ATTACHMENT NO. 9

HERITAGE PROPERTY RESEARCH AND EVALUATION REPORT



HAMILTON BREWING ASSOCIATION BUILDING 78 ONTARIO STREET, TORONTO

Prepared by:

Heritage Preservation Services City Planning Division City of Toronto

September 2016

1. DESCRIPTION



Above: principal (east) elevation of the Hamilton Brewing Association Building on Ontario Street; cover: east and south elevations on Ontario Street and Richmond Street East, respectively (Heritage Preservation Services, 2016)

78 Ontario Street: Hamilton Brewing Association Building		
ADDRESS	78 Ontario Street (northwest corner of Richmond Street	
	East) ¹	
WARD	Ward 28 (Toronto Centre-Rosedale)	
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	Plan 124, Part Lot 1	
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	Queen and Sherbourne Neighbourhood	
HISTORICAL NAME	Hamilton Brewing Association Building	
CONSTRUCTION DATE	1917	
ORIGINAL OWNER	Hamilton Brewing Association	
ORIGINAL USE	Industrial (warehouse)	
CURRENT USE*	Commercial	
	* This does not refer to permitted use(s) as defined by the	
	Zoning By-law	
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	Hand Harris and Merritt, architects	
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS	Brick cladding with brick, stone and wood trim	
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	Edwardian Classicism	
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	See Section 2	
CRITERIA	Design/Physical, Historical/Associative & Contextual	
HERITAGE STATUS	Cultural Heritage Evaluation	
RECORDER	Heritage Preservation Services: Kathryn Anderson	
REPORT DATE	September 2016	

¹ The City of Toronto's street numbering system indicates that 78 Ontario Street is the confirmed municipal address for the property at the northwest corner of Ontario and Richmond streets, which also has a convenience or entrance address at 82 Ontario Street

2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the property at 78 Ontario Street, and applies evaluation criteria to determine whether it merits inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register and designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in Section 4 (Summary).

Key Date	Historical Event
1853	Plan 124 is registered on the former Town Lots in the area bounded by
	present-day Queen Street East (north), Sherbourne Street (west), Richmond
	Street East (south), and Ontario Street (east)
1858 and 1880	The inaugural fire insurance atlases (Boulton and Goad) illustrating Toronto
	show the first wood structures on the northwest corner of Ontario and
	Duchess (Richmond) streets
1903	The Hamilton Brewing Association is formed to hold the assets of four
	Ontario breweries
1911 July	The subject property remains occupied by house form buildings according to
1011 5	the tax assessment rolls
1911 Dec	The Hamilton Brewing Association receives a building permit for the
	warehouse at present-day 78 Ontario Street, identifying architect Havelock
1010 1 1	Elkins Hand of the Buffalo, New York firm of Hand Harris and Merritt
1912 July	The Hamilton Brewing Association's building is numbered at "152-154
1010	Duchess Street" and described as "unfinished" in the tax assessment rolls
1912	The Hamilton Brewing Association is the occupant at "82 Ontario Street"
	according to the City Directory for 1913 (with information dating to 1912),
1012 1 1	and the building is illustrated on the update to Goad's Atlas
1913 July	According to the tax assessment rolls, the Hamilton Brewing Association
	shares its new building with the Dominion Envelope Company (which
	remains the principal tenant in the neighbouring Newell Building (1911) at 90 Ontario Street)
1913-1914	The Home Furniture Company shares the premises with the Hamilton
1915-1914	Brewing Association, according to the City Directories and the tax
	assessment rolls
1923	The update to Goad's Atlas illustrates the Hamilton Brewing Association
1923	Building on the northwest corner of Ontario and Duchess (Richmond)
	streets, but shows the structure divided into two sections that are numbered
	separately on Ontario Street (east) and Duchess Street (south) ²
1925 June	Hygiene Products Limited is the main tenant in the building at 78 Ontario
1920 0 010	Street, where the Hamilton Brewing Association retains a "local office"
1930	Entrepreneur E. P. Taylor creates the Brewing Corporation of Ontario to
	acquire eight Ontario breweries, including those formerly held by the
	Hamilton Brewing Association
1937	Taylor renames the business Canadian Breweries Limited
1939	At the beginning of World War II, archival documents record the Railway

