

**CITY DIVISIONS IN CLUSTER B  
PUBLIC RECOMMENDATIONS – FULLY IMPLEMENTED**

**Division:** Fire Services  
**Report Date:** 09/16/2013  
**Report Title:** Toronto Fire Services - Improving the Administration and Effectiveness of Firefighter Training and Recruitment

Rec. No.	Recommendation
32	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to consider the use of integrated technology devices, such as barcode scanners, to improve the timeliness, completeness, and accuracy of training attendance records.

**Division:** Toronto Building  
**Report Date:** 01/15/2014  
**Report Title:** Toronto Building - Improving the Quality of Building Inspections

Rec. No.	Recommendation
09	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to review the controls in place to ensure that revenue from partial occupancy permits is appropriately accounted for and collected.

**Division:** Transportation Services  
**Report Date:** 06/27/2016  
**Report Title:** Improving the Tendering Process for Paving Contracts

Rec. No.	Recommendation
03	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management Division, in consultation with the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Develop and implement specific criteria for identifying potentially unbalanced bids in road related contracts;</li> <li>b. Ensure appropriate data is captured to allow unbalanced bid analysis;</li> <li>c. Train staff on how to apply the criteria; and</li> <li>d. Develop a decision framework for accepting or rejecting materially unbalanced bids.</li> </ol>

**CITY DIVISIONS IN CLUSTER B  
PUBLIC RECOMMENDATIONS – PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED**

**Division: City Planning**

**Report Date: 03/31/2011**

**Report Title: City Planning Division-Community Benefits Secured Under Section 37 or 45 of The Planning Act**

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
01	The Chief Planner assess the status of community benefits secured since amalgamation (January 1, 1998) under Sections 37 and 45 of the Planning Act to provide an appropriate level of assurance that all cash and significant non-cash benefits that should have been received, have been received and report any uncollectible benefits to Council.	City Planning has implemented a procedure to assess the status of community benefits secured since amalgamation under Section 37 and 45 of the Planning Act to identify all cash and non-cash benefits. Outstanding contributions have been identified and actions undertaken to collect all outstanding cash and significant non-cash benefits. The collection process is ongoing. As a result some outstanding benefits have been received. City Planning will report any uncollected benefits not received to Planning and Growth Management Committee in the first quarter of 2019.

**Division: Fire Services**

**Report Date: 09/16/2013**

**Report Title: Toronto Fire Services - Improving the Administration and Effectiveness of Firefighter Training and Recruitment**

