

**From:** Peggy Moulder  
**To:** [Special Governance](#)  
**Subject:** GV5.1 - 2ND PRESENTATION TO GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE MTG - NOV 1, 2019  
**Date:** October 31, 2019 4:07:20 PM  
**Attachments:** [2nd Presentation to Gov Comm Mtg - Nov 1, 2019.pdf](#)

---

Please find attached our submission for the Special Committee on Governance meeting on Nov 1, 2019.

Please confirm that you will make the Presentation available for the public to view.

Thank you in advance.

Peggy Moulder  
Secretary  
Lakeshore Planning Council Corp. (non-profit)

# SLIDE - 1

## 2<sup>nd</sup> Presentation to the Special Committee on Governance – Nov 1, 2019

Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory  
Boards to City Council



Part 2 - City of Toronto  
Planning Commission



## SLIDE - 2      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

### Impact of reduction in size of Council and number of Wards to 25

A major impact arising from the reduction is the ability of Councillors and Residents (approx. 110,000 Residents per Ward) to effectively communicate with each other. This serious impact was identified by both Councillors and Residents.

- ✓ Re-organization of public consultation and communications between Councillors and their constituents is, therefore, necessary.
- ✓ After nine months of public consultation, the recommendation of the City Manager in the report dated October 23, 2019, to “do nothing” to address this issue is not acceptable.
- ✓ The recommendation underlines the ongoing **failure of public consultations** conducted by City Staff, who filter and reflect public input to suit their personal interests, preference, and convenience, which is often contrary to, and, overall, not the public interest.



## SLIDE - 3      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

### What is Public Consultation?

Public consultation, or simply consultation, is a regulatory process by which the public's input on matters affecting them is sought. Its main goals are in improving the efficiency, transparency and public involvement in large-scale projects or laws and policies. It usually involves notification (to publicise the matter to be consulted on), consultation (a two-way flow of information and opinion exchange) as well as participation (involving interest groups in the drafting of policy or legislation). A frequently used tool for understanding different levels of community participation in consultation is known as Arnstein's ladder. (Wikipedia)



- ✓ Public consultation is public input that formulates public policy.
- ✓ Public consultation protocols and procedures are to be legislated to determine how public input is received, processed and included in public policy.
- ✓ Legislation ensures consistency and fairness of the process.

## SLIDE - 4      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

- ✓ Arnstein's Ladder of Citizen Participation - Perhaps the most significant paper among dozens is one penned by Sherry R Arnstein way back in 1969 during a period of radical reform of many aspects of public life in the USA. It is a, if not the, foundational paper in the development of the discipline of community engagement.



- ✓ Spectrum of Public Participation - Many years later the **International Association of Public Participation (IAP2)** more or less flipped the ladder on its side and adopted Arnstein's ladder of citizen participation as its very own **Spectrum of Public Participation**.

# SLIDE - 5      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

## Spectrum of Public Participation

International  
Association of Public  
Participation (IAP2)



INCREASING IMPACT ON THE DECISION

	INFORM	CONSULT	INVOLVE	COLLABORATE	EMPOWER
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION GOAL	To provide the public with balanced and objective information to assist them in understanding the problem, alternatives, opportunities and/or solutions.	To obtain public feedback on analysis, alternatives and/or decisions.	To work directly with the public throughout the process to ensure that public concerns and aspirations are consistently understood and considered.	To partner with the public in each aspect of the decision including the development of alternatives and the identification of the preferred solution.	To place final decision making in the hands of the public.
PROMISE TO THE PUBLIC	We will keep you informed.	We will keep you informed, listen to and acknowledge concerns and aspirations, and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision.	We will work with you to ensure that your concerns and aspirations are directly reflected in the alternatives developed and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision.	We will look to you for advice and innovation in formulating solutions and incorporate your advice and recommendations into the decisions to the maximum extent possible.	We will implement what you decide.

## SLIDE - 6      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

- ✓ It can be readily determined from the [Spectrum of Public Participation](#), an updated version of Arsteins' Ladder of Citizen Participation in governance decision-making, that Toronto has relegated public input to the lowest rung of "inform" with some of the second rung "consult" added.

- ✓ The report dated October 23, 2019, of the City Manager referenced eight cities in Attachment 2.
- ✓ The populations of three American cities are mentioned. At 1/4 the size, these are too small for any reasonable comparison with Toronto on the subject of public consultation. The populations Edmonton and Calgary are 1/3 to 1/2 that of Toronto.
- ✓ The population of Montreal is 2/3 the size of Toronto, and its public consultations are conducted by an external publicly appointed body at an annual cost of \$1.08 to \$1.64 per person.





# SLIDE - 7      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

- ✓ Toronto pop. – 2,956,024 – area 630 km<sup>2</sup>
- ✓ Los Angeles pop. – 4,055,600 – area 1214 km<sup>2</sup>
- ✓ New York City pop. – 8,700,000 – area 784 km<sup>2</sup>
- ✓ Mexico City pop. – 8,918,653 – area 1485 km<sup>2</sup>
- ✓ Toronto is the 4th largest city by population in North America. It is most similar in land area and configuration with New York City for comparisons of public consultation purposes.
- ✓ Los Angeles lacks the large Central Business District and the dense core of nineteenth century cities, so it is not like New York or Chicago. Los Angeles is highly dependent on the automobile, lacking (at least until recently) the rail transit infrastructure common to older urban areas.
- ✓ Both Los Angeles and New York City utilize Resident Advisory Boards to handle public consultations and to advise their City Councils.
- ✓ In 2018, to better serve residents, both Los Angeles and New York City worked to update practices and legislation for their respective Resident Advisory Boards to address any inequities or deficiencies. The identified reforms are now completed.
- ✓ Los Angeles has 95 Neighbourhood Councils which operate at an annual cost of \$1.02 per resident.
- ✓ New York City has 59 Community Boards which operate at an annual cost of \$1.69 per resident.
- ✓ **It is therefore proposed that 25 Resident Advisory Boards be created for Toronto which can operate at a similar cost of \$1.69 per resident, or \$5 million annually from the 2019 budget for City Council.**





# SLIDE - 8      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

## From the September 11, 2019, report of the City Manager:

### Community Boards

A few participants submitted endorsements of a written submission put forward by a participant at the sessions and submitted to the Committee and the City Manager. The participant recommended a structural model, based on New York City that would see Community Boards established in each ward that would report to City Council.

- Community Boards would be comprised of a mix of citizens, ~~staff~~, business people, and the Councillor (as a non-voting member) to a total of fifty people with paid staff and a budget. Within this model these Boards would be hubs that attend to a variety of local needs including sharing information, conducting outreach, processing requests and complaints, reviewing the scope and design of capital projects, evaluating the quality and quantity of service delivery, and conducting engagement. At the Community Council level, there would be a "District Service Cabinet" in the four quadrants of the City that would coordinate service delivery, the programming of the agencies, work through inter-agency problems and impediments, and recommend joint programs. At the Community Council level, there would be a "District Service Cabinet" in the four quadrants of the City that would coordinate service delivery, the programming of the agencies, work through inter-agency problems and impediments, and recommend joint programs.



- The strengths expressed by these participants for community boards included that they would be more representative of the local neighbourhoods, they would address gaps, their decisions would be made in public, they would be legislated and funded by the City, they would reduce competition between groups, and they would build member's capacity to become Councillors.

# SLIDE - 9      Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

## From the September 11, 2019, report of the City Manager:

### Community Boards

- At the consultations, and through a written submission, some apprehensions were expressed about the board model: they would be an "unnecessary additional layer of governance" offering identical functions to current structures.

**Response: Resident Community Boards will handle all public consultations, and fit into the current governance structure.**

Also, while smaller geographic areas may enable residents to better connect to local governance, politically, having fewer Councillors present can "balkanize to hamstring City Council if no consensus is reached before the item comes to Council". It was expressed that "There are directions which the City must undertake to which local Community Boards may object. Regretfully the benefit of the entire city must overrule the local objections".

**Response: City Council cannot be "hamstrung" by Community/Advisory Boards, as Council makes the final decision.**

A couple of participants expressed concern about how decisions would be made and asked "has equity been baked into the process?"

**Response: Yes, equity has been legislated into the process.**

One reflection mentioned that Councillor's workload may increase noting "it can be a full time job to manage people who are not elected", and another said that the Community Board structure would cost the City additional money.

**Response: The Councillor will NOT be managing the Community Advisory Board. It will be self-managed and governed by legislation. The cost of \$5 million is already set aside in the 2019 City Council budget to facilitate communications with residents.**



# SLIDE - 10 Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

## Presentation by Gabriel Eidelman GV2.1 to the Special Committee on Governance

- ✓ Mr. Eidelman from the University of Toronto School of Public Policy & Governance refers to the 2017 “Practical Blueprint for Change” and confirms it is still practical and contains useful advice. He notes in his April 2019 Slideshow GV2.1 “Start of Term Budget Consultations” that the City has suffered a “missed opportunity”.
- ✓ New York City budget management requires each of its 59 Community Boards (1 CB for each Borough, where a NYC Borough is equivalent to a Toronto Ward) to annually submit a list, by priority, of capital and expense projects for their community.
- ✓ Responses to these budget requests from the relevant City Departments are provided. The 2019 Capital Budget requests and Expense Budget requests from Manhattan Community Board #4 are attached as Appendix A as an example for your review. Source: <http://home.nyc.gov/html/mancb4/html/budget/budget.shtml>
- ✓ These include requests for 44 items listed for Capital Budget Expenditures and 48 items listed for the Expense Budget Expenditures for the Manhattan Community Board #4 area, with responses from the relevant City Department.



- ✓ There is a legislated budget process for the (Resident-based) Community Boards to hold public meetings, vote on, and submit, these budget requests for inclusion in the NYC Annual Budget. An extract from the NYC Community Board Handbook sets out how Community Boards participate in the annual budget process is also attached to Appendix A.

# SLIDE - 11 Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

- ✓ Here is a Summary of the participation by Residents through their Community Boards in the annual NYC budget:

"...As representatives of local communities, Boards are naturally concerned with City spending that affects the quality of life for residents and workers in their districts. The process by which the Community Boards participate in formulating the City's budgets has six major elements...

1. Consultations between Community Boards and City agencies that deliver local services...
2. Public hearings held by the Community Board...
3. Formal budget submissions...
4. Agency review of Board budget requests...
5. Office of Management and Budget (OMB) review of Board budget requests...
6. Public hearings at which the Boards testify"...



