



Toronto Fire Services Diversity, Recruitment and Inclusion Plan Update

Date: To:	May 24, 2017 Community Development and Recreation Committee
From:	Fire Chief and General Manager, Toronto Fire Services
Wards:	All

SUMMARY

This report responds to a request from City Council for the Fire Chief and General Manager to report on the feasibility and implications of establishing a hiring benchmark for Toronto Fire Services (TFS) that reflects Toronto demographics. This report also responds to a request from the Community Development and Recreation Committee for information related to designated groups in TFS, designated groups and Toronto residents in the current class of firefighter recruits, and the feasibility of including Equity, Diversity and Human Rights Division (EDHR) staff in the screening and interview process for all future new recruits. Further, a summary of improvement actions implemented to date and ongoing and planned improvement initiatives is provided.

Numerous significant improvements and enhancements have been made to key TFS outreach, recruitment and data collection processes since May 2016. As a direct result of these improvements and enhancements, TFS Operations Recruit Class 2017-01, is the most diverse in TFS history, with 48 per cent of recruits self-identifying as members of a Designated Group. This class of 42 recruit Operations Firefighters are in the process of completing their training and are expected to graduate from the Toronto Fire Academy on June 15, 2017.

TFS will continue to proactively analyze each aspect of the TFS recruitment process in order to monitor progress of recruitment and outreach strategies and other process improvements, such that diversity and inclusion are maximized in all future TFS recruit processes.

The establishment of formal TFS diversity benchmarks or precise targets does not align with the goals and objectives of the City of Toronto's Employment Equity Policy and is therefore not recommended by HR, EDHR nor TFS. Rather, a number of initiatives to identify and remove barriers have been implemented as part of major recruitment process improvements across TFS. Further, equity and diversity are now and will remain top priorities in the TFS recruitment process.

TFS Update: Diversity, Recruitment and Inclusion [cd17009]

The goal of attracting, recruiting and retaining highly qualified applicants that are reflective of communities served by TFS is a top priority. As outlined in the TFS Inclusion Plan framework, TFS remains committed to being a recognized leader in fire service inclusion, equity and diversity by building and maintaining a workforce that is welcoming and inclusive, comprised of highly trained professionals, and reflective of the community it serves.

TFS continues to work in collaboration with EDHR and HR as TFS outreach, recruitment and inclusion processes are developed and refined. Further, both EDHR and HR are working with TFS on the continuing development of the TFS Inclusion Plan.

Both EDHR and HR were consulted in the preparation of this report.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Fire Chief and General Manager, Toronto Fire Services, recommends that:

1. The Community Development and Recreation Committee receive this report for information.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of the recommendation in this report. Any financial implications associated with the development and implementation of the TFS Inclusion Plan and changes that may be implemented as highlighted in this report will be considered either through separate reporting to the Standing Committee, or considered as part of future year Capital and Operating Budget processes.

The Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

EQUITY IMPACT STATEMENT

The implementation of the Inclusion Plan is expected to lead to the identification and removal of barriers that qualified members of equity-seeking groups and vulnerable populations may face in accessing employment opportunities at Toronto Fire Services. The Plan pays particular attention to - but will not be limited to members of the four Designated Groups - women, Aboriginal Peoples, racialized/visible minorities, and persons with disabilities who have traditionally been excluded from a rightful share of society's economic opportunities and benefits. The Inclusion Plan supports the goals of the City's Talent Blueprint, the City's strategic workforce plan, of having "engaged, diverse, high-performing, adaptive and productive employees to meet our current and future needs." The long-term plan will be based in evidence and will be implemented with the guidance and support of EDHR and HR.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of March 28, 2017, City Council requested the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services provide a report on the feasibility and implications of establishing a hiring benchmark for TFS that reflects Toronto demographics. At its meeting of March 2, 2017, the Community Development and Recreation Committee requested the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services provide additional information including the breakdown of designated groups in TFS and in the current class.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2017.CD18.2

COMMENTS

TFS is committed to being a recognized leader in fire service inclusion, equity and diversity by building and maintaining a workforce that is welcoming and inclusive, comprised of highly trained professionals, and reflective of the community it serves. TFS continues to work with EDHR and HR. Both Divisions were consulted in the preparation of this report.

