

Toronto Newcomer Strategy Renewal
Consultation Synthesis
March 2021

CONTENTS

Purpose	1
Newcomer Experiences	1
Clients of Toronto Settlement Collaborative Members	1
Clients of the FCJ Refugee Centre	3
Clients of Butterfly (Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Support Network).....	3
City as Policy Maker	4
General Views on Policy Role.....	4
Specific Policies	4
City as Service Provider.....	7
General Views on Service Provider Role	7
Delivery Issues and Strategies.....	7
Services for All Residents	9
Services Designed for Newcomers	13
Services of City Agencies, Boards and Corporations.....	14
City as Employer.....	16
Employment within the City and its Agencies.....	16
External Employment Strategies.....	17
City as Buyer of Goods and Services.....	17
City as Collaborator, Convenor, Advocate	18
General Views on Collaborator, Convenor, Advocate Role	18
Specific Types of Engagement	18
Leadership	20
City Councillors	20
Toronto Newcomer Office	21
Newcomer Leadership Table	21
Local Immigration Partnerships (LIPs)	22
Challenges and Opportunities.....	22
Trust.....	22
Diversity and Intersectionality	23
Data	24
Newcomer Retention	24

Pandemic.....	25
Towards a Renewed Newcomer Strategy	25
Importance of a Newcomer Strategy.....	25
Approach to the Strategy	26
Measuring Success.....	26
Appendices.....	28
Appendix A: Consultation Questions.....	28
Appendix B: Consultation Participants	29

Purpose

This document provides highlights from the consultation undertaken to inform the development of a renewed Toronto Newcomer Strategy. During the consultation, City employees, councillors, external stakeholders, and newcomers provided input through individual and group video sessions supplemented in some cases by written submissions. The consultation was conducted by external consultants Naomi Alboim and Karen Cohl with support from the Toronto Newcomer Office. The consultation took place from January 7 to March 5, 2021.

Newcomer Experiences

Clients of Toronto Settlement Collaborative Members

A focus group was held with three newcomers referred by member organizations of the Toronto Settlement Collaborative. The three brief case studies below have been drawn from details these participants shared about the impact of City services on their lives. For privacy purposes, the stories do not use their real names.

“Li Na’s” Story

City Services: library, police, social assistance, youth recreation, TTC

Li Na is grateful for the help she received from a settlement worker at the Toronto Public Library. The worker, who speaks Li Na’s language, helped her gain Access to Ontario Works and to engage with the police to resolve a problem with a landlord who had forced her out and would not let her retrieve her belongings. Li Na has also found the Toronto transit system to be very convenient.

Li Na tried to apply for the Welcome Policy so her son could attend recreation programs at no cost. But she was not eligible because she had not filed taxes that year and could not provide a Notice of Assessment to demonstrate her eligibility. As a result, she had to wait a full year before she could be approved for the Welcome Policy and register her son for recreation programs. An ongoing problem for Li Na is that OW does not provide language interpreters.

“Hassan’s” Story

City Services: library, 311, kiosk program, TTC, Bike Share Toronto, recreation, public health, social assistance, employment services

In Hassan’s experience, the City has a wealth of resources and he has used many of them. At the same time, he believes that the City can do a better job in helping newcomers to know what resources are available and how to access them. He encourages all levels of government to provide more information before immigrants arrive in Canada and immediately upon arrival.

A Google search led Hassan to Toronto City Hall where he met with a Kiosk settlement worker from North York Community House. That organization and the City's 311 line helped to identify a range of resources and support. The public library has also been a great resource for Access to books and to video tutorials that helped Hassan to prepare for his Microsoft certifications.

Hassan has also had positive experiences with Parks and Recreation (for skating in his neighbourhood rink) and Public Health (for locating a family doctor). He also enjoys the bike-share system of the Toronto Parking Authority which he finds to be more reliable than the buses and streetcars.

Hassan gave up on Ontario Works due to the onerous application process and after being told that he would have to liquidate his resources in order to be eligible. And he was discouraged to find that employers who claim to promote diversity and inclusion are unwilling to provide Canadian experience or to recognize international experience.

“George’s” Story

City services: Newcomer Day, shelter, social assistance, employment services, library, correspondence with the Mayor

When George arrived in Toronto, the Red Cross referred him to local agencies who helped him to gain Access to Toronto's emergency shelter system. He lived at Seaton House for two months where he met, in his words, “the most vulnerable people in Canada.”

