

**CITY DIVISIONS PUBLIC HIGH PRIORITY RECOMMENDATIONS – NOT
FULLY IMPLEMENTED
(Status Not Verified by the Auditor General)**

INDEX OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Service Area: City Manager’s Office	5
Division: City Manager’s Office	5
Report Title: Cost Benefits of Extended Warranties for Construction Projects Are Unknown	5
Report Title: Service Efficiency Consultants Studies - Extent of Value for Money From Studies Has Not been Clearly Demonstrated	7
Division: People and Equity	8
Report Title: Improving the Administration of City Training Programs.....	8
Service Area: Community and Social Services	8
Division: Children’s Services	8
Report Title: Children's Services Division: Opportunities to Achieve Greater Value for Child Care from Public Funds	8
Division: Parks, Forestry & Recreation	9
Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation - Capital Program - The Backlog in Needed Repairs Continues to Grow	9
Report Title: Review of Urban Forestry - Permit Issuance and Tree By-law Enforcement Require Significant Improvement.....	12
Report Title: Review of Urban Forestry - Ensuring Value for Money for Tree Maintenance Services	15
Report Title: Getting to the Root of the Issues: A Follow-Up to the 2019 Tree Maintenance Services Audit.....	18
Division: Shelter, Support and Housing Administration	26
Report Title: Strengthening the City's Oversight of Social Housing Programs.....	26
Report Title: Opening Doors to Stable Housing: An Effective Waiting List and Reduced Vacancy Rates Will Help More People Access Housing	28
Report Title: Safeguarding Rent-Geared-to-Income Assistance: Ensuring Only Eligible People Benefit	29
Division: Social Development Finance and Administration	31
Report Title: Municipal Grants - Improving the Community partnership and Investment Program.....	31
Division: Toronto Paramedic Services	33
Report Title: Emergency Medical Services - Payroll and Scheduling Processes Require Strengthening	33

Service Area: Corporate Services	34
Division: 311 Toronto	34
Report Title: 311 Toronto - Full Potential For Improving Customer Service Has Yet To Be Realized	34
Division: Corporate Real Estate Management (CREM)	35
Report Title: Maintenance and Administrative Controls Review – Facilities and Real Estate	35
Report Title: A Mid-Term Review of the Union Station Revitalization: Managing Risks in a Highly Complex Multi-Year, MultiStage, Multi-Million Dollar Project	37
Report Title: Facilities Management - Security and Safety Improvements Required ..	38
Report Title: Real Estate Services Division - Restore Focus on Union Station Leasing	39
Report Title: Enhance Focus on Lease Administration of City-owned Properties ...	41
Division: Fleet Services	45
Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review Phase One: Stronger Corporate Oversight Needed for Underutilized Vehicles.....	45
Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review - Phase One: Lengthy Downtime Requires Immediate Attention.....	46
Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review Phase Two – Stronger Asset Management Needed	47
Division: Technology Services	49
Report Title: Disaster Recovery Planning for City Computer Facilities.....	49
Report Title: Governance and Management of City Wireless Technology Needs Improvement	50
Report Title: Governance and Management of City Computer Software Needs Improvement	51
Report Title: IT Service Desk Unit - Opportunities for Improving Service and Cost – Effectiveness	52
Report Title: Controls Over Telecommunication Expenses Need Improvement.....	52
Report Title: Software Licenses - Managing the Asset and Related Risks	54
Report Title: Audit of Information Technology Vulnerability and Penetration Testing- Phase 1: External Penetration Testing	55
Report Title: Information Technology Vulnerability Assessment and Penetration Testing – Wrap-up Phase I and Phase II	56
Report Title: IT Infrastructure and IT Asset Management Review: Phase 1: Establishing an Information Technology Roadmap to Guide the Way Forward for Infrastructure and Asset Management.....	57

Report Title: Improvement Needed in Managing the City's Wireless Telecommunication Contracts..... 59

Report Title: Establishment of City Wide Cyber Security Breach Incident Management Procedures Required 60

Report Title: Information Technology Projects Implementation: Information Privacy and Cybersecurity Review of Human Resource System..... 61

Service Area: Finance and Treasury Services..... 66

Division: Accounting Services..... 66

Report Title: City Purchasing Card (Pcard) Program - Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program..... 66

Report Title: Review of The Management of the City's Divisional Accounts Receivable 67

Division: Revenue Services 68

Report Title: Improving Controls Over Property Tax Assessments and Payment in Lieu of Taxes (PILTs) 68

Report Title: Audit of Water Billing and Collection- Phase 1: Overdue Water Account Collections Require Strengthening 68

Report Title: Audit of Water Billing and Collection - Phase II: Part 1- Incorrect Vacant Land Status Properties Reduces City's Property Tax Revenue 70

Report Title: Auditor General's Review of Toronto Water Billing and Collections – Phase II: Water Billing and Water Meter Management Controls Require Strengthening 71

Division: Pension, Payroll & Employee Benefits 74

Report Title: Management of the City's Long-Term Disability Benefits Phase One: Improving City Management to Address Growing Trends in Long-Term Disability Benefits 74

Report Title: Management of the City's Employee Extended Health and Dental Benefits Phase One: The City Needs to Ensure Adequate Detection and Review of Potentially Excessive and Unusual Drug Claims 75

Division: Purchasing & Materials Management..... 75

Report Title: City Stores: Maximize Operating Capacity to Be More Efficient..... 75

Report Title: Review of Divisional Purchase Orders..... 77

Report Title: Obtaining the Best Value Through the Use of Vendor Rosters..... 78

Report Title: Audit of Interface Invoice Payments - Improving Contract Management and Payment Processes 79

Service Area: Infrastructure and Development 82

Division: Municipal Licensing and Standards 82

Report Title: A Review of Municipal Licensing and Standards Division's Management of Business Licences - Part One: Licence Issuance, Inspection and Complaint Investigation Functions 82

Report Title: A Review of Municipal Licensing and Standards Division's Management of Business Licences - Part Two: Licensed Holistic Centres..... 84

Report Title: A Review of Municipal Licensing and Standards Division's Management of Business Licences - Part Three: Eating Establishments and Nightclubs 85

Division: Toronto Building 86

Report Title: Toronto Building Division - Building Permit Fees, Improving Controls and Reporting 86

Report Title: Toronto Building - Improving the Quality of Building Inspections 88

Division: Toronto Fire Services 88

Report Title: Toronto Fire Services - Improving the Administration and Effectiveness of Firefighter Training and Recruitment 88

Division: Transportation Services..... 89

Report Title: Inventory Controls Over Traffic Control Devices in Transportation Services Need to be Improved..... 89

Report Title: Detection of Warning Signs for Potential Bid Rigging Should be Strengthened 90

Report Title: Audit of Winter Road Maintenance Program - Phase One: Leveraging Technology and Improving Design and Management of Contracts to Achieve Service Level Outcomes..... 90

Service Area: City Manager's Office

Division: City Manager's Office

Report Title: Cost Benefits of Extended Warranties for Construction Projects Are Unknown

Report Date: 05/01/2014

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
3	City Council request the City Manager develop warranty documentation standards and reports to improve information tracking and communication between staff.	<p>Recommendation has been implemented by the following Divisions: Engineering & Construction Services Facilities Management Solid Waste Management Services</p> <p><u>Parks, Forestry & Recreation (PFR) - management reported recommendation as not fully implemented</u></p> <p>PFR Construction Management has processes in place for managing, tracking and monitoring construction warranties. Our Standard Operating Manual also has been updated to better articulate our practices. Status of warranties are reviewed periodically to ensure compliance, and additional fields have been added to PFRAMS (PFR project tracking system) to formalize the management of that data, and for enhanced monitoring and reporting. Creation and review of warranty tracking reports from the PFRAMS system have revealed some inconsistencies in the way data is being entered by staff, including some missing entries. Also revealed was a lack of formal warranty inspection or sufficient notes to adequately explain why inspections were not required.</p> <p>In order to address these issues, the warranty tracking report, as well as processes related to it, will be reviewed in more detail in Q1 and Q2 2020. Identified improvements, to ensure controls and processes for documenting and maintaining accurate and up-to-date warranty information on the PFRAMS report, are to be fully implemented by Q4, 2021.</p> <p><u>Transportation Services - management reported recommendation as fully implemented (not verified by the AGO)</u></p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>12/31/2017</p> <p>12/31/2016</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
		<p>Transportation Services Division has implemented harmonized warranty controls, forms and processes. They are being applied consistently and the appropriate staff are aware of how to use the forms and processes.</p> <p><u>Toronto Water - management reported recommendation as fully implemented (not verified by the AGO)</u></p> <p>In Toronto Water the majority of capital construction projects are carried out by the Capital Works Delivery (CWD) unit.</p> <p>1. Warranty Documentation Standards: Documentation standards are provided to staff by Toronto Water's Capital Project Closeout Procedure. Warranty Monitoring and the Engineering & Construction Services (ECS) Capital Works Procedures Manual, Warranty Monitoring. These procedures are periodically reviewed during regular staff meetings.</p> <p>2. Reports to improve information tracking and communications between staff: The Project Tracking Portal (PTP) Warranty Report is used to track warranty milestones.</p> <p>Since January 2020, in order to ensure that the PTP Warranty Report contains accurate and up-to-date information the following controls and review processes have been put in place:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) the PTP dashboard is used to notify the CWD unit Manager and Project Managers of warranty procedure milestones. b) Contract Warranty Review is a standing item on the CWD unit Project Manager & Senior Staff meeting agenda. 	

Report Title: Service Efficiency Consultants Studies - Extent of Value for Money From Studies Has Not been Clearly Demonstrated

Report Date: 02/11/2015

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	<p>City Council request the City Manager, in consultation with the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, to expedite the development and implementation of a formal consultant performance evaluation process. The consultant evaluation should include both qualitative and quantitative performance measures that help evaluate the quality and practicality of deliverables, the efficiency of the consultant in managing time and resources, and the cost of work in relation to the benefits received, ensuring that any such measures align with the scope of work.</p>	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>The Management Consultant Performance Evaluation (MCPE) tool has been implemented. All RFPs for management consultant services issued after Sept 13, 2021 will be subject to the MCPE process. The Supplier Performance Evaluation procedure has been updated to include the MCPE as has the RFP template. In addition, the Professional Services Performance Evaluation (PSPE) tool for engineering and architectural services has also been implemented as of August 23, 2021. The work on implementing the Supplier Performance Management module in SAP Ariba is underway and the City's existing performance management tools including the MCPE and PSPE will be moving to this new centralized system starting Q4 of 2021 and into Q1 of 2022</p> <p>Due to COVID-19 we were not able implement pilots projects of the Management Consultant Performance Evaluation (MCPE) tool. Our plan is to commence implementation of the MCPE by June 1, 2021. An engineering and architecture services consultant performance evaluation tool has been developed with plans to roll out in 2021. The implementation of the module in SAP Ariba that will assist in the centralization of vendor performance information has been delayed due to conflicting priorities and COVID 19, however the MCPE tool will move into SAP Ariba when that module is rolled out.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>06/30/2018</p>

Division: People and Equity**Report Title: Improving the Administration of City Training Programs****Report Date: 05/01/2015**

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the City Manager to ensure that Divisional Service plans include training plans which address compliance requirements, Corporate priorities and Talent Blueprint objectives. Divisions will share their plans with Human Resources Division to develop an overall Corporate Training Plan.	<p>The People and Equity division has procured a new performance management tool through the City's learning management system vendor and is revising its performance management program and process for a 2021 rollout. This new program includes a revised development planning process and online tool.</p> <p>Once performance management and development planning move online, data related to learning needs can be collected from the system and People & Equity can plan for learning accordingly. This will result in co-ordinated planning for learning between divisions and People & Equity.</p> <p>When there is sufficient evidence in place of this co-ordinated planning, People & Equity will submit for closure of this recommendation. It is anticipated that this evidence could be in place as early as Q3, 2022.</p>	<p>09/01/2022</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2018</p>

Service Area: Community and Social Services**Division: Children's Services****Report Title: Children's Services Division: Opportunities to Achieve Greater Value for Child Care from Public Funds****Report Date: 04/26/2018**

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
2	City Council request the General Manager, Children's Services Division, to take steps to increase access to the existing licensed child care spaces in the	<p>The Division has taken action to expand the number of spaces in the contracted non-profit sector.</p> <p>Between December 2018 and December 2019 an additional 2759 spaces were added by Licensed, not-for-profit operators who have a Service</p>	<p>3/31/2022</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>3/31/2019</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>City for the purchase of services for children with subsidies consistent with the Child Care Service Plan and Toronto Growth Strategy. Steps should be taken, but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Expanding the maximum number of spaces that can be purchased from contracted non-profit licensed child care centres;</p> <p>b. Minimizing the vacancy rate in the City-run child care centres;</p> <p>c. Exploring ways to access existing spaces in the non-profit licensed child care centres which do not currently have a service agreement with the Division.</p>	<p>Agreement for Child Care Fee Subsidy with the City. Since December 2017 there has been an increase of 5930 additional spaces.</p> <p>In order to minimize the vacancy rate in the City's directly operated child care centres, Toronto Early Learning Child Care Services (TELCCS), the Division implemented an enrollment and vacancy management action plan. This included a TELCCS waitlist management procedure, improved business processes and communication between staff, and added training for staff on these procedures and processes increasing their occupancy capacity to 93%.</p> <p>Instability of the child care sector related to COVID-19, has resulted in few expansion requests across the sector; however, the division continues to receive and approve eligible requests.</p>	

Division: Parks, Forestry & Recreation

Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation - Capital Program - The Backlog in Needed Repairs Continues to Grow
Report Date: 1/23/2009

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
2	<p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, take appropriate steps to:</p> <p>a. develop criteria for determining when a City facility is considered to be no longer cost-</p>	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>Development of the comprehensive list of facilities that are no longer cost-effective to maintain is the</p>	<p>10/1/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>effective to maintain, taking into consideration such factors as utilization, ongoing operating and capital maintenance costs, location, and proximity to other facilities, community impact and changing demographics.</p> <p>b. where practical, incorporate the criteria developed into the capital asset management system.</p> <p>c. compile a comprehensive inventory of all facilities that are no longer cost-effective to maintain based on criteria developed in (a.).</p> <p>d. identify opportunities for consolidation of operations within existing facilities or potential new ones and recommend facility closures, if warranted.</p> <p>e. determine the full financial implications of either maintaining, enhancing or closing facilities, including any potential program changes resulting from each option.</p> <p>f. where a facility closure is recommended, develop alternate accommodation for viable affected programs.</p>	<p>only outstanding component of this recommendation. As the Facility Master Plan Implementation Plan was recently adopted by council, staff will begin work on this project throughout 2021.</p> <p>a. As reported in 2011: Currently in place. Scheduled capital projects are reviewed by PFR Branches to ensure they are still applicable. In addition, the council-approved Facilities Master Plan (FMP) will provide a defensible decision-making process, guided by facility provision principles, and criteria that will allow the City to make long-term decisions on park and recreation facility location, construction, repair, decommissioning, replacement, management and financing in a responsible and cost effective manner that meets the needs of communities across the City. The Implementation Plan for the Facilities Master Plan was approved by Council on October 29, 2019. Implementation of the plan has commenced immediately starting in November 2019.</p> <p>b. As reported in 2011: Currently in place.</p> <p>c. As reported in 2011: The Capital Projects Section has developed the Priority Rank Factor (PCR) which drives the state-of-good repair project priority in the Capital Asset Management Program (CAMP) budget. Each project listed in the CAMP budget is assigned a PCR. The PCR is the sum of the various rankings applied to each asset that include the Facility Condition Index (FCI), Priority Factor (PF) and Rank Factor (RF). In addition, the FMP establishes principles for SOGR investment and prioritization between investments by facility type. The Implementation Plan for the Facilities Master Plan was approved by Council on October 29, 2019. Implementation of the plan has commenced immediately starting in November 2019.</p> <p>d. Currently in place: The FMP addresses this recommendation. For example, the FMP recommends converting 4 single pad arenas based on facility condition and utilization and replacing them with new 2 pad arenas to maximize utilization and efficiency. The Implementation Plan for the Facilities Master Plan was approved by Council on October 29, 2019. Implementation of the plan has</p>	

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	g. conduct appropriate community consultations of any planned actions.	<p>commenced immediately starting in November 2019.</p> <p>e. Currently in place: The Facilities Master Plan establishes baselines to monitor facility usage for trends and to determine when enhancements or closures are appropriate. Any enhancement/closure includes a financial business case and a plan to relocate programs and permits as required. The Implementation Plan for the Facilities Master Plan was approved by Council on October 29, 2019. Implementation of the plan has commenced immediately starting in November 2019. For example, the FMP Plan analyzed all facility utilization and made appropriate recommendations including the repurposing of Harrison Pool to other uses, the repurposing of 4 indoor arenas to other uses, conversion of 8 wading pools to splash pads and the upgrade and conversion of underutilized sport fields to better uses.</p> <p>f. Currently in place: In the event of any facility closure or consolidation, impacted programming will be relocated or modified as required. This is standard operating practice. The Implementation Plan for the Facilities Master Plan was approved by Council on October 29, 2019. Implementation of the plan has commenced immediately starting in November 2019.</p> <p>g. Currently in place: All facility development practices include a requirement for community consultation. This is standard operating practice. The Implementation Plan for the Facilities Master Plan was approved by Council on October 29, 2019. Implementation of the plan has commenced immediately starting in November 2019.</p>	
9	The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, give priority to completing the development and implementation of the work order system for Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division to provide the tracking of both operating and capital costs of each facility.	PFR is one of four divisions implementing the Enterprise Work Management System (EWMS). This project is being implemented in stages. The current stage includes the implementation of the Urban Forestry branch of PFR. It is anticipated this will see Urban Forestry staff using the solution in 2022 with the completion of the implementation for this branch by the end of 2022. Planning for the implementation of the EWMS for the remainder of the division has begun with anticipated completion in 2025.	<p>12/31/2025</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2019</p>