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
03	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to take the necessary steps to evaluate the goals and activities of the Professional Development and Training Division. Such steps should include but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Developing and using relevant and consistent key performance indicators that are aligned with the strategic goals of the Fire Master Plan;</p> <p>b. Determining the reporting requirements of training goals and activities, such as content, frequency, and recipients; and</p> <p>c. Ensuring necessary tools and information for measuring, monitoring and reporting activities consistently are available.</p>	<p>The recommendation has not been fully implemented, but work in this area is ongoing.</p> <p>An Executive Management reorganization took place in Toronto Fire Services (TFS) in 2017. From January to September 2017, the Deputy Fire Chief of the Professional Development and Training Division (PD&amp;T) was seconded to the Cluster B Policy, Planning and Finance Division. An acting Deputy Fire Chief was assigned to the portfolio.</p> <p>In August 2017, TFS restructured the PD&amp;T Division to better support operations and special operations training. The portfolio is now known as the Training and Technical Operations Division. Deputy Fire Chief Jim Kay oversees the Division effective September 2017.</p> <p>a. The development of key performance indicators (KPIs) has commenced within the Division. As part of the CFAI Accreditation Process, high level KPIs have been confirmed. The development of KPIs aligned</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		<p>with the TFS Transformation Plan/Master Fire Plan will continue in 2018.</p> <p>b. In 2017, TFS Enterprise Learning Initiative (ELI) learning specialist along with additional PD&amp;T staff, developed an internal records management process to enhance tracking and record keeping related to online training. Due to competing operational needs in the division, PD&amp;T staff allocations to this initiative was limited. The process is currently being implemented and will continue throughout 2018.</p> <p>c. Standard training reports are made available to TFS Management staff on a shared drive and are updated weekly. Administrative Assistants in all four Commands have access to run reports on an ad hoc basis.</p>
09	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, together with Professional Development and Training and Operations Division Chiefs, to conduct a review into the underlying reasons for the lack of instructor availability, and evaluate ways to address those reasons.</p>	<p>The recommendation has not been fully implemented, but work in this area is ongoing.</p> <p>As part of the TFS Transformation Plan, TFS is in the process of reviewing alternative training/service delivery models including a decentralized Shift-Training Instructor based model.</p> <p>It is anticipated that amendments to the Collective Agreement will be required in order to implement the training delivery model changes arising out of the TFS Transformation Plan.</p> <p>The estimated timeline for completion of this body of work is Q4-2018</p>
15	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure mandatory online training is completed on a timely basis. When firefighters fail to complete mandatory online training requirements, appropriate corrective action be taken. Any such corrective actions be incorporated into the standard operating guideline, and reiterated in staff communications.</p>	<p>The requirement to complete mandatory on-line training has been documented in SOG P-ONLI – Mandatory Online Training, issued in December 2016.</p> <p>Further, a comprehensive management strategy has been created and implemented by the TFS Administrative Services Division. The process is administered on a Command-wide basis by the Operations Platoon Chiefs and Division Commanders, and outstanding course lists are reviewed, at a minimum, on a monthly basis. The process has been successful in reducing the number of outstanding courses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- At the start of 2017, TFS identified 14,840 outstanding courses.</li> <li>- As of January 31, 2018, outstanding courses have been reduced by 78%, with 3294 outstanding courses remaining outstanding.</li> </ul>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 964 employees have been 'coached' by senior staff to ensure courses are completed in a timely manner</li> <li>- 12 employees have been issued warning letters for non-compliance</li> <li>- One (1) employee has been disciplined for non-compliance.</li> </ul> <p>Work in this area will continue to ensure outstanding courses and training continue to be addressed in all Commands and TFS Divisions. The ongoing management and review of mandatory training will continue as a normal course of management business by the Division.</p>
22	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to undertake a detailed review of National Fire Protection Agency's standard on Recommended Practices for Fire Service Training Reports and Records to ensure Toronto Fire Services' standard operating guidelines are aligned with recommended practices, where appropriate, and standard operating guidelines are updated accordingly.</p>	<p>The recommendation has not been fully implemented, but work in this area is ongoing.</p> <p>This completion of this objective is being complicated by the potential introduction of a series of new Regulations by the Ontario Provincial Government under the Fire Protection and Prevention Act (FPPA). The implementation of this objective will continue in accordance with the now-changing Regulatory framework and the associated Regulatory timeframes being considered by the Province of Ontario.</p> <p>Accordingly, An initial review is being completed by Deputy Fire Chief Jim Kay, which has been identified as a priority item since his recruitment into this role in September 2017. It is anticipated that work in this area will commence in the latter half of 2018, with completion estimated for Q2-2019</p>
