

ATTACHMENT 3: COMPETITOR RATES ANALYSIS

The TPA Board Policy 2-1, Parking Rates – Off Street Facilities establishes three (3) guidelines for the relationship of the parking rates at Toronto Parking Authority facilities as compared to privately owned/operated parking facilities offering parking to the general public (“private lots”):

1. the half-hourly rate should normally be less than 75 percent of the average of nearby competitor rates;
2. the day maximum should normally be not less than the average of nearby competitor rates (benchmarked to competitors’ early bird rates where appropriate); and,
3. the monthly rate should normally be between fifteen and twenty times the day maximum (benchmarked to the new proposed day maximum).

These benchmarks were established to achieve the overall mandate of TPA, namely, to support local businesses which were facing competition from rapidly expanding suburban establishments offering ample free parking, by providing customers with affordable, convenient, clean and safe parking options (first guideline) and to discourage discretionary journey to work commuting trips by encouraging commuters to use other modes (second guideline). These principles remain core to TPA operations, and largely of the City as reflected in the transportation and parking policies in the Official Plan. When applying the guidelines with respect to competitor rates, however, staff are cognizant of the following:

1. Number of “competitors” across the City vs. TPA’s 200+ facilities - Outside the commercial centres, there are significantly less, or in some cases, no competitors in proximity to TPA lots. From TPA’s perspective, the “competitor” parking market is generally limited to those TPA facilities in intense commercial areas of the city, including the Downtown core and periphery, and the nodes centered on Yonge/Bloor, Yonge/St. Clair, Yonge/Eglinton, and North York Center. Therefore, Policy 2-1 is essential applicable to only a select portion of the City and TPA’s off-street inventory.
2. Changing Nature of the Parker and Rates in Competitors vs. TPA facilities - In the commercial areas where the “competitors” are applicable, the ratio of private and municipal parking spaces to trips by all modes to these locations has changed substantially over the years. The TPA no longer operates traditional journey to work parking in the core commercial areas and will not provide this type of parking in facilities as TPA facilities redevelop. The TPA has largely phased out its monthly parking permits in the core commercial areas as these permits are almost entirely used for journey to work trips. On the other hand, the competitor market continues to reduce, as expansion of commercial activity and resultant redevelopment of surface parking lots continues. Although the TPA parking service and its

competitor market continues to diverge, the competitor market still generally accommodates traditional journey to work trips and are priced as such. Therefore, the competitor’s early bird rate (or in its absence, the day maximum rate) is the predominant rate for the facility. Subsequently, it was noted the competitors’ half-hour rate is a prorated amount of the early bird/commuter rate and is not geared to attract or accommodate a short-stay parker. This has presented a challenge in determining an appropriate short-stay rate (less than 3 hours) that can be used as a comparable to a TPA facility.

3. TPA facilities where monthly permits are available or still in use, permit rates were increased incrementally across the board, unless there was an extenuating circumstance (i.e. portion of the parking spaces at a facility were closed for construction resulting in poor availability and possibly frustrated customers). The incremental permit rate increases are noted in the table below.

In some instances the proposed incremental change may not bring TPA rates in line with the TPA benchmark, but it will help to bring the rate closer to the benchmark. Unless forced to do so, it would be poor customer service to drastically increase a monthly permit rate.

Existing Permit Rate Range	Permit Rate Increase
\$0.00 - \$99.99	\$5.00
\$100.00 - \$199.99	\$10.00
\$200.00 - \$299.99	\$15.00
\$300.00 - \$399.99	\$20.00
\$400.00 - \$499.99	\$25.00

The following tables review the current and proposed half-hour rate, day maximum rate and monthly permit rate at select TPA facilities, and their respective average competitor rates (where applicable). Observing the analysis, the following is noted:

- **For the proposed half hour rates:** There are five (5) locations that fall outside the guideline:
 - At Carpark 1 it is proposed that the rate (\$2.50), which is \$0.25 higher than the benchmark, remain as this facility which was partially closed for construction until December 2017.
 - Carpark 53 has high usage and as a result staff are proposing to remove the day maximum and lower the half hour rate to encourage more short term parkers. The proposed rate is \$2.00 compared to the existing rate of \$2.50. This decrease brings the rate more in line with the benchmark (\$1.25) versus the existing rate which deviates \$1.75 from the benchmark.
 - Carpark 402 has high usage and as a result it is recommended that the half hour rate be increased from \$2.25 to \$2.50. The existing and proposed rates are above the benchmark \$0.75 and \$1.00 respectively.

