

## Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot - Review

Date: February 26, 2020

To: Infrastructure and Environment Committee

From: General Manager, Transportation Services

Wards: All

### SUMMARY

---

The purpose of this report is to provide an update on the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot, recommend a way forward and propose changes to improve policies and regulations in the City as they relate to various car-share operating models.

The City of Toronto Official Plan and various policies and programs have long supported the operation of car-sharing services as a sustainable transportation option. Car-sharing programs offer a number of potential benefits to individuals, businesses, the environment, communities, and transportation network, including:

- reduced vehicle ownership rates;
- reduced household transportation costs;
- reduced vehicle kilometres travelled (VKT);
- reduced greenhouse gases and emissions; and
- an increase in walking, cycling, and transit use.

Transportation Services currently administers an on-street Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas (CVPA) program, a program for designating on-street spaces specifically for vehicles displaying a car-share vehicle permit. Currently, there are a total of 41 CVPAs, which include approximately 84 on-street parking spaces designated for exclusive use by car-share vehicles. In Toronto car-sharing facilities are also provided on private property.

Car-sharing is a growing new-mobility industry which is evolving as a result of the growth in the sharing economy enabled by mobile technology. Recognizing the benefits of car-sharing and that an alternative operating model for car-share vehicles in the form of free-floating has worked successfully in other jurisdictions, the City decided to undertake a pilot to explore its merits.

The Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot and Interim Policy enables free-floating car-share vehicles to park in residential permit-parking areas of the city. An eighteen-month pilot

began on November 1, 2018 and will end April 30, 2020. Communauto FLEX has been the only car-share company to participate in the pilot.

After an analysis of the car-share vehicles' utilization data provided by Communauto FLEX, an assessment of the complaints received from residents during the pilot and confirmation of compliance with the rules set out in the Interim Free-Floating Policy, Transportation Services has concluded that the pilot has proven to be successful. Based on these findings, Transportation Services is recommending that the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot become a permanent program at the end of the pilot period, starting May 1, 2020. The following changes will need to be implemented to make it a permanent program:

- new Free-Floating Car-Share permit and re-issuance fees to be created;
- new offence created for exceeding the 48-hour parking limit, parking in waitlisted areas/streets, and failing to properly display free-floating car-share parking permit;
- new administrative penalties associated with the new offences;
- enhancements to the On-Street Permit Parking Application (OSPAA) to automate the process to issue free-floating car-share permits; and
- integration of the updated OSPAA with the Toronto Police - Parking Enforcement's Electronic Parking System (EPS) to facilitate enforcement of the offences.

In addition to the free-floating program, staff also examined opportunities to improve the existing on-street Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas (CVPA) program and options to improve off-street car-share availability, including:

- More expeditious approvals for CVPA.
- A future study with City Planning to assess the current state of car-share services in private developments and undertake a review of when and how to best secure car-share spaces through the Development Review Process.
- A commitment from the Toronto Parking Authority (TPA) to work with car-share companies to allocate designated areas in certain TPA lots for car-share vehicles to ensure more convenience for customers.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

The General Manager, Transportation Services recommends that:

1. City Council authorize that the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot be made a permanent program starting May 1, 2020.
2. City Council move the Free-Floating Car-Share requirements from City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking, to City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking, effective May 1, 2020.

3. City Council amend City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 441, Fees and Charges, to create a fee for the Free Floating Car-Share permit of \$1,565.90 per year, per car-share vehicle, effective May 1, 2020, adjusted yearly for inflation.
4. City Council amend City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 441, Fees and Charges, to create a re-issuance fee of \$34.13 per permit, effective May 1, 2020, adjusted yearly for inflation.
5. City Council amend City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking, to establish a new offence for parking any vehicle with a free-floating car-share permit for more than 48 hours in a permit parking area/street and establish an associated penalty amount of \$30.00, with an implementation date of May 1, 2020.
6. City Council amend City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking, to insert a definition for "free-floating car-share waitlisted area" and for "free-floating car-share waitlisted street", to establish a new offence for parking any vehicle with a free-floating car-share permit in a permit parking waitlisted area/street, and establish an associated penalty amount of \$30.00, with an implementation date of May 1, 2020.
7. City Council amend City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking, to establish an offence for failing to clearly display the free-floating car-share parking permit in the lower inside of the windshield on the driver's side of the car-share vehicle, and establish an associated penalty amount of \$30.00, with an implementation date of May 1, 2020.
8. City Council amend City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking, including the associated Schedules, to change the prohibition from parking or standing of an unauthorized vehicle in a designated car-share vehicle parking area (CVPA)(§950-400H) to prohibit the standing of an unauthorized vehicle in a CVPA.
9. City Council amend City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 610, Penalties, Administration of, City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking, and City of Toronto Municipal Code 950, Traffic and Parking, generally as outlined in Attachment 1 to the report (February 26, 2019) from the General Manager, Transportation Services.
10. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary bills to give effect to City Council's decision in items 1 to 9, inclusive, and City Council authorize the City Solicitor to make any necessary clarifications, refinements, minor modifications, technical amendments, or by-law amendments as may be identified by the City Solicitor or General Manager, Transportation Services, in order to give effect to the reasonable operation of the Free-Floating Car-Share Program.
11. City Council request the Toronto Parking Authority to explore the possibility of entering into business arrangements with car-share companies for utilization of parking facilities.
12. City Council request the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning Division in consultation with the General Manager, Transportation Services to further

assess how parking for car-share services should be accommodated as part of a broader strategic review of current parking policies.

