



REPORT FOR ACTION

Parking Ticket Activity - 2016

Date: March 17, 2017
To: Government Management Committee
From: Treasurer
Wards: All

SUMMARY

This report provides information on the total number and type of parking infraction notices (i.e., parking tickets) issued in 2016, as well as information on cancellation activity, trial requests, court conviction activity, and collection rates. Usually this report is submitted to the Government Management Committee together with an annual report from Toronto Police Service on Parking Enforcement Unit Estimated Tag Issuance which identifies enforcement related activity. The Toronto Police Service report will be considered by the Toronto Police Services Board at its meeting on March 23, 2017

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Treasurer recommends that:

1. The Government Management Committee receive this report for information.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

The Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

Staff report annually on parking ticket issuance, collection and cancellation activity.

The 2015 Parking Ticket Activity report (Item GM11.5) was considered and received for information by the Government Management Committee at its meeting of April 4, 2016. Link to 2015 report:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2016.GM11.5>

The City continues to use the Council approved "Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines" when considering cancellation of parking tickets. The Cancellation Guidelines are available at:

http://www1.toronto.ca/City%20Of%20Toronto/Revenue%20Services/Tickets/Files/pdf/C/cancellation_guidelines.pdf

The purpose of the City's various parking by-laws is to regulate the movement of traffic on City streets and to help ensure smooth traffic flow and safe City streets. Fines that have been established for parking related offences serve as a deterrent to illegal parking.

The Toronto Police Service (TPS), through its Parking Enforcement Unit, is responsible for parking enforcement and enforcement practices. The TPS issues the majority of the City's parking tickets each year. However, each year, approximately 10% of all tickets are issued by trained Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEOs). MLEOs are independent private agencies whose staff are trained and certified by the TPS to issue parking tickets on private or municipal property throughout the City of Toronto. MLEO agencies are required to obtain a license from the City's Municipal Licensing and Standards Division in order to operate in the City. Some of the City's agencies, such as the TTC and Toronto Parking Authority, employ MLEOs to enforce off-street parking in their respective areas. Currently, there are approximately 2,500 MLEOs working for 115 different agencies.

Revenue Services Division is responsible for processing and collecting fines for all parking tickets issued in the City of Toronto.

COMMENTS

In 2016, the City of Toronto issued 2,268,110 parking tickets. A total of 2,042,551 tickets were issued by the TPS and the balance of the tickets were issued by MLEOs.

Table 1 below provides a breakdown of the number of tickets issued in 2016 (with a comparison to 2015) by issuing officer/unit.

Table 1: Number of Parking Tickets Issued by Unit

Issuing Unit	2015	2016	Increase / Decrease
Toronto Police Services - Parking Enforcement Officers	1,974,477	2,032,482	58,005
Toronto Police Services - Police Officers/Cadets	8,716	10,069	1,353
Subtotal: Toronto Police Services	1,983,193	2,042,551	59,358
Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEO's)	200,330	225,559	25,229
Total	2,183,523	2,268,110	84,587

The overall number of parking tickets issued in 2016 is more than the number issued in 2015 by approximately 3.9% per cent (there were 84,587 more parking tickets issued in 2016).

Parking Ticket Issuance by Offence Type

Attachment 1 to this report provides a detailed breakdown of parking tickets issued in 2016 by offence type, with a comparison to 2015.

In 2016, the largest category of tickets was issued under "No Parking" type offences (i.e., offences related to parking contrary to the parking rules at a given time and place). This category of offences represented 484,197 tickets or 21.4% of all parking tickets issued in 2016.

The next highest category of offences was "Expired Meter" offences (i.e., offences where vehicles are ticketed for failing to pay and display a parking receipt or park beyond their permitted time). There were 369,775 tickets issued in this category, representing 16.3% of all tickets issued in 2016.

Collection Activity for Tickets Issued in 2016 & Prior Years

Attachment 2 to this report provides information on tickets issued each year and the number of tickets that have been paid as at December 31, 2016. Staff continue to report on collection activity attributable to tickets issued as far back as 1998 since the City continued to receive parking ticket fine payments in 2016 for tickets issued in 1998.

Based on analysis of prior years' collections experience, and recent changes including Habitual Offender Towing and Fixed Fines, staff project a long-term average collection rate of approximately 84 per cent for 2016, however, the collection rate on tickets which are collectible (i.e., excluding those cancelled) is estimated at 99%.