## SLIDE - 12 Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

### EXAMPLE - MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD #5 - MEETING OCT 10, 2019

If you are wondering how New York City conducts their public consultations, public consultation is carried out by the residents through Community Boards, which act as Advisory Boards to NY City Council.

New York City Councillors are not afraid of democracy, or respectfully entrusting their residents to carry out public consultation with legislated protocols in place to protect the legitimacy and integrity of the process.

Manhattan Community Board #5 ( <https://www.cb5.org/cb5m/about/our-role/> ) meeting of Oct 10, 2019, has been chosen AT RANDOM to provide some insight into how "democratically advanced" (inclusive, transparent, participatory, working towards consensus, etc., complying with good governance) public consultation is in New York City. The Community Board meetings are **videotaped** and posted online, while most of the work is done prior to the meeting in Committees comprised of board members and members of the public. If a resident does not have time to participate as a full Board member, he/she can work in a Committee on a topic of interest as a member of the public, or simply deputize at a Board meeting on a particular item of concern.



Here is a video of the meeting: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DI-hclEdAMo&t=1264s> **If you are impressed, remember, NYC Resident Community Boards have been operating for more than 50 years. It's time for Toronto to get started!** An Agenda for the meeting is provided as Appendix B for this Presentation.

# SLIDE - 13 Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

- ✓ The NYC Community Boards, as a template, can readily be adapted to function very well for Toronto residents and for Toronto issues as the 4th largest North American city.
- ✓ Draft Legislation can readily be prepared using the 2019/180 NYC Charter legislation, effective October 25, 2019, for Community Advisory Boards as a template.
- ✓ NYC Community Boards have operated since the 1960's, legislation for which has been periodically updated, and are strongly influenced by the ideas of Jane Jacobs, who is described as a New Urbanist who transformed city planning.
- ✓ The New York City model is the best model for Toronto, all other models being inferior for the purposes of Toronto. The NYC model addresses how public consultation can be achieved efficiently, fairly and effectively.



- ✓ There is no need to spend two-years publicly discussing information on various city data and legislation that is readily available online.
- ✓ That would be time and money misspent when residents could actually be addressing real problems and issues through Advisory Board Committees, and through subsequent recommendations by 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council.

## SLIDE - 14 Part 1 - 25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council

25 Resident Advisory Boards to City Council should be created through **legislation** to facilitate public consultation

For additional information on 25 Resident Community/Advisory Boards to Toronto City Council, please refer to our original presentation entitled “Government in the Community” to the Special Committee on Governance on September 11, 2019.

You will also find the September 11, 2019, presentation on our website, along with other detailed information:

<http://lakeshoreplanningcouncil.com/community-boards/>



Continue to next page – Part 2 – City of Toronto Planning Commission



# SLIDE - 15    Part 2 – City of Toronto Planning Commission

- ✓ It is disappointing to note that the report of the City Manager dated October 23, 2019, does not mention the proposal for a City of Toronto Planning Commission (CPC) to ultimately remove city planning from the jurisdiction of the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (LPAT/former OMB).
- ✓ City Council will delegate all planning decisions to the CPC, a panel of nine independent, qualified experts, including the City's Chief Planner as the Chairman.
- ✓ Politicians are not planning experts and are continually lobbied by for-profit developers.
- ✓ Planning Staff require expert oversight and direction, to ensure full compliance with the Official Plan and Provincial Acts and regulations.



# SLIDE - 16 Part 2 – City of Toronto Planning Commission

- ✓ Creation of the CPC will eliminate the necessity for a Councillors' Committee on Planning and Housing, as the 4 area Community Councils will review planning and zoning matters and provide their recommendations to the CPC.
- ✓ The Resident Community Advisory Boards will also provide their recommendations on planning and zoning matters to the CPC.
- ✓ The creation of a CPC will free up significant time for Councillors, who will be able to rely on professional planning decisions made by the CPC in the best interests of the City.
- ✓ While the CPC decisions will be final, Council will retain the right to overturn any CPC decision at the request of the affected Community Council.



## SLIDE - 17 Part 2 – City of Toronto Planning Commission

A City of Toronto Planning Commission should be created through **legislation** to ultimately remove Toronto from the jurisdiction of LPAT

For additional information on City of Toronto Planning Commission, please refer to our original presentation entitled “Government in the Community” to the Special Committee on Governance on September 11, 2019.

You will also find the September 11, 2019, presentation on our website along with other detailed information :

<http://lakeshoreplanningcouncil.com/city-planning-commission-cpc/>



THANK YOU  
THANK YOU



# APPENDIX A - 2ND PRESENTATION TO THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON GOVERNANCE - NOV 1, 2019

## REQUESTS FOR CAPITAL BUDGET EXPENDITURES - MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD #4 - 2019 PAGE 1 OF 14

Tracking Code	Priority	Request	Reason	Location	Supported by 1	Supported by 2	Agency	Agy Response	Agy Category Description	Additional Comment
304201901C	01	Other affordable housing programs requests	Provide adequate capital subsidy for the HPD development at the NYCHA Harborview Terrace site located at West 55 Street and 10th Avenue.	Location Site Name: Harborview Terrace Address: 525 W 55th St	Council Member Helen Rosenthal	Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer	Department of Housing Preservation & Development	The agency will try to accommodate this issue within existing resources.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate in part	
304201902C	02	Other affordable housing programs requests	Provide adequate capital subsidy for the Multifamily Preservation Loan Program (MPLP) and the Senior Affordable Rental Apartments (SARA) for the following affordable housing projects: 560 West 52nd Street - (MPLP) 500 West 52nd Street - (SARA)	Location Address: 500 & 560 West 52nd St	Clinton Housing Development Corporation	Westside Neighborhood Alliance	Department of Housing Preservation & Development	The agency will try to accommodate this issue within existing resources.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate in part	Under Housing New York, HPD strives to finance the creation and preservation of housing that is affordable to a wide-range of income levels, including for extremely and very low-income households, seniors and the homeless. You can track our success by Borough and by income status here: <a href="https://www1.nyc.gov/site/housing/action/by-the-numbers.page">https://www1.nyc.gov/site/housing/action/by-the-numbers.page</a> It is important to note that HPD creates affordable housing on both public and private sites. On public sites we have greater influence to steer development towards certain affordability levels. The vast majority of sites we work with however, are privately-owned sites. In these cases private owners come to HPD for financing and we have to jointly agree on the affordability/income levels that the owner will provide, and they must be in accordance with our term sheets. In 2017
304201903C	03	Provide new homeless shelters or SROs	Build additional family shelter facility and downsize the West 25th Street BRC site so as to alleviate community conflicts.		West 25th Street Project		Department of Homeless Services	The Agency is continually evaluating shelter facilities across the boroughs. New shelter facilities are being brought online routinely to meet the needs of the client population.	This request requires further study	
304201904C	04	Improve traffic and pedestrian safety, including traffic calming	Install 10 raised pedestrian crossing at various intersection starting with 45th street and 9th Avenue to facilitate circulation of seniors and disabled persons and calm the traffic	Location Address: crossing of 45th st. west of 9	Council member Corey Johnson has provided capital funding	CHEKPE DS	Department of Transportation	Appropriate traffic control devices are installed at this location; a raised intersection is unnecessary.	This request requires further study	Due to operational constraints, we cannot implement raised crosswalks on bus or truck routes, or on streets with more than one lane in each direction.

304201905C	05	Make infrastructure investments that will support growth in local business districts	Fund Block 5 and 6 of Hudson Boulevard Park. Rezone northern part of Hudson Yards to complete the park and allow more residential uses. Blocks 4 of the park is planned to be funded through a private developer working through the Hudson Yards Development Corporation. However block 5 and 6 of the Hudson Yards Boulevard are not currently funded. A rezoning of Hudson Yards North is needed to provide a mechanism to fund the park, and to reflect the realities of the market, which needs to give priority to residential development in this area.	Location Site Name: Hudson Blvd Park	Council Member Corey Johnson	Hudson Yards/Hell's Kitchen Alliance	Economic Development Corporation	Further study by the agency of this request is needed.	This request requires further study	Please contact NYCEDC for further conversation. Please contact Morgan Jones, Manhattan Borough Director: morganjones@edc.nyc
304201906C	06	Improve accessibility of transit infrastructure, by providing elevators, escalators, etc.	Expand funding to the L line repair project to provide critical upgrades, including ADA access, to the 8th Avenue and West 14th Street Stop. And reopen the passage between 6th and 7th Avenues.	Location Address: 8th Avenue West 14th Street Site Street: 8th Ave Cross Street 1: West 14th St			Transit Authority	For information regarding the status of this Request, contact the Transit Authority directly at telephone number 646-252-2660.		
304201907C	07	Create a new, or renovate or upgrade an existing public library	Fund \$800,000 for needed roof repair of Columbus Avenue Branch Library.	Location Site Name: Columbus Branch Address: 742 10th Avenue			New York Public Library	NYPL is in favor of this project; however, restored City capital funding is required. NYPL will continue to work through the City's budget process for needed funding. Please contact NYPL for additional information.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	

304201908C	08	Provide new or increase number of sanitation trucks and other equipment	Provide funding for the following Sanitation vehicles: Two new additional trucks for basket pick up service bringing the total amount of trucks for MCD4 to four Manual Litter Patrol Vehicle to support sanitation crews with cleaning up illegal dumping and homeless encampments.		Chelsea Council of Block Associations	Council Member Corey Johnson	Department of Sanitation	Although the Department of Sanitation supports this program, due to fiscal constraints the availability of funds is uncertain.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201909C	09	Provide a new or expand an existing elementary school	With schools operating a full or over capacity, we need to identify sites to build new elementary schools - particularly in midtown, where Hudson Yards will bring in an extraordinary number of students, in a short time frame.				Department of Education	Community District is located in a school district with identified seat need. Projects are in process or have been completed.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	
304201910C	10	Reconstruct or upgrade a park or amenity (i.e. playground, outdoor athletic field)	Fund the renovation and construction of the bathrooms at the following parks: Dewitt Clinton Park - West 52/54 from 11/12 Ave Matthews-Palmer Park - 445 W 45th St Chelsea Park - 450 West 27th Street Without new and updated bathrooms these parks can not live up to their potential and support needed fixed post park staff.		Hell's Kitchen Neighborhood Alliance	Council of Chelsea Block Associations	Department of Parks and Recreation	Department of Parks and Recreation funds are insufficient for this project. We recommend this project be brought to the attention of your elected officials, i.e. Borough President and/or City Council member.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201911C	11	Renovate or upgrade an elementary school	Expand funding to renovate the following areas and items in P.S. 33: Bathrooms Kitchen Cafeteria PA system Security cameras	Location Site Name: P.S. 33 Address: 281 9 AVENUE	Community Education Council District 2		Department of Education	This request includes more than one proposal. Funding for part is recommended.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate in part	