Feasibility and Implications of Benchmarks

The establishment of formal TFS diversity benchmarks or precise targets does not align with the goals and objectives of the City of Toronto's Employment Equity Policy and is therefore not recommended by HR, EDHR nor TFS. It is important however, to identify and understand the underrepresentation of Designated Groups, and then use this information to develop and implement strategies with the objective of closing the gaps. The overall objective will be a TFS workforce that is representative of the community it serves and the labour market availability.

In order to best inform the development of the TFS Inclusion Plan, EDHR and HR have recommended that TFS commission a comprehensive Employment Systems Review (ESR) by a qualified third-party. This will provide a comprehensive employment cycle review (retention, promotion, engagement, development, termination) and clearly define tasks, timelines, outcomes, success measures and deliverables. It will also identify any systemic barriers that may exist within the TFS recruitment process.

Completion of the ESR will inform the TFS Inclusion Plan and identify how TFS can best address gaps in representation of the Designated Groups, remove any barriers that may exist and focus on representative hiring, particularly in areas where there is significant under-representation. TFS will identify and include the funding required to undertake a comprehensive ESR in the 2018 TFS budget submission.

Work in the area of inclusive and equitable recruitment continues with the following initiatives:

- HR has developed an Inclusive Hiring Framework for the City. This framework will assist TFS in identifying opportunities to strengthen its diversity recruitment.
- EDHR and HR are in the process of developing corporate equity and diversity key performance indicators (KPIs). The emphasis will be on developing and implementing policies, strategies and programs that identify and remove employment barriers and monitor outcomes.
- The National Occupational Classification (NOCs) coding of City jobs, which is scheduled to be completed by HR and EDHR in 2017, will help TFS identify any significant gaps between labour market availability of designated group members and their occupational representation in TFS. EDHR will prioritize NOC coding of TFS positons. TFS will consult with EDHR and HR with respect to researching labour market availability of Designated Groups for job profiles.
- TFS and HR will continue to proactively analyze each aspect of the TFS recruitment process in order to monitor progress of recruitment and outreach strategies and other process improvements.

Designated Groups in TFS - Count Yourself In Survey (CYI Survey)

EDHR collects and manages Toronto Public Service workforce diversity data through the voluntary CYI survey. This survey provides up-to-date City-wide data and eliminates the need for individual Divisions to gather this data locally.

TFS Data from Pension Payroll and Employee Benefits (PPEB) as provided by EDHR is provided in Table 1. PPEB data includes all employees and is based on information contained in the City's payroll system. As noted in the City's payroll system, approximately over eight per cent of TFS employees are female.

CYI Survey results for TFS are summarized in Table 2, providing an overview of TFS staff in each of the Designated Groups as provided by EDHR. For detailed results, please refer to Attachments 1, 2 and 3.

The CYI Survey statistics are based on employees self-identifying as members of one of the Designated Groups and are calculated from the 71% of active TFS employees who responded to the voluntary survey. As per EDHR, 2,202 TFS employees have completed a CYI Survey.

This survey is optional and employees may choose to not respond to specific survey questions. In accordance with EDHR policy and to ensure confidentiality, CYI Survey statistics are reported in aggregates of 10 or more.

Table 1 - TFS Data from Pension Payroll and Employee Benefits (PPEB) (as provided by EDHR)

	Total Active	Active Female Emp	loyees
	Employees	#	% (of Total Employees)
Operations	2679	123	3.95%
Support Divisions	434	132	4.24%
Total	3113	255	8.19%

Table 2 - TFS Count Yourself In Survey Results (as provided by EDHR)

	TFS Respondent Data from the Count Yourself In Survey* (Voluntary; 2,202 active TFS staff responded & self-reported)						
	Female	Aboriginal Peoples	Persons With Disabilities	Members of Visible Minorities	LGBTQ2S		
Total	149	26	50	161	30		
Respondents (2,202)	6.77%	1.18%	2.27%	7.31%	1.36%		

*In accordance with EDHR policy and to ensure confidentiality, CYI Survey results are reported in aggregates of 10 or more. Disaggregated data is not shown in Table 2 as in some cases, fewer than ten employees self-identified as members of Designated Groups.

