By-law which placed a maximum of 200 square metres on the size of a restaurant. The Ossington Study resulted in a By-law that placed a maximum of 175 square metres on the size of a restaurant. The Ossington and Dovercourt By-laws also prohibit new rear yard and rooftop patios in the study area and restrict a patio flanking onto a side lot to 50% of the depth of the building in which a restaurant is located (measured from the front wall) to restrict the level of noise that travels down the residential streets.

Consultation Process

The first community consultation meeting hosted by City Planning on the study was held on April 7, 2014 and attended by approximately 35 people. Participants were asked a)
what they love about the Market, b) if there is anything that may not be protected in the existing policies, zoning permissions, and if successful, the Heritage Conservation District Study, c) suggestions for any changes to the scope of a restaurant study within the capacity of City Planning, and d) whether anything else was missing from the discussion.

- Participants were generally not concerned with restaurant and bar use per se; rather, they were concerned with the behaviours associated with heavy drinking such as litter, noise and concerns about safety.

- Participants also had concerns over the loss of small, independent and/or family-owned businesses that have characterized the Market, including some participants raising concerns that closures of nightclubs in the Entertainment District due to redevelopment may be leading to the re-location of nightclubs within the Market.

A separate meeting was also held with the Kensington Market BIA on June 4, 2014. The BIA sent notice to its membership and hand delivered flyers to businesses in Kensington Market. The meeting was not well attended and subsequently City Planning was advised that some restaurant and bar owners and operators were not aware of the meeting. Participants at that meeting generally concurred with the comments received at the April 7, 2014 meeting.

Community Planning and Heritage Preservation Services staff participated in the Kensington Market Town Hall hosted by the Ward Councillor on March 16, 2015. The meeting was attended by the broader neighbourhood community, including a number of restaurant and bar owners and operators who expressed an interest in attending a stakeholder meeting to find out more about the Restaurant and Bar Study.

Following that meeting the Councillor's office and Community Planning held a consultation meeting on June 22, 2015 for bar and restaurant owners and operators and representation from the Kensington Market BIA. In general, participants expressed:

- Satisfaction with the size permissions (Gross Floor Area) for restaurants and bar use in Kensington Market.

- That restaurant and bars provide "eyes and ears on the street" into the evenings after other businesses close.

- That restaurant and bar owners and operators in Kensington Market are small and independent business owners, many of whom live in Kensington Market, including some who live in the same building as the restaurant / bar.

- A need for more regular pick up of compost, recycling and garbage.
In addition to the above, participants requested clarification on the process for a range of items pertaining to their businesses, not all of which are relevant to this study. Requests for clarification included:

- Interpretation of the zoning by-laws which pertain to restaurant and bar use in Kensington Market.
- How Municipal Licensing Services (MLS) issues permissions for outdoor food service and BBQ use, and in particular how such permissions may be granted for Pedestrian Sundays, a monthly event from May to October which closes the main market streets to traffic and includes outdoor vending.
- The process for granting permissions for patios and for liquor licensing on patios.
- Definition for a night club use in the zoning by-laws.
- How enforcement of the city's by-laws is executed.
- How the Provincial ban on smoking on patios will be implemented.

Planning staff have also met with the City's BIA office and held preliminary meetings with staff in the Economic Development and Culture Division to initiate discussion on whether there is role for that Division to play in developing policies or other initiatives to support small business owners. City Planning staff also participated in a walk through the Market led by the local historic society and have visited the market to observe the retail mix on a number of occasions.

Further consultation is anticipated in tandem with the Heritage Conservation District Study.

**Issues to beResolved**

Issues related to maintaining the scale, built form, small scale retail, and character of Kensington Market have been identified through the consultation process.

Examples of issues identified through the consultation process which are beyond the scope of this City Planning study include noise, litter, costs of renting and leasing and property tax rates in the Market leading to affordability issues for both residents and small business owners, impacts of large scale and chain retail, provincial liquor licensing regulations, permits for patios, and enforcement of the 11 pm Noise By-law.

