

Toronto Police Transformational Task Force Report and Impacts on City Divisions

Date: October 19, 2017
To: Executive Committee
From: City Manager
Wards: All

SUMMARY

The Toronto Police Services Board (TPSB) formed the Transformational Task Force (TTF) with a mandate to review and study all of the reports over the last five years dealing with organizational change and potential efficiency measures, to determine how best to modernize the structure and service delivery of the Toronto Police Service (TPS) and deliver policing services more efficiently and effectively. The TTF's final report contains 32 recommendations to modernize the policing model for the City of Toronto in a manner that is innovative, sustainable and affordable. While there will be up-front costs associated with building capacity and changing practice, these measures will help the TPS rationalize its resources, introduce delivery models with lower cost structures, and strategically drive internal efficiencies while maintaining public safety.

The TTF report supports City Council's goal of a city where individuals and communities feel safe and secure. The recommendations support several City strategies including the Toronto Strong Neighbourhoods Strategy 2020, the City of Toronto Congestion Management Plan 2016-2020, the Vision Zero Road Safety Plan (2017-2021) and align with the City's commitment to continuous improvement.

The TTF final report includes 32 recommendations with the majority largely focused on the internal operations of the TPS and will either have little or no direct impact on City divisions, or the impact is undetermined at this point due to the phased roll-out of the implementation. To date, the City's review has identified three TTF recommendations that will have an impact on certain City divisions that include the proposed transfer of the beach lifeguard and school crossing guard programs to appropriate City divisions (recommendations 12 and 13), and TPS's risk assessment approach to non-emergency calls (recommendation 4).

This report supports the recommendation of the TTF that, going forward, the beach lifeguard program be delivered by the City's Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division (PFR) beginning November 10, 2017, and the school crossing guard program be delivered by a third-party service provider under contract with the City's Transportation Services Division beginning August 1, 2019. While the TPS will continue to deliver the school crossing guard program until July 31, 2019, the City and the TPS are developing alternative options for September 2018 to address school crossing guard vacancies currently backfilled by police officers. The primary goal is to have these positions filled by a civilian workforce, thus freeing up police officers to fulfill core policing duties.

This report also recommends that the TPS budgets for the beach lifeguard and school crossing guard programs be transferred to Parks, Forestry and Recreation and Transportation Services, respectively. The current budgets to deliver these services are recommended to be transferred in 2017 to enable City program development work to proceed. The budget transfers will not be considered budget reductions for the TPS or increases for these City divisions as costs will ultimately remain within the overall City Operating Budget.

The TTF final report also recommends that the TPS develop a risk assessment tool to identify non-emergency calls that can be addressed through alternative approaches, including redirection to the appropriate City division or agency. The risk assessment tool is still under development; however, it is expected that City divisions responsible for the intake and response to calls for by-law enforcement and traffic related services will likely experience increased referrals from the TPS. Staff from these City divisions and the TPS continue to work collaboratively to discuss the impact and implementation of this recommendation. Financial impacts are not anticipated for the 2018 budget.

City staff are supportive of these recommended program delivery changes as they advance City objectives and allow the TPS to focus on core policing to be better positioned to control its overall costs, which will benefit the City as a whole. The City and the TPS are working collaboratively to assess the impacts and feasibility of the balance of the TTF recommendations and timelines.

On May 16, 2017, Executive Committee received from the Toronto Police Services Board (TPSB) the Transformational Task Force Report as its 2017-2019 business plan and requested City Council comment on the plan. In accordance with that request, this report recommends that Council's consideration of this report be the input on the Toronto Police Service's 2017- 2019 business plan, to fulfill a regulatory requirement for the TPSB to consult with City Council on their business plan.

Finally, the report recommends that the City Manager and the TPSB be requested to report back in 2018 on the implementation of the TTF recommendations as the impacts and feasibility of the other recommendations become more apparent.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Manager recommends that:

Toronto Police Services Board

1. City Council deem its consideration of this report to be Council's input on the Toronto Police Service's 2017-2019 business plan, to fulfill Ontario Regulation 3/99 made under the Police Services Act.
2. City Council request the Toronto Police Services Board report to Executive Committee with a progress update on implementation of the Transformational Task Force recommendations in the second quarter of 2018.