i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

² The north part is occupied by the building at 84 Ontario Street

	and Engineering Specialities Company at 78 Ontario Street as the main tenant to Canadian Breweries Limited
1943	The update to the 1921 Underwriters' Survey Bureau Atlas shows the "factory" at 78 Ontario Street, with the "machine shop" labelled at 84 Ontario (the information remains unchanged on the 1965 update)
1949	Archival documents indicate that junk dealers Samuel and Morris Climans own and occupy the property at 78 Ontario Street, sharing the premises with bottles and plastic importers who remain the tenants two decades later

ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Queen and Sherbourne Neighbourhood

The property at 78 Ontario Street is located in the area southeast of the intersection of Queen Street East and Sherbourne Street with Moss Park on the north, Corktown to the southeast and Old Town directly south. Following the founding in 1793 of York (Toronto), a ten-block townsite was established between present-day Front, George, Adelaide and Berkeley Street. Queen Street was laid out as Lot Street, separating Old Town and its environs from the park lots to the north where government and military officials established country estates, including "Moss Park." The 1797 Plan for the expansion of the Town of York (with information transcribed in Image 2) illustrated the "town lots" south of present-day Queen Street East, but the development of the tracts was delayed when the community expanded westward as New Town.

Historical maps and atlases (including those attached in Section 6) trace the development of the Queen and Sherbourne neighbourhood from the 19th century when it contained a mixture of residential and commercial buildings that were replaced in the early 20th century by factories and warehouses, including the property at 78 Ontario Street, as Richmond Street East (formerly Duchess Street) became part of the industrial district extending westward from the Don River.

78 Ontario Street

The subject property at 78 Ontario Street occupies a portion of the town lot originally acquired by William Cooper in the late 18th century and subdivided with the adjacent lands under Plan 124 in 1853.³ Five years later when the first fire insurance atlas depicted Toronto, Lot 1 adjoining the northwest corner of present-day Ontario and Richmond streets contained small wood structures that, according to the city directories, included house form and commercial buildings. The status of the property at present-day 78 Ontario Street remained unchanged until the early 1900s when the Hamilton Brewing Association purchased the corner site.

³ The contributions of early settler William Cooper to the development of York and Toronto are described in <u>http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/cooper_william_1840_7E.html</u>. Plan 124 was registered by George William Allan, who is best remembered as the founder of Allan Gardens

The Hamilton Brewing Association was founded in 1903 to control the assets of four Ontario breweries, including Grant's Spring Brewery, one of the largest in Hamilton, Ontario. The organization weathered the prohibition era in Ontario that followed World War I before it was absorbed by the Brewing Corporation of Ontario, which was created by the famed Canadian entrepreneur, E. P. Taylor, and renamed Canadian Breweries Limited in 1937.

The Hamilton Brewing Association received a building permit for a warehouse at the northwest corner of present-day Ontario and Richmond streets in December 1911, with the structure in place by the close of the following year (Image 6). While the owners occupied part of the building, during World War I the Home Furnishings Company rented the remainder of the premises. By 1925, Hygiene Products Limited began an extended tenancy that lasted until the World War II era when the Railway and Engineering Specialities Limited became the main occupant. After the latter conflict, Samuel and Morris Climans acquired the property where they operated their junk business and rented space in the building to a group of manufacturers and wholesalers who remained the tenants until the late 20th century.

