DA TORONTO

REPORT FOR ACTION

Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register - 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue

Date: June 18, 2018
To: Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From: Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division
Wards: 27 - Toronto Centre-Rosedale

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council include the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

The subject properties are located in the Summerhill neighbourhood on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue, across the CP Rail tracks from North Toronto Station, and contain four two-storey row houses that were completed between 1889 and 1892.

At its meeting of January 24, 2018, the Committee of Adjustment deferred consideration of an application seeking variances to permit alterations and additions to the property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue pending a report from Heritage Preservation Services regarding the site's potential heritage value. As this property anchors the west end of a group of four row houses constructed in the late 19th century, City staff researched and evaluated the entire row.

Following research and evaluation, it has been determined that the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue meet Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, which the City of Toronto also applies when evaluating properties for its Heritage Register.

Official Plan Policy 3.1.5.14 directs that potential and existing properties of cultural heritage value or interest, including cultural heritage landscapes and Heritage Conservation Districts, will be identified and included in area planning studies and plans with recommendations for further study, evaluation and conservation.

Properties on the Heritage Register will be conserved and maintained in accordance with the Official Plan Heritage Policies.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division, recommends that:

1. City Council include the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register, in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue (Reasons for Inclusion) attached as Attachments 3-6 to the report, June 18, 2018, from the Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue is the subject of a Committee of Adjustment application seeking to add a third-floor addition and a two-storey rear addition to the existing house form building. Consideration of the application was deferred by the Committee of Adjustment at its January 24, 2018 meeting to allow Heritage Preservation Services time to research and evaluate the property for possible inclusion on the Heritage Register and protection under the Ontario Heritage Act: http://app.toronto.ca/DevelopmentApplications/associatedApplicationsList.do?action=init&folderRsn=4231533&isCofASearch=true&isTlabSearch=false

The properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are located within the Summerhill Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment (CHRA) study area. At its meeting of January 31, 2018 City Council adopted the report recommending the area be given prioritization and a CHRA study initiated:

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2018.PG25.4

COMMENTS

Listing on the City's Heritage Register

Pro-active listing of properties is intended to give greater clarity to property owners with regards to the City's interest and the application of Official Plan policies. The primary aim will be to achieve an informed, timely listing of properties in tandem with local area studies. An understanding and articulation of contextual value will be prioritized and, where information is readily available, additional values may be identified. The multiple-listing process is an efficient and effective practice that balances the need to respond to growth within Toronto with the need to account for the cultural heritage value that adds character to our neighbourhoods.

Non-designated listed properties do not have any protection under the Ontario Heritage Act, except insofar as an owner must give the City a 60-day notice of his or her intention

to demolish the listed property. Listing does not trigger maintenance requirements over and above existing property standards, it does not allow the City to withhold a building permit for non-demolition related alterations and it does not preclude a property from undergoing renovation or development.

A location map (Attachment 1) and photographs (Attachment 2) are attached. Staff have completed the Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report (Attachment 7) for the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue and determined that they meet Ontario Regulation 9/06 and merit inclusion on the City's Heritage Register. The properties are located within the Summerhill Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment (CHRA) study area, a comprehensive evaluation of the neighbourhood recently prioritized by City Council that will include a review of all building typologies, ranging from large estate homes to modest row housing.

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue have cultural heritage value for their design, historical associations and context. Located on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue, the subject properties contain a group of four late-19th century row houses that represent an important building typology in the Summerhill neighbourhood, are the only surviving examples of their kind in the immediate vicinity featuring simplified Georgian styling with restrained detailing, and contribute to the historical development of this area in the latter half of the 1800s as a working-class community adjoining the north end of the Town of York (afterward Toronto) where families occupied modest multi-unit housing close to local industries and services.

Contextually, the row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are valued for their role in supporting and defining the historical character of the Summerhill neighbourhood where buildings designed for workers' housing, including the subject row houses, adjoin industry and institutional landmarks, particularly the CP railway and North Toronto Station. The subject properties are historically and visually linked to their setting along the northern edge of the CP railway, which employed many of the area's first residents.