Attachment 2 outlines the collection rate(s) for tickets issued in 2016 and paid as of December 31, 2016. The details show that approximately 59.4 per cent of parking tickets issued in 2016 were paid in 2016. However, given that offenders will continue to pay 2016 parking tickets in 2017 and later years (when renewing their license plates at the Ministry of Transportation), or following trials and disputes, the final collection rate is expected to approach approximately 84 per cent (or 99 per cent when excluding cancelled tickets).

Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity

In 2016, 251,482 parking recipients requested a trial. There were 20,518 more trial requests in 2016 compared to the 230,964 trial requests in 2015, however the percentage of parking ticket recipients requesting trials remains at approximately 11 percent. This increase in trial requests is likely attributable to the increased fines implemented in 2016.

In 2016, a total of 221,547 trials were held for parking tickets issued from 2014 to 2016. Of the tickets that went to trial in 2016, a total of 149,006 (or approximately 67 per cent) received a conviction by the Justice of the Peace at trial. A total of 72,541 (or approximately 32.7 per cent) received acquittals by the Justices of the Peace. The remainder were adjourned to future dates.

Attachment 3 to this report provides a breakdown of the number of trials requested for parking tickets issued in 2016; and trials held for parking tickets issued from 2014 to 2016, including the outcome of the trial (i.e. the number of convictions versus the number of acquittals).

Cancellations and Withdrawals

In 2016, of the 2,268,110 tickets issued, 308,499 or 13.6% were cancelled. This is significantly lower than the 351,638 or 16.1% per cent of tickets cancelled in 2015. It is likely that the number of tickets cancelled in 2016 was lower due to fixed fines and stricter rules surrounding rush-hour offences and offences that impede traffic. Tickets are cancelled under a variety of categories including:

- tickets cancelled by staff at the City's First Appearance Facilities (parking ticket counters) under the Council-approved Parking Ticket Cancellation guidelines;
- tickets issued to out-of-province vehicles for which ownership information cannot be obtained (although they remain on the habitual offender list);

- tickets cancelled because the offender drove away prior to the ticket being served; and,
- tickets cancelled in court by the Judiciary.

Table 2, below, outlines and categorizes all tickets cancelled in 2016.

Table 2: Breakdown of Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2016

Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2015		Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2016		Reason for Cancellation
#	%	#	%	
148,149	6.82%	126,822	5.62%	Cancelled/Conviction by Justice of the Peace at Trial.
88,811	4.09%	91,234	4.05%	Cancelled by Parking Ticket staff for various reasons, contained within the Cancellation Guidelines.
2,660	0.12%	177	0.01%	Out-of-Province – issued to out-of-province vehicles - license plate/owner information not available.
64,330	2.96%	70,739	3.14%	Drove Away – offender drives away before officer can serve the ticket.
39,350	1.81%	11,587	0.51%	Plate errors – plate does not exist, plate is unattached
8,338	0.38%	7,940	0.35%	Error on parking ticket ¹
351,638	16.10%	308,499	13.60%	

1. "Error on Parking Ticket" includes incomplete, information missing and illegible. Overall error rates in this category are approximately 1/3 of one-percent and provide evidence that nearly all tickets written can be processed.

There were 43,139 fewer tickets cancelled in 2016 (with 308,499 cancelled) compared to the 351,638 tickets cancelled in 2015. In addition, the percentage of tickets cancelled in 2016 (13.6%) is also lower than 2015 (16.1%). The largest decrease occurred in the Plate Errors Section whereby the Ministry of Transportation reported fewer unattached plates or plates that did not exist.

Overall, the trends for 2016 reflect a slight increase in parking ticket issuance (3.9%), a reduction in the number of ticket cancellations, with trial request rates and collection percentages remaining relatively stable from 2015 to 2016. These overall trends suggest greater compliance with parking regulations, and can be attributed to recent measures put in place to improve compliance, including habitual offender towing, fixed fines and higher fines for congestion-related parking offences.