Transfer of Beach Lifeguard Program

3. City Council direct that:
 - a. The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation deliver the beach lifeguard program starting November 10, 2017.
 - b. The 2017 City Council Approved Operating Budget for the beach lifeguard program totalling \$1.470 million gross and \$1.415 million net be transferred from the Toronto Police Service to Parks, Forestry and Recreation.
 - c. The Toronto Police Service budget for Beach Lifeguards be adjusted on a one-time basis for 2017 to facilitate the reimbursement from the City for their delivery of the program from January 1 to November 10, 2017, by increasing the 2017 Operating budget by \$1.415 million gross with full cost recovery from Parks, Forestry and Recreation, resulting in a net zero financial impact to the Toronto Police Services Budget.
4. City Council request the Toronto Police Services Board to direct the Chief of Police to continue providing communication (radio system) support, as well as maintenance, storage and fueling of equipment used by the beach lifeguard program until September 30, 2019 to assist with the program transition, and that the Toronto Police Service be reimbursed on a cost-recovery basis.
5. City Council authorize the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to explore and enter into the required agreements with the Toronto Police Service on a cost-recovery basis and/or other service providers, to help support the successful delivery of the beach lifeguard program by Parks, Forestry and Recreation.
6. City Council direct that the 2017 Parks, Forestry and Recreation Operating Budget be increased on a one-time basis by \$0.026 million in 2017 and \$0.077 million in 2018 to fund one temporary position for a duration of eight months to be fully recovered from

the Toronto Police Modernization Reserve to support the one-time transition of the beach lifeguard program.

Transfer of School Crossing Guard Program

7. City Council direct that:

a. The General Manager, Transportation Services contract with a third-party service provider to deliver the school crossing guard program starting August 1, 2019, with the Toronto Police Service continuing to provide the school crossing guard program until July 31, 2019.

b. The 2017 City Council Approved Operating Budget for the school crossing guard program totalling \$7.525 million (gross and net) be transferred from the Toronto Police Service to Transportation Services to provide oversight and fund program delivery by a third-party service provider.

c. The Toronto Police Service budget for the delivery of the school crossing guard program be adjusted on a one-time basis for 2017 to facilitate the reimbursement from the City for their delivery of the program for 2017, by increasing the 2017 Operating budget by \$7.525 million gross with full cost recovery from Transportation Services, resulting in a net zero financial impact to the Toronto Police Service Budget.

8. City Council authorize that the 2017 Transportation Services Operating Budget be increased by one temporary position funded on a one-time basis by \$0.038 million funded from the Toronto Police Modernization Reserve to support one-time program development and procurement activities for the school crossing guard program.

City Reporting

9. City Council request the City Manager to report to Executive Committee to provide an update in the second quarter of 2018, as required, on the impacts of implementation of other Transformational Task Force recommendations on City divisions.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Costs from recommendations in this report would increase the 2017 City Operating Budget by \$0.064 million gross and 0 (net), and one position. In 2018, the City Operating Budget would increase \$0.077 million gross and 0 (net), all funded through the Police Modernization Reserve to cover one-time transition costs for Parks, Forestry and Recreation. The overall net financial impact of implementing the balance of the Transformational Task Force (TTF) recommendations on the City's Operating and Capital Budgets (including divisional and the TPS Budgets) is not determined at this point, as many of the recommendations are being assessed for feasibility and/or are in the planning stage of implementation.

Toronto Police Service Budget

The 2017 TPS Operating Budget will be restated to reflect the 2017 transfer of the beach lifeguard and school crossing guard budgets to Parks, Forestry and Recreation and Transportation Services, respectively. The budget transfers, while a TPS budget reduction, will not be considered as efficiencies for the TPS in the 2018 Budget process, as these programs will ultimately be delivered by City divisions and the costs will remain within the City's overall Operating Budget. However, transfer of these program costs from the TPS 2017 Operating Budget will result in increased challenges to the TPS to find the required savings on the remaining TPS 2017 Operating Budget, as employment obligations to some TPS employees currently administering the programs will remain with the TPS despite the programs being delivered by alternative means.