Additional issues may be identified through the study process.
Study Next Steps

In light of the above findings and consultation feedback, staff recommend the following action:

1. Continue to enforce the as-of-right zoning permission for the size of a restaurant / bar in Kensington Market and the Official Plan Site and Area Specific Policy 197.

Study next steps will include:

1. Undertake a detailed review of the Zoning By-law regulations for patio size and location.

2. Work in consultation with the Economic Development and Culture Division, the City’s BIA office, and the Kensington Market BIA to preserve the opportunity for independent, small businesses in Kensington Market.

3. Coordinate final recommendations of the Restaurant and Bar Study in coordination with the Heritage Conservation District Study process and findings and report back on any recommendations to amend the Official Plan policy or Zoning By-law on matters pertaining to the scale, character, land use, lot and building patterns, and built form in Kensington Market.

4. Continue discussions and consultation with the business owners and residents and the BIA.

5. Follow the results of the City-wide initiative being led by Municipal Licensing and Standards (ML&S) to review community nuisance concerns related to liquor licensing of restaurants, bars and entertainment establishments and incorporate the results of this process as appropriate to this Study.


The above next steps may be modified as the study progresses.

Conclusion

Amendments to the Zoning By-law to implement further restrictions on restaurant and bar uses is not being recommended because current zoning restrictions on restaurant size in Kensington Market is already more strict than other areas of the City. Further, the existing restaurant size restriction in the By-law of 200 square metres is twice as large as the average size of eating establishments currently located in Kensington Market. In 2012 only 6 out of 79 restaurants were larger than the as-of-right zoning permissions.
Consultation with restaurant and bar owners indicated satisfaction with the 200 square metre size limit, and no trend was identified toward larger restaurants and bars.

Next steps in the study include: a) reporting back on existing patio permissions and whether any changes to them should be considered; b) working with the Economic, Development and Culture Division to report back on opportunities and tools to support locally-owned, small business enterprises in Kensington Market including property tax rates; and c) reporting on any further analysis and recommendations to protect the scale, mix of uses and character of Kensington Market in co-ordination with the timing of the results of the Kensington Market Heritage Conservation District Study.

CONTACT
Liora Freedman, Planner
Tel. No. (416) 338-5747
Fax No. (416) 392-1330
E-mail: lfreedm@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

_______________________________
Gregg Lintern, MCIP, RPP
Director, Community Planning
Toronto and East York District

(P:\2015\Cluster B\pln\TEYCC\18699981070.doc) - smc

ATTACHMENTS
Attachment 1: Zoning Exception 12(2)240, By-law 438-86
Attachment 2: Area Specific Policy 197
Attachment 3: Zoning By-law 438-86
Attachment 4: Zoning By-law 569-2013
Attachment 1: Zoning Exception 12(2)240, By-law 438-86

CITY OF TORONTO
ZONING BY-LAW No. 438-86

SECTION 12 - EXCEPTIONS APPLYING TO SPECIFIC USE DISTRICTS OR SPECIFIC LANDS

240. No person shall, within the areas shown bounded by heavy lines on the map at the end of and forming part of this Exception, erect or use a building or structure for the purpose of:

(i) a bake-shop, a caterer’s shop, a club, a place of amusement, a place of assembly, a restaurant, or a take-out restaurant unless: (425-93)

A. the non-residential gross floor area used for any such purpose does not exceed 200 square metres;

B. none of the uses listed in (i) is located above the first storey above grade in any such building or structure;

C. not more than one of the uses listed in (i) is located in any such building or structure;

D. any such building or structure used for any such purpose listed in (i) is located on a lot as such lot existed on July 9, 1991, and (1997-0422)

E. the owner or occupant of such building or structure provides and maintains on the same lot as such building or structure is located or in a commercial parking lot or a parking station within 300 metres therefrom, at least one parking space for each 33 square metres of non-residential gross floor area or fraction thereof in excess of the first 100 square metres used for any purpose listed in (i) on such lot. (635-91) (1997-0422)

For the purpose of this Exception, the expression “grade” means the average elevation of the sidewalk or, where there is no sidewalk, of the street in front of the lot on which the building stands. (1997-0422)

(414-91)
Attachment 2: Area Specific Policy 197
Attachment 3: Zoning By-law 438-86