

Danforth Garage Master Plan Process

Date: May 9, 2019
To: CreateTO Board
From: Chief Executive Officer, CreateTO
Wards: Ward 19 – Beaches East York

SUMMARY

At its meeting of January 31, 2018, Toronto City Council ("Council") approved the preferred site located at 1627 Danforth Ave (the "Property" and the "Danforth Garage") for the consolidation of the current Toronto Police Service (the "TPS") 54 and 55 Police District facility.

Council further directed the Deputy City Manager, Internal Corporate Services and the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to convene an interdivisional working group to undertake a Master Plan for the Property, to include community consultations, technical studies, and confirmation of required TTC uses on the Property and the exploration of other potential partners and uses.

The Property, which contains the Danforth Garage is situated at the southeast corner of Danforth Avenue and Coxwell Avenue. The Property is located within a growth area of the City as identified in the City's Official Plan. A small portion of the existing garage facility is used for the TTCs Danforth Transportation and Stations Division, which will need to remain on the Property. The remainder of the Property contains other TTC functions, including storage and maintenance uses, which will require relocation to an alternative location with any future reuse of the Property. The Property's direct access to transit (Coxwell TTC subway station) presents an opportunity for revitalization and for its redevelopment to catalyze further investment along this portion of Danforth Avenue.

CreateTO, Real Estate Services and City Planning, in collaboration with TTC, TPS and the Toronto Public Library ("TPL"), have completed the Danforth Garage Master Plan. The Master Plan provides a framework and phasing strategy to guide the redevelopment of the property as a multi-use civic hub while prioritizing design and construction work for the TTC and TPS building programs in the first phase. Phase 2 and 3 allow for consideration of alternative uses and potential public and interim uses for the portion of the Danforth Garage currently used for storage by the TTC.

The complete Danforth Garage Master Plan Study can be found at <http://bit.ly/danforth-garage-master-plan> and the appendices can be found at <http://bit.ly/danforth-garage-appendices>.

In order to proceed it will be necessary that the City allocate the pre-development costs required to proceed with a feasibility study for the adaptive reuse of the Danforth Garage facility on an interim and long-term basis; continue market sounding for the development of viable public and private partnerships for the development of Parcels A, B, C and F as shown in Attachment 4 of this report; and that a City initiated Official Plan and rezoning amendment to implement the framework for land uses as contained in this report.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chief Executive Officer, CreateTO recommends that:

1. The CreateTO Board endorse the Master Plan as shown in Attachment 4 of this report to guide the development of the Danforth Garage Property.
2. The CreateTO Board direct the Chief Executive Officer to work on the next phase of the project once approved by City Council.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no direct project costs to be borne by CreateTO for the proposed next phase in the Danforth Garage project.

As CreateTO assumes leadership in the delivery of mixed-use projects such as the Danforth Garage service agreements will need to be developed. This matter is currently under review by CreateTO, in consultation with senior City officials, and will be the subject of a future report to the CreateTO Board.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of April 15, 2019, the CreateTO Board received a presentation concerning the Danforth Garage Master Plan process.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.RA4.2>

COMMENTS

The Master Plan study focuses on the Danforth Garage property located at 1627 Danforth Avenue (the “Property”) a 5.05 acre (2.0 ha) property bounded by Danforth Avenue to the north, the rear yards of townhouses facing onto Woodrow Avenue to the south, Coxwell Avenue to the east and Hillingdon Avenue to the west (refer to Attachment 1). The Property was acquired by the TTC in 1921 and constructed to serve as a car house. In 1967, the building was renovated to enable it to store, fuel, and

repair and maintain buses. In 2002, the majority of its garage functions were moved to a new bus garage facility on Comstock Road. The Property currently includes:

1. The 6,503 m² (70,000 SF) TTC Danforth Garage which includes:
 - 1,858 m² (20,000 SF) of administrative space which continues to be used for TTC administrative purposes (the Danforth Subway Collectors and Station Divisions)
 - 4,645 m² (50,000 SF) garage of which 12,000 square feet is currently used for TTC storage and maintenance
 - Approximately 100 surface parking spaces
 - Outside storage
 - A pump and treat station, located in the southwest corner of the Property, required for environmental and ground water monitoring.