Designated Groups in the Current TFS Firefighter Recruit Class

The collection and comprehensive analysis of applicant and recruitment data is essential to identifying and understanding process performance along with any challenges that may compromise the ability to attract and recruit highly qualified and diverse talent. Accordingly, TFS and HR have implemented comprehensive recruitment process analytics that provide detailed information on each phase of the recruitment process. This allows TFS and HR to better understand where improvements can be made and informs ongoing community outreach initiatives and planning.

Since 2015, HR has been collecting data from applicants entering into and moving through the TFS Operations Firefighter recruitment process. Applicants now complete a Pre-Screening Questionnaire (PSQ) that forms part of the online application process for TFS positions. The PSQ provides applicants with the opportunity to voluntarily self-

identify with respect to being members of Designated Groups. HR and TFS have now incorporated this PSQ process into all TFS recruitment processes.

As a result of the improvements made to the TFS Operations Firefighter recruitment process and enhancements made in community outreach, the current TFS Operations Recruit Class (2017-01) is the most diverse recruit class in TFS history, with 20 of the 42 newly recruited Operations Firefighters (48 per cent) self-identifying as being members of a Designated Group. Designated Groups include those who identify as being female, Aboriginal, persons with disabilities and members of visible minorities.

Prior to the improvements and enhancements that have been implemented, the highest recruitment diversity rate in an Operations Firefighter Recruit Class was 33 per cent.

Toronto Residents - Applicants and Hiring

Information related to residency is retrieved by HR based on information collected in Talent Flow, the City's job applicant tracking system. TFS and HR will continue to monitor this data as focussed outreach efforts continue. However, implementing preferential or mandatory pre-requisite treatment based on being a City of Toronto resident is not recommended based on advice provided by Legal Services.

Table 3 provides a breakdown of Toronto residents in Operations Firefighter Recruit Classes in 2015 and 2016 as well as the current 2017 class.

	2015/20	016		2017					
	Total	Toronto Residents (number)	Toronto Residents (per cent)	Total	Toronto Residents (number)	Toronto Residents (per cent)			
Applicants	2,444	593	24%	630	120	19%			
Hired	241	73	30%	42	12	29%			

Table 3 - Toronto Residents in the 2015 to 2017 Operations Firefighters Recruit Class

On average, 30 per cent of all applicants hired since January 1, 2015 indicate they reside in the city of Toronto.

EDHR Involvement in Screening and Interview Processes For All New Hires

EDHR does not have sufficient staff resources to dedicate staff to work with TFS on screening or interview panels. Accordingly, EDHR is not engaged directly in the TFS interview panel process. However, EDHR continues to provide advice and guidance to both HR and TFS with regards to training materials and resources on best practices for inclusive recruitment.

Recruitment processes for frontline positions in TFS draw large numbers of applicants and are very competitive. While there has not been any growth within the Operations Division of TFS for many years, on average TFS hires approximately 100 staff each year to replace retiring Firefighters. Other recruitment entry points into TFS are far less frequent than in Operations and include Communications, Fire Prevention, Public Education, Mechanical, and Administration.

HR and TFS work together to manage TFS recruitment. A Human Resources Consultant is assigned to TFS on a full-time basis, providing dedicated support to assist with meeting the division's recruitment needs. All applications for job postings are processed and tracked through Talent Flow, the City's job applicant tracking system and the HR Consultant manages all aspects of TFS recruitment processes.

Additional support EDHR and HR will be providing to TFS includes:

- Providing TFS with hiring bulletins, best practices and research and ensure HR recruitment advisors highlight these communications when they engage with hiring managers;
- Providing regular workforce analyses reports; and,
- Participation on the Fire Chief's Advisory Council on Equity and Inclusion. The Council will leverage the expertise and perspective of stakeholders, community partners, and subject matter experts to oversee the implementation of the TFS Inclusion Plan.