Report Title: Review of Urban Forestry - Permit Issuance and Tree By-law Enforcement Require Significant Improvement
Report Date: 6/28/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to ensure that the new Urban Forestry information system consists of all key permit issuance functions to enable adequate system controls over permit issuance and the collection of fees, payments, and deposits.	Full implementation of recommendation #1 is dependent upon EWMS. PFR is one of four divisions implementing the Enterprise Work Management System (EWMS). This project is being implemented in stages. The current stage is being implemented in stages. The current stage includes the implementation of the Urban Forestry branch of PFR. It is anticipated this will see Urban Forestry staff using the solution in 2022 with the completion of the implementation for this branch by the end of 2022.	12/31/2022 12/31/2021 6/30/2021 03/31/2019
3	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to develop and implement effective and efficient procedural requirements to verify compliance with tree replanting and tree protection permit requirements.	Full implementation of recommendation #3 is dependent upon TPPR achieving sufficient staffing complement. Additional staffing requirements were identified in the 2018 management response. Previous staff complement did not allow staff sufficient time to verify compliance with permit conditions. Phase 1 of the implementation of additional staff employed late 2019. Phase 2 to be requested as part of the 2020-2022 budget processes. Permit Hoarding Verification and Tree Planting Verification procedures implemented December 6, 2019. Permit Hoarding Verification and Tree Planting Verification revised April 30, 2020 (Version 1.1). Tree Planting Verification Version 1.2 implemented September 8, 2020. Procedures Version 1.1 added and clarified the use of Forecasting and Inspection Codes and provided further details on data entry. Version 1.2 provided further details on data entry including updating City tree assets (e.g. "to be removed" and "removed by TPPR"). TPPR met the 2020 inspection target of a minimum of 1250 inspections across 5 TPPR sections.	12/31/2023 12/31/2020
6	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division, to develop a clear policy	Full implementation of recommendation #6 is dependent upon the development of a corporate policy to guide the process for addressing unclaimed deposits. TPPR developed a comprehensive process and procedure to address	12/31/2022 12/31/2020 6/30/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>and process to address old unclaimed Tree Security and Tree Protection Guarantee deposits. The policy should specify when an outstanding deposit should be classified as aged or forfeited, and the appropriate follow-up steps to verify the status of the deposits. Where all reasonable efforts to locate the applicants have been exhausted, the unclaimed deposits should be transferred to the City's revenue account.</p>	<p>and respond to Guarantee Deposits, implemented Oct. 9, 2019. The procedure outlines a process for staff to investigate, report and facilitate the return, hold or forfeiture of Guarantee Deposits. TPRR staff responsible for the implementation of this procedure have been trained. As of January 2021, 377 sites have been proactively reviewed and \$990,749.37 has been categorized resulting in \$589,522.68 being refunded, \$319,293.73 retained as compensation and \$81,932.96 identified as unclaimed to be transferred to revenue pending a corporate-wide policy from the Accounting Services Division (ASD).</p> <p><u>ASD Update</u> Accounting Services has been working with the division to ensure that performance obligations are identified and that proper revenue recognition standards are applied accordingly. ASD is also finalizing a security deposits policy and revenue recognition policy that aligns with PSAS.</p> <p>Additional staffing approved through 2020-2022 budget processes is expected to accelerate this categorization. A policy specific to the accounting for security deposits has been drafted by ASD and is now being reviewed and rolled out to the divisions.</p> <p>ASD's final policy is expected to be in place by the end of Q2 2021. Once this policy is completed, TPRR is set to revise the existing Guarantee Deposit procedure and will be in the position to transfer unclaimed funds according to the corporate policy.</p>	12/31/2019
8	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to review and where appropriate amend the provisions in the tree By-laws, to ensure effective enforcement and fee and payment requirements for contraventions of the bylaw requirements.</p>	<p>Full implementation of recommendation #8 is dependent upon the continued successful employment of the processes outlined in TPRR's Compliance and Enforcement Procedure and Documentation and Guidelines.</p> <p>TPRR consulted with the City Solicitor and determined that By-law revisions are not required in order to enforce payment requirements. Legal Services and UF have developed solutions that address the intent of this recommendation as outlined in TPRR's Compliance and Enforcement Procedures – Documentation and Guidelines implemented March 4, 2020. These documents outline how to meet compliance objectives and</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
		prosecute contraventions including improved follow-up on Orders, prosecuting illegal tree removals and major tree injuries with sufficient evidence and requesting fees for non-compliant sites.	
9	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division, to review and improve the current complaint handling and investigation process by:</p> <p>a. putting in place a regular supervisory review and training process to ensure contravention related complaints are properly investigated and orders are issued as needed;</p> <p>b. implementing ongoing monitoring measures through periodic reviews of exception reports on duplicated records, investigation status, and follow-up actions by staff to ensure compliance with orders issued;</p> <p>c. ensuring the new Work Management System has controls in place to minimize and prevent data entry errors and the ability to run exception reports to identify anomalies for follow-up. Staff should be provided with adequate training and procedure in recording information in the new system.</p>	<p>Full implementation of recommendation #9 is dependent upon EWMS. Secondary review and training procedures to support consistent contravention file review have been implemented. Contravention procedures were implemented on March 4, 2020. Legal led training for UFSO staff on prosecutions on February 21, 2020 with further MLS led training scheduled on enforcement fundamentals September/October 2020. New procedures provide direction on investigating, documenting, prosecuting and obtaining compliance of the Tree By-laws. A supplemental database to TMMS was created to facilitate accurate data collection and to track and monitor contravention files and to generate reports on site deficiencies, orders issues and fees requested/collected. This interim database is currently being updated. Updates include recent procedural changes, follow-up inspection and compliance requirements tracking, prompts for fee payment due dates, and mechanisms for prepopulated fee selection, minimizing the possibility of entry errors.</p> <p>PFR is one of four divisions implementing the Enterprise Work Management System (EWMS). This project is being implemented in stages. The current stage includes the implementation of the Urban Forestry branch of PFR. It is anticipated this will see Urban Forestry staff using the solution in 2022 with the completion of the implementation for this branch by the end of 2022.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p>

Report Title: Review of Urban Forestry - Ensuring Value for Money for Tree Maintenance Services

Report Date: 04/26/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division to take the necessary steps to ensure the City only pays for legitimate tree maintenance work that has been performed by contractor crews in accordance with the contractual terms. Such steps should include, but not be limited to, a regular review of a sample of contractor crews' Daily Work Activity Reports (daily logs) with the Global Positioning System (GPS) reports to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. identify questionable records; b. Follow up on the discrepancies; c. identify high-risk crews for further review and follow-up. 	<p>Full implementation of recommendation #1 is dependent upon Enterprise Work Management System (EWMS).</p> <p>A/B) Identify Questionable Records & Discrepancies</p> <p>UF updated the Daily Work Activity Report (DWAR) Guidelines to provide activity coding clarification which will improve the ability to review DWAR and GPS logs and assess efficient use of time. The updated DWAR guidelines also include revised review requirements based on the recommendations of the 2021 Audit. Updated guidelines were distributed to City staff and vendors on March 12, 2021. City staff completed ELI training on the revised guidelines by March 31, 2021.</p> <p>UF also updated the Forestry Performance Inspection Report (FPIR) Guidelines to include weekly reviews of DWAR's against GPS reports to help identify questionable activities. These updated guidelines also include new inspection and review targets for Supervisors and Managers. Revised FPIR guidelines were effective March 15, 2021. All Forestry Forepersons and Supervisors completed training on the revised guidelines by March 31, 2021.</p> <p>Enhancements were also made to the FPIR database to support these changes. UF developed GPS Guidelines to support the DWAR/GPS review process. The initial guidelines were distributed to staff on May 2, 2019 and updated guidelines were distributed to staff on August 7, 2019. Two of three of the current tree maintenance vendors provided live GPS access as of July 2019. UF & PMMD developed the 2021 Arboricultural Services contract which is a mix of hourly rate and unit rate contracts. Live GPS access is a requirement of the hourly rate contracts, enhancing UF's ability to identify questionable records and follow up on discrepancies. Unit rate contracts require less oversight and administration.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
		<p>C) High Risk Crews Analysis of the FPIR database provides data on crew leader deficiencies to help identify high risk crews. The performance and productivity of crews identified in the 2021 Audit is being monitored, along with other crew related complaints, and follow-up action will be taken as necessary.</p> <p>ALL) PFR is one of four divisions implementing the Enterprise Work Management System (EWMS). This project is being implemented in stages. The current stage includes the implementation of the Urban Forestry branch of PFR. It is anticipated this will see Urban Forestry staff using the solution in 2022 with the completion of the implementation for this branch by the end of 2022.</p>	
3	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division, to require supervisory staff to conduct thorough reviews of Daily Work Activity Report (daily logs) from both City crews and contractor crews to identify duplicated and questionable tree maintenance activities.	<p>Full implementation of recommendation #3 is dependent upon Enterprise Work Management System (EWMS).</p> <p>UF updated the Daily Work Activity Report (DWAR) Guidelines to provide activity coding clarification which will improve the ability to review DWAR and GPS logs and assess efficient use of time. The updated DWAR guidelines also include revised review requirements based on the recommendations of the 2021 Audit. Updated guidelines were distributed to City staff and vendors on March 12, 2021. City staff completed ELI training on the revised guidelines by March 31, 2021.</p> <p>UF also updated the Forestry Performance Inspection Report (FPIR) Guidelines to include weekly reviews of DWAR's against GPS reports to help identify questionable activities. These updated guidelines also include new inspection and review targets for Supervisors and Managers. Revised FPIR guidelines were effective March 15, 2021. All Forestry Forepersons and Supervisors completed training on the revised guidelines by March 31, 2021.</p> <p>Enhancements were also made to the FPIR database to support these changes. UF developed GPS Guidelines to support the DWAR/GPS review process. The initial guidelines were distributed to staff on May 2, 2019 and updated guidelines were distributed to staff on August 7, 2019.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
		<p>PFR is one of four divisions implementing the Enterprise Work Management System (EWMS). This project is being implemented in stages. The current stage includes the implementation of the Urban Forestry branch of PFR. It is anticipated this will see Urban Forestry staff using the solution in 2022 with the completion of the implementation for this branch by the end of 2022.</p>	
5	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division, to review the time spent by tree maintenance crews on supporting activities with a view to maximizing the actual onsite tree maintenance time. Consideration should be given to:</p> <p>a. undertaking steps to reduce time spent on moving or towing parked vehicles on streets obstructing the scheduled tree maintenance activities;</p> <p>b. Assessing the feasibility of installing a woodchip compound in more City yards to reduce driving time for wood disposal;</p> <p>c. assessing ways to reduce wait time for crews at the City yards, particularly at the end of each shift.</p>	<p>Full implementation of recommendation #5 requires implementation of systematic improvements to deal with parked vehicles that impact tree maintenance activities and the opening of the Murray Road Yard.</p> <p>Procedures outlining a process to obtain Hydro Hold-Off's have been developed and effective March 1, 2021. These new processes aid in minimizing unproductive time which enables crews to maximize time spent working on trees.</p> <p>A) Towing of legally parked cars UF obtained access to the Ministry of Transportation Ontario (MTO) database for 3 staff and worked with Toronto Police Services (TPS) to enhance its service procedures, including a 24-hour advance notice for officers to be on-site to assist with moving parked vehicles. A centralized call log was launched to document all instances where work cannot be completed due to the presence of legally parked vehicles. UF updated the Towing Guidelines as of February 23, 2021 and now require evidence of parked vehicles. The updated guidelines inform decision-making related to improving productivity including seeking direction from Forestry Forepersons to move on to other or alternate work. Utilizing social media and on-site signage to inform residents of scheduled tree maintenance have also been implemented to reduce time spent towing. A Staff Report related to systematic improvements to manage parked cars that impact tree maintenance activities will be brought to the May 2021 Audit Committee meeting.</p> <p>B) Wood chip compounds As part of the Industrial Yard Strategy, being led by Create TO, UF will have an additional wood chip compound at Murray Road Yard, located in the north central part of the city, an area currently without a wood chip compound. This site is planned to open in 2023.</p>	<p>12/31/2023</p> <p>12/31/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
		C) Yard Time In consultation with (PMMD), UF explored alternative approaches to leverage best practices to strategically source tree maintenance services. Through this collaborative effort, PFR and PMMD developed a negotiated Request For Proposals (RFP) for Arboricultural Services, which included a combination of hourly rate and unit rate price schedules. The unit rate price schedules will help reduce administrative cost and contractor oversight at yards. This contract will be effective July 1, 2021, and the award of this contract is pending Council approval. A letter of expectation was issued to each vendor advising that they are responsible for ensuring the full crew complement begins and ends their shift at their assigned yard per the contract terms.	

Report Title: Getting to the Root of the Issues: A Follow-Up to the 2019 Tree Maintenance Services Audit

Report Date: 02/02/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to periodically perform discreet physical observation of tree maintenance vendors for multiple whole days to ascertain the accuracy and reliability of reported work completed and paid for based on an hourly rate.	There is value in the information provided through physical observation. Urban Forestry (UF) will immediately explore how to scope the work, secure budget and develop a pilot under \$50K DPO and a future RFQ to resource this type of work. Timing: Subject to securing an appropriate service provider and available funding; long term funding will be addressed in future budget submissions. Initial pilot Q4, 2021; expansion Q4, 2022, subject to budget approval.	12/31/2022
2	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to improve City and contracted tree maintenance crew productivity, outputs, and outcomes by	a) UF will improve several processes, practices and procedures to maximize efficiency at work locations including, communications on crew expectations, parked car, hydro hold-off and daily log completion procedures, and on-site inspections. Timing: procedures updated and circulated by Q2, 2021. b) UF will enhance its organization of work and increase the number of work packages assigned to	03/31/2023

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>planning, assigning, and monitoring work to:</p> <p>a. maximize the amount of time spent actively working on tree maintenance activities (i.e., pruning, removal, stumping, fill and seed, etc.);</p> <p>b. reduce the time spent on supporting activities (i.e., time spent at the yard, dumping, driving, etc.); and</p> <p>c. minimize non-productive time (i.e., time waiting for parked vehicles to be moved, idle time, unreported breaks, etc.).</p> <p>City Council direct that, to support the effective analysis and monitoring of productivity, Urban Forestry Forepersons or Supervisors must verify that crews accurately record information (including locations, activities, and times) on their daily logs and review the logs for productivity and completeness on a sample basis; the sample should include at least one daily log per crew within every two-week period; and, where issues are noted on a selected daily log, additional logs should be reviewed and, where necessary, daily logs and invoices should be adjusted in accordance with the contract.</p>	<p>crews to reduce frequency of contact for work distribution and expedite daily work direction (to reduce yard time). Timing: Q3, 2021</p> <p>c) UF will continue to implement and expand its pilot project for expediting the temporary relocation of parked cars. UF will enhance the parked car call log to track all calls from crews pertaining to parked cars and improve how it is used to inform quality control and DWAR/GPS reviews. UF will explore additional opportunities to reduce wait times. UF has developed hydro hold-off procedures and has an updated draft of daily log guidelines which will be distributed immediately. Further, UF will communicate crew expectations regarding daily log procedures with regard to break time reporting. Timing: communications and procedures updated and distributed Q2, 2021; monitoring pilot project to inform effective next steps Q4, 2021.</p> <p>Two additional longer-term initiatives that will address the issue of time spent on supporting activities in yards includes</p> <p>(i) the transition to unit rate pricing contracts and</p> <p>ii) the launch of the City's electronic work management system.</p> <p>Timing: (i) pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract;</p> <p>(ii) In partnership with Divisions the high level Roadmap has been developed and includes a preliminary Q4, 2021/Q1, 2022 target for EWMS implementation for Urban Forestry.</p> <p>UF will support effective analysis and monitoring of productivity as noted in the recommendation. This represents an increase in the sample size that is currently reviewed as part of Quality Control reviews, and as such requires additional staffing to support. Timing: staffing resources pending 2022 Operating Budget approval; Q4, 2022</p>	
3	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to:	a) UF Operations currently tracks complaints through its Forestry Performance Inspection Reports (FPIR) database, and UF will expand this to ensure that all complaints received from all other	12/31/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>a. track all tree maintenance complaints to provide indicators of where contractor performance needs closer monitoring;</p> <p>b. include complaints in contract management and contractor performance evaluations, with a special emphasis on recurring issues; and</p> <p>c. remind staff of their obligation to report any allegations of potential wrongdoing involving City resources, including potential wrongdoing against the City by third-party vendors, to the Auditor General for further investigation.</p>	<p>sources are included, ensuring centralized complaints tracking. Timing: Initial process change Q2, 2021; implemented Q4, 2021.</p> <p>b) UF will centralize all complaints into the FPIR database to ensure tracking of recurring issues is easily captured to support performance evaluations. Timing: Initial process change Q2, 2021; implemented Q4, 2021.</p> <p>c) Staff will be reminded of obligations to report allegations of wrongdoing. Timing: Q1, 2021</p>	
4	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to ensure that Forestry Performance Inspection Records accurately reflect the actual scope of the inspection or review performed and note any inspection criteria that staff are unable to assess based on work activities observed at the time of the inspection.</p>	<p>Urban Forestry will update the Forestry Performance Inspection Report (FPIR) procedures to accurately reflect the actual scope of the inspection or review performed and note any inspection criteria that staff are unable to assess based on work activities observed at the time of inspection. Timing: improvements to procedure Q2, 2021; implemented Q4, 2021.</p>	12/31/2021
5	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to:</p> <p>a. obtain precise route information (in accordance with contracts), which includes specific geo-location (latitude and longitude) at frequent</p>	<p>a) UF currently obtains precise route information from vendors (in accordance with contracts), and where latitude/longitude and minute by minute intervals are not available, it will be requested. This issue will be rectified through the award of the 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract, which requires vendors to provide live GPS access which enables these features. Longitude and latitude and/or minute by minute interval GPS reports will be referenced only here there is an anomaly with the DWAR and GPS report. A mapping review will be</p>	12/31/2022

