

## **Responding to the Dundas Street Renaming Petition**

**Date:** September 8, 2020

**To:** Executive Committee

**From:** City Manager

**Wards:** All

---

### **SUMMARY**

The City of Toronto is committed to addressing how systematic racism and discrimination are embedded in City assets, commemorative programs, and naming policies.

In response to a June 2020 petition calling for Dundas Street to be renamed, Mayor John Tory asked City Manager Chris Murray to form a working group including the City's Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit and Indigenous Affairs Office to recommend potential next steps.

A decision to rename a major arterial road like Dundas requires careful consideration and an equitable and inclusive public process that considers Black and Indigenous perspectives as well as those of the broader community.

The City Manager committed to bringing forward this report to provide a background on the community petition calling for the renaming of Dundas Street, the street's namesake (Scottish MP Henry Dundas), and the street's development since the 1790s.

Staff reviewed historical sources, recent media and webinars, materials provided by historical societies, written submissions and letters to the City, and started discussions with over a dozen scholars and subject matter experts. Staff also reviewed 256 recent case studies relating to street and place renamings and monument removals generated world-wide. This information along with additional research will form the basis of the communication and engagement strategies.

The question is how the City of Toronto should respond to these findings.

This report outlines a process to assess four options:

- do nothing
- retain the legal street names with additional interpretation and recognitions
- retain the legal street names but rename those civic assets with Dundas in their name, except TTC facilities
- rename the streets and all other civic assets now carrying the Dundas name.

For the renaming option, the report estimates the costs to City divisions and agencies, and potential impacts to businesses, organizations, property owners, and residents with a street address on Dundas as well as any service or directory that maps or shows addresses on Dundas.

For the renaming option, the report outlines a community engagement strategy and integrated change management process to address all civic assets with the Dundas name by the end of 2021.

The report also outlines a framework to more broadly understand and respond to how systemic racism and discrimination may be embedded in City assets, commemorative programs, and naming policies.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

The City Manager recommends that:

1. City Council authorize the City Manager to undertake Round 1 of the Dundas Street consultation and communications plan as described in Attachment 1 of this report.
2. City Council direct the City Manager to report back to the Executive Committee in the first quarter of 2021 on the consultation findings and recommendations relating to:
  - a) a preferred option for responding to the petition to rename Dundas Street and, by extension, addressing other civic assets with the Dundas name;
  - b) a work plan with estimated costs to implement recommendation 2(a) above;
  - c) revisions to the City's commemorative policies and programs, including the Property Naming Policy, the Street Naming Policy, and the Public Art and Monuments Donation Policy, and programs relating to civic honours, awards, and tributes;
  - d) an overall commemorative framework for the City, including guiding principles for naming/renaming and other forms of recognition, developed in consultation with City divisions, agencies, and corporations.
3. Subject to the adoption of recommendation 2(c), City Council direct that no new applications to name or rename streets or other civic properties (including parks) or requests to remove City monuments received on or after October 1, 2020 be considered until the review of policies and programs has been completed; this direction to apply to those agencies which are City boards under the *City of Toronto Act*, while the Board of Health, Police Services Board, and Public Library Board are requested to comply with this direction.

## **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

---

The cost to undertake Round 1 of the consultation and communications plan recommended in this report is estimated at \$250,000. Funding is available in the 2020 non-program Corporate Studies Reserve Fund. A best-estimate amount for future funding requirements will be included as part of the 2021 Operating Budget process for consideration by Council.

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

## **DECISION HISTORY**

---

On June 29 and 30, 2020, City Council received for information a petition entitled "Let's Rename Dundas Street in Toronto."

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2020.RM22.4>

## **COMMENTS**

---

### **The Community Petition to Rename Dundas Street**

In the aftermath of the killing of George Floyd in late May 2020, the world was rocked by protests against anti-Black racism and police violence and by calls for racial justice. Demands for change took many forms. The origins and meanings of monuments and street, park, and building names were scrutinized, as part of an effort to identify figures who contributed to the oppression and discrimination of Black, Indigenous, and other racialized communities through colonialism and other processes.

Toronto saw its own waves of protest, particularly after the police-involved death of Regis Korchinski-Paquet later that month. In early June 2020, local artist and activist Andrew Lochhead created an online petition entitled "Let's Rename Dundas Street in Toronto" (the "Petition"). The Petition's preamble included the following:

...Toronto City Council can take a constructive and symbolic step toward disavowing its historic associations with persons who have actively worked toward preserving systems of racial inequality and exploitation.

As such, we ask that Toronto City Council begin a public process to rename Dundas Street in the city of Toronto to honour a more appropriate person, place or event.

We also believe that this process should be transparent and undertaken in partnership particularly with Black-lead [*sic*] organisations and historical societies, Indigenous groups and other community representatives that accurately reflect the rich cultural diversity of the City of Toronto, in order to

create a long list of potential candidates.

Lochhead wrote that Henry Dundas, First Viscount Melville (the street's namesake), actively participated as a British MP and Secretary of State in obstructing the abolition of slavery in the British Empire from 1791 to 1806.

