

Survey of Circular Economy Procurement in Other Jurisdictions

Staff surveyed a total of 111 jurisdictions to determine whether they had a Circular Economy policy or had embedded Circular Economy language into their public procurement processes. Out of the 111 jurisdictions, 37 responded. The list of survey questions asked are located in Table 1 and the results of the survey are found in Tables 2 and 3.

Out of the 37 jurisdictions that responded, 33 jurisdictions reported having no Circular Economy policy in procurement while four jurisdictions reported having no formal policy, however did include elements of circular economy within their sustainable procurement processes. These four jurisdictions included the City of Oslo in Norway, the City of Windsor, the Government of BC and the City of Columbus in Ohio.

City of Oslo

The City of Oslo provides municipal agencies with strategic provisions to guide them in implementing Circular Economy principles within procurement under their new strategy released in October 2017 for the procurement of goods, services, buildings and construction. Procurement as a powerful instrument for a greener city requires that Oslo Municipality use procurement to accelerate Oslo's green shift, climate goals and circular economic thinking by adopting procurement processes that strengthen the competitiveness of climate and environmentally-friendly solutions that leave a minimal environmental footprint and have quality based on high expectations, a long lifespan and ample opportunities for repurposing.

City of Oslo's strategic procurement provisions relating to Circular Economy principles include:

1. Ensuring that in planning procurements, the municipality aims to become an emissions free city.
2. That the municipality continuously makes a strong stand for increased recycling, repurposing and sharing including making arrangements for the greatest possible repurposing and recycling of materials.
3. Uses category management to increase the portion of sustainable materials as well as organic food and beverages.
4. Calculates the cost of delivery from a life-cycle perspective including climate and environmental impacts and the use of resources throughout the entire lifespan from production and consumption to the disposal phase.
5. Develops green rental leases for municipal leasing of premises.

6. Prioritizes transportation based on zero emissions or biofuels.
7. Procures vehicles and construction machinery that have zero emission technology to conduct all construction work.
8. That Oslo will assess whether bio-plastics are to be required, as this can provide positive and more environmentally friendly solutions/products.
9. That Oslo will not procure tropical timber unless there are reliable approval schemes that ensure that the timber or wood originates from sustainable and legal harvests.

City of Windsor

The City of Windsor's Sustainable Purchasing Guide provides guidelines to staff that ensure purchase of goods and services that are environmental friendly. This includes low toxicity, reduced packaging, life cycle considerations, and reduction of unnecessary/short-term purchases.

More specifically, the guide provides staff with guidelines on things to consider within specifications for goods and services procured under key purchasing categories such as general building maintenance, janitorial products, vehicle maintenance, furniture and office systems, office equipment and related services, office supplies, lighting and lighting systems, construction, renovation and demolition, parks recreation amenities and landscaping and food.

Broadly, the specifications encourage staff to consider procuring goods and services with:

- highest recycled content including environmentally friendly packaging, and preference for products that have been environmentally certified by organizations such as ECOLOGO, Green Seal or GREENGUARD;
- low or no fumes and preferably no volatile organic compounds;
- product longevity including signs of durable construction and low maintenance;
- consulting with the Essex Winsor Solid Waste Authority to consider disposal and recycling options;
- cleaning products should be purchased in containers which are reusable, returnable or recyclable;
- preference for procuring blended fuels such as ethanol blended gasoline;

- consider the reuse of existing furniture to avoid final disposal and purchasing new furniture from companies that demonstrate environmental responsibility in their manufacturing processes;
- consider procuring energy efficient lighting systems with Energy Star or Energuide certifications and procure goods with preference for distribution and end of use disposal by the same contractor;
- reduce unnecessary impact on environment in the form of additional chemicals and unsustainable forestry practices (especially for procurement of paper); and,
- encourage procurement of locally grown food packaged using unbleached paper and or recyclable plastics.