13. City Council forward a copy of this report to the Toronto Police Services Board to engage the Toronto Police Service to work with Transportation Services in order to implement the new free-floating car-share offences and related system changes into the Parking Enforcement's Electronic Parking System.

## **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

---

The one time cost of enhancing and integrating the On-Street Permit Parking Application to implement the permanent Free-Floating Car-Share program is estimated to be \$300,000. Funding is available within the 2020 – 2029 Capital Budget and Plan for Transportation Services.

Future operating budget impacts of capital investments in the updated Permit Parking system (e.g., maintenance costs, etc.) will be assessed and included for consideration as part of future Operating Budget submissions for Technology Services, if required.

At 200 free-floating car-share permits, the City received approximately \$306,000 during the pilot period. The potential escalation in that number of up to 2,000 permits would generate a commensurate increase in permit revenue. The permit revenue will be monitored and any budget adjustments, if necessary, will be considered as part of the budget submission for Transportation Services during the 2021 budget process.

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

## **DECISION HISTORY**

---

City Council, at its meeting held on September 30 and October 1, 2009 adopted, as amended, Public Works and Infrastructure Committee Item PW26.3 entitled "Reserved On-Street Parking Spaces for Use by Car-Share Vehicles - Pilot Program in the Downtown Area (Sustainable Transportation Initiative)", establishing a pilot program for designating on-street spaces specifically for vehicles displaying car-share vehicle permits.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2009.PW26.3>

Toronto and East York Community Council, at its meeting of September 15th, 2009, established designated car-share vehicle parking areas on certain streets in the downtown area.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2009.TE27.84>

City Council, at its meeting of April 10 and 11, 2012, adopted an expansion of the pilot program to allow car-share parking within the city. This expansion established specified installation criteria, a tiered parking permit structure, and introduced new fees.  
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2012.PW13.4>

Public Works and Infrastructure Committee, at its meeting of June 18, 2014, considered a communication, "Pilot Project Investigating On-street Parking for Car-share Vehicles" (Item PW32.25) and requested Transportation Services to report in 2015 on a review of the Car-Share Vehicle Parking Area Program and on the feasibility of creating a pilot project allowing car-share vehicles to park in on-street permit parking areas with existing parking capacity.  
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.PW32.25>

Public Works and Infrastructure Committee, at its meeting of November 12, 2015, received a report, "Car-Share Parking in Permit Parking Areas" (Item PW9.10). Transportation Services is responding to a request from the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee regarding the feasibility of creating a pilot project to allow car-share vehicles to park in certain residential on-street permit-parking areas throughout the city where on-street parking exists.  
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.PW9.10>

Public Works and Infrastructure Committee, at its meeting of February 28, 2017, considered a letter from the Chair of the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee, "Car-sharing On-Street Policy and Pilot Project" (Item PW19.5), and requested that Transportation Services report in 2017 on a review of parking permit allocations, current car-share data, feasibility of a pilot project, impacts to residents and a comprehensive Free-Floating Car-Share Vehicle Policy.  
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.PW19.5>

City Council, at its meeting of October 2, 3 and 4, 2017, referred Item PW23.8 on "Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot and Interim Policy" to the General Manager, Transportation Services for further consideration and to report back to the January 31, February 1 and 2, 2018 City Council meeting.  
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.PW23.8>

City Council, at its meeting of January 31 and February 1, 2018, referred Item CC36.14 on "Revised Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot and Interim Policy" to the General Manager, Transportation Services for further consideration and to report back to the April 11, 2018 Public Works and Infrastructure Committee meeting.  
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.CC36.14>

City Council, at its meeting of April 24, 25, 26 and 27, 2018, adopted, as amended, the "Revised Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot and Interim Policy" (Item PW28.11).  
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.PW28.11>

City Council, at its meeting of May 22, 23, and 24, 2018, through Member Motion 41.54, directed the General Manager, Transportation Services, to further consult with the free-floating car-share industry and to report back directly to City Council if any changes are recommended to improve the pilot.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.MM41.54>

City Council, at its meeting of July 23, 24, 25, 26, 27 and 30, 2018, adopted, as amended, the "Update on Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot and Interim Policy" (Item CC44.33).

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.CC44.33>

## COMMENTS

---

### Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot

City Council at its meeting of April 24 to 27, 2018, adopted, as amended, Item PW28.11 titled "Revised Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot and Interim Policy." The pilot was further amended at the July 23, 24, 25, 26, 27 and 30, 2018 meeting of City Council when a follow-up report titled "Update on Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot and Interim Policy" (CC44.33) was adopted, as amended.

The main requirements of the pilot approved by Council were as follows:

- The pilot would run for an 18 month period.
- Free-Floating Car-Share Permits can be issued on an annual basis starting when the first car-share company joins the pilot.
- Up to 500 on-street permits can be issued to each car-share company for customers to park on permitted streets (for a maximum of 2,000 permits).
- A Free-Floating Car-Share permit fee would be set at \$1,531.11 plus HST (2019 rates) for each vehicle.
- Car-share companies must pay their outstanding fines or penalties before permits can be issued to them.
- A Free-Floating Car-Share Parking Permit must be clearly displayed in the lower inside of the windshield on the driver's side of the car. Six months after the commencement of the pilot, Community Council has the authority to add/remove and/or exclude a street and/or area from the pilot, after providing public notice.
- Conditions of Permit:  
*Excluded Areas* -
  - Streets and areas that are at 100 percent capacity or more for residential permit parking must be excluded from the car-share company's service area via geo-fencing within the respective car-share company's trip reservation system. A list of excluded streets/areas that are at 100 percent capacity or more for residential permit parking are to be provided by the City at the beginning of the permit period and updated every six months.