The Petition, containing 13,955 names, was formally presented by Councillor Layton to City Council on June 29 and 30, 2020.

A letter was also sent to the City Manager from Councillors Perks, Layton, Fletcher, Cressy, and Wong-Tam, all of whom indicated their support for a public process to review and rename Dundas Street.

### **Work by City Staff to Date**

To respond in an effective way to the Petition, the City Manager mobilized a steering committee composed of senior management from across the organization to provide overall guidance for the Dundas Street Renaming Project. A staff working group, focused on research, information gathering and analysis, has also been created. Multiple City divisions, agencies, and corporations who may be affected by any renaming of Dundas Street have been engaged.

#### *a) The Scope of "Dundas Street"*

The name "Dundas Street" has existed in what is now known as Toronto from at least the early 1800s. Today there are four legal entities carrying the Dundas name:

- Dundas Street East (the arterial road east of Yonge St.)
- Dundas Street West (the arterial road west of Yonge St.)
- Dundas Square (a local road south of Yonge-Dundas Square)
- Old Dundas Street (a local road east and west of the Humber River, south of Dundas Street West)

For the purposes of this report, Dundas Street refers collectively to these four entities.

#### *b) The Establishment, Naming, and Development of Dundas Street*

Staff have confirmed that the road was named in 1793 by John Graves Simcoe, the first Lieutenant-Governor of Upper Canada, in honour of Henry Dundas, then the Home Secretary in the U.K. government of William Pitt the Younger. Dundas Street was originally a military road running from Burlington Bay (where the town of Dundas was later founded) to the Thames River. By the War of 1812, the road terminated at Queen St. West and Ossington Ave., at the northern edge of the Garrison Reserve where the Indian Department assembled Indigenous warriors to defend the Town of York. Dundas Street was slowly extended eastward after 1913, taking in existing roads and expropriated properties. It reached its current end within the City of Toronto at Kingston Road in 1954.

### c) *John Graves Simcoe, Henry Dundas, and Slavery*

During his tenure as the civilian and military head of Upper Canada, Simcoe corresponded frequently with Henry Dundas. Simcoe's exact motivations for naming the road after Dundas are unclear, though the latter, as Home Secretary, had oversight of colonial affairs and it followed Simcoe's pattern of naming places in the province after prominent British politicians.

Simcoe took charge after Black enslavement had been a reality in what is now Canada for over 160 years. He is well-known as an opponent of slavery and for introducing legislation passed in July 1793 to prevent the further introduction of slaves into Upper Canada and allow for the gradual abolition of slavery. No enslaved people already residing in the province were freed outright; children born to enslaved mothers after the legislation was passed were freed upon reaching the age of 25 years. Late in 1793, Simcoe wrote to Dundas about the challenges in getting this compromise through the Upper Canadian parliament.

As the head of a British colony, Simcoe would have been familiar with efforts underway in the British parliament to abolish slavery, in which Dundas had an important role. In 1776, Dundas represented a man who had been purchased as a slave in Jamaica and taken to Scotland; in winning the case, Dundas helped establish the principle that slavery did not exist under Scots law and that enslaved people living in Scotland could claim their freedom. However, in 1792, William Wilberforce's motion in the British House of Commons to immediately abolish the transatlantic slave trade was amended by Dundas.

Dundas' amendment – to end slavery on a gradual basis – was adopted in the House of Commons, which then determined the end date should be 1796. However, the House of Lords did not consent to the motion and resolutions. It would be 1807 before the *Slave Trade Act* was enacted. As a result of this delay, more than half a million Africans were enslaved and transported across the Atlantic, many to British colonies.

The intentions and actions of Simcoe and Dundas must be considered in the context of the devastating impact of the transatlantic slave trade on Black lives and culture. As the United Nations has noted:

The Trans-Atlantic Slave Trade was the largest forced migration in history, and undeniably one of the most inhumane. The extensive exodus of Africans spread to many areas of the world over a 400-year period and was unprecedented in the annals of recorded human history....

From 1501 to 1830, four Africans crossed the Atlantic for every one European, making the demographics of the Americas in that era more of an extension of the African diaspora than a European one. The legacy of this migration is still evident today...