Equity and Inclusion in Action - Summary of Recruitment Process Improvements Implemented Since May 2016

TFS continues to develop equity and inclusion strategies that are enabling TFS to better reflect the population we serve, and to enhance and expand the commitment to diversity, access, equity and inclusion. Attachment 4 provides a summary of key recruitment process improvements TFS has implemented since May 2016.

Inclusion and diversity is a top TFS priority. TFS remains committed to attracting and selecting the most qualified candidates and to building a workforce that is increasingly reflective of the communities we serve.

CONTACT

Toni Vigna, Division Chief Tel.: (416) 338-9550, E-mail: <u>Toni.Vigna@toronto.ca</u>

Mary Lorenzoni, Policy and Planning Advisor Tel.: (416) 338-9026, Email: <u>Mary.Lorenzoni@toronto.ca</u>

SIGNATURE

113

Matthew Pegg Fire Chief & General Manager Toronto Fire Services

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Toronto Fire Services Count Yourself In Survey - Responses for Designated Groups - Total

Attachment 2: Toronto Fire Services Count Yourself In Survey - Responses for Designated Groups - By Section

Attachment 3: Toronto Fire Services Count Yourself In Survey - Responses for Designated Groups - By Affiliation

Attachment 4: Summary of Recruitment Process Improvements Implemented Since May 2016

Attachment 1: Toronto Fire Services Count Yourself In Survey - Responses for Designated Groups - Total

Data as of: Tuesday April 18, 2017 Sources: SAP Ad Hoc Query and SAP HR Extract Prepared by: Workforce Reporting on April 19, 2017

2,202 of 3,113 active employees in Fires Services have completed a CYI survey (71%)

			PPEB Women		CYI Survey Responses									
	Division	All Employees			Wor	nen	Aborigina	l Peoples	Persor Disabi		Memb Visible M	ers of linorities	LGBT	rq2S
			Represe	entation	Represe	ntation	Represe	entation	Represe	entation	Represe	entation	Represe	ntation
		#	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
]	Fire Services	3,113	255	8.19%	149	4.79%	26	0.84%	50	1.61%	161	5.17%	30	0.96%

Notes:

- Percentages are of the whole group and are calculated as (Representation # / All Employees #)*100
- Includes all active employees whose base position is in Toronto Fire Services
- To ensure confidentiality, CYI Survey statistics are reported in aggregates of 10 or more, shown by an asterisk (*).
- Pension, Payroll and Employee Benefits (PPEB) data includes all employees and is based on information in the City's payroll system.
- The CYI Survey statistics are based on employees self-identifying as members of one of the Designated Groups and are calculated from the 71% of active TFS employees who responded to the survey.
- The survey is optional and employees may choose to not respond to specific survey questions.

Attachment 2: Toronto Fire Services Count Yourself In Survey - Responses for Designated Groups - By Section

Data as of: Tuesday April 18, 2017 Sources: SAP Ad Hoc Query and SAP HR Extract Prepared by: Workforce Reporting on April 19, 2017

2,202 of 3,113 active employees in Fires Services have completed a CYI survey (71%)

		PP	FB	CYI Survey Responses									
Section	All Employees	Women		Wor	nen	Aborigina	al Peoples		ns with ilities	Memb Visible M		LGB	rq2s
		Represe	entation	Represe	ntation	Represe	entation	Represe	entation	Represe	entation	Represe	ntation
	#	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Communications & Technology	87	40	46.0%	23	26.4%	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Fire Services	8	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Fire Svcs Administrative Services	51	36	70.6%	24	47.1%	*	*	*	*	17	33.3%	*	*
Fire Svcs Fire Prevention & Public Educ	202	47	23.3%	33	16.3%	*	*	*	*	13	6.4%	*	*
Fire Svcs Operations Command	2,679	123	4.6%	61	2.3%	21	0.8%	38	1.4%	116	4.3%	23	0.9%
Fire Svcs Prof Dev, Trng & Mech Mtce	86	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