Government of BC

The Government of BC provides its ministries with procurement guidelines to procure environmentally responsible products and services. These guidelines require ministries to:

1. Where feasible and cost effective, give preference to purchasing environmentally sensitive products and services.
2. Procure environmentally sensitive products and services on a trial basis to ensure performance and technical requirements are met, prior to making longer term purchasing commitments.
3. Evaluate the environmental impact over the life cycle of each product compared to the alternatives, by taking into account economic and environmental impact, production processes used, energy use, maintenance, and disposal requirements.
4. Evaluate the proponents' corporate environmental substantiality policy as part of the purchasing process.
5. Consider specifying that products be certified under a relevant environmental labelling program in the solicitation document. Evaluation is left up to the ministries to implement according to their business needs. Municipalities are not governed by these sustainable purchasing guidelines and may have their own processes.

City of Columbus

The City of Columbus requires its agencies to develop specifications to require the purchase of environmentally preferable products or services ("EPPS") unless a determination is made there is not an acceptable EPPS for a good or service. For goods and services that are of a specialized or unique nature, EPPS specifications are developed on a case-by-case basis. As part of their procurement planning, staff are

encouraged to consider life cycle costs of goods and services being procured including continuously working to conserve resources through waste prevention, reduction, reuse, recycling and reclamation.

TABLE 1: LIST OF SURVEY QUESTIONS ASKED:

No.	Question
1.	<p>Does your Municipality/organization's Procurement Division currently have a Circular Economy (CE) policy/ Framework or Circular Economy language for procurement in place? <i>(Please see below for our definition of Circular Economy).</i></p> <p>A circular economy approach to goods and service procurement focuses on shifting away from the current system of "take, make, use and dispose." Instead it challenges us to rethink our current ways of providing services by considering three core principles:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. We can find new ways to deliver services, purchase goods, and enter into contracts that reduce our reliance on non-renewal resources, minimizes our carbon footprint and use less toxic materials. 2. Once we are using a resource we can pilot, research and collaborate with others or ask the marketplace and industry to work with us to find ways to extend its lifecycle to ensure maximum useful potential (think reduce, share, repair, reuse, recycle and nutrient/energy recovery for organic materials). 3. We can continue to look for ways to redesign our systems and service delivery service in order to reduce any waste or inefficiency through further research, collaboration, innovation, prototyping and pilots.
2.	What types of sustainable purchasing does your municipality/organization currently include within its procurement process?
3.	Would your organization be willing to share a copy of these sustainable purchasing processes with us?
4.	If yes, please provide a web link to where your sustainable purchasing policies can be accessed.
5.	If you answered yes to Q2 above (please complete questions 5 to 8):
6.	Please briefly describe how your municipality/ organization measures/evaluates Circular Economy principles as part of the procurement process.
7.	In What year did your municipality/ organization implement a Circular Economy policy for procurement?
8.	Would your Procurement Division be willing to share a copy of your Circular Economy in Procurement policy/ Framework with us?

TABLE 2: SUMMARY OF RESPONSES TO SURVEY QUESTIONS

Jurisdictions that reported having no Circular Economy Policy in Procurement:

No.	Jurisdiction	Relevant Survey Questions		
		Q1. Have a CE Policy?	Q2: Types of other Sustainable Procurement Policies?	Q3. Willing to share these policies?
1.	City of London	No Policy	Sustainable Purchasing and Supplier Code of Conduct are part of our Procurement of Goods and Services Policy (By-Law).	No
2.	Municipality of Clarington	No Policy	No official policy. However, the municipality does try to buy where possible, products that leave a smaller carbon foot print and to reuse. When there is no use for a particular product, the municipality tries to sell it rather than send it to a land fill.	No
3.	City of Markham	No Policy	Sustainable Purchasing Guide.	Yes
4.	Town of Caledon	No Policy	Green purchasing policy included in the Purchasing Bylaw.	Yes
5.	Town of Ajax	No Policy	Green Procurement Policy	Yes

