



REPORT FOR ACTION

Retention of Phase 2 Red Light Cameras

Date: May 8th, 2017
To: Public Works and Infrastructure Committee
From: General Manager, Transportation Services, and Director,
 Purchasing & Materials Management
Wards: All

SUMMARY

In July 2016, City Council unanimously endorsed the Vision Zero Road Safety Plan (RSP). The Vision Zero approach to road safety is to eliminate fatalities and serious injuries in our transportation system because no loss of life is acceptable. Where red light cameras have been installed in the City of Toronto they have reduced serious injuries by 23% and fatalities by 40%.

In light of these benefits, the purpose of this report is to request authority to continue to operate an additional 70 of the existing Phase 2 Red Light Cameras (RLC'S), for a total of 74 existing Phase 2 RLC's, which were previously scheduled for decommissioning in addition to the 75 new Phase 3 RLCs currently being constructed with activation in Q2 2017. The proposed expansion of the RLC program will be revenue neutral, with all operational costs being recovered.

The ongoing operation of the additional existing 70 RLCs will continue to reduce occurrences of killed or seriously injured (KSI) collisions resulting from red light running, and responds to direction to staff to explore opportunities to expand, enhance, or accelerate RSP programs and initiatives.

Staff are recommending that the expansion of the RLC program be carried out via a purchase order amendment and/or contract amendments as:

- there is urgency related to the Road Safety Plan in order to maintain these sites and continue to see reductions in angle KSI collisions;
- the timeframe required between RFP tendering, evaluation and redeployment of the RLC sites when the existing contractor is already mobilized;
- the currency of the existing contract which was market tested and illustrated that Traffipax, LLC offer best value to the City at the time of the last tender in Q4 2015; and
- That cost savings are unlikely to be realized as a different vendor would:
 - require a new central software and hardware processing system to be implemented which would require additional cost and time;
 - have to go through a proof of performance phase to validate that the technology meets the legislated requirements

Overall, this report reviews:

- The alignment of the RLC program with the City's Vision Zero Road Safety Plan;
- The required amendments to the Phase 2 Contract 47012243 awarded to Traffipax, Inc. (now known as Traffipax, LLC) and Phase 3 Contract No. 47020019 RLC awarded to Traffipax, LLC for the supply, installation, operation and maintenance of RLC's sites;
- Implementation considerations, including the financial impacts and the impacts to the Joint Processing Centre and Court Services; and
- The need to negotiate, enter into and execute a new agreement with the Ministry of Transportation for access and use of licence plate registration information

RECOMMENDATIONS

The General Manager, Transportation Services and the Director of Purchasing and Materials Management recommend that City Council authorize:

1. The General Manager, Transportation Services, to continue to operate the 70 existing Phase 2 Red Light Cameras, previously scheduled for decommissioning (Attachment 1) until 2021.
2. The General Manager, Transportation Services, to negotiate and execute amendments to the Phase 2 contract and Phase 3 contract with Traffipax, LLC such that the City can continue to operate and maintain an additional 70 existing Phase 2 red light camera sites for the period from June 1, 2017 to December 31, 2021 and to increase the value of the current contract (and the associated Blanket Contract No.47020019) by no more than \$9,498,184 net of all taxes (\$9,665,353 net of HST recoveries), on terms and conditions satisfactory to the General Manager, Transportation Services, and in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor.
3. An increase to the Transportation Services' 2017 Operating Budget of \$1,165,854 gross and net, to fund the 2017 portion of the purchase order amendment, licence plate information costs and the hiring of 2 new temporary positions to process additional offences and manage the Red Light Camera contract on a temporary contract basis up to December 31, 2017. These temporary positions to be considered for conversion to permanent staff as part of the 2018 budget process.
4. An increase to the Legal Services' 2017 Operating Budget of \$244,125 gross and \$0 net, fully recovered from Court Services, for the hiring of 5 new temporary positions to process additional offences and manage the expanded Red Light Camera program on a temporary contract basis up to December 31, 2017. These temporary positions to be considered for conversion to permanent staff as part of the 2018 budget process.
5. An increase to the Court Services' 2017 Operating Budget of \$739,375 gross and \$1,905,229 revenue for a total net revenue increase of \$1,165,854, which includes the hiring of 6 new temporary positions and associated processing costs (Provincial cost recovery payments, Legal staff cost recovery) to support the expanded Red Light Camera program on a temporary contract basis up to December 31, 2017. These

temporary positions to be considered for conversion to permanent staff as part of the 2018 budget process.