Hand Harris and Merritt, Architects

The Hamilton Brewing Association Building was designed by the Buffalo, New York architectural firm of Hand Harris and Merritt, led by Havelock Elkins Hand (1860-1918) in partnership with Thomas W. Harris and Aaron R. Merritt. During the trio's short-lived practice that was dissolved following the outbreak of World War I, they "executed some of the most distinctive terra cotta buildings in Ontario for H. L. Bowles, owner of the Bowles Lunch Company restaurant chain."⁴ Hand was based in Toronto beginning in 1908, after which his firm received the commission for the subject building. According to Hand's profile in <u>The Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada, 1800-1950</u>, the Hamilton Brewing Association Building is Hand Harris and Merritt's only surviving project in Toronto.

iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

Current photographs of the property at 78 Ontario Street are found on the cover and in Sections 2 and 6 of this report. The Hamilton Brewing Association Building is a modest example of Edwardian Classical styling, which was popular for all building types in the early 20th century in reaction against the extravagant architecture of the late Victorian era. Edwardian Classicism is identified by its simple balanced design with symmetricallyplaced door and window openings and restrained classical detailing. The style is displayed on the Hamilton Brewing Association Building in the red brickwork with little embellishment, the symmetrical placement of the door and window openings, and the parapets along the roofline overlooking Ontario Street.

⁴ <u>http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/236</u>, unpaged

The Hamilton Brewing Association Building rises three stories on a rectangular-shaped plan beneath a flat roof with parapets at the east end. The structure is clad with red brick and trimmed with brick, stone and wood, including the wood sash windows in some of the openings. The principal (east) elevation on Ontario Street is organized into three symmetrical bays, with an additional narrower bay at the north end. Above the first (ground) floor shopfronts (which have been altered over time as illustrated in the archival photographs in Section 6), the end bays project slightly and contain large flat-headed tripartite window openings, while the centre bay boasts trios of segmental-arched window openings. The north bay on the east elevation contains segmental-arched window openings, which are repeated on the three-bay south elevation facing Richmond Street East. An entrance with a segmental-arched surround and wood doors is placed in the west bay of the south elevation. The north wall has small segmental-arched window openings, which are visible above the single-storey building at 84 Ontario Street.⁵ The rear (west) wall of the Hamilton Brewing Association abuts the Newell Building (1917) at 410 Richmond Street East.

iv. CONTEXT

The maps attached as Image 1 show the location of the subject building anchoring the northwest corner of Ontario and Richmond streets. The Hamilton Brewing Association Building is adjoined to the north and west by the complex developed by Newell Buildings Limited for the Dominion Envelope Company during the World War I era, with the factories and warehouse at 90 Ontario Street (1911), 410 Richmond Street East (1917) and 384 Richmond Street East (1925, with later additions). On the opposite (southwest) corner of Ontario and Richmond streets, the Gendron Manufacturing Company Building (1894) at 411 Richmond Street East is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

3. EVALUATION CHECKLIST

The following evaluation applies <u>Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario</u> <u>Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest</u>. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

Design or Physical Value

i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, **X** material or construction method

⁵The two-storey building attached to the north wall of Hamilton Brewing Association Building has a separate municipal address at 84 Ontario Street and, according to archival records, was built as the machine shop for the latter complex. The changes to the openings in the first (ground) floor have affected its integrity, and it is not identified as having cultural heritage value

ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

Representative Example of a Style and Type – The property at 78 Ontario Street has cultural heritage value for the design of the Hamilton Brewing Association Building as an early 20th century industrial building with Edwardian Classical styling. Its simple balanced design with the red brick cladding, the symmetrical arrangement of the door and window openings, and the restrained classical detailing incorporating stepped parapets along the east roofline are identified with Edwardian Classicism, the most popular style for all building types in the World War I era. With its scale and appearance, the Hamilton Brewing Association Building is part of a collection of early 20th century factories and warehouses adjoining the intersection of Ontario and Richmond streets.