#### *48-Hour Parking Limit -*

- A car-share vehicle must not be parked in any one place for a period exceeding two (2) consecutive days.

#### *Clustering of Car-Share Vehicles -*

- No more than one car-share vehicle from the same company is allowed to park on a street block (i.e., a street block is defined as that physical portion of the road between two consecutive intersections) with residential permit parking for any length of time. The car-share company must move its vehicle(s) within two hours of a complaint.
- Car-share companies must provide, within 30 days after issuance of their first free-floating car-share parking permit and every three months thereafter, data related to the pilot, such as membership information, fleet usage and complaint information.

Following adoption of the pilot by Council in July 2018, the only car-share company operating a free-floating car-share model at that time, Car2Go, made a business decision to leave Toronto. The free-floating car-share pilot did not start until November 1, 2018, when the car-share company Communauto FLEX purchased its first permit. Currently, Communauto FLEX is the only car-share company participating in the pilot with approximately 200 permits and over 5,600 members registered. The pilot officially ends on April 30, 2020 after the eighteen-month period expires. The pilot program has been operating in parts or all of wards 3, 4, 5, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14 and 19.

### **Pilot Findings**

During the pilot period staff have been monitoring and examining vehicle usage data, considering any complaints/issues raised by residents, verifying whether vehicles have been complying with the Council approved conditions of the pilot, and reviewing survey results of members using the free-floating service. These are discussed in greater detail below.

#### *Data Analysis*

As a condition of the permit during the pilot, car-share companies were required to provide vehicle usage data to the City every three months. Table 1 below summarizes key performance indicators provided and calculated during the car-share pilot for the first 12 months of the pilot - the period between November 1, 2018 and October 31, 2019 from Communauto FLEX.

Table 1: Vehicle Usage

Item	2018		2019									
	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sept	Oct
No. of Cars	186	196	196	196	199	194	198	200	197	198	199	197
No. of Vehicle Trips	455	5,355	8,679	5,147	6,173	6,788	7,750	7,646	7,941	8,202	7,920	7,629
Active Members/ Day	65	108	165	125	136	162	177	189	191	200	199	194
Avg. Trip Duration (Minutes)	52	536	155	237	221	236	214	257	324	366	333	375
Avg. Trip Length (Km)	20	21	17	26	25	26	25	31	38	44	38	41
% of trips after which the Car was parked for 48 hrs or greater	39%	10%	4%	9%	8%	6.7%	4.0%	3.1%	2.3%	1.2%	1.5%	1.5%
Avg. Length of Time between two usages (night time included) (hours)	25.3	15.9	11.2	15.1	15.8	15.50	13.90	12.62	11.65	10.50	11.23	10.71

Since the launch of the pilot on November 1, 2018, the number, length and duration of trips have steadily increased. Similarly, the length of time that vehicles have remained idle for more than 48 hours and the average time that vehicles were idle between trips have decreased significantly. It should be noted that the significant increase in the number of trips in January 2019 is likely attributable to Communauto FLEX offering a number of promotions and incentives in December and January to attract new customers.



A detailed analysis was performed on the trip origin and destination data provided. Some of the results are as follows:

- The majority of car-share trips are reserved for short periods of time, with 56.5% being less than 30 minutes. However, the proportion of trip duration shows an increasing trend for longer trips.
- For day trips, the distance traveled by car-share vehicles are mostly short distance trips, with a median of 6 kilometres.
- The majority of longer trips (more than 1 day) typically occur on Fridays, Saturdays, and Sundays.

### *Waitlisted Areas and Streets*

For the purposes of the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot waitlisted areas or streets are where the number of residential on-street parking permits issued has reached the number of available parking spaces for the area or street or 100 percent capacity and were excluded from the pilot. The list of waitlisted areas and streets is updated every six (6) months, and is applicable at the start of the permit parking period, that being either June 1st or December 1st.

Of the 99 permit parking areas and 418 street-specific licenced streets in the city, 12 permit parking areas and 44 streets were not available for the service for the first six months of the pilot. For the next six months, the number of areas and streets, 15 and 48 respectively, shifted due to changing capacity and were removed from the service areas. In the first year of the pilot, the City received only one complaint related to a car-share vehicle parked in a waitlisted area. A review of the trip data provided by Communauto FLEX showed that very few trips ended in waitlisted areas and streets and the number reduced to zero within six weeks of the new waitlist coming into effect. This is likely due to the time it took the car-share company to revise their service area to exclude these waitlisted locations and their members to adapt to the change.

### *Complaints and Compliance with Pilot Conditions*

During the pilot, City staff monitored and addressed any complaints from residents who may have raised general concerns or observed parking violations. The City received a number of complaints and inquiries in the first few months of the pilot. Initially some residents were not aware of the pilot or its terms and conditions. The initial complaints received were mainly regarding the car-share company not complying with the two main requirements of the permit during the pilot, namely the 48-hour parking limit and clustering. Other complaints included parking in waitlisted areas, lack of options for parking in Green P lots and other general comments.

