



**STAFF REPORT
ACTION REQUIRED**

Alterations to Heritage Properties and Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act - 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Date: | March 2, 2016 |
| To: | Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council |
| From: | Chief Planner & Executive Director, City Planning Division |
| Wards: | Ward 30 – Toronto-Danforth |
| Reference Number: | P:\2016\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE16038 |

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the proposed alterations to the properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue and state its intention to designate the properties under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. These properties are part of the complex that makes up the Montcrest School campus. The rear portions of the buildings at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue will be demolished and an addition will be constructed between and behind 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue. 660 Broadview Avenue will become the new administrative building for Montcrest School.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue, in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to allow for the construction of a new addition on the lands known municipally in the year 2016 as 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue, with such alterations substantially in accordance with plans and drawings dated February 10, 2016, prepared by Montgomery Sisam Architects Inc, date-stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services February 19, 2016, and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), prepared by Goldsmith Borgal & Company Ltd. Architects, dated October 21, 2015, date-stamped received by City Planning on November 27, 2015, and on

file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, all subject to and in accordance with a Conservation Plan satisfactory to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and subject to the following additional conditions:

- a. That prior to Final Site Plan approval for the alterations to the properties located at 650, 658 & 660 Broadview the owner shall:
 - i. Provide a Conservation Plan prepared by a qualified heritage consultant that is consistent with the conservation strategy set out in the Heritage Impact Assessment for 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue, prepared by Goldsmith Borgal & Company Ltd. Architects, dated October 21, 2015, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - ii. Provide final site plan drawings related to the approved Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 1.a.i in the report (March 2, 2016) from the Chief Planner & Executive Director, City Planning to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - iii. Provide a Lighting Plan that describes how the heritage properties will be sensitively illuminated to enhance their heritage character to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - b. That prior to the issuance of any permit for all or any part of the properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue, including a heritage permit or a building permit, but excluding permits for interior work not affecting the heritage attributes of the property, repairs and maintenance and usual and minor works for the existing heritage buildings as are acceptable to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - i. Have obtained final site plan approval for such property, issued by the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning;
 - ii. Provide full building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures keyed to the approved Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 1.a.i in the report (March 2, 2016) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, including a description of materials and finishes to be prepared by the project architect and qualified heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
2. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 650 Broadview Avenue under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with

- the Statement of Significance: 650 Broadview Avenue (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 7 to the report (March 2, 2016) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division.
3. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 658 Broadview Avenue under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 658 Broadview Avenue (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 8 to the report (March 2, 2016) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division.
 4. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 660 Broadview Avenue under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 660 Broadview Avenue (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment No. 9 to the report (March 2, 2016) from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division.
 5. If there are no objections to the designations in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the bills in Council designating the properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
 6. If there are objections to the designations in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council direct the City Clerk to refer the designations to the Conservation Review Board.
 7. If the designations are referred to the Conservation Review Board, City Council authorize the City Solicitor and appropriate staff to attend any hearing held by the Conservation Review Board in support of Council's decision on the designation of the properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The property located at 660 Broadview Avenue was listed on the City of Toronto's Inventory of Heritage Properties (now "Heritage Register") on April 10, 1978. The properties located at 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue were listed on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register on September 27, 2006.

BACKGROUND

Development Proposal

The application proposes an expansion of the Montcrest School Campus by constructing a new addition between and behind 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue. Proposed exterior alterations include the removal of the rear portions of both buildings and the alteration of an existing window opening on the north elevation of 650 Broadview Avenue into a door

opening. The side elevations of both buildings will be maintained in full within the interior of the new addition.

Policy Framework

Provincial Policy Statement and Planning Act

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. The key objectives include: building strong communities; wise use and management of resources; and, protecting public health and safety. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province and they include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 reads: "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved".

Official Plan

The revised heritage policies in the City of Toronto's Official Plan provide the policy framework for heritage conservation in the City. The following Official Plan policies apply to the proposed alterations:

3.1.5.4: "Properties on the Heritage Register will be conserved and maintained consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as revised from time to time and adopted by Council."

3.1.5.5: "Proposed alterations, development, and/or public works on or adjacent to, a property on the Heritage Register will ensure that the integrity of the heritage property's cultural heritage value and attributes will be retained, prior to work commencing on the property and to the satisfaction of the City."

3.1.5.6: "The adaptive re-use of properties on the Heritage Register is encouraged for new uses permitted in the applicable Official Plan land use designation, consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada."

3.1.5.26: "New construction on, or adjacent to, a property on the Heritage Register will be designed to conserve the cultural heritage values, attributes and character of that property and to mitigate visual and physical impact on it."

3.1.5.27: "Where it is supported by the cultural heritage values and attributes of a property on the Heritage Register, the conservation of whole or substantial portions of buildings, structures and landscapes on those properties is desirable and encouraged. The retention of facades alone is discouraged."