304201912C	12	Renovate or upgrade public housing developments	Harborview Terrace (525 West 55th Street, New York, NY 10019) - New trash compactors for both buildings - 28 New hoppers (Compactor doors) on each floor of both buildings - Complete replacement of hallway light fixtures with New light fixtures for both buildings (240) - New Radiator covers for all floors in both buildings - Upgrade the lighting in the lobby and exterior courtyards. - Motion detection door for the senior	Location Address: 525 West 55th Street	Harborview Terrace Tenants Association		Housing Authority	This request includes more than one proposal. Funding for part is recommended.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201913C	13	Renovate or upgrade an elementary school	PS11 Capital Needs: Complete Scope and fund Handicap Lift for universal access to the building. This school of approximately 950 students is not yet handicap accessible.	Location Address: 320 West 21 Street	PS11 PTA		Department of Education	Unable to prioritize funding for this project request at this time.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201914C	14	Renovate or upgrade a high school	Business of Sports School: Fund \$117,000 for 21 new Smartboards.	Location Site Name: Business of Sports School Address: 439 West 49th Street			Department of Education	Specific projects to be funded are decided at the local level. Please contact your school for specific information.	The agency agrees with this request, but the funding decision follows a different budget process (i.e. RFP, local level decision)	
304201915C	15	Install security cameras or make other safety upgrades	Fulton Houses (421 West 17th Street New York, NY 10011): Install security cameras on the roof of all buildings - Elliot-Chelsea (425 West 25th Street) Cameras in front of the Hudson Guild pathway and playground 441 West 26th Street		Elliot-Chelsea Tenant Association	Fulton House Resident Association	Housing Authority	Elected officials have provided funding for this NYCHA initiative in prior fiscal years. Contact elected officials to ensure the appropriations of proposed funding so that all work can be completed.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	



304201916C	16	Renovate or upgrade public housing developments	Fulton Houses (421 West 17th Street New York, NY 10011) 400 West 17 Street - New Sump PitPumps for 401 West 16 Street - New Sump PitPumps for 420 West 19 street - New Sump PitPumps for 434 West 17 Street - New security fence in the rear of all buildings - New Lights for roof landings in all 19 buildings - Additional bench's for seniors and families to sit throughout the whole complex.	Location Address: 421 West 17th Street	Fulton Houses Residents Association		Housing Authority	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	NYCHA would be happy to meet with the resident association to discuss what is possible.
304201917C	17	Renovate or upgrade public housing developments	Elliot-Chelsea (425 W 25th St) - Repainting all Lobbies - New fence and gate surrounding playground in front of 420 West 26th Street and 425 West 25th Street.	Location Address: 425 West 25th Street	Elliot-Chelsea Tenant Association		Housing Authority	Elected officials have provided funding for this NYCHA initiative in prior fiscal years. Contact elected officials to ensure the appropriations of proposed funding so that all work can be completed.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate in part	
304201918C	18	Other park maintenance and safety requests	DPR vehicle: Our District is in need of DPR vehicles including a truck for the transportation of equipment and seasonal employees.				Department of Parks and Recreation	Department of Parks and Recreation funds are insufficient for this project. We recommend this project be brought to the attention of your elected officials, i.e. Borough President and/or City Council member.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201919C	19	Renovate or upgrade an elementary school	Fund upgrades to make P.S. 111 School entrance and gymnasium ADA accessible.	Location Site Name: P.S. 111 Manhattan	P.S. 111 PTA		Department of Education	Unable to prioritize funding for this project request at this time.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201920C	20	Provide a new or expanded park or amenity (i.e. playground, outdoor athletic field)	Fund the \$1.3 needed to complete the design for a new park at West 48th Street and 10th Avenue as committed to during Western Rail Yard rezoning and negotiations.	Location Site Street: 10th Ave Cross Street 1: West 48th St Cross Street 2: West 49th Str	47/48 Street Block Association		Department of Parks and Recreation	Department of Parks and Recreation funds are insufficient for this project. We recommend this project be brought to the attention of your elected officials, i.e. Borough President and/or City Council member.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	Parks is also seeking private funds for this project.

304201921C	21	Other transit infrastructure requests	Work with MTA to design the West 41st and 10th Ave station for the # 7.	Location Site Street: West 41 St Cross Street 1: 10th Ave Cross Street 2: 11th	HYHK Alliance	CHEKPE DS	Transit Authority	For information regarding the status of this Request, contact the Transit Authority directly at telephone number 646-252-2660.		
304201922C	22	Build new, expand or repair storm sewers	Expand funding for broken catch basin capital contracts at the following locations: - Northeast and Northwest corners of West 23rd street and 9th Avenue, - Northeast corner of 21st Street at Tenth Avenue. All corners of Tenth Ave and West 21st & 20th Street.		Council Member Corey Johnson	Council of Chelsea Block Associations	Department of Environmental Protection	This project was funded in a prior fiscal year and the construction contract has been let.	This request has already been funded	DEP has a contract in place to repair and replace broken catch basins in Manhattan.
304201923C	23	Repair or construct new curbs or pedestrian ramps	Fulfill the city commitment to install ADA compliant ramps at intersections - Dyer Ave and W. 34th street - North side of West 42 Street and Dyer Avenue - where ramp is missing - South west corner of 39th street and 8th Avenue ramp is unusable - West 48th Street and Eighth Avenue the ramp is missing In addition, Install up to 30 audible pedestrian signals - Especially at 15th street and 9th Avenue.		CHEKPE DS		Department of Transportation	Pedestrian ramps will be constructed at all locations citywide by NYCDOT over the next several years. DOT received additional funding for this purpose.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	The Board requested a survey of the pedestrian ramps on Dyer Avenue from 34th to 36th Streets. The location Dyer Ave and 36th Street has existing ramps. The location Dyer Ave 34th Street there is a tree obstruction. We are reaching out to Parks to see what can be done.

304201924C	24	Provide new facilities such as a firehouse or EMS station	Permanently relocate the West 23rd Street #7 EMS station (FDNY) to a new facility MCB4 specifically requests immediate funding for a relocation of the EMS station that is temporarily located on W. 23rd Street and Tenth Avenue. The current temporary location was never designed for the heavy use the EMS is placing on this site. The current small, cramped location adjacent to residential buildings has resulted in noise and exhaust pollution. The site is unsafe for both FDNY personnel and nearby residents and pedestrians.		Council of Chelsea Block Associations	Council Member Corey Johnson	Fire Department	This project is included in the ten-year plan.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	
304201925C	25	Other transit service requests	MCB4 continues to receive complaints about deficiencies in various aspects of the Para-transit system, Access-a-Ride service. Additional vehicles as well as upgrades vehicles are needed. better customer service training is needed.		CHEKPE DS		Transit Authority	For information regarding the status of this Request, contact the Transit Authority directly at telephone number 646-252-2660.		
304201926C	26	Provide more on-street trash cans and recycling containers	Provide more on street trash cans and recycling cans.		West 25 Street Project	Council of Chelsea Block Associations	Department of Sanitation	This is not a budget request. The matter in question is an issue of service delivery and/or agency policy. Contact the Department of Sanitation to determine how best to resolve this issue.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	
304201927C	27	Invest in piers or other capital projects to improve access to the waterfront	Fund a Brooklyn\Chelsea Ferry service to serve the large workers population in the lower part of our district. Location Site Street: 11th Avenue/Pier 57 Cross Street 1: West 14th Street Cross Street 2: West 14th Street	Location Site Name: Pier 57			Economic Development Corporation	Further study by the agency of this request is needed. Contact EDC.	This request requires further study	EDC completed the rollout of the first phase of NYC Ferry in 2017. EDC remains committed to studying additional locations throughout the city for future service following the implementation of additional phases in 2018.

304201928C	28	Repair or construct new curbs or pedestrian ramps	Extend the sidewalks: Both corners of Ninth Avenue and West 41st Street (Hells Kitchen Transportation Study). South side of West 45th Street. 8th Avenue from 34th Street to 47th Street. In particular, on the west side of Eighth Avenue between West 42nd and 43rd Streets (bike lane extensions).		CHEKPE DS		Department of Transportation	This project is included in the ten-year plan.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	A neckdown was installed on the east side of Ninth Avenue and West 41st Street. Also, the fence was removed in 2017 on the west side of 8th Ave between West 42nd and 43rd Streets to accommodate a new pedestrian space.
304201929C	29	Other transit infrastructure requests	Work with MTA to dedicate \$2 million to complete the work of the #7 Train Extension Study Group to extend the #7 train to Frank R. Lautenberg Station (FRL Station) in Secaucus.		CHEKPE DS		Transit Authority	For information regarding the status of this Request, contact the Transit Authority directly at telephone number 646-252-2660.		
304201930C	30	Provide new or expand green infrastructure, e.g. greenbelts, bioswales	Expand permeable surface and sidewalk bioswale pilot program to include MCD4: The New York City Council passed a bill in 2014 to begin a pilot program of using permeable sidewalk surfaces to reduce runoff from entering our combined sewage system. MCB4 would like to extend that pilot program to our district, which includes High Risk Flood Zones in some of our neighborhoods. In addition to this measure sidewalk swales used in other parts of the city should be installed within our district. The pedestrian islands that were installed to accommodate the separated bike lines along Eighth, and Nine Avenues would be optimal locations for sidewalk swales. Notably all new parks should				Department of Environmental Protection	Further study by the agency of this request is needed.	This request requires further study	Road and sidewalk surfaces are built and maintained by NYC DOT. This community board is not targeted at this time for new rain garden construction. Construction of bioswales or rain gardens is only being funded to mitigate areas that most often contribute to combined sewer overflows.