To address and reduce the types of complaints being received, City staff worked with Communauto FLEX to find solutions to improve their service. For instance, to address concerns about car-sharing vehicles being parked at the same location for over 48-hours, the following measures were implemented:

- More staff were hired by Communauto FLEX to move/relocate the car-share vehicles;

- New features were added to the Communauto FLEX system to track complaints and to flag vehicles parked too long at the same location; and
- New promotions/incentives were introduced to increase vehicle usage.

Table 2 below summarizes the number of complaints received during the first year of the pilot. The numbers clearly show that complaints decreased significantly as the pilot progressed and in large part to the new measures put in place by Communauto FLEX.

Table 2: Number of Complaints

Complaint Type	2018	2019										Total
	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sept	Oct	
<b>48-Hour Limit Exceeded</b>	5	2	10	3	9	8	2	0	0	0	2	<b>41</b>
<b>48-Hour Limit Exceeded and Clustering</b>	0	1	2	1	4	7	0	0	0	0	0	<b>15</b>
<b>Clustering</b>	1	0	2	0	2	3	0	0	1	0	3	<b>12</b>
<b>Other Complaints</b>	0	0	0	0	1	3	1	0	0	0	0	<b>5</b>
<b>Total</b>	6	3	14	6	18	21	3	1	1	0	5	<b>73</b>

Note: "Other Complaints" include parking in waitlisted areas, lack of options for parking in Green P lots and other general comments about the pilot

### *Enforcement*

Free-floating car-share users must abide by all parking regulations as any other motorist, the only exceptions being the citywide three-hour parking limit within permit parking areas and the overnight parking prohibition during permit parking hours.

Should the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot be made permanent, a couple of new offence categories will need to be created and administrative penalties established in the Municipal Code for these new infractions.

In order to guard against potential illegal clustering, Communauto FLEX has indicated that they will enhance their reservation system so that prior to a customer ending their trip, the system will notify the customer if they are parking on a street block where another car-share vehicle exists and will be directed to park on another block. Given this approach, the clustering issue will be automatically corrected through the car-share company's reservation system.

## Survey Results

One of the requirements of the pilot was for the car-share companies to conduct a survey of their members regarding travel behaviour, vehicle ownership, and car-sharing use. Communauto FLEX conducted a survey of its members in April 2019 and had 500 responses from 3,000 registered members at the time. Those survey results are summarized below:

- Over 70% of respondents were already members of other car-share services.
- Over 76% find free-floating car-share more convenient than other car-share models (i.e., CVPA).
- 82% of respondents do not own a vehicle.
- Approximately 20% of respondents report that they did away with a vehicle, 37% decided to forgo the purchase of a vehicle, and 8% delayed the purchase of a vehicle since subscribing to Communauto FLEX services.
- Over 80% live in a permit parking area and 89% of those respondents did not have a permit.

## Conclusion

During the course of the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot a number of lessons were learned and improvements introduced by Communauto FLEX to ensure that the City's terms and conditions were met. Transportation Services is recommending that the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot be made a permanent program to provide another car-share model option which can operate in a regulated manner in the City, and provide potential benefits to individuals / businesses, to our environment, communities and transportation network.

## Next Step in Making the Free-Floating Car-Share Program Permanent

Should the Free-Floating Car-Share Pilot be approved as a permanent program, a number of Municipal Code changes will need to be introduced, which are generally detailed below and in Attachment 1. In addition, many of the original conditions of the pilot, such as the total number of permits issued and number of allowable permits to be issued per car-share company is proposed to remain the same (i.e., 2000 permits in total, 500 maximum per car-share company), and car-share companies will be expected to provide car-share data every three months related to their membership information, fleet usage and complaint information as a condition of their permits.

*Move Free- Floating Car-Share Requirements from Municipal Code Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking, to Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking*

Because the Free-Floating Car-Share program is connected to the residential on-street permit parking program, it is recommended that all sections related to the Free-Floating Car-Share program currently contained in Municipal Code Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking, be moved to Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking.

### *New Free-Floating Car-Share Permit Fee*

The equivalent of the "Car Share Vehicle Parking Area - Tier 2 Permit - spaces replaced on a street residential permit parking", as modified to include the inflation adjustment given that the fee for Free-Floating Car-Share would be in effect in 2020, will be used as the permit fee amount for Free-Floating Car-Share program, which is consistent with what was used for the pilot and in line with fixed fee structures in other municipalities. At 200 Free-Floating Car-Share permits, the City received approximately \$306,000.00 during the pilot period. A potential escalation in that number up to 2,000 permits would generate a commensurate increase in permit revenue. The current 2019 Free-Floating Car-Share permit rate used for the pilot is \$1,531.44 plus taxes. Adjusted for inflation and given implementation in May 2020, the fee for the Free-Floating Car-Share permit in 2020 will be \$1,565.90 plus taxes, and will be adjusted yearly for inflation.

A re-issuance fee of \$34.13 plus taxes (2020 rate) per permit will also be established as a replacement of a lost or damaged free-floating car-share parking permit and when there is a change of vehicle and/or licence plate. This re-issuance fee is also based on the Car Share Vehicle Parking Area re-issuance fee amount used for the pilot, albeit adjusted for inflation given that it would be effective in May 2020, which is currently \$33.38. This fee will also be adjusted yearly for inflation.