- Carpark 403 and 412 have high usage therefore although their existing rates are greater than the benchmark (\$0.63 and \$0.31), no rate change is proposed. To bring the rates in line with the policy would require in the reduction of the half hour rate that could result in a greater facility usage.
- **For the proposed day maximum rates:** There are seven (7) facilities that have rates that fall outside this guideline:
 - Carpark 11 has a proposed day maximum of \$15.00 (+\$3.00 existing rate of \$12.00) which brings it more in line with competitor rates and the benchmark (-\$5.00 vs. -\$8.00).
 - The existing day maximum (\$15.00) at Carpark 29, is below competitors, and yet no new day maximum is proposed because this facility is in close proximity to the Eglinton Crosstown.
 - Carpark 36 rates are below those of competitors, however due to capital work at this location, it is recommended that the existing rates remain.
 - The proposed increase of \$2.00 (from \$13.00 existing to \$15.00) at Carpark 43 will bring the day maximum rate in line with the benchmark.
 - The current day maximum (\$14.00) at Carpark 58 is -\$5.25 below the benchmark. Current usage of this facility does not warrant a rate change at this time.
 - The suggested day maximum of up to \$24.00 (from \$16.00) at Carpark 71 would bring the rate more in line with the benchmark and competitor rates from -\$9.00 to -\$1.00.
 - The existing rate of \$20.00 at Carpark 215 does not meet the benchmark (-\$1.00), however the proposed day maximum (\$25.00) will result in the benchmark being exceeded by \$4.00.
 - Low usage at Carpark 261 does not warrant the rate be adjusted and therefore the rate which is -\$2.00 below that of competitors and the benchmark will remain.
 - The day maximum of \$15.00 at Carpark 403 is below competitor rates by -\$6.00. Regardless, no new rate is being proposed as revenues and the number of vehicles parked at this facility is down from 2017.
- **For the proposed monthly permit rates:** There are 23 locations, based on the new proposed monthly permit rates, that fall outside of the benchmark including:
 - Rates at Carpark 5, 11, 26, 39, 43, 51, 71, 125, 139, 161, 178, 181, 224, 231, 233, 400, 402, 403, 412 are proposed to be increased, however the rates will still be below the benchmark.
 - Carparks 68, 111, 150 rates are proposed to be increased and will be slightly above the benchmark by \$5.00, \$10.00, \$10.00 respectively.
 - Rates at each facility where parking permits are sold, with the exception of Carpark 286, are proposed to be increased incrementally as detailed in the table. The permit rate at Carpark 286 is not being changed as a rate change was recently adjusted.