304201931C	31	Other street trees and forestry services requests	Tree guards for dangerous tree pits: A number of tree pits have been identified as dangerous for pedestrians and for low vision individuals in particular. More tree guards should be used to resolve this problem, which presents a real danger to low-vision pedestrians.		CHEKPE DS	Hell's Kitchen Neighborhood Alliance	Department of Parks and Recreation	Department of Parks and Recreation funds are insufficient for this project. We recommend this project be brought to the attention of your elected officials, i.e. Borough President and/or City Council member.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	Capital funds can only be used to install tree guards for newly planted trees within two years of them being planted. Tree pits are usually enlarged for new trees.
304201932C	32	Other NYPD facilities and equipment requests	Relocate the Tow Pound from Pier 76: The Hudson River Park Act calls for the City to use its best efforts to find a new location for the existing tow pound so that Pier 76 can be developed as 50% parkland and 50% compatible commercial use. We urge the City to consider alternatives as soon as possible so that Pier 76 can take its rightful place as part of Hudson River Park.				Police Department	After extensive search by NYPD, no site is available.	This is not a budget request	
304201933C	33	Install streetscape improvements	Build bulb out for the Westbound M34 SBS stop at Eighth Avenue, which was put on hold due to adjacent construction.	Location Site Street: 8th Ave Cross Street 1: West 34th St Cross Street 2: West 34th St			Department of Transportation	Work on this project/program has either been completed or will be finished in FY 2018.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	This work was completed.
304201934C	34	Provide a new or expand an existing middle/intermediate school	With schools operating at full or over capacity, we need to identify sites to build new district middle schools. Development on the west side, including Hudson Yards, will bring in an extraordinary number of students, in a short time frame.				Department of Education	Community District is located in a school district with identified seat need. Projects are in process or have been completed.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	

304201935C	35	Provide a new NYPD facility, such as a new precinct house or sub-precinct	Provide a new NYPD facility and precinct district for CD4: It is time to regroup all of MCB4 within a single precinct that incorporate all the new areas in development for commercial and residential use. These combined with the exponential influx of residents, commuters and businesses in and around Hudson Yards calls for the creation of a new precinct and a redistribution of territory. We request the remapping of our district from 4 precincts to 1 or at most 2 precincts				Police Department	This is not recommended for funding because it is not an efficient use of resources to open a new police precinct or substation. To establish an additional precinct requires splitting personnel resources (including additional administrative positions) between the existing precinct and the new precinct. Consequently, the net effect may result in a reduction of officers available for patrol in the precinct because the new facility would require adequate	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201936C	36	Create a new, or renovate or upgrade an existing public library	CB4 recommends adding libraries in proportion to the residential development in our neighborhoods. Such as building the Library on West 40 Street between 9th and 10th Avenues.	Location Site Street: West 40th St Cross Street 1: 8th Ave Cross Street 2: 9th Ave			New York Public Library	NYPL supports a new library; however, the site recommended may not be suitable. Contact NYPL for information.	This request requires further study	
304201937C	37	Repair or construct new curbs or pedestrian ramps	Fulfill the city commitment to reduce radius of West 35th Street turn at Dyer Avenue (Hudson Yards rezoning follow up actions, Western Rail yards negotiations.	Location Site Street: Dyer Avenue Cross Street 1: West 35th St			Department of Transportation	The agency will accommodate this issue within existing resources.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	
304201938C	38	Renovate or upgrade an elementary school	PS51: Fund a \$100,000 Earth Science Lab that includes hydroponic equipment, indoor growing stations, grow lights, and aquaponics.	Location Site Name: PS 51, The Elias Howe School Address: 525 West 44th Street			Department of Education	Unable to prioritize funding for this project request at this time.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	

304201939C	39	Renovate or upgrade a high school	P35M at Manhattan High School: Fund \$135,000 upgrade to School library to include also computer and media lab.	Location Site Name: P35M at Manhattan High School Address: 317 West 52 Street			Department of Education	Unable to prioritize funding for this project request at this time.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201940C	40	Renovate or upgrade a high school	P35M at the Beacon School: Fund \$55,000 upgrade to art classroom and equipment.	Location Site Name: P35M at the Beacon School Address: 522 West 44th Street			Department of Education	Unable to prioritize funding for this project request at this time.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201941C	41	Renovate or upgrade a high school	Arts & Craftsmanship High School: Fund \$70,000 for 10 Smartboards for classrooms.	Location Site Name: Arts & Craftsmanship High School Address: 439 West 49th Street			Department of Education	Specific projects to be funded are decided at the local level. Please contact your school for specific information.	The agency agrees with this request, but the funding decision follows a different budget process (i.e. RFP, local level decision)	
304201942C	42	Renovate or upgrade a high school	HS for Environmental Studies: Fund \$50,000 for a Bottle filling water cooler.	Location Site Name: HS for Environmental Studies Address: 444 West 56 Street			Department of Education	Unable to prioritize funding for this project request at this time.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201943C	43	Renovate or upgrade a high school	Food and Science High School: Fund \$2 million for a chemistry lab.	Location Site Name: Food and Science High School Address: 525 West 50th Street			Department of Education	Further study by the agency of this request is needed.	This request requires further study	



304201944C	44	Reconstruct streets	Reconstruct Ninth Avenue from West 55th to 34th Streets to implement changes resulting from the DOT study now underway. Implement neck downs on each street block directly to the East and West of Ninth Avenue.	Location Site Street: 9th Ave Cross Street 1: West 55th St Cross Street 2: West 34th St	CHEKPE DS		Department of Transportation	Further study by the agency of this request is needed.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201945C	CS	Provide more or better equipment to a library	Continue funding: Muhlenberg Branch for existing project of the HVAC Replacement (ID# LRCA14MBG).	Location Site Name: Muhlenberg Branch	Council of Chelsea Block Associations		New York Public Library	NYPL is in favor of this project but added or restored City funding is required for all expense budget costs and any needed capital costs. NYPL will continue to work through the City's budget process for needed funding. Contact NYPL for more information.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201946C	CS	Reconstruct or upgrade a park or amenity (i.e. playground, outdoor athletic field)	Fund horticultural plan for Clement Clark Moore Park.	Location Site Name: Clement Clark Moore Park	Council of Chelsea Block Associations		Department of Parks and Recreation	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	This request requires further study	
304201947C	CS	Provide more housing for medium income households	Initiate RFPs for the offsite affordable housing developments committed to the Western Rail Yards points of Agreements. DEP Site: 705 10th Avenue MTA Site: 806 9th Avenue		West Side Neighborhood Alliance	Housing Conservation Coordinators	Department of Housing Preservation & Development	The agency will try to accommodate this issue within existing resources.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	
304201948C	CS	Provide a new or expanded park or amenity (i.e. playground, outdoor athletic field)	Convert lots in West Chelsea on West 20th Street into interim or permanent parks as feasible.	Location Site Street: West 20th St Cross Street 1: 6th Ave Cross Street 2: 7th Ave	20th Street Park Coalition	Council Member Corey Johnson	Department of Parks and Recreation	This project was funded in a prior fiscal year and the project is currently in procurement.	This request has already been funded	Construction is anticipated to begin in Spring 2018.

304201949C	CS	Provide or enhance rental subsidies programs	Provide affordable housing subsidy for Slaughterhouse Site RFP located at 495 11th Ave. This 100% permanently affordable development will satisfy two commitments made by the City in the rezoning for affordable apartments to be built on Site M, and on the 20th Street sanitation parking space. It will be affordable at 80 to 165% of AMI. The project will have a height of 45 stories, will include an affordable supermarket and not include a hotel. <a href="http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb4/downloads/pdf/2015%20PDFs/july/37%20CHKL%20letter%20to%20EDC%20re%20Slaughterhouse%20and%20RFP">http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb4/downloads/pdf/2015%20PDFs/july/37%20CHKL%20letter%20to%20EDC%20re%20Slaughterhouse%20and%20RFP</a>	Location Address: 495 11th Avenue	Council Member Corey Johnson	Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer	Department of Housing Preservation & Development	This request is not recommended for funding.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201950C	CS	Reconstruct or upgrade a building in a park	Chelsea Recreation Center: The center continues to be the most utilized public recreation center in New York City. Given its high level of use, systematic maintenance of this center is a crucial issue in avoiding costly repairs and in keeping future costs low. In particular the exercise equipment is showing age and needs to be upgraded.	Location Site Name: Chelsea Recreation Center	Hudson Guild		Department of Parks and Recreation	Department of Parks and Recreation funds are insufficient for this project. We recommend this project be brought to the attention of your elected officials, i.e. Borough President and/or City Council member.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201951C	CS	Upgrade existing facilities for the homeless	Complete and green the BRC roof so residents can use that area for socialization rather than gathering on 25th street. Projected cost \$250,000.	Location Address: 131 West 25th Street	Council Member Corey Johnson	West 25 Street Project	Department of Homeless Services	DHS has restructured to better monitor the capital and maintenance related issues that may develop at shelters and SROs. If you have a particular site you think should be inspected, please bring it to our attention.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	

304201952C	CS	Rehabilitate or renovate existing fire houses or EMS stations	Accelerate the implementation of Shore power Alternative Energy Pilot Program at curbside locations. This program would eliminate the noxious diesel fumes emanating from the idling emergency vehicles at the the Temporary 23rd Street EMS station (FDNY). These fumes are a major health concern for the resident of adjacent units.		Council Member Corey Johnson	State Senator Brad Hoylman	Fire Department	This project was funded in a prior fiscal year and the scope is now underway.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	
------------	----	---------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--	------------------------------	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------	--

Tracking Code	Priority	Request	Reason	Location	Supported by 1	Supported by 2	Agency	Agy Response	Agy Category Description	Additional Comment
304201901E	01	Expand code enforcement	Update DOB website so applications for improper demolitions in special districts can be flagged earlier. In addition, update DOB website to flag when permits are approved without tenant safety plan and certificate of non-harassment. Coordinate enforcement of regulations between HPD and the Department of Buildings in the interests of efficiency.		West Side Neighborhood Alliance	Housing Conservation Coordinators	Department of Buildings	The agency will accommodate this issue within existing resources.	This request has already been funded	DOB has already implemented a daily reporting tool which alerts senior staff to any demo filed in the anti-demo districts. When a alert is received the BC's office places a hold on the filing until the applicant supplies evidence that the zoning restriction is addressed. The BIS does have a public facing flag or tag regarding the applicable zoning district and includes notation for preservation districts.  BIS has not been upgraded to include 'better' monitoring for DEMO/ALT projects in the anti-demo districts. The new DOB Now system does contain improved monitoring as that is being programmed into the computer as part of the application filing protocols.
304201902E	02	Other cleaning requests	Expand funding for DSNY staff for an additional 2-3 crews to bring residential and recycling pick-up service on Thursday and Saturday equivalent to the rest of the week.				Department of Sanitation	This is not a budget request. The matter in question is an issue of service delivery and/or agency policy. Contact the Department of Sanitation to determine how best to resolve this issue.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	
304201903E	03	Address traffic congestion	Convert 11th Avenue to one-way southbound from 57th Street to 42nd Street. Reduce congestion by re-balancing traffic between 9th and 11th Avenue as recommended in the Hells Kitchen study. Add pedestrian safety features and a protected bus lane. Make Eleventh Avenue one-way southbound from West 57th Street to West 44th Street to ensure the reliability of the new bus route.	Location Site Street: 11th Ave Cross Street 1: West 42 St Cross Street 2: West 57 St	CHEKPED S	Hell's Kitchen Neighborhood Association	Department of Transportation	Work on this project/program has either been completed or will be finished in FY 2018.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	In 2016 34th to 37th Streets on 11th Ave was restored to at two way operation. In spring 2018, we will convert 11th Ave from 57th to 44th Streets from a two-way operation to a one-way s/b with a proposal for a bike lane on the east side of 11th Ave from 57th to 43rd Streets.

304201904E	04	Provide, expand, or enhance anti-eviction legal services	Expand HRA Anti-Harassment Legal Services to Manhattan Community District 4. These important homeless prevention programs are only provided in East Harlem and Inwood neighborhoods in Manhattan. While the administration is committed to supporting legal services to prevent harassment in districts that are to be rezoned in the near future, community districts such as CD4 which was subject to three large rezonings in the past decade, need enhanced funding to mitigate the increasing amount of tenant harassment due to the increasing development pressures as a result of the rezoning. Enhanced legal services are needed to represent individual tenants and tenant associations in Manhattan CD4.		Housing Conservation Coordinators		Human Resources Administration	Mayor Bill de Blasio and City Council Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito earlier this year announced that, for the first time, the City will fund universal access to legal services for all tenants facing eviction in New York City Housing Court. The \$93 million allocation more than doubles the Administration's existing funding for tenant legal services. With this step, the City of New York became the first city in the United States to implement a universal access to counsel program for tenants in Housing Court, with the largest tenant legal services program anywhere in the country.	This request has already been funded	
304201905E	05	Other homelessness prevention program request	Include additional funding for after placement support for homeless families that are selected through the recently announced DHS family preference for buildings receiving 421a benefits. These buildings are typically luxury buildings with no supportive services. Both the families coming from the DHS shelter system and the building management will benefit and may require additional supportive services to assist the family to acclimate into their environment.				Human Resources Administration	In December 2016, the City awarded contracts to 11 organizations to provide 550 supportive housing units. The units are part of the Mayor's plan to create 15,000 units of supportive housing during the next 15 years	The agency agrees with this request, but the funding decision follows a different budget process (i.e. RFP, local level decision)	
304201906E	06	Expand code enforcement	Enhance funding for staffing to pursue with due diligence the collection of outstanding fines owed by repeat violators, and enforce unsafe and after hours construction compliance is essential. In particular, Increase the number of Inspectors, Community Coordinators, and Administrative Associates to CD4 Special Districts: HPD and DOB inspectors and those assigned to the Mayor's Office of Special Enforcement (OSE) do essential work in our area. Their work is particularly important within Community District 4s Special Districts, including the Special Clinton, West Chelsea and Hudson Yards Districts, where we depend on their skills to enforce arcane, but essential provisions preventing the demolition of sound residential housing and protecting tenants from harassment.		Save Chelsea	West Neighborhood Alliance	Department of Buildings	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	

304201907E	07	Improve traffic and pedestrian safety, including traffic calming	Install signal changes: Split phases and Barnes Dances for 4 priority intersection from the DOT Vision Zero pedestrian Action plan and already requested by Council member Johnson W 42 Street and 8 Avenue - 5 pedestrians Killed or Seriously Injured (KSI) , W 40 Street and 8 Avenue - 7 pedestrians KSI , W 57 Street and 10 Avenue - 6 pedestrian KSI , 7 Avenue and W 14 Street - 4 pedestrian KSI 11th Avenue and 42nd Street 6th Avenue and 14th Street 8th Avenue and 57th Street 8th Avenue and 24th Street 9th Avenue and 42nd street		Hell's Kitchen Neighborhood Association	CHEKPED S	Department of Transportation	This request is not recommended for funding.	This is not a budget request	Split LPI's were installed at the following locations in 2017: 38th/8th; 36/8th; 38/8th;50th/8th; 45th/9th; 47/9th; 49/9th and 53rd/9th Aves. Regular LPI's were installed at the following locations in 2017: 39th/9th; 23rd/11th; 37th/11th and 42nd/11th Aves.
304201908E	08	Conduct traffic or parking studies	Study the location and construction of a Tour and charter Bus Garage. In the Hudson Yards rezoning in 2005 the city identified the need of a garage to accommodate additional off-street parking sites for tourist and commuter buses and vans, services, and waiting "black cars". Currently these buses and cars layover on the street and idle. According to the New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, this community suffers the third highest levels of air pollution in the five boroughs.				Department of Transportation	Further study by the agency of this request is needed.	This request requires further study	
304201909E	09	Conduct traffic or parking studies	Study sidewalk capacity and pedestrian demand along 8th and 9th Avenue North of 34th Street. In particular, study space effectively allocated to pedestrians, sidewalk obstructions and pedestrian volumes resulting in a true pedestrian level of service. Make recommendation to address congestion and lack of pedestrian flow.	Location Site Street: 8th and 9th Ave Cross Street 1: West 34th St Cross Street 2: West 59th St			Department of Transportation	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	This request requires further study	
304201910E	10	Other park maintenance and safety requests	Increase funding for fixed post staff at Dewitt Clinton Park Mathew Palmer Park, and Chelsea Park. The parks in the CD4 district that have comfort stations should have fixed post staff to address constituents' concerns, provide security and perform routine maintenance of that park.				Department of Parks and Recreation	The agency recommends funding this expense budget request in FY 2019, but at this time the availability of funds is uncertain.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	We currently do not have fixed post staff at this site. The comfort stations at these sites need some funding to upgrade them and make them suitable locations for staff to report out of. New fixtures, doors and partitions are needed.

304201911E	11	Provide more HIV/AIDS information and services	As referenced in the 2015 NYC DOHMH Community Health Profile for Clinton and Chelsea neighborhoods, CD4 ranks highest in the rate of new HIV diagnoses, almost four times the citywide rate. Given the demographics of the resident population in Chelsea and Clinton, the district requires increased funding for education, prevention and treatment that is specific to our neighborhoods.		Actors Fund	GMHC	Department of Health and Mental Hygiene	DOHMH has a variety of HIV programs, with a special focus on men who have sex with men; transgender women who have sex with men; blacks; Latinos; and people struggling with substance abuse. We will review and assess the request for additional programming, which would be contingent upon availability of funds.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201912E	12	Increase home delivered meals capacity	Expand existing programs for Seniors (DFTA) Meal programs at the following locations: Penn South NORC - 290 9th Ave Encore Community Services - 239 West 49th Street The SAGE Center Midtown - 305 Seventh Avenue		Clinton Housing Development Corp.		Department for the Aging	As demand increased, additional funding for home delivered meals was provided by the current administration. The agency encourages the community board to make referrals to DFTA Home Delivered Meals program.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201913E	13	Support nonprofit cultural organizations	Fund the develop of study and database for accessibility of Theatre groups for accessible rehearsal space sharing for the purposes of preserving and creating affordable space for small to mid-sized art and theatrical groups, and other non-profit performance and visual art organizations. MCB4 has long advocated for the creation of a subsidy program, as part of the overall budget of the Department of Cultural Affairs as well as through the theater Sub-district. A database and the subsidy program would help ensure permanent locations for existing and displaced nonprofit arts entities.		League of Independent Theaters		Department of Cultural Affairs	The Department of Cultural Affairs recommends this project be brought to the attention of your local elected official, i.e. Borough President or City Council member.	The agency agrees with this request, but the funding decision follows a different budget process (i.e. RFP, local level decision)	
304201914E	14	Other zoning and land use requests	Fund study to review moving the heliport at West 36th Street and the tow pound on Pier 76 at West 34th Street. Study should explore how these sites will support the construction and maintenance of sections of Hudson River Park and bring some predictability to the development community for sites one block east of the Park.	Location Site Name: Hudson River Park			Department of City Planning	This request is not within DCP's purview. Please contact OMB's Community Board Unit.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	These sites are outside the jurisdiction of DCP. Please contact Office of Management and Budget (OMB) to determine the appropriate agencies to respond to this request.
304201915E	15	Increase case management capacity	As the SARA program expands affordable senior housing, an increase in funding for support services are needed to help seniors age-in-place. The number of people over age 65 began to increase substantially beginning in 2011 as the oldest members of the baby-boom generation reach the 65-year mark.				Department for the Aging	DFTA continues to advocate for increased funding to support aging services throughout the five boroughs. Presently, there is no additional funding available to increase program budgets or commence new initiatives.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	