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>(minute-by-minute) intervals and not just fixed addresses associated with tree locations;</p> <p>b. investigate any discrepancy between the reported geo-location and GPS geo-location exceeding an acceptable threshold no greater than 25 metres;</p> <p>any challenge to the GPS accuracy should be supported by GPS service providers' direct confirmation to the City that the data recorded by their GPS device is faulty; and explanations and supporting evidence for discrepancies should be properly documented;</p> <p>c. request crews to submit geo-tagged photos of each tree, showing the tree before and after work has been completed; and Urban Forestry staff should review these photos when signing off on crews' daily logs; and d. update Urban Forestry tree maintenance records with current geo-tagged photos of trees submitted by tree maintenance crews.</p>	<p>included as part of the quality control inspection process. Timing: pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract.</p> <p>b) UF currently reviews a sample of DWAR and GPS when we conduct the quality control inspections. As per Recommendation 2, UF will increase the sample size of DWARs/GPS reports that are reviewed as requested. Discrepancies greater than 25 meters will be investigated. UF will properly document supporting evidence in a central database. Timing: staffing resources pending 2022 Operating Budget approval; Q4, 2022</p> <p>c) UF will immediately inventory City and vendor crews to determine if equipment is available to take and send "geo-tagged" photos. Alternatively, the capability of taking "regular" photos exists and submission of these will be requested. UF will also evaluate if the photos effectively document the work in order to improve daily reviews. The "geo-tagged" photos capability has been included in the 2021 RFP. Timing: pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract; staffing resources pending 2021 and 2022 Operating Budget approval; Q4, 2022</p> <p>d) UF will consult Technology Services on photo storage size capacities of TMMS and the internal network drives. Timing: Q2, 2021 *UF will undertake a review to determine the cumulative impacts of all recommendations related to crew management and oversight, and develop and implement an effective plan to improve operational efficiency. The implementation of Recommendations 1, 2, 6, 7, 8 and 11 will also contribute to the implementation of this Recommendation.</p>	
6	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to improve crew management at the operations yards to reduce daily yard time and increase efficiency on tree maintenance work and City Council request Urban Forestry</p>	<p>UF will enhance its organization of work and increase the number of work packages assigned to crews to reduce frequency of contact for work distribution and expedite daily work direction (to reduce yard time). UF will improve several processes, practices and procedures to maximize efficiency at work locations including, communications on crew expectations, parked car, hydro hold-off and daily log completion procedures. Operational efficiency will be monitored on an annual basis following implementation of the</p>	12/31/2022

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	management to monitor whether there is any improvement to operational efficiency when taking this action.	<p>improvements noted above. Timing: Q3, 2021; Monitoring of improvements to operational efficiency to begin Q4, 2022, in conjunction with the launch of EWMS Two additional longer-term initiatives that will address the issue of time spent on supporting activities in yards includes:</p> <p>(i) the transition to unit rate pricing contracts and</p> <p>(ii) the launch of the City's electronic work management system.</p> <p>Timing:</p> <p>(i) pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract;</p> <p>(ii) In partnership with Divisions the high level Roadmap has been developed and includes a preliminary Q4, 2021/Q1, 2022 target for EWMS implementation for Urban Forestry. *UF will undertake a review to determine the cumulative impacts of all recommendations related to crew management and oversight and develop and implement an effective plan to improve operational efficiency. The implementation of Recommendations 1, 2, 5, 7, 8 and 11 will also contribute to the implementation of this Recommendation.</p>	
7	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to:</p> <p>a. analyze why certain crews report parked vehicles at a higher frequency or longer duration than other crews and implement measures to reduce related downtime;</p> <p>b. request crews to submit geo-tagged photos of the location of parked vehicles obstructing work at the time these obstructions occur; and Urban Forestry Forepersons should reconcile reported parked car time to the submitted evidence of the obstruction when they review and sign off on daily logs; and</p>	<p>This recommendation builds on Recommendation 5 of the 2019 Audit. While the 2019 recommendation focused on improving the efficiency of moving parked cars, this recommendation adds the need for crews to prove that they spent time trying to move cars. The following updates will address both.</p> <p>a) UF currently has some data to support the analyzing of crews whose license plate call-ins are being tracked. UF will enhance the parked car call log to track all calls from crews pertaining to parked cars and improve how it is used to inform trends by crews. UF will monitor and adjust the tracking over a period of time to get the information required to support the proof that time was legitimately being spent trying to move cars. Once we have an analysis based on crew leader, this will further inform potential action and continued next steps.</p> <p>Timing: Q4, 2021.</p> <p>b) UF will inventory City and vendor crews to determine if equipment is available to take and send "geo-tagged" photos. Alternatively, the capability of taking "regular" photos exists and submission of these will be requested. UF will also undertake an analysis to determine the effectiveness of the photos as documentation for verifying work. The "geo-tagged" photos capability has been included in the 2021 RFP. Timing:</p>	12/31/2022

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	c. expedite how the Division will minimize downtime related to parked vehicles obstructing work from proceeding, temporarily directing, until this issue can be properly addressed, tree maintenance crews to carry on to the next tree location if they cannot gain access and then return when parking enforcement and towing can be arranged; and Urban Forestry management should monitor whether there is any improvement to operational efficiency when taking this action.	<p>pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract; staffing resources pending 2021 and 2022 Operating Budget approval; Q4, 2022</p> <p>c) The Towing Procedure document will be updated to include criteria to assist crew leaders in making decisions about efficient vehicle moving. UF will monitor improvements. Timing: procedure updates Q2, 2021; staffing resources pending 2021 and 2022 Operating Budget approval; Q4, 2022</p> <p>*UF will undertake a review to determine the cumulative impacts of all recommendations related to crew management and oversight, and develop and implement an effective plan to improve operational efficiency. The implementation of Recommendations 1, 2, 5, 6, 8 and 11 will also contribute to the implementation of this Recommendation.</p>	
8	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to:</p> <p>a. ensure that Urban Forestry or vendor staff are pre-arranging all required hydro hold-offs, wherever possible, to minimize downtime spent waiting for a hold-off; and the time of pre-scheduled hold-off, the time when hold-off was actually received, and any time waiting should be clearly noted on daily logs; and</p> <p>b. ensure that any need for an emergency hold-off is reported to the Urban Forestry Foreperson and is noted on their daily log; and the time when the request for hold-off was called in, the time when hold-off was actually received, and any time</p>	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>Pre-booking is done by City staff for all City and Vendor crews. Toronto Hydro has guidelines that the City is expected to follow on how and when hold offs can be booked and the process under which a hold off will be provided. UF convened a working group to deal with issues of downtime related to hold-offs, to explore issues noted above with the goal of minimizing downtime associated with hold-offs. UF has developed hydro hold-off procedures and has an updated draft of our daily log guidelines which will be distributed. Timing: procedure distribution Q2, 2021.</p> <p>*UF will undertake a review to determine the cumulative impacts of all recommendations related to crew management and oversight, and develop and implement an effective plan to improve operational efficiency. The implementation of Recommendations 1, 2, 5, 6, 7 and 11 will also contribute to the implementation of this Recommendation.</p>	06/30/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	waiting should be clearly noted on daily logs.		
9	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to ensure that payment for services is consistent with the express terms of the contract.	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>UF is currently consulting with Legal Services on this issue. It is also noted that this issue has been rectified in the 2021 RFP. Timing: pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract.</p>	07/01/2021
10.	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to:</p> <p>a. verify that vendors fulfill their contractual responsibilities for ensuring complete compliance with all regulations and provisions contained in, or issued under, the Occupational Health and Safety Act, the Arborist Industry Safe Work Practices, the Infrastructure Health and Safety Association (formerly the Electrical Utilities Safety Rules) Rule Book, the Highway Traffic Act, and any other applicable regulations, and any amendments to the foregoing acts and regulations and any new applicable acts or regulations that are enacted from time to time;</p> <p>b. ensure that non-compliance is properly documented as part of vendor contract</p>	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>UF is currently consulting with Legal Services on this issue. It is also noted that this issue has been rectified in the 2021 RFP. Timing: pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract.</p>	04/07/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	performance management processes; and c. pursue measures up to, and including, contract termination for repeated non-compliance with safety provisions of tree maintenance contracts.		
11	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to: a. obtain GPS routes travelled information that includes actual location coordinates (longitude and latitude) that are routinely captured by vendors' GPS systems every minute (or more frequent) and whenever there is a vehicle change (start, stop, change in direction, power take off on/off, etc.); and b. retain all GPS records needed to support invoiced amounts in accordance with the City's records retention policy.	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>a) UF currently obtains precise route information from vendors (in accordance with contracts), and where latitude/longitude at frequent (minute by minute) intervals is not available, it will be requested. This issue will be rectified through the award of the 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract, which requires vendors to provide live GPS access which enables these features. Longitude and latitude and/or minute by minute interval GPS reports will be referenced only where there is an anomaly with the DWAR and GPS report. A mapping review will be included as part of the quality control inspection process. Timing: pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract. b) Moving forward, UF will retain all GPS records. Timing: Q1, 2021 *UF will undertake a review to determine the cumulative impacts of all recommendations related to crew management and oversight, and develop and implement an effective plan to improve operational efficiency. The implementation of Recommendations 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, and 8 will also contribute to the implementation of this Recommendation.</p>	03/31/2021
13	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to: a. define expected outcomes for tree maintenance service delivery and include related performance	a & b) Information regarding expected outcomes is included in the current contract such as: meeting or exceeding recognized industry standards and City pruning guidelines and standards. These expectations have been enhanced through the 2021 RFP for hourly rates and includes minimum productivity requirements for unit rate contracts. Further, UF will use future data obtained through EWMS to monitor trends and define expected outcomes and related performance measures to	03/31/2022

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	measures directly within the contracts; b. specify actions and remedies for not meeting performance outcomes in the contracts; and c. consider contract terms that allow the City to base the assignment of tree maintenance work packages or hourly rate work based on how crews perform relative to other crews.	inform future contract development. Timing: subject to the launch of EWMS (in partnership with Divisions the high level Roadmap has been developed and includes a preliminary Q4, 2021/Q1, 2022 target for EWMS implementation for Urban Forestry), and pending award of 2021 Arboricultural Services Contract. c) UF will explore with PMMD whether contract terms based on performance is feasible. UF anticipates discussions with Labour Relations and CUPE Local 416 will need to take place with respect to the implementation of this recommendation. Timing: subject to consultation with partnering divisions.	
14	City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to compare performance measures and outcomes achieved by City and contracted tree maintenance crews and use this information to determine the appropriate type and volume of work to allocate to City crews and outsourced service providers.	UF will use data available and future data obtained through EWMS to monitor all crews and use it to inform future decisions on work allocation between City staff and outsourced contracts. UF anticipates discussions with PMMD, Labour Relations and CUPE Local 416 will need to take place with respect to the implementation of this recommendation. Timing: subject to the launch of EWMS (in partnership with Divisions the high level Roadmap has been developed and includes a preliminary Q4, 2021/Q1, 2022 target for EWMS implementation for Urban Forestry); subject to consultation with partnering divisions and organizations; staffing resources subject to future Operating Budget approval.	03/31/2022

Division: Shelter, Support and Housing Administration

Report Title: Strengthening the City's Oversight of Social Housing Programs

Report Date: 06/02/2014

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
13	City Council request the General Manager, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration in consultation with the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial	SSHA has completed an analysis of the financial implications of granting property tax exemption to all social housing providers. Reporting to Council was deferred until more details were known about the Federal Government's National Housing Strategy and the Ontario Governments proposed	12/31/2021 12/31/2020 12/31/2017 12/31/2016

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>Officer to report to City Council in the spring of 2015 on the potential financial implications of obtaining property tax exemptions for eligible social housing providers.</p>	<p>social housing modernization (i.e. Community Housing Renewal Strategy).</p> <p>With the release of the National Housing Strategy, which included the reinvestment of federal funding through the Canada-Ontario Community Housing Initiative (COCHI), SSHA reported to Council through the November meeting of the Planning and Housing Committee and received approval for the Community Housing Partnership Renewal (CHPR) program.</p> <p>CHPR provides a new funding and relationship framework for housing providers that are or were subject to a Federal Government operating agreement and includes property tax exemptions for eligible and participating housing providers. At its meeting in October 2020, Council approved the first round of housing providers committed to participating in CHPR and additional housing providers will be brought forward for approval in Q2 2021.</p> <p>The Province recently adopted Bill 184, Protecting Tenants and Strengthening Community Housing that included number changes to the Housing Services Act (HSA) which provides the legislative framework for social housing in Ontario who fall under the Act. The changes were enabling in nature allowing for changes to Regulations including the requirements for service agreements and related municipal funding requirements for social housing projects that have reached the end of their original mortgage obligations.</p> <p>The Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing has initiated consultations on the development of Regulation and struck the Advisory Table and related Technical tables with Service Manager including the City of Toronto. Reporting to Council on proposed property tax exemptions for housing provider properties subject to the funding formulae will be deferred until further details are known on the Ontario government's regulatory changes to housing provider service agreements and related municipal funding requirements.</p> <p>This estimated completion date is subject to change as SSHA's delivery schedule is dependent on the province.</p>	

Report Title: Opening Doors to Stable Housing: An Effective Waiting List and Reduced Vacancy Rates Will Help More People Access Housing

Report Date: 6/21/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
27	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration Division, in consultation with the City's Chief Information Officer, to ensure:</p> <p>a. that progress is made to select a vendor and develop an implementation plan for the new choice-based system for selecting households to receive rent-geared-to-income assistance.</p> <p>b. the new technology includes appropriate system access controls, input and validation controls to prevent data entry errors.</p> <p>c. exception monitoring controls are developed, including regular reports to support the detection of errors or irregular activity.</p>	<p>a. & c: Feature development for system access control and monitoring and reporting was complete and deployed to City staff, Housing Providers and Community Agency Partners in Q2 2021. Processes and reports monitoring irregularities were implemented in Q2 2021.</p> <p>b. Development and deployment of Choice-Based access and validation controls will be complete in Q4 2021.</p> <p>Note: Date revised to Q4 2021, due to accessibility related delays with the development of the applicant portal and Choice-Based Access Model.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p>
28	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration Division, to collaborate with the General Managers of Employment and Social Services and Children's Services divisions to ensure implementation of the Human Services Integration project achieves service efficiencies in administering these</p>	<p>Staff are reviewing common functions that could be more efficiently delivered through integrated processes. SSHA continues to integrate initial and ongoing eligibility with Human Services partners.</p> <p>In Q1 2020, initial cross-training for housing was completed by all caseworkers, with further training and integration taking places throughout Q2 2020 and Q3 2020. Further integration and training are being developed in preparation for deployment of the New Waitlist management system in Q2 2021.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>3/31/2020</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	income based subsidy programs. In the short term, this will include one income assessment process and in the longer term this should be expanded to include other common functions. The implementation should include a rationalization of resources.		

Report Title: Safeguarding Rent-Geared-to-Income Assistance: Ensuring Only Eligible People Benefit
Report Date: 10/09/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the General Manager, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration Division, to ensure all rent-geared-to-income households identified by the Auditor General as having potential eligibility issues are appropriately reviewed.	1046 of 1,415 (74%) Fraud and Waste Hotline household records have been closed. SSHA continues the process of securing access to other data sources to support eligibility reviews. SSHA previously estimated that reviewing the 1,415 files identified by the AG's Office would be completed by 2021 Q4. Due to TCHC's significant volume of files, resource limitations, and competing demands, the target completion for this recommendation is being revised. SSHA will close 100% of non-TCHC files by 2021 Q4. SSHA will work with TCHC to close 90% of all files by 2022 Q1. The remaining files are expected to be time intensive, requiring thorough investigation by TCHC staff. As such, SSHA estimates that the review of all files will be completed by 2022 Q3.	09/30/2022 12/31/2021 12/31/2020
7	City Council request the General Manager, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration Division, to: a. directly administer the eligibility reviews	a. Access to Housing continues implementing a mail-out strategy inviting applicants to register and update their RGI housing applications through MyAccessToHousingTO portal. New applications are reviewed for eligibility. As applicants update their applications, the database system automatically prompts staff to recheck eligibility. Annual Notice of Assessment reminder	12/31/2021 12/31/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>for households seeking RGI assistance and entering into RGI housing.</p> <p>b. work in partnership with housing providers to ensure adequate supports are in place for them to continue to manage the ongoing annual eligibility review process.</p> <p>c. consider how resources can be optimized to ensure cost-effectiveness.</p>	<p>functionality is built within the database. Policy, business process and technical functionality development are underway to ensure that applicants entering into choice-based bidding cycles have current NOA on file.</p> <p>b. Due to changes resulting from RGI Simplification, and to ensure administration of RGI is performed in accordance with the Housing Services Act, SSHA updated the RGI Administration Manual to emphasize its role as a key support to housing providers in conducting annual eligibility reviews. The following actions have been taken to ensure housing providers have adequate support to manage the annual eligibility review process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The revised RGI Administration Manual was released on July 1, 2021 to coincide with the implementation of RGI Simplification. The manual includes enhanced material to assist housing providers assess eligibility and has also been extensively reworked to provide clear linkages between the legislative and policy direction and the specific action required by RGI Administrators. - Online RGI simplification training was launched May 17th, including a section on the detection of fraud and what to do when fraud is suspected. To date 559 people have been trained. Targeted follow-up is being done to ensure that any RGI administrator that has not completed the training does so. The vendor for the RGI online training has been engaged to incorporate additional materials on fraud detection for housing provider staff. This training will be revised to adapt the implementation of RGI Simplification. <p>c. SSHA continues to monitor the utilization of resources for administration of the RGI program. The implementation of RGI Simplification on July 1, 2021 and the implementation of a new CWL system in Q4 2021 will introduce significant change to the RGI program. After the implementation has progressed sufficiently SSHA will review the impact of these changes and will make adjustments as needed to ensure that resource use is optimized.</p>	