ATTACHMENT 3 - COMPETITOR RATE ANALYSIS

HALF HOUR - RATE ANALYSIS							
Carpark No.	Existing Rates (A)	Proposed Rate	Avg of Competitor Rates (C)	Max Benchmark (D) <=0.75*C	Difference of Existing Rate Δ (A-D)	Difference to Proposed Rate Δ(B-D)	Notes
1	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$3.00	\$2.25	\$0.25	\$0.25	Construction at this location recently wrapped up and as a result it is recommended that the rate remain as is
3	\$3.00	\$3.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
5	\$3.00	\$3.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
11	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$3.50	\$2.63	-\$0.13	-\$0.13	No rate change proposed
12	\$3.00	\$3.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
13	\$3.00	\$3.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
26	\$3.00	\$3.25	\$5.00	\$3.75	-\$0.75	-\$0.50	Usage warrants a rate increase
29	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$2.88	\$2.16	-\$0.16	-\$0.16	No rate change proposed
34	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$4.75	\$3.56	-\$0.56	-\$0.56	No rate change proposed
36	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$5.21	\$3.91	-\$0.91	-\$0.91	No rate change proposed
39	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$4.00	\$3.00	-\$0.50	-\$0.50	No rate change proposed
43	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$3.67	\$2.75	-\$0.25	-\$0.25	No rate change proposed
49	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$3.50	\$2.63	-\$0.63	-\$0.63	No rate change proposed
51	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
52	\$3.50	\$3.50	\$5.23	\$3.92	-\$0.42	-\$0.42	No rate change proposed
53	\$2.50	\$2.00	\$1.00	\$0.75	\$1.75	\$1.25	Carpark usage is extremely high and as a result it is proposed that the half hour be decreased and day maximum be removed
55	\$1.00	\$1.00	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
58	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$4.25	\$3.19	-\$0.19	-\$0.19	No rate change proposed
68	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
71	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$4.50	\$3.38	-\$0.88	-\$0.88	No rate change proposed
96	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change is proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
106	\$3.00	\$2.00	\$4.00	\$3.00	\$0.00	-\$1.00	Carpark usage is extremely high and as a result it is proposed that the half hour be decreased and day maximum be removed
111	\$1.50	\$1.50	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
125	\$2.50	\$2.50	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
139	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
150	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
161	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$3.50	\$2.63	-\$0.63	-\$0.63	No rate change proposed
171	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
178	\$1.50	\$1.50	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
181	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$4.50	\$3.38	-\$1.38	-\$1.38	No rate change proposed
195	\$1.50	\$1.50	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
212	\$3.00	\$3.50	\$4.75	\$3.56	-\$0.56	-\$0.06	Rate change proposed due to usage
215	\$3.00	\$3.50	\$4.33	\$3.25	-\$0.25	\$0.25	Peak usage is high and as a result increasing rate
219	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$4.50	\$3.38	-\$0.88	-\$0.88	No rate change proposed
223	\$2.50	\$2.50	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
224	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
227	\$3.00	\$3.50	\$4.75	\$3.56	-\$0.56	-\$0.06	Rate change proposed due to usage
231	\$1.50	\$2.00	\$2.83	\$2.13	-\$0.63	-\$0.13	Rate change proposed due to usage
233	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$4.00	\$3.00	-\$0.50	-\$0.50	No rate change proposed
261	\$1.50	\$1.50	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed
262	NA	\$3.00	\$4.00	\$3.00	N/A	\$0.00	New parking garage expected to open in Fall 2018. Keep rate down until usage can be reviewed / examined
268	\$2.25	\$2.50	\$4.00	\$3.00	-\$0.75	-\$0.50	Slightly modify rate to be in line with competitors
275	\$1.50	\$1.50	N/A	-	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
286	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	-	-	-	Leave rates as they were changed @ end of June 2018 and no qualified competitors within 600 ft.
288	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	-	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
300	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor half hour rate within 600 ft.
400	\$1.50	\$1.50	\$2.00	\$1.50	\$0.00	\$0.00	Facility usage does not warrant rate increase
402	\$2.25	\$2.50	\$2.00	\$1.50	\$0.75	\$1.00	Usage high and therefore need to increase half hour rate
403	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$1.88	\$0.63	\$0.63	Leave rate as is due to high facility usage
404	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$4.00	\$3.00	-\$1.00	-\$1.00	No rate change proposed
410	\$2.00	\$2.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No rate change proposed. No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
412	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$2.25	\$1.69	\$0.31	\$0.31	High usage observed and therefore need higher half hour rate
655	\$1.00	\$1.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.

