



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property – 160 Gerrard Street East (Allan Gardens)

Date:	January 7, 2016
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto-East York Community Council
From:	Chief Planner & Executive Director, City Planning Division
Wards:	Toronto Centre-Rosedale –Ward 27
Reference Number:	P:\2016\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE16006

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 160 Gerrard Street East (Allan Gardens) under Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act as set out in this report.

The application proposes the replacement of the existing link building with washrooms that connects the Palm House and the Boiler House with the construction of a new glazed vestibule. The application also proposes the construction of new washrooms in the existing Administrative Building. A new glazed addition is proposed to be added at the southeast corner of the Administrative Building to accommodate existing administrative functions/ office space.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 160 Gerrard Street East, in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to allow for the replacement of the existing link building between the Palm House and the Boiler House with construction of a new glazed vestibule, the construction of new washrooms in the existing Administrative Building, and the construction of a new glazed addition at the southeast corner of the Administrative Building, with such alterations substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA),

prepared by Baird Sampson Neuert Architects Inc., dated December 2015, and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and plans and drawings dated January 21, 2015, prepared by Baird Sampson Neuert Architects Inc., and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the following condition:

- a. That prior to the issuance of any permit for all or any part of the alterations as set out in the report dated January 7, 2016 from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division, for the alterations to the designated heritage property at 160 Gerrard Street East, including a heritage permit or a building permit, but excluding permits for repairs and maintenance and usual and minor works as are acceptable to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services:
 - i. Provide full building permit drawings including a landscape plan with notes and specifications for the conservation, stabilization and protective measures substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), prepared by Baird Sampson Neuert Architects Inc., dated December 2015, and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and plans and drawings dated January 21, 2015, prepared by Baird Sampson Neuert Architects Inc., and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The property at 160 Gerrard Street East containing Allan Gardens was listed on the former City of Toronto inaugural Inventory of Heritage Properties on June 20, 1973 and designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act on July 20, 1986 by By-Law No. 418-86.

At its meeting of September 28, 29, 30 and October 1, 2004, City Council approved amending of the designating By-Law to update the Reasons for Designation to include additional heritage resources, particularly the relocated University of Toronto Greenhouse that is now known as the Children's Conservatory.

Subsequently at its meeting of October 2, 2012, City Council adopted amending By-Law No. 1091-2013 to revise the Reasons for Designation in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act.

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2012/te/bgrd/backgroundfile-49946.pdf>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

Development Proposal

The application proposes the replacement of the existing link building that connects the Palm House and the Boiler House with construction of a new glazed vestibule. The westerly portion of the vestibule will be used as operational storage space. The easterly portion of the vestibule will continue to be accessible from the Palm House and will provide direct access from the park through the proposed doors on the north and south elevations.

New washrooms will be constructed in the existing Administrative Building. The new washrooms will continue to be accessible from the Tropical Greenhouse and from the north and east elevations of the Administrative Building. The new washrooms will improve existing conditions by providing universal access and direct access from the park. A new glazed addition is proposed to enlarge the Administrative Building to accommodate administrative functions/ office space.

Policy Framework

Provincial Policy Statement and Planning Act

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. The key objectives include building strong communities, wise use and management of resources, and protecting public health and safety. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province and include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 reads "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved".

Official Plan

The newly revised heritage policies in the City of Toronto Official Plan provides the City's policy framework for heritage conservation in the City. Policy 4 states that, "Properties on the Heritage Register will be *conserved* and maintained consistent with the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*, as revised from time to time and as adopted by Council". Policy 5 states that, "Proposed *alterations*, development, and/or public works on or *adjacent* to, a property on the Heritage Register will ensure that the *integrity* of the heritage property's cultural heritage value and attributes will be retained, prior to work commencing on the property and to the satisfaction of the City". Policy 26 states that, "New construction on, or *adjacent* to, a

property on the Heritage Register will be designed to *conserve* the cultural heritage values, attributes and characters of that property and to mitigate visual and physical impact on it.

Heritage Resource

The property at 160 Gerrard Street East is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value. Established in the mid-19th century, Allan Gardens is a rare surviving example of a botanic gardens and public park. Allan Gardens contains a unique collection of greenhouses associated with a public garden that illustrates the evolution of glass technology from the Edwardian Era to the later 20th century. The site is a prominent landmark with its open space, iconic structures and special features that reflect the history of horticulture in the City.

Specific heritage attributes that relate to this proposal include:

Palm House, 1910:

- The placement of the structure near the west end of Allan Gardens, west of the north-south axial path and facing east toward Sherbourne Street, where it forms the nucleus of the eight-part complex of horticultural buildings
- The scale, form and massing of the single-storey structure
- The materials, with brick, stone, wood, glass and metal
- The circular brick-clad base with sandstone detailing
- The fenestration, with wood-framed windows, sidelights and transoms beneath a frieze with dentils
- The iconic 16-sided dome with curved trusses supporting the glazing (the original steel components were replaced with aluminum ones)
- Above the dome, the clerestory windows separating it from a small cupola with a finial
- The square corner pavilions, which are faced with sandstone, decorated with incised pilasters and reliefs, and covered by small domes with finials
- The entrances to the Palm House, which are placed on the east facades of the pavilions and were converted from the original three-part windows with transoms
- Between the entries, the colonnade where the original entrance was changed to windows and the portico removed