No.	Jurisdiction	Relevant Survey Questions		
		Q1. Have a CE Policy?	Q2: Types of other Sustainable Procurement Policies?	Q3. Willing to share these policies?
6.	Corporation of the City of Pickering	No Policy	None	No
7.	City of Kitchener	No Policy	Green Procurement	Yes
8.	City of Mississauga	No Policy	Environmental, Ethical and Social Considerations. very early stages as policy came into effect on January 1, 2018	Yes
9.	City of Thunder Bay	No Policy	The Corporation is committed to a procurement process for Goods and Services that takes into account sustainable environmental and ethical procurement considerations including Corporate Social Responsibility and embedding ethical, environmental, social and economic performance criteria into all Corporate supply chain procedures, processes and activities.	Yes
10.	Region of Waterloo	No Policy	No formal sustainable Policy. However, considers as part of procurement, LEED building standards, recycled content in Blue Bins/Green Bins, recycled content in Paper products and janitorial cleaning products.	No
11.	Town of Oakville	No Policy	Have a comprehensive green procurement policy	Yes

No.	Jurisdiction	Relevant Survey Questions		
		Q1. Have a CE Policy?	Q2: Types of other Sustainable Procurement Policies?	Q3. Willing to share these policies?
12.	Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville	No Policy	None	No
13.	City of Hamilton	No Policy	None	No
14.	City of Brampton	No Policy	Green Procurement and The City of Brampton recently adopted a new Purchasing Bylaw that includes, as one of its principles, a section to support of Sustainable and Ethical Procurement.	Yes
15.	Regional Municipality of Peel	No Policy	Currently developing a Sustainable Procurement Policy and procedures to support its implementation in summer 2018. Also have an approved Corporate Social Responsibility Strategy and In certain applicable procurements, they do source products and services that are either supporting or directly providing environmental, social and/or economic benefits. For example, procuring services from a vendor to support at risk youth to provide job training opportunities, energy saving LED lights with rebates and procuring green fleet and LEED like building standards for construction services.	Yes
16.	The Corporation of the City of Niagara Falls	No Policy	None	No

No.	Jurisdiction	Relevant Survey Questions		
		Q1. Have a CE Policy?	Q2: Types of other Sustainable Procurement Policies?	Q3. Willing to share these policies?
17.	Toronto Parking Authority	No Policy	None	No
18.	Toronto Transit Commission (TTC)	No Policy	Green Procurement, Social Procurement and Ethical Procurement.	Yes
19.	Exhibition Place	No Policy	As a Board of the City, Exhibition place follows the policies and procedures the City has in place.	No
20.	Toronto Public Library	No Policy	Environmentally Responsible Procurement Policy which considers as part of their RFP template, the use of environmentally preferred products that are less harmful to the environment.	Yes
21.	Metrolinx	No Policy	Currently drafting a sustainable procurement Policy and Vendor Code of Conduct,	No
22.	City of Winnipeg	No Policy	Currently developing its sustainable procedures with a focus on Green and Social procurement.	Yes
23.	Halifax Regional Municipality	No Policy	Looks at Environmental impact for sustainability.	Yes
24.	City of Edmonton	No Policy	Have a Sustainable Purchasing Policy which is being updated this year to incorporate social procurement elements.	Yes

No.	Jurisdiction	Relevant Survey Questions		
		Q1. Have a CE Policy?	Q2: Types of other Sustainable Procurement Policies?	Q3. Willing to share these policies?
25.	City of Calgary	No Policy	Have Green Procurement that considers Environmental aspects. In addition, also have social and ethical procurement, purchase from certified vendors. The City of Calgary is also has an environmental management system (EnviroSystem) that is registered internationally with ISO 14001 and uses international environmental standards and/ or environmental labeling and guidelines in specifications, including supplier code of conduct within RFX's and evaluating ethical and environmental commitment through questionnaires that are used in the evaluation process of RFX's.	Yes
26.	City of Vancouver	No Policy	Have a formal Sustainable Ethical Procurement program (SEP) and are working towards a Social Procurement framework in 2018	Yes
27.	City of Montreal	No Policy	Green Procurement, Environmental Preferences, Ethical Purchasing, Corporate Social Responsibility and Social Procurement	Yes