23	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to consult the City's Human Resources Division, the Ontario Fire Marshal, and other municipal fire services and consider whether Toronto Fire Services can benefit from evaluation methodologies being used elsewhere.</p>	<p>The recommendation has not been fully implemented as a result of some fundamental Regulatory changes that are pending, but work in this area is ongoing.</p> <p>This completion of this objective is being complicated by the potential introduction of a series of new Regulations by the Ontario Provincial Government under the Fire Protection and Prevention Act (FPPA). The implementation of this objective will continue in accordance with the now-changing Regulatory framework and the associated Regulatory timeframes being considered by the Province of Ontario.</p> <p>TFS receives and reviews course feedback through a variety of avenues including hardcopy feedback forms, dedicated email account and electronic feedback via ELI. The feedback is reviewed by the Division Chief of PD&amp;T and staff responsible for developing training modules as well as delivering training, and implemented as appropriate.</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		<p>Revisions to the TFS Promotional Process, including all assessment centres and methodologies is underway and nearing completion, in collaboration with the Toronto Professional Fire Fighters' Association (TPFFA).</p> <p>A comprehensive review of evaluation methodologies, and specifically the potential transition into a Results-Based Accountability methodology is underway and work on this initiative will continue in the latter half of 2018, with completion expected by the end of Q4, 2018.</p>
25	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to develop and implement a records management policy. The policy should include, but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Ensuring standard operating guidelines dealing with records management practices and procedures are consistent and align with City policies; and</p> <p>b. Ensuring standard operating guidelines are complied with, such as obtaining and maintaining all required documentation on file.</p>	<p>The recommendation has not been fully implemented, but work in this area is ongoing.</p> <p>This completion of this objective is being complicated by the potential introduction of a series of new Regulations by the Ontario Provincial Government under the Fire Protection and Prevention Act (FPPA). The implementation of this objective will continue in accordance with the now-changing Regulatory framework and the associated Regulatory timeframes being considered by the Province of Ontario.</p> <p>A comprehensive Information Management Plan was developed in 2016. Currently, staff are developing a records management filing system and creating a central repository for all training records. Going forward, training records will be recorded in ELI. Work in this area is ongoing and will continue throughout 2018, with completion anticipated completion by Q2 - 2019.</p>
26	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to develop and implement a quality assurance process to verify the completeness, accuracy, and consistency of training records and ensure internal guidelines are followed.</p>	<p>The recommendation has not been fully implemented, but work in this area is ongoing.</p> <p>This completion of this objective is being complicated by the potential introduction of a series of new Regulations by the Ontario Provincial Government under the Fire Protection and Prevention Act (FPPA). The implementation of this objective will continue in accordance with the now-changing Regulatory framework and the associated Regulatory timeframes being considered by the Province of Ontario.</p> <p>In 2017, TFS Enterprise Learning Initiative (ELI) learning specialist along with additional PD&amp;T staff, developed an internal records management process to enhance tracking and record keeping related to online training. Due to competing operational needs in the division, PD&amp;T staff allocations to this initiative was limited. The process is currently being implemented and will continue throughout 2018. A</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		<p>quality assurance process will be included to ensure the completeness, accuracy and consistency of training records.</p> <p>Completion of this objective is anticipated by Q2-2019.</p>
31	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure controls are implemented that provide for timely, complete, and accurate data entry. Further, controls should include a data entry verification process.</p>	<p>The recommendation has not been fully implemented, but work in this area is ongoing.</p> <p>This completion of this objective is being complicated by the potential introduction of a series of new Regulations by the Ontario Provincial Government under the Fire Protection and Prevention Act (FPPA). The implementation of this objective will continue in accordance with the now-changing Regulatory framework and the associated Regulatory timeframes being considered by the Province of Ontario.</p> <p>In 2017, TFS Enterprise Learning Initiative (ELI) learning specialist along with additional PD&amp;T staff, developed an internal records management process to enhance tracking and record keeping related to online training. Due to competing operational needs in the division, PD&amp;T staff allocations to this initiative was limited. The process is currently being implemented and will continue throughout 2018. A quality assurance process will be included to ensure accurate data entries.</p> <p>Completion of this objective is anticipated by Q2-2019.</p>

