

Regularizing Toronto For All: A Public Education Initiative to Support Civic Resiliency

Date: September 12, 2017

To: Executive Committee

From: Acting Director, Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights; Executive Director, Human Resources; Executive Director, Social Development, Finance & Administration; Director, Strategic Communications

Wards: All

SUMMARY

Toronto is the most diverse city in the world, a fact celebrated in the City's motto: Diversity Our Strength. Yet, implicit biases, negative attitudes, stereotypes, and prejudices are still present, contributing to discrimination and racism that negatively impact the access to safety, wellbeing and life chances of Torontonians who belong to one or more equity-seeking groups.

The goal of the Toronto For All public education initiative is to generate dialogue amongst Toronto residents in order to create a city that says "no" to all forms of discrimination and racism, including systemic racism. Each campaign is designed to drive awareness of a social equity issue presently faced by Torontonians and to equip the broader public with the knowledge and skills to identify, question, and challenge systemic barriers through a multi-staged conversational approach.

The initiative is a municipal tool that supports the civic resiliency for all Toronto residents. Civic resiliency is the capacity of a group of residents or community to adapt to the evolving complexity and diversity of their social environment by building good relationships and viewing these changes as a strength. The City, as the government closest to residents, must lead public dialogue that can support civic resiliency in all Torontonians.

The initiative is also designed to support customer service improvement efforts across all City divisions by equipping staff to better understand their own biases or stereotypes that may prevent them from providing the best service to Torontonians from equity-seeking groups.

This report recommends regularizing the Toronto For All public education initiative as an annual program with two campaigns per year across a range of media platforms, supported by a learning program for City staff. Media platforms include print and digital transit shelter advertising (TSA) provided by Astral Media, with which the City runs approximately 50 campaigns per year. The next two proposed campaigns will focus on the experiences of Indigenous people and people living with disabilities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Acting Director, Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights; Executive Director, Human Resources; Executive Director, Social Development, Finance & Administration; and the Director, Strategic Communications recommend that:

1. City Council request the Acting Director, Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights; Executive Director, Human Resources; Executive Director, Social Development, Finance & Administration; and the Director, Strategic Communications collaborate to regularize the Toronto For All public education initiative into an annual City program that implements two campaigns per year.
2. City Council request the Executive Director, Social Development, Finance & Administration initiate a Request for Proposals (RFP) for a four-year term to contract a creative agency to execute seven consecutive campaigns for Toronto For All, from 2018-2021, subject to annual budget approval.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

This report recommends regularizing the Toronto For All public education initiative as an annual program to deliver two strategically chosen campaigns per year focused on social equity issues.

Two campaigns will total \$0.340 million gross and net to develop and execute in collaboration with community subject matter experts. Campaigns will leverage the free transit shelter advertising spaces from Astral media with additional ad buys in other electronic media platforms (see Table 1). In the requested advertising period, Toronto For All must receive no less than one-third of the print TSA spaces allocated to the City of Toronto by Astral Media.

Given the municipal election, only one campaign will run in 2018 and focus on the experiences of Indigenous people. Funding for the Indigenous campaign of \$0.100 million gross and net is included as a New Service Priority in the 2018 Operating Budget Submission for Social Development, Finance and Administration, with additional funding of \$0.240 million gross and net included in the 2019 Outlook for consideration through the 2018 and future-year budget reviews.

Table 1

Campaign Component	2018 Impact	2019 Impact
Creative Development & Engagement Additional Ad Buys	\$90,000	\$190,000
	\$10,000	\$130,000
Annual Program Total:	\$100,000	\$240,000

Funding for the next campaign is scheduled to begin in 2019, with the first 2019 campaign focusing on the experiences of people living with disabilities in the spring, and a second strategically chosen topic in fall 2019.

Of the four campaigns undertaken to date, only one – the Islamophobia campaign – received project-specific funding. The three campaigns that followed were supported from under-expenditure within existing resources. However, base funding is now requested to support a regular, annualized public education initiative.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

EQUITY IMPACT

The goal of Toronto For All is to generate dialogue amongst Toronto residents in order to create a city where all Torontonians say "no" to all forms of discrimination and racism, including systemic racism. Toronto For All encourages all Torontonians to challenge implicit biases, negative attitudes, stereotypes, and prejudices that contribute to systemic barriers to respect, inclusion, and equity.