Parks, Forestry and Recreation Budget: Beach Lifeguard Program

The transfer of the beach lifeguard program delivery to Parks, Forestry and Recreation (PFR) will result in additional financial impacts to the overall 2018 City Operating Budget. The 2017 TPS Operating Budget for delivery of the beach lifeguard program is \$1.470 million gross and \$1.415 million net. Based on the current model, the 2018 PFR estimated budget for delivery of the program is \$1.759 million gross and \$1.699 million net, an overall higher cost of \$0.284 million net. Funds for this increase will be included in the Parks, Forestry and Recreation 2018 Operating Budget submission.

The higher cost for delivery of the program by PFR is mainly attributable to delivering the same service within the City's current operations, which include a narrower span of control and increased relief coverage, as well as the required contribution to reserves for the replacement of the program's assets in the future.

This report also recommends one-time increases in the 2017 PFR Operating Budget of \$0.026 million and \$0.077 million in 2018 for transition costs related to planning required for delivery of the program effective November 10, 2017, to be funded through the Police Modernization Reserve.

Transportation Services Budget: School Crossing Guard Program

As a new program for the City's direct delivery, the school crossing guard program will require significant resources to build capacity. This report recommends that a third-party service provider is the most cost effective mechanism to deliver the program with oversight from Transportation Services.

The 2017 TPS Operating Budget for delivery of the school crossing guard program direct costs was \$8.809 million (gross and net). The annual estimated cost for third-party service delivery of the program and oversight of the contract for the program by Transportation Services is \$10.383 million (gross and net), an increase of \$1.574 million to deliver the program. The higher cost is largely due to the current low but unsustainable program structure (hours and wages), unrecognized costs for police

officer backfill for vacant crossing shifts, third-party service provider profit margins and staffing for Transportation Services' oversight function.

This report recommends the transfer of direct costs in the 2017 TPS Operating Budget for the school crossing guard program to Transportation Services, totalling \$7.525 million gross and net. Additional cost impacts to manage the delivery of the program, including indirect management costs which cannot be transferred from the TPS, will result in an overall higher cost of \$2.859 million gross and net for Transportation Services. This increase will be phased in over 2019 and 2020.

Also recommended is a one-time increase in the 2017 Transportation Services Operating Budget of \$0.038 million, funded from the Police Modernization Reserve, to support one-time program development activities.

The transfer of the school crossing guard program delivery to Transportation Services will also result in additional financial impacts to the overall 2018 City Operating Budget which will be addressed through the 2018 budget process.

The Toronto Police Services Board (TPSB) has directed the TPS to continue delivery of the program until the end of the 2017/2018 school year. This report recommends that the TPS be reimbursed for costs related to their delivery of the program at current service levels to July 31, 2019, and that a third-party service provider deliver the program starting August 1, 2019 under the City's Transportation Services Division. During 2018, the City will be developing an RFP and other alternative options in collaboration with the TPS, to ensure that school crossing guard vacancies are not backfilled by police officers after July 2018.

The costs of part-year program delivery by TPS, part-year program delivery by a third-party service provider, and procurement and contract oversight by Transportation Services will be included in the 2018 and future year outlooks for the Transportation Services Operating Budget; as well as any adjustments to the TPS budget related to the continued delivery of the program until a third-party service provider is awarded the contract to deliver the program.

Other City Divisions: Non-Emergency Calls

The TTF recommendation to develop a risk assessment tool to identify non-emergency calls could increase budget pressures for City divisions. As the TPS refocuses on core policing, officer response to non-emergency calls will be limited to those where there is a clear risk to public safety. Divisions responsible for the intake and response to calls for by-law enforcement and traffic related services will likely experience increased referrals from the TPS. As a result, 311 Toronto, Municipal Licensing and Standards, Transportation Services and Economic Development and Culture (Film & Television and Digital Media Office) will likely be affected. City staff are working with the TPS to understand the full operational and financial impacts to City divisions. Any financial impacts to the City as a result of this recommendation will be addressed through future year budget cycles.