**Division: Municipal Licensing & Standards**

**Report Date: 01/30/2013**

**Report Title: Municipal Licensing and Standards, Investigation Services Unit - Efficiencies Through Enhanced Oversight**

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
01	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to:</p> <p>a. review and, where appropriate, amend individual and organizational performance objectives particularly those pertaining to emergency complaints</p> <p>b. develop a quality assurance program to ensure that there is an ongoing review of staff's performance against objectives</p> <p>c. ensure that appropriate action is taken</p>	<p>a. Yes (provided in 2016): Performance objectives for Managers and Supervisors revised to include responsibility for performance reviews and in-field inspections. All divisional service standards are being reviewed.</p> <p>b. Yes (provided in 2016): Monthly reports are automatically generated and sent to Director, Managers/Supervisors by IBMS which identifies Officers' performance in terms of active Violation folders, workload analysis and missed inspections. These reports are reviewed by appropriate management levels to ensure that Officers are</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
	to address performance which does not meet the established standard.	<p>meeting the Division's performance objectives. Any issues arising from these monthly reviews are addressed by the management group.</p> <p>c. No: The Division will develop a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for reading, assessing and using monthly employee performance reports, including established standards. The SOP should include what to do when standards are not met and how to deal with a poor performer.</p> <p>Time Frame: Q4 2018.</p>
02	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to:</p> <p>a. develop and document organizational expectations for recording the progress and closure of investigations</p> <p>b. develop a management oversight process to ensure that policies and procedures and expectations are complied with. Particular emphasis be placed on the review of all emergency related complaints. The oversight process include appropriate levels of documentation and evidence of supervisory approval</p> <p>c. develop a process to ensure that investigations are assigned to appropriate staff with particular emphasis on reallocating files from staff who are absent for significant periods of time.</p>	<p>a. Yes (provided in 2016): Investigation Services continues to make improvements to its operational procedures and processes as a result the operational review completed in 2014. Currently, the rate of closure for 2015 files is 82% with an average time frame of 36 days to complete an investigation.</p> <p>b. No: A Divisional Quality Assurance Program is being developed in 2018. Automated IBMS reports have been created to assist Managers and Supervisors in monitoring Officers' performance in responding to service requests.</p> <p>c. Yes (provided in 2016): Supervisors review all assigned files to ensure a balanced workload for Officers, as well as to ensure that files are not assigned to Officers who are absent due to illness/vacation and/or training.</p> <p>An IBMS report is automatically generated on a monthly basis and sent electronically to all Managers and Supervisors in Investigation Services. This particular job responsibility is also an objective for all management staff within the 2016 Non-Union Performance Management Process.</p> <p>Timeframe: Q4 – 2018.</p>
08	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to report back to Council, as outlined in the 2013 budget request, on the results of the pilot project providing corporate vehicles to Municipal Standards Officers.	<p>The Division's goal is that all MSOs have access to a fleet vehicle to use during the course of their duties. In 2017 the Division purchased 20 new vehicles to bolster its complement of fleet vehicles. The 2016 business case for the purchase of 20 cars is attached. It outlines the rationale for purchasing additional cars based on the criteria such as visibility, accountability, safety, and efficiency.</p> <p>No stand-alone report back was done on the pilot project as originally outlined in the 2013 budget request. The 20 vehicles that were part of the pilot</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		<p>project were made a permanent part of the fleet via the budget process.</p> <p>The Division is proceeding with a plan to purchase additional vehicles (approximately 50) in 2018. This will increase the overall complement of fleet vehicles to a level that will ensure that all MSOs in Investigation Services have access to a fleet vehicle while performing their daily investigations/inspections.</p>