### d) *Expert Advice on the Dundas Street Renaming Project*

Staff have monitored the ongoing debate about Henry Dundas, including a recent webinar hosted by the University of Edinburgh (<https://www.ed.ac.uk/history-classics->

[archaeology/news-events/events-archive/2020/historians-on- Dundas-and-slavery/](https://www.archaeology.com/news-events/events-archive/2020/historians-on- Dundas-and-slavery/)), online academic articles (e.g., <https://www.opendemocracy.net/en/opendemocracyuk/henry- Dundas-empire-and-genocide/>), and materials forwarded by the Henry Dundas Committee for Public Education on Historic Scotland. A list was compiled of academics and public historians (especially people of colour) who have studied colonial history, the history of slavery, and renaming processes or who practice public history. To date, interviews have been conducted with:

- Dr. Melanie Newton, University of Toronto
- Dr. Regina Rini, York University
- Dr. Cheryl Thompson, Ryerson University
- Dr. Carl James, York University
- Dr. Alan Gordon, University of Guelph
- Dr. Jonathan Lofft, University of Toronto
- Dr. Wesley Crichlow, University of Ontario Institute of Technology
- Dr. Elliot Worsfold
- Natasha Henry, Ontario Black History Society
- Beth Hanna, Ontario Heritage Trust
- Paul Federico, Toronto Historical Association

Dr. Afua Cooper (Dalhousie University) and Dr. Carl Benn (Ryerson University) were contacted but were unable to participate at this time. Other potential subject matter experts will be contacted soon.

Staff have also consulted with senior administrators from Ryerson University (Denise O'Neil Green & Daniel Bowden) who are responding to the controversial legacy of Egerton Ryerson in relation to Indian residential schools. Processes are underway at the University to address that legacy; their lessons may inform action by the City in regard to the Dundas Street issue.

To begin the community outreach process, staff made presentations to the Partnership & Accountability Circle supported by the City's Confronting Anti-Black Racism unit, and to the City's Aboriginal Affairs Advisory Committee.

Key findings from these discussions included:

- All commemorations are simplifications of history
- History is messy and complicated, and commemorating the past can be problematic
- Public spaces do not have to eternally reflect community values from the past
- Acknowledge the past, then take steps to promote community healing
- Actions taken today should reflect contemporary community values, to meet current needs
- Extensive community engagement is essential for renaming projects - many voices need to be heard
- Be transparent throughout the process - share research, explain the rationale for decisions

- The use and form of public spaces will often be contested, as people and events have different meanings for different people at different times
- Debates about renaming and reshaping public spaces will be ongoing, so continuous, renewable change should be embraced - in Toronto, many place names have been changed over the past 200 years
- Reinterpretation or recontextualization of public spaces can expand the range of stories told, making history more inclusive, honest, and authentic
- Treat the Dundas Street issue as an important educational project
- Use the Dundas Street issue as an opportunity to create tools to address other problematic place names and monuments
- The positive and negative impacts on Black communities of renaming Dundas Street should be considered

#### *e) City Staff's Perspective on the Legacy of Henry Dundas*

Interpreting the role and legacy of Henry Dundas in the abolition and preservation of slavery is complicated. While Dundas made statements opposing slavery, his "gradualist" motion marked him as no more than a moderate anti-slavery reformer. His motivations for taking this stance should be considered, including his connections to British West Indian economic interests and the possibility that his compromise motion might have been more acceptable to decision-makers than immediate abolition. The parliamentary context within which Dundas operated is also important. Dundas' amendment was blocked by the House of Lords, further obstructing social change and perpetuating slavery.

While there is no evidence that Dundas personally owned slaves or profited directly from the slave trade, his "gradualist" motion was a rebuff to immediate abolition. As a powerful Cabinet minister, he would have influenced decisions around the abolition question. Whether Dundas is viewed cynically or as a pragmatist, his actions from 1792 onward contributed to the perpetuation of the crime against humanity of enslaving human beings.

#### *f) Street Renamings and Monument Removals in Other Jurisdictions*

The Dundas renaming Petition is one of many global efforts currently underway to confront anti-Black racism and discrimination against other communities, especially Indigenous people. Staff are working to understand how other jurisdictions are responding to proposals to rename streets and facilities and to remove monuments.

By the end of August, 256 case studies from 2017-20 were identified, drawn from Canada, the U.S., the U.K., and 11 other countries. Overall, 71% of the cases relate to anti-Black racism; 25% relate to anti-Indigenous racism; 2% relate to both anti-Black and anti-Indigenous racism.

Generally, an appetite for change exists in light of community concerns. Key findings, with Canadian experiences noted in parentheses, are:

- 64 municipalities changed a street/community name (Montreal); 15 did not (Kitchener); 2 added interpretive plaques

- 2 municipalities issued anti-racism statements but have not yet made further changes (Mississauga)
- 8 are looking into a variety of ways to honour Indigenous and equity-seeking communities (Halifax)
- 25 established advisory committees, and 47 included public consultation (Halifax)
- 157 removed monuments (Victoria)
- 15 kept monuments but added or plan to add new interpretative plaques or make other modifications (Orillia); 5 kept monuments and made no further changes
- 25 case studies included costs associated with this work (Halifax, Victoria)
- 11 street naming cases noted the size of the street and/or the number of residents affected (Fort Frances); most Canadian streets were not main thoroughfares
- The Canadian government announced that a Coast Guard ship will be renamed

Five case studies relate to Henry Dundas, including three in Canada (Dundas County, London, and Hamilton, Ontario). A monument to Henry Dundas in Edinburgh, Scotland, has fuelled intense public debate as to whether it should be removed or reinterpreted. In July 2020, signs were erected by the City of Edinburgh Council and Edinburgh World Heritage announcing the text that will appear on a new permanent plaque accompanying the monument. The text reads, in part:

At the top of this neoclassical column stands a statue of Henry Dundas, 1st Viscount Melville (1742-1811). He was the Scottish Lord Advocate and an MP for Edinburgh and Midlothian, and the First Lord of the Admiralty. Dundas was a contentious figure, provoking controversies that resonate to this day. While Home Secretary in 1792 and first Secretary of State for War in 1796 he was instrumental in deferring the abolition of the Atlantic slave trade. Slave trading by British ships was not abolished until 1807. As a result of this delay, more than half a million enslaved Africans crossed the Atlantic....