CONTACT

Casey Brendon, Director Revenue Services 416-392-8065 casey.brendon@toronto.ca

Anthony Fabrizi, Manager, Utility Billing & Parking Tickets 416-392-5880
anthony.fabrizi@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Mike St. Amant
Treasurer

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1: Breakdown of Parking Offences – 2015 and 2016
- Attachment 2: Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2016 & prior 10 years
- Attachment 3: Summary of Trial Requests - 2016
- Attachment 4: Summary of Court Conviction Activity

Attachment 1: Breakdown of Parking Offences for 2015 and 2016

Bylaw / Offence	Set Fine Amount	Tickets Issued		Tickets Issued	
		2015		2016	
		#	%	#	%
No Parking – “Park Signed Highway during Prohibited Times/Days – Excess Times”	\$50.00	447,652	20.50%	484,197	21.35%
Expired Meter Offences – “Park at Expired Meter, Fail to deposit fee/display receipt”	\$30.00	390,390	17.88%	369,775	16.30%
No Valid Permit - “Park (Prohibited area/location) without a Permit”	\$30.00	327,174	14.98%	344,536	15.19%
Private Property - “Park Vehicle on Private Property without Consent”	\$30.00	324,890	14.88%	367,630	16.21%
No Stopping - “Stop Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day”	\$60.00- \$150.00	193,569	8.86%	195,810	8.63%
Parking – 3 Hour Limit - “Park Longer than 3 Hours”	\$15.00	103,505	4.74%	116,498	5.14%
Parking with Expired Plates – Parking vehicle displaying expired license plate	\$40.00	71,246	3.26%	69,439	3.06%
No Standing – “Stand Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day”	\$60.00- \$150.00	77,175	3.53%	78,996	3.48%
Other Offences – Park facing wrong direction, etc.	\$15-\$150*	16,193	0.74%	1,785	0.08%
Fire Hydrant – “Park – 3M of Fire Hydrant”	\$100.00	33,732	1.54%	35,490	1.56%
No Parking 2:00am – 6:00am in North York from Dec 1 to Mar 31	\$40.00	25,589	1.17%	25,909	1.14%
Parking – Transit Zone - “Stand Vehicle - Signed Highway – Transit Zone”	\$150.00	26,009	1.19%	26,024	1.15%
Stop Sidewalk/Footpath - “Stop - on/over sidewalk/footpath”	\$150.00	21,467	0.98%	19,882	0.88%
Parking – Public Lane - “Park in Public Lane”	\$40.00	16,046	0.73%	15,933	0.70%
Fire Route – “Park Vehicle in Designated Fire Routes”	\$250.00	19,440	0.89%	14,712	0.65%

Bylaw / Offence	Set Fine Amount	Tickets Issued		Tickets Issued	
		2015		2016	
		#	%	#	%
Parking – 9M Intersection - “Park - 9M of Intersecting Highway”	\$50.00	12,809	0.59%	13,334	0.59%
Park Passenger/Freight Loading Zones contrary to Permitted times	\$40.00	11,191	0.51%	16,099	0.71%
Unauthorized Parking on Boulevard	\$50.00	10,163	0.47%	10,238	0.45%
Disabled Parking - “Park Vehicle in Designated Disable Parking Space”	\$60.00- \$450.00	12,876	0.59%	16,085	0.71%
Municipal Offences - “Park Vehicle on Municipal Property without Consent”	\$30.00	6,233	0.29%	6,567	0.29%
Park not within period permitted	\$30.00	2,547	0.12%	2,476	0.11%
Parking – Parallel to Curb – “Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to curb”	\$30.00	6,794	0.31%	6,947	0.31%
Parking - “Park/Obstruct Driveway/Laneway”	\$50.00	4,657	0.21%	4,938	0.22%
Stand Signed Taxi Cab Stand	\$60.00	4,542	0.21%	4,811	0.21%
Park Contrary to Posted Condition	\$105.00	5,333	0.24%	6,089	0.27%
Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to Right Hand Side of Highway	\$30.00	3,819	0.17%	4,203	0.19%
Parking - Not in Designated Area	\$105.00	4,118	0.19%	4,762	0.21%
Stop Roadway Side of any Stopped or Parked Vehicle	\$150.00	1,912	0.09%	2,164	0.10%
Stop Within 9.0 m of Crosswalk	\$60.00	1,640	0.08%	1,861	0.08%
Park Heavy Truck Highway, Prohibited Times/Days	\$90.00	812	0.04%	920	0.04%
Totals		2,183,523	100%	2,268,110	100%
* The “Other Offences” category is a summation of all other parking offences where the number of tickets issued is under 1,000 in each category. The fines in this category range from \$15 - \$150.					