Historical or Associative Value	
i. direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or	
institution that is significant to a community	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	N/A
understanding of a community or culture	
iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	X
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

Architect - The Hamilton Brewing Association Building is valued for its historical associations with the architectural practice of Buffalo, New York architects, Hand Harris and Merritt, which designed it. With partner Havelock Elkins Hand based in Toronto, the firm was known for its design of terra cotta-clad buildings for the Bowles Lunch chain of restaurants in the 1920s, none of which remain extant. The Hamilton Brewing Association Building is rare as the last surviving documented building by Hand Harris and Merritt in Toronto.

Contextual Value	
i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	Х
ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	Х
iii. landmark	N/A

Character and Surroundings – Contextually, the value of the property at 78 Ontario Street is through its role in defining and supporting the character of the neighbourhood southeast of Queen and Sherbourne streets as it evolved in the early 20th century from its residential and commercial origins to an industrial district focused on Richmond Street East (originally Duchess Street). With its placement opposite the Gendron Manufacturing Company Building at 411 Richmond Street East (which is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act), and with the adjoining factory and warehouse complex built by the Newell Company at 90 Ontario Street and 384 and 410 Richmond Street East, the Hamilton Brewing Association Building is historically, visually and physically linked to its surroundings and remains a key component of the industrial enclave adjoining the intersection of Ontario and Richmond streets.

4. SUMMARY

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the Hamilton Brewing Association Building at 78 Ontario Street has cultural heritage value for its design, historical associations and context. As a representative example of an industrial building with Edwardian Classical styling from the World War I era that was commissioned and occupied by one of the first amalgamations of Ontario breweries, the Hamilton Brewing Association Building is a rare surviving project by the American architectural firm of Hand Harris and Merritt. Contextually, with the adjoining three-part complex developed by the Newell Company, the Hamilton Brewing Association Building contributes to the early 20th century industrial character of Richmond Street East in the neighbourhood southeast of Queen and Sherbourne streets where it is historically, visually, and physically linked to its setting in an industrial enclave adjoining the northwest corner of Ontario and Richmond streets.

5. SOURCES

Archival Sources

Abstract Indices of Deeds, Plan 124, Part Lot 1
Archival Photographs, City of Toronto Archives and Toronto Historical Board (individual citations in Section 6)
Assessment Rolls, City of Toronto, Ward 2, Division 1B, 1905 ff.
Boulton, Historical Atlas of the City of Toronto, 1858
Building Permit #31973, December 12, 1911, City of Toronto Archives
Building Records, City of Toronto, Toronto and East York, 1943 ff.
City of Toronto Directories, 1905 ff.
Goad's Atlases, 1884-1923
Underwriters' Survey Bureau of Canada Atlases, Vol. 1, 1921 revised to 1943, and 1965

Secondary Sources

Arthur, Eric, <u>Toronto: No Mean City</u>, 3rd ed. revised by Stephen A. Otto, 1986
Blumenson, John, <u>Ontario Architecture</u>, 1990
"Bowles Lunch," <u>https://losttoronto2.wordpress.com/tag/bowles-lunch/</u>
"Havelock Elkins Hand," entry in <u>Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada</u>, <u>1800-1950</u>, <u>http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/236</u>
Lumsden, Liz, <u>The Estates of Old Toronto</u>, 1997
McHugh, Patricia, <u>Toronto Architecture: A City Guide</u>, 2nd ed., 1989
Robertson, J. R., <u>Landmarks of Toronto</u>, Vol. 1, 1894

6. IMAGES – maps and atlases are followed by archival images and current photographs. The **arrows** mark the location of the property at 78 Ontario Street. All maps are oriented with north on the top.



 Location Maps, 78 Ontario Street: showing the setting of the Hamilton Brewing Association Building anchoring the northwest corner of Ontario Street and Richmond Street East and its context in relation to the adjoining industrial complex composed of the Newell Building (1911) at 90 Ontario Street, the Newell Building Annex at 410 Richmond Street East beside the subject property and, to its left (west), the Dominion Envelope Company Building at 384 Richmond Street East (City of Toronto Property Data Map and www.bing.com/maps).