	Proposed Rates
	Deviation from TPA Policy 2-1 Benchmark

ATTACHMENT 3 - COMPETITOR RATE ANALYSIS

DAY MAXIMUM - RATE ANALYSIS							
Carpark No.	Existing Rates (A)	Proposed Rate	Avg of Competitor Rates (C)	Max Benchmark (D) <=0.75*C	Difference of Existing Rate Δ (A-D)	Difference to Proposed Rate Δ(B-D)	Notes
1	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	No new rate proposed. Rates in line with competitors
3	NA	NA	N/A	N/A	-	-	No new rate proposed. Rates in line with competitors
5	\$18.00	\$20.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
11	\$12.00	\$15.00	\$20.00	\$20.00	-\$8.00	-\$5.00	Proposed new day max puts the rate more in line with qualified competitors
12	\$25.00	\$25.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
13	\$15.00	\$15.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
26	\$28.00	\$30.00	\$26.50	\$26.50	\$1.50	\$3.50	High usage observed and therefore a higher rate is required
29	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$19.00	\$19.00	-\$4.00	-\$4.00	This facility is in close proximity to the work tied with Eglinton Crosstown. As a result a rate increase is not recommended.
34	\$22.00	\$22.00	\$19.80	\$19.80	\$2.20	\$2.20	High usage observed and therefore a higher rate is required
36	\$20.00	\$20.00	\$27.00	\$27.00	-\$7.00	-\$7.00	Capital work at this facility
39	\$15.00	\$17.00	\$12.00	\$12.00	\$3.00	\$5.00	High usage observed and therefore a higher rate is required
43	\$13.00	\$15.00	\$13.50	\$13.50	-\$0.50	\$1.50	High usage observed and therefore a higher rate is required
49	\$18.00	\$18.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	Usage is at desired amount. Leave rate.
51	\$10.00	\$12.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
52	\$25.00	\$25.00	\$24.42	\$24.42	\$0.58	\$0.58	Usage does not warrant rate change
53	\$12.00	No Day Max	\$8.00	\$8.00	\$4.00	-	Carpark usage is extremely high and as a result it is proposed that the day maximum be removed
55	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
58	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$19.25	\$19.25	-\$5.25	-\$5.25	Usage does not warrant a rate change
68	\$8.00	\$8.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
71	\$16.00	\$24.00	\$25.00	\$25.00	-\$9.00	-\$1.00	Proposed day max up to \$24.00 put the rate more inline with qualified competitors and benchmark
96	\$15.00	\$20.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
106	\$15.00	No Day Max	\$12.00	\$12.00	-	-	High usage observed and therefore a higher rate (or no day max) is required
111	\$8.00	\$8.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
125	\$15.00	\$18.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
139	\$10.00	\$12.00	NA	NA	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
150	\$8.00	\$8.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
161	\$20.00	\$20.00	\$20.00	\$20.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	Rates in line with qualified competitor lots
171	\$10.00	\$12.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
178	\$9.00	\$10.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
181	\$14.00	\$20.00	\$12.00	\$12.00	\$2.00	\$8.00	Rate requested is a day max up to \$20.00. A respite building is currently being constructed at this location and will result in the loss of a number of parking spaces
195	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
212	N/A	N/A	\$20.25	\$20.25	-	-	No new rate proposed. Lot currently has no day max
215	\$20.00	\$25.00	\$21.00	\$21.00	-\$1.00	\$4.00	Peak usage is high and as a result increasing and brings it in line with benchmark rate
219	N/A	N/A	\$26.50	\$26.50	-	-	No new rate proposed. Lot currently has no day max
223	\$20.00	No Day Max	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
224	\$12.00	\$20.00	\$7.00	\$7.00	\$5.00	\$13.00	Rate requested is a day max up to \$20.00. A respite building is currently being constructed at Carpark 181 which is in close proximity to this facility and is expected to increase parking usage at this facility
227	N/A	N/A	\$20.25	\$20.25	-	-	No new rate proposed. Lot currently has no day max
231	\$10.00	\$12.00	\$9.17	\$9.17	\$0.83	\$2.83	Usage is very high and therefore day rate needs to be increased
233	\$16.00	\$18.00	\$12.00	\$12.00	\$4.00	\$6.00	Usage is very high and therefore day rate needs to be increased
261	\$10.00	\$10.00	\$12.00	\$12.00	-\$2.00	-\$2.00	Usage does not warrant rate change
262	NA	\$20.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	-	-	New parking garage expected to open in Fall 2018. Keep rate lower until usage can be reviewed / examined
268	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$12.00	\$12.00	\$2.00	\$2.00	
275	\$8.00	\$8.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
286	\$16.00	\$16.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
288	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
300	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$8.67	\$8.67	\$5.33	\$5.33	Rates were increased at the end of June 2018 therefore leave rates
400	\$10.00	\$10.00	\$9.00	\$9.00	\$1.00	\$1.00	Usage does not warrant a rate change
402	\$15.00	\$16.00	\$9.00	\$9.00	\$6.00	\$7.00	Usage high and therefore warrants an increase
403	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$21.00	\$21.00	-\$6.00	-\$6.00	The number of cars parked and revenues at this facility are down from 2017. As a result a rate increase is not warranted.
404	N/A	N/A	\$16.00	\$16.00	-	-	No day max at this facility
410	\$12.00	\$13.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.
412	\$12.00	\$14.00	\$9.00	\$9.00	\$3.00	\$5.00	High usage observed and therefore high rate required
655	\$6.00	\$6.00	N/A	N/A	-	-	No qualified competitor lots within 600 ft.

