

**Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property and
Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement
– 450 Yonge Street (Oddfellows Hall)**

Date:	November 18, 2015
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division
Wards:	Ward 27 - Toronto Centre-Rosedale
Reference Number:	P:\2015\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE15117

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council endorse the conservation strategy generally described in this report for the heritage property located at 450 Yonge Street (Oddfellows Hall) in conjunction with a Site Plan application for the construction of a five-storey addition atop the existing four-storey building, provided the existing building is retained, conserved and is subject to a Heritage Easement Agreement.

Should City Council endorse this strategy, staff recommends that City Council require the owner to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City and authorize staff to take the necessary steps to enter into such Heritage Easement Agreement to ensure the long-term protection of 450 Yonge Street.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 450 Yonge Street, in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to allow for the construction of a five-storey rooftop addition and interior alterations to the existing building on the lands known municipally in 2015 as 450 Yonge Street, with such alterations substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Assessment dated May 8, 2015, prepared by E.R.A. Architects Inc., date-stamped

received by Heritage Preservation Services on May 27, 2015, and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services subject to the following conditions:

- a. Prior to the issuance of Final Site Plan Approval for the property at 450 Yonge Street, the owner shall:
 - i. Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City for the property at 450 Yonge Street substantially in accordance with the plans and drawings dated May 8, 2015 prepared by E.R.A. Architects Inc., date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services on May 27, 2015 and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, and in accordance with the Conservation Plan, required in Recommendation 1. a. ii. in the report (November 18, 2015) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, including registration of such agreement to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor;
 - ii. Provide a Conservation Plan prepared by a qualified heritage consultant that is consistent with the conservation strategy set out in the Heritage Impact Assessment for 450 Yonge Street prepared by ERA Architects Inc. dated May 8, 2015, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - iii. Provide a Lighting Plan that describes how the heritage property will be sensitively illuminated to enhance its heritage character to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and thereafter shall implement such Plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager Heritage Preservation Services;
 - iv. Provide final site plan drawings including drawings related to the approved Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 1. a. ii. in the report (November 18, 2015) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
- b. Prior to the issuance of a heritage permit for the designated property at 450 Yonge Street pertaining to the rooftop addition and interior alterations, but excluding permits for interior work not affecting the heritage attributes of the property, repairs, maintenance and usual and minor works to the property as are acceptable to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the owner shall:
 - i. Have obtained final site plan approval for the property, issued by the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning;

- ii. Provide full building permit drawings including notes and specifications for the conservation, stabilization and protective measures keyed to the approved Conservation Plan required in recommendation 1 a. ii. in the report (November 18, 2015) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - iii. Provide a Letter of Credit, including provisions for upward indexing, in a form and amount and from a bank satisfactory to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services to secure all work included in the approved Conservation Plan;
 - c. Prior to the release of the Letter of Credit, the owner shall:
 - i. Provide a letter of substantial completion prepared and signed by a qualified heritage consultant confirming that the conservation work has been completed in accordance with the Conservation Plan and that an appropriate standard of conservation has been maintained, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
 - ii. Provide replacement Heritage Easement Agreement photographs to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
- 2. City Council authorize the entering into of a Heritage Easement Agreement under Section 37 of the Ontario Heritage Act with the owner of the property at 450 Yonge Street in a form and content satisfactory to the Chief Planner and Executive Director and City Solicitor.
- 3. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary bill in Council authorizing the entering into of the Heritage Easement Agreement for the property at 450 Yonge Street.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of April 14, 1997, City Council designated the property at 450 Yonge Street by By-Law No. 176-97.

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/pre1998bylaws/toronto%20%20former%20city%20of/1997-0176.pdf>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

Heritage Property

Completed in 1892, the building known as Oddfellows Hall is the order's oldest surviving lodge in Toronto and represents the work of the important architectural firm, Dick and Wickson. With its towers, gables and mixture of brick and stone, the 4-storey building is a significant example of late-19th century design. The Oddfellows Hall is a prominent landmark on the north-west corner of Yonge and College Streets.

