



IE17.6

Attachment 6

Request to Prequalify No. 1205-17-5043

for

**ADAPTIVE TRAFFIC SIGNAL TECHNOLOGY THROUGH A
PILOT DEPLOYMENT**

FAIRNESS MONITOR

FINAL ATTEST REPORT

Project:	RTP No. 1205-17-5043 for Adaptive Traffic Signal Technology through a Pilot Deployment
Report Stage:	FINAL Attest Report
Date of submission:	February 11, 2020 (Revised Feb 12, 2020)
Submitted to:	Carmen Lam, City of Toronto, Transportation Services Richard Hampton, City of Toronto, PMMD



1. INTRODUCTION

BDO Canada LLP (BDO) was engaged by the City of Toronto to provide independent oversight throughout its procurement process to select a preferred provider of **Adaptive Traffic Signal Technology**.

The procurement process is comprised of two stages:

- Stage 1 is RTP No. 1205-17-5043 to prequalify providers of Adaptive Traffic Control Technology through a Pilot Deployment, which consisted of both evaluation of proposals and a subsequent pilot deployment. The objective of Stage 1 was to prequalify up to three (3) providers following the pilot evaluation.
- Stage 2: Issue an RFP to identify a recommended provider of Adaptive Traffic Signal Technology, which is not underway at the date of this report.

BDO participated as Fairness Monitor for Stage 1. Accordingly, the scope of this Final Attest report is limited to Stage 1. We hereby submit our Final Report covering the activities and monitored observations of the Fairness Monitor.

This report includes our attestation of assurance, a summary of the scope and objectives of our assignment, and relevant observations from the activities undertaken.

BDO is an independent third party with respect to this RTP and has no conflict of interest. We reviewed the information provided to us by the City of Toronto, Transportation Services and observed relevant activities as described herein in accordance with our mandate.

2. SUMMARY OF OBSERVATIONS AND ACTIVITIES

BDO participated in all steps of Stage 1 which led to the identification of a preferred proponent.

The City of Toronto's Purchasing and Materials Management (PMMD) team managed the RTP procurement process, which was conducted in 4 steps.

- Step 1: Screening of Mandatory Requirements;
- Step 2: Evaluation of proposals including interviews and demonstrations to prequalify solutions providers to proceed to a Pilot Deployment;
- Step 3: Conduct Pilot deployment; and
- Step 4: Evaluate Pilot Deployment. Note: In consultation with PMMD, City of Toronto Transportation Services engaged a consulting firm HDR to assist with an independent evaluation of two prequalified solutions.



In accordance with the City's requirements the following chart summarizes BDO's involvement and findings throughout this project:

Step	Task	Fair (Yes/No)
1-4	BDO Canada LLP participated in the validation of the procurement process and all mandatory submission requirements, and provided oversight during Stage 1, the evaluation of Proposals to prequalify providers of Adaptive Traffic Control Technology through a Pilot Deployment ;	Yes
1-4	Attended Selection Committee evaluation sessions;	Yes
1-4	Ensured that the procurement management team, evaluation team members and other stakeholders understand ongoing confidentiality responsibilities post-selection committee recommendation;	Yes
1-4	Reviewed evaluation results: and	Yes
1-4	Ensured that evaluation scores are accurate and the documented methodology was adhered to.	Yes

BDO observed and participated in the validation of the procurement process and all mandatory submission requirements, and provided oversight during the evaluation of Proposals through to the conclusion of Stage 1 of the project. The same evaluation team was used throughout the project. The evaluators declared no conflicts of interest with the Proponents.

The evaluation process and criteria described in the procurement documents were applied consistently and equitably. The evaluation team consisted of evaluators from Transportation Services, bringing a level of expertise required to evaluate the Proposals accurately. Evaluators were able to achieve consensus on the scoring and each evaluator signed-off on the evaluation summary. There were no unresolved issues at the conclusion of each observed stage of this procurement.



3. RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTIONS TAKEN

At Step 4 - Pilot Evaluation, there was discussion amongst the evaluators on how to apply the City's General Guide to Assign Marks (the "Guide"). According to the Guide a proposal that "Meets all expectations and needs of the City" should be assigned a score of 70%. This is incongruent with the stated threshold within the RTP wherein 80% was required for a proponent to remain in the competition.

The Guide provides for three higher degrees, and a scoring gap of 30%, above "Meets all expectations and needs of the City" which, in BDO's opinion, is excessive and bears the risk of introducing avoidable subjectivity to the evaluation process potentially eroding the City's ability to defend a score in the event of a challenge.

The evaluation committee successfully addressed this incongruity by recalibrating the scoring table such that a proposal that met all expectations and needs was assigned a score of 80% enabling the proponent to remain in the competition.



4. CONCLUSION

BDO Canada LLP certifies that the principles of openness, fairness, consistency and transparency that we observed have been, in our opinion, properly established and maintained throughout the project.

These findings are based on material provided to BDO and BDO as witness to the process. The evaluation process and criteria described in the procurement documents appear to have been applied consistently and equitably. Results documents, including the individual and consensus scoring, demonstrated that the evaluators had been diligent in their responsibilities, that they were able to support their individual evaluation assessments and that they held no bias for or against any Proponent. There were no unresolved issues at the end of Stage 1.

As the Fairness Monitor for the **City of Toronto Adaptive Traffic Control Solution through a Pilot Deployment (RTP No. 1205-17-5043)** it is our professional opinion that the principles of openness, fairness and transparency have been, in our opinion, properly established and maintained throughout the Request to Prequalify processes. Furthermore, we were not made aware of any issues that emerged during the process that would impair the fairness of this initiative.

As of the date of this report, there have been no requests from proponents for debriefs.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'S. Whittaker', written over a horizontal line.

Stephen Whittaker
Fairness Monitor

February 12, 2020
Dated