Demolition of a Designated Heritage Property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District and Construction of a Replacement Structure – 3 Douglas Drive

Date: May 5, 2016

To: Toronto Preservation Board
   Toronto and East York Community Council

From: Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division

Wards: Ward 27 – Toronto Centre-Rosedale

Reference Number: P:\2016\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE16077

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the demolition of a designated non-contributing heritage property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act and the construction of a replacement structure.

The proposal is to demolish an existing 1-storey building and to construct a new 2-storey residence. The existing property has been evaluated as an "unrated" structure in the NRHCD, and as per the District Plan is not considered to be of national, provincial, citywide or contextual heritage significant and does not contribute to the heritage character of the heritage conservation district.
RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the demolition of the heritage building at 3 Douglas Drive, an "unrated" structure in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District, in accordance with Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act subject to the following:
   a. City Council approve the replacement structure for 3 Douglas Drive as shown in the plans and elevations submitted by the applicant and prepared by Ruben and Associates, date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services on May 4, 2016 and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, and that the replacement structure be constructed substantially in accordance with the submitted plans;
   b. That prior to the issuance of any heritage permit for the property at 3 Douglas Drive including a demolition permit, but excluding permits for interior work, repairs and maintenance and usual and minor works for the existing heritage building as are acceptable to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the applicant provide the following to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services:
      i. photo documentation of the existing structure at 3 Douglas Drive; and
      ii. final building permit drawings for the replacement structure and a landscape plan consistent with the plans and elevations submitted by the applicant and prepared by Ruben and Associates date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services on May 4, 2016, and with the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Financial Impact
There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY
Council adopted the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) on September 30, 2004 (By-law 749-2004).


There have been no previous reports to Council regarding the property at 3 Douglas Drive under the Ontario Heritage Act.
BACKGROUND
Proposal
The property known as 3 Douglas Drive is located within the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) and at the time the heritage conservation district study was undertaken, was evaluated as an "unrated" property (Attachment Nos. 1 and 2). The proposal is to demolish the existing 1-storey stucco building and to construct a new 2-storey brick and stone residence.

Policy Framework
OPA 199
The revised heritage policies in the City of Toronto's Official Plan provide the policy framework for heritage conservation in the City. The following Official Plan policy applies to heritage conservation districts and proposed new construction:

3.1.5.33: "Heritage Conservation Districts should be managed and conserved by approving only those alterations, additions, new development, demolitions, removals and public works in accordance with respective Heritage Conservation District plans."

North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) plan
As per the NRHCD plan, "unrated" buildings are "… not of national, provincial, citywide or contextual heritage significance and do not contribute to the heritage character of North Rosedale or they are buildings which are too recent to be accurately evaluated for their heritage value".

As per the district design guidelines, "demolition of an unreated building will generally be permissible if the replacement building, as shown in the building permit application, is acceptable under these guidelines and the zoning by-law". New buildings within the NRHCD should "contribute to and not detract from the variety and heritage character of the district", and they "should be designed to be compatible with the heritage buildings" in the district "in terms of scale, massing, height, setback, and entry level".

COMMENTS
Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) staff have reviewed a proposal for the demolition of the existing house and for a proposed new house at 3 Douglas Drive against the guidelines of the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) Plan.

HPS staff raised concerns about the overall massing of the house as viewed from the street, in particular, the large roof form, the garage, window proportions and material selection. The owner has agreed to a number of changes to the primary elevation including, setting the central entry bay forward with the massing of the rest of the house stepping back in two stages on either side of the bay. Windows were modified to reflect classical proportions and the garage is stepped back with windows introduced above the doors to further reduce visual impact from the street. The central plan layout, eave line and roof form are similar to that of houses along Douglas Drive and the exterior cladding
materials including stone and brick are typical of materials used in the District (Attachment Nos. 2 and 3).

For these reasons, HPS supports the application to demolish the existing unrated property and recommends approval of the proposed replacement structure as it is consistent with the guidelines of the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) Plan and will be an appropriate addition to the existing streetscape of Douglas Drive.

CONTACT
Sherry Pedersen, Program Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

____________________________
Jennifer Keesmaat, MES, MCIP, RPP
Chief Planner and Executive Director
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS
Attachment 1: Location Map
Attachment 2: Photographs of existing house
Attachment 3: Drawings of proposed replacement building