<u>-×÷</u>+ gore

November 30, 2020

Ms. Julie Lavertu c/o Toronto City Council – Audit Committee City Clerks' Office 10th floor, West Tower, City Hall 100 Queen Street West Toronto, ON M5H 2N2

Re: Auditor General's Office of the City of Toronto Report on the Results of Applying Specified Auditing Procedures to Financial Information Other Than Financial Statements for the Year Ended December 31, 2019.

To the Audit Committee of the City of Toronto:

This letter has been prepared at the request of Toronto City Council to obtain assurance that expenditures incurred by the Auditor General's Office of the City of Toronto (AGO) are in compliance with the applicable policies and procedures, including appropriate exercise of delegated authorities as set by the City of Toronto.

We have performed the auditing procedures as described below. This agreed-upon procedures engagement was performed in accordance with standards published by Chartered Professional Accountants of Canada. The sufficiency of these policies, procedures and delegated authorities is solely the responsibility of the City of Toronto. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the City of Toronto policies, procedures and delegated authorities described below.

For the purpose of this letter, the financial information to which the auditing procedures were applied was included within the City of Toronto SAP report, "Actual Cost Line Items for Cost Centres for the Year Ending 2019" for the AGO. This report is essentially a General Ledger detailing the transactions that have been posted under the cost elements which in turn comprise the scope of the transactions subject to audit. The report was provided directly to us by staff of the AGO.

To clarify, the Quotation Request identified the following Cost Elements to be tested; those elements are summarized on the following pages.

$\frac{-\times \div +}{gore}$

SALARIES AND BENEFITS	SERVICES AND RENTS (Con't)			
 1025 – Permanent – Overtime 				
 1050 – Permanent – Vacation Pay 	 4310 - Training & Development- 			
	External			
MATERIALS AND SUPPLIS	 4340 - Tuition Fees 			
 2010 - Stationery and Office Supplies 	• 4406 – Contracted Services – Office			
• 2020 - Books and Magazine Subscriptions	Equipment			
• 2040 - Paper & Print Supplies	 4407 – Contracted Services - 			
• 2080 - Photographic & Video Supplies	Buildings			
• 2082 – Health and Safety Supplies	 4410 – Contracted Services – 			
2090 - Graphic Design Supplies	Electrical			
2099 - Other Office Materials/Minor	4414 - Advertising & Promotion			
	 4415 – Contracted Services – 			
Furnishings	Janitorial			
• 2260 - Gasoline	• 4416 - Transfer, Haulage & Storage			
• 2570 - Janitorial Supplies	 4410 - Transier, Tradiage & Storage 4424 - Contracted Services-General 			
• 2610 - Kitchen Supplies				
 2650 - Computer and Printer Supplies 	4435 – Contracted Services –			
• 2670 – Uniforms*	Security Systems*			
 2710 - General Hardware 	• 4452 - Transportation-Taxis			
• 2741 - Food Cost	 4465 - Contracted Services- 			
 2790 - Presentation/Promotional Items 	Monitoring Systems			
 2791 – Ribbons, Medals & Trophies 	• 4472 - Computer Hardware			
• 2999 - Miscellaneous Materials & Supplies	Maintenance and Support Services			
	 4473 – Managed Print Charges 			
EQUIPMENT	 4474 - Computer Software 			
 3020 - M & E-Communications 	Maintenance and Support Services			
• 3030 - M & E-Office	 4510 - Rental of Vehicles & 			
• 3032 - M & E-Photographic	Equipment			
• 3033 - M & E-Printing & Binding	 4515 - Rental of Office Equipment 			
• 3050 - M & E–Kitchen	 4530 - Rental of Property (Other 			
• 3099 – General Equipment	than Office)			
• 3310 – Furnishings	 4555 - Pager/Radio Rentals 			
• 3320 – Fixtures*	 4590 - Rental-Other 			
	 4699 – Repair & Maintenance – 			
• 3410 - Computers-Hardware	Other			
3420 - Computers–Software	 4755 - Meal Allowances (Non- 			
	Travel)			
SERVICES AND RENTS	4760 - Membership Fees			
4010 - Professional Services - Legal	 4770 - Parking Expenses (In town) 			
4038 - Professional & Technical Services	 4775 - Metrage-Operational (In 			
	town)			
 4050 – Technical Services – Survey and 	 4804 – Wireless Devices 			
Mapping	 4805 - Postage 			
4078 - Consulting Services-Technical	 4803 - Postage 4808 - Network Equipment, incl. 			
 4079 - Consulting Services-IT 	 4808 - Network Equipment, Incl. Cabling 			
 4082 - Photo/Video Services 				
	4810 - Telephone			