#### *g) Current Metrics for Dundas Street*

Staff assembled property, population, and business data from a number of sources, including the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation (MPAC) database, the 2016 Canadian Census, the Dun & Bradstreet business database, and the 2019 Toronto Employment Survey. Key findings include:

- 4,970 properties with 7,061 owners along Dundas Street
- 97,673 residents and 48,975 dwellings along and immediately adjacent to Dundas, with 18,606 owner/occupant/tenant records for the street per se
- 4,510 business establishments with an estimated 25,426 employees along Dundas
- 58 Toronto businesses with "Dundas" in their name

The count of residents and dwellings is considered to be a high estimate, as it is based on Statistics Canada's dissemination blocks touching and extending behind Dundas. The count of owners/occupants/tenants is considered to be a low estimate of population, as it is based on MPAC data; owners are not necessarily occupants, and not all occupants of a dwelling may be counted.



## *h) Options for Responding to the Petition*

Four options have been identified to respond to the community Petition:

- Option 1 - do nothing
- Option 2 - retain the legal street names and add ceremonial street names and/or interpretation (e.g., plaques) along each street addressing the legacy of Henry Dundas
- Option 3 - retain the legal street names but rename the three parks and one public library branch with Dundas in their names, as well as Yonge-Dundas Square
- Option 4 - change the legal names of Dundas Street East, Dundas Street West, Dundas Square, and Old Dundas Street, as well as all other civic assets carrying the Dundas name

Staff are **not** recommending option 1. While generating no impacts on residents and businesses along Dundas or on City assets, this option fails to address the impact of the name on Black communities or respond to the concerns of the Petitioners. A more balanced approach is warranted for a city whose motto is "Diversity Our Strength."

Option 2 minimizes impacts on residents and businesses along Dundas, but would entail costs for the City to prepare and implement an interpretation plan for the street. Adding ceremonial street names would preclude the use of the upper blade of a street sign by local BIAs or neighbourhoods wishing to brand their area. A linear approach to interpretation could, however, also include an online component, as was recently demonstrated by Heritage Toronto's "Dundas + Carlaw: Made in Toronto" digital walking tour. This option goes some way in addressing the impact of the Dundas name on Black communities and adopting the Petition's request.

Option 3 also minimizes impacts on residents and businesses along Dundas but entails costs for City divisions and agencies. The most significant change would be felt at a major public space, Yonge-Dundas Square. Interpretation along Dundas Street could also be included in this option. This option also goes some way in addressing the impact of the Dundas name on Black communities and adopting the Petition's request.

Option 4 includes fully adopting the Petition's request, but has the greatest impact on residents, businesses, and City assets. This option is explored in detail in the following three sections.

## *i) Potential Impacts of Renaming on City Assets*

If Dundas Street was renamed, impacts on City assets include:

- 730+ street signs replaced
- 2 subway stations, 2 streetcar/bus routes and numerous transit shelters renamed and signage, etc., replaced
- Yonge-Dundas Square renamed and signage, etc., replaced
- 3 parks renamed and 13 park and facility signs replaced
- 1 Toronto Public Library branch renamed and signage, etc., replaced

- 625 Bike Share station and Green P carpark signs, etc., replaced
- 129 signs and 35 infopillars for the TO360 wayfinding program replaced
- PATH signage replaced
- 1 Toronto Police Service division headquarters sign replaced
- 1 Corporate Real Estate Management operations centre sign replaced

The total estimated costs for the above work is \$3.02 million.

New street addresses would also be required for Toronto Community Housing Corporation (TCHC) properties, a fire station, a museum, a shelter, Employment & Social Services offices, and a major Toronto Public Health centre offering a variety of clinical services to the community. The impact on clients has been underscored by the TCHC, which houses over 2,000 tenants across 18 buildings on Dundas:

Many of these communities are low-income and may face unique challenges if address records and personal identification are not promptly updated to reflect any potential renaming of Dundas St.

A main area of impact will be ensuring documentation and mailing addresses are updated to ensure timely and accurate RGI (Rent Geared to Income) calculation for tenants. Many TCHC residents are housed according to an RGI formula and as such must submit regular documentation of pay/income (e.g. T4). Updating records with employers, government agencies (e.g. CRA) etc. will be important to ensure RGI calculations/subsidies are not jeopardized.