CONTACT

Tamara Anson-Cartwright, CAHP Program Manager Heritage Preservation Services Tel: 416-338-1083; Fax: 416-392-1973 E-mail: tamara.ansoncartwright@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Lorna Day, MCIP, RPP, B. Arch Director, Urban Design City Planning

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Location Map

Attachment 2 – Photographs

Attachment 3 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) 116 Shaftesbury Ave Attachment 4 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) 118 Shaftesbury Ave Attachment 5 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) 120 Shaftesbury Ave Attachment 6 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Inclusion) 122 Shaftesbury Ave Attachment 7 – Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report





This location map is for information purposes only; the exact boundaries of the site are not shown. The properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are indicated by the red arrow.



Heritage Preservation Services, 2018



Google Maps, 2014

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE: 116 SHAFTESBURY AVE (REASONS FOR INCLUSION)

The property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue is worthy of inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, which the City of Toronto also applies when evaluating properties for its Heritage Register.

Description

Located on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue, east of Yonge Street and directly north of the CP rail tracks, the property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue is part of a group of four two-storey row houses that were completed between 1889 and 1892, and owned by local builder Edward Martin. The subject properties were first occupied by tradespeople along the CP railway and nearby North Toronto train station.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its design as part of the intact row of four two-storey house form buildings at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue dating to the late 19th century that is typical of the modest row housing identified with the development of the area north of the CP rail tracks that is now known as Summerhill. Archival records indicate that they are the only surviving row houses of their kind in the community featuring simplified Georgian styling with restrained detailing. With their shared scale and the organization of the principal (south) elevations, the row houses are unified by the rhythm of their symmetrically-placed fenestration and door openings.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue is also valued for its association with the local resident, property owner and builder, Edward Martin. In 1890, Martin owned all four of the subject properties and he constructed 122 Shaftesbury Avenue that anchors the east end of the row in 1892. Martin is also known to have owned at least four other properties in the immediate vicinity including the group of three two-storey row houses at 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place (now demolished) which were the only other known examples in the area of similar scale and styling to the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, as well as Martin's own building supply shop and lumberyard at 1 Shaftesbury Place.

Contextually, the property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its role as part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue in supporting and defining the historical character of the southernmost portion of the Summerhill neighbourhood in the late-1800s as a working-class community where families occupied modest row housing, including the subject row houses, adjoining industry and institutional landmarks, particularly the CP railway and North Toronto Station, that reflect the early development of the neighbourhood and remain city-wide landmarks.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue is historically and visually linked to its setting along the northern edge of the CP railway, which employed many of the area's first residents.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue are:

- The setback, placement and orientation of the building as one of four row houses located within its property boundary on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue
- The scale, form and massing of this portion of the group with its two storey height
- On the principal (south) elevation, the materials with the brick cladding and the brick and stone detailing (the brick has been painted)
- The flat roof covering the building
- On the principal (south) elevation, the symmetrical placement of the first and second-storey window openings
- On the principal (south) elevation, the placement of the segmental-arched doorway opening with transom light above the door
- On the principal (south) elevation, the segmental-arched window openings with brick detailing and brick corbelling below the second-storey stone sill

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE: 118 SHAFTESBURY AVE (REASONS FOR INCLUSION)

The property at 118 Shaftesbury Avenue is worthy of inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, which the City of Toronto also applies when evaluating properties for its Heritage Register.

Description

Located on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue, east of Yonge Street and directly north of the CP rail tracks, the property at 118 Shaftesbury Avenue is part of a group of four two-storey row houses that were completed between 1889 and 1892, and owned by local builder Edward Martin. The subject properties were first occupied by tradespeople along the CP railway and nearby North Toronto train station.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property at 118 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its design as part of the intact row of four two-storey house form buildings at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue dating to the late 19th century that is typical of the modest row housing identified with the development of the area north of the CP rail tracks that is now known as Summerhill. Archival records indicate that they are the only surviving row houses of their kind in the community featuring simplified Georgian styling with restrained detailing. With their shared scale and the organization of the principal (south) elevations, the row houses are unified by the rhythm of their symmetrically-placed fenestration and door openings.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 118 Shaftesbury Avenue is also valued for its association with the local resident, property owner and builder, Edward Martin. In 1890, Martin owned all four of the subject properties and he constructed 122 Shaftesbury Avenue that anchors the east end of the row in 1892. Martin is also known to have owned at least four other properties in the immediate vicinity including the group of three two-storey row houses at 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place (now demolished) which were the only other known examples in the area of similar scale and styling to the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, as well as Martin's own building supply shop and lumberyard at 1 Shaftesbury Place.