George describes his experience at Newcomer Day at City Hall to be like “finding a golden egg”. At that event, he met someone from Neighborhood Link Support Services who told him about the New Knowledge New Steps program. That six-week program gave him guidance about what he needed to do to support his settlement and integration process.

Ontario Works connected George to the Job Incentive Program and he completed a volunteer placement at a municipal office. It also enabled him to receive funding for the bridging program he needed to complete the accreditation process. Despite many challenges, George was successful in the bridging program and obtained licensure in his field.

George has had positive experiences with Toronto Public Health, the TTC and the Toronto Public Library. The library helped him to improve his literacy and language skills.

George observed that many landlords are not interested in renting to newcomers and the waiting period for subsidized housing is 10 years. He feels strongly that this situation needs to change. He would also like new arrivals to have access to system navigators, discussion circles to enhance orientation and reduce isolation, and information on financial institutions and credit.

Although George is in many ways a success story, he cautioned that it is a challenge “to search for resources that are scattered everywhere to support an individual in reaching their end goal.”

Clients of the FCJ Refugee Centre

The FCJ Refugee Centre met with three undocumented Toronto residents and asked them the focus group questions provided by the consultants. They are grateful for City services such as housing/shelter, apartment subsidy, public health (e.g., vaccinations), food banks, and the public library. However, they would like the City to make its programs and services better known. “For the most part, the services are there but some individuals have no idea.”

These residents have observed that some City workers do not understand the “don’t ask don’t tell” nature of the Access T.O. policy. When asked about status, it is embarrassing, upsetting, shaming, and discouraging. There is also a sense that services seem to be rushed or dismissed because “they know I don’t have status and can’t do anything to really complain.” The City should help build public understanding that “people who don’t have status aren’t bad people, we’re just in hard circumstances.”

Despite the challenges, the three individuals do their best to maintain a positive outlook: “This is my home now and I’m trying to do my best to be a part of everything.” Their main recommendation is that the City should make newcomers feel safe and listen to youth.

Clients of Butterfly (Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Support Network)

Butterfly reached out to migrant sex workers and workers in holistic centers and body rub parlors to obtain input to the consultation. The workers were asked about their experience accessing City services and navigating City policies. 28 responded to an online survey and 15 participated in one of three focus groups. This response reflects an interest and willingness to participate in social change and take part in the policy-making process.

The respondents noted that the Access T.O. policy for undocumented residents has not been well implemented. The City needs to inform newcomers and migrants about the policy, train City staff, and remove identification requirements for City services such as business, trade and vehicle licences, social housing, and financial assistance. “I didn’t know about the policy before, and I am still afraid of the police and bylaw enforcement officers.” The City also needs to provide interpretation, translation and technology support so newcomers can access City services.

The respondents are mostly satisfied with government financial support during the pandemic but they would like the City to waive the application and renewal fee for licensing and permits for 2020 and 2021 due to lost income. They also ask that no license or permit be removed from people who lost their status due to delayed

immigration applications during the pandemic. “The license is really important because it is only way for me to make my living.”

They also recommend that the City provide accessible occupational training and workshops to newcomers to increase job mobility and security. Such training is often unavailable to marginalized populations due to language barriers, a lack of financial support, and long working hours.

City as Policy Maker

General Views on Policy Role

The City has done a good job in creating policies and frameworks that recognize newcomers as a vital part of the community, in keeping with the City’s motto: “Diversity Our Strength.” But that is only half the battle. Real change comes with implementation and that is where the City’s focus needs to be. Access T.O. is a notable example of a good policy that lacks proper implementation. It is essential for the entire City – not just the Toronto Newcomer Office – to address issues through a newcomer lens.

Possible directions:

- Focus on implementing decisions already made, such as the Access T.O. policy, to address gaps between policy and practice.
- Direct each City division to conduct a systemic policy review to identify the barriers that newcomers face in access to City services.
- Follow up policies with evaluation of their implementation.

Specific Policies

Integrating Cities Charter

The City’s endorsement of the Integrating Cities Charter is viewed as significant because it refers to migrants, not just immigrants, and focuses on municipal roles.

Refugee Resettlement Policy

Policy leadership in refugee resettlement was highlighted as a positive development. The Syrian Refugee Resettlement work is well regarded for its focused approach and work with United Way, other levels of government, and community agencies. Collaboration with the settlement sector led to seamless transition from federal to municipal income support for Syrian Government Assisted Refugees.

Access T.O.