2. <u>Historical Maps and Atlases, 1797 and 1858:</u> showing the subject property when it was part of a town lot north of the original Town of York (above), and occupied by wood-clad structures on the first fire insurance atlas for the City of Toronto (below) (Landmarks of Toronto, Vol. 1, 1894, and Boulton, 1858).





3. <u>Goad's Fire Insurance Atlases, 1880 and 1903:</u> showing the property on the first Goad's atlas illustrating the neighbourhood (above), and over 20 years later (below) when it was still occupied by wood-clad structures.



4. <u>Goad's Atlas, 1910 revised to 1912 and 1923:</u> showing the Hamilton Brewing Association Building when it was addressed at "150 Duchess Street" (above) and, on the update, labelled 78 and 82 Ontario Street and 152 Duchess Street. The 1923 update corrects the map to show the subject building separate from the adjoining structure at present-day 84 Ontario Street (which was identified as a "machine shop" on later atlases).



5. <u>Underwriters' Survey Bureau Atlases, 1921 revised to 1943 (above) and 1965</u> (below): showing the factory at 78 Ontario Street, with the adjoining "machine shop" at 84 Ontario Street.

No.	7.53		Piez No.
			Lat He.
	Toronto,	DBC /2 10	191
	Per	mit granted to	
Mr. The	Howillia	Burning	asin Homilto
To crect a	1ston 1	up Word	lower
	1		
		1 0	-1 -1
Statement of the second s			utour sta
Architect	H- E Har	d	
Builder			
Cost of Buildi	ng, \$ 10,00	nr	and the line of the second
Plans and Spe			
io. of Block P	lan		1
NO. OF DIOCK I		Water	

6. <u>Building Permit 31973, December 12, 1911:</u> issued to the Hamilton Brewing Association for the "brick warehouse" at present-day 78 Ontario Street (City of Toronto Archives).



7. <u>Archival Photograph, Ontario Street, 1960:</u> showing the Hamilton Brewing Company Building at 78 Ontario Street (right), left of the sign reading "McAlpine Pattern Works" (City of Toronto Archives, Series 372, Item 372).



8. <u>Archival Photographs, 78 Ontario Street, 1973:</u> showing the east elevation of the Hamilton Brewing Association facing Ontario Street (top), part of the north elevation, which is visible above the low-rise addition at 84 Ontario Street (centre), and the context of the building on the northwest corner of Ontario and Richmond streets (bottom) (Toronto Historical Board).



9. <u>Archival Photograph, Ontario Street north of Adelaide Street East, 1973:</u> showing the Hamilton Brewing Association Building marked by the arrow in its context at the intersection of Ontario and Richmond streets where the Gendron Manufacturing Company Building (1894) at 411 Richmond Street East (left) anchors the southwest corner (Toronto Historical Board).



10. <u>Archival Photograph, Bowles Lunch, Queen and Bay Streets, Toronto, 1928:</u> showing one of the Bowles Lunch locations in Toronto by the Buffalo, New York architectural partnership of Hand Harris and Merritt, which designed the Hamilton Brewing Association Building. The firm's projects for Bowles Lunch remain their best known work, but are no longer extant (City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 1244, Item 7361).





11. <u>Current Photographs, 78 Ontario Street, 2016</u>: showing the location of the Hamilton Brewing Association Building anchoring the northwest corner of Ontario and Richmond streets (above), and the south elevation on Richmond Street East (below) (Heritage Preservation Services).





12. <u>Current Photographs, 78 Ontario Street, 2016</u>: showing the context of the Hamilton Brewing Association Building looking north on Ontario Street from Richmond Street East (above), and the adjoining low-rise building at 84 Ontario Street that is historically related to the subject property, but has been extensively altered (below) (Heritage Preservation Services).