

2016 Voting Results and Funding Allocations for Participatory Budgeting Pilot

Date: December 19, 2016

To: Budget Committee

From: City Manager

Wards: 33, 35, and 12

SUMMARY

2016 is the second year of a three-year Participatory Budgeting Pilot Project. This pilot project is being evaluated in three neighbourhoods: Oakridge (Ward 35), Rustic (Ward 12), and across all of Ward 33. In the pilot, residents propose, develop and vote on local community improvement projects. Each community has up to \$250,000 to spend on capital projects on City-owned property. This year's votes concluded in December and residents from these three neighbourhoods selected a total of 16 community projects at a total cost of \$730,000.

This report authorizes the Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer to fund the cost of these community improvements in the amount of \$545,000 gross, \$0 debt from the Parkland Acquisition Reserve Fund, and \$185,000 gross, \$0 debt from the Public Realm Reserve Fund.

City staff will continue to carry out the pilot project through 2017 and will report to City Council in 2018 with a comprehensive evaluation and recommendations for future participatory budgeting in Toronto.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Manager recommends that:

1. City Council authorize the Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer to adjust the following 2017 Preliminary Capital Budgets to fund the 16 Participatory Budgeting pilot projects detailed below:

- a. The Parks, Forestry and Recreation 2017 Preliminary Capital Budget be increased by \$545,000 gross, \$0 debt for:

- the following (Oakridge, Ward 33) PB projects to be funded from Account XR2207 Parkland Acquisition - North District Local Development Reserve Fund at a cost of \$150,000 gross, \$0 debt:

- Fitness Track at Linus Park - \$100,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- New Water Bottle-Filling Stations - \$20,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Ping Pong Table in Bellbury Park - \$10,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- New Benches in Parkway Forest Park - \$20,000 gross, \$0 debt;

- the following (Ward 35) PB projects to be funded from Account XR2205 Parkland Acquisition - East District Local Development Reserve Fund at a cost of \$160,000 gross, \$0 debt:

- Performance Stage in Oakridge Park - \$75,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Walking/Running Path in Local Park - \$75,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Upgrade Prairie Drive Playground - \$10,000 gross, \$0 debt;

- the following Ward 12 PB projects to be funded from Account XR2203 Parkland Acquisition - West District Local Development Reserve Fund at a cost of \$235,000 gross, \$0 debt:

- New Water Bottle-Filling Stations - \$20,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Movie Wall in Maple Leaf Park - \$35,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- New Lighting in Maple Leaf Park - \$75,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Ping Pong Table in Rustic Park - \$10,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Gazebo in Rustic Park - \$75,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Chess Tables in Rustic Park - \$20,000 gross, \$0 debt.

b. The Transportation Services 2017 Preliminary Capital Budget be increased by \$185,000 gross, \$0 debt for the following projects to be funded from Account XR1410 - Public Realm Reserve Fund:

- Mural on Pharmacy Avenue Underpass - \$90,000 gross, \$0 debt;
- Ward 33 Butterfly Garden - \$75,000 gross, \$0 debt; and
- Improved Pedestrian Safety and Accessibility Around Bellbury and Lescon Parks - \$20,000 gross, \$0 debt.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Approval of the recommendations of this report will result in an increase of \$730,000 to the 2017 Preliminary Capital Budget for Parks, Forestry and Recreation (\$545,000) and Transportation Services (\$185,000).

This increased capital investment will be fully funded through draws from the following Reserve Funds: XR2207 Parkland Acquisition - North District Local Development Reserve Fund (\$150,000); XR2205 Parkland Acquisition - East District Local Development Reserve Fund (\$160,000); XR2203 Parkland Acquisition - West District Local Development Reserve Fund (\$235,000); and XR1410 - Public Realm Reserve Fund (\$185,000).

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

The City Manager reported on the 2015 pilot project experience, in which residents voted for seven community improvement projects at a total cost of \$435,000. On February 17, 2016, City Council adopted the 2016 Capital and Operating Budgets (EX12.2), which authorized the City Manager to extend the Participatory Budgeting pilot for two additional years, provide each area up to \$250,000 each year, and add a temporary staff position in the City Manager's Office to implement the pilot program. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2016.EX12.2>

At its March 10, 2015 meeting, City Council adopted the 2015 Capital and Operating Budgets (EX3.4), which included consideration of the City Manager's report 2015 Participatory Budgeting (PB) pilot. City Council authorized the City Manager to undertake a Participatory Budgeting pilot project in Ward 33 and the neighbourhoods of Rustic (in Ward 12) and Oakridge (in Ward 35), with each receiving up to \$150,000 in capital funding. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.EX3.4>

COMMENTS

Participatory Budgeting (PB) is an engagement process where City residents propose and vote on community investment projects. These projects are funded through a pre-determined portion of a municipal budget.