**Division: Toronto Building**

**Report Date: 01/15/2014**

**Report Title: Toronto Building - Improving the Quality of Building Inspections**

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
02	<p>City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to take the appropriate action to develop and implement an action plan to resolve dormant permits and priority be given to those with unresolved violations.</p>	<p>As part of the Division's dormant permit action plan, work to close existing permits is underway throughout all four districts. In 2017 priority was given to resolve dormant permits with violations. To date, of the 146,654 open permits identified in the Auditor General's report, 50,284 have been closed under this program.</p> <p>In addition, Toronto Building's dedicated enforcement unit has been working on closing open permits where an in depth review of outstanding issues is required. Pre-revocation letters are being sent to owners where there are open permits on record with no inspections performed in over a year. Information of the Active Permit Review Program is posted on the City of Toronto's website.</p> <p>Toronto Building has also implemented an Introductory Inspection; a service provided by an area building inspector when new permits are issued. The area inspector visits the site at the beginning of a project to go over what the responsibilities are for the homeowner/builder and emphasizing their responsibility to meet the requirement to close the permits once the work is completed. This service was implemented in Q4-2017 and will be closely monitored into 2018.</p> <p>A new report is in development that will support management controls of all open permits and provide enhanced tracking. This report is scheduled to be completed in Q2-2018 and will be used as part of the Division's dormant permit action plan.</p> <p>Toronto Building is targeting that all components of an action plan to manage dormant permits, with full</p>



Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		implementation of this recommendation will be completed by Q4-2018.
03	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director review the current administrative process and the controls related to outstanding violations. Such a process ensure that there is ongoing supervisory review of all outstanding violations. In particular, the review should include an immediate evaluation of "unsafe orders" and, where appropriate, immediate action be taken.	<p>To date, of the 3,735 active violations identified in the Auditor General's report, 2,391 have been closed by the Divisions inspection staff. Toronto Building has prioritized the evaluation of all "unsafe orders" in its review of outstanding violations. Where possible these were processed and cleared. A number of outstanding unsafe orders relate to MGOs (Marijuana Grow Operations). Clearance of these orders is pending the implementation of new legislation related to these operations.</p> <p>To strengthen management controls going forward, Toronto Building is developing a new enhanced report that will be used to administer all outstanding violations to ensure timely processing of these violations. It is expected the report will be completed put into operation in Q2-2018 with a target for full implementation of this recommendation by Q3-2018.</p>
07	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to ensure compliance with inspection documentation standards and that all inspection records are complete and reliable.	<p>Use of the RCS (Remote Computing System) has substantially increased since the review by the Auditor General. In addition to using the RCS to download their daily inspection requests, inspectors are utilizing the system to record their inspection results in the field.</p> <p>Toronto Building developed and has implemented an inspection status service on the corporate webpage. An applicant/owner/contractor/neighbour can input the address of a property and can obtain the status of any inspection stage including if any violation (orders) were issued on the property.</p> <p>In conjunction with Legal Services, the Division completed an Inspection Notes Guideline publication. Management has implemented training for all inspection staff using this document. The training program will continue to be delivered throughout 2018 utilizing ELI (Enterprise eLearning Initiative) to manage and track the progress of each inspector.</p> <p>To further strengthen the management review of inspector's entries into IBMS, the Division's inspection audit policy is being revised to include a review of inspection notes and records. This will include a consideration of the accuracy and completeness of information entered by the inspector pertaining to the purpose of the inspection and clear notations regarding building code deficiencies. The frequency of inspection audits is also being reviewed. The revised policy is planned to be implemented across all districts</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		<p>by Q2-2018. The Division anticipates this recommendation will be fully implemented by Q4-2018.</p>
10	<p>City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director review the current quality assurance process and take steps to ensure City-wide inspection practices are consistent and comply with established Divisional standards.</p>	<p>Through a realignment of existing positions within the Division's complement, a Building Compliance Quality Assurance team has been developed. Toronto Building has been working with HR (Human Resources) to establish positions for this team. Work has been completed to create job profiles and is now awaiting final approval from HR prior to filling these new positions. The new team will focus on improving the quality assurance process across all districts in the Division and will consist of two positions; one PCBIQA (Program Coordinator Building Inspections Quality Assurance) and two FABIQA (Field Assessor Building Inspections Quality Assurance).</p> <p>The PCBIQA will focus on developing and implementing standards, programs, policies, and procedures to ensure City-wide building inspection practices are consistent and comply with established Divisional Standards. The PCBIQA will also provide leadership and support to Divisional projects and the Inspections Coordinating Team, develop and coordinate staff training, and administer continuous improvement programs.</p> <p>The scope of work for the FABIQA will include assessing whether City-wide inspection practices are consistent and comply with established Divisional Standards, policies, and procedures. FABIQA will also be responsible for staff training, auditing employee performance, quality assurance monitoring, and supporting the development of Toronto Building's Quality Assurance program and tools.</p> <p>With the final approval of job profiles from Human Resources, it is expected that the Building Compliance Quality Assurance team will be operational by Q3-2018 with this recommendation from the Auditor General fully implemented by Q4-2018.</p>

