

SCHEDULE "A," REASONS FOR DESIGNATION (STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE) for the designation of the properties at 189-193 Mutual Street, By-law 1294-2015, under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Description

189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are located on the east side of Mutual Street just north of Gerrard Street East. Built in 1887, the three properties are two-and-a-half-storey row houses with brick facing.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The properties at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for their cultural heritage value, and meet the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the three categories of design, associative and contextual values.

The row houses at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are valued for their design and construction which display a high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit. They are also valued as fine examples of the Bay-n-Gable type combined with the Second Empire Style. While the Second Empire Style was featured in some of the grand estates on the adjacent Jarvis Street, and was also widely employed for institutional uses across Canada, it is a rare stylistic example for row houses within the Garden District enclave of Mutual, McGill and Granby Streets. The elements of the style are seen primarily in the Mansard roof and in the rich elaboration of well-preserved architectural elements and wood trim evident at the windows and cornices. The Bay-n-Gable type is represented in the two-and-a-half storey building on a raised basement. Other features include the main entrance, set to one side, with the bay window adjacent at the first floor level. The variation on the type is the replacement of the typical gable roof in the attic story with a mansard. Within the Garden District it is a very well-preserved, rare example of this variation of the Bay-n-Gable type which includes the Second Empire Style.

The properties at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street have an associative value for their contribution to understanding the historic, social and urban development, and subsequent evolution, of this part of the Garden District. Initially the properties were a part of one of the series of hundred acre Park Lots, created with the founding of the town of York in 1793 and acquired by the influential Jarvis family. Its subdivision included the creation of Jarvis Street, an extraordinarily wide, grand avenue where influential and wealthy Torontonians built their estates and which provided a connection from the Second Concession Line (Bloor Street) southward to the town's commercial and civic institutions and lakefront wharves. Mutual Street, in contrast, represents a residential enclave developed for the middle class, adjacent to the grand Jarvis Street estates. The whole area declined in the 1920s with the retreat of the wealthy northwards, but the residential enclave persisted and was revived with complimentary infill projects in the last quarter of the twentieth century.

189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street have contextual value as they are important in defining, maintaining and supporting the character of the residential enclave west of Jarvis and north of Gerrard Street East, which along with McGill and Granby Streets, are part of the Garden District. The Garden District is named for Allan Gardens, and enclosed by Queen, Yonge, Carleton and Sherbourne Streets.

This character was defined in the last quarter of the nineteenth century with row houses and semi-detached houses of a consistent scale and built form which featured two-and-a-half storey dwellings, on raised basements, with sloping attic roofs expressed as gable, hips or mansards. Other features included bay windows, verandahs and porches, and dormer windows. Variety was achieved through materials, brick, wood, stone and shingle, different geometrical shapes in plan, elevation and three dimensions and elaborate decoration provided through intricately carved, turned and incised wood elements. This character was reinforced in the last quarter of the twentieth century with infill projects that carefully maintained the scale and built form of the residential types reflecting the pattern of lot sizes. 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street contribute to the consistency of the late nineteenth century character of this enclave and through their well-preserved details and rare combination of Second Empire Style with Bay-n-Gable type enhance the quality of variety and diversity. They are physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to their surroundings.

Heritage Attributes:

The heritage attributes on the exterior of the houses at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are:

- The location of the buildings on the east side of Mutual Street including the set back and orientation
- The scale, form and massing of the buildings including its two and a half storey height on a raised basement with a mansard roof
- The west facades with their bay windows, paired windows at the second floor and single dormer windows in the mansard-roof attic story
- The north and south facades, constructed of orangey-red brick with projecting corbelled fire-break walls and window openings stepping from three to two storeys towards the rear elevation
- The chimneys on each house expressed on the side walls of the main two-and-a-half storey portion and on the rear two-storey extension
- The materials, including the orangey-red brick, limestone lintels, slate shingles in a rectangular and fish-scale pattern, the decorative wood detailing of the dormer windows, cornices of the bay windows, and detailing of the mansard roof and soffits at both the second and third floor levels