Division: Social Development Finance and Administration

Report Title: Municipal Grants - Improving the Community partnership and Investment Program

Report Date: 01/21/2013

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years)
8	City Council request the City Manager to ensure that standard documents developed for the application or assessment of specific grant programs be carefully completed, all outstanding issues are addressed, and files contain explanations for exceptions to established guidelines.	<p>Social Development, Finance & Administration (SDFA), Shelter, Support & Housing Administration (SSHA) and Toronto Public Health Division have not fully implemented the recommendation.</p> <p>Please see management responses as shown below:</p> <p><u>Social Development, Finance & Administration (SDFA) response:</u> Toronto residents play an important role in the review of grant applications, contributing their lived experience, knowledge of local resources, and unique perspectives. This expertise is contributed in a volunteer capacity and is integral to achieving City goals regarding increasing equity both in service delivery and in decision making. SDFA will ensure that all meeting notes related to application review for the panelist, the deliberations, short-listing and management meetings are complete and clearly document funding decisions. Specifically, in recruiting and training reviewers we will ensure that they understand the importance of documenting their ratings and their capacity to do so. When we are fully operational in TGRIP we will create mandatory fields for reviewers which require that they enter comments related to their ratings. We will institute a dedicated note taker at all deliberation meetings and consider recording the deliberations, particularly if they occur virtually. SDFA will institute a review of all documentation related to a grant call review within a month of recommending final decisions to ensure complete documentation. SDFA anticipates Recommendation 8 to be fully implemented in 2022-Q3.</p> <p><u>Shelter, Support & Housing Administration (SSHA) response:</u> SSHA has developed the standard documents for the application and assessment of specific grant programs that are operationalized in the online grants management system – Toronto Grants, Rebates, and Incentives Portal (TGRIP). This work will be fully demonstrated and verifiable with the</p>	<p>09/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2016</p>

Attachment 2

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years)
		<p>completion of the 2022/2023 Grants open call. Therefore, SSHA anticipates Recommendation 8 to be fully implemented in 2022-Q3.</p> <p><u>Toronto Public Health response:</u> All grant application documents, review procedures, other supporting documents, and training plans were reviewed and updated to ensure standard assessment processes were clear for the 2020/21 grant cycle (Dec 2019-Dec 2020). During the grant process, the grant manager and staff carefully monitored and followed the process to ensure that procedures were applied carefully and any exceptions to established guidelines were applied consistently. At the time of this report, the final stages of the 2020/21 grant application cycle are in progress.</p>	

Division: Toronto Paramedic Services**Report Title: Emergency Medical Services - Payroll and Scheduling Processes Require Strengthening****Report Date: 10/03/2013**

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
9	City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, evaluate whether transactions entered using shared IDs or by system users not authorized to enter transactions identified during the audit require further analysis to determine if transactions were valid and properly authorized. Reports should be developed to identify such transactions on an ongoing basis for review and action.	<p>User IDs and login credentials are unique and not shared among staff. Audit reporting functionality within Kronos TeleStaff is currently available but lacks the level of detail required to accurately identify who completed the transaction. Ongoing development by the vendor is in progress, and a series of enhancements have been planned to address the deficiencies identified in the Audit reporting tools in Kronos TeleStaff.</p> <p>The vendor has established a roadmap outlining a phased release of Audit enhancements comprising 4 phases which Technology Services anticipates being completed by Q4 2021. Once completed, testing and implementation are expected to be completed by Q2 2022.</p>	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>6/30/2017</p> <p>12/31/2016</p>
12	City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, upgrade the history log in the scheduling module to track deletions and changes by user ID, date and time.	<p>User IDs and login credentials are unique and not shared among staff. Audit reporting functionality within Kronos TeleStaff is currently available but lacks the level of detail required to accurately identify who completed the transaction and other details. Ongoing development by the vendor is in progress, and a series of enhancements have been planned to address the deficiencies identified in the Audit reporting tools in Kronos TeleStaff. Details requested from the vendor to be included in the report include date, author, inserts, deletions, and edits as well as the field or piece of information that was changed (e.g., a regular shift changed to vacation).</p> <p>The vendor has established a roadmap outlining a phased release of Audit enhancements comprising 4 phases which Technology Services anticipates being completed by Q4 2021. Once completed, testing and implementation are expected to be completed by Q2 2022.</p>	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>6/30/2017</p> <p>12/31/2016</p>

Service Area: Corporate Services

Division: 311 Toronto

Report Title: 311 Toronto - Full Potential For Improving Customer Service Has Yet To Be Realized

Report Date: 10/17/2011

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
2	City Council request the Deputy City Managers, in consultation with the Director of 311, to conduct a comprehensive review of business processes of the call centers operated by Solid Waste Management, Municipal Licensing and Standards, and Urban Forestry, with a view to streamlining processes to effect a consolidation of operations.	An informal business process review of the functions performed within the call centers operated by Solid Waste Management, Municipal Licensing and Standards, and Urban Forestry has been completed. These call centers provide functional services such as dispatching and Tier 2 escalation services. However, a comprehensive customer service review is currently underway that will assist in identifying how all Tiers across the City are coordinated and consolidated to ensure that the delivery of customer service is consistent across all divisions. This review will be completed by Q2 of 2022 and will provide a roadmap of any additional consolidations that could possibly take place.	06/30/2022 6/30/2020 9/30/2016
3	City Council request the Director, 311 Toronto Division, in consultation with the General Managers/Executive Director of Solid Waste Management, Transportation Services, Toronto Water, Municipal Licensing and Standards, and Parks, Forestry and Recreation, to improve the service request status information such that customers are provided with accurate and clear status information on-line.	The City has now selected Salesforce as its software of choice and is moving forward with it as an Enterprise-Wide solution for the Customer Relationship Module (E-CRM). As 311 Toronto proceeds with phase 2 of the implementation of the E-CRM, it will become easier for partner divisions to populate and share status updates. It is anticipated that this recommendation will be implemented by Q1 of 2022.	03/31/2022 12/31/2020 6/30/2016

Division: Corporate Real Estate Management (CREM)

Report Title: Maintenance and Administrative Controls Review – Facilities and Real Estate
Report Date: 09/16/2005

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
4	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer give priority to the completion of an implementation plan for facilities maintenance standards including:</p> <p>(a) a process to monitor compliance with legislative requirements;</p> <p>(b) funding, staffing and operational requirements of the Facilities and Real Estate Division and all other City divisions;</p> <p>(c) the development of specific facilities maintenance standards, if necessary, for speciality facilities such as water treatment plants and arenas; and</p> <p>(d) timelines for implementation.</p>	<p>FLS has received dedicated funding and staffing, therefore this process is already implemented for FLS.</p> <p>FM consultant is currently developing an asset inventory (CMMS-Computerized Maintenance Management System) for all CREM managed facilities. Upon completion, this information will be used to develop the legislative and industry best practice PM program. Ongoing development to determine the appropriate staffing and funding levels to implement the proper industry best practice preventative maintenance program across the City.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>3/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>
13	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to:</p> <p>(a) determine the complete state of good repair backlog for all City-owned buildings;</p> <p>(b) develop City-wide funding priorities for the state of good repair backlog; and</p>	<p>a. Through the annual capital budget process, the Financial Planning Division consolidates the SOGR backlog for each City division and prepares a briefing note on this. Within this briefing note the complete, City-wide, SOGR backlog is provided. The detailed support for this is submitted through each Divisional capital budget submission and stored within the Financial Planning Division. This portion of the recommendation has been implemented.</p> <p>b. The City's Asset Management policy was approved by Council in June 2019 and effective since July 2019, as required by Provincial legislation.</p>	<p>02/28/2022</p> <p>12/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	(c) ensure that approved capital projects are completed on a timely basis.	c. Within Facilities Management execution and spending on SOGR projects has improved over the last 3 years. There has been a greater emphasis on capital project execution. This is evident through monthly capital program review meetings at the Divisional level and enhanced capital variance reporting at the corporate level. This has led to improvements in capital funding utilization and in turn capital project completions. Within Facilities Management, spending on SOGR projects under its control exceeded 80% in 2018. The AG's office has indicated that a City-wide strategy should be developed to ensure improvements are realized throughout City divisions and programs. This will also require coordination with the City's corporate financial leads, and Facilities Management will support these efforts in developing these plans.	
14	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that a database of the physical condition of all City-owned buildings is developed and forms the basis for a long-term capital plan. In addition, building condition assessments should be completed for all City-owned buildings using criteria based on industry standards and best practices developed by the Facilities and Real Estate Division.	Facilities Management has accomplished all items within this recommendation for facilities under the Divisions' direct oversight. In order to implement this recommendation, the practices FM employs needs to be implemented across all City owned buildings. The objectives outlined within the City-Wide real-estate model includes consolidated oversight of asset management related to facilities under the jurisdiction of Facilities Management. The timeline for completion of this recommendation is dependent on the adoption and implementation of all aspects of the City-wide real estate model, expected to be completed over the next 3 years.	12/31/2022 12/31/2021 12/31/2017
16	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to establish a maintenance plan for each City building that: (a) includes both capital and operating repairs for current and future years; (b) addresses building deficiencies identified in	Facilities Management has accomplished all items within this recommendation for facilities under the Divisions' direct oversight. In order to implement this recommendation, the practices FM employs needs to be implemented across all City owned buildings. The objectives outlined within the City-Wide real-estate model includes consolidated oversight of asset management related to facilities under the jurisdiction of Facilities Management. The timeline for completion of this recommendation is dependent on the adoption and implementation of all aspects of the City-wide real estate model, expected to be completed over the next 3 years.	12/31/2022 12/31/2021 6/30/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>building condition assessments; and</p> <p>(c) effectively coordinates maintenance and repair activities between the Design, Construction and Asset Preservation and Facilities Operations Units of the Facilities and Real Estate Division.</p>		
17	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that all necessary building information is incorporated into the SAP Plant Maintenance and Asset Management Modules to assist in maintenance planning and repair decisions and provide a record of regulatory inspections.</p>	<p>CREM is currently in the process of an asset tagging initiative that will allow for detailed records of all key building assets to be stored in the City's SAP Plant Maintenance system. This will be integrated with CREMs current work order tools to ensure asset records are continually updated and maintenance records are developed by asset, including regulatory inspections and maintenance. The scope of this project covers all facilities under CREM's SOGR oversight (approx. 400) and the project is 80% complete. Asset tagging and maintenance tracking will become a standard within CREM and this will be applied to facilities that come under its oversight over the next 3 years through the implementation of the City-Wide Real Estate mandate. For the City's fire and life safety systems, the City has implemented a system (BRC) and processes within the newly formed Fire and Life Safety team in CREM to track maintenance and inspection records of these key assets, City-wide.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>6/30/2017</p>

Report Title: A Mid-Term Review of the Union Station Revitalization: Managing Risks in a Highly Complex Multi-Year, MultiStage, Multi-Million Dollar Project
Report Date: 10/02/2012

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
6	<p>City Council request the City Manager to ensure that the responsible City division develop and</p>	<p>A stage gating process is included in the corporate Capital Budget directions and manual for 2019. All Divisions and programs are expected to follow this approach based on these guidelines and directions.</p>	<p>12/31/2025</p> <p>12/31/2023</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	implement, for all significant and complex capital projects, an enhanced process for assessing and managing project risks. The risk assessment should be comprehensive prior to the start of the project and be continuously reviewed and updated	<p>Further work is being done to ensure major projects are reviewed on a periodic basis in a uniform manner across the City.</p> <p>This recommendation cannot be fully implemented until there are major projects available to flow through all phases of the process, and it can be demonstrated that project risks are assessed and managed through all phases of the project. The phased approach that has been developed is currently being applied to the Relocation of Etobicoke Civic Centre project, therefore this recommendation will remain outstanding until 2025 with the estimated completion of the Etobicoke Civic Center.</p>	<p>12/31/2025</p> <p>12/31/2020</p>

Report Title: Facilities Management - Security and Safety Improvements Required
Report Date: 02/03/2015

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to develop a plan to complete a review of physical security at all City facilities using a risk based approach and to address any deficiencies found during the review.	An appropriate and sustainable plan that provides on site physical security audits for all City facilities and addresses noted deficiencies is being finalized. This plan is being addressed in a staged manner following the implementation timeline of City-Wide Real Estate. Physical security continues to be currently reviewed at City sites in a number of ways including site security audits, preventative maintenance reviews, divisional security plan updates, penetration tests, and security incident reporting and reviews.	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>
2	City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to perform the appropriate follow up reviews to ensure identified security deficiencies are adequately addressed by the divisions.	All deficiencies noted through patrols and incident reporting are appropriately managed through the security incident management system with divisional management follow. A tracking system is currently being implemented to fully track deficiencies noted through on site security audits tracking both short-term repairs and long-term enhancements.	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>3/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>
7	City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to run reports to identify inactive access cards and upon review, cancel	A daily SAP report is used to ensure inactive employees have their security access disabled. A capital project providing access to divisional management staff contacts to run reports and validate employee data (Self-Serve application) is	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>03/31/2019</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	user access as required.	also being implemented by Technology Services. The implementation of this project was affected by the COVID response and is now planned for full implementation in 2022.	12/31/2018
10	City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to review the current level of mobile patrolling activity to determine if it adequately meets requirements and propose options for the actions, if any, necessary to satisfy the security needs.	An upgraded security incident report system, as well as, a new mobile patrol software with field data reporting devices has been implemented. A review is occurring using the results of the data obtained from these systems to ensure the level of mobile patrol activity is adequately satisfying the security needs of City properties. Currently, adjustments are being made to the proactive mobile security patrolling based upon seasonality of City services, site criticality, past incidents, and security management feedback.	12/31/2021 12/31/2019 12/31/2018

Report Title: Real Estate Services Division - Restore Focus on Union Station Leasing
Report Date: 06/13/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to: a. determine the City's measurements at Union Station (as at January 1, 2010) and assess the impact of significant changes to the following measurements for each year after 2010: 1. rentable area (occupied and vacant); 2. common areas and facilities; 3. common use equipment; 4. areas used for municipal purposes; and 5. areas under construction; and	a. The spatial tracking exercise is comprised of analyses of relevant leases, construction schedules and operational activations to produce the required information as at December 31st of each respective year. The work is approximately 85% complete with full completion anticipated during Q1-21. Additionally, the process for annually updating the spatial tracker is currently being documented in a Standard Operating Procedure for leasing matters specific to Union Station. b. The business process for annually updating the spatial tracker is complete. Formal documentation of the Standard Operating Procedure for leasing matters specific to Union Station is anticipated in Q4-20. Completion of the USRP project (including conveyance to Metrolinx) did not occur until June, 2021 with deficiencies correction still underway. As such, measurement has been delayed. Vendor has been procured and expected to complete the measurements by December, 2021 after which the balance of activities will be completed.	03/31/2022 09/30/2021 3/31/2021 12/31/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	b. ensure that current measurements are maintained and used for annual settlement purposes.		
2	City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to determine the appropriate action to take to settle the accounts related to the retail operations at Union Station for the period from 2010 to 2015.	<p>CREM has undertaken an external audit to ensure that lease related revenue during the period is accounted for in pursuit of developing a reliable audit opinion on which the City can determine both the level of recovery and strategy to ensure payment is collected. The audit is being reviewed and validated in order to finalize any level of recovery to pursue and collection strategy necessary. CREM anticipates closing out the review during Q4-20.</p> <p>Management working with Accounting Services to confirm receipt of revenue confirmed. No remaining work to complete. Still expecting completion by Oct 31.</p>	<p>10/31/2021</p> <p>05/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>3/31/2020</p>
5	<p>City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to:</p> <p>a. complete the 2016 settlements of additional rent for all occupants at Union Station and ensure the amounts owing are recorded and collected on a timely basis; and</p> <p>b. ensure future settlements of additional rent are completed with each occupant at Union Station on an annual basis and in accordance with their respective agreements.</p>	<p>Legal Services has clarified interpretation on direct vs CAM cost recoveries under the Head Lease Agreement to ensure a singular and mutually accepted interpretation of the relevant provisions. The City is to continue recovering CAM from the Head Lessee as done for prior years. Payment for the outstanding amounts have been made by Head Lessee. However, accurate and up-to-date measurement information about occupancy in Union Station is required to reflect actual outstanding amounts. At the conclusion of the current Union Station Revitalization, up-to-date measurements will be taken, and lease reconciliations will be corrected to account for any emerging differences.</p>	<p>02/28/2022</p> <p>10/31/2021</p> <p>03/31/2020</p>
12	City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to develop and implement a cost allocation model that clearly defines how annual operating costs associated with different areas of Union Station	All City-buildings are subject to the cost allocation model. Tenants are required to pay their proportionate share of operating costs based on their rentable area (ex. the area that the occupant rents exclusively + their proportional share of the building common area costs). For multi-tenanted buildings, CREM utilizes the Building Owners and Managers Association's ("BOMA") Standard Methods of Measurement for cost allocation. The	<p>02/28/2022</p> <p>10/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	will be allocated to and recovered from the Station's occupants.	standard takes a building-wide approach to the measurement of floor area, providing a basis for measuring common space and allocating the related costs. The BOMA standard and calculation approach is incorporated into the annual lease reconciliation process and used to allocate operating costs to the Union Station's tenants. However, accurate and up-to-date measurement information about occupancy in Union Station is required for the Cost Allocation Model to be applicable. At the conclusion of the current Union Station Revitalization, up-to-date measurements will be taken and applied to the Cost Allocation Model and property taxes recovery in order to fully address the recommendation.	