At the same time, many residents may lack resources or face additional barriers to quickly update all records particularly seniors and tenants with language barriers. Many tenants do not have home internet access and will find it more difficult to update records online. Tenants with disabilities or mobility issues may find it harder to go in person to Service Ontario or Service Canada office locations. To mitigate all these potential issues, a coordinated plan with Canada Post, Service Ontario, Service Canada, and other agencies would be the best approach for helping tenants.

*j) Potential Impacts of Renaming on Residents, Businesses, and Property Owners along Dundas*

Financial costs to residents to change their address are minimal as most changes can be made online. However, the time required to make the changes with a variety of institutions and personal contacts could take up a considerable amount of an individual's time. Direct costs could include mail forwarding by Canada Post and the purchase of a new address plaque. The City of Toronto Municipal Code requires that property owners display the appropriate municipal address number for the property at a conspicuous, clearly visible location facing the street providing primary access to the property, and shall remove or cause to be removed any inaccurate or noncomplying municipal addresses.

In reviewing other jurisdictions, it was found that in several cases, Canada Post provided free mail forwarding service when a municipality initiated the name change of a street (Ottawa, Newmarket). If Toronto could secure a similar service from Canada

Post, expenses borne by residents resulting from a change in street name would be minimal.

In a number of jurisdictions, the municipality provides direct compensation to property owners (residential, commercial, and industrial) for costs associated with a change to property address that is initiated by the municipality:

Amherstburg, ON      The Town compensates businesses and residents required to change their addresses as a result of a street name and/or numbering change deemed necessary by the Town. Each residential property owner/tenant or business will receive reasonable compensation, on presentation of proof of costs incurred.

There is no set limit for a reasonable expense, as long as it relates to the name change. For example, if an inlaid brick exists with a number that has changed or includes a street name that has changed, the Town would consider costs incurred to remove and redo the inlay. The Town would also consider costs incurred for the redirection of mail, or any other expense related to the change.

Clarington, ON      The Goodwill Payment for Municipally Initiated Street Name Changes policy states "that a goodwill payment should be provided for the inconvenience; it is not provided to compensate for actual costs or time."

A Commercial Landlord, a Business Owner, a Business tenant, a Home Occupation Business, Schools, Places of Worship and Fraternal Lodges will be paid \$200.

A Secondary Business, a residential Owner, a Residential Landlord and a Residential Tenant will be paid \$75.

Oshawa, ON      On a case-by-case basis, residents and businesses may be provided \$100 for a street name change initiated by the municipality.

Peel Region, ON      One-time payment of \$100 for residential properties and \$300 for non-residential properties may be provided if the property owner makes a request to the municipality.

Kelowna, BC      Affected residential property owners receive a free one year change of address service with Canada Post. Property owners are also compensated for replacement house numbers at a maximum cost of \$15 per number (maximum four numbers).

Affected business owners also receive a free one year Change of Address service with Canada Post. Business owners may be compensated for the initial printing costs of letterhead and envelopes to a maximum amount of \$250 and they may be compensated for replacement numbers at a maximum cost of \$15 per number (maximum four numbers).

If the City of Toronto were to consider compensation for a street name change by

property or by resident, the costs could be around \$500,000 at \$100 per property, about \$187,000 at \$100 per owner/occupant/tenant (based on MPAC data), or around \$980,000 at \$100 per resident (based on Statistics Canada's dissemination blocks, including Dundas Street and immediately adjacent areas).

Businesses would incur higher financial costs than residents even though most changes to address can be made online. However, the time required to make the changes with a variety of suppliers, institutions and other contacts could take up a considerable amount of an operator's time. Direct costs could include mail forwarding by Canada Post, the purchase of new civic address numbers (if necessary) or a new address plaque. Other costs could include printing of new marketing materials, letterhead, envelopes and business cards, as well as potential costs related to business signage.

In some jurisdictions reviewed, street name and civic address changes were delayed by up to one year in order to allow affected businesses to deplete their stocks of marketing and other paper materials printed with the original street name. New storefront signage for businesses with Dundas included in their name could be a key change component. Depending on the signage type, ranging from vinyl-face panels to free-standing individual illuminated letters, costs have been estimated at up to \$8,000 per business.

If the City of Toronto were to provide compensation of \$250 to these businesses for a change of street name and civic address, costs could run up to \$1,200,000. This would be considered a goodwill payment and would not likely cover all expenses incurred by a business owner. It represents the average compensation provided by other Canadian municipalities.

If those Toronto businesses with the word "Dundas" in the business name chose to change the name of their business, considerable costs would be incurred including new logo design (approximately \$20,000 to register intellectual property), signage and marketing expenses, as well as fees to register a new business name.

There are six Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) along Dundas, including one (Little Portugal On Dundas) with Dundas incorporated as part of its name. BIAs will also incur costs associated with a change to the street name and civic address. Little Portugal On Dundas would incur additional cost associated with rebranding and marketing of a name change. It was scheduled to launch a new name and brand in February 2020 as a result of a merger of the Dundas West and Little Portugal BIAs, but suspended this due to COVID-19. Subject to City Council's decision and direction, the BIA board will consider its next steps regarding an appropriate name. Key elements of their strategy included a new branding (\$20,000), new banners (\$10,000), and a new website (\$5,000), which may have to be reconsidered.

To calculate a total cost to the individual businesses located along Dundas Street, a direct survey of individual business owners would be required.

### *k) Potential Processes for Renaming*

If Dundas Street is renamed, other civic assets would require renaming due to their use of "Dundas" as a geographic orientation tool (e.g., Jane/Dundas Branch of the Toronto Public Library). Council has adopted several tools to guide renamings:

- Property Naming Policy, used for parks and facilities
- Street Naming Policy, used for legal (official) street names and ceremonial (non-official) street names

Use of the City's Street Naming Policy in this instance is not recommended. This policy requires that the applicant provide a single alternate new name and that 75% of the properties along the street give their consent to the new name. This approach is better suited to short local roads rather than a major street of citywide importance like Dundas.

An alternative process would be to modify the one successfully used for the Six Points Interchange project, which resulted in names being established for three new public streets in Etobicoke in 2019. The process might include:

- Online/mail gathering of potential street names from the public
- Staff and a community advisory panel (including Black representatives and Indigenous knowledge and language keepers) to create a short list
- Online/mail voting by public of the short-listed names (Six Points reserved one street for an Indigenous name)
- Results ranked by staff
- Further consultation with the Confronting Anti-Black Racism unit's Partnership & Accountability Circle and the City's Aboriginal Affairs Advisory Committee
- Recommendations to Executive Committee

Should Council decide to adopt either Option 3 or 4, a single integrated renaming project covering all affected civic assets with the Dundas name (streets, parks, transit facilities, public libraries, and public squares) should be developed. It is recognized that the Toronto Public Library has its own naming policy and procedures, with decisions made by its board. Nonetheless, a modified Six Points process that ensures that community engagement is comprehensive and equitable could bridge the interests of all City divisions and agencies.

### **Next Steps**

Staff recommend that action be taken on the four fronts discussed below:

- Developing a new framework for the City's commemorative policies and programs
- Undertaking consultation and communication activities on the four options identified for responding to the community Petition and the City's broader approach to commemoration
- Reporting back to Executive Committee on the above topics

- Placing a short-term moratorium on new street, park, and facility namings and renamings and the removal of City-owned monuments

Staff will also continue to gather information on related experiences in other jurisdictions, undertake historical research relating to the transatlantic slave trade, enslavement in Upper Canada and York, Henry Dundas, and Dundas Street, and work with subject matter experts to obtain guidance for the project.

*a) Toward a New Framework for the City's Commemorative Policies and Programs*

Commemoration is about public memory and how we remember and honour the past. Not every response to the past is celebratory; sometimes commemorations are solemn, but every act of remembrance requires a complete context to be understood meaningfully.

At the same time as the City develops a response to the specific Dundas Street issue, it is critical that we more broadly understand and respond to how systemic racism and discrimination are currently embedded in City assets, commemorative programs, and naming policies.

In terms of *understanding*, a review of the City's policies, programs, and assets should be developed for Council's consideration. This review might ultimately touch all named City streets, parks and facilities as well as public monuments and civic awards and honours. The first step is to assess the City's existing commemorative policies and programs:

- Property Naming Policy
- Street Naming Policy
- Public Art and Monuments Donation Policy
- Programs relating to civic honours, awards, and tributes

Naming and recognition across City divisions is governed by program-specific policies and practices. There are no consistent guiding principles to determine how decisions are made to recognize and honour an individual, group, or event and, conversely, how to manage revocations. While different City programs may require different approaches to recognition, a review would identify gaps, inconsistencies, and best practices. This review should extend to those City agencies which also have commemorative policies and programs, such as the Toronto Public Library's Naming Policy and Heritage Toronto's Plaques Program Draft Policy.

In terms of *responding*, an approach should be developed that is both retrospective and prospective, addressing the past, present, and future. Action on legacy issues might take a four-Rs approach: **rename** (e.g., a street), **remove** (e.g., a monument), **reinterpret** (e.g., a street name, monument, or artwork), or **revoke** (e.g., an award). Taking a proactive stance involves developing a corporate framework for commemoration and recognition that provides guidance and oversight for namings as well as renamings, the creation of new monuments, and recognition revocations. This framework could also involve evaluating each of the City's named assets before

controversy arises, or identifying notable Torontonians who have yet to be recognized in the city's landscape. Depending on the action, change can be symbolic or systemic.