The City prides itself as being a sanctuary city and the creation of the Access T.O. policy is a positive development. In addition to guiding City employees, this policy sets an example for other municipalities, such as the City of Durham which has relied on it as a framework.

The City has followed through with some Access T.O. training of City staff, and certain programs are seen as well aligned with the policy, such as the Toronto Public Library, the Toronto Public Health sexual health and prenatal clinics, and the Fair Wage Office. The TPL, for example, will issue a library card simply by confirming a person's mailing address to demonstrate that they are a resident of Toronto. 311 has also excelled in providing information safely.

Despite this progress, the City has not rigorously implemented Access T.O. in a meaningful way across all its divisions and agencies, and it is unclear which services can be safely accessed. Some staff are still asking for immigration status when they shouldn't be. And the lack of photo identification remains a persistent barrier preventing people from gaining access to some City services. This is harmful to residents who are afraid to contact the City or access services due to the risk of deportation.

While the problem is widespread, stakeholders say that Toronto residents without status are especially intimidated by by-law enforcement officers and police, fearing that they will be reported to the Canadian Border Services Agency.

Possible directions:

- Strengthen commitment and action on Access T.O. through dedicated resources for training, policy work, implementation, and communication.

Commitment

- Obtain buy-in from the City and Council that undocumented residents are a population that needs support in terms of access to City services and referrals.
- Embed Access T.O. as top of mind in everything the City does.

Training

- Provide training to City staff and volunteers about the Access T.O. Policy, what it means for their services, and how it should be applied. Include sensitivity training developed by migrant organizations.
- Train City Councillors to support Access T.O. by making referrals safely.

Policy work

- Amend the Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act to bar the City from sharing personal information with law enforcement or another government where it may result in detention or deportation.

Implementation

- Create a comprehensive implementation plan that includes licensing, policing, public health, transit, social services, social/community housing, and paramedics.
- Amend intake and registration forms to remove requests for immigration status and identifying information.

- When absolutely necessary, accept copy of passport, including expired passport; birth certificate, library card, Ontario Photo ID card, and letter and affidavit attesting identity.
- Provide IDs for those who don't have official ID in order to access City services.
- Simplify and anonymize complaint policies so newcomers feel safe using them.

Communication

- Ensure that undocumented residents are aware of the Access T.O. policy.
- Make it clear what City services can and cannot be safely accessed.
- Make the information visible in multiple languages at the location where forms are available or need to be submitted.
- Use public signage, advertisements in community newspapers, and a broadly advertised online portal.

Toronto for All

The Toronto for All Campaign (Welcome Toronto Campaign) is a good initiative countering xenophobia, racism and more to ensure that the Toronto is a welcoming community.

Strong Neighbourhoods

The City's Strong Neighbourhoods initiatives are viewed positively. Most of the identified neighbourhoods are also where newcomers live.

Community Coordination Plan

The City established clusters through the Community Coordination Plan but when discussing community issues, a newcomer lens was not utilized which is why it was necessary to develop a newcomer cluster.

Possible directions:

- Provide a local approach to newcomer access based on neighbourhoods, leveraging the work of the City clusters.

Equity Lenses

The City's equity lens tools help divisions to identify unintended impacts in policies and programs and to think about mitigation opportunities for a variety of equity groups including newcomers. The Equity Responsive Budgeting process is also positive in that divisions putting forth requests for enhanced budgets must include an equity impact statement.

Possible directions:

- Make use of an equity lens mandatory for policy and program design.

Pursuing a Municipal Nominee Program

There are differing views about whether Toronto should pursue a Municipal Nominee Program. One view is that this new program represents an opportunity for talent recruitment and converting essential temporary or undocumented workers to permanent residency. Another view is that such a program would not have a significant impact on the number of immigrants who settle in Toronto.

City as Service Provider

General Views on Service Provider Role

The Toronto Public Library was cited as exemplary in improving the lives of a wide range of newcomers. City shelters, employment and social services, 311, and public health were also noted as achieving positive results. Newcomer benefits have also been derived from recreation and economic development programs but more attention is required in these areas. In general, temporary foreign workers, international students, and undocumented residents are underutilizing City services.

Possible directions:

- Identify and revise eligibility requirements for City services that may unintentionally create systemic barriers for newcomers.
- Educate staff on how to apply a newcomer lens to their programs and services. This is not just a TNO responsibility.
- Scrutinize approaches to see if some subgroups are being overlooked, such as temporary foreign workers, international students, refugee claimants, and undocumented residents.
- Create a newcomer centre where anyone who first arrives can obtain initial emergency support and referral to other services.