The Acting Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting on May 16, 2017, Executive Committee received from the Toronto Police Services Board (TPSB) the Transformational Task Force Report as its 2017-2019 business plan and its request for comment on the plan by Council. Executive Committee referred the report to the City Manager to report back on potential impacts of the Task Force recommendations on City divisions, and opportunities to improve alignment of services. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.EX25.19>

At its meeting on February 23, 2017, the TPSB approved the TTF final report as the Toronto Police Service 2017- 2019 business plan, requested comment on the plan by Council, and approved the commencement of implementation of the recommendations contained in the report, subject to changes that may be made as a result of comment by Council or other consulted bodies. <http://www.tpsb.ca/component/jdownloads/send/8-2016/523-july-21>

At its meeting on February 16-17, 2017, City Council directed the TPSB to report on TTF recommendations regarding City Wide Divisional Boundary and Facilities Realignment and the repurposing of existing facilities and locations. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.EX22.2>

At its meeting on October 20, 2016, the TPSB directed the Chief of Police to continue to deliver the beach lifeguard and school crossing guard programs using the current operational model to no later than the end of July 2018, and requested the City fund delivery of these programs in 2018 and transfer the cost and revenue to the responsible body at the date of transition. <http://www.tpsb.ca/component/jdownloads/send/8-2016/535-october-20>

During its deliberations on the 2016 Operating Budget, City Council on February 17, 2016 requested the TPSB to expedite the implementation of recommendations contained in the KPMG Opportunities for the Future report of December 17, 2015, as well as other opportunities for structural change to improve efficiency in advance of the 2017 budget cycle. City Council also requested the Board to specifically focus on recommendations such as civilianization of non-core elements of its court services, parking enforcement and other duties, paid duty, premium pay and the employment of technology, to improve demand management and staff deployment. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2016.EX12.2>

At its meeting on December 17, 2015, the TPSB formed the Transformational Task Force with a mandate to review all of the reports over the last five years dealing with organizational change and potential efficiency measures to determine how best to modernize the structure and service delivery of the TPS and to deliver policing services

more efficiently and effectively. <http://www.tpsb.ca/component/jdownloads/send/7-2015/186-december-17>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The Toronto Police Services Board (TPSB) formed the Transformational Task Force (TTF) with a mandate to review all of the reports over the past five years dealing with organizational change and potential efficiency measures to determine how best to modernize the structure and service delivery of the Toronto Police Service (TPS) and to deliver policing services more efficiently and effectively.

The TTF was jointly chaired by the Chair of the TPSB and the Chief of Police, and included 12 TPS members and external subject matter experts. External members included a former City Councillor and Budget Chief, and the City's former Auditor General. The TTF members worked intensively through 2016 developing recommendations and consulting with community, internal and external stakeholders.

The Transformational Task Force's final report "Action Plan: The Way Forward" (Attachment 1), contains 32 recommendations to modernize the policing model for the City of Toronto in a manner that is innovative, sustainable and affordable. The new modernized model of policing includes:

- Neighbourhood-centric policing and how that approach will result in improved community safety;
- Working with partners, communities and members to keep Toronto the best and safest place to be;
- A smarter approach to policing;
- Maximizing the use of technology to be more efficient and effective in policing; and
- Being transparent and accountable about how the Toronto Police Service modernizes.

The implementation of the TTF recommendations is an opportunity for the TPS to enhance efficiency and effectiveness by reviewing its current operations, refocussing on its core policing responsibilities, enhancing its partnership approach to community safety, exploring alternative service delivery, and utilizing technology.

The TTF estimated that implementation of its recommendations would result in budget reductions, cost avoidance and efficiencies in the TPS Operating Budget of \$100 million between 2017 and 2019. They recommended spending reductions and enhanced efficiencies that include:

- \$60 million from attrition and a moratorium on hiring and promotion between the ranks for officers and civilians;
- \$30 million in efficiencies through alternative service delivery, shared services and better supply chain management. This includes the transfer of the beach lifeguard and school crossing guard programs to another service provider; and

- \$10 million in additional efficiencies from miscellaneous sources over the next three years.

The TTF also suggested that up to \$72 million in City assets (buildings and land) currently used by the TPS could be returned to the City as a result of implementation of its recommendations.

While there will be up-front costs associated with building capacity and changing practice, these measures will help the TPS rationalize its resources, introduce delivery models with lower cost structures, and strategically drive internal efficiencies while maintaining public safety.

The work of the TTF is finished and the TPS Strategy Management Office, under the direction of the Chief of Police and Command, now has responsibility to implement the recommendations contained in the TTF final report. To support the initiative, the Office is engaging across their organization, developing an organizational change management strategy, and reporting quarterly on its progress to the TPSB and the public. It has already driven changes to police officer deployment that have enhanced resources on the front lines.