Report Title: Enhance Focus on Lease Administration of City-owned Properties
Report Date: 6/28/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
6	<p>City Council request the Director, Real Estate Services to establish a process to ensure the lease management system is accurately set up to automatically alert staff to:</p> <p>a. agreements where negotiations for the next term should commence in order to prevent unnecessary overholding; and</p> <p>b. charge the appropriate overhold rate upon agreement expiry, where appropriate; and take action to address expired agreements in a timely manner.</p>	<p>On a monthly basis, Property Management & Lease Administration (PMLA) generates two SAP reports to monitor the expiry of agreements 1) within the following 30 days and 2) within following 6 months for both Lease-Out agreements (City as Landlord) and Lease-In Agreements (City as Tenant).</p> <p>The reports are subsequently referred to Transactions Services to coordinate renewal renegotiation before expiry. Where Transactions Services staff determine that the overhold rate is appropriate (relative to criteria detailed in Rec 5), a request is sent to PMLA to apply the increase along with a reason to be documented within SAP.</p> <p>Should PMLA encounter records on the monthly SAP report that include expired agreements, Transactions is required to confirm the application of the overhold rate (if not already applied).</p> <p>Transaction Services and Property Management have developed a Leasing Management Oversight Committee, whose mandate is to:</p>	<p>11/30/2021</p> <p>05/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>9/30/2018</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
		<p>(i) ensure alignment on the City's lease strategy, across the portfolio, through various lease related programs;</p> <p>(ii) serve as a working group to develop, approve and implement lease related strategies, tools and projects, and</p> <p>(iii) provide support and advice from a leasing and lease management perspective on corporate programs and priorities (e.g., office optimization project).</p> <p>One of the key responsibilities of this Committee will be to develop, approve and implement a lease overhaul strategy and complete quarterly reviews of the lease portfolio and recommend action to ensure compliance with the overhaul strategy.</p> <p>Draft terms of reference and work plan for the Committee are complete with meetings scheduled to begin in December 2020.</p>	
7	<p>City Council request the Director, Real Estate Services, in consultation with other City Divisions that administer leases, to perform a complete review of all leases to:</p> <p>a. identify any accounts where percentage rents were missed and obtain all necessary financial information from occupants to calculate applicable percentage rents;</p> <p>b. identify any accounts where utilities (such as water, gas, and hydro), as well as all operating expense recoveries have been missed; and</p> <p>c. recover, where possible, any amounts that have gone unbilled or uncollected from prior periods.</p>	<p>CREM has developed and implemented a lease reconciliation process that operates annually to review accounts with responsibility to pay utilities and/or percentage rents based on shared common area costs.</p> <p>The initial implementation plan included a comprehensive review of all accounts to identify where cost allocation of utilities or percentage rents may have been missed. The resulting audit evaluated the preceding 6 years of each agreement and identified 114 accounts with receivables totalling \$6,715,255 among leases that were within CREM management responsibility as of December 31, 2019. Going forward, the annual lease reconciliation process will operate within each fiscal year to ensure that allocated cost responsibilities are appropriately calculated, documented and collected in compliance with the terms of each agreement.</p> <p>The lease reconciliation exercise utilized within CREM will be conducted among the agreements within the jurisdiction of other agencies and divisions in early 2021.</p>	<p>03/31/2022</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p>
9	<p>City Council request the Director, Real Estate Services, in consultation with other City Divisions</p>	<p>CREM has developed and implemented a lease reconciliation process that includes allocation of utility costs along with other cost allocations for which tenants may have responsibility as part of</p>	<p>03/31/2022</p> <p>3/31/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	that administer leases, to establish and implement a process, including appropriate monitoring controls, to ensure all utilities billed to the City that should be recovered from occupants in accordance with their respective agreements are recovered in a timely manner.	their respective agreements. This process includes use of functionality within SAP to identify accounts with utility cost responsibilities, document results of lease reconciliation exercises (including utility cost information utilized for calculation) and track/collect the resulting receivable within a 30-day expectation. The Accounts Receivable process manages aged receivable with a 30, 60 and 90+ day perspective to manage collection within a timely fashion. The lease reconciliation exercise utilized within CREM will be conducted among the agreements within the jurisdiction of other agencies and divisions in early 2021.	12/31/2019
10	<p>City Council request the Director, Real Estate Services, in consultation with other City Divisions that administer leases, to establish and implement a process to:</p> <p>a. review all properties with occupancy agreements to identify any space that needs to be assessed for property tax purposes and notify the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation accordingly; and</p> <p>b. ensure that when new occupancies are established on City-owned properties that the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation is notified promptly so that they can be assessed for property taxes.</p>	<p>a. In absence of staff resources necessary to conduct a dedicated exercise to review occupancy agreements, the work to review all properties with occupancy agreements to determine which (if any) should be provided to MPAC for assessment is integrated into the annual lease reconciliation process. As the annual lease reconciliation process is implemented among other divisions and agencies with agreements (2021), occupancy agreements will be reviewed</p> <p>b. All new agreements or renewals are identified for initial review by the tax services team who identify criteria such as agreement type, term and the lessor / lessee arrangement to determine if the agreement should be sent to MPAC for review and tax status determination. The new LSF checklist requires all agreements to be reviewed and approved by the tax services team to in order proceed.</p>	<p>03/31/2022</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>3/31/2019</p>
14	<p>City Council request the Director, Real Estate Services, in consultation with any City divisions managing leases, to:</p> <p>a. identify all City-owned properties where a cost allocation model</p>	<p>a. & b.) All City-buildings are subject to the cost allocation model. Tenants are required to pay their proportionate share of operating costs based on their rentable area (ex. the area that the occupant rents exclusively + their proportional share of the building common area costs). For multi-tenanted buildings, CREM utilizes the Building Owners and Managers Association's ("BOMA") Standard Methods of Measurement for cost allocation. The</p>	<p>03/31/2022</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>is required to allocate the appropriate proportionate share of operating costs to respective occupants;</p> <p>b. develop a cost allocation model that clearly defines how annual operating costs will be allocated to and recovered from the respective occupants including details on the type and source of information for appropriate cost recovery; and</p> <p>c. ensure the implemented cost allocation models are used to accurately calculate and allocate operating cost estimates and year-end settlements to the respective occupants.</p>	<p>standard takes a building-wide approach to the measurement of floor area, providing a basis for measuring common space and allocating the related costs.</p> <p>c.) The BOMA standard and calculation approach is incorporated into the annual lease reconciliation process and used to allocate operating costs to the City's tenants.</p>	
16	<p>City Council request the Director, Real Estate Services, as part of the development of a City-wide leasing strategy and in consultation with relevant program areas, to:</p> <p>a. establish and maintain an accurate and up-to-date consolidated inventory of leasable space across the City; and</p> <p>b. establish a process to identify available vacant leasable space on an ongoing basis and prioritize such space to be marketed to interested parties on a timely basis.</p>	<p>a) The City's financial system (SAP) has an inventory of leasable space that can be exported to identify vacant properties. The inputs to the inventory result from updates via agreements terminations, internal occupancy changes and the Technical Review Committee (the body that considers strategy for surplus City property).</p> <p>b.) The inventory is provided to Leasing Management Oversight Committee consisting of staff from CREM's Transaction Services and Property Management teams. Meeting monthly, the working committee reviews the vacant leasable space to assign an optimal use, prioritize circulation to interested parties and/or develop marketing approaches.</p> <p>Administration to track the both the time spent vacant and the work planned to lease is conducted to enable performance reporting of the working committee against commitments to lease.</p>	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>09/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>3/31/2019</p>
18	<p>City Council request the Director, Real Estate</p>	<p>CREM has reviewed the use of administrative fees among private and public sector real estate</p>	<p>3/31/2022</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	Services to review and report to the Government Management Committee on whether the City should be including an administrative fee in lease agreements to help recover the cost of lease administration. Such review to consider the appropriate fee structure to be applied and any criteria for exempting lessees from such an administrative charge.	property managers and adopted an approach based on prevailing practices and that is consistent with the scope of administrative duties carried out by the division. Given that fees can only be introduced at the point of leasing or lease renewal, the administrative fee will be subsequently integrated into those respective processes. Any exception made to the application of the fee will require the approval of the Manager of Property Management & Lease Administration. The timing to the suggested implementation of the fee (and Council Report requesting authority) is being re-evaluated in the context of COVID-19's financial impact on tenants.	08/31/2021 12/31/2020 3/31/2019

Division: Fleet Services

Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review Phase One: Stronger Corporate Oversight Needed for Underutilized Vehicles
Report Date: 4/16/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the City Manager, in consultation with the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to take steps to: a. review and minimize the number of underutilized vehicles, including implementing car share and pooling programs, using City-owned vehicles where cost and operationally effective; and	Fleet Asset Management formalized a process for car share and pooling program; however it is on hold due to Covid-19 with no date of resumption at this time	03/31/2024 9/30/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	b. maximize the use of the City's available fleet.		

Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review - Phase One: Lengthy Downtime Requires Immediate Attention

Report Date: 4/26/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to take the necessary steps to shorten vehicle and equipment downtime and achieve the downtime target set out in the Division's 2016 Alternate Service Delivery model report.	To shorten vehicle and equipment downtime, FSD is taking the following actions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Maintenance capacity continues to be augmented to meet service level demands. We are currently in the final stages of the legal agreement with a vendor and are negotiating with appropriate dealers within the vendor's network. The contract is expected to be in place no later than Aug 1st, 2021. - Fleet Maintenance Information System (M5), MCC coding methodology and naming convention has been updated to reflect the appropriate inspection and maintenance schedule. Training sessions have been provided to maintenance staff. 	12/31/2022 06/30/2021
13	City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to take steps to maximize warranty claims for parts and labour costs. Steps to be taken should include, but not be limited to: <p>a. setting a performance target for warranty claims and periodically measuring warranty effort against the target;</p> <p>b. allocating appropriate staff resources to adequately review and monitor the parts supplier's administration</p>	Delayed due to Covid reprioritization efforts. FSD is taking the necessary action to implement the recommendation by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Hiring and training appropriate employees 2. Upgrading the FMIS 3. Developing standard procedures 4. Benchmarking with reference to industry leading practices 	06/30/2022 12/31/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>of aftermarket part and labour warranty claims; c. making sure the warranty data in M5 are accurate and complete; d. providing training to Fleet maintenance staff on policies and procedures pertaining to warranty claims.</p>		

Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review Phase Two – Stronger Asset Management Needed

Report Date: 10/10/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
13	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to take steps to strengthen vehicle warranty administration. Such steps should include but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Ensuring all warranty information for vehicles, equipment, and related add-ons and attachments are entered into the M5 system in a timely manner; b. Establishing a threshold to guide garage staff on when to pursue warranty claims, considering both downtime and repair costs; and c. Ensuring work order notes contain sufficient details and evidence to allow staff to effectively pursue warranty claims.</p>	<p>Warranty information has been updated in M5. Fleet Services has established a warranty threshold guide which is pending further communication with all fleet garages.</p>	3/31/2022

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
15	City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to utilize the Warranty Claims Manager module in the M5 system to automate the tracking and reporting of warranty claims.	M5 Warranty Claims Manager module has been utilized, including scheduled tracking reports. Further communication is required with the garage staff.	3/31/2022
16	City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to track warranty work order statuses and periodically review work orders for missed warranty opportunities.	The Warranty Administrator checks work order daily and receives work order activities report weekly. This is pending further communication with fleet garages.	3/31/2022
17	City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to establish internal warranty claim submission and success rate targets, and to measure and report actual performance against these targets	Fleet Services has implemented internal warranty claim recovery targets, including actual performance measures against those targets. \$700,000 warranty savings in 2020.	3/31/2022
19	City Council request the City Manager, in consultation with the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to take steps to effectively identify, report, and deter damages caused from operating without care to avoid unnecessary costs to the City.	<p>Fleet Safety will continue to conduct regular training to our clients and they also share the training manuals with them.</p> <p>Fleet Maintenance is sending the identified errors related to operator's accidents with associated costs to clients on a regular basis. This recommendation has been communicated to clients during the FSD steering committee.</p>	03/31/2022 03/31/2020
20	City Council request the City Manager to consider the appropriate role of Fleet Services in the management and oversight of the City's fleet assets, and provide the Fleet	<p>This initiative has been delayed due to ongoing Covid-19 efforts.</p> <p>FSD is: 1. Expanding asset procurement centralization to additional divisions and agencies to improve economies of scale, standardization and related financial and operational savings or efficiencies.</p>	09/30/2022 12/31/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	Services Division with authority to act accordingly.	<p>2. Continuing to streamline contracts and commodity procurement to drive operating and financial efficiencies</p> <p>3. Developing policies, procedures and service level agreements with clients to clarify roles and responsibilities.</p> <p>Additional actions are being revised to align with the City's Covid reprioritization efforts.</p>	

Division: Technology Services

Report Title: Disaster Recovery Planning for City Computer Facilities

Report Date: 03/03/2008

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
2	The City Manager implement a disaster recovery and business continuity program that includes divisional roles and responsibilities, resource and training requirements, and simulation and plan maintenance schedules.	<p>Technology Services Division has established a Data Centre Modernization Program that includes a Disaster Recovery (DR) component with an assigned Project Director and there is a Business Continuity Program (BCP) that is managed by the office of CISO. A Disaster Recovery project manager and a BCP Specialist (consultant) are in place. The development of the BCP plan and the DR plan are in process with (5%) development undertaken. The testing of critical applications recovery based on the current state is at (25%) progress.</p> <p>Data Center construction was completed in March 2020, as well as the Data Centre Reference Architecture (signed off in June 2020), along with the budgetary estimates to support the operationalization. High level design workshops, pertaining to the network, security, compute & storage, are in progress and will be completed by the mid Q1 2021, which will be an input to start the procurement of required hardware/software components.</p>	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>6/30/2019</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>12/31/2016</p>
6	The City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, direct divisions to test information	The testing of technology disaster recovery plans is dependent on the completion of the Disaster Recovery Strategy Standard document. Once this is finalized, a Memo from the City Manager will be published to direct divisions to test information	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	technology disaster recovery plans on a regular basis.	technology disaster recovery plans on a regular basis based on DR Standard including frequency of testing.	9/30/2019 12/31/2017 9/30/2016
7	The Chief Information Officer develop disaster recovery testing guidelines and provide training necessary to ensure cross-divisional consistency.	<p>In the planning phase, preparing a Project Charter that includes the audit items as part of the scope and Disaster Recovery (DR) Strategy Standard document. Stakeholder engagements are underway to gather information requirements for the Standards. The DR Standards will include disaster recovery testing guidelines and provide training necessary to ensure cross-divisional consistency.</p> <p>The DR strategy is 50% complete and a shortlist of applications prioritized into scope will be used to determine the divisional roles and responsibilities required. The outcome of the strategy is the plan which will determine not only the simulations, schedules, it will also drive the divisional R&R. Training and material will be part of the rollout of the DR and available late Q3-Q4 2021.</p> <p>All this work will be time-lined into a schedule for delivery and completion by Q4 2021. The DR is work in progress. The strategy will drive the detailed plan in addition to the prioritized DR application list. The implementation will be collaborative with the impacted divisions as they will be instrumental delivering DR and adoption into their landscape of BCP. This will all be driven by the plan which is the next step after the strategy is completed, reviewed and signed off.</p>	09/30/22 12/31/2021 6/30/2021 12/31/2019 12/31/2018 3/31/2017

Report Title: Governance and Management of City Wireless Technology Needs Improvement

Report Date: 04/20/2010

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
6	The Chief Information Officer develop a	Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully	09/30/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	comprehensive IT Security Manual as a ready reference for City staff.	<p>implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>All standards, policies and guidelines related to cyber will be collated into a master cyber manual. The manual will be published on the Office of the CISO intranet for easy reference of City Staff. Expected completion by Q2 2021.</p>	<p>06/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>9/30/2018</p> <p>12/31/2017</p> <p>12/31/2016</p>

Report Title: Governance and Management of City Computer Software Needs Improvement

Report Date: 1/7/2011

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
4	The Chief Information Officer ensure the City Information Technology Risk Management Program includes a periodic risk assessment to identify, assess and implement processes to address software related risk.	<p>The OC is currently proactively conducting risk assessments for new projects, including new applications and software, in addition to PCI related compliance applications. We are now in the process of defining a framework for the assessment of legacy applications, this should be completed by Dec 31 2021.</p> <p>An external third-party has been engaged to assist in the development of a risk management program. A gap assessment is being conducted and recommendations will provide critical inputs for the development of the Risk Assessment Policy, and the associated processes required for the periodic assessments of risks. Expected completion Q3 2021.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>09/30/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>3/31/2016</p>

Report Title: IT Service Desk Unit - Opportunities for Improving Service and Cost - Effectiveness

Report Date: 9/18/2013

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
4	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to implement proactive problem management for the IT Service Desk Unit to improve the efficiency and cost-effectiveness in providing information technology support.	<p>A Problem Management Process flow has been developed to demonstrate proactive problem management by TSD Service Desk. The proactive creation of problem tickets based on recurring incident trends, enable root-cause analysis to prevent the trend resulting in improved efficiency and cost-effectiveness in providing information technology support. The following have been completed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A report to identify incident trends and proactively create problem ticket to prevent recurrence; - Process Flow, Reference Guide and Trending Report based on Service, Configuration Item and/or Symptom, which serve as foundational elements for carrying on proactive problem management activities. - On a regular basis, problem tickets are being created proactively for remediation of discovered vulnerabilities and for RCA of major incidents. Socialization of the process, training and stabilization of the process execution coordinated by Service Desk and Problem Lead is planned by Q4/2021 <p>Note: Better tooling (ServiceNow) is planned for 2022 that will reduce time spent on data analytics. Data in original tooling (HP Service Manager) will not be migrated in ServiceNow except for any outstanding Problem Records</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>06/30/2021</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>6/30/2019</p> <p>9/30/2018</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>