Notes:

- Percentages are of the whole group and are calculated as (Representation # / All Employees #)*100
- Includes all active employees whose base position is in Toronto Fire Services
- To ensure confidentiality, CYI Survey statistics are reported in aggregates of 10 or more, shown by an asterisk (*).
- Pension, Payroll and Employee Benefits (PPEB) data includes all employees and is based on information in the City's payroll system.
- The CYI Survey statistics are based on employees self-identifying as members of one of the Designated Groups and are calculated from the 71% of active TFS employees who responded to the survey.
- The survey is optional and employees may choose to not respond to specific survey questions.

Attachment 3: Toronto Fire Services Count Yourself In Survey - Responses for Designated Groups - By Affiliation

Data as of: Tuesday April 18, 2017 Sources: SAP Ad Hoc Query and SAP HR Extract Prepared by: Workforce Reporting on April 19, 2017

2,202 of 3,113 active employees in Fires Services have completed a CYI survey (71%)

	РРЕВ		CYI Survey Responses										
Affiliation	All Employees	Women		Wor	nen	Aborigina	d Peoples	Person Disabi	is with		ers of linorities	LGB	rq2s
		Represe	entation	Represe	ntation	Represe	entation	Represe	entation	Represe	entation	Represe	ntation
	#	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Non-Union	64	23	35.9%	20	31.3%	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
L79 Full-time	30	26	86.7%	14	46.7%	*	*	*	*	10	33.3%	*	*
L3888 Firefighters	3,019	206	6.8%	115	3.8%	24	0.8%	47	1.6%	143	4.7%	29	1.0%

Notes:

- Percentages are of the whole group and are calculated as (Representation # / All Employees #)*100
- Includes all active employees whose base position is in Toronto Fire Services
- To ensure confidentiality, CYI Survey statistics are reported in aggregates of 10 or more, shown by an asterisk (*).
- Pension, Payroll and Employee Benefits (PPEB) data includes all employees and is based on information in the City's payroll system.
- The CYI Survey statistics are based on employees self-identifying as members of one of the Designated Groups and are calculated from the 71% of active TFS employees who responded to the survey.
- The survey is optional and employees may choose to not respond to specific survey questions.

Attachment 4: Summary of Recruitment Process Improvements Implemented Since May 2016

Item	Former Process/Service Level	Current and Improved Process/Service Level
Website	 Very limited employment information available. Complicated website navigation to obtain career information 	 Online application processes streamlined, simplified and clarified. Streamlined career information easily accessible on the TFS website. Website updated to showcase and celebrate TFS diversity.
Recruitment Outreach Materials	 Generic outreach materials; did not showcase diversity. 	 New career outreach materials developed to showcase and celebrate diversity. Required qualifications clearly outlined in new recruitment outreach materials.
Employment Information	 Employment qualifications not clearly and consistently communicated. 	 New job matrix is currently being finalized to better reflect qualifications required for entry level positions: firefighter, inspector, educator, call-taker/dispatcher and mechanic. Qualifications will be communicated on the TFS website.
Public Engagement /Recruitment Outreach	 One full time equivalent (FTE) allocated to recruitment outreach activities Limited recruitment outreach program 	 Increased capacity to conduct recruitment outreach with 24 Public Education staff trained to conduct recruitment outreach in addition to fire safety programming.

Item	Former Process/Service Level	Current and Improved Process/Service Level
Interview Panels	 HR staff not in attendance at recruit interviews. Interview panels did not reflect diversity. 	 Every interview panel is now led by an HR professional. Interview panels now promote a more inclusive interview environment. Implemented interview panel and candidate Conflict of Interest declaration processes, including Employment of Relatives Conflict of Interest processes.
TFS staff	 No clear communication to staff related to inclusion. 	 Clear messaging related to inclusion communicated to all staff. Launched Inclusion Plan Working Group composed of staff from all TFS internal divisions. Training and designation of 25 TFS senior staff as Positive Space Ambassadors.
Data and Metrics	 Limited and informal data collection related to diversity and recruitment processes. Only applicants for Operations Firefighter positions completed a Pre-Screening Questionnaire (PSQ). 	 Enhanced candidate analytics introduced into the OFAI Candidate Testing Process in response to recommendations made by TFS with further diversity-based enhancements ongoing. Implemented recruitment process analytics which provide detailed information on each phase of the recruitment process for all positions. Incorporated the PSQ into all divisional recruitment processes.