Contextually, the property at 118 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its role as part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue in supporting and defining the historical character of the southernmost portion of the Summerhill neighbourhood in the late-1800s as a working-class community where families occupied modest row housing, including the subject row houses, adjoining industry and institutional landmarks, particularly the CP railway and North Toronto Station, that reflect the early development of the neighbourhood and remain city-wide landmarks.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 118 Shaftesbury Avenue is historically and visually linked to its setting along the northern edge of the CP railway, which employed many of the area's first residents.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 118 Shaftesbury Avenue are:

- The setback, placement and orientation of the building as one of four row houses located within its property boundary on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue
- The scale, form and massing of this portion of the group with its two storey height
- On the principal (south) elevation, the materials with the brick cladding and the brick and stone detailing (the brick has been painted)
- The flat roof covering the building
- On the principal (south) elevation, the symmetrical placement of the first and second-storey window openings with brick detailing and brick corbelling below the stone sills
- On the principal (south) elevation, the placement of the segmental-arched doorway opening with transom light above the door
- On the principal (south) elevation, the second-storey segmental-arched window opening

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE: 120 SHAFTESBURY AVE (REASONS FOR INCLUSION)

The property at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue is worthy of inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, which the City of Toronto also applies when evaluating properties for its Heritage Register.

Description

Located on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue, east of Yonge Street and directly north of the CP rail tracks, the property at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue is part of a group of four two-storey row houses that were completed between 1889 and 1892, and owned by local builder Edward Martin. The subject properties were first occupied by tradespeople along the CP railway and nearby North Toronto train station.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its design as part of the intact row of four two-storey house form buildings at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue dating to the late 19th century that is typical of the modest row housing identified with the development of the area north of the CP rail tracks that is now known as Summerhill. Archival records indicate that they are the only surviving row houses of their kind in the community featuring simplified Georgian styling with restrained detailing. With their shared scale and the organization of the principal (south) elevations, the row houses are unified by the rhythm of their symmetrically-placed fenestration and door openings.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue is also valued for its association with the local resident, property owner and builder, Edward Martin. In 1890, Martin owned all four of the subject properties and he constructed 122 Shaftesbury Avenue that anchors the east end of the row in 1892. Martin is also known to have owned at least four other properties in the immediate vicinity including the group of three two-storey row houses at 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place (now demolished) which were the only other known examples in the area of similar scale and styling to the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, as well as Martin's own building supply shop and lumberyard at 1 Shaftesbury Place.

Contextually, the property at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its role as part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue in supporting and defining the historical character of the southernmost portion of the Summerhill neighbourhood in the late-1800s as a working-class community where families occupied modest row housing, including the subject row houses, adjoining industry and institutional landmarks, particularly the CP railway and North Toronto Station, that reflect the early development of the neighbourhood and remain city-wide landmarks.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue is historically and visually linked to its setting along the northern edge of the CP railway, which employed many of the area's first residents.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue are:

- The setback, placement and orientation of the building as one of four row houses located within its property boundary on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue
- The scale, form and massing of this portion of the group with its two storey height
- On the principal (south) elevation, the materials with the brick cladding and the brick and stone detailing (the brick has been painted)
- The flat roof covering the building
- On the principal (south) elevation, the symmetrical placement of the first and second-storey window openings with brick detailing and brick corbelling below the stone sills
- On the principal (south) elevation, the placement of the segmental-arched doorway opening with transom light above the door

Note: the pop-up roof structure (access stair) and rooftop deck at 120 Shaftesbury Avenue are not considered heritage attributes

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE: 122 SHAFTESBURY AVE (REASONS FOR INCLUSION)

The property at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue is worthy of inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, which the City of Toronto also applies when evaluating properties for its Heritage Register.