6. The General Manager of Transportation Services to negotiate, enter into and execute a new agreement with Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Ontario, as represented by the Minister of Transportation, for the access and use of licence plate registration information on terms and conditions generally as set out in this report and on such other terms and conditions satisfactory to the General Manager of Transportation Services and in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Purchase Order Amendments

Contract No. 47020019 with Traffipax, LLC for the Phase 3 RLC's is currently valued at \$10,553,538 net of all taxes (\$10,739,280 net of HST recoveries). In order to maintain the operation of an additional existing 70 Phase 2 RLC's, the Contract will be increased by \$9,498,186 net of all taxes (\$9,665,354 net of HST recoveries), for a total of \$20,051,724 net of all taxes (\$20,404,634 net of HST recoveries).

Transportation Services 2017 Operating Budget Impact

As a result of the increase in Red Light Cameras, there will be a corresponding increase to Transportation Services' 2017 Operating Budget of \$1,165,854 (net of all taxes) gross and net, reflective of cumulative costs for the Purchase Order Amendment, additional temporary staff (1 full-time and 1 part-time), and an increase of requests to the MTO for licence plate information from July 1st, 2017 to December 31st, 2017:

Table 1: Transportation Services 2017 Operating Budget Impact (net of all taxes)

Item	Cost	Operating Account
Purchase Order Amendment	\$1,055,354	TPO393 – GL4481
Staffing	\$88,000	TPO393 – GL1015 and GL1215.
Licence Plate Information	\$22,500	TPO393 – GL4424.
Total	\$1,165,854	--

For the period 2018 to 2021, Transportation Services will include as part of their annual Operating Budget submissions a total request for \$2,331,708 (net of all taxes) gross and net, including annualization costs.

Court Services 2017 Operating Budget Impact

The additional volume of charges generated as a result of the further RLC sites will require an extra six (6) temporary positions in Court Services. These positions will be

provided on a temporary basis through 2017, and included for consideration for conversion to permanent as part of the 2018 Operating Budget process.

To cover the costs for additional staffing, associated processing costs including Provincial cost recovery payments in Court Services and costs for additional Legal staffing to support the expanded Red Light Camera program, there will be a requirement for an in-year increase to Court Services' 2017 Operating Budget of \$739,375 (net of all taxes) gross and \$1,905,229 revenue for a total net revenue increase of \$1,165,854 reflecting the period of July 1st, 2017 to December 31st, 2017.

For the period 2018 to 2021, Court Services will include as part of their annual Operating Budget submissions a request for \$1,478,750 (net of all taxes) gross and estimated revenue of \$6,000,000 for a total net revenue increase of \$4,521,250, including annualization costs.

Legal Services 2017 Operating Budget Impact

The additional volume of charges generated as a result of the further RLC sites will require an extra 5 temporary positions in Legal Services. These positions will be provided on a temporary basis through 2017, and included for consideration for conversion to permanent as part of the 2018 Operating Budget process.

To cover the costs for the additional staffing there will be a requirement for an in-year increase to Legal Services' 2017 Operating Budget of \$244,125 (net of all taxes) gross and \$0 net, fully recovered from Court Services, reflecting the period of July 1st, 2017 to December 31st, 2017.

For the period 2018 to 2021, Legal Services will include as part of their annual Operating Budget submissions a request for \$488,250 (net of all taxes) gross and \$0 net, including annualization costs.