To date, the Toronto For All public education campaigns have focused on the experiences of:

1. Migrant and Muslim Torontonians (challenging Islamophobia and xenophobia)
2. Black Torontonians (challenging anti-Black racism)
3. Torontonians who are experiencing homelessness (challenging NIMBYISM and negative stereotypes about homeless men)
4. Young Torontonians who are transgender and racialized (challenging transphobia)

Among the next proposed campaigns are a focus on the experiences of Indigenous people living in Toronto and Torontonians with disabilities.

The creative of the campaigns addresses issues of intersectionality by focusing on the lived experiences of Torontonians facing discrimination and racism who belong to one or more equity-seeking groups. For example, the fourth campaign to challenge transphobia demonstrated intersectionality by supporting public awareness that young

women who are Black and transgender face discrimination and racism, including systemic racism, in the forms of gender-based violence, ageism, anti-Black racism and transphobia. By pairing each campaign topic with ongoing City initiatives and engaging City staff in a learning program, the Toronto For All campaign model will equip City staff with skills and knowledge to better serve Torontonians who are from equity-seeking groups.

DECISION HISTORY

Inspired by a public service campaign in Barcelona, Spain that was designed to dispel misconceptions and prejudices about immigrants, on June 10, 2014, Toronto City Council approved the development of "an anti-rumours campaign" as part of the Toronto Newcomer Strategy, 2014-2016 Implementation. Council directed the campaign to address stigma and stereotypes as barriers to greater newcomer participation, better integration, social cohesion, and community building, but in the absence of resources, implementation was delayed.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.CD29.10>

On September 30, 2015, City Council approved the anti-rumours campaign as part of the proposed activities of the City of Toronto Syrian Refugee Resettlement Program. The campaign model was directed to address issues related to Islamophobia, xenophobia and anti-immigrant sentiments in the context of Syrian refugees arriving to Toronto.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.EX8.39>

On November 8 and 9, 2016, reviewing the Toronto Newcomer Strategy – Progress Report, City Council directed the Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration and the Director, Equity, Diversity and Human Rights to further develop the "Toronto For All" public education initiative to address transphobia and issues experienced by Indigenous people in Toronto.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2016.CD15.5>

COMMENTS

Supporting Civic Resiliency

Toronto is the most diverse city in the world, a fact celebrated in the City's motto: Diversity Our Strength. Yet, implicit biases, negative attitudes, stereotypes, and prejudices contribute to systemic barriers of discrimination and racism. These barriers continue to negatively impact the safety, wellbeing and life chances of Toronto residents who belong to one or more equity-seeking groups. When Torontonians fail to recognize diversity as a resource and a source of strength, residents demonstrate low civic resiliency.

Civic resiliency is the capacity of a group of residents or community to adapt to the evolving complexity and diversity of their social environment by building good

relationships and viewing these changes as a strength. Civic resiliency can be measured in residents' awareness of – and engagement with – the systemic barriers that exist for people in their environment due to group membership. Implicit biases, negative attitudes, stereotypes and prejudices negatively impact our civic resiliency.

The City, as the government closest to residents, must take steps to support the civic resiliency of Torontonians for the benefit all Toronto residents.

Toronto For All: To Date

Since Council direction in Fall 2015, four public education campaigns have been delivered.