COMMENTS

Transformational Task Force Report: 2017-2019 Toronto Police Business Plan

The Police Services Act requires every police services board in Ontario to approve a three-year business plan for its police service. Ontario Regulation 3/99, made under that Act, further requires police services boards to undertake consultations on the business plan, including consultations with its municipal council. The TPSB approved the TTF's final report as its 2017-2019 business plan for the TPS. To ensure that the TPSB is in compliance with Ontario Regulation 3/99, the Board requested that City Council review the business plan and provide input on it to the Board.

As a business plan, the TTF report provides the TPSB with a revitalized focus on core-policing and promotes a modernized Toronto Police Service that delivers efficient and effective services. Although there will be up-front investment required for implementation, the recommendations in the TTF report embrace innovation and continuous improvement to achieve affordable and sustainable policing for Toronto.

In May 2017, Executive Committee received from the TPSB the TTF Report as its 2017-2019 business plan, and requested City Council comment on the plan. This report therefore recommends that Council's consideration of this report be input on the Toronto Police Service's 2017- 2019 business plan, to fulfill the requirement of O. Reg. 3/99 made under the Police Services Act that the TPSB consult with City Council on their business plans. The TTF Report / business plan is located at the link below.
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-103581.pdf>

Review of the TTF Report and Potential Impacts and Opportunities for City Divisions

The Transformational Task Force's final report "Action Plan: The Way Forward" provides the TPS, and the City as a whole, with a business plan to modernize policing that is future focussed and supportive of City Council's goal of a city where individuals and communities feel safe and secure. Aligned to the City's commitment to continuous improvement, the 32 recommendations provide a strategic path for the TPS as it seeks to explore new methods of service delivery in a manner that is effective, efficient and adaptable to the changing needs of the residents and the communities it serves. In addition, a number of the recommendations support several City strategies including Toronto Strong Neighbourhoods Strategy 2020, the City of Toronto Congestion Management Plan 2016-2020 and the Vision Zero Road Safety Plan (2017-2021).

Recommendations and Opportunities with Identifiable Impact on the City

City staff continues to work closely with the TPS to assess the impact of the TTF's recommendations on City divisions, to assist with implementation where appropriate, and to identify opportunities to improve the alignment of complementary TPS and City divisional services. To support this effort, a City staff member from Strategic and Corporate Policy was embedded in the TPS Strategy Management Office.

The City's review of the TTF final report to date identified that three recommendations will have a direct impact on certain City divisions and/or present opportunities for service alignment and partnerships. TTF recommendations with an immediately identifiable impact or opportunity for partnership and alignment include:

- Recommendation 12: Transfer of the beach lifeguard program
- Recommendation 13: Transfer of the school crossing guard program
- Recommendation 4: Non-emergency calls/ risk assessment for priority response/ (alternative approaches to non-emergency calls, redirection of calls to City division or agency)

City staff worked with their TPS counterparts to assess the implications of the transfer of the beach lifeguard and school crossing guard programs and will continue to work collaboratively to assess the implications and feasibility of the TTF recommendation regarding non-emergency calls on City divisions.

Next Steps

The TTF also recommended a city-wide TPS divisional boundary and facilities realignment. The TPS have partnered with City staff in Real Estate Services and City Planning for the site selection of a new station as it works towards the consolidation of 54 and 55 Divisions, and to identify other opportunities for facility optimization. The impacts on the City will be assessed and detailed in a future report.

The TPS is developing implementation plans for other TTF recommendations which may have an impact on City divisions or present an opportunity for alignment and partnership with the TPS. City staff are actively engaged in discussions with their TPS counterparts to assess the implications and feasibility of these recommendations and potential opportunities. The majority of the remaining recommendations are largely focussed on the internal operations of the TPS and if implemented, will have little to no direct impact on the City's divisional operations or budgets, or the impact is undetermined at this point due to the status of implementation.

This report recommends that the TPSB be requested to provide an update on the implementation of the TTF recommendations overall, and that City staff report back on impacts on City divisions, to Executive Committee in the second quarter of 2018. In addition, staff will bring forward reports to Committee and Council for required approvals as necessary, and reflect any impacts in future annual budget submissions.