Delivery Issues and Strategies

Language and Interpretation

Language barriers were mentioned as an area of concern due to a widely-perceived lack of interpretation and translation support for many City services. TESS has made some progress in enhancing the use of interpreter supports and 311 provides access to multiple languages through the Language Line.

Possible directions:

- Make a concerted effort to resolve challenges related to the availability of interpretation and translation.
- Establish a centralized budget for translation and interpretation.
- Provide more interpreters for services delivered online.

Technology and Online Services

COVID-19 has amplified the digital divide which remains a barrier to successful integration. This problem affects many newcomers, including children who are falling behind in school.

Possible directions:

- Consider newcomer challenges in access to technology when delivering services online.
- Provide internet, WIFI, and equipment for people living in TCHC buildings. Consider the mobile internet bus model that was used in Rexdale when libraries were closed.

Mental Health

Mental health issues have been exacerbated by the pandemic. This impedes newcomers' ability to learn English, to integrate and to access services.

Equitable Access

Some neighbourhoods where newcomers reside have minimal City facilities, especially outside the downtown core. Services must be geographically equitable so that newcomers have access to facilities, transit, childcare and recreation. Geographic equity would help to make neighbourhoods more welcoming for newcomers.

Possible directions:

- Invest in building City facilities in neighbourhoods with large newcomer populations.
 - Conduct an analysis of each neighbourhood to determine where the need is.
 - Create a capital budget to provide libraries, community centres, pools, etc. equitably in all neighbourhoods.
 - Be cautious not to stigmatize neighbourhoods as poor or disadvantaged.

Direct vs. Community Delivery

While the City provides many services that help newcomers with their settlement, it does not provide settlement services directly. Such services are provided by community agencies. Consultation participants cautioned against the City moving to the direct delivery of settlement services.

Possible directions:

- Support and work closely with community agencies but do not compete with them.
- Fund more grass roots organizations.
- Better leverage the existing network of settlement service providers.

Understanding City Services

The ability to find and understand City services is of critical importance to newcomers. While some initiatives such as the welcome brochure and settlement kiosks have helped, many newcomers struggle to find what they need. Navigation of the City's website is a particular challenge.

Possible directions:

- Provide more information sessions at community centres, TESS locations, etc. on how the City operates and the services it provides. Use local TV and radio to get information out more widely in multiple languages.
- Use non-traditional strategies to reach newcomer youth. WhatsApp and Twitter are insufficient.
- Improve and streamline the flow of information on the City website to improve newcomer access to information.
- Collaborate with Service Canada to communicate about services and facilitate cross referrals.
- Engage with pre-arrival service providers to ensure that people destined to Toronto are well informed about City services.

Resources

The allocation of resources speaks to the City's priorities. To-date, the perception is that newcomer initiatives have not been adequately funded by the City, although it is a positive development that equity issues must now be considered in making budget decisions.

Possible directions:

- Ensure newcomer activities and the Toronto Newcomer Office are appropriately funded.
- Identify how money spent by the City ensures the betterment of newcomers and does not create additional barriers.

Services for All Residents

Shelters and Housing

The City supports refugee claimants in shelters and in their transition to housing in collaboration with community and GTA partners. Shelters are open and inclusive and they don't ask about immigration status. Outcomes for refugee claimants have been positive, in that their length of stay within shelter system tends to be brief and one-time, whereas other individuals may stay longer and have multiple stays.

The Shelter, Support & Housing Administration division has had to ramp up new programs, secure funding commitments through City Council, and try to recoup expenses from the federal government. The division also had to equip shelter staff with training and information about the needs of refugee claimants.

Because of negative attitudes and stigma, landlords often are unwilling to rent spaces to newcomers. Affordable housing stock continues to be a challenge for newcomers and the broader population.

The City has responded well to previous surges of refugee claimants arriving in Toronto. Stakeholders would like to know whether sufficient planning is in place for the anticipated increase in demand on the shelter system when the border reopens and a new surge of claimants arrive.

Possible directions:

Shelters

- Address the unique needs of refugee claimants in the shelter system.
- Dedicate refugee shelters for children whose parents are detained and for refugee claimants who have mental health issues.
- Be prepared for the anticipated influx of refugee claimants when borders reopen.

Transition to Housing

- Work with landlords to make them more open to rent to newcomers.
- Play a stronger leadership role in affordable housing by pursuing co-ops, using city land for affordable housing rather than townhomes, and fixing up decrepit housing.