Report Title: Controls Over Telecommunication Expenses Need Improvement

Report Date: 6/10/2014

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
11	City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer to review the existing process of manually updating	TSD has enhanced the previous process by capturing the Contract number, but the current system is unable to update the amount spent on each Contract. Although this semi-automation has been done, the manual method of updating invoice payment is still in place.	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>9/30/2020</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	invoice payment information from SAP to the NetPlus telecommunication system and evaluate whether the process can be automated.	<p>In 2019, TSD sought for a more integrated solution that addressed the critical audit findings while garnering more efficiencies and better value. The competitive procurement resulted with a new fully managed, 3-year Telecommunication Expense Services that was awarded on April 15, 2020.</p> <p>Contract negotiations is still under way and has been slow due to the pandemic situation. Current timeline for a full implementation date is targeted for Q2 2021. The new solution intends to meet all the requirements set forth by this audit recommendation.</p>	<p>6/30/2019</p> <p>6/30/2018</p>
15	City Council request the City Manager to direct divisions to review their respective inventory of telecommunication devices to ensure that it reflects the current status of such devices. Inventories should be adjusted where appropriate and reviews should be performed on a periodic basis.	The wireless cost reporting to divisions includes the device inventory information. Divisions are responsible for submitting inventory updates. Stronger language was added to the covering instructions for the report distributions. TSD is in process to prepare report regarding the actions taken for inventory cancellation, which would be completed in Q4 2021. CTO memo describing actions required from Divisions will also be sent.	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>9/30/2020</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>12/31/2017</p> <p>9/30/2016</p>
16	City Council request the City Manager to develop exception reporting criteria to assist in evaluating unnecessary telecommunication costs. Criteria identified should include devices and services with no activity, suspended phones beyond a specified period and phones no longer in use. Devices and services no longer required should be cancelled.	<p>A Usage and Inventory report is issued to all Divisions on a monthly basis since 2019. A process and set of associated tools have been developed to guide divisions in their periodic reporting of wireless devices inventory. Updates received from the Divisions based on the usage report are used to process cancellation if needed.</p> <p>Divisions are responsible for submitting inventory updates. Stronger language was added to the covering instructions for the report distributions. In 2019, TSD sought for a more integrated solution that addressed the critical audit findings while garnering more efficiencies and better value. The competitive procurement resulted with a new fully managed, 3-year Telecommunication Expense Services that was awarded on April 15, 2020. Contract negotiations is still under way and has been slow due to the pandemic situation. Current timeline for a full implementation date is targeted for Q2 2021. The new solution intends to meet all the requirements set forth by this audit.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>9/30/2020</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>

Report Title: Software Licenses - Managing the Asset and Related Risks
Report Date: 2/4/2015

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to ensure there is a software owner identified for all software assets and that activities to ensure compliance with software licensing agreements are performed in accordance with the divisional policy.	<p>The ITSM Team has put a process to manage and ensure license compliance of Software Assets. The initial scope of the process has been on Software Assets that have cumulative value of 500K per year. It covers software assets that are managed by either Technology Services Division (TSD) or a Divisional IT.</p> <p>The next phase of the work was stifled due to COVID19. It includes the following activities that is now targeted for Q4 of 2021:</p> <p>1) By early Sep 2021, a CTO Memo will be sent to the Divisions to reinforce the need for the compliance monitoring of the License Agreements while being compliant to the Software Onboarding process.</p> <p>2) The memo will be followed by activities outlined below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Software owners list continued to be maintained - ITAM start to onboard software other than major titles identified - Software asset management procedures/policy document posted on TechWeb reviewed and - Process training scheduled - Software exception reports distributed regularly <p>3) By Oct/Nov 2021, bi-weekly compliance review process performed by Asset Governance Team of existing software license agreements, software versioning, and any new/retirement through the list of Software Asset Owners that is centrally published.</p> <p>Note: Better tooling (ServiceNow) is planned for 2022 that will reduce time spent on manual activities to manage the software assets</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>06/30/2018</p>
11	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to ensure that the inventory of software is completed as soon as possible	The ITSM Team has put a process to manage and ensure license compliance of Software Assets. The initial scope of the process has been on Software Assets that have cumulative value of 500K per year. It covers software assets that are	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	and that software usage reports be developed and distributed to software owners for their review. Software owners should report back on license usage to the Chief Information Officer so that proper decisions can be made in relation to City software assets.	<p>managed by either Technology Services Division (TSD) or a Divisional IT.</p> <p>The next phase of the work was stifled due to COVID19. It includes the following activities that is now targeted for Q4 of 2021:</p> <p>1) By early Sep 2021, a CTO Memo will be sent to the Divisions to reinforce the need for the compliance monitoring of the License Agreements while being compliant to the Software Onboarding process.</p> <p>2) The memo will be followed by activities outlined below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Software owners list continued to be maintained - ITAM start to onboard software other than major titles identified - Software asset management procedures/policy document posted on TechWeb reviewed and updated - Process training scheduled - Software exception reports distributed regularly <p>3) By Oct/Nov 2021, bi-weekly compliance review process performed by Asset Governance Team of existing software license agreements, software versioning, and any new/retirement through the list of Software Asset Owners that is centrally published.</p> <p>Note: Better tooling (ServiceNow) is planned for 2022 that will reduce time spent on manual activities to manage the software assets.</p>	06/30/2018

**Report Title: Audit of Information Technology Vulnerability and Penetration Testing-
Phase 1: External Penetration Testing**
Report Date: 02/16/2016

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
2	City Council request that the Chief Information Officer to	An external third-party has been engaged:	12/31/2021 12/31/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	develop a cybersecurity program that includes ongoing vulnerability assessment and penetration testing using current tools used by industry subject matter experts. The testing tools adopted by the City should be updated regularly and provide ongoing reporting and metrics around existing and newly discovered threats.	<p>1) to assist in the development and implementation of a vulnerability management program, to conduct cyber risk assessments to enhance the City's cyber defense and its resiliency to cyberattacks and to improve the protection of the data involved in the delivery of City services.</p> <p>b) to assist in the review and development of cyber policies and standards. A gap assessment is being conducted and recommendations will provide critical inputs for the development policies and standards, and the associated processes required for the periodic assessments of risks. Expected completion Q4 2021.</p>	<p>6/30/2019</p> <p>3/31/2017</p>

Report Title: Information Technology Vulnerability Assessment and Penetration Testing – Wrap-up Phase I and Phase II
Report Date: 3/10/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	<p>City Council request the City Manager to review how best to create and implement a Chief Information Security Officer's role reporting administratively to the Chief Information Officer and functionally to the City Manager. The Chief Information Security Officer should coordinate with the Chief Information Officer:</p> <p>a. To develop information technology security baseline standards at the City, and report to the City Manager and Chief</p>	<p>The City's first Chief Information Security Officer (CISO) was hired on October 2019. The CISO reports functionally to the City Manager and administratively to the Deputy City Manager of Corporate Services.</p> <p>In 2019, a cyber maturity assessment was concluded for Corporate Technology Services and ransomware assessments was conducted on all twelve Divisional IT units. Additional cyber maturity assessments are planned in 2021 for Agencies and Corporations.</p> <p>An external third-party has been engaged to assist in the review and development of cyber policies and standards. A gap assessment is being conducted and recommendations will provide critical inputs for the development policies and standards, and the associated processes required for the periodic assessments of risks.</p> <p>Expected completion: Q3 2022</p>	<p>9/30/2022</p> <p>6/30/2018</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>Information Officer on compliance to established baseline standards.</p> <p>b. To work with City Agencies and Corporations to align baseline standards and leverage best practices.</p>		

Report Title: IT Infrastructure and IT Asset Management Review: Phase 1: Establishing an Information Technology Roadmap to Guide the Way Forward for Infrastructure and Asset Management

Report Date: 01/30/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
4	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer, in consultation with all relevant divisions, to:</p> <p>a. develop a comprehensive list of applications and identify those applications and systems that have the potential to be consolidated and modernized, eliminating the need to procure, implement, and maintain duplicative systems in the future; and</p> <p>b. review existing decentralized Information Technology services and, where possible, consolidate these services with the Information and Technology Division.</p>	<p>a. A comprehensive list of all applications City-Wide not including City Agencies, Boards, and Corporations (ABCs) has been completed in Q1 2020. A roadmap will be developed in collaboration with key City business partners to identify applications that have the potential to be decommissioned, consolidated and/or modernized with a target of Q2 2021. Several key technology platforms have been identified for decommissioning with a target of Q4 2022, pending detailed planning and consultation with application owners.</p> <p>b. TSD is in process of reviewing existing decentralized IT services across Divisions. As a first step, TSD is liaising with various Corporate functions to develop a standard model that supports centralization across the City. The Centralization Working Committee (Corporate Services lead, TSD lead, FPD lead, P&E lead, Internal Audit lead, OC lead) and Governance accountability table are being set up to provide further direction on centralization.</p> <p>Estimated timelines Q4 2022.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2019</p>
6	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer to develop and</p>	<p>TSD hired new DCTO for Technology Services Delivery in Sept 2020. Under the new leadership, roles and responsibilities are being developed to</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>06/30/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	implement procedures to promote clarity in roles and responsibilities for creating, maintaining, and refreshing the Information Technology infrastructure roadmap.	create, maintain and refresh the IT infrastructure roadmap. The roles and responsibilities to create, maintain and refresh the IT infrastructure roadmap will be endorsed by the Enterprise Architecture Review Board (EARB) in Q4 2021.	3/31/2021 6/30/2019
13	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer, in consultation with the City Clerk, the City Solicitor, and where needed, the City's Accountability Officers, to include in the data governance model:</p> <p>a. guidance on the City's enterprise-wide data strategy to provide direction for lifecycle management and classification of data in alignment with the Municipal Code; and</p> <p>b. a special case data retention policy and procedure to address scenarios where archiving specific data is required, such as litigation needs.</p>	<p>To support compliance with the City's information management strategies, digital record keeping standards, governance and consultations were implemented for the inclusion of records management functions and capabilities into enterprise technologies.</p> <p>Also, Enterprise Content management technologies including a virtual record center for archiving of data and content was rolled out, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Descriptive Metadata Standards • Destruction of Source Records following Digitization • Creating and Managing Digitized Records Standard • Common Data Elements for City Forms Standard • Electronic Signatures (eSignature) Guideline • Records Management Metadata Standard <p>New digital information management standards, policies, and guidelines, will continue to be developed in 2021, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complimentary Fact Sheets • Controlled Vocabulary Policy • Privacy Policy (updates) • Information Management Accountability Policy 	12/31/2021 12/31/2019

Report Title: Improvement Needed in Managing the City's Wireless Telecommunication Contracts

Report Date: 6/28/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
5	<p>City Council request the Chief Executive Officers of City Agencies and Corporations to consider and implement the recommendations relevant to their operations included in the following Auditor General's reports:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Toronto Transit Commission: Managing Telecommunication Contracts and Payments. b. Improvements Needed in Managing City's Wireless Telecommunication Contracts. 	<p>Technology Services Division shared the Audit Reports for consideration and implementation by Chief Executive Officers of City Agencies and Corporations through a memorandum in October 2020. However, since this recommendation is also directed to Agencies and Corporations, the recommendation is being kept as Not Fully Implemented for tracking purposes so that the Auditor General's Office can follow up on it with the Agencies and Corporations. There is no action item for TSD.</p>	<p>12/31/2021 12/31/2020</p>

Report Title: Establishment of City Wide Cyber Security Breach Incident Management Procedures Required
Report Date: 6/19/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	<p>City Council request the City Manager, the Chief Information Officer and the City Clerk to coordinate and develop standard incident management procedures including communication protocols to address incidents involving cyber attacks / information breaches. The procedures and protocols should include:</p> <p>(a) Guidelines describing the sequence of actions that should take place as soon as staff become aware of a cyber attack/information breach incident.</p> <p>(b) Communication protocols detailing key contact names, functions and contact information for staff to receive guidance.</p> <p>(c) Reports to be completed by the affected organization, detailing the date of incident, systems affected, information compromised, and other relevant details.</p> <p>(d) Communications to the media/public, where required, including privacy protocols. The incident management procedures and communication protocols should be liaised across the City, including agencies and corporations.</p>	<p>Point a, b and c have been addressed. With respect to point D the Office of the CISO is in the process of sharing the plan within the city divisions and will extended to Agencies and Corporations once completely shared within the division. The completion date has been updated to Dec 31, 2021.</p> <p>A third-party external vendor has been engaged to develop the roles and responsibilities, as well as the relevant remediation playbooks.</p> <p>Multiple stakeholders have been engaged and are actively participating in developing an enterprise cyber incident response plan. Expected completion Q3 2021.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>09/30/2021</p> <p>3/31/2021</p>

Report Title: Information Technology Projects Implementation: Information Privacy and Cybersecurity Review of Human Resource System

Report Date: 02/03/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	<p>City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to enhance the management of cybersecurity and privacy risks, as part of its information technology project governance, by:</p> <p>a. ensuring that cybersecurity and information privacy requirements and related budget are part of the acquisition, development, design, and testing phases of technology projects; and the Office of the Chief Information Security Officer and the City Clerk must review and endorse the requirements and budget allocated for cybersecurity and information privacy for all City technology initiatives, transformations, and procurements;</p> <p>b. ensuring that a process is in place to identify, analyze, and communicate all cybersecurity and information privacy risks to all stakeholders at each project phase through a documented risk mitigation plan; and the identified risks are either mitigated or formally accepted by the division head/project</p>	<p>The Chief Technology Officer will enhance the management of cybersecurity and privacy risks as part of its IT project governance by:</p> <p>a. Reviewing and updating project governance to ensure that the business case for business and technology projects includes cybersecurity and information privacy requirements and related budget. The appropriate consultation with the Office of the Chief Information Security Officer and the City Clerk will be done through project governance – Q2 2022</p> <p>b. An updated project governance will be established to ensure that cybersecurity and information privacy risks are proactively identified, documented and communicated to all relevant stakeholders at each project phase through a Risk Mitigation Plan. The identified risks will be either mitigated or formally accepted during project reviews and meetings, by the Division Head/Project Sponsors before the system is launched – Q2 2022</p> <p>c. Regular project governance will ensure that specified timelines are followed for remediation of open risks in the Risk Mitigation Plan and that risks are either mitigated or formally accepted by the Division Head/Project Sponsors as part of defined Exit Criteria before moving to the next project development stage – Q2 2022.</p> <p>Expected implementation date: Q2 2022</p>	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>09/30/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>sponsor and communicated to the City's Senior Leadership Team before the system is launched;</p> <p>c. ensuring that the remediation of open risks is completed within a specified timeline and are signed off by the division head/project sponsor before moving to the next project development stage; and</p> <p>d. identifying new or reallocated resource requirements required by the Office of the Chief Information Security Officer or the City Clerk needed to support the information technology project through its life cycle.</p> <p>City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to extend the actions in Part 1 above to existing in-progress technology projects and all future implementations.</p>		
3	<p>City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to enhance project governance by:</p> <p>a. ensuring that all projects fully comply with the Project Review Team gating approvals; and exceptions relating to cybersecurity and privacy must be reviewed by the Chief Information Security Officer and the City Clerk for a go/no-go decision;</p> <p>b. ensuring that project management gating criteria include a clear</p>	<p>The Chief Technology Officer will enhance project governance by:</p> <p>a. Establishing an updated Project Review process with appropriate Gating Model. Project Review Team (PRT) will ensure mandatory compliance with the Gating Model for all capially funded projects that meet the established criteria. The PRT gating model to include review and sign-off of exceptions relating to cybersecurity and privacy by the Chief Information Security Officer and the City Clerk for a Go/No-go decision. – Q2 2022</p> <p>b. Ensuring the PRT Gating Model includes a support transition plan from 'project' to 'operations' for all projects at last gate before moving to production stage or from one stage to another, depending on which project management methodology is used, such as Agile project management – Q2 2022</p>	<p>09/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	support transition plan when projects move from development to operations or from one stage to the next, depending on which project management methodology is used, such as Agile project management; and c. ensuring that project managers are trained in change management methodology.	c. Conducting assessment of the change management needs to prepare Change Management training. All Project Managers will be trained in change management methodology – Q3 2022. Expected implementation date: Q3 2022	
4	City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to: a. in coordination with the Chief Information Security Officer and the City Clerk, prioritize and direct resources to develop a training program for project managers and key staff involved in the implementation of technology initiatives to receive cybersecurity and information privacy training focused on managing technology projects; and b. conduct an assessment to determine the feasibility of extending this training program to major agencies and corporations.	The Chief Technology Officer will coordinate with the Chief Information Security Officer for cybersecurity training material and with the City Clerk for information privacy training material to educate project managers and key staff involved in the implementation of technology initiatives– Q4 2022. Expected implementation date for City Divisions and an agreed approach for major agencies and corporations: Q4 2022	12/31/2022
5	City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to enhance the project governance and project management framework by ensuring that: a. all stakeholders' roles and responsibilities are clearly defined and key stakeholders are	The Chief Technology Officer will enhance the project governance and project management framework by: a. Developing a clear responsible, accountable, consulted, and informed (RACI) matrix for each project. It will ensure that stakeholders' roles and responsibilities are clearly defined and there is proper stakeholder representation from the project initiation stage, including the City Clerk and Chief	06/30/2022 09/30/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>involved from the pre-procurement stage;</p> <p>b. a clear support transition plan when a project is moved from development to operations at Gate 4, the last gate before the system is moved to operations;</p> <p>c. the Chief Information Security Officer and the City Clerk are part of the project steering committee for all key technology initiatives and transformations; and</p> <p>d. criteria are developed to determine projects with high risks that have not been mitigated prior to moving to production be escalated to the Senior Leadership Team; and the developed criteria should be shared with the City Manager for City-wide implementation.</p>	<p>Information Security Officer for privacy and security impacts – Q2 2022</p> <p>b. Ensuring the PRT (project review team) Gating Model includes a support transition plan from 'project' to 'operations' for all projects at last gate before moving to production stage – Q2 2022</p> <p>c. Please refer to response: a.</p> <p>d. Developing criteria to determine projects with high risks that have not been mitigated prior to moving to production and the mechanics for escalating to the Senior Leadership Team (SLT) – Q2 2022.</p> <p>Expected implementation date: Q2 2022.</p>	
6	<p>City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to enhance the project management framework by:</p> <p>a. including a review of internal controls for systems that involve financial transactions; and</p> <p>b. involving the Controller or the Director, Internal Audit in the review of user roles in relation to financial transaction processing to ensure that the appropriate segregation of duties is maintained for all user roles.</p>	<p>The Chief Technology Officer will enhance the project management framework by ensuring that projects that involve financial transactions have a specific review of internal controls including segregation of duties, in consultation with the Controller's Office or Internal Audit – Q2 2022.</p> <p>Expected implementation date: Q2 2022</p>	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>09/30/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
7	<p>City Council request the Chief Technology Officer improve the user permissions framework of the Human Resources application, including:</p> <p>a. conducting a cybersecurity and information privacy review of the various roles created in the Human Resources system;</p> <p>b. reviewing the users with a Super Administrator role and limiting the number of users with that role considering the industry's best practices and professional bodies;</p> <p>c. ensuring that user access roles are designed with cybersecurity and information privacy in mind; and access roles should be provided to users on a "need to have" basis;</p> <p>d. defining a process for the approval of access roles for support staff; instead of providing Super Administrator access, support staff should be provided access on a "need to have" basis; and</p> <p>e. eliminating the use of generic and anonymous accounts; if these roles are needed as an exception for operational reasons, detailed monitoring and logging procedures should be developed and implemented for these roles; and, in addition,</p>	<p>The Chief Technology Officer will improve the user permissions framework of the Human Resources application by:</p> <p>a. Conducting a cybersecurity and information privacy review and update of all roles created in the HR system, not only those identified in the previous privacy incidents – Q1 2022</p> <p>b. Conducting a review of accounts with Super Administrator access and limiting the number of users with that role, using least privileged access principles and considering the industry's best practices and respective professional bodies – Q1 2022</p> <p>c. Ensuring that user roles are designed based on least privileged access principles where possible, and considering the industry's best practices and respective professional bodies – Q2 2022</p> <p>d. Defining a process for the approval of access roles for support staff based on least privileged access principles where possible, and considering the industry's best practices and respective professional bodies – Q2 2022</p> <p>e. Eliminating the use of generic and anonymous accounts for operational support where possible. If these roles are needed as an exception for operational reasons, a risk based approach will be adopted to limit use, considering the industry's best practices and respective professional bodies – Q2 2022</p> <p>In addition, a review of elevated access roles and use of generic or anonymous users in the SAP enterprise application will be considered, with the intent of adopting a risk-based approach to limit use.</p> <p>Expected implementation date: Q2 2022</p>	<p>06/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	the review of elevated access roles and the use of generic or anonymous users should be extended to the SAP enterprise application.		