Transfer of Beach Lifeguard Program

The TTF recommended that the beach lifeguard program be transferred to a City division or another appropriate service provider to allow the TPS to better focus on its core policing duties. The TPSB has directed the Chief of Police to deliver the program up to the end of July 2018.

City staff reviewed the TPS beach lifeguard program, shadowed the TPS operation coordinator for the 2017 season, reviewed legislated responsibilities on the waterfront, researched beach lifeguard programs in other jurisdictions, and identified alternative service delivery options.

Current Program Delivery

The TPS has delivered the beach lifeguard program out of its Marine Unit since 1982. Beach lifeguards provide supervision at 11 beaches along the Toronto shores of Lake Ontario from mid-May to Labour Day daily from 11:30 am to 6:30 pm. Their current duties include supervising an assigned stretch of beach, providing safety supervision, first aid, and emergency response. The TPS program is staffed by a coordinator and two supervisors/deck hands year round, and 13 head lifeguards and 84 lifeguards employed through seasonal contracts. Head lifeguards receive 100 hours of training each spring, and new lifeguards receive 60 hours of training. Equipment used in the delivery of the program includes boats (rowboats, paddleboards, kayaks, Boston Whalers), lookout stations, two-way radios and other related equipment. Program operations are integrated with those of the TPS Marine Unit, and lifeguard communications are monitored by the Marine Unit dispatch centre. Beach lifeguards also conduct water quality testing on behalf of Toronto Water to meet provincial requirements and in support of the international Blue Flag Program, on a cost recovery basis.

Review of Current Program

There is no legislated requirement for the TPS or the City to provide lifeguarding services at Toronto beaches. However, delivery of the program may create a "duty of care" where the service provider assumes an obligation to provide a certain standard of conduct for the protection of the public against an unreasonable risk of harm. Whether or not the beach lifeguard program is delivered, the TPS Marine Unit has policing responsibilities on the Toronto waterfront under the Police Services Act, which include preserving the peace, preventing crime, laying charges, apprehending criminals and duties assigned by the Chief. Further, the City of Toronto Act provides that the TPS may maintain a safety and lifesaving patrol of the waters of Lake Ontario within the limits of the City.

Staff have identified a number of options regarding the beach lifeguard program, including ceasing delivery of the program, direct delivery of the program by PFR, or delivery of the program by a third party service provider under contract with PFR.

Recommended Program Delivery

This report recommends that the beach lifeguard program be delivered directly by PFR following the 2017 season, effective November 10, 2017. Continuing the program supports City recreation and park priorities, reduces risk to beach swimmers, and supports the City's participation in the international Blue Flag Program for safe beaches. A preliminary scan of the market has not identified any potential qualified third-party service providers that currently have the capacity, expertise, and the administrative structure to deliver a complex waterfront lifeguard program in a cost effective manner.

PFR has extensive experience providing lifeguard services at City-affiliated pools, has a well-developed administrative structure to support this type of service, and already maintains City beaches and beach facilities. Once transferred, PFR expects to deliver the program in a cost effective manner with public safety as its first priority. The Division will ensure its beach lifeguards are qualified, trained and competent in open water accident prevention, rescues and related duties, and may be able to realize synergies in program operation with City outdoor pools such as Sunnyside Gus Ryder and Donald D. Summerville, located nearby.

PFR estimates its costs to deliver the program will be higher than those for TPS, mainly due to delivering the same service within the City's current operations, which include a narrower span of control and increased relief coverage. Despite the increased costs, staff are supportive of the program transfer as it helps to position the TPS to focus on core policing business.

The current hiring process for beach lifeguards typically begins in December of the previous year. To prepare for delivery of the program by PFR, the City will develop new job descriptions for the beach lifeguard and head beach lifeguard positions to determine their appropriate rate of pay. The 2017 Budget is based on an estimated compensation level consistent with the current Lifeguard classification. However, the final compensation level will not be known until this process is completed.

