



Decision Letter

Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting No. 7
Meeting Date Thursday, June 20, 2019
Start Time 9:30 AM
Location Committee Room 3, City Hall
Contact Carlie Turpin, Committee Administrator
Phone 416-392-7033
E-mail teycc@toronto.ca

PB7.5	ACTION	Adopted		Ward: 10
-------	--------	---------	--	----------

Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register 40-44 and 71-75 Mitchell Avenue and 735-737 and 753-755 Richmond Street West, and Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act - 40-44 Mitchell Avenue

Board Decision

The Toronto Preservation Board recommends to the Toronto and East York Community Council that:

1. City Council include the properties at 71-75 Mitchell Avenue on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register, in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 71-75 Mitchell Avenue (Reasons for Inclusion) attached as Attachment 3 to the report (June 12, 2019), from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning.
2. City Council include the properties at 735-737 Richmond Street West on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register, in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 735-737 Richmond Street West (Reasons for Inclusion) attached as Attachment 4 to the report (June 12, 2019), from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning.
3. City Council include the properties at 753-755 Richmond Street West on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register, in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 753-755 Richmond Street West (Reasons for Inclusion) attached as Attachment 5 to the report (June 12, 2019), from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning.
4. City Council include the properties at 40-44 Mitchell Avenue on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register and state its intention to designate the properties under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 40-44 Mitchell Avenue (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 6 to the report (June 12, 2019) from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning.
5. If there are no objections to the designation of the properties at 40-44 Mitchell Avenue, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the bill in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
6. If there are objections in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council direct the City Clerk to refer the designation to the Conservation Review Board.

7. If the designation is referred to the Conservation Review Board, City Council authorize the City Solicitor and appropriate staff to attend any hearing held by the Conservation Review Board in support of Council's decision on the designation of the property.

Origin

(June 12, 2019) Report from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning

Summary

This report recommends that City Council include the properties at 40-44 and 71-75 Mitchell Avenue and 735-737 and 753-755 Richmond Street West on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register and state its intention to designate the properties at 40-44 Mitchell Avenue under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The properties at 40-44 and 71-75 Mitchell Avenue and 735-737 and 753-755 Richmond Street West contain four pairs of single-storey semi-detached cottages that were among 16 pairs constructed in 1858 by James Lukin Robinson on three streets southeast of Queen and Niagara streets. In addition, two pairs of cottages at 703-705 and 719-721 Richmond Street West that are part of this group were listed on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register in 2005.

The buildings are known historically as the Robinson Cottages for the man who commissioned them, as well as the Garrison Common Cottages for their location on the former Military Reserve lands east of Garrison Creek (where Mitchell Avenue was known earlier as Garrison Street). With the two pairs of cottages at 703-705 and 719-721 Richmond Street West, which were built at the same time and were listed on the Heritage Register in 2005, they form an important collection and are the last surviving examples of the original group of 16 cottages in the Niagara Street Neighbourhood.

Prior to zoning approval in August 2017 for the redevelopment of a pair of semi-detached cottages at 18-22 Mitchell Avenue, area residents nominated them and the four other pairs listed in Recommendations 1-4 for the Heritage Register. The residents formed a Facebook group "Save the Garrison Common Cottages" in support of the preservation of the remaining cottages:

<https://www.facebook.com/Save-The-Garrison-Common-Cottages-1700966533531818/>

The properties at 40-44 Mitchell Avenue are the subject of a Committee of Adjustment application for a minor variance to replace the pair of single-storey semi-detached house form buildings with three 3-storey town houses.

Following research and evaluation, it has been determined that properties at 40-44 and 71-75 Mitchell Avenue and 735-737 and 753-755 Richmond Street West meet Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, which the City of Toronto also applies when evaluating properties for its Heritage Register. With the listed heritage properties at 703-705 and 719-721 Richmond Street, the properties identified in Recommendations 1-4 comprise a rare surviving collection of mid-19th century semi-detached workers' cottages that were built as a group in the former Military Reserve east of Garrison Creek.

The inclusion of the properties at 40-44 and 71-75 Mitchell Avenue and 735-737 and 753-755 Richmond Street West on the City's Heritage Register and the designation of the properties at 40-44 Mitchell Avenue under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act would identify all of the property's cultural heritage values and heritage attributes.

Following the inclusion in 2005 of the other extant cottages at 703-705 and 719-721 Richmond Street West on the Heritage Register, additions were made to the rear of the buildings at 705 and 721 Richmond (as shown in the photographs in Attachments 2C and 2D). The lot sizes allowed for substantial additions that retained the cottages while accommodating the owners' needs.

Properties on the Heritage Register will be maintained and conserved in accordance with the Official Plan Heritage Policies. Designation enables City Council to review applications to the site, enforce heritage property standards and maintenance, and refuse demolition.

Background Information

(June 12, 2019) Report and Attachments 1-7 from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning - Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register - 40-44 and 71-75 Mitchell Avenue and 735-737 and 753-755 Richmond Street West, and Intention to Designate Under Part IV, Section 29, Ontario Heritage Act - 40-44 Mitchell Avenue

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2019/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-134684.pdf>

(June 6, 2019) Report from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning - Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register 40-44 and 71-75 Mitchell Avenue and 735-737 and 753-755 Richmond Street West, and Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act - 40-44 Mitchell Avenue - Notice of Pending Report

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2019/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-134155.pdf>

Communications

(June 19, 2019) E-mail from Gabriele Guiducci (PB.Supp.PB7.5.1)

(June 19, 2019) E-mail from Andrea Chambers (PB.Supp.PB7.5.2)

(June 19, 2019) E-mail from Dolores Borkowski (PB.Supp.PB7.5.3)

(June 20, 2019) E-mail from Chris Chambers (PB.Supp.PB7.5.4)

Speakers

Kenneth Chestney

Daniel Hall, The Architect Builders Collaborative

Jason Chestney

Chris Uchiyama, Letourneau Heritage Consulting Inc.

Sunny Punia, Punia Group Inc.

Andrea Chambers

Dolores Borkowski

Rajdev Sidhu

Michael Smith