



REPORT FOR ACTION CONTRACT AWARD

Contract Award - Request for Proposal Number 9101 17 7040 for Security Guard Services at Toronto Parking Authority Off-Street Parking Facilities

Date: November 28, 2019
To: Board of Directors, Toronto Parking Authority
From: Acting President, Toronto Parking Authority
Wards: All

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Acting President, Toronto Parking Authority recommends that:

1. The Board of Directors of Toronto Parking Authority grant authority to award the contract for the provision of security guard services (responding to complaints and staff safety concerns, providing routine and as-required patrols, making arrests when required, etc.) for Toronto Parking Authority off-street parking facilities to Garda Canada Security Corporation, providing the highest ranking proponent score, for a term of two years, plus three optional one-year extensions, at the sole option of the President, Toronto Parking Authority, in the estimated amount (two years) of \$3,790,008.98 (based on hours invoiced in 2018) plus \$284,250.67 (approximately 7.5 percent of the contract value over the two-year period) as a contingency allowance, being the sum total amount of \$4,074,259.65, subject to annual inflation adjustments as applicable based on the Consumer Price Index in accordance with the contract provisions and net of all taxes and charges.
2. The Board of Directors of Toronto Parking Authority authorize the President, Toronto Parking Authority, to recover from the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) the estimated total amount of \$423,485.53 over the term of the contract (2019-2021) referenced in Recommendation 1 or such other actual costs incurred which may include contingency and repair allowances (approximately 7.5 percent of the contract value over the two-year period), subject to annual inflation adjustments as applicable based on the Consumer Price Index in accordance with the contract provisions and net of all taxes and charges, for security guard services carried out under the contract on the TTC's commuter parking lots.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

The estimated potential total amount to award the contract for security guard services over the two (2) year term from 2019 to 2021 is \$3,790,008.98, plus \$284,250.67 for contingency, being the sum total amount of \$4,074,259.65, subject to annual inflation adjustments as applicable based on the CPI in accordance with the contract provisions and net of taxes and charges.

Table 1: Financial Impact Summary of Recommended Two-Year Contract Plus Three Optional One-Year Contracts

Company	Year 1 Price (2020)	Year 2 Price (2021)	Extended 1 Year Price (2022)	Extended 1 Year Price (2023)	Extended 1 Year Price (2024)
Garda Canada Security Corporation	\$1,866,999.50	\$1,923,009.48	\$1,980,699.76	\$2,040,127.75	\$2,101,324.58

Table 1 shows the annual contract value for the two-year contract with three optional one-year extensions.

TPA currently retains these services through a third-party provider, G4S. In 2017, TPA spent \$1.658 million and, in 2018, TPA spent \$1.611 million for security services. In 2019 YTD October, TPA has spent \$1.138 million on security services. TPA's 2020 security budget is \$1.273 million for this contract, resulting in an estimated 2020 budget shortfall of \$0.507 million, as the previous contracted rates were significantly lower. Garda's base Security Guard and Supervisor hourly rates, on average, are 36 percent and 12 percent higher, respectively, over current contracted rates.

CALL SUMMARY

Call Number: Request for Proposal Number 9101 17 7040 - Security Guard Services at Toronto Parking Authority

Call Issued: October 15, 2019

Call Closed: November 15, 2019, Noon, Toronto time

Number of Addenda Issued: One (1)

Number of Bids: Seven (7)

Description:

The non-exclusive provision of security guard services for TPA off-street parking facilities from the date of award for a term of two (2) years, plus three (3) optional one (1) year extensions at the sole option of TPA. Should the option(s) be exercised, the Director of Parking Services will request the Vice President of Operations to process the renewals under the same terms and conditions.

Corporate Security and TPA developed the business requirements and prepared the procurement documents. This RFP was then publicly posted on MERX on October 15, 2019 and the process was open to all interested proponents. One subsequent Addendum was issued and the call closed on November 15, 2019. In total, seven (7) proposal submissions were received from the following firms:

Active Security Enterprises
Paladin Security Group Ltd.
Cannon Security and Patrol Services Ltd.
ValGuard Security Inc.
Garda Canada Security Corporation
A.S.P. Incorporated
Cancom Security Inc.

The evaluation of submissions followed a 3-stage process (see attached evaluation guidelines):

Stage 1 - The Evaluation Committee assessed if the submission met all the mandatory requirements. If the submission failed any of the mandatory requirements, the submission did not proceed to Stage 2.

Stage 2 - The Evaluation Committee assessed the submissions for the technical eligibility requirements and rated each submission. Each criteria was rated on a scale of 0 to 5, with 0 being the lowest and 5 being the highest. Each criteria carried different weights.