Amendments to Municipal Code Chapter 441, Fees and Charges, Appendix C, Schedule 2 will be required to add the fees for the Free-Floating Car-Share program. The detailed Municipal Code changes are included in Attachment 1 of this report.

### *New Parking Offences*

In order to enforce some of the program parking requirements, the following parking offences, established as part of the pilot, will need to be created in Municipal Code Chapter 925, Permit Parking, and associated administrative penalties established in Municipal Code Chapter 610, Penalties, Administration of - Schedule A Table 9. These offences should carry an administrative penalty of \$30.00 which is consistent with other minor parking infractions. The detailed Municipal Code changes are included in Attachment 1 of this report.

- No car-share vehicle with a free-floating car-share permit is allowed to park for more than 48 hours in a permit parking area or street.
- No car-share vehicle with a free-floating car-share permit is allowed to park in a permit parking waitlisted area or street (i.e., areas/streets at 100% capacity).
- Wherever a motor vehicle is parked in accordance with a free-floating car-share parking permit, the permit shall be clearly displayed in the lower inside windshield on the driver's side of the car-share vehicle.

Enforcement will be done on a complaint basis through either an online request ([https://www.torontopolice.on.ca/core/immediate\\_parking\\_complaint.php](https://www.torontopolice.on.ca/core/immediate_parking_complaint.php)) or via the police non-emergency phone number (416-808-2222).

### *Improvement to Permit Parking Application*

Transportation Services' On-Street Permit Parking Application (OSPPA) will need to be enhanced to create a free-floating car-share permit module to manage these new types of permits, which are currently being done manually for the pilot. This new module will also need to be integrated with Toronto Police Service Parking Enforcement Unit's Electronic Parking System (EPS), so that free-floating permit information can be transferred to EPS. The one time cost for enhancing and integrating the OSPPA is expected to be approximately \$300,000.00.

### **Improvement to Other Car-Share Initiatives**

City Council requested the General Manager, Transportation Services to propose "recommendations to improve car-share policies and regulations in the City as they relate to various car-share operating models." Different car-share initiatives in the City were reviewed and are described in the sections below, along with the proposed next steps to improve these initiatives.

#### *Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas (CVPAs)*

The Permit Parking office in Transportation Services oversees the management of the Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas (CVPA) program since its creation in 2009. It consists of delineating on-street car-share vehicle parking areas (CVPAs) for the exclusive use of car-share companies. There are currently 43 CVPAs in the City for a total of 84 spaces. A maximum of 40 additional spaces can be approved annually. Typically between 8 and 15 spaces are approved each year, never reaching the maximum allowance.

Under the current CVPA program, car-share companies must obtain the Ward Councillor's support in writing prior to submitting an application to the Permit Parking office. Applications are accepted once a year. After applications are submitted, they are sent to Traffic Operations staff for a technical evaluation. This process can be lengthy at times due to staff workload. To address this concern, Transportation Services has identified some internal process changes which will expedite approvals. Timelines will be compressed to approximately three months (i.e., a third of the time) from the time Transportation Services receives a car-share company's application and final approval received through the Community Councils.

Another concern raised with regards to the CVPA program is that car-share vehicles often receive parking tickets for parking outside the designated CVPA spots. This is because other unauthorized vehicles often occupy these designated spaces, causing car-share members to park just outside these designated spots and leading to parking infractions.

With a view to resolving this issue, Transportation Services is recommending that the current provision in Municipal Code Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking, that prohibits the parking or standing of an unauthorized vehicle in a designated CVPA be amended to only prohibit the standing of an unauthorized vehicle in a CVPA. This change will enable Parking Enforcement officers to tow any unauthorized vehicles parked in these areas,

which will ensure car-share customers have an available spot to park their vehicle at the end of their trip.

### *Accommodating Car-Share Parking in New Development*

There are currently no car-share regulations in the general part of the city-wide Zoning By-law 569-2013. Car-share in new developments is generally dealt with on a site-by-site basis, recorded in Chapter 900 Site Specific Exceptions of By-law 569-2013. These site-specific zoning by-law amendments usually includes a parking rate reduction formula. The formula was developed as part of the "Parking Standards Review: Examination of Potential Options and Impacts of Car Share Programs on Parking Standards" report (IBI, March 2009), and was based on a very small sample size. This is all that was available at the time, since car-share was a relatively new concept in Toronto. In order to confirm the provision of car-share spaces for zoning compliance, a letter from a car-share company committing to car-share services in the development must be submitted prior to approval for condominium registration. However at this stage, the development is already constructed which leaves little room for adjustments.

City staff have identified that the current approach is problematic because once the reduced rate is accepted, if a car-share provider is not secured or if the car-share provider ceases to operate the spaces, the development would be in non-compliance with the Zoning By-law, and there would likely be no opportunity to retroactively provide additional parking spaces in most already-constructed developments.

Car-share companies have also expressed concerns regarding the current approach. In some private residential developments, it is difficult for members of the public to access car-share spaces, potentially making the car-share operation not viable for the car-share companies. This assumes, however, that car-share spaces being required in residential developments should be available to both residents and members of the public. In addition, since the car-share formula is approved at the rezoning stage prior to a car-share operator being secured, the number of spaces approved may be higher than the demand for car-share in the area, particularly since it is possible that the analysis would not have considered other car-share spaces available in the vicinity.