Public Health

Targeted support for newcomers is provided in a variety of Toronto Public Health programs such as Healthy Babies Healthy Children and Breastfeeding Clinics. The universal nature of Toronto Public Health means that everyone can get support regardless of status. Public Health is seen as having done a good job in making COVID information available in multiple languages and formats. Mental health remains a serious barrier to newcomer integration.

Possible directions:

- Prioritize newcomers arriving with mental health issues.
- Strengthen work in health promotion and literacy to help newcomer youth get connected to primary health care early on.
- Find ways for the City to help non-status people to receive healthcare.

Children's Services

Newcomer families need children's services for successful integration. The Children's Services staff are viewed as responsive and helpful in conducting assessments and referrals. And it is a positive development that interpretation services are included in the virtual caseworker services of the EarlyOn childcare program. The main gap, however, is that there not enough childcare spaces.

The City cannot waive provincial legislative requirements for childcare subsidy programs, such as the requirement that taxes have been filed. Despite provincial

barriers for subsidies for childcare, the children's services division uses discretion where possible for newcomers and assigns more subsidized spaces to neighbourhoods with a high concentration of newcomers.

Potential ideas:

- Ensure all newcomers, including refugee claimants, have equitable access to in children's services.
- Consider more flexible interpretations of provincial guidelines to remove barriers for newcomer access to children's and social services.

Employment and Social Services

Toronto Employment and Social Services (TESS) works well with settlement agencies to provide training to social assistance recipients and is inclusive of refugee claimants. Additional investments through COVID-19 have enabled more clients to receive training. "Building Connections", a TESS employment program, is beneficial for newcomers who tend not to be well connected to other available supports. Toronto Employment and Social Services (TESS) uses interpreter supports, a client advisory board, and client satisfaction surveys. A significant barrier is that non-status residents remain ineligible for the program because Ontario Works is delivered on behalf of the provincial government,

Possible directions:

- Provide social services regardless of immigration status. Non-status people are literally left out in the cold.
- Provide access to interpreters to enable clients to communicate with their Ontario Works caseworkers.
- Increase funding for the TESS employment preparation programs. The programs are great but there is insufficient funding to expand the work.

Recreation

Many newcomers have benefited from Toronto's recreation programs, parks and playgrounds which enable them to make connections and feel a sense of belonging. Positive initiatives include youth recreation workers, the piloting of settlement service stations in five community recreation facilities, and interactive gardening activities that promote social engagement in an environmental recreational setting.

The City's Welcome Policy provides free admission to paid recreation programs for residents unable to afford it. This is a critically important policy. However, the requirement to provide tax documentation can present a significant barrier. Other barriers to recreation programs (line-ups, cost, and limited resources) are not unique to newcomers, but have the effect of impeding integration. The phone and online system for registration can be particularly challenging and frustrating for newcomers, and some do not have the necessary technology or language skills. It has also been observed that refugee claimants are not well represented in recreation programs.

While the Parks, Forestry & Recreation division has received positive feedback from newcomers, settlement agencies report that they hear many complains about access to recreation. Moving forward, the division's ability to measure its impact in supporting newcomers and delivering relevant programming will be enhanced through updating and defining appropriate demographic and outcome indicators for services to newcomers.

Possible directions:

- Make recreation programs easier to navigate, access and register.
- Make the Welcome Policy easier to understand and access.
- Work with settlement agencies on issues raised by their clients about access to recreation.

Long-Term Care

Long-term care homes operated by the City provide essential services for many newcomer seniors and also have a high representation of newcomers in their workforce.

Possible directions:

- Provide culturally appropriate services and spaces for long-term care residents. Language is not enough.
- Address precarious employment issues, discussed below under the City as Employer.
- Gather newcomer data for the City's day programs and long-term care homes.

Economic Development and Culture

The Economic Development & Culture division has worked with settlement partners and arts organizations on cultural initiatives, including efforts to decolonize museums, incorporate the immigrant experience in cultural events, establish a newcomer museums month, and offer free tickets for events. The Division also oversees economic development programs that could benefit newcomers. Overall, economic development and culture are seen as an area where the City could do more in terms of access by newcomers to City services.

Possible directions:

- Ensure newcomers are more aware of economic development and cultural programs.
- Be more intentional in newcomer outreach to ensure access to economic development and cultural programs, including supports for small immigrant-owned businesses and entrepreneurs.
- Support newcomer-led businesses in becoming successful in networking, capital resources, and entrepreneurship.
- Work with employers to encourage them to hire newcomers.

