

# PA13.1 Appendix G

## APPENDIX G: IN-CAMERA BOARD MEMORANDUM DATED SEPTEMBER 10, 2015 - MINUTE NUMBER 15-146 (AUTHORIZED BY PUBLIC RELEASE BY THE ACTING PRESIDENT, TORONTO PARKING AUTHORITY, ON JANUARY 27, 2020)



### BOARD MEMORANDUM IN-CAMERA

**5.6**

TO: Lorne Persiko FILE NO: 6190-00  
FROM: Marie Casista DATE: September 10, 2015  
SUBJECT: BIKE SHARE TORONTO  
Market Feasibility Study

**MEETING DATE:** Thursday, September 17, 2015

**RECOMMENDATION:**

It is recommended that the Board of Directors of the Toronto Parking Authority (the "TPA") approve the proposal from MMM Group Limited dated August 17, 2015 to complete a Bike Share Feasibility Study for the expansion of the Bike Share, Toronto system for a fee not to exceed \$45,000 plus disbursements and taxes under the terms outlined herein.

MEETING	MINUTE
Sept. 17 / 2015	15-146
Approved	<i>[Signature]</i>

**Purpose:**

The purpose of this report is to obtain TPA Board approval to engage MMM Group Limited to prepare a Bike Share Feasibility Study for the Expansion of Bike Share, Toronto in the Toronto market area. The consulting report will establish parameters and guide the expansion of the system over the next five (5) years. Important considerations include:

- i) The system's coverage area (assuming a 5,000 bike system within the next five (5) years;
- ii) Appropriate station densities given growth corridors and area demographics;
- iii) Station design and placement efficiencies; and,
- iv) Five (5) year implementation schedule.

**Background:**

The existing Bike Share, Toronto system was launched May 1, 2011 and contains approximately 1,000 bikes, 81 payment stations and 1,500 docks. Over the last four (4) years it has grown in popularity and usage despite its slow start due to, among other factors, the bankruptcy of the equipment supplier and operator. In April 2014 we engaged Alta (now Motivate) to manage the operations of the bike share system in a professional, first class manner. In the fall of 2014, we obtained sponsorship funding from TD Bank. The system is now financially sustainable from an operational perspective.

In the spring of 2015, Metrolinx became a capital partner of Bike Share, Toronto and invested \$4.9 million to expand the system. This capital funding, combined with over \$2.6 million in reserve accounts with the City of Toronto for bike share expansion, well-positions the system to fund an expansion program. We have recently issued an RFP for new equipment to major suppliers located throughout North America and Europe. This RFP closes September 17, 2015. We will report on the

results of this RFP shortly. It is important to note that the existing system is no longer manufactured and, as such, a component of the RFP includes either the replacement of the existing system or integrating the existing system with the proposed new equipment. In order to be fair to all respondents, we have requested a purchase price (or value) for the existing system to be included in each response.

In order to optimally layout the expansion system and its timing, requests for a Bike Share Feasibility Study were sent out to nine (9) consulting firms across North America who are knowledgeable about bike share systems and transportation networks. Each proponent was requested to provide a single fixed price to complete the consulting assignment. Five (5) consulting firms responded as summarized in the table below.

1. Alta Planning + Design, Portland Oregon	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Remaining market research group after operating division sold to Motivate</li> <li>• Lead by Michael Jones</li> <li>• Completed 7 major studies since 2010, largely in US cities</li> <li>• Initially audited the Bike Share Toronto system prior to assuming operations in 2013</li> <li>• Approximately 10 weeks to complete</li> <li>• Fee: \$35,000 US before disbursements and taxes but it includes a one-day trip to Toronto</li> </ul>
2. Foursquare Integrated Transportation Planning, Rockville Maryland	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 18 person multi-modal transportation planning firm</li> <li>• Founded in 2009 by Lora B. Byala (President)</li> <li>• Experience with bike share operations primarily in the NE United States</li> <li>• Also experienced with public transit and design</li> <li>• Approximately 14 weeks to complete</li> <li>• Fee: \$46,516 (CDN) before disbursement and taxes</li> </ul>
3. MMM Group Limited, Toronto Ontario	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Large multi-divisional engineering and planning consulting firm</li> <li>• Team lead: Dave McLaughlin, Project Manager: Jay Cranstone</li> <li>• Experience with over 20 regional studies relating to bike mobility</li> <li>• Bike share feasibility studies in Ottawa, GTA and Hamilton</li> <li>• Local, therefore likely more knowledgeable about vagaries in Toronto sub-markets</li> <li>• Experienced with 3P's, municipal and provincial governments</li> <li>• Approximately 14 weeks to complete</li> <li>• Fee: \$63,053 before disbursements estimated to be \$5,500 and taxes</li> </ul>

4. Stantec Consulting Ltd, Toronto Ontario	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Large local transportation and engineering consulting firm</li><li>• Project Lead: Pauline Craig, who as a former City of Toronto employee was project lead for the original service area and station location planning for the Bixi system in 2011</li><li>• Local, therefore likely more knowledgeable about vagaries in Toronto sub-markets</li><li>• Approximately 13 weeks to complete</li><li>• Fee: \$29,961 including normal (5%) for disbursements but excluding taxes</li></ul>
5. Toole Design Group, Silver Spring MD	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• 18 person multi-modal transportation planning firm</li><li>• Founded by Jennifer Toole (President); Project Lead: R.J. Eldridge</li><li>• Experience with over 30 bike share systems primarily in the United States, most recently in San Francisco Bay Area and Las Vegas</li><li>• Also experienced with pedestrian planning and engineering</li><li>• Approximately 12 weeks to complete</li><li>• Fee: \$42,240 (CDN) before disbursement estimated to be \$5,000 and taxes</li></ul>

After a detailed review of the five (5) submissions, it appeared that all consulting firms had a good understanding of the requirements and suggested similar research and methodologies to satisfy them. Each firm would use demographic data, trend analysis and GIS positioning to determine optimal routes, size and positioning. However, the scope of work for the proposals from the US companies relied heavily on statistical data and published information rather than obtaining knowledge of the Toronto physical and cultural landscape on a first hand basis. For this reason we decided to interview the Toronto consulting firms (MMM and Stantec) to see if they could meet our requirements.

The dedicated project team from both consulting companies was interviewed and the project scope further refined. Project timing did not change but the scope of work proposed by MMM changed to eliminate their review of the financial/operational feasibility related to the system and the Public/Stakeholder portion of their services as these items were beyond the scope of the study. As such MMM fees were reduced to \$39,750 plus disbursements estimated to be \$2,000 and taxes.

Although the MMM quote is approximately \$10,000 higher than Stantec before contingency, we are recommending awarding the contract to MMM for the reasons noted below. Further we recommend a \$5,250 contingency be added to the fee proposal.

1. The size, knowledge and experience of the MMM project team assigned to this study is significantly greater than the Stantec team;
2. MMM is very familiar with the on-going cycling initiatives within the City of Toronto;
3. Their transportation planning group have assisted both the City of Toronto and Metrolinx on several matters and will be helpful as the bike share system continues to expand; and,
4. MMM enjoys an excellent reputation with Bike Share, Toronto stakeholders.

Lorne Persiko  
September 10, 2015  
Page 4

---

**Conclusions:**

It is recommended that the Board of Directors of the Toronto Parking Authority (the "TPA") approve the proposal from MMM Group Limited dated August 17, 2015 to complete a Bike Share Feasibility Study for the expansion of the Bike Share, Toronto system for a fee not to exceed \$45,000 plus disbursements and taxes under the terms outlined herein.

:MC