**Division:** Toronto Building  
**Report Date:** 01/23/2012  
**Report Title:** Toronto Building Division - Building Permit Fees, Improving Controls and Reporting

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
01	<p>City Council request the Chief Building Official in consultation with related City</p>	<p>Toronto Building continues to work with Accounting Services to integrate the updated Full Cost Model that</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
	<p>divisions review, revise and monitor the accuracy and completeness of information used to calculate building permit fees on an annual basis.</p>	<p>was part of the User Fee Policy adopted by City Council.</p> <p>The MOU (Memorandum of Understanding) with Toronto Fire, the SLA (Service Level Agreement) with I&amp;T (Information and Technology) and the clarification of the scope of work currently provided by ML&amp;S (Municipal Licencing and Standards) Prosecutions Unit, will complete the required information needed to more accurately establish the indirect costs associated with the enforcement of the Building Code Act. (Details on the status of divisional agreements is provided in the update to Auditor Generals recommendation 02).</p> <p>Once agreement on the allocations under the full costing model are determined, along with the completion of the service agreements with other divisions, the indirect costs associated with Toronto Building's administration and enforcement of the Building Code Act will be fully clarified and will be used to confirm building permit fees on an ongoing basis.</p> <p>Completed by: Q4-2018.</p>
02	<p>City Council request the City Manager formalize service level agreements with key divisions supporting the Toronto Building Division permit process. Service level agreements should set forth anticipated service levels and applicable charges.</p>	<p>In Q4-2017 Toronto Building and Toronto Fire reached a new agreement on the respective roles related to the enforcement of the Building Code, fire and life safety system requirements. A new MOU (Memorandum of Understanding) was approved in October 2017, changing the work required by Toronto Building and Toronto Fire. The MOU provides clear direction on the service level expectations of each division and has resulted in eliminating the need to attribute Toronto Fire service costs to Toronto Building for the enforcement activity associated with the Building Code.</p> <p>The SLA (Service Level Agreement) between Toronto Building and I&amp;T (Information and Technology) has been completed. I&amp;T costs incurred in support of Toronto Building are reviewed and adjusted on a regular basis to ensure they are accurately reflected in the calculation of building permit fees.</p> <p>Toronto Building is undertaking a review of the work that is currently provided by ML&amp;S (Municipal Licencing and Standards) Prosecutions Unit, in support of Toronto Building's administration and enforcement of the Building Code Act. The review will consider the respective roles, responsibilities and best options to complete the work associated prosecutions (service of orders under the Building Code Act and</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		<p>documentation preparation for court proceedings). The review may result in Toronto Building assuming all or part of the work associated with prosecutions currently provided by ML&amp;S.</p> <p>Once the review has been completed and costing is clarified, this recommendation can be fully implemented.</p> <p>Completed by: Q4-2018.</p>
08	<p>City Council request the Chief Building Official to ensure that the annual report on building permit fees includes additional information explaining the differences between building permit fees collected and the amounts included in the annual report.</p>	<p>Toronto Building is supporting a review of costs associated with the enforcement of the Building Code Act that is being undertaken by MBNC (Municipal Benchmarking Network Canada, formerly known as OMBI) MBNC established a Financial Advisory Panel made up of financial experts from participating municipalities, including the City of Toronto. The review will include an analysis of both direct and indirect costs related to administering the Building Code Act. A focus of the review will be to determine what indirect costs should be used to reflect more consistently across municipalities, the actual cost used to determine building permit fees. The findings of the Financial Advisory Panel will be reviewed by the Building Expert Panel of MBNC. Toronto Building is represented on the Building Expert Panel and will bring forward this review to be considered for this audit recommendation.</p> <p>There continues to be ongoing discussions between the Ministry of Municipal Affairs (MMA) Additionally, Toronto Building is conducting a review to consider best practices and a consistent approach with other municipalities to satisfy the requirement for the annual report on fees required by the Building Code Act s.7(4). This review will consider revenue deferral and reserve funding practices.</p> <p>Toronto Building will implement any necessary changes once requirements are clarified.</p> <p>Completed by: Q4-2018.</p>