City Planning's Heritage Preservation Services has been collaborating with CreateTO throughout the Master Plan process and the Toronto Preservation Board, at its meeting April 30, 2019, adopted inclusion of the Property on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

The Property is also home to the Danforth–Coxwell Public Library (1625 Danforth Avenue East). In 1988 the TPL entered into a lease agreement with the TTC for use of the northeast corner of the Property to accommodate an 893 m² (9,617 SF) stand-alone public library.

While not included in the Study Area, the Property is also home to Tobias House of Toronto Caring for People in the Spirit of St. Francis Incorporated ("Tobias House") at 1577 Danforth Avenue. Tobias House is a non-profit housing corporation that provides personal supportive services (self-advocacy, resource counselling and workshop/social events) to individuals with physical challenges. The Tobias House facility is situated on City/TTC lands leased to Martap Development 87 Limited for 99 years which were subsequently sub-leased to Tobias House. The lease agreement provides for 130 below grade parking spaces associated with Tobias House to be used for TTC parking.

Study Purpose

The purpose of the Master Plan was to provide a framework to guide the redevelopment of the Property as a multi-use civic hub, incorporating the program needs of the anchor tenants (TTC, TPS and TPL) while leaving room for additional civic, cultural, and other uses. Building program requirements for each of the anchor tenants can be found in Attachment 2.

Study Process

An interdivisional working group (the "Technical Working Group"), led by CreateTO, was established and included the following City stakeholders:

City Planning (Community Planning, Urban Design and Heritage Preservation Services);
Real Estate Services;
TTC;
Toronto Police Services; and
Toronto Public Library

The Technical Working Group was supported by a team of consultants, led by: DTAH Architects, with support from ERA Architects (heritage architects); Swerhun Facilitation (community engagement facilitators); (BA Consulting Group (transportation); Stantec Consulting Ltd (civil engineers); and the J.C. Williams Group (retail consultant).

To support development of the Danforth Garage Master Plan a comprehensive public consultation process was conducted. A Local Advisory Committee (“LAC”) was established. The LAC was a non-political advisory group composed of representatives from local community organizations with an interest in informing the development of the Master Plan for the Property. The LAC met four times during the process and assisted in the preparation of three community meetings, one in each phase of the study, to share information and seek feedback from the larger public at critical decision points.

A project website was established (www.danforthgarage.com) which allowed anyone interested to get background information and other relevant policies and studies, updates on the consultation process, summaries of meetings and all materials presented at the public consultation meetings. In addition to the LAC, community meetings, and the public website, CreateTO and City staff managed two pop-up consultations in August 2018 (at the Gerard Bazaar and the East Lynn Farmer's Market) to discuss the study with the community.

The Master Plan process began in the spring of 2018 with the majority of the design and consultation scopes of work undertaken in the summer and fall, and the final public meeting taking place in early December 2019. The process was conducted in three phases:

Phase 1: focused on refining guiding principles which governed the Master Plan and future development of the property and confirming the building requirements for the TTC, TPS and TPL. The guiding principles can be found in Attachment 3.

Phase 2: focused on exploring different options for the Property’s redevelopment; and

Phase 3: developed the preferred master plan concept informed by a set of urban design framework considerations, as well as a demonstration plan and phasing strategy.

The analysis of the Property’s history and context, combined with the functional program of the anchor tenants and the guiding principles shaped a set of planning and design frameworks to assist with the development of Master Plan options. The frameworks included:

Frontages: the character of Danforth, Coxwell, Hillingdon and the Property’s southern edge

Pedestrian circulation and open space: experiencing movement to and through the Property

Vehicular Circulation: how parcels can be accessed and serviced

Preservation/Adaptive re-use Strategy for the existing Danforth Garage

Built Form Strategy: how building heights on the Property will be determined

Development opportunities: where new buildings can be developed

The frameworks guided the exploration of a range of potential Master Plan options for the Property. The options distinguished themselves by different approaches to each of the frameworks above. The three Master Plan options were presented to the Technical Working Group, the LAC and the public at large for their review and comments. A full description of the planning and design frameworks and development of the master plan options can be found in the Danforth Garage Master Plan Study, Chapter 5: Options Development, at <http://bit.ly/danforth-garage-master-plan>.

In regards to the preservation/adaptive reuse strategy, the Master Plan process, undertook, in collaboration with the City's Heritage Preservation staff, supported by ERA Architects, an analysis of the heritage value of the Danforth Garage. This review established a series of heritage objectives and parameters to govern the redevelopment of the Property and the reuse of the existing Danforth Garage. Building upon the history and function of the Property, three distinct character zones were developed to inform the adaptive re-use of the Danforth Garage and new development on the Property.

Zone 1 - Danforth Interface: vibrant, active extroverted, welcoming, porous, and fine grained with multiple entries, contributing to the energy of Danforth

Zone 2 - Danforth Car Barns: Dynamic, connective, open volumes, publicly accessible, interpreting heritage, contributing to the flanking streets

Zone 3 – Surface Parking Lot: Low key, introverted, compatible, transitional

A fulsome explanation of the objectives, parameters and character zones can be found in the Danforth Garage Master Plan Study, Chapter 4: Existing Conditions and Analysis, found at <http://bit.ly/danforth-garage-master-plan>.

Preferred Master Plan

The preferred option, refer to Attachment 4, was informed by an analysis of existing conditions and policies; public and stakeholder consultation; the Guiding Principles; the testing, evaluation and iterative development of the options; and the Project Team's professional expertise. The recommended framework for the Master Plan is fully described in Chapter 6: Recommended Framework of the Danforth Garage Master Plan Study found at <http://bit.ly/danforth-garage-master-plan>.

The parcel plan for the Property suggests new buildings on parcels A, B, C and F to accommodate future partnerships delivering civic, cultural, mixed-use residential and employment uses, while parcels D and E are intended to accommodate the TPS and TTC uses respectively. The existing garage building is intended to be adaptively re-used to accommodate future civic, cultural and employment uses, including the potential new home for the Danforth-Coxwell Library. The proposed land parcels uses are summarized in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Proposed Land Parcel Uses and Below Grade Parking Potential

Land Parcel	Proposed Use	Below Grade Parking Potential
Parcel A	Requires demolition of library	+/- 50 cars per level
Parcel B	Development site tied to adaptive re-use of the existing building	No underground parking below existing building due to costs
Parcel C	Infill redevelopment or pedestrian passageway	No underground parking below existing building due to costs
Parcel D	Toronto Police Services District Facility	+/- 100 cars per level
Parcel E	TTC Danforth Transportation and Stations Division Admin function Existing Garage Barn not occupied	+/- 90 cars per level
Parcel F	Integration of pump station	+/- 100 cars per level

Pedestrian Circulation

Pedestrian circulation on the Property is achieved through east-west and north-south interior and exterior walkways that connect major on-site uses to the surrounding municipal streets, providing active/retail opportunities throughout the site. The circulation plan also ensure users with accessibility needs will be accommodated.

Vehicular Circulation

Vehicular circulation for the Property is achieved through a southern private driveway connecting Coxwell and Hillingdon Avenues, controlled as necessary to support TPS and TTC uses. An additional driveway connection to Coxwell Avenue is anticipated to encircle Parcel F in order to establish a communal pick-up and drop-off zone and multi-use court against the western elevation of the existing garage. Below grade parking is accessed by discrete entries accommodated primarily from this internal roadway network. Parcel A is accessed from Hillingdon Avenue in line with the pattern of servicing laneways to the east.

Open Space

The open space strategy includes a new publically-accessible Hillingdon Parkette on the eastern edge of Property, with a Pedestrian Gateway and Heritage Court on Danforth Avenue and a new Multi-Use Court accessed from Coxwell Avenue.

Built Form

The heights illustrated in the Master Plan (refer to Attachment 4) conform to the planning permissions established by the policy framework ("OPA 420") adopted by Council in July 2018, through the Danforth Avenue Planning Study, with the opportunities for height occurring in the centre of the Property where there is least impact to surrounding uses. As specific uses for Parcels A, B, C and F have not been determined, the character of these parcels will evolve as specific partnerships and uses

are identified. Further development applications and public review will be required prior to the development of these parcels.

Phasing

The Master Plan permits a three part phasing strategy which facilitates the TTC and TPS advancing their design and construction schedules while providing further opportunities for the Danforth Garage facility and other land parcels. The Phases are outline in Table 2.

Table 2: Phasing Strategy

Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3
TTC and TPS build their new facilities on Parcels D and E	Adaptive re-use of the Danforth Garage including the Danforth frontage	Development of new buildings on Parcel A and F
Driveway along the southern edge of the Property with appropriate controls as required by TTC and TPS	Development of the Hillingdon Parkette	Relocation of the Library as a new facility as part of an adaptive reuse plan for the Garage or in the base of Parcel A
Existing library remains in its location	Development of Parcel B Development of Parcel C as either an infill use or a possible public pedestrian access point	Completion of the Pedestrian Gateways and construction of the Multi-Use Court.

CONCLUSIONS

A Master Plan process was undertaken to guide the redevelopment of Property as a multi-use civic hub in a way that permits accommodation of the key anchor tenants (TTC, TPS and TPL) while leaving room for additional civic, cultural, employment and other uses. This process was supported by a robust community consultation process which achieved general consensus on the Master Plan.

The plan identifies redevelopment parcels and a phasing strategy which will permit the TTC and TPS to advance their respective programs, which have immediate schedules, while further feasibility and market testing is undertaken to explore the subsequent phases of development.

TTC

In regards to Parcel E and the future administrative uses for the TTC, an alternative location for the new administrative function has been identified which may be better suited for the TTCs program needs and overall city building objectives. During the course of the Master Plan process, CreateTO undertook due diligence, in consultation with the TTC, to assist the TTC in a fulsome review of both properties to inform a final selection. For the purposes of this study, Parcel E will continue to be reserved for TTC uses, until a decision regarding a preferred location is undertaken and approved. It

should be noted that the current Danforth Transportation and Stations Division use accommodated on Property will remain and must be accommodated in any future redevelopment of the Property.

Interim Use

During the course of the Master Plan process there emerged a desire to explore the opportunities for a possible interim use of the southern portion of the existing Danforth Garage currently not used by the TTC for the Traffic Office, however used for TTC storage. There are several examples in Toronto which have accommodated interim uses in empty industrial buildings for festivals, assembly uses and farmers markets, in buildings such as the Unilever Soap Factory, the Hearn Generating Station and the Evergreen Brick Works.

An investigation and cost estimate was undertaken to determine what improvements would be necessary to the existing Danforth Garage facility in order to make a portion of the building publically accessible and safe for an interim use. Any interim use would also be subject to the TTCs approval and agreement to clear the Repair Bay and Inspection Bays of storage and to make them available for reuse. The investigation involved the following review:

1. Assessment of architectural elements that may be necessary in order to make the building safe for occupation.
2. An update of designated substances survey and testing of materials.
3. Assessment of the structural integrity of the building for public occupancy
4. Assessment of required improvements for public access and use (life safety systems).

Based on this scope of work outlined above, an estimated cost of \$8.6M would be required to bring the existing garage space to a safe standard to permit its public use. In addition to the capital costs, further investigations are required to determine how the space can be curated, operated and maintained while the subsequent phases of development are explored.

Future Policy Framework

The Site is located within an Avenue (an area for growth) and is designated Mixed Use Areas and Neighbourhoods in the City's Official Plan. Given the existing policy and zoning framework, City Planning staff have determined that the land use designation and in-effect zoning will require updating to implement the recommendations of the Master Plan process. The intent for the entire Property is that it be designated Mixed Use Areas and mixed commercial/residential zoning. The land use designation and site-specific zoning by-law will permit a range of uses that will support the future uses as contemplated in the Master Plan process.

As the Property is City/TTC-owned, it is recommended that a City-initiated Official Plan and rezoning amendment process be undertaken. It is anticipated that City Planning staff will bring forward a proposed Official Plan and site-specific rezoning amendment to a future Council meeting, through a statutory public meeting process. This update will support the future program of the Property, including permitting the TTC and TPS to proceed with their programs and facilitate future uses for the remaining land parcels.

Environmental Investigation

In response to impacts linked to the historical fuelling system associated with TTC uses on the Property, the Property has been the subject of remedial efforts and ongoing monitoring and treatment for both on and/or off-site groundwater, through a pump and treat facility operating at the southwest corner of the Property. CreateTO has undertaken a peer review of the investigative reports to assess the scope of work required to support the Master Plan and future uses. This work will require:

1. Environmental Assessment Phase I and II;
2. A Designated Substances investigation to support any future adaptive reuse of the 3. Garage; and
3. A review of remedial measures installed in the 2002-2003 in the context of proposed redevelopment

Future changes in use on Property from commercial to civic, community and residential uses will likely dictate the requirement for a Risk Assessment, Site Specific Risk Assessment Measures, a Certificate of Property Use and a Record of Site Condition.

The TTC and TPS uses are considered “commercial uses” and the health and safety of workers is governed under the regulatory authority of the Ministry of Labour who have their own requirements. Allowances should be made for these investigations to ensure the appropriate measures are factored into the design and construction of the respective TTC and TPS uses.

Capital Funding

The Toronto Police Services 2018-2027 Council Approved Capital Budget and Plan includes the capital project known as "54/55 Amalgamation" with a total project cost of \$39.873 million for the cost of the facility only.

The TTC has allocated funding in their 2019-28 capital budget to begin planning for the construction of 66,000 square foot administrative function. This funding does not permit any relocation of the existing Transit Operator Office (approximately 10,000 square feet) housed in the office area of the existing Danforth Garage.

The TPL asset (the Danforth-Coxwell Library) has been identified as requiring an upgrade to service the growing needs of this community, however, TPL capital funding for the facility's renovation/replacement has not been allocated.

Any future redevelopment of this Property to include the adaptive reuse of the Danforth Garage as a civic hub is currently unfunded.

Future Uses and Market Sounding

During the Master Plan process, early market sounding was undertaken to explore the interest and possible future uses. There is a strong arts and cultural community in this area of the City, whose representatives participated in the Master Plan process and expressed interest in being part of a future civic hub envisioned for the reuse of the Danforth Garage. Non-profit organizations also active in the City's east end have expressed interest in future partnerships in the delivery of community services, child

care and possibly affordable housing. The health and wellness community, in particular in the form of assistive care, have also expressed interest in possible partnerships. The potential is emerging to bring together, arts and cultural, health and wellness and City uses which could support and enhance partnerships with the presence of the TPS and a potentially new and expanded public library. The opportunities presented by development parcels A, B, C and F and the adaptive reuse of the Danforth Garage offers an opportunity to create a mix of uses which can, over time, serve to activate and catalyze revitalization for this stretch of Danforth Avenue.

Next Steps

CreateTO Management propose the following activities for the next phase the project:

1. CreateTO continue to work with the TTC, Real Estate Services and City Planning, to determine the preferred location for the TTC administrative functions which may be at a location other than the Property and make any necessary changes to the Master Plan to reflect a change in proposed use for Parcel E as shown in Attachment 4 of this report.
2. City Planning initiate an expedited Official Plan Amendment and Rezoning amendment to facilitate the policy framework required to implement the uses shown in Attachment 4 of this report;
3. A feasibility study be undertaken to explore the viable options for the adaptive reuse of the Danforth Garage facility as a civic hub that:
 - a. Follows the vision and directions provided by the Master Plan and continues to engage the local community, key internal and external stakeholders in identifying the preferred type of users for the Property;
 - b. Leverages capital funds from public and private sources to execute the shared vision for the Danforth Garage facility; and
 - c. Develops a sustainable operating model that, to the extent feasible, does not require annual operating and maintenance support from the City of Toronto.
4. Further investigation for possible interim use of the Danforth Garage facility.
5. Explore public and private opportunities and partnerships for the development of Parcels A, B, C and F as show in Attachment 4 of this report.
6. Environmental investigation for the development of an environmental strategy which will facilitate the redevelopment of the Property as envisioned by the Master Plan shown in Attachment 4 of this report
6. A budget of \$650,500 be authorized for the completion of activities set out in items 3, 4, 5, and 6.

CONTACT

Don Logie
SVP, Development
Tel: 416 981- 2896
Email: dlogie@createto.ca

Gabriella Sichi
Director, Development
Tel: 416 981-2466
Email: gsichi@createto.ca

SIGNATURE

Brian Johnston
CEO, CreateTO

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Property and Study Area

Attachment 2: Anchor Tenants' Building Program

Attachment 3: Guiding Principles

Attachment 4: Preferred Master Plan and Demonstration Plan