Attachment 2: Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2016 & Prior 10 Years

Year	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H
	Number of Tickets Issued	# of Tickets Cancelled ¹	Outstanding Tickets (i.e., tickets issued and not cancelled) (A-B)	Total # of Tickets Paid as of Dec. 31, 2015	Total Revenue collected (fines only – does not include MTO/MAG fees)	Collection Rate as a % of Tickets Issued (D/A)	Collection Rate as a % of Outstanding Tickets (D/C)	Anticipated Final Collection Rate ³ (estimated)
2006	2,852,100	708,679	2,143,421	2,016,219	\$64,668,001	70.7%	94.1%	96.0%
2007	2,888,234	486,163	2,402,071	2,140,026	\$71,167,390	74.1%	89.1%	94.0%
2008	2,902,929	472,201	2,430,728	2,071,565	\$77,423,532	71.4%	85.2%	91.0%
2009	2,794,460	465,729	2,328,731	1,587,601	\$74,803,044	56.8%	68.2%	89.0%
2010	2,787,071	457,587	2,329,484	1,852,708	\$73,693,423	66.5%	79.5%	98.0%
2011	2,833,787	493,185	2,340,602	1,581,843	\$75,172,461	55.8%	67.6%	99.0%
2012	2,761,802	633,108	2,128,694	1,953,222	\$2,766,919	70.7%	91.8%	99.0%
2013	2,630,402	578,250	2,052,152	1,852,481	\$68,847,822	70.4%	90.3%	99.0%
2014	2,498,660	509,768	1,988,892	1,799,299	\$2,189,209	72.0%	91.1%	99.0%
2015	2,183,523	351,638	1,831,885	1,315,494	\$55,373,952	60.6%	67.5%	99.0%
2016	2,268,110	308,499	1,959,611	1,346,802	\$59,084,018	59.4%	68.7%	99.0%

1. Tickets are cancelled for legislative reasons, in accordance with the Council approved cancellation guidelines, for vehicles that drive away prior to the ticket being served, for out-of-province offenders, or by the Judiciary at trial.
2. The collection rates at 100 percent collection relate to occasions when tickets are cancelled but the owners make payments anyways. This occasionally results in collection rates that are slightly above 100 percent.
3. Final Collection Rates are accurate within 1% since many tickets that were originally cancelled had payments made on the tickets concurrent with the cancellation or after cancellation.

Attachment 3: Summary of Trial Requests - 2016

Tickets & Trial Requests for 2016 Tickets			
2016	Number of Tickets Issued	Number of Trial Requests	Percentage of Trial Requests
January	186,608	19,729	10.5%
February	175,741	19,195	10.9%
March	191,029	21,228	11.2%
April	209,728	23,222	11.0%
May	207,489	23,267	11.3%
June	194,404	20,340	10.5%
July	185,010	18,954	10.2%
August	189,975	20,250	10.8%
September	193,250	22,974	11.9%
October	188,169	22,041	11.7%
November	187,177	22,133	11.9%
December	159,530	18,149	11.5%
Total	2,268,110	251,482	11.1%

Note: 2016 Court Activity figures shown above include parking tickets with trial requests from late 2015 and Re-openings/ Appeals from earlier years.

Attachment 4: Summary of Court Conviction Activity: Court Activity for Tickets issued in 2014, 2015 & 2016

Court Activity for Tickets issued in 2014, 2015 & 2016					
	Total # of Trials Held	Convictions		Acquittals	
		Total Convicted	Percentage Convicted	Acquittals	Percentage of Acquittals
January	16,600	14,157	85.3%	2,463	14.8%
February	14,715	10,652	72.4%	4,063	27.6%
March	29,607	14,657	49.5%	14,950	50.5%
April	13,351	9,365	70.1%	3,986	29.9%
May	15,850	12,953	81.7%	2,897	18.3%
June	22,337	17,866	80.0%	4,471	20.0%
July	15,928	8,721	54.8%	7,207	45.2%
August	13,255	11,150	84.1%	2,105	15.9%
September	22,190	11,738	52.9%	10,452	47.1%
October	16,346	14,303	87.5%	2,043	12.5%
November	21,457	11,341	52.9%	10,116	47.1%
December	19,891	12,103	60.8%	7,788	39.2%
Total	221,547	149,006	67.3%	72,541	32.7%

Note: 2016 Court Activity figures shown above include parking tickets with trial requests from late 2015 and Re-openings/ Appeals from earlier years.