Administration Building, c. 1923

- The placement of the Administration Building, which is attached to the Tropical House also known as Greenhouse No. 5 (east)
- The scale, form and massing of the single-storey structure
- The rectangular plan under a flat roof
- The brick cladding, with brick banding on the west and south facades and stone detailing
- The main entrance, which is placed on the north wall, with a secondary entry on the east elevation
- The brick voussoirs and stone keystones and sills on the openings

Boiler Room and Chimney, 1910

- The placement of the Boiler Room and Chimney, which is connected to the Palm House (east) by a link building (the link is not identified as a heritage attribute)
- The scale, form and massing of the single-storey structure
- The rectangular plan beneath a flat roof
- The brick cladding with brick and stone detailing
- The stepped roofline at the west corner with stone quoins, and the parapet walls on the north and south elevations with stone cornices
- The door and paired window openings with brick and stone detailing
- The tall brick chimney with inset panels and crenelles

Tropical House, 1957 (Greenhouse 5)

- The placement of the Tropical House, which is connected to the South Conservatory (east) and attached to the Administration Building (west)
- The scale, form and massing of the pair of single-storey structures that are placed side-by-side
- The steel-framed glazed gable roofs that are connected at the eaves
- The wood framed walls supporting the glazing

Key Views

The key views of Allan Gardens that extend inside and outside of the property are:

- The view from Carlton Street along the north-south axial corridor south to Gerrard Street East and Pembroke Street toward the historical location of "Moss Park" near Queen Street East
- The view from Gerrard Street East along the north-south axial corridor north to Carlton Street and Homewood Avenue toward the historical location of "Homewood" near Wellesley Street East

COMMENTS

Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) has reviewed the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by Baird Sampson Neuert Architects Inc. for the alterations to 160 Gerrard Street East. The HIA finds that the proposed alterations will have minimal impact on the described heritage attributes of the property and will in part be mitigated through the proposed Conservation Strategy.

HPS has considered the application in the context of the Planning Act, the heritage policies of the Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), and the heritage policies of the City of Toronto Official Plan. As identified in Policy 4 of the Official Plan, properties on the Heritage Register must have regard to the *Standard and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*. The most appropriate conservation treatment for the proposed alterations is Rehabilitation. For this reason, the General Standards (1-9) and the Standards for Rehabilitation (10-12) apply to this project.

The link building is a modern addition that is excluded from the Amended Reasons for Designation as it detracts from the heritage character of the property. The new glazed vestibule will provide visual separation between the Palm House and the Boiler House, subsequently improving key views within and around the property as identified in the Amended Reasons for Designation. Constructed upon the existing foundation of the infill addition, the proposed vestibule will be erected with a combination of opaque and translucent glass. The height of the vestibule will be aligned with the top of the existing wall of the Boiler House. The proposed materials and height of the vestibule is distinguishable, yet physically and visually compatible to the heritage resource. The proposed alteration will also facilitate future courtyard improvement projects.

The proposed addition will be constructed at the southeast corner of the existing Administrative Building. The addition will be connected to the existing building through a glazed access corridor that partially extends along the east elevation of the Administrative Building. The addition is designed with curved corners and is set back behind the south elevation window of the existing Administrative Building to minimize obstruction of views around the existing site. The height of the proposed addition will be aligned with the top of the brick voussoir on the south elevation window of the existing Administrative Building to minimize visual impacts on the heritage building. This will help keep the addition subordinate to the heritage resource. Constructed with a combination of opaque and translucent fritted glass, the proposed addition will materially connect with the existing glazing surface of the Conservatory Complex. The materials selected for the proposed addition are visually and physically compatible yet distinguishable from the heritage resource. The proposed addition will better integrate the existing Administrative Building with the adjoining greenhouses and open space. A landscape garden is proposed around the perimeter of the addition to reinforce the presence of horticulture at this property.

The new universally accessible washrooms will be constructed in the existing Administrative Building to minimize the overall footprint of new construction and the visual impacts on the heritage attributes of the property. This relocation is considered as a minimal intervention. The existing entries on the north and east elevation of the Administrative Building will be altered to provide barrier free access.

As part of their mitigation strategy for the proposed alterations, the applicant has proposed a conservation strategy to restore the existing masonry of the Administrative Building. Masonry will be salvaged from the enlargement of the existing entry along the east elevation to provide barrier free access and will be used for localized replacement of bricks. Existing masonry will be cleaned throughout and repointed, where required.

Prior to issuance of any permits for the proposed alterations, the applicant is required to submit full building permit drawings including a landscape plan for the conservation, stabilization and protective measures substantially in accordance with the HIA. Staff will review the proposed landscape plan to ensure that it creates a supportive context within Allan Gardens.

CONCLUSION

Staff agree with the findings of the HIA and have determined that the proposed alterations will not have a negative impact on the heritage character of 160 Gerrard Street East. It is recommended that City Council approve the proposed alterations to 160 Gerrard Street East as set out in the report.

CONTACT

Sherry Pedersen, Program Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jennifer Keesmaat, MES, MCIP, RPP
Chief Planner & Executive Director
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Location Map
Attachment 2 – Amended Reasons for Designation (Statement of Significance), 2012
Attachment 3 – Photographs
Attachment 4 – Proposed Site Plan
Attachment 5 – Proposed Floor Plan: Vestibule
Attachment 6 – Proposed Elevation Drawing: Vestibule
Attachment 7 – Proposed Floor Plan: Administrative Building and Addition
Attachment 8 – Proposed Elevation Drawings: Administrative Building and Addition
Attachment 9 – Proposal Rendering: Administrative Building and Addition