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

In 2008, Toronto City Council adopted the Parks Canada Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada as the official document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage within the City of Toronto.

The Heritage Impact Assessment submitted in support of this application identifies the proposed conservation approach as Rehabilitation. For this reason the General Standards (1-9) and the Standards for Rehabilitation (10-13) apply to this project. The Standards for Restoration (13-14) apply specifically to the proposed restoration work.

Heritage Resource

The properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue are included on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register and each contains an early 20th century house form building that contributes to the residential enclave on the west side of the street, north of Montcrest Boulevard. The property at 660 Broadview Avenue is particularly significant as the residence from 1908-1935 of William Peyton Hubbard (1842-1935), Toronto's first black politician, who served variously as an alderman, a member of the City's Board of Control and as Acting Mayor during his 15-year career in municipal politics.

Heritage Evaluation and Designation

Staff have completed the attached Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Reports (Attachments 10-12) and determined that the three properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue meet Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation. The properties contain early 20th century house form buildings that were designed in the popular styles of the era and contribute to the residential enclave on the west side of Broadview Avenue, north of Montcrest Boulevard in the Riverdale community.

The Statements of Significance (Attachments 10-12) comprise the Reasons for Designation, which are the Public Notices of Intention to Designation and will be advertised on the City of Toronto's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions and served on the property owners and the Ontario Heritage Trust according to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act.

COMMENTS

Proposed Conservation Strategy

Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) has reviewed the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by Goldsmith Borgal & Company Ltd. Architects. The HIA finds that the proposed alterations to the properties at 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue are

appropriate and that the proposal will rehabilitate these buildings while conserving identified heritage attributes. The HIA also addresses the proposed addition and concludes that the placement of the addition behind and between 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue will ensure their ongoing maintenance and preservation and will not have a negative impact on the heritage character of these properties due its location and setback, legible and compatible materials, reduced height, preservation of the side walls within the interior and improved landscaping along Broadview Avenue.

Assessment of Heritage Impacts

HPS has considered the application in the context of the Planning Act, the heritage policies of the Provincial Policy Statement 2014 (PPS), the heritage policies of the City of Toronto Official Plan, the heritage policies of the Council-adopted amendments to the City of Toronto Official Plan, and the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada. Staff agree that the proposed development will not have a negative impact on the heritage character of the subject properties, and that the proposed physical alterations to the subject properties are generally appropriate.

The rear (west) elevations of 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue have been altered by additions and are not identified as heritage attributes of the properties. The application proposes to remove the rear additions on 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue in addition to an existing wooden deck on the rear elevation of 660 Broadview Avenue. The new addition will connect into the sides and rear of both 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue, creating an interior space between the two buildings that will retain the side elevations of each heritage building. One window on the ground floor of the north elevation of 650 Broadview Avenue will be altered to a door opening to provide access from the lobby space to the ground floor of the heritage building.

The new addition will connect into the side elevations of 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue underneath the existing eaves for the entire length of each side elevation. Ramps will allow connections between the existing interior floors of the heritage buildings to those of the new addition without altering the original floor levels. On the ground floor of the new addition, the new interior space created between the side walls of the heritage buildings will serve as a new entrance and lobby space. On the second floor, the space will be used as a new art room. The addition will extend behind the 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue and will house a new elevator, a science lab, and additional classroom space for Montcrest School. Open space between the rear wings of the addition will become a courtyard which will be used for both recreation and teaching space.

The front façade of the new addition will be primarily glazed, ensuring that the new building will be legible as contemporary construction against the existing heritage fabric and brick construction of 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue. Additionally, the height of the proposed addition is stepped well below the roof peaks of the adjacent heritage buildings ensuring it remains subordinate.

The existing paved area in front of 650 and 658 Broadview Avenue will be maintained as it serves as the drop-off from Broadview Avenue for the school. However, new planters,

stone pavers and natural concrete will be introduced to improve the existing landscaping in front all three heritage properties.

CONCLUSION

Staff are supportive of the applicant's efforts to conserve these heritage properties and find that the proposed alterations to 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue will not have a negative impact on the identified heritage attributes and heritage character of these properties.

Staff recommend that City Council approve the proposed alterations to 650, 658 and 660 Broadview Avenue, and designate these properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

CONTACT

Sherry Pedersen, Program Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jennifer Keesmaat, MES, MCIP, RPP
Chief Planner & Executive Director
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 Location Map – 650, 658 & 660 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 2 Proposed Site Plan – 650, 658 & 660 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 3 Proposed Plans – 650, 658 & 660 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 4 Proposed Elevations – 650, 658 & 660 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 5 Photograph – 650, 658 & 660 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 6 Rendering – 650, 658 & 660 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 7 Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) - 650 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 8 Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) - 658 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 9 Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) - 660 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 10 Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report - 650 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 11 Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report - 658 Broadview Avenue
- Attachment 12 Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report - 660 Broadview Avenue