



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register – Bathurst-Bloor Properties

Date:	September 8, 2015
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Director, Urban Design, City Planning
Wards:	Trinity- Spadina – Wards 19 and 20
Reference Number:	P:\2015\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE15103

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council include 35 properties in the Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study Area on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

This report was prepared in response to a City Council request that the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, report to the Toronto and East York Community Council on the heritage attributes and options for inclusion on the City's Heritage Inventory of the properties identified in Section 4.2 of the "Better Bathurst" Final Report by DTAH, and to advise on any potential for a Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Study for Mirvish Village. It has also been prepared in anticipation of the *Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study – Official Plan Amendment*, which will contain specific recommendations for the conservation of heritage resources within the Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study Area.

In addition to a review of all of the properties within the boundaries of the Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study Area, heritage staff conducted a block-by-block analysis, including Mirvish Village, to determine whether a Heritage Conservation District (HCD) study may be warranted. Staff concluded that while there is a variety of properties that merit inclusion

on the Heritage Register, the heritage character of the area is not sufficiently cohesive to warrant an HCD Plan and district designation.

In 2012 on the direction of City Council, City Planning undertook the study of Bathurst Street from Queen Street West to Dupont Street that resulted in the "Better Bathurst" Final Report by DTAH, planning consultants and included recommendations on potential heritage resources.

RECOMMENDATIONS

City Planning Staff recommend that:

1. City Council include the property at 738 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
2. City Council include the property at 740 Bathurst Street (which is also a convenience address for the property at 738 Bathurst Street) on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
3. City Council include the property at 742 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
4. City Council include the property at 744 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
5. City Council include the property at 746 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
6. City Council include the property at 756 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
7. City Council include the property at 758 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
8. City Council include the property at 760 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
9. City Council include the property at 791 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
10. City Council include the property at 793 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
11. City Council include the property at 795 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
12. City Council include the property at 830 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

13. City Council include the property at 840 Bathurst Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
14. City Council include the property at 581 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
15. City Council include the property at 583 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
16. City Council include the property at 585 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
17. City Council include the property at 586 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
18. City Council include the property at 587 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
19. City Council include the property at 588 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
20. City Council include the property at 589 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
21. City Council include the property at 590 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
22. City Council include the property at 591 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
23. City Council include the property at 592 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
24. City Council include the property at 593 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
25. City Council include the property at 594 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
26. City Council include the property at 595 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
27. City Council include the property at 596 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
28. City Council include the property at 597 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

29. City Council include the property at 598 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
30. City Council include the property at 599 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
31. City Council include the property at 600 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
32. City Council include the property at 601 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
33. City Council include the property at 602 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
34. City Council include the property at 610 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.
35. City Council include the property at 659 Markham Street on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of July 11, 2012, City Council directed City Planning to initiate a built form and land use study of both sides of Bathurst Street from Queen Street West to Dupont Street, which resulted in the identification of potential heritage resources:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2012.TE17.57>

City Council at its meeting of July 8, 2014 adopted TE33.7, "Final Report – Bathurst Street – Queen Street West to Dupont Street: Zoning Amendment and Official Plan Amendment Direction". The recommendations requested Community Planning to initiate a specific study of the Bloor-Bathurst Four Corners Area and also authorized a Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Study for Mirvish Village, which is located within the study area

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.TE33.7>).

On August 25-28, 2014, City Council adopted TE34.8, "Final Report – Bathurst Street – Queen Street West to Dupont Street – Official Plan Amendment" and directed the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, to report to the Toronto and East York Community Council on the heritage attributes and options for inclusion on the City's Heritage Inventory of the properties identified in Section 4.2 of the "Better Bathurst" Final Report by DTAH

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.TE34.8>).

At its meeting of May 5, 2015, City Council adopted TE5.8 entitled "Principles Report – Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study – Official Plan Amendment"

(<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.TE5.8>).

Recommendation 2.d. of the report requested the Director, Community Planning, Toronto and East York District to "report back to the Toronto and East York Community Council in the third quarter of 2015 with specific recommendations for the conservation of heritage resources within the Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study Area."