Taking action should be based on a set of principles to be tested with Torontonians:

- Renamings, removals, reinterpretations and revocations do not erase history. They do change who and what we decide to remember, celebrate, and honour in public.
- History is complex, with multiple narratives that are often contested. Public interpretations of history should involve both pride and shame.
- Public spaces should be both welcoming and reflective of our diverse community and City of Toronto values. Place-names and monuments should promote equity and healing.
- The urban landscape should reflect the broad demographics and full history of Toronto. Place-names and monuments cannot be restricted to those who enjoy privilege and hold power.
- Conferring civic honours and awards on individuals, groups, and organizations must consider the actions and records of the recipients in both their public and private capacities, as well as subsequent behaviour which may reflect on the City's reputation and the integrity of its recognition programs.
- The criteria for making commemorative changes must be rigorous. While we should be open to change, it cannot be arbitrary.

The City's existing commemorative policies and programs include a variety of decision-making criteria. Additional criteria, which could be used to revise existing policies or create new ones, could be tested with Torontonians:

- Is the principal legacy of the commemorated subject fundamentally at odds with current community values?
- Does the subject being commemorated serve the public good by having made a significant contribution to Toronto, from the beginning of human occupation to the present?
- Does the commemoration transmit to present and future generations a fuller, more authentic account of Toronto history since time immemorial?
- Does the commemoration educate residents and visitors in an honorable but also honest way?
- Does the commemoration increase the diversity of stories being told in Toronto's urban landscape (e.g., in relation to Indigenous, Black, and other equity-seeking populations)?
- Does the commemoration involve achievements that were exceptionally noteworthy?
- Does the commemoration prioritize people closely connected to Toronto over those who have achieved provincial, national, or international status?
- Does the commemoration reflect significant geographical, natural heritage, neighbourhood, and historical themes as well as significant contributions made by individuals and organizations to the public life and well-being of Toronto?

- Does the commemoration help to reduce the commemorative underrepresentation in Toronto of Indigenous peoples as well as Black communities and other equity-seeking populations?

#### *b) Proposed Consultation and Communications Plan*

Staff have developed a robust consultation and communications plan to support the Dundas Street Renaming Project and solicit participation by the general public, by residents and business owners with properties on or near Dundas Street, and by Toronto's diverse Black communities. The plan will also support a framework for future street namings and renamings, monumental removals and additions, reinterpretations, and revocations. The following sections outline the high-level strategy that will be employed.

#### *Round 1: How We Name*

The focus of this round is to raise awareness, educate and gather feedback on the four proposed options in response to the request to rename Dundas Street, as well as the framework to address systemic racism and discrimination in other City assets, commemorative programs and naming policies. The City will engage with a diverse group of stakeholders and the general public.

A variety of consultation activities include:

- A Speakers Panel event featuring representatives from academic institutions as well as historians
- Two telephone town hall public events
- Meetings with key stakeholder groups, including the City's Partnership & Accountability Circle, Aboriginal Affairs Advisory Committee, Indigenous Place-Making Circle, Toronto Accessibility Advisory Council, and Equity and Inclusion Advisory Group, as well as historical societies, the Toronto Association of Business Improvement Areas, the Toronto Aboriginal Support Services Council, etc.
- Meetings with traditional territory and treaty holders including the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation, the Haudenosaunee, and the Huron-Wendat
- A public opinion poll
- Project web page with online survey
- Dedicated email and phone line for commenting

The communications strategy in Round 1 will provide relevant information and ensure participants have adequate opportunities to provide feedback on Dundas Street and the framework criteria for other City assets, commemorative programs and naming policies. Tactics will include informing the public and residents and businesses on Dundas Street of consultations via digital, social and print ads, including ethnic and specialized media; organic social media content; content for Councillors and BIAs to share with constituents and the business community; media releases and outreach; and Out-Of-Home advertising.



## *Round 2: What We Name*

In Round 2, a decision by City Council to rename or add a ceremonial name to Dundas Street will involve a two-step process to develop and select a name. City staff will re-engage with stakeholders and the general public. This round will employ a similar approach to the one used in the recent naming of three new public roads as part of Six Points Interchange Reconfiguration in the Etobicoke Centre neighbourhood. Step 1 will involve an invitation to the public to submit potential names. Step 2 will involve public voting on a shortlist of vetted names.

To engage the public in the submission and selection of a name, the following activities would be undertaken:

- A Speakers Panel event
- Telephone town hall public event
- Councillor-supported Ward-based meetings
- Establishment of an Advisory Committee for vetting submitted names
- Separate meetings with stakeholders consulted in Round 1
- Online survey to solicit names

The Advisory Committee will follow a detailed process to review all names submitted by the public against evaluation criteria, and will develop a short list of names proposed by the public that can be used in the renaming of Dundas Street and that can be referred to for potential renaming of other City monuments and assets.

In addition to the tactics employed in Round 1, the communications strategy and tactics will be amplified to support and encourage public engagement in the renaming of Dundas Street and/or civic assets with Dundas in their title. This will include involving the City's advertising agency of record in the creation of a public education strategy and creative, as well as the addition of new paid advertising tactics. Communications efforts will also inform key stakeholders of next steps.