Description

Located on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue, east of Yonge Street and directly north of the CP rail tracks, the property at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue is part of a group of four two-storey row houses that were completed between 1889 and 1892, and owned by local builder Edward Martin. The subject properties were first occupied by tradespeople along the CP railway and nearby North Toronto train station.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its design as part of the intact row of four two-storey house form buildings at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue dating to the late 19th century that is typical of the modest row housing identified with the development of the area north of the CP rail tracks that is now known as Summerhill. Archival records indicate that they are the only surviving row houses of their kind in the community featuring simplified Georgian styling with restrained detailing. With their shared scale and the organization of the principal (south) elevations, the row houses are unified by the rhythm of their symmetrically-placed fenestration and door openings.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue is also valued for its association with the local resident, property owner and builder, Edward Martin. In 1890, Martin owned all four of the subject properties and he constructed 122 Shaftesbury Avenue that anchors the east end of the row in 1892. Martin is also known to have owned at least four other properties in the immediate vicinity including the group of three two-storey row houses at 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place (now demolished) which were the only other known examples in the area of similar scale and styling to the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, as well as Martin's own building supply shop and lumberyard at 1 Shaftesbury Place.

Contextually, the property at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue is valued for its role as part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue in supporting and defining the historical character of the southernmost portion of the Summerhill neighbourhood in the late-1800s as a working-class community where families occupied modest row housing, including the subject row houses, adjoining industry and institutional landmarks, particularly the CP railway and North Toronto Station, that reflect the early development of the neighbourhood and remain city-wide landmarks.

As part of the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, the property at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue is historically and visually linked to its setting along the northern edge of the CP railway, which employed many of the area's first residents.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are:

- The setback, placement and orientation of the building as the southern anchor of four row houses located within its property boundary on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue
- The scale, form and massing of this portion of the group with its two storey height and extra bay at the south end
- The flat roof covering the building
- On the principal (south) elevation, the symmetrical placement of the first and second-storey window openings
- On the principal (south) elevation of the southernmost bay, the symmetrical placement of the doorway opening and second-storey window

ATTACHMENT 7

HERITAGE PROPERTY RESEARCH AND EVALUATION REPORT



ROW HOUSES 116, 118, 120 & 122 SHAFTESBURY AVENUE, TORONTO

Prepared by:

Heritage Preservation Services City Planning Division City of Toronto

June 2018

1. DESCRIPTION



Cover: aerial view showing the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue (Google Maps); above, current photograph looking northeast (Heritage Preservation Services, 2018)

116, 118, 120 & 122 Shaftesbury Avenue: Row Houses		
ADDRESS	116, 118, 120 & 122 Shaftesbury Avenue	
WARD	Ward 27 (Toronto Centre-Rosedale)	
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	Plan 636 Block E	
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	Summerhill	
HISTORICAL NAME	Row Houses	
CONSTRUCTION DATE	Completed 1889-1892	
ORIGINAL OWNER	Margaret C. Smith (116, 118, 120);	
	Edward Martin (122)	
ORIGINAL USE	Residential (row houses)	
CURRENT USE	Residential (row houses)	
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	Edward Martin, builder ¹	
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS	Brick cladding with wood framing, brick,	
	stone and stucco detailing	
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	See Section 2	
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	See Section 2	
CRITERIA	Design, Associative and Contextual	
HERITAGE STATUS	n/a	
RECORDER	Heritage Preservation Services:	
	Liz McFarland	
REPORT DATE	June 2018	

¹ There are no building records for 116, 118 and 120 Shaftsbury Avenue, which were under construction in the same year that Shaftesbury Avenue was annexed to the City (1888). Building permit #879 exists for 122 Shaftsbury Avenue, built by Edward Martin in 1892. Martin already lived, worked as a builder and owned property in the immediate vicinity by 1884 and by 1890 he owned all four of the subject lots (CTA).