In the short term, as part of the site-plan review process, Transportations Services' Development Planning and Review staff will focus on the possibility of locating car-share spaces in parts of the site that are accessible and visible to non-residents.

In the future, Transportation Planning of City Planning, in consultation with Transportation Services will conduct a review of how parking for car-share has been accommodated within private developments since the 2009 report.

The review will take place in the context of a strategic review of parking policies and the role that car-share services play in Toronto's transportation network.

One outcome of the review will be an evaluation of the current formula used for the reduction of required parking spaces in return for the provision of car-share spaces. Such a review would also consider if, when and how to best secure car-share spaces in

the Development Review Process, as well as if and how car-share spaces in private residential developments should be made accessible to the public.

### *Toronto Parking Authority - Green P Lots*

Toronto Parking Authority (TPA) operates off-street parking facilities at 307 locations (Green P lots) and has been working with car-share companies for a number of years to accommodate car-share vehicles in Green P lots. Although there is currently no existing arrangement for designated car-share parking spaces at any of the Green P lots, TPA does accommodate car-share companies in non-parking areas (i.e., unused spaces) in certain Green P lots. These spaces are not standard sized parking stalls, but are large enough to fit compact and mid-sized vehicles. Car-share companies that wish to use Green P lots must pay per use, similar to the general public.

The TPA has been consulted, is committed to working with car-share companies and has agreed to explore the following:

- to offer spaces in non-parking areas on a first come first serve basis;
- to work to find space if a specific area of the City is of interest;
- charge car-share companies an applicable monthly permit fee;
- request that car-share companies pay for directional signage installed by the TPA; and
- bring forward a report if any by-law amendments or authorities are required.

## CONTACT

---

Nazzareno A. Capano, P.Eng.  
Manager, Transportation Policy & Innovation  
Transportation Services  
Tel. (416) 392-7766  
[Nazzareno.Capano@toronto.ca](mailto:Nazzareno.Capano@toronto.ca)

Elyse Parker  
Director, Policy & Innovation  
Transportation Services  
Tel. (416) 338-2432  
[Elyse.Parker@toronto.ca](mailto:Elyse.Parker@toronto.ca)

## SIGNATURE

---

Barbara Gray  
General Manager, Transportation Services

## ATTACHMENT

---

Attachment 1 - Municipal Code Amendments

# Attachment 1 - Municipal Code Amendments

## AMENDMENTS TO MUNICIPAL CODE CHAPTER 441, FEES AND CHARGES (To be effective May 1, 2020)

Addition to Appendix C - Schedule 2, Transportation Services

Ref. No.	I Service	II Fee Description	III Category	IV Fee Basis	V Fee	VI Annual Adj.
119.6	Parking Permits	Free-Floating Car-Share Permit	City Policy	Per car-share vehicle	\$1,565.90	Yes
119.7	Parking Permits	Free-Floating Car-Share Permit - Re-issuance Fee	City Policy	Per permit	\$34.13	Yes

## AMENDMENTS TO MUNICIPAL CODE CHAPTER 610, PENALTIES, ADMINISTRATION OF

### 1. Changes to be effective May 1, 2020:

Addition to Schedule A, Table 9: Chapter 925, Permit Parking:

Column 1 Designated Part of Chapter	Column 2 Short Form Wording	Column 3 Penalty Amount
§ 925-5.1(6)(a)	Park - Free-Floating Car-Share Vehicle in Free-Floating Car-Share Waitlisted Area	\$30.00
§ 925-5.1(6)(a)	Park - Free-Floating Car-Share Vehicle on Free-Floating Car-Share Waitlisted Street	\$30.00
§ 925-5.1(6)(b)	Park – Free-Floating Car-Share Vehicle Longer than 48 Hours	\$30.00
§ 925-5.1(6)(c)	Park - Fail to Properly Display Free-Floating Car-Share Parking Permit	\$30.00



**2. Other Amendments:**

Deletion from Schedule A, Table 10: Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking:

Column 1 Designated Part of Chapter	Column 2 Short Form Wording	Column 3 Penalty Amount
§ 950-400H	(Park/Stand) Unauthorized Vehicle in Car-Share Vehicle Parking Area	\$60.00
§ 950-400H	(Park/Stand) Car-Share Vehicle - Parking Permit not properly affixed	\$60.00

Addition to Schedule A, Table 10: Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking

Column 1 Designated Part of Chapter	Column 2 Short Form Wording	Column 3 Penalty Amount
§ 950-400H	Stand Unauthorized Vehicle in Car-Share Vehicle Parking Area	\$60.00
§ 950-400H	Stand Car-Share Vehicle - Parking Permit not properly affixed	\$60.00

**AMENDMENTS TO MUNICIPAL CODE CHAPTER 925, PERMIT PARKING  
(To be effective May 1, 2020)**

A. Delete the definition of "Free-Floating Car-Share Parking Permit" from § 925-1B and insert in alphabetical order the following new definitions in § 925-1B:

**CAR-SHARING** - A shared use vehicle program offering short-term rental service of motor vehicles owned by a car-share organization/company to individuals or businesses who are members.

**CAR-SHARE ORGANIZATION/COMPANY** - An organization or company that provides pre-approved members with access to a car-share vehicle which is parked for convenient access at geographically distributed locations throughout the City for the payment of a fee that includes the cost of fuel, maintenance and insurance.