In June 2016, the City launched the first campaign aimed at confronting Islamophobia in Toronto. OCASI – the Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants – served as lead community partner. Public Inc. was the creative agency and Social Development, Finance & Administration (SDF), Equity, Diversity & Human Rights (EDHR) and Strategic Communications contributed subject matter expertise, strategy and project support. The campaign was timed to align with the Syrian Refugee Resettlement Program with the arrival of thousands of Syrian refugees and an increase in incidents of anti-Muslim and anti-migrant violence locally.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.EX8.39>

In November 2016, the City launched the second public education campaign aimed at confronting anti-Black racism in Toronto. Work was completed with the same partners but the process was improved by adding a community advisory of residents with lived experience and a strong analysis of anti-Black racism. This campaign was created to support the development of the Interim Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism. The Steering Committee decided to enhance this campaign further by partnering with Human Resources to hold an Open Dialogue on Anti-Black Racism to support learning at the leadership level of the City.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.EX26.5>

In Spring 2017, Shelter, Support & Housing Administration (SSHA) joined the initiative to support the third campaign aimed at confronting stereotyping and discrimination against Torontonians who are experiencing homelessness, particularly men. Working with the Toronto Alliance to End Homelessness and Public Inc., this campaign supported SSHA's work to implement a new model for locating municipal shelters, the Proposed New Engagement and Planning Process for Emergency Shelters. This campaign included additional online and out of home advertisements to complement the transit shelters and online social media which was the basis for the previous campaigns. This third campaign ran from April to May 2017.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.CD19.6>

The fourth campaign ran from June to August 2017 and aimed at confronting transphobia experienced by racialized transgender youth. The City partnered with the Black Coalition for AIDS Prevention (Black CAP) and a community advisory committee comprised of racialized transgender youth. The campaign launched during Pride and complemented a primer report to the Community Development and Recreation

Committee and Council on gender identity and gender expression as well as community engagement to create a Transgender Youth Service Plan.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.CD21.1>

Overview of the Campaign Model

Senior staff from Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights, Human Resources, Social Development, Finance & Administration and Strategic Communications comprise the Toronto For All Steering Committee that oversee and support each campaign. Together, the Steering Committee will regularize the Toronto For All public education initiative by producing two strategically chosen campaigns per year.

Based on lessons learned over the first four campaigns, the Toronto For All program model includes:

1. Selection of a campaign topic that is aligned with a larger initiative at the City and/or with priorities for public education expressed by Toronto residents or City Council;
2. Identification of a community partner with subject matter expertise, who has strong connections and credibility with Torontonians affected by the issues and with local advocates, and who is able to act as the public face and voice of the campaign;
3. Identification of a City division with subject matter expertise to support the campaign;
4. Collaboration with the community partner, a community advisory committee and a creative agency to develop the purpose, key messages and creative execution of the campaign;
5. Development of communications and advertising content including information on a purpose-built site www.torontoforall.ca, transit shelter advertising (through Astral media), additional out of home advertising, paid and organic social media campaigns, online advertisements, media outreach, internal staff communications, and posters in recreation and community centres and Toronto Employment and Social Services and Toronto Public Libraries locations;
6. Facilitation of internal leadership dialogue and appropriate staff learning by both Equity, Diversity and Human Rights, and Human Resources¹ to support better City staff understanding of the residents the City serves and implications for policy development, program and service planning and development, and customer service; and,

¹ The learning program for City staff included in the Toronto For All campaign model is supported by complementary budget requests made by Equity, Diversity and Human Rights and Human Resources, aimed at enhancing corporate capacity to deliver equity, diversity and human rights related training to City staff.

7. Evaluation of the effectiveness of the campaign in generating dialogue amongst Torontonians through the use of measured indicators, including social media impressions, engagement and sentiment; website visits; impressions and engagement of out of home and online advertisements; earned media, accuracy and sentiment; feedback from residents through other channels (e.g., 311, emails to City staff); and participation in a learning program for City staff.

2018 Work Plan

Given the 2018 municipal election, a fall 2018 campaign is not possible, so the Toronto For All public education initiative will begin to regularize with two campaigns per year in 2019. In 2018, the Steering Committee proposes one public education campaign aligned with Council directed equity priorities. The 2018 campaign will focus on the experiences of Indigenous people living in Toronto. In reviewing the Toronto Newcomer Strategy Progress report, last November, City Council directed the Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA) and the Director, Equity, Diversity and Human Rights (EDHR) to create a Toronto For All campaign that addresses issues experienced by Indigenous people in Toronto. Funding was not available to meet this direction but the campaign stands as an important priority.