Proposed Rates
Deviation from TPA Policy 2-1 Benchmark

ATTACHMENT 3 - COMPETITOR RATE ANALYSIS

MONTHLY PERMIT - RATE ANALYSIS								
Carpark No.	Proposed Day Max (B)	Existing Rates (A)	Proposed Rates (B)	Average of Competitor Rates (C)	Benchmark Range Proposed Day Max	Existing MP rate meet benchmark (variation)	Proposed MP rate meet benchmark (variation)	Notes
1	\$14.00	\$230.00	\$245.00	N/A	\$210.00 - \$280.00	YES	YES	Existing and proposed monthly rate in line with benchmark. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
3	No Day Max	\$150.00	\$160.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No Day Max at this facility so benchmark doesn't comply. No comparable competitors. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
5	\$20.00	\$260.00	\$275.00	N/A	\$300.00 - \$400.00	NO (-\$40.00)	NO (-\$25.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark; a higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
11	\$15.00	\$180.00	\$190.00	N/A	\$225.00 - \$300.00	NO (-\$45.00)	NO (-\$35.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark; a higher rate is proposed for 2018.
12	\$25.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$375.00 - \$500.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
13	\$15.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$225.00 - \$300.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
26	\$30.00	\$400.00	\$425.00	\$377.00	\$450.00 - \$600.00	NO (-\$50.00)	NO (-\$25.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark and above comparable competitors. The carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
29	\$15.00	\$220.00	\$235.00	\$290.00	\$225.00 - \$300.00	NO (-\$5.00)	YES	Proposed rate is in line with benchmark and less than competitor average. A higher rate is proposed for 2018.
34	\$22.00	\$400.00	\$425.00	\$299.33	\$330.00 - \$440.00	YES	YES	Proposed rate is in line with benchmark and higher than competitor average. The carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
36	\$20.00	\$300.00	\$320.00	\$346.60	\$300.00 - \$400.00	YES	YES	Proposed rate is in line with benchmark; rate less than competitor average, thus increased. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
39	\$17.00	\$200.00	\$215.00	N/A	\$255.00 - \$340.00	NO (-\$55.00)	NO (-\$40.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
43	\$15.00	\$200.00	\$215.00	\$288.33	\$225.00 - \$300.00	NO (-\$25.00)	NO (-\$10.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark and comparable competitor rates. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
49	\$18.00	N/A	N/A	\$145.00	\$270.00 - \$360.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
51	\$12.00	\$125.00	\$135.00	N/A	\$180.00 - \$240.00	NO (-\$55.00)	NO (-\$45.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. A higher rate is proposed for 2018.
52	\$25.00	\$400.00	\$425.00	\$326.62	\$375.00 - \$500.00	YES	YES	Proposed rate is in line with benchmark and higher than comparable competitor average. A higher rate, increased incrementally, is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
53	No Day Max	\$110.00	\$120.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No Day Max at this facility so benchmark doesn't comply. No comparable competitors. Permit rate increased incrementally, as detailed in report. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
55	No Day Max	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
58	\$14.00	\$260.00	\$275.00	\$347.50	\$210.00 - \$280.00	YES	YES	Proposed rate is in line with benchmark and less than competitor average. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
68	\$8.00	\$155.00	\$165.00	N/A	\$120.00 - \$160.00	YES	NO (+\$5.00)	Existing monthly permit rates are in line with the benchmark, however the annual increase in the permit amount will bring the rate over the benchmark
71	\$24.00	\$160.00	\$170.00	\$375.00	\$360.00 - \$480.00	NO (-\$200.00)	NO (-190.00)	Proposed rate is in line with benchmark; rate less than competitor average, thus increased. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.