**CAR-SHARE VEHICLE** - A shared use vehicle bearing an up-to-date licence plate validation sticker and belonging to a car-share organization/company, identified with the organization/company's business logo on the body of the vehicle and provided for short-term rental by members of the car-share organization/company.

**FREE-FLOATING CAR-SHARE PARKING PERMIT** - A permit issued by the General Manager under this chapter authorizing parking of a particular car-share vehicle in locations designated for permit parking under this chapter, excluding residential permit parking locations that are in a free-floating car-share waitlisted area or on a free-floating car-share waitlisted street or streets that have been otherwise excluded from parking by free-floating car-share permit holders under Schedule C to this chapter.

**FREE-FLOATING CAR-SHARE WAITLISTED AREA** - an area where residential parking permit issuance has reached 100% capacity at the start of the applicable permit parking period for residential permit parking permits, that being either June 1st or December 1st.

**FREE-FLOATING CAR-SHARE WAITLISTED STREET** - a street where residential parking permit issuance has reached 100% capacity at the start of the applicable permit parking period for residential permit parking permits, that being either June 1st or December 1st.

B. Delete from § 925-5N(1.1) the phrase: "is not at or above 100 percent capacity" and insert the phrase: "is not a free-floating car-share waitlisted area or a free-floating car-share waitlisted street".

C. Insert a new §925-5.1 as follows:

§ 925-5.1. Free-floating car-share parking permits.

(1) Applications.

(a) A car-share organization/company may submit an application to the General Manager for one or more free-floating car-share parking permits in accordance with this section.

(b) No more than 500 car-share vehicles per application is permitted.

(c) Despite § 925-5B, applications for free-floating car-share parking permits by a car-share organization/company for car-share vehicles shall contain the following:

(i) Name, address and telephone number of the car-share organization/company; and

(ii) A list of the valid license plate numbers and up-to-date Ontario validation sticker information for each car-share vehicle which is the subject of the application.

(d) Despite § 925-4D(1), applications for free-floating car-share parking permits shall only be accepted where all of the car-share vehicles that are the subject of the application are passenger motor vehicles which each have a registered gross weight of no more than 3,000 kilograms.

(2) Term and Maximum Number of Permits

(a) All free-floating car-share parking permits issued in accordance with § 925-5.1 shall be valid for a term of no more than 12 months.

- (b) A free-floating car-share parking permit may be issued only to a car-share organization/company and only for one car-share vehicle where the requirements of § 925-5.1(1) are complied with. Where an application under § 925-5.1(1) was submitted for more than one car-share vehicle, each car-share vehicle that was the subject of the application may be issued a free-floating car-share parking permit where the requirements of § 925-5.1(1) are complied with.
- (c) A free-floating car-share parking permit, when issued, is only valid for the particular car-share vehicle identified on the free-floating car-share parking permit.
- (d) A free-floating car-share parking permit is non-transferrable.
- (e) The total number of free-floating car-share parking permits issued by the General Manager under this chapter per car-share organization/company shall not exceed 500 free-floating car-share parking permits for any given time.
- (f) The total number of free-floating car-share parking permits issued by the General Manager under this chapter shall not exceed 2,000 for any given time.
- (g) A free-floating car-share parking permit may only be issued to a car-share organization/company for the term described in § 925-5.1(2)(a) where the car-share organization/company has paid their parking fines and penalties prior to the issuance of the free-floating car-share permit.
- (h) Sections 925-5E, F, G, H, I, J, K, M, and M.1 do not apply to free-floating car-share parking permits.

### (3) Termination.

- (a) Despite § 925-5.1(2)(a), the General Manager may terminate any free-floating car-share parking permit at any time if the permit holder fails to comply or ensure compliance with any of the conditions under § 925-5.1(6).
- (b) Despite § 925-5.1(2)(a), in addition to § 925-5.1(3)(a), the General Manager may terminate any free-floating car-share permit for any reason at any time.

### (4) Fees.

- (a) The car-share organization/company, upon the approval of a free-floating car-share parking permit application, shall pay to the City of Toronto the Free-Floating Car-Share Permit fee as set out in Chapter 441, Fees and Charges.
- (b) The Free-Floating Car-Share Permit fee is non-refundable unless the permit associated with the fee is terminated under § 925-5.1(3)(b).
- (c) The fee for a re-issuance of a lost or damaged free-floating car-share parking permit or when there is a change of vehicle and/or licence plate, shall be the fee as set out in Chapter 441, Fees and Charges, for Free-Floating Car-Share Permit - Re-issuance Fee.

### (5) Refunds.

- (a) In the event that the General Manager terminates a free-floating car-share parking permit under § 925-5.1(3)(b), the General Manager may issue a refund of a pro-rated portion of the free-floating car-share parking permit fee to the permit holder for any unused days remaining in the free-floating car-share parking permit term, with the number of unused days being calculated as the number of days from and including the date the free-floating car-share parking permit was terminated under § 925-5.1(3)(b) to the end of the permit term.

(b) The General Manager shall not refund the free-floating car-share parking permit fee for a free-floating car-share permit revoked or cancelled under § 925-5.1(3)(a).

(6) Conditions of permit.

(a) Despite § 925-5N(3) and despite having a free-floating car-share parking permit, no person shall park a car-share vehicle for which a free-floating car-share parking permit has been issued continuously in any one place for a period exceeding 48 consecutive hours.