Net Costs

Table 2: Red Light Camera Operating Budget Impact Summary (net of all taxes)

Program	Gross	Revenue	Net
Transportation	\$1,165,854	\$0	\$1,165,854
Courts	\$739,375	\$1,905,229	(\$1,165,854)
Legal	\$244,125	\$244,125	\$0
Total	\$2,149,354	\$2,149,354	\$0

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of June 14 and 15, 2011, City Council adopted the recommendations of Public Works and Infrastructure Committee Report No. PW4.5 "Amendment to Contract No. 47012243 for the Supply, Installation, Operation, Maintenance, and Decommissioning of Red Light Camera Systems in the City of Toronto". This report details the extension of Contract No. 47012243 for the supply, installation, operation, maintenance and decommissioning of red light camera systems in the City of Toronto, issued to Traffipax Traffic Safety Systems for five additional one-year periods on an annual basis up to December 31, 2016. The Council decision can be found at:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2011.PW4.5>

At its meeting of September 30, October 1 and 2, 2015, City Council adopted the recommendations of Public Works and Infrastructure Committee Report No. PW7.8 "Red Light Cameras - Status Update and Phase 3 Contract Award (Request for Proposal No. 9148-15-5000 - 2017 to 2021)". This report discusses the award of the contract for the supply, installation, operation, maintenance and future removal of red light camera systems for the five (5) year period from January 1, 2017 to December 31, 2021 to Traffipax, LLC. The Council decision can be found at:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.PW7.8>

At its meeting of July 12, 13, 14 and 15, 2016, City Council endorsed the Road Safety Plan (2017-2021) and endorsed in principle the countermeasures and enhanced Road Safety Plan identified within the supplementary report (July 11, 2016). The report outlines the proposed safety countermeasures that will be implemented over a five (5) year period with the ultimate goal of eliminating traffic-related fatalities and serious injuries. The Council decision can be found at:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2016.PW14.1>

At its meeting of February 20, 2013, City Council adopted the recommendations of Public Works and Infrastructure Committee Report No. PW20.6 "Agreement Approvals Required for Red Light Camera Operations". This report details the previous agreement between the City of Toronto and the MTO in regards to access and use of licence plate registration information for the purposes of processing RLC related charges and can be found at:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.PW20.6>

COMMENTS

Alignment with the Vision Zero Road Safety Plan

In July 2016, City Council unanimously endorsed the Vision Zero Road Safety Plan (RSP). The Vision Zero approach to road safety is to eliminate fatalities and serious injuries in our transportation system because no loss of life is acceptable.

As part of the ongoing efforts in the roll-out of the Vision Zero RSP, City staff have been continuing the review of existing road safety countermeasures to assess their

effectiveness and determine whether there are opportunities to accelerate, enhance or expand programs.

One of the emphasis areas identified in Toronto's Vision Zero RSP is 'Aggressive Driving and Distraction' which would include red light running. Red Light Cameras have been recognized by many jurisdictions in North America as an effective safety countermeasure to reduce collisions attributed to aggressive driving.

In Toronto, based on a before and after (2001-2007 compared to 2008-2014) analysis of Phase 2 of the RLC program, injuries decreased from 1639 to 1266 and fatalities decreased from 5 to 3 at locations where RLC were installed. As a percentage, injuries were reduced by 23% and fatalities by 40%.

However, citywide there has been an increase in the number of killed or seriously injured (KSI) collisions. In 2015 and 2016, there were 387 and 393 KSI's respectively on all City streets. Further analysis of this data indicates that 153 and 170 KSI's respectively, occurred at signalized intersections. Therefore, it is critical that the City continues to take action to eliminate these fatalities and serious injuries at signalized intersections by implementing and maintaining existing safety countermeasures such as RLCs.

Program Background

In November 2000, Phase 1 of red light camera operations started in the City of Toronto with 10 cameras rotated through 38 different locations. Phase 2 of red light camera operations commenced in November 2007 and there are now 70 RLC sites in the field. City Council provided authority to operate this second phase of red light cameras until December 31, 2016.

In September of 2015, Transportation Services received authority to proceed with Phase 3 of the RLC program. Phase 3, proposed 75 new RLC's and a continuation of four existing sites from Phase 2, to operate between 2017 and 2021 with an option for a five (5) year extension period from 2022 to 2026. These Phase 3 sites are currently under construction with anticipated completion by July, 2017.

The selection of RLC sites has always been based on angle collision history. Angle collisions at signalized intersections are generally attributed to red light running and often result in fatalities and serious injuries. The sites selected in Phase 3 had seven (7) or more angled collisions in at least one direction over a 5 year period.

As per previous phases, it was recommended at the time that 70 existing Phase 2 RLCs in Attachment 1 be decommissioned and be replaced with new RLC sites in Phase 3. However, in order to move forward the goals of the Road Safety Plan, and reduce the number of KSI's at signalised intersections, it is now recommended that these additional 70 Phase 2 sites be retained.