No.	Jurisdiction	Relevant Survey Questions		
		Q1. Have a CE Policy?	Q2: Types of other Sustainable Procurement Policies?	Q3. Willing to share these policies?
28.	Province of Nova Scotia	No Policy	Our policy is called the sustainable procurement policy and includes many elements such as Social procurement, green and environmental procurement.	Yes
29.	City of Los Angeles	No Policy	Currently have the following: Small Local Business Preference, Environmentally Preferable Products Purchasing, Sweat-Free Procurement, First Source Hiring program, Local Business Preference, Business Inclusion Program.	Yes
30.	City of San Diego	No Policy	The City of San Diego has an Environmentally Preferential Purchasing Program.	Yes
31.	City of Sydney Council, Australia	No Policy	No formal integration with procurement but Considers Environmental aspects where appropriate.	Yes
32.	City of Stockholm, Sweden	No Policy	Green procurement, ethical purchasing, CSR, social inclusion/ employment opportunities,	Yes
33.	Administration for environmental Protection of Berlin (Ministry at Federal level).	No Policy	Have a regulation for environmentally friendly procurement by the Senate of Berlin that is valid for all public divisions of the City and state of Berlin.	Yes

TABLE 3: SUMMARY OF RESPONSES FOR JURISDICTIONS WITH SOME CIRCULAR ECONOMY PRINCIPLES IN PROCUREMENT

Jurisdictions that reported having no formal Circular Economy policy but incorporate some elements of Circular Economy principles in procurement included:

Survey Question Responses	Jurisdictions			
	City of Oslo	City of Windsor	Government of BC	City of Columbus,
Q1. Have a CE Policy?	Yes Have a Policy	Yes Have a Policy	Yes Have a Policy	Yes Have a Policy
Q2: Types of other Sustainable Procurement Policies?	Green procurement, Ethical procurement, fair trade, social procurement	Purchase environmentally friendly goods. This includes low toxicity, reduced packaging, life cycle considerations, and reduction of unnecessary/short term purchases.	Corporately there are Guidelines for Procurement of Environmentally Friendly Products and Services and a ministry (Social Development and Poverty Reduction) also has Social Impact Purchasing Guidelines.	Have an Environmentally preferable purchasing which ensure agencies develop specifications for the purchase of environmentally preferable products or services ("EPPS") unless a determination is made there is not an acceptable EPPS for such goods or services.

Survey Question Responses	Jurisdictions			
	City of Oslo	City of Windsor	Government of BC	City of Columbus,
Q3. Willing to share these policies?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Q5. How are CE principles measured/ evaluated as part of procurement process?	<p>Arrangements are to be made for the greatest possible re-purposing and recycling of materials. The municipality calculates the cost of delivery from a life-cycle perspective. Climate and environmental impact as well as the use of resources throughout the entire lifespan - from production, consumption and to the disposal phase are also included as far as possible in the calculation, and provisions are to be set out for which solutions are chosen.</p>	<p>Conduct periodic environmental assessments, at which point policy success is reviewed</p>	<p>Current processes are guidelines only, with evaluation left up to the ministries to implement according to their business needs and Core Policy and Procedures Manual (CPPM). Note that municipalities are not governed by CPPM and may have their own processes.</p>	<p>In determining whether an acceptable EPPS exists for a specific good or service, city departments consider:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) If the EPPS is cost-effective, including, but not limited to, life-cycle costs (2) If the EPPS is known or anticipated to perform as needed (3) If the EPPS is available in the necessary timeframe (4) If a competitive market exists for the EPPS and; (5) If reliance on an EPPS would adversely impact the quality and reliability of the good or service to be procured.

Survey Question Responses	Jurisdictions			
	City of Oslo	City of Windsor	Government of BC	City of Columbus,
Q6. In what year was the CE policy implemented?	2017	2013	2014	2012
Q7. Is your Municipality willing to share the CE policy/ Framework with us?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes