



REPORT FOR ACTION

Amendments to Toronto Parking Authority Policy Resolution 2-9: Enforcement Practices at Unattended/Uncontrolled Car Parks

Date: March 8, 2019
To: Board of Directors, Toronto Parking Authority
From: Acting President, Toronto Parking Authority
Wards: All

SUMMARY

Under Toronto Parking Authority (TPA) Policy Resolution 2-9: Enforcement Practices at Unattended and Uncontrolled Car Parks, the TPA enforces the car parks through a two-tiered enforcement approach:

1. For a first offence, a voluntary payment notice (Courtesy Envelope) is issued;
2. If the voluntary payment notice is not paid, a Parking Violation Notice (PVN) is issued for subsequent offences. Unpaid PVNs are subject to plate denial.

TPA staff recommend that Policy Resolution 2-9 be amended to eliminate the voluntary payment notice and issue only PVNs. Voluntary payment notices were introduced when parking equipment only accepted coins and was highly unreliable. The voluntary payment notice was a customer service approach to allow customers who had not paid for parking to pay. With the implementation of Pay and Display machines that accept credit cards, together with the introduction of the Green P Mobile App that allows customers to pay and extend their parking using their smartphone, the ability for customers to pay for parking and, in turn, compliance levels have increased significantly and there is no longer a need to offer a courtesy payment option.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Acting President, Toronto Parking Authority recommends that:

1. The Board of Directors of the Toronto Parking Authority approve amendments to Toronto Parking Authority Policy Resolution 2-9: Enforcement Practices at Unattended and Uncontrolled Car Parks, shown in Appendix 1 to this report (March 8, 2019) from the Acting President, Toronto Parking Authority, and direct staff to enact this Policy Resolution, as amended.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Funds collected through the existing Courtesy Envelopes program are retained by TPA. Funds generated by PVNs are collected by Revenue Services and retained directly by the City of Toronto (City) as general revenue. Due to the uncertainty of the impact on customer's compliance and the PVN issuance rate, it is difficult to estimate the impact on overall City revenues from this change but they are likely to increase substantially as the PVN fee and payment rate is higher than the Courtesy Envelope fees. TPA estimates incremental revenue for the City to be approximately \$250,000 per year.

There were approximately 56,000 Courtesy Envelopes and 32,000 PVNs issued in 2018.

DECISION HISTORY

TPA Policy Resolution 2-9 has been in effect since 1967. It was substantially amended to define the current issuance rules in 2002. The Policy Resolution has subsequently been amended from time to time to adjust the Courtesy Envelope fee amount.

More recently at its meeting of October 22, 2014 (Minute No.14-142), the Toronto Parking Authority Board of Directors approved amendments to TPA Policy Resolution 2-9: Enforcement Practices at Unattended and Uncontrolled Car Parks.

COMMENTS

The purpose of TPA Policy Resolution 2-9 is to define the objectives underlying the enforcement practices at unattended and uncontrolled car parks and to define the rules to be followed by enforcement personnel to achieve the objectives. This Policy Resolution currently requires that where a vehicle has failed to comply with the posted parking rates on site, it is subject to a two-tiered enforcement approach. The vehicle will be issued either a Courtesy Envelope for a first offense or a PVN for subsequent offenses. The Courtesy Envelope is a voluntary payment device and has a relatively low collection rate, averaging 41 percent. As the PVN, if unpaid, results in plate denial it is paid at a much higher rate.

The Courtesy Envelope program was first introduced in the 1960s when the parking equipment was very different. Specifically, more spaces were governed by mechanical single space meters. These devices were frequently broken or jammed and many customers were unable to pay. In addition, the machines only accepted coins which limited customers' ability to pay. The Courtesy Envelope allowed the TPA to collect revenues through another channel. All TPA locations are now equipped with both highly reliable pay and display machines which accept coins and credit cards as well as allowing payment through the TPA Mobile Payment for Parking App.

There is approximately one Courtesy Envelope issued for every 100 paid transactions so they impact a small number of customers. This is due to the high compliance rate that has been achieved due to the reasonable parking prices and ease of payment. Given this, the TPA is of the opinion that where customers don't pay it is not due to the lack of a payment options and they should be subject to PVN to encourage the relatively few non-paying customers to pay for parking.

As can be seen in the tables below, the number of Courtesy Envelopes being issued is in decline due to the increasing ease of payment.

Table 1: Number of Courtesy Envelopes Issued

Year	No. Courtesy Envelopes Issued
2016	64,342
2017	58,073
2018	55,766

CONTACT

Ian Maher, Vice President, Planning Strategy, Policy, Planning and Technology,
Toronto Parking Authority, Telephone: 416-393-7291, Email: ian.Maher@toronto.ca

Patricia Pearsall-Mills, Senior Planning and Policy Analyst, Parking Strategy, Policy,
Planning and Technology, Toronto Parking Authority, Telephone: 416-393-7259,
Email: patricia.pearsall-mills@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Robin Oliphant
Acting President, Toronto Parking Authority

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix 1: Proposed Toronto Parking Authority Policy Resolution 2-9: Enforcement Practices at Unattended and Uncontrolled Car Parks

APPENDIX 1

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TORONTO PARKING AUTHORITY POLICY RESOLUTION 2-9 "ENFORCEMENT PRACTICES AT UNATTENDED AND UNCONTROLLED CAR PARKS"

TORONTO PARKING AUTHORITY

POLICY RESOLUTION

2-9

ITEM: **Enforcement Practices at Unattended/Uncontrolled Car Parks**

PAGE 1 OF 3

PURPOSE: To define the corporate objectives underlying the enforcement practices at unattended/uncontrolled car_parks and to define the rules to be followed by enforcement personnel to achieve the objectives.

SCOPE: The policies apply to all unattended/uncontrolled car_parks except as specially noted below or in the accompanying standard procedure.

POLICY: The Parking Authority posts rates at all of its car_parks. It is the Policy of the Authority that vehicles utilizing lots which are uncontrolled/~~and~~ unattended should only park in defined spaces in accordance with posted rates. Where a vehicle is parked in an otherwise legal manner, but has failed to comply with the posted rates, it will be subject to ~~a two-tiered enforcement approach.~~ receive a Parking Violation Notice (PVN). ~~The vehicle will be issued either a Courtesy Envelope or a Parking Infraction Notice depending on the specific rules outlined herein. Generally, where no previous unpaid Courtesy Envelopes are registered against the plate a Courtesy Envelope will be issued. Where previous Courtesy Envelopes have been issued, the vehicle may be issued a P.I.N. depending on the severity of the infraction. Where vehicles are not properly parked (eg. in an aisle) a P.I.N. will be issued.~~

The enforcement rules are intended to achieve the following objectives:

1. Encourage initial compliance;
2. Discourage underpayment of parking time;
- ~~3. Achieve enforcement revenues at least equivalent to the amount of unpaid parking being consumed.~~
- ~~4. Provide a customer-oriented approach to enforcement to encourage high usage levels.~~
5. Deliver enforcement in a cost effective ive manner.
- ~~6. Ensure that the required Courtesy Envelope payment for any infraction exceeds the value of the unpaid parking operation except in extreme circumstances.~~

FIRST ADOPTED: 02-117 (TPA)
LAST AMENDED: October 22, 2014 MINUTE NUMBER: 14-142
LAST REVIEWED: April 24, 2017 MINUTE NUMBER: 17-055

TORONTO PARKING AUTHORITY

POLICY RESOLUTION

2-9

ITEM: Enforcement Practices at Unattended/Uncontrolled Car Parks

PAGE 2 OF 3

RULES: ~~The PVN charge is set as defined in Chapter 610 – Administration of Penalties in the Toronto Municipal Code.~~

~~A P.I.N. PVN~~ will be issued under the following circumstances:

1. Where a vehicle is parked without ~~displaying a pay and display ticket or where no time is showing on a meter and; being registered in a Parking Authority payment system;~~
 - ~~the vehicle plate has at least one unpaid Courtesy Envelopes registered against it.~~
2. Where a vehicle is parked and a ~~pay and display ticket Parking Authority payment system~~ indicates that the vehicle has stayed beyond the length of the time purchased, or where the time purchased is not visible;
 - ~~if the vehicle plate has at least two unpaid Courtesy Envelopes registered against it.~~
3. ~~Where a vehicle plate has received 6 Courtesy Envelopes in the previous 6 month period;~~
4. Where a vehicle is parked in a stall with an invalid monthly permit;
5. Where a vehicle is not properly parked in a space;
6. Where a vehicle is parked in a reserved space without authorization;

AMOUNTS: ~~The Courtesy Envelopes will be issued in three denominations.~~

~~The denomination utilized for a "no ticket" event on a carpark will be based on the underlying half hour rate in effect on that carpark. The rates will be as set out below:~~

FIRST ADOPTED:	02-117 (TPA)	
LAST AMENDED:	October 22, 2014	MINUTE NUMBER: 14-142
LAST REVIEWED:	April 24, 2017	MINUTE NUMBER: 17-055

TORONTO PARKING AUTHORITY

POLICY RESOLUTION

2-9

ITEM: **Enforcement Practices at Unattended/Uncontrolled Car Parks**

PAGE 3 OF 3

<u>Half Hour Rate – In lot</u>	<u>Courtesy Charge</u>
\$0.75 or less	\$ 8.00
\$1.00	\$10.00
greater than \$1.00	\$15.00

~~The denomination utilized for an overtime event will be set at the same rate for all lots. This rate will be set at \$8.00.~~

GRACE PERIODS: A Grace Period of 10 minutes is granted from the time of expiry of a valid pay and display receipt, during which a ~~Courtesy Charge or PIN_PVN~~ is not to be issued. If a pay and display receipt indicates payment has been made for an entire day or night maximum amount, a grace period of 30 minutes is granted from the time of expiry shown on the receipt before commencing enforcement.

FIRST ADOPTED:	02-117 (TPA)	
LAST AMENDED:	October 22, 2014	MINUTE NUMBER: 14-142
LAST REVIEWED:	April 24, 2017	MINUTE NUMBER: 17-055