Amendment of Contract with Traffipax, LLC

Traffipax, Inc. (subsequently known as Traffipax Traffic Safety Systems), now known as Traffipax, LLC, was the awarded contractor for the previous Phase 2 RLC contract and extensions that ended in December, 2016. Traffipax, LLC is the awarded contractor for

the new Phase 3 RLC contract effective January 1, 2017 awarded under Request for Proposal 9148-15-5000. Traffipax, LLC is mobilized to deliver Phase 3 and is prepared to continue to maintain the additional existing 70 Phase 2 sites. However, now that these additional Phase 2 sites are not recommended to be decommissioned as envisaged in Contract #47020019, an amendment will be required to cover the additional costs associated with these units over the next five (5) years. The recommended amendment will increase Phase 3 Contract No. 47020019 by \$9,498,184 net of all taxes (\$9,665,353 net of HST recoveries) from \$10,553,538 net of all taxes to \$20,051,722 net of all taxes (\$20,404,632 net of HST recoveries). An amendment will also be required to the Phase 2 Contract 47012243 in order to permit the existing Phase 2 RLC sites to remain in the field for the term described in this report. As the costs for decommissioning for the existing Phase 2 RLC sites have already been paid for under the Phase 2 Contract 47012243, the decommissioning for those Phase 2 RLC sites under the Phase 3 contract, as amended, will be at no cost to the City.

Within the current contract, Traffipax, LLC is responsible for the construction of the Phase 3 RLC sites, ongoing maintenance of the sites and the retrieval and delivery of RLC images from each of the respective sites back to the Joint Processing Centre (JPC) for processing. Under the current Phase 3 contract, Traffipax, LLC is also responsible to maintain 4 of the existing Phase 2 sites. Staff are recommending that an additional 70 existing Phase 2 sites be included within the Phase 3 contract, such that Traffipax, LLC would then also be responsible to maintain those additional Phase 2 sites, for a total of 74 Phase 2 sites. To continue maintaining the existing Phase 2 sites plus the additional 70 Phase 2 RLC sites, Traffipax, LLC would have to upgrade and replace the cameras in each camera housing to be compatible with the new central system, however all of the existing poles will be refurbished and underground plant will remain and can be reused.

Given that Traffipax, LLC would only be responsible for installing the new cameras into the existing housings and refurbishing the existing poles, a revised cost needs to be negotiated with Traffipax, LLC, albeit the rate would have to be amortized over the shorter operating period. The estimated costs have been included in the financial considerations.

Consideration was also given to the possibility of tendering a new RFP for this work however, this is not recommended as a viable option because of:

- the urgency of the Road Safety Plan to maintain these sites and continue to see reductions in angle KSI collisions;
- the timeframe required between RFP tendering, evaluation and redeployment of the RLC sites when the existing contractor is already mobilized;
- the currency of the existing contract which was market tested and illustrated that Traffipax, LLC offer best value to the City at the time of the last tender in Q42015; and
- that cost savings are unlikely to be realized as a different vendor would:
 - require a new central software and hardware processing system to be implemented which would require additional cost and time; and
 - have to go through a proof of performance phase to validate that the technology meets the legislated requirements.

Implementation Considerations

Impacts on the Joint Processing Centre

The City is currently one (1) of eight (8) municipalities designated by Provincial regulation to operate red light cameras in the Province of Ontario. In addition to managing its own red light cameras, the City currently operates the Joint Processing Centre (JPC) on the behalf of all Partnering Municipalities. The JPC is responsible for:

- oversight of the RLC contract whereby a vendor is responsible for installing and maintaining RLC sites;
- preparation of charging documents and notices; and
- preparation of evidence to be used in municipal prosecutions.

To maintain and operate the additional 70 Phase 2 existing sites in parallel with the 79 sites contemplated under the Phase 3 contract essentially entails a doubling of the City of Toronto's program. The retention of the additional existing RLC's would basically result in a doubling of the number of images to be reviewed, offences to be laid and disclosure packages to be prepared for Court Services. In addition, the retention would also need an increase in staff resources to provide contract oversight, maintenance coordination and asset management.