Stage 3 - The Evaluation Committee assessed the submissions for the cost of services. The Proponents carried a maximum of 35 points. Each Proponent's price was evaluated based on the following formula:

$$\frac{\text{Lowest Price}}{\text{Proponent's Price}} \times 20 = \text{Proponent's score for price}$$

Total points from Stage 2 and Stage 3 were added to determine the final ranking. The highest scoring proposal was then selected for award as was outlined in the tender document.

Upon detailed evaluation, only 4 were deemed to be compliant with all parameters of the call. The 4 compliant firms were Garda Canada Security Corporation, Paladin Security Group Ltd., Cancom Security Inc., and A.S.P. Incorporated. The other 3 firms failed to provide all of the mandatory requirements and therefore full scoring was not completed.

Some key items to note from the scoring process:

- 1) The winning vendor scored 2.5 points higher on the Stage 2 technical score than the next closest vendor. This shows the winning vendor had provided a better response on how they will manage the contract. They specifically showed that they have experience in providing similar services in the GTA in large public facilities in the past 12 months, experience providing highly trained and qualified Security Guards in large public facilities and knowledge and experience in establishing a protective and authoritative Security Guard presence in large facilities. They also demonstrated they had a clear understanding of TPA's goals and objectives and therefore proposed a relevant and appropriate solution that met our timelines for implementation.
- 2) The next closest scoring vendor closed the gap in the score only by providing better yearly pricing. From past experience, best or lowest pricing does not always equal quality service.
- 3) Reference checks were completed for Garda Canada Security Corporation and they were favourable. An internal reference check was completed for the company with the second highest score, as they are a vendor of the City of Toronto, and it was unfavourable.

Table 2: Summary of Bids Received for RFP Number 9101 17 7040 including bid price and score.

Bidder Name	Year 1 Price (2020)	Year 2 Price (2021)	Total for Year 1 and 2 (2020 and 2021)	Proponent Points
Garda Canada Security Corporation	\$1,866,999.50	\$1,923,009.48	\$3,790,008.98	84.64
Paladin	\$1,884,958.98	\$1,941,507.74	\$3,826,466.72	81.49
A.S.P.	\$1,737,821.85	\$1,789,956.50	\$3,527,778.35	83.85
Cancom	\$1,509,607.24	\$1,554,895.45	\$3,064,502.69	54.68

While Garda priced highest when it came to mobile and static Security Guard hourly rates, they priced lowest on unmarked vehicle services. Paladin priced highest on Supervisor hourly rates and A.S.P.'s unmarked vehicles services were priced the highest.

Following the comprehensive evaluation, it is recommended that Garda Canada Security Corporation be awarded a contract for the TPA security guard services as stipulated in the RFP.

COMMENTS

TPA has an on-going requirement for a security agency to perform mobile patrols, loss prevention (surveillance), respond to employee/customer complaints and to ensure a safe workplace for employees who work at various TPA facilities. TPA currently retains these services through a third-party provider, G4S. G4S provided 90 days' written notice of termination of contract on September 5, 2019 and therefore a Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued by staff on October 15, 2019.

The open call was posted on the MERX Canadian Public Tender network and closed November 15, 2019. Proponents were invited to submit proposals for providing security services; conducting mobile and foot patrols, responding to employee/customer complaints, incident report writing, reacting to and resolving emergency and crisis situations, making arrests as required, in accordance with the terms of reference specified by TPA for the two (2) year term of the contract. Prices submitted are inclusive of all applicable costs except HST, subject to annual CPI adjustments for subsequent years.

Four proposals out of 7 were considered compliant and scored following a rigorous analysis of each written proposal and pricing structure.

After the review and scoring of the RFP responses, the results show that Garda Canada Security Corporation has the highest overall bid score, meeting the key objectives of the contract. Staff recommend that their bid be accepted and TPA enter into a two-year agreement with Garda Canada Security Corporation for security guard services for TPA and TTC off-street facilities.

Garda Canada Security Corporation was established in 1995 and is a privately-owned international provider of security services. Their corporate headquarters are based in Montreal. Their complement of security personnel provide general security services, event security and/or guest services 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, 365 days a year in 140+ cities across Canada protecting 5000+ clients in 11 different sectors. With 10,600+ security professionals and 168 mobile patrol vehicles in Ontario and 101 vehicles in the GTA, they have the resources and fleet required to provide uninterrupted services to TPA.

CONTACT

Anu Aduvala, Vice President, Operations, Toronto Parking Authority, (416) 393-7254
anu.aduvala@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Robin Oliphant, Acting President
Toronto Parking Authority

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 - Evaluation Guidelines