SUMMARY

At its meeting of March 10, 2016, City Council considered TE14.9, recommending Inclusion on the City of Toronto’s Heritage Register of the property at 158 Pearl Street. City Council adopted a motion to “defer Item TE14.9 to its June 7 and 8, 2016 meeting and City Council direct the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to report back to Council with any new information about 158 Pearl Street that may inform the Reason of Inclusion on the City of Toronto’s Heritage Register and possible future designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.”

Following a supplementary review of the building and the additional information received from the property owner’s consultant, this report recommends that City Council adopt the revised Statement of Significance (Attachment No. 1) and direct the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to prepare a report providing recommendations with respect to the designation of the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council include the property at 158 Pearl Street on the City of Toronto’s Heritage Register in accordance with the Revised Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) – 158 Pearl Street, attached as Attachment 1 to the supplementary report (May 20, 2016) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning.

2. Direct the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to prepare a report providing recommendations with respect to the designation of the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for consideration of the Toronto Preservation Board at its next meeting on August 25, 2016.

Financial Impact
There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY
The property is located within the current King-Spadina Heritage Conservation District Study area. At its meeting of October 2, 2012, City Council adopted the report recommending the area be given prioritization and a study initiated.


The Toronto Preservation Board at its meeting of February 10, 2016 adopted
recommending that the property at 158 Pearl Street be included on the City of Toronto’s Heritage Register.

At its meeting of March 10, 2016, City Council deferred consideration of TE14.9 “Inclusion on the City of Toronto’s Heritage Register – 158 Pearl Street” until the June 7 and 8, 2016 City Council meeting:


ISSUE BACKGROUND
The property at 158 Pearl Street (including the vacant portion at 154 Pearl Street) contains a building dating to 1903 that is known historically as the White Swan Mills Building. The property is included within the boundaries of the King-Spadina Heritage Conservation District Study Area. Following a review of the area, staff recommended that it be included on the City of Toronto’s Heritage Register, which would enable staff to monitor any proposed changes to the site and require that a Heritage Impact Assessment be submitted should the site undergo redevelopment.
The owners of 158 Pearl Street commissioned a consultant’s report (dated May 9, 2016) reviewing the cultural heritage value and attributes of the property, which was submitted to Heritage Preservation Services on May 11, 2016. The report determined that the property meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Section 29, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, which the City of Toronto also applies when considering properties for its Heritage Register. However, the consultant’s report also concluded that the Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) prepared by City staff should be corrected to clarify the historical connection between the current building and the original Upper Canada College (UCC). The report also recommended that consideration should be given to only commemorating the north elevation of the building (associated with UCC) rather than describing it as a heritage attribute.

In reviewing the consultant’s report and its conclusions, staff concur with the recommendation that the Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) attached to the January 19, 2016 staff report be revised to clarify the historical relationship between the subject property and the former UCC campus. However, staff do not agree that the heritage attributes of the north elevation of the building that is associated with this history be removed from the list of attributes. While a remnant from an earlier building, it is the only identified surviving feature from the original UCC campus apart from the former board house at 20 Duncan Street (which was converted for industrial and commercial uses and is identified on the City’s Heritage Register).

Staff acknowledge that the building has been altered over time, but feel strongly that changes to the building (including those made in the 1980s that retained part of the wall associated with UCC) are part of the evolution of the site and do not detract from its ability to communicate its cultural heritage values and attributes.
It is recommended that the Revised Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) comprising Attachment 1, which includes revisions to the values and attributes linking the property at 158 Pearl Street to the original UCC campus, replace the original Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion), which was Attachment 3 in the report (January 19, 2016) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director.

CONTACT
Mary L. MacDonald, Senior Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: mmacdon7@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

_______________________________
Jennifer Keesmaat, MES, MCIP, RPP
Chief Planner & Executive Director
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS
Attachment No. 1 – Revised Statement of Significance (May 27, 2016) (Reasons for Inclusion)