Development Proposal

The applicant proposes to alter the four-storey brick and stone structure by constructing a five-storey glazed rooftop addition and making interior alterations. The five-storey addition is proposed to be set back behind the two turrets at the east elevation and the gable roof along the south portion of the building. The addition will undulate and step back at each level, ranging from approximately six to twelve metres, from the Yonge Street property line.

The proposal also includes the rehabilitation of the interior entrance hall, elevator lobby and fourth floor lodge room and the removal of an interior light well and skylight.

Policy Framework

Planning Act and Provincial Policy Statement

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) 2014 provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. These policies support the goal of enhancing the quality of life for all Ontarians. Key policy objectives include: building strong, healthy communities; wise use and management of resources; and protecting public health and safety. The PPS recognizes that local context and character is important. Policies are outcome oriented, and some policies provide flexibility in their implementation provided that provincial interests are upheld. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and the associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the province and they include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 directs that "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved." Properties included on the City's Heritage Register are considered to be significant in this context. In the PPS 2014, conserved is defined as "the identification, protection, use and/or management of built heritage resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Official Plan

Amendment No. 199 to the Official Plan provides the City's policy framework for heritage conservation in the City. OPA 199, Policy 4 states that, "Properties on the Heritage Register will be *conserved* and maintained consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as revised from time to time and as adopted by Council".

The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

In 2008, Toronto City Council adopted the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada as the official document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approaches for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City of Toronto.

The Heritage Impact Assessment submitted in support of this application identifies the proposed conservation treatment for the Broadview Hotel as rehabilitation and preservation. For this reason the General Standards (1-9) and the Standards for Rehabilitation (10-12) apply to this project.

North Downtown Yonge Site and Area Specific Policy

By-law No. 1507-2013 was enacted by City Council on November 15, 2013 to amend the Official Plan with respect to the North Downtown Yonge Site and Area Specific Policy Area. It is intended to guide and shape development and private and public investment within the North Downtown Yonge Area and includes policies directing the conservation of heritage resources.

COMMENTS

The construction of a 60-storey tower directly north of the heritage property has provided an opportunity for the owner to undertake building upgrades via access through the adjacent construction site.

The proposed five-storey addition will be set back behind the important turrets at the east and gable at the south and will step back and undulate at each level, minimizing the visual impact on the heritage building. Constructed of lightly framed glazed panels, the addition will provide a simple backdrop for the strong architectural features of the building's parapet and turrets.

The ground floor interior lobby will be conserved. Both the important elevator and cage will be retained and encased in firelight glazing. The stairs leading to the second storey which are currently located behind the elevator are not a heritage attribute and will be removed to provide access to new elevators.

The proposed removal of the interior light well and skylight would result in the loss of these heritage attributes. While the addition is proposed to cover the skylight, it is also acknowledged that the light well and railing present safety and fire separation issues. As these elements are not publicly accessible, staff believe this is an acceptable intervention in the context of the rehabilitation of the building.

The rehabilitation of the fourth floor lodge room involves general repairs, painting, and wood and window conservation.

Prior to final site plan approval for the property at 450 Yonge Street, the applicant is required to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City and to submit a Conservation Plan for the work described in the HIA. The Conservation Plan will be required to detail all the proposed interventions and conservation work.

CONCLUSION

This proposal will rehabilitate and revitalize this landmark building on Yonge Street. Staff are supportive of the applicant's efforts to conserve the heritage property while providing for new, contemporary uses and recommend that City Council approve the proposed alterations.

CONTACT

Sherry Pedersen, Program Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jennifer Keesmaat, MES, MCIP, RPP
Chief Planner & Executive Director
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment No. 1 - Location Map
Attachment No. 2 – Photograph – Southeast Elevation
Attachment No. 3 – Proposal Rendering
Attachment No. 4 – Proposed Roof Plan
Attachment No. 5 – Proposed South Elevation Drawing
Attachment No. 6 – Proposed East Elevation Drawing
Attachment No. 7 – Existing Skylight and Light Well