This report recommends the transfer of direct costs in the 2017 TPS Operating Budget for the beach lifeguard program to PFR, totalling \$1.470 million gross and \$1.415 million net. Additional cost impacts based on the current model for PFR will bring the full 2018 cost for this program to \$1.759 million gross, \$1.699 million net, for an overall higher cost of \$0.284 million gross and net. Also recommended is a one-time increase in the 2017 PFR Operating Budget of \$0.026 million and \$0.077 million in 2018 to fund one temporary position for a duration of eight months, with full cost recovery from the Police Modernization Reserve, to support one-time program development and human resource activities.

TPS will transfer all equipment and marine vessels required to support the beach lifeguard program, including specialized communications equipment. Estimates to deliver this program also include a provision for a vehicle and equipment reserve contribution to ensure sufficient funding for future replacement of these assets. Prior to the summer 2018 season, PFR and the TPS would take several actions to facilitate service continuity such as: establish clarity of roles and responsibilities of PFR beach lifeguards and the TPS Marine Unit; develop communication protocols between PFR beach lifeguards and the TPS; and formalize an interim arrangement related to lifeguard equipment, storage and maintenance. Following the first season, PFR and TPS will review the arrangement and consider modifications and refinements, as appropriate. This report recommends the authority to establish service agreements between PFR and other service providers to ensure the most effective supports at the waterfront for PFR's lifeguards.

Transfer of School Crossing Guard Program

The TTF report recommended that the school crossing guard program be transferred to a City division or other appropriate service provider in order for the TPS to better focus on its core policing duties. The TPSB directed the Chief of Police to deliver the program to the end of the 2017/2018 school year and no later than July 31, in 2018.

City staff have since conducted an in-depth analysis of the direction approved by the TPSB which included a review of the current school crossing guard program, a jurisdictional scan of school crossing guard programs in other Ontario municipalities and development of a recommended service delivery model. Although July 31, 2018 was the TPSB's desired transfer date, given the complexity of the transition, a risk-based assessment determined an August 2019 transition date as the most feasible to ensure service continuity and maintain the City's commitment to public safety. During 2018, the City will be developing an RFP and other alternative options in collaboration with the TPS, to ensure that school crossing guard vacancies are not backfilled by police officers after July 2018.

Current Program Delivery

Based on September 2017 data, the school crossing guard program assisted children crossing at 620 designated locations, usually in close proximity to a school. While provision of the service is not a legislated responsibility, it can be considered a traditional service in Toronto as the TPS has been providing it since 1947. To deliver the program,

the TPS annually contracts approximately 750 non-union crossing guards for the school year and of these, approximately 100 are considered spares to fill vacant shifts. The program is coordinated and shifts are assigned by a group of 14 police officers and civilian coordinators located in existing police divisions. Regular duty police officers backfill crossing guard shifts when spares are unavailable (police officers backfilled crossing guards approximately 3,400 hours as at September 2017). TPS Traffic Services provide program oversight and recruit, hire and terminate school crossing guards. In addition, they support the process to assess whether guarded crossings are warranted based on pre-established criteria. TPS also provides back office functions to support the program, including hiring, payroll and personnel functions.

Review of Current Program

The jurisdictional scan included 10 large Ontario municipalities with formal school crossing guard programs. Toronto has the largest program as it provides service at 620 crossings; the next largest program is delivered by Mississauga which provides service at 220 crossings. Of the municipalities surveyed, four utilize a private sector service provider to deliver the program, and none of the programs were delivered by a local school board or police service. While there is some variation in service levels, the average annual cost per crossing for municipally delivered programs was \$11,240, and for privately delivered programs was \$9,951, a difference of 13%.

Staff have identified a number of options regarding the school crossing guard program, including ceasing delivery of the program, direct delivery of the program by Transportation Services, or delivery of the program by a third-party service provider under contract with Transportation Services.

Recommended Program Delivery

This report recommends that the school crossing guard program be delivered by a third-party service provider under contract with Transportation Services beginning August 1, 2019 and that the TPS continue to provide the school crossing guard service until July 31, 2019. In the interim, the City and the TPS will explore alternative options available through the City, TPS and/or alternative service providers to backfill school crossing guard vacancies beginning September 2018, currently resourced by police officers. This will ensure that police officers will no longer be deployed to backfill crossing guard vacancies; a result that will support the TPS's overall objective of better focus on core-policing functions.