This Toronto For All campaign will align with efforts being led by EDHR to create a strategic focus at the City on Indigenous people. A lead community partner, the Toronto Aboriginal Support Services Council (TASSC) has been identified and partnership discussions will begin in late Q4 to enable a campaign launch date in Q2 2018.

The first proposed 2019 campaign will focus on the experiences of people living with disabilities. The Steering Committee has chosen to confront disableism to reinforce understanding and compliance with new provincial requirements in the Integrated Accessibility Standards (IAS) made under the Accessibility of Ontarians with a Disability Act (AODA) and with The Path to 2025: Ontario's Accessibility Action Plan. A second campaign topic will be chosen based on City priorities.

Evaluation Mechanisms

Each Toronto For All campaign has been evaluated in a Wrap Report using a combination of measured indicators, including earned media coverage and sentiment; social media impressions, engagements and sentiments on organic and paid posts made by the City and the community partner, including individuals reached, new followers, shares, retweets, likes, reactions, and comments; impressions and engagement of out of home and online advertisements; visitors to www.torontoforall.ca and the community partner's website; leadership and speaking opportunities for the community partner; and requests for further engagement opportunities from community advocates.

The fourth Toronto For All campaign, for example, was evaluated as highly successful. The campaign garnered 12 media clips, securing coverage in local and international media including the Toronto Star, Breakfast Television, Huffington Post, and BuzzFeed; generated 8.9 million social media impressions; attracted 300 participants to an Open

Dialogue; welcomed 4,614 visitors and 7,249 total page views to www.torontoforall.ca; attracted 329 new followers to Black CAP during the campaign period; and prompted requests from schools to Black CAP for more classroom learning materials.

Vandalism and defacement of transit shelter advertising may also be considered as a measured indicator. The four campaigns to date launched a total of 550 posters in transit shelters across Toronto and only one poster was defaced. Residents actively engaged with the community partners and with City when they had questions or differing perspectives on campaign topics.

A summary evaluation of the four campaigns to date is found in Table 2.

Table 2

Evaluation Mechanism	Campaign #1	Campaign #2	Campaign #3	Campaign #4
Earned Media Coverage	30 media clips	17 media clips	8 media clips	12 media clips
Social Media Impressions	443,800	806,687	1.4 million	8.9 million
Visitors to torontoforall.ca	13,956 visits	10,104 visits	9,175 visits	4,614 visits
Community Partner Audience during Campaign Period	750 new Facebook followers	640 new Facebook followers	377 new Facebook and 90 new Twitter followers	165 new Facebook, 142 new Twitter and 22 new Instagram followers

Campaign #3 focused on homelessness was the only campaign to benefit from additional ad buys. As a result, this campaign achieved the highest media engagement rate. An average engagement rate on a social media campaign is 0.5%-1%. This campaign reached a social media engagement rate of 1.76%. The next highest social media engagement rate was the fourth campaign focused on transphobia where the social media engagement rate was 1.2%, aided by the timing of Pride and the social media skills of the community partner. Additional ad buys allow for greater targeting of each audience for the campaigns to ensure that the highest engagement rate possible is achieved.

Conclusion

The Toronto For All public education initiative supports civic resiliency in Torontonians by inviting public dialogue and engagement. It drives awareness of a social equity issue presently faced by Torontonians and equips Torontonians and City staff with the knowledge and skills to identify, question, and challenge systemic barriers of discrimination and racism. The biannual campaign model is designed to inspire a long-term shift in culture shared by Toronto residents and City staff. The City, as

government, must lead public dialogue in order to become the Toronto that we aspire to be – a city that says "no" to all forms of systemic discrimination and racism and where evolving complexity and diversity is recognized as a resource and a strength.

CONTACT

Denise Andrea Campbell
Director, Social Policy, Analysis and Research
Social Development, Finance & Administration
416-392-8614
DeniseAndrea.Campbell@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Omo Akintan
Acting Director, Equity, Diversity and Human Rights

Kerry Pond
Executive Director, Human Resources

Chris Brillinger,
Executive Director, Social Development, Finance & Administration

Jackie DeSouza
Director, Strategic Communications