Item	Former Process/Service Level	Current and Improved Process/Service Level
	 Screening matrix was not updated and did not clearly delineate values of a modern and progressive fire service. 	 Introduction of enhanced diversity values in screening matrix, placing a clear value on diversity.
Recruit Selection and Second Screening Matrices (Operations Firefighter)	 Suppression firefighter skills experience and fitness. Preferred and assessed: Previous training and/or experience in fire suppression Previous training in a fire service role Emergency medical response training/experience (lifeguard, ambulance attendant, primary, advanced care or critical care paramedic, registered nurse etc.) Engagement in physical activity (self-directed, exercise facility membership, running/biking/hiking/swimming club membership, fitness instructor, competitive sports. 	• Deleted

Item	Former Process/Service Level	Current and Improved Process/Service Level
	 Technical/Mechanical skills and experience. Preferred and assessed: Mechanical/technical training and/or experience (electrical, plumbing, building, auto mechanics, hvac, construction, blue prints) Operating heavy vehicles Using technology as a communication tool (hand held mobile radio, base or multiband radio) Computer, technology training/experience (electronic or electrical systems, wiring, panels) Applying health and safety practices (WHIMIS, Health and Safety representative or instructor 	 Technical/Mechanical skills and experience. Prefer and assess: Training and experience in operating heavy vehicles
	 Transferable Soft Skills. Preferred and assessed: Customer service experience (experience in a public service role, police officer, TTC operator) Language skills/fluency (French, Cantonese, Mandarin, Portuguese, Tagalog, Spanish, Italian, Sign Language) Experience working in a team environment (member of a sports team, multiple teams, team leader) Experience working in a military/paramilitary environment 	 Transferable Soft Skills. Prefer and assess: Ability to communicate in multiple languages

ltem	Former Process/Service Level	Current and Improved Process/Service Level
	 Community Engagement. Preferred and assessed: Volunteer activities (social/civil/community events and initiatives, non-profit organizations, counselling, crisis intervention) Experience working or volunteering in culturally diverse environments 	 Community Engagement. Prefer and assess: Commitment to volunteerism and community involvement (social/civil/community events and initiatives, non-profit organizations, counselling, crisis intervention
	 Commitment to Personal and Professional Development, Continuing Education. Preferred and assessed: Level of education (certificate, diploma, undergraduate degree, graduate degree, multiple degrees) Recent education Relevancy of education (medical, advanced or specialized medical, fire science related, advanced fire related courses) 	 Commitment to Personal and Professional Development, Continuing Education. Prefer and assess: Level of education (certificate, diploma, undergraduate degree, graduate degree, multiple degrees)

Community Outreach Enhancements

TFS is actively involved in community-based recruitment outreach. Current activities include:

- Outreach materials have been distributed to Employment Offices, operated by Toronto Employment and Social Services (TESS) in Scarborough and Etobicoke.
- As part of Toronto's Strong Neighbourhood Strategy, TFS has attended four Neighbourhood Planning Tables to meet with residents and provide them information about career opportunities at TFS; these residents have been provided with materials and information to share with their communities.
- Public Education staff have attended four career fairs to conduct outreach and distribute materials including the Multicultural Canadian Fair and Trade Show.

- A career presentation has been developed for Grade 10 Civics students. This was piloted at Malvern Collegiate and will be rolled out to all high schools in late 2017.
- TFS is currently preparing for outreach activities that will take place during the 2017 Indigenous Games, Invictus Games and Pride Week.
- TFS is also preparing to deliver career presentations this summer to Youthworx employees, Chalkfarm Community Centre members aged 18-29, and to Toronto Community Housing residents aged 14-18 in the east end of the city.