Summary of the 2016 PB process

The City Manager's Office coordinates the PB pilot in collaboration with local councillors and Parks Forestry and Recreation, Social Development Finance and Administration, Transportation Services, Toronto Public Health and Strategic Communications. Key components of the PB pilot in 2016 included:

- **Community outreach, engagement and information (June-September 2016)** City staff promoted PB and encouraged participation by reaching out to residents and community networks through social media, a website and printed materials distributed through summer camps, at community centres and events, and mailed to all households.
- **Idea brainstorming (September 2016)** Community meetings and an online portal invited residents to discuss and suggest community improvement projects for potential PB funding. Approximately 140 residents attended a total of eight meetings and contributed over 300 ideas for consideration.
- **Proposal development and shortlisting (October 2016)** City staff reviewed all ideas against PB eligibility criteria - for example, potential projects needed to cost \$250,000 or less, be fundable through the capital budget and be located on City-owned property - and brought feasible ideas back to each community for discussion. Residents selected 8-10 projects to appear on each area ballot for voting. The

ballots were posted online and information distributed through community newspapers in advance of the voting dates. Ideas not selected for the ballot were forwarded to the local councillor and appropriate City divisions for consideration.

- **Voting (November-December 2016)** Two voting dates were held in each pilot area. Anyone 14 years or older who lived in the pilot area could choose up to three projects from a ballot. A total of 780 people cast votes for PB projects.

2016 Voting Results

Residents selected 16 projects with a total cost of \$730,000. The results are described in Table 1.

This report recommends that City Council authorize the Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer to fund the projects in Table 1 from the appropriate capital funding source.

Table 1: Final 2016 PB Projects by Area, Total Ballots and Total Votes 1

<p>Ward 33: Total Ballots: 653 / Total Votes: 1,959 / Total cost: \$245,000</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ward 33 Butterfly Garden (\$75,000) A naturalized butterfly garden will be created on the northeast corner of Buchan Court and Sheppard Avenue East, close to the North York General Seniors Health Centre, condominiums and Dallington Park.• Fitness Track in Linus Park (\$100,000) An accessible rubberized or gravel track in Linus Park will replace a worn foot path.• Improved Pedestrian Safety and Accessibility around Bellbury and Lescon Parks (\$20,000) Curb cuts and signage will be installed where park pathways cross several streets.• New Water Bottle-Filling Stations (\$20,000) Existing water fountains will be replaced with water bottle-filling stations in two or three parks.• Ping-Pong Table in Bellbury Park (\$10,000) An outdoor concrete ping-pong table will be installed.• New Benches in Parkway Forest Park (\$20,000) Four or five new benches will be installed in Parkway Forest Park.

1 Residents were invited to vote for up to three of the projects on the ballot.

Oakridge: Total Ballots: 75 / Total Votes: 206 / Total cost: \$250,000

- **Performance Stage in Oakridge Park (\$75,000)**
A covered performance space for community events and art programs. Space is limited in Oakridge Park so its location would be based on considerations such as available lighting and distance from homes due to noise.
- **Mural on Pharmacy Avenue Underpass (\$90,000)**
A painted mural would beautify the space and images can reflect cultures and history of local area to create pride, neighbourhood connections and inspiration. The exact location and artwork would be determined through a community consultation coordinated by Street Art Toronto.
- **Walking / Running Path (\$75,000)**
A rubberized path in a local park would encourage physical activity. The location and details of the path will be determined in consultation with the community.
- **Upgrade Prairie Drive Park Playground (\$10,000)**
Replace one of the existing swings and make the playground more accessible for children with limited mobility.

Rustic: Total Ballots: 52 / Total Votes: 150 / Total cost: \$235,000

- **New Water Bottle-Filling Stations (\$20,000)**
Existing water fountains will be replaced with water bottle-filling stations in Falstaff Community Centre and two local parks.
- **Movie Wall in Maple Leaf Park (\$35,000)**
A movie wall and minor landscaping will create a space for public events and movie showings.
- **New lighting in Maple Leaf Park (\$75,000)**
Four or five new light posts will be installed in Maple Leaf Park.
- **Ping-Pong Table in Rustic Park (\$10,000)**
An outdoor concrete ping-pong table will be installed.
- **Gazebo in Rustic Park (\$75,000)**
A shaded gathering place with tables and seating will be installed.
- **Chess tables in Rustic Park (\$20,000)**
Two outdoor chess tables and seating will be erected in Rustic Park.

Project Implementation

The City seeks to complete the selected PB projects within 12 to 18 months of the vote, to align with capital budgeting and spending timelines. Parks Forestry and Recreation will coordinate design and installation of PB projects on parkland, and Transportation

Services-Public Realm will lead implementation of projects on sidewalks and other public spaces. The City Manager's Office will communicate progress of project implementation to residents via the PB website and social media feeds. The success in meeting implementation timelines is being evaluated as part of the pilot project.

Project Evaluation

The City is evaluating the PB pilot project throughout its implementation to consider its success and options for future participatory budgeting initiatives in Toronto. Participation rates, idea types, projects supported, impact on civic engagement and community empowerment are all being examined through surveys and interviews with participants, City divisions and stakeholder organizations. The City Manager will report on the PB pilot results, its evaluation and recommendations to City Council in 2018.

CONTACT

Todd Orvitz, Director, Corporate Policy, Strategic and Corporate Policy, 416.392.6783,
Todd.Orvitz@toronto.ca

Stephen Conforti, Director, Financial Planning, 416.397.0958,
Stephen.Conforti@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Peter Wallace
City Manager