Continuing the school crossing guard program supports City priorities related to pedestrian safety (such as the Vision Zero plan). Research and past experience suggest that a contract with a third-party service provider will be the most cost effective mechanism for the City to deliver the program. Transportation Services is well positioned to procure and provide oversight for this type of arrangement. In contrast, the division does not currently directly deliver similar programs, and would require significant resources to develop the capacity to do so. City staff would still be required to develop program requirements, manage the contract, and provide oversight of program delivery.

While evidence suggests that third-party service delivery will be the most cost effective mechanism to deliver the school crossing guard program going forward, staff estimate that the recommended arrangement will be more costly than the status quo delivery by TPS. The higher cost is largely due to TPS's current low but unsustainable program structure for school crossing guards (hours and wages) unrecognized costs for police officer backfill for vacant crossing shifts, third-party service provider profit margins and staffing for Transportation Services' oversight function. Staff are supportive of the proposed delivery model, as it will support divisional objectives and allow the TPS to focus on core policing.

In fall 2017, staff will issue a non-binding Request for Proposals (RFP) for third party service providers to deliver the school crossing guard program starting August 1, 2019. The successful proponent will have experience with providing similar services, and demonstrate an appropriate, reliable, cost-effective approach to assist unaccompanied children to cross roadways and safely arrive at school. The RFP will be issued in 2017 to allow the successful proponent sufficient time to develop an operating model to meet program requirements, hire and train staff, procure necessary equipment and put in place operating procedures before August 1, 2019. Through the RFP, the City will encourage the third-party service provider to extend the opportunity to existing TPS school crossing guards to apply for jobs with the third-party service provider.

The 2017 TPS Operating Budget for delivery of the school crossing guard program direct costs was \$8.809 million (gross and net). The annual estimated cost for third-party service delivery of the program and oversight of the contract for the program by Transportation Services is \$10.383 million (gross and net), an increase of \$1.574 million to deliver the program.

This report recommends the transfer of direct costs in the 2017 TPS Operating Budget for the crossing guard program to Transportation Services, totalling \$7.525 million gross and net. Additional cost impacts to manage the delivery of the program, including indirect management costs which cannot be transferred from the TPS, will result in an overall higher cost of \$2.859 million gross and net for Transportation Services. This increase will be phased in over 2019 and 2020. Also recommended is a one-time increase in the 2017 Transportation Services Operating Budget of \$0.038 million, funded from the Police Modernization Reserve, to support one-time program development activities.

During 2018, the City will be developing an RFP and other alternative options in collaboration with the TPS, to eliminate the use of police officers as backfill for school crossing guard vacancies after July 2018.

Non- Emergency Calls

In an effort to refocus the TPS on core police services and rationalize its resources, the TTF recommended that the TPS develop a risk assessment tool to identify non-emergencies that can be addressed through alternative approaches, including redirection to an appropriate City division or agency. The risk assessment tool is currently under development. However, it is expected that divisions responsible for the intake and response to calls for by-law enforcement and traffic related services will likely

experience increased referrals from the TPS once implemented. The City divisions primarily affected include 311 Toronto, Municipal Licensing and Standards, Transportation Services and Economic Development and Culture (Film & Television and Digital Media Office). To ensure that public confidence is maintained in the City's response to all types of call for service, the TPS and the City are working collaboratively on the development of the risk assessment tool and opportunities for further service alignment.

This collaborative approach will provide the TPS and the City with the opportunity to deliver public education and promotion regarding the most appropriate number to call for non-emergency assistance, and to establish protocols to share relevant dispatch information in cases of mutual concern to improve outcomes, taking into consideration legislated privacy protections.

Although some resource enhancements are expected as a result of these changes to TPS practices, the streamlining of these police services and improved alignment with complementary City programs will help to contain long-term costs for both the TPS and the City.

CONTACT

Karen Jones, A/Director, Corporate Intergovernmental & Agency Relations, Strategic & Corporate Policy; Karen.Jones@toronto.ca; 416.397.4429

Gwen McIntosh, Executive Director Strategic and Corporate Policy;
Gwen.McIntosh@toronto.ca; 416.397.4995

Josie LaVita, Executive Director, Financial Planning; Josie.Lavita@toronto.ca;
416.397.4229

SIGNATURE

Peter Wallace
City Manager

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Transformational Task Force Final Report - Action Plan: The Way Forward