The map of the study area from that report is attached as Attachment No. 1.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

In 2012, City Council directed Community Planning staff to undertake a built form and land use study of Bathurst Street from Queen Street West to Dupont Street. DTAH planning consultants conducted the study, resulting in the "Better Bathurst" Final Report that included specific recommendations on the listing and designation of heritage properties. In the part of the study area identified as "Bathurst/Bloor West Main Street", the consultants identified six individual or groups of buildings as potential heritage properties. As the result of the study, Council adopted a new Official Plan Site and Area Specific Policy (SASP) to guide development in the study area.

In 2014, City Council directed the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services to report to the Toronto and East York Community Council on "the heritage attributes, and options for inclusion on the City's heritage inventory" of the properties identified in the "Better Bathurst" Final Report by DTAH and, at a separate meeting, authorized a Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Study for Mirvish Village, which adjoins Bathurst Street.

COMMENTS

Following research and evaluation, staff have determined that the 35 properties identified in this report meet Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation that the City also uses when assessing properties for the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

The recommended properties are shown on Attachment No. 2. Location maps and photographs for each of the properties listed are shown in Attachments Nos. 3A-3S.

The Statements of Significance (Reasons for Listing) describing the values and attributes of the properties are contained in Attachment Nos. 4A-4S. A background document on the heritage resources in the Bathurst-Bloor Study Area is contained in Attachment No. 5.

Heritage staff also surveyed and analyzed the Bathurst-Bloor Study Area to determine whether an HCD study may be warranted in the future. An HCD may be designated if it meets one of five criteria groups and it retains enough integrity to communicate its

significance. The criteria measure a district's cultural heritage significance as demonstrated through its design/physical, historical/associative, contextual, social/community or natural/scientific values.

Staff analysis suggests that the district has associative value due to its long association with the Mirvish family, and contextual value in that it contains heritage resources that are interrelated by use and setting. The adaptive reuse of residential properties on Markham Street for commercial use – originally for artistic enterprises (galleries, studios, bookstores, etc.) – has given that particular block a character which is distinct from similar contemporary residential blocks in the neighbourhood.

However, the City's HCD policies require that a district also demonstrate physical integrity "to ensure its established significance is evident in its heritage resources and attributes." Integrity is measured against two criteria: visual, functional or historical coherence; and authenticity.

Heritage staff analysis determined on the question of the first criterion that the highly eclectic Markham Street lacks a sense of coherence, except insofar as most properties have been moderately to significantly altered over time. The distinction of scale between the large, monolithic Honest Ed's store on Bloor and Bathurst streets and the low-rise residential typology of Markham Street further precludes a sense of visual coherence. The narrower nineteenth century commercial buildings on Bathurst Street, while historically linked to Markham Street through use, are nonetheless visually and physically separated from it by an expanse of surface parking and the presence of an underground parking garage ramp.

Authenticity is the degree to which "a district can convey its cultural heritage value through its authentic attributes." This criterion is particularly important in assessing a district for potential designation, because it explores the question of what should be conserved in a district. In other words, there must be enough extant physical attributes, linked to identified values, that a district designation would seek to conserve. In Mirvish Village, authenticity is not present due to the extent of alterations, particularly along Markham Street. Although the legacy of alterations may be traced back to single ownership and the character of the businesses that leased the properties, this has been a continually evolving process and it would be very challenging to identify shared attributes that must be conserved. There is however a discernible "village" character in the Mirvish Village which may be best conserved through other planning tools.

Due to its lack of integrity, HPS does not recommend that Council pursue any portion of the Study Area for an HCD study. However the inclusion of 35 properties on the City's Heritage Register (formerly known as the Heritage Inventory) will enable staff to monitor any applications affecting them and will encourage the conservation of the heritage values and attributes within an integrated planning framework for the Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study Area.

CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald, Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: mmacdon7@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment No. 1 - Map of the Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study Area
Attachment No. 2 - Map of Bathurst-Bloor Properties recommended for Listing on the City of Toronto Heritage Register
Attachments Nos. 3A-3S – Location Maps and Photographs, Bathurst-Bloor Properties
Attachments Nos. 4A-4S – Statements of Significance, Bathurst-Bloor Properties
Attachments No. 5 – Historical Development of the Bathurst-Bloor Four Corners Study Area