2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, and applies evaluation criteria to determine whether they merit designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in Section 4 (Summary).

i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

Key Date	Historical Event
1796- 1833	The patent for the 200-acre Lot 17, Second Concession (on the east side of Yonge Street to Bayview Avenue between present-day Woodlawn Avenue East and Shaftesbury Avenue) is granted to John Playter and is passed successively to Samuel Ridout, John Castle and John Henry Dunn. ²
1833- 1858	Entrepreneur Charles Thompson owns Lot 17, builds 'Summer Hill' House and puts in two roads, Charles Street and Thompson Avenue (now Shaftesbury Avenue and Summerhill Avenue, respectively) (<i>Image 1</i>)
1884	Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR) opens the first North Toronto train station on the west side of Yonge Street, on Marlborough Avenue
1887	The City Directory for 1888 (with statistics from the previous year) lists all lots east of 'a lane' (now Ottawa Street) as vacant.
1888 Jan	The southernmost portion of what is today known as the Summerhill neighbourhood (then part of Deer Park) is annexed to the City of Toronto, including Shaftesbury Avenue, Shaftesbury Place, Tacoma Avenue and Ottawa Street.
1888 Oct	The tax assessment rolls for 1889 (with statistics from the previous year) indicate that Mrs. Margaret C. Smith, widow, owns all four subject properties. Construction of 116, 118 and 120 Shaftesbury Avenue is underway.
1889 Oct - 1890 Oct	Margaret C. Smith lives at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue and owns all four lots. Other tenants listed as living at 116, 118 and 120 Shaftesbury include a painter, labourer, letter carrier and traveller.
1890 Oct 21	Edward Martin, builder, purchases all four lots from Margaret C. Smith.
1890	Goad's Atlas illustrates 116 and 118 Shaftesbury Avenue ³ (Image 2)
1891	Martin also owns 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place, lives at 6 Shaftesbury Place and has his workshop/building supply store directly across the street at 1 Shaftesbury Place (today known as 40R Shaftesbury Avenue).
1892 Jun	Building permit #879 is issued to Edward Martin to construct a small 2- storey dwelling at 122 Shaftesbury Avenue ⁴

² Land Registry Records, Plan 277, 662, 669, 636, Lot 17 in Metro Toronto Book 389.

³ Subsequent editions of *Goad's Atlas* (1893, 1899 and 1903) unfortunately don't contain any updates in the Summerhill neighbourhood, despite obvious development during this period.

Inclusion on the Heritage Register - 116-122 Shaftesbury Avenue

1916	North Toronto train station, designed by the architectural firm of Darling & Pearson, is completed on the east side of Yonge Street, south of Shaftesbury Avenue
1964	122 Shaftesbury Avenue and part of 120 appear in an archival photograph from the City's Deer Park Planning District images (<i>Image 3</i>)
2007	Summerhill neighbourhood authorized by City Council for Heritage
Feb	Conservation District study
2017	The current owner of the property at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue submits an
Aug	application to the Committee of Adjustment to add a third-floor addition and a two-storey rear addition to the existing house form building
2017 Dec	Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment study for the Summerhill neighbourhood recommended for prioritization by Toronto Preservation Board
2018 Jan	Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment study for the Summerhill neighbourhood authorized for prioritization by City Council
2018	Heritage Preservation Services requests a deferral of the Committee of
Jan	Adjustment to permit time for staff to evaluate the property

ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Summerhill Neighbourhood:

The properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are situated in what is known today as the Summerhill area. As part of the Deer Park neighbourhood,⁵ the Summerhill community comprises the area adjacent to Yonge Street on the ridge of the escarpment south of St. Clair Avenue. Summerhill takes its name from the home of transportation magnate, Charles Thompson, who in 1833 purchased Lot 17, Concession 2 on the east side of Yonge Street, at the then north edge of the Town of York, and had his 'Summer Hill House' built there in 1842 (now demolished). The designer of Summer Hill House, Toronto's prominent 19th-century architect John G. Howard had recently completed William Hume Blake's 'Woodlawn' estate on the west side of Yonge Street, which is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. By the mid-1800s, Toronto's wealthiest and most prominent families established country estates on 'the Hill', an elevated enclave prized for both its views of the city and its healthier atmosphere than the downtown core.