**Division: Transportation Services**

**Report Date: 06/27/2016**

**Report Title: Improving the Tendering Process for Paving Contracts**

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
01	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, in consultation with the Director,</p>	<p>a. Transportation Services is conducting a reverse bid analysis of all contracts annually by the end of February each year for the prior year's construction</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
	<p>Purchasing and Materials Management Division, to implement a process to assess the impact of awarding construction contracts to materially unbalanced bids tendered by the Division. Steps to be included in the process should consist of:</p> <p>a. Performing a reverse bid analysis of unit price Transportation contracts on an annual basis to quantify the negative financial impact of materially unbalanced bids; and</p> <p>b. Performing reconciliations between planned and actual road construction contracted services and costs to identify negative impact of materially unbalanced bids on service delivery, such as cancellations or delays in work.</p>	<p>season. This was first done in 2017 for the 2016 construction contract season. Any negative financial impact of materially unbalanced bids is identified by the end of February each year.</p> <p>b. Planned and actual road construction contract quantities and costs are reviewed by Transportation Services by February each year for the previous year, to identify any negative impact of materially unbalanced bids on service delivery, such as cancellations or delays in work. For any Purchase Order Amendments (POA) a reverse bid analysis including the amended quantities is being completed by Transportation Services at the time of the POA.</p>
02	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to take steps to ensure quantity estimates in tender documents are reasonably accurate. Steps to be taken should include but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Analyzing historical information on prices and quantities;</p> <p>b. Ensuring that road resurfacing tender documents contain actual field measurements such as original handwritten notes and drawings from the field, and documented rationale for changes to the estimated quantities;</p> <p>c. Ensuring staff justify the significant variances between estimated and actual quantities and such explanation clearly indicate why the variances could not have been anticipated;</p> <p>d. Requiring staff responsible for estimation to sign off on the estimated quantities and any subsequent changes to the estimated quantities; and</p> <p>e. Ensuring measurements taken for estimation purposes are reviewed by management for reasonability.</p>	<p>a. Transportation Services has completed a review of prior year contracts: historical trend analysis of 2013, 2014, 2015, 2016 and 2017 contracts to identify variances for road construction contracts. Similar analysis will be completed for future contracts.</p> <p>b. As of 2017 Transportation Services no longer delivers its annual local road resurfacing program, which is now delivered by Engineering and Construction Services. To ensure that original handwritten notes and drawings from the field are retained for any future tender, a secure district-based centralized filing system was implemented in 2016. Transportation Services also implemented a new procedure to document any changes in item quantities after the field estimates are completed and the rationale for the changes.</p> <p>c. Transportation Services has implemented a procedure where any significant differences between actual quantities and estimates are documented and reported to senior management via Concurrence Memo, with appropriate explanations and sign off by management.</p> <p>In Q3 2016 an "Items Overruns/Under Justification Report" was implemented by Transportation Services to ensure staff justify the variances between estimated and actual quantities and such explanation focus on why the variances could not have been anticipated.</p> <p>d. Transportation Services has taken steps to ensure records are comprehensive and accurate with appropriate sign off and ensure all tender quantities are sufficiently supported. This was completed for 2016 Local Road Resurfacing contracts. As of 2017 Transportation Services no longer delivers its annual local road resurfacing program, which is now</p>