Service Area: Finance and Treasury Services

Division: Accounting Services

Report Title: City Purchasing Card (Pcard) Program - Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program

Report Date: 10/27/2009

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
18	<p>The Treasurer develop and implement strategies to promote and expand the use of PCards by City divisions. Such strategies should include, but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Analyzing divisional purchasing patterns to identify potential areas for expansion;</p> <p>b. Developing and implementing measures to increase the use of PCards by divisions;</p> <p>c. Setting performance goals for the City based on the number of participating divisions and yearly PCard purchase volume.</p>	Systems Transformation Project (FSTP) will be incorporating all recommendations associated with financial processes, including payment options available to City divisions. As a result, all recommendations will be implemented as part of process and system redesign to be implemented in late 2023, based on the work of the system integrator and City project team.	<p>06/30/2023</p> <p>1/1/2023</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>

Report Title: Review of The Management of the City's Divisional Accounts Receivable
Report Date: 4/12/2012

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the City Manager to review the current management of all City-wide receivables. Such a process should be a part of the ongoing shared service review. The review should include an evaluation of centralizing the collection efforts of all outstanding receivables.	The City's Financial Systems Transformation Project (FSTP) will be incorporating all recommendations associated with financial processes, including payment options available to City divisions. As a result, all recommendations will be implemented as part of process and system redesign to be implemented in late 2023, based on the work of the system integrator and City project team	1/1/2023 9/30/2019 6/30/2018
3	City Council request the Treasurer to review current SAP management reports pertaining to the management of receivables. The reports should contain relevant and current information and include performance management information.	The City's Financial Systems Transformation Project (FSTP) will be incorporating all recommendations associated with financial processes, including payment options available to City divisions. As a result, all recommendations will be implemented as part of process and system redesign to be implemented in late 2023, based on the work of the system integrator and City project team.	1/1/2023 9/30/2019 6/30/2018 12/31/2016
7	City Council request the Treasurer to assess the feasibility of using the City SAP Financial System to the fullest extent in tracking actions taken on customer accounts sent to Legal Services and collection agencies.	The City's Financial Systems Transformation Project (FSTP) will be incorporating all recommendations associated with financial processes, including payment options available to City divisions. As a result, all recommendations will be implemented as part of process and system redesign to be implemented in late 2023, based on the work of the system integrator and City project team.	1/1/2023 9/30/2019 6/30/2018 12/31/2016

Division: Revenue Services**Report Title: Improving Controls Over Property Tax Assessments and Payment in Lieu of Taxes (PILTs)****Report Date: 10/03/2015**

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
2	City Council request the Director Revenue Services develop a process and criteria to identify where Payment in Lieu of Tax amounts paid by the government agencies are significantly less than requested amounts and take steps to invoke the review process when warranted.	A process for this requirement is currently being developed and documented.	12/31/2021 12/31/2018 12/31/2017
4	City Council request the Director Revenue Services develop a process and criteria to identify where Payment in Lieu of Tax payments may be deemed unreasonably delayed and request supplementary payments where warranted.	A process for this requirement is currently being developed and documented.	12/31/2021 12/31/2018 12/31/2017

Report Title: Audit of Water Billing and Collection- Phase 1: Overdue Water Account Collections Require Strengthening**Report Date: 2/17/2016**

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
7	City Council request the Director, Revenue Services, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to review the potential of charging interest on outstanding water	RSD staff continue to conduct a review and expect to be completed by Q4 2021.	12/31/2021 12/31/2019 12/31/2016

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	account balances that are not eligible for transfer to property taxes. Such a change may require amendment to the City of Toronto Municipal Code.		
18	<p>City Council request the Director, Revenue Services, in consultation with the General Manager, Toronto Water, to:</p> <p>a. Establish a formal protocol for setting up in the water billing system non-billable City accounts (where water consumption requires tracking but no payments are required from the Divisions), as well as, billable accounts (where payments are required from the Divisions for water service provided); and</p> <p>b. Review existing internal City accounts with overdue balances to determine if these are collectible and billable. The account status should be updated accordingly and outstanding balances should be collected or written-off.</p>	<p>a) "No Bill" Report exists and was provided to the AG's Office along with sample accounts identifying why certain accounts are not to be billed. This process will be automated in the new Water Management System Upgrade expected to be implemented in Q4 - 2022.</p> <p>b) City accounts will be identified during the review of the aged utility receivables by the collection unit. All accounts identified as non collectible will be included in the write-off list for considerations and approved by the Treasurer.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>6/30/2019</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>12/31/2016</p>

Report Title: Audit of Water Billing and Collection - Phase II: Part 1- Incorrect Vacant Land Status Properties Reduces City's Property Tax Revenue
Report Date: 10/13/2016

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	<p>City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to develop an action plan to resolve dormant permits. The Action Plan should include:</p> <p>a. A communication strategy to educate property owners about their responsibilities and obligations to inform the City about the progress of their construction project.</p> <p>b. A strategy to prioritize the review of permits that have been open for an extended period of time and are classified as vacant land.</p>	<p>a. As part of a communication strategy to educate property owners about their responsibilities to inform the City about the progress of their construction projects, Toronto Building has implemented the following actions:</p> <p>i) Toronto Building has a website for owners to look up the status of their inspections and Building Permit. Website link: https://secure.toronto.ca/ApplicationStatus/setup.do?action=init</p> <p>ii) As part of Toronto Building's Residential Infill Strategy, an area inspector visits the site at the beginning of a project to review what the responsibilities are for the homeowner/ builder, emphasizing their responsibility to meet the requirement to close the permits once the work is completed.</p> <p>iii) A Permit Closure Notice is automatically sent to the owner after the Building Permit is closed by the inspector to clearly communicate the completion of the work on the property.</p> <p>iv) In addition to the actions above, Toronto Building continues to explore new opportunities to educate applicants and provide upfront communications on the need to close permits.</p> <p>b. Toronto Building is continuing its work to close existing permits in all four districts through its dormant permit action plan. Toronto Building is supporting Revenue Services in compiling a database of properties classified as vacant land. Once the database is complete, dormant permits associated with these properties will be investigated against the database.</p> <p>Completion Timeline: Q1, 2022</p>	<p>3/31/2022</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>9/30/2020</p> <p>9/30/2017</p>
2	<p>City Council request the Director, Revenue Services and the Chief Building Official develop exception reports to monitor the classification status of vacant land properties, such as:</p> <p>a. Reports identifying</p>	<p>Revenue Services staff currently reviews occupancy permits relating to high-rise buildings to identify properties assessed as vacant land and confirm completed construction status. Revenue services are co-ordinating with both Toronto Water, and Toronto Building, to obtain additional water consumption data, and open permit data, to identify other vacant land properties with completed construction.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>09/30/2020</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>6/31/2017</p>

Attachment 2

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	properties with completed construction still coded as vacant land. b. Reports of properties with open permits coded as vacant land and consuming water.		
4	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to implement measures that will deter the occurrence of no show inspection visits. The measure should include an assessment of whether a fee can be charged to property owners for 'no show' inspection visits where these visits are pre-scheduled.	Toronto Building is undertaking a comprehensive Program Review that will include an examination of building inspection services. This review will consider what measures can be implemented to deter the occurrence of no-show inspection visits including whether a fee can be charged to property owners when no one appears for a scheduled site inspection. Implementation of this recommendation is linked with the Program Review currently underway with the Division. Completion Timeline: Q3, 2022	3/31/2022 7/31/2021 6/30/2020 6/30/2019 6/30/2017

Report Title: Auditor General's Review of Toronto Water Billing and Collections – Phase II: Water Billing and Water Meter Management Controls Require Strengthening
Report Date: 3/10/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Director, Revenue Services, to coordinate with Real Estate Services, Parks, Forestry & Recreation, Toronto Water and	Awaiting Information from Parks and Facilities to establish Lease information and parameters. Once that information is received, respective accounts will be updated and actioned accordingly.	12/31/2022 12/31/2021 3/31/2020 3/31/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>other City Divisions, and develop a plan to:</p> <p>a. compile a complete list of all City-owned leased and licensed properties and determine whether water consumption is being billed in compliance with the lease or licensing agreement;</p> <p>b. implement a communication process for 'Do Not Bill' properties for timely status updates when these properties are leased, licensed or sold, to verify whether they should be billed for water consumption;</p> <p>c. review existing 'Do Not Bill' properties to identify if they should be billed for water usage and adjust the designation accordingly;</p> <p>d. review existing 'Garbage Only' properties to determine if any of these accounts are billable for water; and</p> <p>e. periodically monitor the status of all 'Do Not Bill' and 'Garbage Only' accounts for updating the billable status.</p>		
2	<p>City Council request the Director Revenue Services in consultation with the City Solicitor, Real Estate Services, Parks Forestry &</p>	<p>Awaiting Information from Parks and Facilities to establish Lease information and parameters. Once that information is received, respective accounts will be updated and actioned accordingly.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2020</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>Recreation and Toronto Water to:</p> <p>a. determine the back billing period for outstanding unbilled water consumption for City-owned leased and licensed properties and where required install water meters; and</p> <p>b. retroactively bill the water consumption accordingly.</p>		
6	<p>City Council request the Director, Revenue Services and General Manager, Toronto Water, to evaluate the feasibility of updating the water billing system with water meter records for multi residential properties, severed properties and properties with more than one street address associated with the same meter. A process should be developed for future updates to ensure every address is mapped to a water meter.</p>	<p>Water Meter records for multi-residential or multi-unit properties will be identified under a separate field in the re-developed WMACS System.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>3/31/2021</p>
7	<p>City Council request the Director, Revenue Services and General Manager, Toronto Water, to review all property addresses in the various systems with a view to integrating data and developing exception reports for properties without a water meter. A similar process should be developed for billing other revenue sources, such as, property taxes</p>	<p>Address matching has been identified as necessary in the re-developed WMACS System.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>3/31/2018</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	and solid waste charges.		

Division: Pension, Payroll & Employee Benefits

Report Title: Management of the City's Long-Term Disability Benefits Phase One: Improving City Management to Address Growing Trends in Long-Term Disability Benefits
Report Date: 10/6/2015

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Director, Pension, Payroll and Employee Benefits Division, in consultation with the Executive Director, Human Resources Division, to review alternate ways of managing the City's Long-Term Disability benefit program, including a review of how the Toronto Police Service and the Toronto Transit Commission manage their respective Long-Term Disability benefit programs.	<p>The Director Pension, Payroll and Employee Benefits, in conjunction with the Director Occupational Health, met with TTC and TPSB management team and completed a review of their Long Term Disability Plans and process.</p> <p>Key learnings of benefit to the City will be tabled at the next round of bargaining.</p>	<p>12/31/2023</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>03/31/2019</p> <p>06/30/2018</p>
5	City Council request the Director, Pension, Payroll and Employee Benefits Division, in consultation with the City Solicitor and the Executive Director, Human Resources Division, to review the current process to seek consent from Long-Term Disability claimants to facilitate employee return to work process.	<p>A process was developed and consent language was negotiated with the City's unions. In some cases, the consent language may not address the Benefits Administrator's privacy concerns and additional consent may be required to allow full communication of return to work issues.</p> <p>The Director Pension, Payroll and Employee Benefits, in concert with Director Occupational Health and Safety, will document an internal communication protocol to address workplace-related issues associated with Long Term Disability Claims and associated return to work. Due Q4 2021</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>9/30/2021</p> <p>3/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>06/30/2019</p>

**Report Title: Management of the City's Employee Extended Health and Dental Benefits
Phase One: The City Needs to Ensure Adequate Detection and Review of Potentially
Excessive and Unusual Drug Claims
Report Date: 10/24/2016**

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
15	City Council request the Treasurer to undertake a review of the City's records of eligible individuals for health benefits coverage to ensure accurate and complete information in the City's system. A review of the health benefit claim histories should be conducted on individuals with questionable or missing dates of birth. Where claim reimbursements were made for ineligible individuals, steps should be initiated to recover overpayments.	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>In addition to previous validation steps implemented by PPEB, the Treasurer will meet with the City's health benefits administrator to review the viability of providing an annual report listing of those members age 100 or greater with no benefits activity within the preceding year.</p>	<p>09/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>01/31/2019</p> <p>03/31/2017</p>

Division: Purchasing & Materials Management

**Report Title: City Stores: Maximize Operating Capacity to Be More Efficient
Report Date: 10/5/2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
3	City Council request the City Manager, through the Shared Services review, to explore ways to maximize purchasing power and rationalize materials handling for items commonly purchased by the City,	PMMD has been working with Agencies and Corporations on conducting joint procurement over the last few years. A working group was set up in 2015 and was active until late 2019 when due to staff changes, it was paused and then the global pandemic occurred. Working to restart the working group in 2021. PMMD has also become a member of larger purchasing groups. All of these are to leverage greater spend volumes to assist the City in	<p>12/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2017</p>

Attachment 2

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	its Agencies and Corporations.	getting better savings and being more efficient in the procurement process.	
4	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, to develop and implement an online system for ordering goods from City and Divisional stores.	PMMD continues to work with Technology Services Division to find an interim solution to create an online order form accessible for staff at remote work locations until a complete solution inclusive of the picture catalogue, can be completed.	12/30/2021 3/31/2021 12/31/2020 12/31/2018 6/30/2017

Report Title: Review of Divisional Purchase Orders
Report Date: 2/6/2015

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	<p>City Council request the City Manager to expedite implementation of the outstanding recommendation, below, which is contained in the Auditor General's 2010 report "City Purchasing Card (PCard) Program – Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program": "The Treasurer develop and implement strategies to promote and expand the use of PCards by City divisions. Such strategies should include, but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Analyzing divisional purchasing patterns to identify potential areas for expansion. b. Developing and implementing measures to increase the use of PCards by divisions. c. Setting performance goals for the City based on the number of participating divisions and yearly PCard purchase volume."</p>	<p>Accounting Services has initiated a fulsome review of the Pcard program than includes the policy and approved use, associated procedures and expanded use of the card as a payment tool.</p>	<p>06/30/2023 12/31/2021</p>
2	<p>City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management review and revise quality assurance procedures including:</p> <p>a. Taking a risk-based approach to selecting</p>	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>The review of the Quality Assurance Procedures is currently underway. Some additional delays resulted in 2020 due to the impact and workload of</p>	<p>7/31/2021 12/31/2019</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	Departmental Purchase Order files for review. b. Adjusting sample sizes to a manageable level, to allow for a balance between the sufficiency and timeliness of file reviews. c. Tracking and monitoring the progress and compliance of divisions.	COVID19 on other functions, preventing the review process of the Quality Assurance Procedure from commencing sooner. The completion date for this recommendation of July 31, 2021 remains unchanged.	
4	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management to require staff be re-trained on the use of Divisional Purchase Orders in instances where consistently significant non-compliance is detected through quality assurance procedures.	With the transfer of the Non-Competitive Procurement function from CPPQA to Purchasing Client Services planned for July 1st, 2021, the CPPQA Team will commence Quality Assurance activities on Divisional Purchase Orders (DPOs), and where appropriate in findings relating to significant non-compliance, and will recommend training for users. This recommendation completion date is being reset to December 31, 2021 to enable time for the CPPQA Team to review data, conduct reviews, consult with clients, and make recommendations for retraining.	12/31/2021 09/30/2021 7/31/2021 12/31/2019

Report Title: Obtaining the Best Value Through the Use of Vendor Rosters
Report Date: 10/13/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, to: a. provide clear guidance on roster design, unless there is an overriding consideration otherwise, vendor selection methods that prioritize	Due to conflicting priorities and Covid 19 the creation of a RFSQ guideline, updates to the RFSQ procedure, roster audit procedure, and updates to the RFSQ template were delayed. The plan is to complete this by Q4 2021.	12/31/2021 9/30/2021 12/31/2019 12/31/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	cost should be used; and b. update the Buyer review process for rotational rosters, such as including verification of how a vendor was selected, and that prices charged match the original submissions made to the Request for Expression of Interest.		