The JPC is currently staffed by four (4) full-time staff and 12 part-time Provincial Offences Officers. The four (4) full-time staff provide coordination and communications with the other seven (7) red light camera participating municipalities, management of the staffing and shift assignments for the Provincial Offences Officers, oversight of the red light camera contractor including the coordination of maintenance activities and approvals for invoicing, budget tracking for the operation of the JPC and tracking and reporting of red light cameras performance on behalf of the Province.

Given that there will be an increase in workload due the approximate doubling of the program; it is recommended that one (1) new full-time position be introduced in the JPC dedicated to:

- ensure all of the RLC sites continue to be operated as per contract requirements and to coordinate notifications to the contractor and other associated parties if and when systems require to be serviced or maintained; and
- provide greater oversight to the red light camera contractor with respect to invoicing, and overall budget tracking.

The Provincial Offences Officers are designated by the Province to review images captured by the red light cameras as potential offences, match images with license plate information from the Province, prepare and issue the pertinent charging documents, prepare disclosure packages and testify in court as required.

The 12 Provincial Offences Officers manage red light camera offences for all eight (8) participating municipalities. Each Provincial Offences Officer typically manages the offences from 25 red light camera sites per week. By extension, the additional 70 sites would require three (3) additional part-time Provincial Offences Officers to manage the increase in offences. However, the JPC would be able to find efficiencies by extending the amount of part-time hours afforded to existing staff in combination with the fact that

the new central processing system makes it easier and faster to review potential charges such that only one (1) additional Provincial Offences Officer would be required.

Both the full time JPC position and the Provincial Offences Officer position would be hired immediately in 2017 on a temporary contract basis up to December 31, 2017 and be requested as permanent positions in the 2018 budget.

Impacts on Court and Legal Services

In 2016, there were 34,539 RLC charges filed with Court Services. With the proposed expansion of the RLC program, the charges are expected to range between 60,000-70,000 charges per year.

Transportation Staff have met and discussed the additional work this will generate with Court Services. Whilst parking ticket disputes will move out of the court system to an administrative model later this year, additional staff resource will be required to manage the additional red light camera offences. In total, 11 additional staff will be required to provide administrative support and prosecutors across both Court and Legal services in order to collect and process fines as well as to coordinate cases where individuals have chosen to meet with a prosecutor to review the charges.

Court Services staff are responsible for RLC fine payment processing, coordination and scheduling of meetings with the City prosecutor, preparation of court documents and follow up to collect fines after a court decision has been made and/or to take additional enforcement action if fines are not paid. Based on the anticipated increase in the number of RLC charges that will need to be managed, Court Services has anticipated the need for 6 additional staff.

City Prosecutors have a legal obligation to disclose to individuals information about the RLC charges when requested ahead of a court proceeding. Prosecutors meet with individuals who have been charged with the RLC offence as part of the early resolution or trial process. Based on the anticipated increase in the number of RLC charges, Legal Services anticipates the need for two (2) additional prosecutors as well as three (3) administrative staff to provide support.

Resources will need to be revisited in subsequent years depending on the actual volume of charges that result from the expansion of the program.

Extension of the RLC Operational Agreement with the Ministry of Transportation of Ontario (MTO)

The new operational agreement with MTO is necessary in order for the City to continue to obtain access to the Provincial motor vehicle registration information and to enable charges to continue to be laid under the red light camera program. In the event that the City does not enter into the new operational agreement with MTO on or before June 30, 2017, the City's authority to operate red light camera systems may be terminated by MTO.

The initial red light camera operational agreement between the City and MTO took effect in April 2007 (the "2007 MTO Agreement"). The 2007 MTO Agreement provided the City with the authority to use licence plate registration information for laying red light

violation charges and established the City's requirements associated with the operation of red light camera systems. The 2007 MTO Agreement expired in April 2012.

The most recent red light camera operational agreement between the City and MTO took effect on April 1, 2012 (the "2012 MTO Agreement"). The 2012 MTO Agreement expired March 31, 2017. However, given that City staff were undertaking the internal review to assess the feasibility of expanding the red light camera program, MTO has continued to provide vehicle registration information under the 2012 MTO Agreement and has advised that it will do so until June 30, 2017. The new operational agreement with MTO will be back-dated with an effective date of April 1, 2017.