(b) Despite § 925-5N(4), whenever a car-share vehicle for which a free-floating car-share parking permit has been issued is parked in accordance with the conditions in this § 925-5.1(6), the free-floating car-share parking permit shall be clearly displayed in the lower inside of the windshield on the driver's side of the car-share vehicle.

(c) Clustering

[1] For the purposes of this § 925-5.1(6), "Clustering" will be defined as more than one car-share vehicle from the same car-share organization/company being parked on the same City street block for any length of time; and a "street block" is defined as that physical portion of the road between two consecutive intersections".

[2] No car-share vehicle shall be parked as to cause clustering on a City street block.

[3] Where a car-share organization/company becomes aware of its car-share vehicles clustering, the car-share organization/company shall move its car-share vehicle(s) within two hours to location(s) which do not result in clustering and shall ensure its car-share vehicles are moved and parked in accordance with all applicable parking regulations.

[4] Where a car-share organization/company becomes aware of its vehicles clustering, the car-share organization/company shall move its car-share vehicle(s) in accordance with Subsection (c)[3] or within two hours of receipt of notification from the City or a resident.

(d) Data requirements

[1] Any car-share organization/company to which a free-floating car-share parking permit has been issued shall provide the General Manager, within 30 days after issuance of their free-floating car-share parking permit and every three months thereafter for the term of any free-floating car-share parking permit issued to the car-share organization/company, the following information to the satisfaction of the General Manager:

[a] Geographical distributions of membership of the car-share organization/company, including the number of members for the car-share organization/company who reside/are located in each City ward and each permit parking area as defined in this chapter;

[b] Total number of car-share members registered in the City for the car-share organization/company;

- [c] Number of car-share vehicles in the fleet for the car-share organization/company in the City;
  - [d] Fleet usage data for the car-share vehicles in the fleet for the car-share organization/company in the City, including the percentage of time car-share vehicles were used by members or customers during the preceding three months;
  - [e] The date, time, and location of the start and end of all car-share vehicle trips for each car-share vehicle of the car-share organization/company in the City for the preceding three months, as well as the vehicle kilometres travelled (VKT) for each car-share vehicle trip for each car-share vehicle of the car-share organization/company in the City for the preceding three months;
  - [f] Average number of unique users for each car-share vehicle of the car-share organization/company in the City for each of the preceding three months (i.e., user frequency); and
  - [g] Log of all complaints received by the car-share organization/company regarding car-share vehicle parking locations in the City for the preceding three months, including:
    - a. The time and date each complaint was received by the car-share organization/company;
    - b. The time and date the car-share organization/company dispatched staff to address the complaint;
    - c. The time and date the car-share vehicle of the car-share organization/company was moved from the location of the complaint; and
    - d. The location of the parked car-share vehicle which is the cause of each complaint.
- [2] Any car-share organization/company to which a free-floating car-share parking permit has been issued shall conduct a member survey about travel behavior, vehicle ownership, and car-sharing use within 30 days after issuance of their free-floating car-share permit and within 30 days after the end of the permit term. The survey questions shall be approved by the City prior to being released to the members of its car-share company, and the General Manager shall be provided with the results of the survey within 30 days of the survey being conducted by the car-share company.
- [3] The General Manager will provide data collected from free-floating car-share companies on the City of Toronto Open Data Portal within 30 days of receiving it

D. Amend each of § 925-6B and § 925-6C by deleting the word "or" where it appears between "925-5N(5)(a)" and "925-5N(5)(b)" and by inserting the following after "925-5N(5)(b)": "925-5.1(6)(a), 925-5.1(6)(b) or 925-5.1(6)(c)".

## AMENDMENTS TO MUNICIPAL CODE CHAPTER 950, TRAFFIC AND PARKING

### 1. Amendments to be effective May 1, 2020:

A. Delete the definition of "Free-Floating Car-Share Parking Permit" from § 950-101B; and insert the following new definitions in alphabetical order in § 950-101B:

**FREE-FLOATING CAR-SHARE PARKING PERMIT** - A permit issued by the General Manager pursuant to Chapter 925, Permit Parking, authorizing parking of a particular car-share vehicle in locations designated for permit parking under Chapter 925, excluding residential permit parking locations that are in a free-floating car-share waitlisted area or on a free-floating car-share waitlisted street or streets that have been otherwise excluded from parking by free-floating car-share permit holders under Schedule C to Chapter 925.

**FREE-FLOATING CAR-SHARE WAITLISTED AREA** - an area where residential parking permit issuance has reached 100% capacity at the start of the applicable permit parking period for residential permit parking permits, that being either June 1st or December 1st.

**FREE-FLOATING CAR-SHARE WAITLISTED STREET** - a street where residential parking permit issuance has reached 100% capacity at the start of the applicable permit parking period for residential permit parking permits, that being either June 1st or December 1st.

B. Delete § 950-400D(5)(b) and replace with the following new § 950-400D(5)(b):

(b) Subsection D(5) does not apply to a car-share vehicle with a valid free-floating car-share parking permit parked in a location designated for permit parking under Chapter 925, Permit Parking, which is not in a free-floating car-share waitlisted area or on a free-floating car-share waitlisted street and/or which has not been otherwise excluded from parking by free-floating car-share permit holders under Schedule C of Chapter 925, Permit Parking.

C. Delete § 950-510C.

2. Delete the phrase "park or" from § 950-400H.