Report Title: Audit of Interface Invoice Payments - Improving Contract Management and Payment Processes
Report Date: 6/18/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
2	City Council request the Controller to develop a process to verify the accuracy of early payment discounts for both interface and non-interface payment vendors. The 'discount lost' report should be updated to identify and include discounts lost on interface payments.	The Controller, in consultation with the Chief Purchasing Officer, the Director of Accounting Services and the Chief Information Officer, will as part of the P2P process implementation ensure that early payment discounts are properly identified on the contracts. This has been delayed due to COVID and targeted at end of 2022.	12/31/2022 12/31/2020
3	City Council request the Controller to automate recording, monitoring and collection of volume rebates. Outstanding amounts of volume rebates should be followed-up on, including those identified during the audit.	In January 2020 PMMD identified and developed a list of all existing contracts that contained volume rebate from year 2015 thru to 2019 and recently added a tab for 2020. The list was cross referenced to the list identified by the AG and further cross referenced to the list of payments received. The list has been updated and will continue to be updated on a monthly basis. However, the list will be maintained manually until such time an alternate option becomes available to track electronically.	12/31/2022 8/31/2021 12/31/2020
4	City Council request the Chief Purchasing Officer to compare the current list of volume	In January 2020 PMMD identified and developed a list of all existing contracts that contained volume rebate from year 2015 thru to 2019 and recently added a tab for 2020. PMMD began issuing emails	11/30/2021 08/31/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	rebate vendors with City contracts to identify any vendors offering discounts but which may have been omitted from the existing manually maintained list.	to the vendors. Of the vendors that were contacted we received little or no response. However, this activity came to a halt in March 2020 due to Covid which didn't allow us to complete the follow-ups nor complete the draft procedure. We will commence this activity again and continue to reach out to all the vendors by email and phone calls. Should we not receive a response or do not receive the volume rebate that is owed to the City, PMMD will add the vendor to the Debtors Watch list. PMMD will have this completed by 4th Quarter Of 2021.	1/31/2021 6/30/2020
6	City Council request the Chief Purchasing Officer to develop criteria and procedures for limiting the use of 'miscellaneous category' in contracts. Any excess expenditures under the miscellaneous category over a specified limit should be reported as exceptions to respective Division Heads.	Due to COVID this has been delayed. PMMD will develop a procedure with respect to the use of a miscellaneous category in contracts. Due date has been set to be completed by end of Q4, 2021	12/31/2021 11/30/2021 7/31/2021 6/30/2020
10	City Council request the Controller to evaluate the feasibility of establishing a Centralized Contract Management Unit/Centre of Excellence to look after City-wide contracts, where possible. The Unit should be responsible for: a. performing continuous controls monitoring on contracts, including analyzing divisional purchases, consolidating overall trends, and monitoring contract compliance; b. developing criteria for providing exception	The Controller, PMMD, Internal Audit and the City Manager's Office are working on how best to approach this recommendation.	12/31/2022 12/31/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	<p>reports to divisions on contract compliance, for example, purchase of goods not listed in the contract, and following up with divisions on any potential changes required to contracts;</p> <p>c. developing processes and guidelines for divisions to improve automation and consistency in ordering, receiving and paying for goods and services.</p>		
16	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Facilities Management Division to develop:</p> <p>a. a complete list of all City-owned transformers.</p> <p>b. a process for validating city's records of transformers with hydro service provider for eligible credits.</p> <p>Further, the transformer list should become part of the Facilities maintenance program.</p>	<p>The Energy Management Team has established a list of accounts that include City-Owned transformers that meet the sizing requirements of the Transformer Allowance. This list is used to validate that the City is receiving the transformer allowance on eligible accounts. The process 'Transformer Allowance Verification Procedures' document outlines the steps necessary to ensure that the Transformer Allowance line item is appearing on invoices. This process can be run as needed but will be run quarterly as a normal business process.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>06/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2020</p> <p>6/30/2019</p>

Service Area: Infrastructure and Development

Division: Municipal Licensing and Standards

Report Title: A Review of Municipal Licensing and Standards Division's Management of Business Licences - Part One: Licence Issuance, Inspection and Complaint Investigation Functions

Report Date: 10/24/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to review the By-law provisions, related enforcement framework, and the Division's Standard Operating Procedures, pertaining to unlicensed businesses with a view to strengthen the City's efforts to ensure compliance with licensing requirements.	Staff completed a review of a suite of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) in 2019, including those for licences such as eating establishments and retail food stores, nightclubs and entertainment establishments, and body-rub parlours, and holistic centres. The Chapter 545, Licensing reviews, including bars, restaurants, and nightclub licensing, are ongoing with a target completion date in Q4 2021. Staff will report on body-rub parlours and holistic centres in Q3 2021. These reviews have been impacted by COVID-19 as a result of shifting City priorities, staffing challenges, limits on consultations, and industry impacts.	12/31/2021 6/30/2019
2	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, to review and improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the existing proactive inspection process. Steps to be considered should include:</p> <p>a. Develop and implement proactive inspection frequency by the type of business licences based on risks and enforcement history.</p> <p>b. Ensure adequate supporting documentation on proactive inspections is</p>	<p>Due to pressing and ongoing Covid 19 pandemic and the divisional pressures and competing priorities this recommendation remains under review by Management and will not meet the original target date. It remains under further review by Management.</p> <p>Management is further reviewing the details of the recommendation and the documents required to fully satisfy this recommendation. Due to Divisional pressures the deadline was not met.</p> <p>Business Licence Enforcement has finalized and implemented a series of standard operating procedures to support enforcement decisions relating to proactive enforcement and frequency of enforcement based on risk assessment. SOPs also provide guidance on documentary evidence building. Updated officer training continues to be rolled out. Further, prioritization projects are underway within Business Licence Enforcement to develop a priority matrix rating system to objectively rank work areas and better deploy resources.</p>	06/30/2022 09/30/2021 12/31/2019 12/31/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	retained to ensure the inspections are conducted in a consistent and equitable manner to all licensees and for quality assurance monitoring purpose.	DataMart (Business Intelligence tool) launched in Q4 2019.	
3	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, to review and enhance the timeliness and efficiency of the complaint investigation process. Steps to be considered should include but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Capture the necessary milestone dates in the licensing database to enable monitoring of performance measures.</p> <p>b. Establish performance measures to track and monitor the efficiency of complaints handling and investigation process.</p> <p>c. Develop internal processes to periodically review staff time spent by type of investigation to ensure efficiency use of staff resources.</p>	<p>MLS has launched DataMart (Business Intelligence tool) in Q4 2019, which provides a suite of performance measures that are used to track the efficiency of complaints handling and investigation process. MLS has chosen Salesforce as the cloud based system to replace current systems. MLS will move all of Licensing, IBMS and parts of Chameleon to Salesforce over the next two years. MLS began by working with 311 to manage noise complaints, from intake to resolution, on Salesforce. The next phases of modernization include implementing Investigation Services and Licensing bylaw enforcement on Salesforce which will streamline and assist in complaints handling and performance measurement. Updated implementation date is Q2 2022.</p>	<p>6/30/2022</p> <p>12/31/2020</p>

Report Title: A Review of Municipal Licensing and Standards Division's Management of Business Licences - Part Two: Licensed Holistic Centres

Report Date: 10/24/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to re-assess the merits and practicality of relying upon Professional Holistic Associations as governing and accreditation bodies for holistic licensees and practitioners.	<p>A staff report recommending changes to these bylaw provisions was considered by the General Government and Licensing Committee (GGLC) in May 2019. The committee did not accept staff recommendations and referred the report back to staff for further research and consultation.</p> <p>MLS staff are reviewing the decision of Committee and will conduct research and consultation with a new report on this issue expected at the GGLC. Bylaw reviews have been impacted by COVID-19 as a result of a shift in City priorities, staffing challenges, limits on consultations and industry impacts.</p> <p>Due to COVID-19 pandemic and competing priorities, as well as the need and importance of further stakeholder consultation, at this time the report is not scheduled in 2021. Staff are reviewing the report timing and will have more information later in the year.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>6/30/2019</p>
2	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards in consultation with the City Solicitor, to conduct a detailed and thorough review of the existing By-laws and legislative framework governing the licensing of body rub parlours and holistic centres, with a view to ensuring the City can exercise effective oversight and enforcement actions to stop licensed holistic centres from offering services outside of the parameters and conditions of the licensing category.	<p>A staff report recommending changes to these bylaw provisions was considered by the GGLC May 2019. The committee did not accept staff recommendations and referred the report back to staff for further research and consultation.</p> <p>MLS staff are reviewing the decision of Committee and will conduct research and consultation with a new report on this issue expected at the GGLC. Bylaw reviews have been impacted by COVID-19 as a result of shifts in City priorities, staffing challenges, limits on consultations, and industry impacts.</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p> <p>6/30/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>6/30/2019</p>

Report Title: A Review of Municipal Licensing and Standards Division's Management of Business Licences - Part Three: Eating Establishments and Nightclubs
Report Date: 10/24/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to review the existing definition of "entertainment establishments/nightclubs" in By-law 545 to identify the necessary changes that will strengthen the Division's inspection and enforcement efforts relating to licensed eating establishments operating as unlicensed nightclubs.	MLS is currently reviewing regulations related to restaurants, eating establishments, entertainment establishments and nightclubs (called the Review of Bars, Restaurants, Nightclubs and Music Venues) – this will include public and stakeholder consultations. A staff report responding to the Auditor General recommendations and addressing other issues raised through the review will be presented to GGLC in 2021. This review has been impacted by COVID-19 as a result of shifting City priorities, staffing challenges, limits on consultations, and industry impacts.	12/31/2021 12/31/2019 3/31/2019
4	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to review By-law 545 provisions and classifications relating to eating establishments and entertainment establishments/nightclubs to identify needs for By-law amendments.	MLS is currently reviewing regulations related to restaurants, eating establishments, entertainment establishments and nightclubs (called the Review of Bars, Restaurants, Nightclubs and Music Venues) – this will include public and stakeholder consultations. In consultation with the City Solicitor, a staff report responding to the Auditor General recommendations and addressing other issues raised through the review will be presented to GGLC in 2021. This review has been impacted by COVID-19 as a result of shifting City priorities, staffing challenges, limits on consultations, and industry impacts.	12/31/2021 12/31/2019

Division: Toronto Building

Report Title: Toronto Building Division - Building Permit Fees, Improving Controls and Reporting

Report Date: 1/23/2012

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Chief Building Official in consultation with related City divisions review, revise and monitor the accuracy and completeness of information used to calculate building permit fees on an annual basis.	Toronto Building is currently working with an external consult who is engaged in a comprehensive Program Review. The review includes a detailed examination of the full cost model focused on reviewing the direct & indirect costs, revenues & reserve fund components that should be used to calculate building permit fees. Once completed it is anticipated that the Division can utilize the consultant's report to fully implement this recommendation by Q4-2021	12/31/2021 12/31/2019 12/31/2018 12/31/2017 12/31/2016
2	City Council request the City Manager formalize service level agreements with key divisions supporting the Toronto Building Division permit process. Service level agreements should set forth anticipated service levels and applicable charges.	<p>Toronto Building has now established a service level agreement (SLA) or a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with key Divisions supporting Toronto Building in the permit process including Information and Technology Division, 311 Toronto and Toronto Fire Services. Establishment and maintenance of the annual cost recovery for these divisions is managed through the Inter-Divisional Charges (IDC) and Recoveries (IDR) process, in accordance with Operating Budget policies. However, as a result of changes to the City's budget development guidelines implemented as of the 2020 Budget process, the actual and budget cost charges and breakdowns for the Service Level Agreements with the other City divisions is not available. As of the 2020 Budget process, interdivisional chargebacks (IDCs) and interdivisional recoveries (IDRs) have been eliminated corporate-wide, except in exceptional circumstances mostly associated with rate-based budgets.</p> <p>Toronto Building is currently undertaking a Program Review, which includes a review of the division's cost allocation model. This exercise is expected to result in recommendations to better align and integrate the division's budget development and the full costing processes. Implementation of Toronto Building's Program Review has just started and will take approximately 18 months to complete. Once this work is complete, the Division will update the Service Level Agreements to reflect the findings of the Program Review.</p>	10/31/2022 12/31/2019 12/31/2018 12/31/2017 12/31/2016

Attachment 2

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
8	City Council request the Chief Building Official to ensure that the annual report on building permit fees includes additional information explaining the differences between building permit fees collected and the amounts included in the annual report.	The Program Review currently underway is also considering best practices and recommendations on the annual reporting of building fees. The review is considering the full cost model including the "direct costs" & "indirect costs" as required under the Building Code Act for annual reporting. Recommendations brought forward by the consultant as part of the review will assist the Division to fully implement recommendation by Q4-2021	12/31/2021 12/31/2019 12/31/2018

Report Title: Toronto Building - Improving the Quality of Building Inspections
Report Date: 1/15/2014

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
7	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to ensure compliance with inspection documentation standards and that all inspection records are complete and reliable.	<p>Note: Management updated the status of the recommendation to report that it has been fully implemented after the Auditor General's Office had already completed the current follow-up review. Management's assertion will be verified in a subsequent follow-up.</p> <p>Toronto Building has amended its Inspection Audit Policy (A-60b), to align with the Auditor General's recommendation. The policy requires that management staff include a review of inspection notes and records entered IBMS by building inspectors when completing inspection audit reviews. The revised policy now requires audits be performed at least twice each year.</p> <p>Target completion date is Q3, 2021.</p>	<p>08/31/2021</p> <p>03/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>6/31/2017</p> <p>9/31/2016</p>
10	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director review the current quality assurance process and take steps to ensure City-wide inspection practices are consistent and comply with established Divisional standards.	<p>The Division has completed the development of the new Building Compliance Quality Assurance (BCQA) team. New positions have now been approved by City Council. With some recent audits and investigations, the Division is currently reassessing the BCQA team to ensure that it is appropriately structured to manage risks identified within the Division.</p> <p>With the new Quality Assurance team in place, the Division will be able to ensure City-wide inspection practices are consistent, comply with established Divisional standards and appropriately address risk management. It is anticipated the implementation of the BCQA team will commence in Q4-2021.</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>6/30/2018</p> <p>6/30/2017</p>

Division: Toronto Fire Services

Report Title: Toronto Fire Services - Improving the Administration and Effectiveness of Firefighter Training and Recruitment
Report Date: 09/16/2013

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
3	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to take the necessary steps to evaluate the goals and activities of the Professional Development and Training Division. Such steps should include but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Developing and using relevant and consistent key performance indicators that are aligned with the strategic goals of the Fire Master Plan;</p> <p>b. Determining the reporting requirements of training goals and activities, such as content, frequency, and recipients; and</p> <p>c. Ensuring necessary tools and information for measuring, monitoring and reporting activities consistently are available.</p>	<p>TFS is working to expand the Training Divisions Key Performance Indicators to include new performance targets and report training activities and accomplishments in measurable terms. This will allow TFS to better evaluate performance and opportunities for continuous improvement within the training division. In order to fully evaluate the effectiveness of the newly developed Key Performance Indicators, Training will monitor the data through a full cycle in 2021. TFS will provide the updated report to show the results of the full cycle in January 2022.</p>	<p>01/31/2022</p> <p>12/31/2019</p> <p>12/31/2018</p> <p>6/31/2017</p>

Division: Transportation Services

Report Title: Inventory Controls Over Traffic Control Devices in Transportation Services Need to be Improved
Report Date: 4/25/2012

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
8	<p>City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer to take</p>	<p>PMMD has been delayed in working with Toronto Water (TW) Ash Bridges Bay treatment plant, to ensure adequate inventory controls for TW's spare</p>	<p>12/31/2021</p> <p>6/30/2021</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
	appropriate action to identify City operations that maintain a significant level of inventory and review those operations to ensure adequate inventory controls are in place such as those identified in City's warehouse and stores business model as adopted by Council in the Corporate Warehouse/Stores Rationalization Project.	parts inventory are implemented, due to the pandemic.	6/30/2019 3/31/2018 6/30/2016

Report Title: Detection of Warning Signs for Potential Bid Rigging Should be Strengthened
Report Date: 3/17/2017

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
1	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, to develop and maintain a database of tender, contract, and sub-contracting information for all construction contracts in order to proactively monitor and detect potential bid rigging.	Supply Chain Transformation SAP Ariba team successfully implemented SAP Ariba Sourcing. Throughout 2020, work was completed on the design of the Contract Module which will provide a consolidated repository for all contracts and related data. COVID related resource reallocations slowed the progress on implementation, and timelines were adjusted to reflect the extended time requirements needed for completion to Q4 2021.	12/31/2021 9/30/2019

Report Title: Audit of Winter Road Maintenance Program - Phase One: Leveraging Technology and Improving Design and Management of Contracts to Achieve Service Level Outcomes
Report Date: 10/14/2020

No.	Recommendation	Management Comments as of October 1, 2021	Target Implementation Date(s) Provided in the Last 5 Years
18	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to ensure that the management and payment for services is consistent with the express terms of the contract for the next contract cycle.</p>	<p>Transportation Services proposes to: Create processes, procedures and forms as needed in order to ensure the contract management and payment for services is consistent with the express terms of the contract for the next contract cycle.</p> <p>Staff will be provided a training session from the Transportations' Contract Development & Controls Unit on the new contract terms and conditions. Additionally, the Corporate Compliance Unit (created in 2018 to support AG recommendations concerning contract management) will follow up in order to confirm that staff are aware of the terms and conditions of the contract as well as associated processes and procedures.</p> <p>This action shall be completed by: Future Winter Maintenance Contracts Q4 2022 (pending the start of new contracts).</p>	<p>12/31/2022</p>