In the latter half of the 19th century, transportation improvements in the area spurred further, more diverse, development. At the bottom of the escarpment, the first North Toronto train station opened in 1884 on the west side of Yonge Street, on Marlborough Avenue.⁶ Small industry and services appeared along the south side of Shaftesbury Avenue, east of Yonge Street and modest row house-type dwellings constructed on the

⁴ The building permit incorrectly lists the street address as 120 Shaftesbury Avenue and should say 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, as records indicate that 120 was already occupied by June 1892.

⁵ Deer Park's western and eastern boundaries are marked by the ravines that intersect St. Clair Avenue near Spadina Road and east of Yonge Street. The southern boundary consists of the Canadian Pacific Railway tracks; while the northern boundary is the old Belt Line Railway Bridge. The Deer Park neighbourhood gets its name from mid-19th century Deer Park estate belonging to the Heath family, which was located at Yonge Street and the Third Concession Road (St. Clair Avenue). 6 Kinsella, 6-7.

north side of Shaftesbury Avenue (as well as on Tacoma Avenue and Ottawa Street) housed many of the associated tradespeople. With its lumberyards, ice houses, food stalls and even a dairy, Shaftsbury Avenue became a commercial hub of the local community.

By the early 20th century, the old North Toronto train station could no longer accommodate the amount of traffic and in 1916, Darling & Pearson's new station opened on the east side of Yonge Street just south of Shaftesbury Avenue (*Image 4*). Though the new station operated for less than twenty years, its clock tower - modelled on the campanile at St. Mark's Cathedral in Venice - remains a physical and visual landmark of the Summerhill neighbourhood and is recognized on the City's Heritage Register. The opening of the Yonge subway line in 1954 brought much commercial redevelopment along Yonge Street and by the early 1960s, the City's Planning Board studies of the area promoted the "the protection, preservation and enhancement of those parts of the district that will remain essentially as they are today."⁷

While there has been some residential renovation and redevelopment in the Summerhill community in recent decades, much of the original mid-to-late 19th century housing stock remains intact and maintains the historical character of the neighbourhood, ranging from stately homes on Summerhill Gardens to the modest row houses closest to the railway tracks.

116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue

Following Charles Thompson's death, his property was subdivided into lots for individual sale. In 1888, the year that construction commences on Plan 636, Block E (the legal description for the subject properties), all of Block E is owned by Margaret C. Smith of 52 Walton Street, widow and seamstress. Three units of the group were under construction by October 1888, according to the tax assessment rolls.

In 1889, local builder and shop owner Edward Martin purchases all of Block E from Margaret C. Smith, who is now listed as the first tenant at 116 Shaftesbury Avenue. Numbers 118 and 120 are occupied by tradesmen, Patrick Dean and Eugene Torpey, respectively. In the same year, Martin is also listed as owning Lot 17, closer to Yonge Street and flanking the west side of Shaftesbury Place where a group of three row houses at 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place are listed as 'unfinished'. It is likely that Martin himself built the latter row houses on the rear of Lot 17, which are strikingly similar in scale and styling to those at 116-120 Shaftesbury Avenue (*Image 5*). By 1890, he's residing at 6 Shaftesbury Place, and also owns and operates a building supply shop and lumber yard located on the east side of Shaftesbury Place (*Image 6*). By June 1892, Martin is issued a building permit to complete the row on Shaftesbury Avenue and constructs 122 in the latter part of the same year.

City Directories and Land Registry records indicate that Martin maintained his building supply shop on Shaftsbury Place and ownership of the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue through 1905. Today, part of the original structure of Martin's

Inclusion on the Heritage Register - 116-122 Shaftesbury Avenue

⁷ City of Toronto Planning Board, Deer Park Planning District Appraisal (1961), 4.

building supply shop has been preserved by its incorporation into the 2007 design of the laneway house located at what is now known as 40R Shaftesbury Avenue (*Image 7*).

iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

Current photographs of the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are found in Attachments 2 and 6 of this report. The sites contain a group of four attached row houses, a type that first appeared in Europe and Britain during the 17th century and ranged from elaborate terraces in cities for the upper classes, to workers' housing in industrial settings. In 19th-century Toronto, row houses were more commonly found in urban areas where greater densities were accommodated on modest-sized plots. As a familiar building type, Toronto row houses designed for workers' accommodation "are not ambitious dwellings, but they charm with their modest demeanour and harmonious scale."⁸

The properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue contain a group of four contiguous two-storey house form buildings that, with an overall rectangular-shaped plan, are covered by flat roofs. Constructed with brick cladding and incorporating brick and stone trim, the units at 116, 118 and 120 have been painted on the principal (south) elevation and 122 has been covered with stucco. Georgian styling is apparent in the symmetrical placement of the door and window openings and the simplified detailing without classical embellishments. The principal (south) elevations of the buildings are symmetrically organized with 116-118 and 120-122 designed as mirror images.⁹ The entries are flanked by a single window opening in the first floor. The second stories also have a single window opening, each aligned directly above the first floor window opening. Overall, the placement of the door and window opening still survives, with the rough-cut stone sills supported by brick corbels (*Images 8-10*).

While altered, with the scale of the buildings and the repetition of the fenestration on the south elevations, the row houses retain their overall integrity and continue to communicate their cultural heritage values.

iv. CONTEXT

The properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are found on the north side of the street, east of Yonge Street and facing the CP rail tracks (*Image 11*). In this setting, they are part of a group of residential buildings of modest scale and size that were originally tenanted by tradespeople associated with the railway and other industries located along the tracks on the south side of Shaftesbury Avenue. In the immediate Summerhill neighbourhood, other properties recognized on the City's Heritage Register include 84 and 87 Woodlawn Avenue East (both designed by architect and local resident, James Avon Smith) and the North Toronto train station, now Summerhill LCBO, designed by Darling & Pearson in 1915-1916.

⁸ Cruikshank, 85

^{9 122} Shaftesbury Avenue has an additional bay at its east end but its recessed placement doesn't affect the symmetrical design of the principal (south) elevation of all four units.

3. EVALUATION

The following evaluation of 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue applies Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register. The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

Design or Physical Value	
i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression,	
material or construction method	
ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

The properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are valued for the design of the intact row of house form buildings dating to the late 19th century that are typical of the modest row housing identified with the development of the area. Archival records indicate that they are the only surviving row houses of their kind in the immediate vicinity featuring simplified Georgian styling with restrained detailing. With their shared scale and the organization of the principal (south) elevations, the row houses are unified by the rhythm of their symmetrically-placed fenestration and door openings.

Historical or Associative Value	
i. direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization	
or institution that is significant to a community	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	Х
understanding of a community or culture	
iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	N/A
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

The properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are valued for their association with the local resident, property owner and builder, Edward Martin. In 1890, Martin owned all four of the subject properties and he constructed 122 Shaftesbury Avenue that anchors the east end of the row in 1892. Martin is also known to have owned at least four other properties in the immediate vicinity including the group of three two-storey row houses at 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place (now demolished) which were the only other known examples in the area of similar scale and styling to the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, as well as Martin's own building supply shop and lumberyard at 1 Shaftesbury Place.

Contextual Value	
i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	Х
ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	Х
iii. landmark	N/A

Contextually, the group of four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are valued for supporting and defining the historical character of the southernmost portion of the Summerhill neighbourhood in the late-1800s as a working-class community where families occupied modest row housing, including the subject row houses, adjoining industry and institutional landmarks, particularly the CP railway and North Toronto Station, that reflect the early development of the neighbourhood and remain city-wide landmarks.

The four two-storey row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are historically and visually linked to their setting along the northern edge of the CP railway, which employed many of the area's first residents.

4. SUMMARY

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the properties at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue have cultural heritage value for their design, historical associations and context. Located on the north side of Shaftesbury Avenue, the subject properties contain a group of four late-19th century row houses that represent an important building typology in the Summerhill neighbourhood, are the only surviving examples of their kind in the immediate vicinity featuring simplified Georgian styling with restrained detailing, and contribute to the historical development of this area in the latter half of the 1800s as a working-class community adjoining the north end of the Town of York (afterward Toronto) where families occupied modest multi-unit housing close to local industries and services.

Contextually, the row houses at 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue are valued for their role in supporting and defining the historical character of the Summerhill neighbourhood where buildings designed for workers' housing, including the subject row houses, adjoin industry and institutional landmarks, particularly the CP railway and North Toronto Station. The subject properties are historically and visually linked to their setting along the northern edge of the CP railway, which employed many of the area's first residents.

5. SOURCES

Archival Sources:

- Abstract Indices of Deeds, Plan 636, Block E and Plan 662, Lot 17
- Archival Maps, 1802-1842, http://oldtorontomaps.blogspot.ca/p/index-of-maps.html
- Archival Photographs, Toronto Archives and Toronto Reference Library
- Assessment Rolls, St. Paul's Ward, 1889-1893; Ward 2, Division 2, 1894
- Building Records, City of Toronto, Toronto and East York, 122 Shaftesbury Avenue (Permit #879)
- City of Toronto Directories, 1888 ff.
- Cotterell, Alfred T. Map of Yorkville and its Vicinity, 1878.
- Goad, Charles E. Atlas of the City of Toronto and Suburbs, 1884-1924 (CTA)
- Miles & Co. Illustrated Historical Atlas of the County of York, 1878 <u>http://oldtorontomaps.blogspot.ca/2013/01/1878-illustrated-historical-atlas-of.html</u>

- Ng, Nathan. *Historical Maps of Toronto*. <u>http://oldtorontomaps.blogspot.com/</u>
- Tremaine, George R, Tremaine's Map of the County of York Canada West, 1860. <u>http://oldtorontomaps.blogspot.com/2013/02/1860-tremaines-map-of-county-of-york.html</u>

Secondary Sources:

- Arthur, Eric, Toronto. No Mean City, 3rd ed., revised by Stephen A. Otto, 1986
- Blumenson, John, Ontario Architecture, 1990
- Careless, J. M. S., *Toronto to 1918*, 1984
- City of Toronto Planning Board, Deer Park Planning District Appraisal, Jan 1961.
- Cruikshank, Tom, and John De Visser, Old Toronto Houses, 2003
- Kinsella, Joan C. Historical Walking Tour of Deer Park, 1996
- Lundell, Liz, The Estates of Old Toronto, 1998
- McHugh, Patricia, Toronto Architecture: A City Guide, 2nd ed., 1989
- Middleton, J. E., *The Municipality of Toronto: A History*, 1923
- Shostack, Hanna and Christopher Webster, *The Summerhill Area: Historical Notes*, 1974
- Rogers Television, 2004, 'Summerhill Neighbourhood' [Episode 8] in Structures, Toronto: Rogers TV

6. IMAGES – maps and atlases are followed by other archival images and current photographs. The arrows mark the location of the subject properties. All images are oriented with north on the top unless indicated in the captions.



1. Cotterell's *Map of Yorkville and its Vicinity*, 1878, detail showing Thompson Avenue and Charles Street in Lot 17, Concession 2, which are now Summerhill Avenue and Shaftesbury Avenue respectively (Ng).



2. *Goad's Atlas*, 1890, detail showing 116 and 118 Shaftesbury Avenue, which were already completed when the information for the map was gathered during the previous year (Ng).



3. City Planning Board archival photograph showing 122 Shaftesbury Avenue and most of 120 to the left in 1964 (CTA).



City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 1244, Item 1748 4. Archival photograph showing the old and new North Toronto train stations (CTA).



5. Archival photograph showing 2, 4 and 6 Shaftesbury Place in 1940, now demolished (CTA).



6. Archival photograph showing Edward Martin's building supply shop and lumberyard at 1 Shaftesbury Place (CTA).



7. The current laneway house at 40R Shaftesbury Avenue built in 2007-2008, the design for which intentionally incorporated the remaining structure of Edward Martin's late-19th century building supply shop (Google Maps).



8. View of 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue looking northeast (HPS, 2018)



9. (*From left to right*) The principal (south) elevations of 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue, respectively (HPS, 2018).



10. Photograph showing the window opening detailing with the rough-cut stone sills supported by brick corbels (HPS, 2018)



11. Location Map, 116, 118, 120 and 122 Shaftesbury Avenue: showing the location of the row houses on the north side of the street, directly across the road from the CP rail tracks (City of Toronto Property Data Map).