$\overline{g}_{ore}^{\times \div +}$

 4086 - Tech. Services-Translations & Interpreters 4089 - Consulting Services - Management/Research and Development 4091 - Consulting Services - External Lawyers and Planners 4093 - Consulting Services - Creative Communications 4110 - Honoraria 4118 - Tickets 4122 - Transcripts 4130 - Process Server Fees 4132 - Conduct Money 4144 - Investigative Expenses 4199 - Other Professional and Technical Services 4205 - Business Travel-Kilometrage 4210 - Business Travel-Accommodation 4215 - Business Travel-Air Transportation 4220 - Business Travel-Other Expenses 4251 - Conferences/Seminars- Kilometrage 4252 - Conferences/Seminars- Air/Rail/Bus Travel 4254 - Conferences/Seminars- Air/Rail/Bus Travel 4255 - Conferences/Seminars- Conferences/Seminars- Registration Fees 	 4811 - Cellular Telephones 4812 - Long Distance Phone Calls 4813 - Internet 4815 - Courier 4820 - Business Meeting Expenses 4822 - Receptions and Public Relations 4825 - Printing and Reproduction - Third Parties 4827 - Online Services Fee 4985 - Cash Over / Under 4995 - Other Expenses CAPITAL TRANSFERS & OTHER EXPENDITURES 6031 - Contribution Insurance Reserve Fund 6570 - Bank Service Charges INTER-DIVISIONAL CHARGES 7025 - IDC - Postage & Courier 7030 - IDC - Printing 7035 - IDC - Copying 7070 - IDC - Facilities Maintenance Services* 7080 - IDC - Other Services 7097 - IDC - EMS 7130 - IDC - Verthardware & Operational System Support 7170 - IDC - Parks Services 0THER REVENUE 9185 - Foreign Exchange – Gains or Losses 9450 - Sundry Revenue* 9457 - Trade A/P Discount Received 9475 - Insurance Loss Recoveries*
--	--

-×÷+ gore

We were provided directly from the City Clerk's Office, the Policy Applicability Matrix (Matrix) that linked each Cost Element above with the applicable City of Toronto policies and procedures below:

- Business Expense Policy
- Vacation
- Kilometrage Reimbursement for use of Personal Vehicle for City business
- Lieu time
- Training and Development
- Attendance Management
- Leave without pay
- Tuition Reimbursement
- Blanket Contract Procedures
- Divisional Purchase Orders (DPOs)
- Long Distance Telephone
- Payment Requisition Procedures
- Petty Cash Policy and Procedures (including Penny Elimination Policy)
- Purchasing Card (PCard) Program
- Selection and Hiring of Consulting Services
- Sole Source or Non-Competitive Procurement Procedures
- Using an Established Roster to Obtain Professional, Consultant or Other Services

To further clarify, the Quotation Request identified the delegated authorities as follows:

- Chapter 71, Financial Control
- Chapter 195, Purchasing
- Chapter 217, Records, Čorporate (City)
- Chapter 257, Signing Authority (spending authority set at the level of a Division Head)

In addition, the Quotation Request identified the policy framework for the City's Accountability Officers, codified in the Toronto Municipal Code, Chapter 3, "Accountability Officers", which reinforces both their arms-length relationship to the City and their independent status within the City's governance system. As part of the implementation of Chapter 3, Accountability Officers are required to comply with all applicable City by-laws, policies and procedures while maintaining their balance between accountability and independence.