## *Round 3: Sharing the Name*

If Council decides to retain the Dundas Street name with additional interpretation and recognitions (Option 2), the final round of engagement will focus on educating the public and stakeholders of this decision and which assets will be receive interpretation and/or recognitions.

If Council decides to rename Dundas Street or the civic assets with Dundas in their name (Options 3 or 4), the communications strategy will focus on informing the general public and key stakeholders of the new name for Dundas Street. Tactics will include a multi-faceted advertising campaign scaled according to the option chosen. Announcing the new name chosen for Dundas Street could include radio ads, Dundas streetcar wraps and other marketing tactics, in addition to previously used tactics.

The cost to implement Round 1 of the consultation and communication plan is estimated at \$250,000. Costs to implement Rounds 2 and 3 will vary depending on which option is selected by Council in 2021:

Project Round	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4
<i>Round 1: How We Name</i>	\$250,000	\$250,000	\$250,000	\$250,000
<i>Round 2: What We Name</i>	\$0	\$210,000	\$210,000	\$520,000
<i>Round 3: Sharing the Name</i>	N/A	\$110,000	\$550,000	\$850,000
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$250,000</b>	<b>\$570,000</b>	<b>\$1,010,000</b>	<b>\$1,620,000</b>

*c) Reporting Back to Executive Committee*

Staff propose reporting back to Executive Committee in the first quarter of 2021 on the Dundas Street consultations and any new research findings, along with recommendations on: a preferred option for the City's Dundas-named assets; any revisions to the City's commemorative policies and programs; and a process to review the City's other assets (i.e., other street, park, and facility names and monuments).

Should City Council decide to rename all or some of its Dundas assets, the consultation process described above will be implemented, with the new name(s) being recommended to Council in the fourth quarter of 2021.

*d) Short-term Approach to Addressing Other Renaming and Removal Proposals*

Staff have received a number of specific renaming proposals for Dundas Street, as well as requests to rename other streets and remove certain monuments. It is recommended that proposals relating to Dundas Street be incorporated into the upcoming consultation process; and that no action be taken on other renamings, new street naming applications, and monument removals until after staff report on revisions to the City's commemorative policies and programs in the first quarter of 2021, unless they are or have been specifically authorized by Council.

**Conclusion**

Any decision to rename a major arterial road like Dundas requires careful consideration of its potential impacts and a rigorous, equitable, and inclusive public process that responds to the community at large and addresses neighbourhood considerations as appropriate. The process should be coordinated across the City government to review the full range of Dundas-named assets and ensure consistent, coherent community consultation and communications. In this, the voices, perspectives, and lived experiences of our Black communities must be front and centre.

The City of Toronto is at a particularly turbulent moment in its history, facing not only calls for racial justice but the consequences of COVID-19 and its inequitable impact on our racialized communities and residents. The City should reaffirm its commitment and take the necessary action to implement the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism, the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada's Calls to Action, and the Calls for Justice for Murdered and Missing Indigenous Women and Girls. At the mid-point of the UN's International Decade for People of African Descent, taking steps to right wrongs, challenge systemic institutionalized racism, and build a more inclusive Toronto is more important than ever. Addressing the historical legacy of Dundas Street is one of these steps.

## **CONTACT**

---

Cheryl Blackman, Director - Museums and Heritage Services, Economic Development and Culture Division, [Cheryl.Blackman@toronto.ca](mailto:Cheryl.Blackman@toronto.ca) 416-392-9135

## **SIGNATURE**

---

Chris Murray  
City Manager

## **ATTACHMENTS**

---

Attachment 1: Dundas Street Consultation and Communications Plan, Round 1

## ATTACHMENT 1

### Dundas Street Consultation and Communications Plan, Round 1

The focus of this round is to raise awareness, educate and gather feedback on the four proposed options in response to the request to rename Dundas Street, as well as the framework to address systemic racism and discrimination in other City assets, commemorative programs and naming policies. The City will engage with a diverse group of stakeholders and the general public.

A variety of consultation activities include:

- A Speakers Panel event featuring representatives from academic institutions as well as historians
- Two telephone town hall public events
- Meetings with key stakeholder groups, including the City's Partnership & Accountability Circle, Aboriginal Affairs Advisory Committee, Indigenous Place-Making Circle, Toronto Accessibility Advisory Council, and Equity and Inclusion Advisory Group, as well as historical societies, the Toronto Association of Business Improvement Areas, the Toronto Aboriginal Support Services Council, etc.
- Meetings with traditional territory and treaty holders including the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation, the Haudenosaunee, and the Huron-Wendat
- A public opinion poll
- Project web page with online survey
- Dedicated email and phone line for commenting

The communications strategy in Round 1 will provide relevant information and ensure participants have adequate opportunities to provide feedback on Dundas Street and the framework criteria for other City assets, commemorative programs and naming policies. Tactics will include informing the public and residents and businesses on Dundas Street of consultations via digital, social and print ads, including ethnic and specialized media; organic social media content; content for Councillors and BIAs to share with constituents and the business community; media releases and outreach; and Out-Of-Home advertising.