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
		delivered by Engineering and Construction Services. The Transportation Services Contract Sub Group has reviewed and revised the estimating methodologies in October 2016, and again
04	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, and the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management Division, to ensure that bid information and contract documents are organized in a manner that facilitates analysis of historical tender information.	<p>PMMD revised its procedure related to properly documenting a procurement file and provided training to Divisional staff in two quarterly staff meetings, and in additional manager meetings. Part of the revision was to clearly indicate that PMMD will retain original copies of all submissions to RFxs.</p> <p>As part of PMMD's Supply Chain Transformation, the City is implementing SAP Ariba which will move the procurement process from a paper based system to an electronic system. This will further facilitate the proper record retention and analysis of procurement information.</p> <p>Transportation Services has ensured that paper contract files are locked every day in filing cabinets and old files are archived locally and centrally, to ensure these files are available and secure.</p> <p>Transportation Services standardised its major contract items numbers in Q4 2017, and will number special bid items in a continuous manner to facilitate analysis of historical tender information.</p>
05	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management Division, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to develop and implement an effective policy to address potential risks arising from sub-contracting arrangements between competitive bidders.	PMMD has launched a working group to consider how to approach this issue. Timeline Q4 2018.
06	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to review differences in district practices in relation to preparation of tender estimates and record keeping with a view to ensuring best practices are incorporated in all district offices.	<p>Transportation Services' Contract Sub Group has reviewed District best practices in relation to tender estimate preparation and record keeping (completed in Q3 2016).</p> <p>Current best practices for tender estimate preparation and record keeping documentation have been developed and standardized across all Transportation Districts, and were incorporated into Transportation's Contract Inspection Manual which was revised in Q4 2017 and rolled out to each District.</p>
07	City Council request the City Manager to forward this audit report to other relevant City divisions and major agencies and corporations which acquire contracted	The City manager will forward the report to the identified agencies and corporations for review by Q3 2018.

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
	construction services on a regular basis for information.	

**Division: Transportation Services**

**Report Date: 04/25/2012**

**Report Title: Inventory Controls Over Traffic Control Devices in Transportation Services Need to be Improved**

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Management Comments
08	City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer to take appropriate action to identify City operations that maintain a significant level of inventory and review those operations to ensure adequate inventory controls are in place such as those identified in City's warehouse and stores business model as adopted by Council in the Corporate Warehouse/Stores Rationalization Project.	<p>Purchasing and Materials Management has completed the review of all Divisions and Units that had identified holding significant inventory from the survey results of 2012. Where inventory was held outside of a Corporate or Divisional Store it was recommended the Division/Unit not maintain more than a few weeks' worth of operational demand for such inventory.</p> <p>There areas include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PF&amp;R Rockcliffe yard &amp; Kipling yard: Confirmed that common goods are acquired through City Stores and the two storage locations are no longer operating.</li> <li>• LTHCS: All Homes are now using City Stores with the exception of some items that are procured through PMMD.</li> <li>• OEM: City Stores now holds the OEM's emergency supplies saving the OEM storage space rental costs of \$48,000/year.</li> <li>• Toronto Water - Ashbridges Bay Treatment Plant: An existing secured central storage area within the Ashbridges Bay Treatment Plant that has adequate inventory controls in place currently stocks consumable items such as personal protective equipment, shovels, soap, paper towels, toilet paper, and other low value items from Corporate Stores. PMMD in conjunction with TW are continuing to evaluate the need for adding further products into the central storage area that are currently kept in other secured areas throughout the plant, but not currently maintained by an inventory control system.</li> </ul> <p>Expected Completion Timeline: End of Q2 2019 (for evaluation and workplan development by PMMD and Toronto Water).</p>