304201916E	16	Funding for Supplies	Midtown Community Court located at 314 West 54th Street is partially funded through the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice. The MCC serves over 1000 homeless clients in a year and needs additional funding to assist them with basic needs. They are a critical resource for our community and CB4 requests a dedicated line of funding of an additional \$5,000 for supplies for their work with the homeless.	Location Site Name: Midtown Community Court Address: 314 West 54th Street			Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice	This request is outside of the scope of our existing contract.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201917E	17	Provide more frequent litter basket collection	Baseline DSNY staff overtime for additional basket pick up.		Council Member Corey Johnson	Council of Chelsea Block Associations	Department of Sanitation	Although the Department of Sanitation supports this program, due to fiscal constraints the availability of funds is uncertain.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201918E	18	Other services for homebound older adults programs	Expand existing programs for Seniors in the following areas: In-home supports supportive housing Preventive health and social services		Clinton Housing Development Corp.		Department for the Aging	DFTA continues to advocate for increased funding to support aging services throughout the five boroughs. Presently, there is no additional funding available to increase program budgets or commence new initiatives.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201919E	19	Other transit service requests	NYC DOT Para-Transit Service Access-A-Ride vehicles have GPS capabilities but do not use them. Training staff to utilize the GPS technology is needed as well as better customer service training is needed.		New York City Comptroller Scott Stringer		Transit Authority	For information regarding the status of this Request, contact the Transit Authority directly at telephone number 646-252-2660.		
304201920E	20	Other senior center program requests	Expand existing mental health services for low income seniors by partnering with service providers such as Service Program for Older People (SPOP). With the number of people age 65 and older doubling by 2030, more case management and mental health services are needed.		Actor's Fund	Clinton Cares	Department for the Aging	DFTA will continue to advocate for increased funding support for aging services.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	In FY18 DFTA will be launching a new program to provide mental health services to CMA clients.
304201921E	21	Other request for services for the homeless	Casework for families with a multitude of issues, including dealing with homeless and often poverty, can better be assessed by a licensed professional who may also provide mental health services within the shelter. Addressing this may also help in creating more successful exiting strategies.				Department of Homeless Services	As part of the First Lady's mental health initiative ThriveNYC, DHS is adding masters-level social workers, known as Client Care Coordinators, to all contracted shelters for families with children. Client Care Coordinators will work with each family to improve access to mental health treatment to help cope with the stress of living in shelter	This request has already been funded	



304201922E	22	Other educational programs requests	Provide full funding for after school programs:	Location Site Name: PS11,PS33,PS35,PS51,PS58,PS111			Department of Youth & Community Development	Presently, there are a variety of agency-funded programs in the district for this target population. Additional programs are contingent upon available funding and will be distributed through an RFP process. Organizations are encouraged to apply.	The agency agrees with this request, but the funding decision follows a different budget process (i.e. RFP, local level decision)	
304201923E	23	Assign additional uniformed officers	DEPLOY 10 traffic officers to increase enforcement of the following traffic violations: Vehicular spillback, Parking in no standing, Bus drivers using unauthorized routes, Vehicular idling, Bicycles riding on sidewalks, Wrong way on bike paths and streets, Running red lights, Illegal electric bikes, Vehicles blocking bike lanes, and Unnecessary honking.		CHEKPED S		Police Department	NYPD's total uniformed staffing levels depend on decisions made in the Preliminary and Executive Budget process. Allocation of uniformed personnel is scheduled by the agency only after graduation of police classes from the Academy.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201924E	24	Address air quality issues	Conduct air pollution studies: Provide Funding to conduct air pollution studies in the Lincoln Tunnel Corridor. According to the New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, this community suffers the third highest levels of air pollution in the five boroughs. Air pollution increases incidents of chronic lung disease. Given the proximity of the Chelsea and Clinton/Hells Kitchen neighborhoods to the Lincoln Tunnel and to the Port Authority Bus Terminal, MCD4 most likely is at particular risk from unhealthy air.				Department of Environmental Protection	DOHMH partners with Queens College to conduct the New York City Community Air Survey (NYCCAS), which measures air pollution at roughly 150 locations in New York City. This program studies how pollutants from traffic, buildings boilers and furnaces, and other sources impact air quality. NYCCAS monitors pollutants that cause health problems such as fine particles, nitrogen oxides, elemental carbon (a marker for diesel exhaust particles), sulfur dioxide, and ozone. This effort helps the City improve air quality policies and enforcement.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201925E	25	Assign additional staff to address specific crimes (e.g. drug, gang related, vice, etc.)	Increase enforcement staff for idling laws: work with DEP to conduct repeated and targeted operations in areas identified by our communities. The hundreds of buses idling in our community warrant a much level higher of enforcement.				Police Department	Additional NYPD resources for this project are unavailable at this time due to funding constraints. However, the program will continue to operate within current funding levels.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201926E	26	Address traffic congestion	Study the creation of bus lane on 9th Avenue from 44th street to 57th street to increase the M11 reliability and consistency of its service	Location Site Street: 9th Ave Cross Street 1: 44th St Cross Street 2: 57th St	CHEKPED S		Department of Transportation	Further study by the agency of this request is needed.	This request requires further study	
304201927E	27	Conduct traffic or parking studies	Study new protected crosstown bike lanes in midtown - between 36 and 33rd street should be moved to expenses				Department of Transportation	Bike path enhancement requests will be reviewed as part of the federally-funded Bicycle Network Development Program.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	The agency is working on bike lane proposals at several corridors in Midtown. Presentations will be made to CB's 4, 5 and 6 either in January or February 2018.

304201928E	28	Expand street outreach	Expand staffing and resources for Street Homeless Outreach Program		Council of Chelsea Block Associations	Hell's Kitchen Neighborhood Association	Department of Homeless Services	Since 2014, this Administration has more than doubled the City's investment in street homeless programs and more than doubled the number of outreach staff canvassing the streets engaging NYers 24/7/365. Through our HOME-STAT outreach effort, hundreds of highly-trained staff, including licensed social workers canvass the streets around the clock, working to gain the trust of homeless New Yorkers so that the underlying issues that may have caused or contributed to their street homelessness can be addressed.	This request has already been funded	
304201929E	29	Expand homelessness prevention programs	Support for families and adults exiting shelter to decrease homeless recidivism through GED completion and job training and continuity of social services, for at least 3 months after exiting shelter.				Department of Homeless Services	DHS provides aftercare services through the Homebase program to families newly relocating from the shelter system into NYCHA-assisted project-based Section 8, NYCHA public housing units, and LINC rental assistance programs. Homebase also serves as a safety net for all shelter exits, including LINC families.	This request requires further study	
304201930E	30	Assign additional crossing guards	Add additional crossing guards for Beacon High School and PS 51 at West 44th and West 43rd Street between 10th and 11th Avenues. Combined the Schools have over 2,000 students.	Location Site Name: Beacon School Address: 522 West 44 Street	Manhattan Borough President's Office		Police Department	NYPD funding is currently available to maintain the previously established School Crossing Guards and School Safety Agents headcounts. Any new post/staffing needs would need to go through internal and external vetting before being funded. The availability of future funding depends on decisions made in the Preliminary and Executive budget process. Last year, the School Crossing Guard headcount was increased by 200 to create a group of replacement guards, who are deployed to cover existing posts due to illness, vacation, or other absences.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	

304201931E	31	Streamline 311 update process	Increase funding to upgrade 311 Mobil application so it is equivalent to the regular web based program. In particular the ability to report illegal short term stay needs to be included in the 311 Mobil application. In addition, reprogram 311 to direct A frames complaints to Dept. of Sanitation. Currently they are erroneously directed to NYPD .				Dept of Information Technology & Telecommunication	The Community Board should work with OMB to obtain necessary funding for this request. DOITT will assist in implementing the project as necessary.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	
304201932E	32	Conduct Historic District Study	Expand funding and the mandate of LPC to recognize that the significant development at Hudson Yards and the West Chelsea area have begun threatening the surrounding existing built neighborhoods. LPC needs to be directed to work with Community Board 4 to identify, approve, and expand the historical districts in the neighborhood.		Save Chelsea	Hell's Kitchen Neighborhood Association	Landmarks Preservation Commission	The agency will accommodate this issue within existing resources.	This request has already been funded	LPC designates new individual landmarks and historic districts in the context of the agency's priorities and citywide equity agenda. LPC's Research Department has a detailed workplan to accomplish significant designation work within this Fiscal Year in accordance with the agency's priorities. The agency would be willing to meet with CB4 to understand the specific needs and concerns of the district.
304201933E	33	Study land use and zoning to better match current use or future neighborhood needs	Explore rezoning the northern part of Hudson Yards to complete the planned park and allow for additional residential units. A rezoning of Hudson Yards North is needed to provide a mechanism to fund the construction of the planned Hudson Yards Blvd. park, and to reflect the realities of the market which favors residential development over commercial development.	Location Site Name: Hudson Yards	Clinton Housing Development Corp	Council Member Corey Johnson	Department of City Planning	This request has already been accommodated. Please contact DCP's Borough Office to discuss.	This request has already been funded	
304201934E	34	Other zoning and land use requests	Modify the special permit process for off-street parking in new residential buildings. The current methodology for calculating parking for special permit findings does not reflect the realities of CD4, particularly in West Chelsea. The methodology encourages the building of unnecessary parking spaces which attract more cars in an area that is already overwhelmed by traffic and has excellent mass transit.		Manhattan Borough President	CHEKPED S	Department of City Planning	A feasibility study regarding this work is currently underway.	This request requires further study	The DCP Borough Office is currently evaluating the most recent data points related to off-street parking, and comparing to prior data and trends.

304201935E	35	Study land use and zoning to better match current use or future neighborhood needs	Implement the extension of the Special West Chelsea District (SWCD) to adjacent areas. It is now time, nine years after the creation of the SWCD, for the City to follow through with the promises it made including those listed then as Points of Agreement. Also it is important that the City examine the unforeseen problems, which have emerged as development rises in the SWCD creating pressures on adjacent areas like West 14th Street that might necessitate new zonings or the expansion of the SWCD itself.	Location Site Name: Special West Chelsea District	Save Chelsea	Council of Chelsea Block Associations	Department of City Planning	This request has already been accommodated. Please contact DCP's Borough Office to discuss.	This request has already been funded	The potential expansion of the SWChD has already been studied by DCP. The Board should contact the DCP Borough Office with any further concerns.
304201936E	36	Provide resources to train officers, e.g. in community policing	Provide additional resources to further train officers in the following: Traffic officers and agents: Pedestrian safety Bus/truck laws including idling Preventing gridlock Precinct Officers: Collision investigation (10-190). It is critical that all agents responding to crashes be educated in the 10-190 laws and be ready to report all crashes causes.				Police Department	This NYPD request is funded.	This request has already been funded	
304201937E	37	Address air quality issues	Increase incentives for building owners to Convert dirty boilers that burn heating oil #4 and #6. DEP needs to work with the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (NYSERDA) and the Energy Efficiency Corporation to develop specialized financing solutions to towards this effort.		Housing Conservation Coordinators		Department of Environmental Protection	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	
304201938E	38	Provide more programs in parks or recreational centers	Programming in needed for all age groups in our parks; more art in the parks in the form of exhibits, dance or musical performances would be a great way to engage the community.				Department of Parks and Recreation	The agency recommends funding this expense budget request in FY 2019, but at this time the availability of funds is uncertain.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	Most often dance or musical performances in our parks are sponsored by community groups that apply for Special Events permits. Our Recreation division would be happy to organize such events if funding is made available. Our Public Art coordinator will keep District 4 parks in mind for future exhibits.
304201939E	39	Other park maintenance and safety requests	Expand fund support Green Thumb Community Gardens				Department of Parks and Recreation	The agency recommends funding this expense budget request in FY 2019, but at this time the availability of funds is uncertain.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201940E	40	Provide or expand NYC organics collection	Expand NYC organics collection program				Department of Sanitation	This project is included in the ten-year plan.	The agency agrees with this request, will accommodate	

304201941E	41	Other community board facilities and staff requests	Reevaluate Community Board's OTPS budget for inflation.				Mayor's Office of Management and Budget	The community boards' budgets will be maintained in FY 2019.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	
304201942E	42	Other programs to address public health issues requests	Continued Support: Substance Abuse: The Board is concerned about reports that the use of crystal methamphetamine and K2 is gaining a foothold in our community. In addition to other health and mental health dangers, use of this drug has been associated with increased use of other illicit drugs, as well as sexual practices that enhance the chances of contracting HIV and other sexually transmitted diseases.	Location Site Name: Gay Men's Health Crises Address: 446 W 33rd St			Department of Health and Mental Hygiene	The agency will try to accommodate this issue within existing resources.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	DOHMH manages a variety of HIV programs that include education, testing, and counseling. We will review and assess the request for additional programming, which would be contingent upon available funds. Data suggests that crystal meth is not very prevalent in NYC; however, we are gathering information about current practices of use to ascertain whether use is rising again. There remain concerns about other emerging synthetic drugs, such as synthetic marijuana and bath salts, and we have been working on initiatives with our colleagues at the State level to reduce availability. Local laws have been passed barring the sales of K2 and bath salts and enforcement by several City agencies including NYPD, Sheriff, DOF, DCA and DOHMH have proven effective
304201943E	43	Forestry services, including street tree maintenance	Continued Support: Tree Pruning: Many of the trees within our district are in desperate need of pruning and may not survive until the next seven-year cycle for pruning comes up.	Council of Chelsea Block Association	CHEKPED S		Department of Parks and Recreation	The agency recommends funding this expense budget request in FY 2019, but at this time the availability of funds is uncertain.	The agency agrees with this request, but funding cannot be determined at this time	
304201944E	44	Other sewer maintenance requests	Continued Support: MCB4 lauds DEPs NYC Green Infrastructure Program we ask that DEP and agency partners, including the Federal government design, construct and maintain a variety of sustainable green infrastructure practices within MCD4. A portion of the FY 2016 budget should be earmarked to conduct a feasibility study of measures that can limit the damage of storm surges including flood gates. It has been estimated that the cost to design and construct flood gates at Verrazano Narrows, Arthur Kill and Throgs Neck is approximately \$10 billion.				Department of Environmental Protection	DEP is not responsible for building a storm surge barrier of this type. The scale and scope of such a request needs 100's of millions of dollars and requires Army Corp of Engineers approval.	The agency does not/cannot give priority to funding this request	

304201945E	45	Address illegal conversions and uses of buildings	Continued Support: Expand funding for the enforcement of the new regulations recently signed into law by Governor Cuomo. Illegal hotel use in our district continues to grow exponentially. The NYS Attorney General report Airbnb in the City, found that CB4 is one most trafficked neighborhoods for illegal hotel use, and of the three community districts that collectively account for 41% of Airbnbs revenue in NYC. Illegal hotel use depletes our affordable housing stock, incentives tenant harassment and creates quality of life issues for existing tenants. Increase OSE resources including lawyers, investigators and inspectors dedicated to bringing litigation against illegal hotel use, particularly in the most problematic districts.		Housing Conservation Coordinators	Westside Neighborhood Alliance	Department of Buildings	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	
304201946E	46	Other zoning and land use requests	Continued Support: Conduct a study of publicly accessible Community Facilities. Create a publically accessible Community Facilities database that would index information contained in the COO of every building located within MCD4.		MANHATTAN LEAGUE OF INDEPENDENT THEATERS		Department of City Planning	This request has been accommodated in a prior fiscal year.	This request has already been funded	City Planning Facilities Database, which includes community facilities, can be accessed through the Facilities Explorer ( <a href="https://capitalplanning.nyc.gov/facilities/">https://capitalplanning.nyc.gov/facilities/</a> )
304201947E	47	Other water supply system maintenance requests	Continued Support: MCB4 requests that NYC DEP finalize transfer mechanism of portion of DEP site at West 48th Street and 10th Avenue to the City's Parks Department. This transfer has been committed as part of the Western Rail Yards re zoning and the water maintenance tunnel construction is completed at this location.	Location Site Street: 10th Ave Cross Street 1: West 48th St Cross Street 2: West 49th St	47/48 Block Association	Council Member Corey Johnson	Department of Environmental Protection	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	Transfer of agency property is directed by DCAS and DEP follows that agency's lead in these matters.
304201948E	48	Enhance or expand noise pollution abatement and enforcement programs	Continued Support: Enhance or expand noise pollution abatement and enforcement programs: Additional resources are needed for night inspections when the noise pollution is most acute and invasive.		Council of Chelsea Block Associations	HK50/51 Block Association	Department of Environmental Protection	More information is needed from the community board before making a funding decision. The community board should contact the agency.	The agency requires additional information from the community board regarding this request	
304201949E	49	Other facilities for the homeless requests	Continued Support to provide funding for DHS Peace officers to address Bowery Residents Committee (BRC) 127 West 25th Street (BRC) Community Advisory Committee issues.	Location Site Name: Bowery Residents Committee Address: 127 West 25 Street	Council Member Corey Johnson	West 25 Street Project	Department of Homeless Services	Based on an evaluation conducted by NYPD, the Agency has increased the number of Security Guards and Peace Officers in the DHS shelters throughout NYC.	This request requires further study	



## THE ROLE OF THE COMMUNITY BOARDS THE BUDGET PROCESS

---

### INTRODUCTION

Under the City Charter, Community Boards are given a broad range of responsibilities for advising the City about local budget needs and priorities. The Charter mandates that the Community Boards consult with agencies on the capital and expense budget needs of the district, hold public hearings, prepare capital and expense budget priorities for the next fiscal year and comment on the funding choices presented in the preliminary budget. To meet these mandates, a dynamic formal structure was created which allows the City's communities to make their needs known to agency decision makers and the Mayor. This ensures that local neighborhood opinion is considered when the City allocates its resources and services.

The Office of Community Board Relations within the Office of Management and Budget (OMB), oversees procedures that assure the Community Boards' active and effective participation in forming the City's budgets. The following outlines the essential features of this process. For more information, consult the Manual for Public Participation in the Budget Process available from the Office of Community Board Relations, (212) 788-5930.

### THE CITY'S BUDGETS

New York City's budget year begins on July 1<sup>st</sup> and ends on June 30<sup>th</sup>. The total budget consists of three components. First comes the Revenue Budget, which is the City's best estimate of how much money will be available during the fiscal year to support operating expenditures and capital improvement projects. These include all tax and non-tax funds expected to be received during the fiscal year.

- ◆ **The Expense Budget** covers all the City's day-to-day operations such as salaries and supplies as well as debt service. It is supported by City taxes, fees and other local revenue as well as state and federal aid.
- ◆ **The Capital Budget** covers the cost of the City's long-term construction program, purchases of land and large equipment. Reconstruction of streets, sewers, parks and buildings are examples of capital projects. Capital budget items are financed by the sale of municipal bonds as well as by state and federal grants.

In addition, the **Community Development Program** allocates federal money for long-term physical improvements and related activities that chiefly benefit low and moderate income persons.

# AN OVERVIEW OF THE COMMUNITY BOARD BUDGET PROCESS

As representatives of local communities, Boards are naturally concerned with City spending that affects the quality of life for residents and workers in their districts. The process by which the Community Boards participate in formulating the City's budgets has six major elements.

## **1. Consultations between Community Boards and City agencies that deliver local services.**

From May through September, Community Boards have two formal opportunities to consult with agency officials about budget needs and the funding of programs and projects. The agencies that formally consult with the Boards are the Departments for the Aging; Buildings, Children's Services, Small Business Services, Economic Development, Environmental Protection, Fire, Homeless Services, Housing Preservation and Development, Parks and Recreation, Police, Sanitation, Transportation, and the Human Resources Administration. Consultations take place at two levels:

- ◆ District level - In late spring, District Managers and Community Board committee members meet with the agencies' local representatives to discuss the needs of the district, the current level of service delivery and the resources needed to meet those needs.
- ◆ Borough level - During the month of September and October, Boards in each borough meet with agency commissioners to discuss long range needs, important budget requests, operational issues, agency policy choices and fiscal constraints. Borough Consultations let Community Boards present their needs and budget suggestions while at the same time letting top agency decision makers explain the difficult spending choices they must make in times of fiscal constraints.

These formal meetings give both the agencies and the Boards an opportunity to openly discuss the criteria used in making difficult spending choices.

## **2. Public hearings held by the Community Board.** Community Boards hold at least two public budget hearings each year.

- ◆ September/October - At the time the Board is developing specific budget priorities to submit to City agencies, the public has the chance to identify community district needs and the Board gets community input.
- ◆ January/February - An opportunity for the public to react to the policies in the just released Preliminary Budget. This hearing forms the basis for the Community Board's Statement on the Preliminary Budget, which tells City officials how the community feels about the City's budget choices.

## **3. Formal budget submissions.** By the date announced by OMB, usually late October, Boards formally submit their budget requests to City agencies and the Office of Management and Budget as the agencies begin to prepare their next year's budget. Budget submissions consist of three components:

- ◆ Requests for funding in the Capital Budget for physical improvements to the City's infrastructure and public facilities, for land acquisition and major equipment.



- ◆ Requests for funding in the Expense Budget for programs and personnel.
- ◆ Community Board Service Program Rankings where Boards indicate the importance of services to their community by ranking 85 programs provided by 24 agencies.

Both the capital and expense budgets impact on community districts, so Community Boards develop and vote separate priorities for up to 40 capital requests and up to 25 expense budget requests.

