June 28, 2016

TO: Members of the Executive Committee
    Toronto City Council
    Meeting: June 28, 2016

RE: EX16.1 – Developing Toronto’s Transit Network Plan to 2031

The current proposal for replacing the Scarborough “Rapid Transit” system is far too costly and operationally ineffective to be seriously considered.

A cost-effective alternative solution is readily implementable at a considerable cost-savings to taxpayers – and will have a far superior result in terms of rapid transit infrastructure.

The “Scarborough Subway Solution” entails building a new Kennedy Subway Station along the alignment of the subway tracks just west of the current station, and tunneling a short section underground to link up with the existing Scarborough RT right-of-way (see attached drawing).

By re-using and upgrading the current RT infrastructure and adapting it to subway standards, cost savings of over $2-billion should be realized. That valuable public-transit infrastructure funding could be more effectively utilized elsewhere, such as extending the subway system further into Scarborough.

The project would require the construction of a new subway station, a new underground track section which would connect the existing subway tracks to the old RT trackage, and re-gauging the RT tracks to the same track gauge as the subway system. All construction can be undertaken while the existing Subway/RT system continues to operate.

Such a project would eliminate a totally-needless physical transfer from the subway system to the RT system, due to the complete incompatibility of the two transit systems.
Cost savings can also be realized by construction of subway stations of a basic standard design – instead of expending exorbitant sums of taxpayers’ money on totally-unnecessary architectural extravagance, which does nothing to provide faster and more-effective transit service.

By recognizing that the Regional Express Rail (RER) proposal along rail corridors within Toronto and the SmartTrack proposal essentially duplicate each other, eliminating that duplication and operating the proposed system at a higher frequency of service tailored to service demand throughout the day will be much more cost-effective.

On the east side of Toronto, RER and SmartTrack are planned to operate concurrently, while on the west side, RER, SmartTrack and the Union-Pearson Express service duplicate service on the northwestern rail corridor.

In addition, construction of LRT (Light Rail Transit) systems, which are streetcars typically operating in partially-segregated rights-of-way with cross-street intersections at grade, within the City are not “rapid transit” – unlike Toronto’s Subway system or GO Transit. LRT systems are designed for short to medium-distance travel at a slower pace than rapid transit and cannot effectively compete with faster rapid transit systems for commuting.

If Toronto, as the 4th largest city in North America, aspires to be a world-class city, then the plan must be to connect our city-centres with mass rapid transit: subways and GO.

Toronto taxpayers expect that public servants, those who are employed at taxpayers’ expense and who are expected to take direction from the public and to serve the public, will implement the most cost-effective and operationally-effective public transit projects.

Public transit projects are often uncoordinated (e.g. unnecessary duplication of competing transit systems in close proximity to each other such as RER and SmartTrack, GO Transit service and proposed local LRT projects) – resulting in ineffective and poorer service overall.

Taxpayers expect that their money will be spent on optimized projects that operate effectively - instead of what sounds good, but never lives up to the grand promises made to taxpayers, as occurs far too often.

Sincerely,

(signed)

Paul Chomik  
Peggy Moulder

Attachment: