Attachment 1: Proposed Work Plan, Stage 2: Building the Plan

This appendix provides an outline of work that will be undertaken over the next 12 months to finalize the digital infrastructure principles and develop a draft Digital Infrastructure Plan.

Consultations

Create a Community Advisory Group
Staff are in the process of assembling a Community Advisory Group (CAG). The CAG will be comprised of up to 25 interested individuals and representatives from organizations and community groups. The role of the CAG is to:
- Act as a sounding board for the Project Team to share and discuss ideas and findings;
- Provide guidance and suggestions to strengthen proposed approaches, concepts and materials (including materials to be presented at public meetings);
- Provide a sense of the broader community's sentiments and concerns and how these might be addressed; and
- Provide a forum for two-way communication between members of the public, members' organizations (if applicable) and the Project Team.

Opportunities to participate in the CAG were promoted during consultations held in December 2019. Applications were open from December 7 to December 20, 2019, during which time 85 applications were submitted. Staff are currently in the process of reviewing these applications. Members will be identified to reflect a balance of interests, diversity of opinions, as well as demographic and gender considerations.

The CAG will provide its advice and recommendations to staff with the assistance of an independent facilitator. It is anticipated that there will be at least 4 CAG meetings during 2020.

The Terms of Reference for the CAG are available at the following link:
https://s.cotsurvey.chkmkt.com/lib/48827/files/1546.pdf

Continue with Community and Stakeholder Engagement
Engagement with the public, stakeholders and other community groups will continue into 2020, including large meetings and small group meetings. Groups to be consulted in the short term (Q1 2020) include the Toronto Region Board of Trade, the Toronto Youth Cabinet, the Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee, and the Community Advisory Group (outlined above), among others.

Staff will hold consultations with the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation in 2020. Outreach to Toronto urban indigenous communities will also be a component of the community consultation program. Staff are also reaching out to experts on First Nations data governance such as the First Nations Information Governance Institute on issues such as Indigenous data sovereignty considerations.

Consultation with City Divisions, ABCs and Other Government Entities
Engagement will continue with City Divisions, ABCs and other government entities that will be impacted by the DIP, and those with particular expertise on digital infrastructure issues such as the Toronto Public Library and Waterfront Toronto. In particular, staff will discuss current or planned digital infrastructure projects that are being explored and will examine these in light of the Working Principles and emerging DIP.

One example would be how the DIP will impact a project like Data for Equity. Staff will review how the DIP would support the planning and implementation of disaggregated data collection and analysis. This work would be undertaken to ensure equitable program planning and service delivery for Toronto residents that is also in accordance with the City's Open Data Master Plan.

International and Intergovernmental
Staff will engage regional organizations and municipalities, and other cities that have joined the Cities Coalition for Digital Rights to develop policy approaches and coordinate cross-boundary matters. Staff will explore opportunities for ongoing government partnerships, and the inter-governmental working group will continue to meet in 2020.

Develop Additional Engagement and Education Materials
In Phase 2, staff will be developing additional materials to assist in public engagement and education. These include:
- Glossary: Definitions of terms used in the Principles and in the DIP.
- Frequently Asked Questions: Answers to questions received during the consultation process.
- Focussed Education on data collection, privacy and security: Education and outreach program specifically focussed on explaining the types of data that is collected by the City and others, the rules around this data collection and the tools that are used to enforce these rules.

Research

Data Governance Research Project
The Data Governance Research Project final report is anticipated in Q1 2020 and will be posted on the project web site. The outcomes from this research work, and related recommendations, will be incorporated into the Stage 2 report to Executive Committee.

Focussed Research on Key Issues and Policy Options
A significant component of feedback obtained through recent consultations focussed on questions regarding how the Working Principles would be applied. At the public meetings, this issue was addressed through the inclusion of two sections for each principle, entitled: "Some Things We Are Currently Doing" and "Some Things We Are Thinking About". The complete materials provided at the public meeting can be viewed at the following website: www.toronto.ca/connectedcommunity.

Through the consultation process, the public has provided additional input on key issues to be examined. This information is contained in the consultation report (Appendix 5).

In Stage 2, staff will build upon existing materials and this public feedback to determine areas where focussed research is required to explore policy options. Some examples included in the consultation materials are:

- Equity and Inclusion: A way for the City to ensure automated processes, which result in decisions about people or groups of people, will not harm Indigenous people and equity-seeking groups (e.g. through the use of Algorithmic Impact Assessments).
- A Well-run City: How proposals for Digital Infrastructure may be integrated with the existing building, planning and development review processes.
- Social, Economic and Environmental Benefits: A public-interest intellectual property policy, where the City can create value for Toronto's residents, businesses and others by broadening access to innovation.
- Privacy and Security: More specific guidance on the regulation of data gathered in areas that are "semi-public" (e.g. some privately-owned publicly accessible spaces, courtyards, shopping malls, building lobbies).
- Democracy and Transparency: Look into publishing an education and transparency web page about the City's Digital Infrastructure, sharing our policies and a list of digital items.

Clarify Scope of the Digital Infrastructure Plan and Examine Existing Projects

Clarifying the scope of the Digital Infrastructure Plan (DIP) was a key theme that emerged through the public consultations conducted in December 2019. As noted in the Decision History of this report, on October 29, 2019, City Council directed the Chief Technology Officer to take on an expanded City-wide scope and mandate providing support, oversight and direction on standards, practices and policies to all City divisions and a large number of agencies and corporations, with immediate effect with respect to all technology assets, goods, and services. City Council identified that this directive applies to:

- Service Agencies (e.g. Toronto Parking Authority, Toronto Transit Commission, Toronto Zoo);
- Arena Boards (e.g. George Bell Arena, North Toronto Memorial Arena, McCormick Playground Arena);
- City Board-run Community Centres (Association of Community Centres or AOCC's) (e.g. 519 Community Centre, Scadding Court Community Centre, Swansea Town Hall Community Centre); and
- City Corporations (Toronto Community Housing Corporation; Lakeshore Arena Corporation).

Some Agencies and Corporations that this directive does not apply to include Toronto Hydro, Toronto Police Service, Toronto Public Health, and the Toronto Public Library.

A detailed list of the Agencies and Corporations that this directive applies to can be found at the following link:
http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.AU4.1

This directive provides some clarity around how the Chief Technology Officer will apply the DIP to projects that originate from within the City and the listed Agencies and Corporations. In addition to working with internal City divisions, Information and

Technology division staff will need to work with the listed Agencies and Corporations to develop a governance and decision-making structure that is reflective of the DIP.

The extent to which the Plan will apply to the private- and not-for-profit sector, as well as the extent to which is can be applied to private property, including privately-owned publically accessible spaces, will also be explored over the coming year.

Staff will examine current or planned internal digital infrastructure projects in light of the Working Principles and emerging DIP in order to inform and apply the creation of the application and evaluation processes.

Develop Draft Digital Infrastructure Plan

Update Working Principles based on further public engagement
The Working Principles may be refined further through the Stage 2 process. The Working Principles will be incorporated into the Draft DIP and Staff report.

Create Application and Evaluation Process
A number of regulations and policies are already in place to evaluate digital infrastructure proposals that originate from within the City. These cover issues such as personal information, privacy, security, data management, procurement, intellectual property, consumer protection and others. The Digital Infrastructure Plan (DIP) will build on these existing regulations and policies to enable a consistent approach to the evaluation of digital infrastructure policies and proposals, including those which might be submitted by third parties (private companies, universities, researchers, community organizations etc.) looking to partner with the City or launch products or services. Part of this work will be to ensure alignment with corporate Information Management policies.

The Working Principles will play a central role in informing the evaluation of proposals. However, a more objective and rigorous intake and evaluation process will be needed. The following components need to be explored as part of this work:

- A streamlined process for the intake and circulation of proposals from third parties, which gives consideration to the City's User Fee Policy;
- A transparent and objective process to evaluate proposals from third parties, including the creation or application of policies, performance measures, standards, or other criteria necessary for an evaluation;
- Application submission requirements, including specific documents required and Terms of Reference;
- A process to determine if and when public consultation and City Council approval may be required for digital infrastructure proposals; and
- An appeal process.

Privacy Impact Assessments (PIAs) are widely recognized as important tools to help ensure that privacy risks are identified and adequately addressed in the design of new technologies and programs. An additional component of this element of the work plan will be to determine which party – the City or the external organization - is responsible for conducting a PIA for projects that don't originate from within the City.

<u>Clarify Internal City Governance Processes</u>
A central objective of the DIP is to ensure that internal decisions related to digital infrastructure support corporate objectives and are not made in isolation. This includes but is not limited to ensuring alignment with the City's Technology Strategy and Roadmap, and the Connected Community Strategy as required. The DIP's guiding principles align with the City's internal technology principles, which are:

- A technology ecosystem that is continuously modernized and extended to provide best-in-class and innovative capabilities to the city;
- Information Management as an Asset, data clarity across the City to assist in anticipating divisional needs to service the city's residents, visitors and businesses; and
- Standardized service delivery architectures and operations that are reliable, adaptable, effective, open and secure by design.

In addition, the City's Connected Community (Smart City) team is working on ways to deliver City services in a collaborative, effective, resilient, outcome focused, data enabled, and equitable manner that also maximizes solutions.

A formal decision-making process will be developed to ensure that the necessary teams are involved when making decisions about the use of digital infrastructure. This work is also an opportunity to establish mechanisms to support innovation in the provision of City services and asset management. Depending on the scope and scale of the proposed digital infrastructure, including an assessment of potential risk (privacy, security, hacks etc.), a requirement for public consultation and reporting to a Committee of Council could be embedded into this decision-making process.

In the longer term, as the DIP is implemented, it will be necessary to establish performance indicators to monitor the implementation of the DIP and related issues such as compliance. A process of regular review will be needed to ensure that the DIP remains reflective of technological and regulatory changes, and equity objectives. Through this process, the coordination of cross-boundary matters will be necessary to complement the actions of other authorities.