



Toronto Parking Authority – Results of Follow-up of Previous Audit Recommendations

Date: May 23, 2017

To: The Board of Directors of the Toronto Parking Authority

From: Auditor General

Wards: All

SUMMARY

The Auditor General's Office conducts an annual follow-up review of the implementation status of recommendations contained in previously issued audit reports.

This report provides the status of the implementation of the audit recommendations included in the report entitled "Toronto Parking Authority Pay and Display Parking Operations - Review of Revenue, Expenditure and Procurement Practices" dated May 15, 2009. The May 2009 audit report contained 16 recommendations. In our prior follow-up reviews, we determined that 11 recommendations had been fully implemented and four were no longer applicable. During the current follow-up process, the one remaining recommendation was assessed as fully implemented. This recommendation is listed in Attachment 1.

The follow-up reviews for the following two Toronto Parking Authority audit reports will be completed in 2018:

- Toronto Parking Authority – Phase 1: Audit of Real Estate Activities, October 2015
- Toronto Parking Authority – Phase 2: Audit of the Revenue Operations of Off-Street Controlled Facilities, January 2016

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. The Board of Directors of the Toronto Parking Authority receive this report for information.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There is no financial impact resulting from receipt of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The results of the Auditor General's review of the Toronto Parking Authority Pay and Display Parking Operations - Review of Revenue, Expenditure and Procurement Practices was presented to the Board of Directors of the Toronto Parking Authority on May 15, 2009 and to the City's Audit Committee on October 28, 2009. The audit report is available at:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-22024.pdf>

The results of our previous follow-up review is available at:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2016/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-94493.pdf>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The follow-up of outstanding recommendations is required by Government Auditing Standards. Following up on outstanding recommendations from previous audit reports is important as it ensures that management has taken appropriate action to implement the recommendations. The Auditor General reports to the Board of Directors and the City's Audit Committee each year on the implementation status of outstanding recommendations.

In accordance with the Auditor General's Work Plan, we have completed a review of the status of outstanding audit recommendations from the May 15, 2009 audit report on Pay and Display Parking Operations of the Toronto Parking Authority.

We conducted this follow-up audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

COMMENTS

The follow-up review process requires that management provide the Auditor General with a written response regarding the implementation status of each audit recommendation. Where management indicates that recommendations have been implemented, audit work is conducted by audit staff to ensure the accuracy of management assertions.

Table 1 represents the results of our current follow-up on audit recommendations for the Review of the Pay and Display Parking Operations of the Toronto Parking Authority.

Table 1: Results of the Current Review

Report Title and Date	Total No. of Recs.	Previously Reported as		Results of Current Review		
		Fully Implemented	Not Applicable	Fully Implemented	Not Fully Implemented	Not Applicable
Toronto Parking Authority Pay and Display Parking Operations - Review of Revenue, Expenditure and Procurement Practices	16	11	4	1	0	0

In our prior follow-up reviews, we determined that of the 16 recommendations included in the 2009 audit report, 11 had been fully implemented and four were no longer applicable. During the current follow-up process, the one remaining recommendation was assessed as fully implemented. This recommendation is listed in Attachment 1.

A consolidated report on the implementation status of outstanding recommendations from previous audit reports that relate to the City's Agencies and Corporations will be issued by the Auditor General and tabled at the June meeting of the City's Audit Committee. The implementation status of the audit recommendations from the "Toronto Parking Authority Pay and Display Parking Operations - Review of Revenue, Expenditure and Procurement Practices" dated May 15, 2009 will be included in that report.

The follow-up review for audit recommendations contained in the report "Toronto Parking Authority – Phase 1: Audit of Real Estate Activities" dated October 2015" will be conducted in 2018 at the same time as the scheduled review of audit recommendations in the report "Toronto Parking Authority – Phase 2: Audit of the Revenue Operations of Off-Street Controlled Facilities dated January 2016.

CONTACT

Ina Chan, Assistant Auditor General

Tel: 416-392-8472, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: Ina.Chan@toronto.ca

Akrivi Nicolaou, Acting Senior Audit Manager

Tel: 416-392-0057, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-Mail: Akrivi.Nicolaou@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Beverly Romeo-Beehler
Auditor General

ATTACHMENT

Attachment 1: Toronto Parking Authority Audit Recommendation – Fully Implemented

Attachment 1

TORONTO PARKING AUTHORITY AUDIT RECOMMENDATION - FULLY IMPLEMENTED

**Report Title: Toronto Parking Authority Pay and Display Parking Operations -
Review of Revenue, Expenditure and Procurement Practices**
Report Date: 05/15/2009

No.	Recommendation
3.	<p>The President of the Toronto Parking Authority, in consultation with legal counsel, take appropriate steps to execute a formal data and management services agreement, ensuring adequate terms and conditions are provided, including</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. access to vendor program source codes essential to the operation of pay and display equipment, in the event of vendor insolvencyb. defined service levels and standards, including criteria and measures for non-performance subject to penaltyc. TPA ability to obtain potential financial benefits should the vendor market the product to other clients.