Copies of the above City of Toronto policies and procedures and web-links to the City of Toronto related delegated authorities were provided by the City Clerk's Office.

We selected a statistical sample of transactions to be tested based on the number of entries in each Cost Element and examined those transactions for compliance with the applicable policies and procedures of the Matrix, including appropriate exercise of delegated authorities with underlying supporting documents for adherence to the policies, procedures and delegated authorities noted above.

As a result of applying the above procedures, we found no exceptions to the adherence to the policies, procedures and delegated authorities as they applied to our test sample.

It should be understood that we make no representations as to the sufficiency for your purposes of the procedures as described in the preceding paragraphs. Further we have addressed ourselves solely to the report, which we received directly from the Auditor General's Office of the City of Toronto and make no representations as to whether any material items were omitted. Our procedures do not constitute an audit of the report and therefore we express no opinion on the report.

-×÷+ gore

This letter is provided solely for the purpose of determining compliance with the Section 3-8B of the City of Toronto's Municipal Code and should not be used for any other purpose.

Any use that a third party makes of this letter, or any reliance or decisions made based on it, are the responsibility of such third party. We accept no responsibility for loss or damages, if any, suffered by any third party as a result of decisions made or actions taken based on this letter.

Yours very truly,

Robert Gore & Associates Chartered Professional Accountants Licensed Public Accountants

1238 Kingston Road, Toronto, Ontario M1N 1P3 (416) 699-8070

Appendix

In compliance with section 6.3 b. of the Quotation Request, the following are items set forth in Appendix 3 for the year ended December 31, 2019.

List of Annual Non-Competitive Procurement Activity

The AGO provided us with the list of Annual Non-Competitive Procurement Activity. Certain details have been redacted to comply with Section 181 of the City of Toronto Act in which the Duty of Confidentiality is defined.

Cost Element	Vendor	PO#	Net Price	HST/GST	Gross Total	Item Description
3420	ACL Services Ltd	6044765	\$ 15,053.76	\$ 1,956.99	\$17,010.75	ACL Data Analytics Software
3420	Vound Colorado Ltd	3588073	\$ 3,440.61	\$ 1,747.28	\$15,187.88	Investigation Software
4015	Redeacted	3582487	\$ 8,125.00	\$ 1,056.25	\$ 9,181.25	Confidential forensic
4015	Redeacted	3578081	\$ 2,740.02	\$ 356.20	\$ 3,096.22	Confidential forensic
4015	Redeacted	3584581	\$ 1,800.00	\$ 234.00	\$ 2,034.00	IT Audit Services
4015	Redeacted	3584886	\$ 18,000.00	\$ 2,340.00	\$20,340.00	IT Audit Services
4015	Redeacted	6049711	\$ 54,590.00	\$ 7,096.70	\$61,686.70	IT Audit Services
4015	Redeacted	6049939	\$ 3,215.00	\$ 417.95	\$ 3,632.95	Confidential forensic
4038	Redeacted	6046813	\$ 86,166.67	\$11,201.67	\$97,368.33	Hotline Complaint Management Software
4038	Wolters Kluwer Limited	6048109	\$ 78,500.00	\$10,205.00	\$88,705.00	Audit Software
4199	Redeacted	3575833	\$ 7,827.60	\$ 1,017.59	\$ 8,845.19	Confidential forensic
4310	Mcluhan & Davies Communication	3585537	\$ 9,800.00	\$ 1,274.00	\$11,074.00	Training and Development: Think on Your Feet
4424	Redeacted	3567551, 3578886, 3585976	\$ 11,282.74	\$ 1,466.76	\$12,749.50	Hotline Call Center
4474	Vound Colorado Ltd	3588073	\$ 5,226.91	\$ 679.50	\$ 5,906.40	Investigation Software
4828	Redeacted	6046813	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 2,860.00	\$24,860.00	Hotline Complaint Management Software

List of Annual Consulting Services Expenditures

During our engagement, we made enquiries to the City Clerk's Office regarding Annual Consulting Services Expenditures incurred by the Accountability Offices. The City Clerk's Office noted there were no such transactions incurred by the AGO.