Unlike in the 2007 MTO Agreement and 2012 MTO Agreement, the term of the new operational agreement with MTO (the "MTO Agreement") shall be an initial term of five years, unless terminated earlier in accordance with the MTO Agreement. Further, the term shall be automatically renewed for five one-year periods provided that neither party notifies the other in writing, at least ninety calendar days prior to the expiration of the current term, of its intention not to renew.

With the exception of the above, the terms of the new MTO Agreement are generally the same as those contained in the 2012 MTO Agreement, with some minor operational changes. The terms of the proposed MTO agreement are further detailed in Attachment 3.

CONTACT

Myles Currie
Director, Traffic Management Centre
Transportation Services Division
Telephone: 416-392-5372
Email: Myles.Currie@toronto.ca

Joanne Kehoe,
Manager, Construction Services
Purchasing and Materials Management
Telephone: 416-392-7323
E-mail: Joanne.Kehoe@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Barbara Gray
General Manager, Transportation Services

Michael Pacholok
Director, Purchasing and Materials Management

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 - Existing RLC Locations Proposed to Remain in Operation
Attachment 2 - Safety Effectiveness - Phase 2 (2007-2014)
Attachment 3 - Terms of the Ministry of Transportation Agreement

**ATTACHMENT 1
EXISTING RLC LOCATIONS PROPOSED TO REMAIN IN OPERATION**

Steeles Ave. and Carpenter Rd.	Eastern Ave. and Coxwell Ave.
Steeles Ave. and Hilda Ave.	Midland Ave. and Progress Ave.
Albion Rd. and Silverstone Dr.	Lawrence Ave. and Bellamy Rd.
Albion Rd. and Finch Ave.	Eglinton Ave. and Birchmount Rd.
Dixon Rd. and Kipling Ave.	Danforth Rd. and Birchmount Rd.
Steeles Ave. and Islington Ave.	St. Clair Ave. and Brimley Rd.
Sheppard Ave. and Wilson Heights Blvd.	Keele St. and Lawrence Ave.
Bathurst St. and Sheppard Ave.	Bloor St. and Ossington Ave.
Lawrence Ave. and Marlee Ave.	Danforth Ave. and Greenwood Ave.
Lawrence Ave. and Bathurst St.	Queen St. and Woodbine Ave.
Bayview Ave. and Cummer Ave.	Jarvis St. and King St.
Finch Ave. and Willowdale Ave.	Lake Shore Blvd. and Leslie St.
Leslie St. and Lawrence Ave.	Lower Jarvis St. and The Esplanade
Leslie St. and York Mills Rd.	Lake Shore Blvd. and Carlaw Ave.
Bayview Ave. and Truman Rd. / Fifeshire Rd.	Keele St. and Rogers Rd.
Midland Ave. and McNicoll Ave.	Bloor St. and Dundas St.
Steeles Ave. and Birchmount Rd.	Yonge St. and Lawrence Ave.
Warden Ave. and Arkona Dr. / Cloverleaf Gt.	Spadina Ave. and Adelaide St.
Steeles Ave. and Brimley Rd.	Eglinton Ave. and Spadina Rd.
College St. and Bathurst St.	Lawrence Ave. and Don Mills Rd.
Lawrence Ave. and Morningside Ave.	Neilson Rd. and Sheppard Ave.
Dixon Rd. and Carlingview Dr.	Sheppard Ave. and Malvern St./Progress Ave
Dufferin St. and Glencairn Ave.	Ellesmere Rd. and Military Trl.
Overlea Blvd. and Thorncliffe Park Dr. / Beth Neelson Dr.	Warden Ave. and Comstock Rd.
Ellesmere Rd. and Kennedy Rd.	Islington Ave. and The Westway
Finch Ave. and Leslie St.	Danforth Ave. and Birchmount Rd.
Birchmount Rd. and Huntingwood Dr.	O Connor Dr and Bermondsey Rd/Yardley Ave.
Kingston Rd. and Port Union Rd. / Sheppard Ave.	Jane St. and Clair Rd. / Spenvally Dr.
Bloor St. and The West Mall	Jane St. and Bala Ave. / Emmett Ave.
Lake Shore Blvd. and Thirty Seventh St.	Eglinton Ave. and Bermondsey Rd. / Sloane Ave.
Kipling Ave. and Horner Ave.	Sheppard Ave. and Keele St.
The Queensway and North Queen St.	Burnhamthorpe Rd. and The East Mall
Wilson Ave. and Transit Rd. / Billy Bishop Way	Queen St. and Lansdowne Ave. / Jameson Ave.
Lake Shore Blvd. and Windermere Ave.	Dupont St. and Lansdowne Ave.
Warden Ave. and McNicoll Ave.	Keele St. and Wilson Ave.