ATTACHMENT 3 - COMPETITOR RATE ANALYSIS

MONTHLY PERMIT - RATE ANALYSIS								
Carpark No.	Proposed Day Max (B)	Existing Rates (A)	Proposed Rates (B)	Average of Competitor Rates (C)	Benchmark Range Proposed Day Max	Existing MP rate meet benchmark (variation)	Proposed MP rate meet benchmark (variation)	Notes
96	\$20.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$300.00 - \$400.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
106	No Day Max	\$180.00	\$190.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No Day Max at this facility so benchmark doesn't comply. No comparable competitors. The carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
111	\$8.00	\$160.00	\$170.00	N/A	\$120.00 - \$160.00	YES	NO (+\$10.00)	Existing monthly permit rates are in line with the benchmark, however the annual increase in the permit amount will bring the rate over the benchmark. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
125	\$18.00	\$215.00	\$230.00	N/A	\$270.00 - \$360.00	NO (-\$55.00)	NO (-\$40.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. No comparable competitors. Carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
139	\$12.00	\$100.00	\$110.00	N/A	\$180.00 - \$240.00	NO (-\$80.00)	NO (-\$70.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. No comparable competitors. Carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
150	\$8.00	\$160.00	\$170.00	N/A	\$120.00 - \$160.00	YES	NO (+\$10.00)	Existing monthly permit rates are in line with the benchmark, however the annual increase in the permit amount will bring the rate over the benchmark
161	\$20.00	\$240.00	\$255.00	\$299.00	\$300.00 - \$400.00	NO (-\$60.00)	NO (-\$45.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark and comparable competitors. A higher rate is proposed for 2018.
171	\$12.00	\$170.00	\$180.00	N/A	\$180.00 - \$240.00	NO (-\$10.00)	YES	The proposed monthly permit rates are in line with the benchmark. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
178	\$10.00	\$120.00	\$130.00	N/A	\$150.00 - \$200.00	NO (-\$30.00)	NO (-\$20.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. A higher rate is proposed for 2018.
181	\$20.00	\$140.00	\$150.00	\$200.00	\$300.00 - \$400.00	NO (-\$160.00)	NO (-\$150.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark and comparable competitors. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
195	No Day Max	\$185.00	\$195.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No Day Max at this facility so benchmark doesn't comply. No comparable competitors. The carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
212	No Day Max	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
215	\$25.00	N/A	N/A	\$323.33	\$375.00 - \$500.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
219	No Day Max	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
223	No Day Max	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
224	\$20.00	\$105.00	\$115.00	N/A	\$300.00 - \$400.00	NO (-\$195.00)	NO (-\$185.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
227	No Day Max	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
231	\$12.00	\$135.00	\$145.00	N/A	\$180.00 - \$240.00	NO (-\$45.00)	NO (-\$35.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
233	\$18.00	\$140.00	\$150.00	\$175.00	\$270.00 - \$360.00	NO (-\$130.00)	NO (-\$120.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark and comparable competitors. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
261	\$10.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$150.00 - \$200.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
262	\$20.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$300.00 - \$400.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.

ATTACHMENT 3 - COMPETITOR RATE ANALYSIS

MONTHLY PERMIT - RATE ANALYSIS								
Carpark No.	Proposed Day Max (B)	Existing Rates (A)	Proposed Rates (B)	Average of Competitor Rates (C)	Benchmark Range Proposed Day Max	Existing MP rate meet benchmark (variation)	Proposed MP rate meet benchmark (variation)	Notes
268	\$14.00	N/A	N/A	\$175.00	\$210.00 - \$280.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
275	\$8.00	\$150.00	\$160.00	N/A	\$120.00 - \$160.00	YES	YES	Monthly permit rates in line with benchmark. No comparable competitors. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Permit rate increased incrementally, as detailed in report.
286	\$16.00	\$220.00	\$220.00	N/A	\$240.00 - \$320.00	NO (-\$20.00)	NO (-\$20.00)	Monthly permit rates below benchmark. Recent rate increase approval in June 2018. No rate change to be implemented. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
288	No Day Max	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
300	\$14.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$210.00 - \$280.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
400	\$11.00	\$145.00	\$155.00	N/A	\$165.00 - \$220.00	NO (-\$20.00)	NO (-\$10.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. No comparable competitors. Permit rate increased incrementally, as detailed in report. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
402	\$16.00	\$175.00	\$185.00	N/A	\$240.00 - \$320.00	NO (-\$65.00)	NO (-\$55.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. No comparable competitors. Carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
403	\$15.00	\$95.00	\$100.00	N/A	\$225.00 - \$300.00	NO (-\$130.00)	NO (-\$125.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark. No comparable competitors. Carpark is functioning over capacity. A higher rate is proposed for 2018.
404	No Day Max	\$220.00	\$235.00	\$197.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	No Day Max therefore benchmark doesn't apply. Monthly permits are higher than comparable competitors. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
410	\$13.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$195.00 - \$260.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.
412	\$14.00	\$85.00	\$90.00	\$150.00	\$210.00 - \$280.00	NO (-\$125.00)	NO (-\$120.00)	Monthly permit rates are below the benchmark and comparable competitors. A higher rate is proposed for 2018. Monthly permit quota is set to zero.
655	\$6.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$90.00 - \$120.00	N/A	N/A	No monthly permits available at this facility.

	Proposed Rates
	Deviation from TPA Policy 2-1 Benchmark