4. **Agency review of Board budget requests.** After Community Boards submit their requests, City agencies review them thoroughly. Agency funding recommendations are reflected in the City's Preliminary Budget and Departmental Estimates which are published by January 16<sup>th</sup>. Agency responses to each Community Board budget request are published by OMB in the Register of Community Board Budget Requests for the Preliminary Budget. Boards then have the opportunity to respond to agency decisions in their Statement on the Preliminary Budget, which is due one month later.
5. **OMB review of Board budget requests.** For the Mayor's Executive Budget published on April 26<sup>th</sup>, these same budget requests are evaluated by the Office of Management and Budget. OMB funding recommendations are published in the Register of Community Board Budget Requests for the Executive Budget.

#### 6. **Public hearings at which the Boards testify.**

- ◆ February - Hearings held by Borough Boards prior to submitting Borough Board Budget Priorities and Borough President submissions to the Executive Budget.
- ◆ OMB hearings on the City's Community Development Program Application.
- ◆ March and May - City Council hearings on the Preliminary and Executive Budgets.

Testifying lets the Boards try to advance projects which have not been recommended by the agencies or the Mayor's Office of Management and Budget.

The budget process described above represents a real opportunity for Boards to affect the decisions that are made about projects and programs for their community.

The Community Boards find out the final disposition of the budget requests they submitted in October in the Register of Community Board Budget Requests for the Adopted Budget, which is published after the City Council finalizes the budget.

## **ASSESSING COMMUNITY DISTRICT NEEDS**

As you see, the Community Boards' participation in the budget process is a year-round activity. Even before the budget is adopted, the simultaneous process of considering budget requests for the next cycle begins.

Assessing community needs is one of the most important and useful activities performed by Community Boards in determining the district's service and budget requests. This should be an on-going activity which requires the involvement of each Board member and committee. Personal observations, published surveys, public hearings, discussions with local service chiefs and the use of

such community records as minutes from the District Service Cabinet and the district office complaint log can all help in identifying patterns or areas of problems within the community.

The Board can then determine whether the identified problem can be addressed by reallocating existing resources or through a request for capital or expense budget funds. Throughout this process, an understanding of overall City and agency funding priorities and constraints will help your Board as you match Board budget proposals to available funds. The Board's long range needs are presented to City decision makers in the Statement of Community District Needs which is published by the Department of City Planning within a framework of information detailing demographics and community facilities.

## **GEOGRAPHIC INFORMATION FOR COMMUNITY BOARDS**

The more the Boards know, the more effectively they can participate in developing the City's budgets. To this end, OMB publishes expense budget and service information sorted two ways - by agency and by local service district. The first gives the Citywide picture for the agency and the second shows community and borough allocations of money, personnel and equipment. Boards can find out how many people are assigned to their district, what they do, how much they are paid, the equipment assigned to the district and contract services for agencies which provide local level services. Indicators of agency performance are also included. This information is found in the District Resource Statement and the Geographic Reports for the Expense Budget.

OMB also publishes several forms of geographic capital information so that Community Boards know which projects are being funded in their districts, how much they will cost and when implementation is planned for each phase of a project. The Geographic Reports for the Capital Budget are published with the release of each budget phase. The Capital Commitment Plan and the Capital Budget Detail Data Report delineates the projects planned for the next four years. The planned timing and the cost of each phase of a project is available to the Community Boards. Combining formal budget participation mechanisms with increased availability of geographic information gives the Community Boards the opportunity to influence agency and OMB budget decisions about the allocation of scarce resources.

## BUDGET PROCESS TIMETABLE FOR COMMUNITY BOARDS

*New York City's fiscal year (FY) - i.e., budget year - runs from July 1 of one calendar year through June 30 of the next. These two pages describe all the steps in the budget adoption process.*

- **June/July** - The budget process begins with district consultations between agency local service chiefs (Police Precinct Commanders, Sanitation Superintendents, etc.) and Community Boards (CBs) to discuss local service needs.
- **August** - CBs assess district needs and prepare District Needs Statements (a narrative description of their communities and their needs). CBs' District Needs Statements are submitted to the Department of City Planning.
- **By Aug. 15** - Fourteen major agencies submit a policy statement describing major goals and priority programs for the coming year to the Community Board Unit.
- **September/October** - CBs hold public hearings on budget priorities and district needs. In each borough, consultations are held between CBs and top managers of fourteen agencies that deliver local services.
- **By late October** - CBs submit their budget requests to OMB.
- **By early November** - OMB sends CBs' budget requests to agencies for evaluation while they prepare their departmental estimates (the agencies' budget requests for the coming year).
- **By Jan. 16** - In odd-numbered years, the City Planning Commission holds a public hearing on a draft of the Ten-Year Capital Strategy (a plan for how the capital budget should be used), to be submitted by the Mayor every two years.
- **By Jan. 16** - Release of the Mayor's Financial Plan and Preliminary Budget, which includes the departmental estimates. OMB sends the CBs the Register of Community Board Budget Requests (the submitted Board requests accompanied by agency funding recommendations). They are also available at <http://www.nyc.gov/omb>.
- **By Feb. 15** - CBs hold public hearings on the Preliminary Budget and send a Statement on the Preliminary Budget reflecting CB reaction and public testimony to the Mayor, City Council, Borough President and Borough Board.
- **By Feb. 25** - Borough Boards hold public hearings as a basis for their comments on the Preliminary Budget and for the Borough Presidents' recommended modifications to the Preliminary Budget.
- **By March 10** - Borough Presidents submit capital and expense budget allocations and modifications to Mayor for inclusion in Executive Budget.
- **By March 25** - City Council holds public hearings on Preliminary Budget.

- **By April 26** - Release of the Mayor's Executive Budget. OMB sends the CBs the Register of Community Board Budget Requests with OMB funding recommendations, and the proposed Community Development Statements of Objectives and Budget. They are also available at <http://www.nyc.gov/omb>.
- **By May 6** - Borough Presidents modify Executive Budget submissions when necessary.
- **By May 25** - City Council holds public hearings on Executive Budget.
- **By May 30** - OMB holds public hearing on the Community Development Grantee Performance Report (federal funds that are given to the City).
- **By June 5** - City Council adopts budget.
- **By June 21** - Mayor, Comptroller and City Clerk certify budget.
- **JULY 1 - FISCAL YEAR BEGINS.**
- **After July 1** - OMB sends the CBs the **Register of CB Budget Requests** with the final disposition of requests. They are also available at <http://www.nyc.gov/omb>.
- **By one month after budget adoption** - Agency heads for six programs submit plans for allocation of personnel and resources to Borough Presidents. Within 30 days of receiving such plans, Borough Presidents may propose a reallocation of staff and resources, providing the modification does not increase or decrease personnel or resources for any Community District by more than 5 percent.

## APPENDIX B – 2ND PRESENTATION TO THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON GOVERNANCE – NOV 1, 2019

---

### EXAMPLE - MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD #5 - MEETING OCT 10, 2019

If you are curious as to how New York City conducts their public consultations, public consultation is carried out by the residents through Community Boards, which act as Advisory Boards to NY City Council.

New York City Councillors are not afraid of democracy, or respectfully entrusting their residents to carry out public consultation with legislated protocols in place to protect the legitimacy and integrity of the process.

Manhattan Community Board #5 ( <https://www.cb5.org/cb5m/about/our-role/> ) meeting of Oct 10, 2019, has been chosen AT RANDOM to provide some insight into how "democratically advanced" (inclusive, transparent, participatory, working towards consensus, etc., complying with good governance) public consultation is in New York City. The Community Board meetings are videotaped, while most of the work is done prior to the meeting in Committees comprised of board members and members of the public. If a resident does not have time to participate as a full Board member, he/she can work in a Committee on a topic of interest as a member of the public.

Here is a video of the meeting: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DI-hclEdAMo&t=1264s> **If you are impressed, remember, NYC Resident Community Boards have been operating for more than 50 years. It's time for Toronto to get started!**

Here is a video of the meeting: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DI-hclEdAMo&t=1264s> **If you are impressed, remember, NYC Resident Community Boards have been operating for more than 50 years. It's time for Toronto to get started!**

Live-streaming funded by NYC Council and DYCD.

Public Session [28:10](#)

Adoption of the September 2019 Minutes [48:20](#)

District Manager's Report - Wally Rubin - NA

Vote for Assistant Secretary and Treasurer [49:40](#)

Chair's Report - Vikki Barbero [51:38](#)

Committee Reports [52:31](#)

Old Business/New Business - NA

NYCManhattanCB5\_10\_10\_2019

Here is the Agenda for the meeting

## Resolutions: October 2019

### Transportation & Environment

[Application by the Moxy Hotel \(the "Applicant"\) for revocable consent from DOT to construct and maintain four planters on the 36th Street sidewalk at the northeast corner of 7th Avenue.](#)

[Request by Dough Doughnuts \(14 West 19th Street\) to remove "No Standing 11pm to 6am" signs from the south side of West 19th Street between 5th and 6th Avenues](#)

## **Budget, Education & City Services**

[Community Board Five support for Phone Booth Removal and BID Efforts to Improve Street Congestion & Cleanliness](#)

## **Land Use, Housing & Zoning**

[Application by 515 Seventh Avenue Realty LP and SP Plus requesting a ten-year extension and modification of a variance granting the right to operate a commercial parking garage at 515 7th Avenue in an M1-6 district](#)

[Application by the Fashion Institute of Technology \(FIT\) to redesign their proposed new academic building on 28th Street between Seventh and Eighth Avenues.](#)

[Review of Intro 1701 introduced by Council Member Kallos to amend the administrative code of the City of New York, in relation to community notification requirements for transfers of development rights.](#)

## **Landmarks**

[75 Rockefeller Plaza – Application for a new entrance with sliding doors at the West 52nd Street side of the building with infill to match the existing finishes at the base of the building, including a new marquee and signage for tenant](#)

[Central Park Conservancy Harlem Meer redevelopment](#)

## **Joint Landmarks and Parks & Public Spaces**

[Proposed Monumental Women statue in Central Park featuring New Yorker's Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony and Sojourner Truth](#)

## **Landmarks**

[Recommendation by Community Board Five for landmark designation of the Demarest Building at 339 Fifth Avenue, located on the NE corner of 33rd Street](#)

## **Parks & Public Spaces**

[Application from Trattoria Dell'Arte at 900 7th Avenue for an unenclosed sidewalk café at 900 7th Avenue consisting of 6 tables and 28 chairs](#)

[Request from Central Park Conservancy for a project to redevelop the Lasker Pool and Rink site at the Harlem Meer in Central Park](#)