ATTACHMENT 2
SAFETY EFFECTIVENESS - PHASE 2 (2007-2014)

Table 1 - Safety Effectiveness, Phase 2

Collision Type	Severity of Injury	Collisions Before RLC Installation (2001-07)	Collisions After RLC Installation (2008-14)	Collision Frequency Reduction (Before vs. After)	Collision Frequency Reduction % (Before vs. After)
Angle	Property Damage Only	855	695	- 160	- 19 %
	Injury	628	394	- 234	- 37 %

	Fatality	5	3	- 2	- 40 %
Rear End	Property Damage Only	2,271	2,878	+ 607	+ 27 %
	Injury	1,011	872	- 139	- 14 %
	Fatality	0	0	0	0 %

Attachment 3 - Terms of the MTO Agreement

The MTO Agreement specifies the responsibilities and requirements of each party. In exchange for licence plate ownership information, the City of Toronto is required to:

- use licence plate registration information solely for the purpose of identifying owners of vehicles which disobey red traffic signals for legal proceedings including the preparation of notices required by law;
- maintain staff and system security provisions to protect confidential information;
- comply with privacy laws;
- post signs at red-light camera sites;
- increase public awareness of the risk of red-light running through traffic safety advertising campaigns;
- report the collision history of monitored sites to the MTO; and
- pay the Province of Ontario fees.

Several provisions of the agreement require specific authority from City Council. These provisions are ones which:

- grant the MTO the right to stop providing licence plate registration information to the City at any time without notice. The potential consequences of accepting this provision is that if the interruption is temporary, Transportation Services would have to stop laying red-light running charges until the Ministry resumes the provision of licence plate registration information. If the interruption is permanent, Transportation Services would have to terminate the red-light camera program;
- deem the City of Toronto to be in default if the City of Toronto merges with another municipality, submits false or misleading information to MTO, commits a Privacy breach, fails to make payments or fails to post warning signs. If the City is deemed to be in default, MTO has the right to stop providing licence plate registration information and may terminate the agreement. The MTO may also terminate the agreement without cause on 60 days notice;
- require the City to indemnify the Government of Ontario in respect of any damages, losses or claims that may arise, among a broad range of matters, as a result of a breach of the agreement, as a result of the failure of the Province to provide information to the City or as a result of the use of inaccurate information which has been provided by the Province to the City. Under this provision, the City could be liable to third parties and the Province if it properly and through no negligence of its own relied on and used faulty information supplied by the Province; and
- grants MTO the right to adjust its fees in order to cover all costs to the Province of Ontario related to Red-Light Camera Systems. Although the relationship between the parties has been and continues to be good, under this provision, the City could potentially be charged with unexpected and unspecified future fees if the Province's cost of the operating the system were to change. Failure by the City to meet these provisions may result in a termination of the agreement either by the City or the Province. A termination of the agreement would result in the loss of the investment made by the City to reduce red-light running.

Some of the minor operational changes made in the MTO Agreement from the 2012 MTO Agreement are generally as described below:

- identifying the approved delivery channel to be ARIS;
- including service of notices by courier to registered licence plate holders;
- the obligation upon Toronto to ensure that no licensed information requests will be made and that no licensed information responses or licensed information will be received, transmitted, stored or retained by Toronto or on behalf of Toronto in the cloud;
- changing the timing by Toronto of posting signs to prior to the cameras becoming operational;
- the timing of reporting by the City to MTO on the types of collisions, volumes of each type of collision, number of charges laid, and the number and types of injuries and fatalities that occurred at each intersection equipped with a red light camera system;
and
- the timing of invoicing to Toronto by MTO