Licensing and By-Law Enforcement

The Municipal Licensing and Standards Division takes newcomer issues into account in RentSafeTO and Apartment Building Standards bylaw enforcement for high-rise communities which tend to have high concentrations of newcomers.

As observed earlier in the discussion of Access T.O., undocumented residents may be fearful in their interactions with by-law enforcement officers. There is also a perception by organizations representing migrants that some by-law officers have engaged in racial profiling and the targeting of newcomer racialized women.

Possible directions:

- Do not require immigration status for licenses and business permits.
- Train licensing staff on Access T.O. and to identify issues of exploitation in the workplace and human trafficking.

311

311 is a highly regarded service where newcomers can find help, in multiple languages, to identify the resources and support they need. Staff are well trained and helpful.

Toronto Paramedic Services

Possible direction:

- Provide cultural training for emergency medical service providers.
- Guarantee free access to essential services such as ambulances.

Services Designed for Newcomers

The City provides three services designed specifically for newcomers: Newcomer Service Kiosks, Toronto Newcomer Day, and the Newcomer Welcome Brochure. These activities have benefited from IRCC funding.

Newcomer Service Kiosks

The Newcomer Services Kiosks are a collaborative program that brings settlement services into City facilities such as City Hall, civic centres, community centres, TESS offices, and shelters. This enables newcomers – who wouldn't normally come to a settlement agency -- to address their settlement needs and navigate City services. This program is viewed as working well and has the potential for expansion to more City facilities to enhance its presence and reach more newcomers.

Possible directions:

- Scale up the Kiosk Program so that it is available in more City facilities, especially those with public facing desks or areas where newcomers go to receive city services.
- Improve outreach to raise awareness about the Kiosk program.

Toronto Newcomer Day

Toronto Newcomer Day is viewed as a good information sharing and community building exercise. Hosting Newcomer Day at City Hall connects newcomers to the main institution of the City, and to others in the community, making them feel included and welcomed. Newcomers find it helpful to be connected through Newcomer Day with service providers who can guide them in their settlement and integration process.

Possible directions:

- Consider decentralizing Newcomer Day by convening virtual events and possibly spreading the event to more locations during the year.
- Involve the City's Event Support Office in planning and delivering this event.

Newcomer Welcome Brochure

The Newcomer's Welcome Brochure is an informative resource that has been translated into Arabic, Farsi, Simplified Chinese, Spanish and Tamil.

Possible directions:

- Increase the distribution and number of languages of the Welcome Brochure to increase accessibility.

Services of City Agencies, Boards and Corporations

City agencies, boards and corporations (ABCs) are part of the City's broader public service. A newcomer strategy that does not include or mention them would be seen to fall short. While Council can make direct requests of ABCs, it must be mindful of their governance structures and applicable legislation, such as the statutes governing libraries, police, and health. There is an opportunity to build newcomer issues into the agency framework when resurrecting the government agency review, put on hold due to COVID.

Toronto Public Library

A widely held view among consultation participants is the value of the Toronto Public Library as a centre of information and support for newcomers. Libraries benefit a wide range of newcomers, including undocumented residents and individuals who do not otherwise have access to technology. Newcomers spoke in personal terms of the difference their local library made in their lives. The Library Settlement Partnerships, funded by IRCC, was highlighted as a successful partnership with settlement agencies to provide settlement services in libraries year-round.

Possible directions:

- Identify best practices that enabled Toronto Public Library to do such a good job. Was it having settlement workers there? Learn from them about how a large institution can make a shift.

- Explore whether the libraries are a resource and a space that could be utilized even more to deepen community wellbeing and improve outcomes for newcomers.
- Accept a library card as ID for all City services.

Community Centres

Community centres are a place where newcomers gain access to recreation and other services. Many programs in community centres are youth focussed which works to the disadvantage of newcomer seniors. At the same time, newcomer youth may be hesitant to use community centres without guidance about how they work.

Toronto Transit Commission

Newcomers benefit from the public transit system and some also use the Bike-Share system of the Toronto Parking Authority. The potential of the TTC was noted, both in terms of its role as a large employer and in terms of targeting its investments to serve residents who most need them.

Toronto Community Housing Corporation

The Toronto Community Housing Corporation affects social determinants of health. The chronically long wait list for community housing disadvantages newcomers who need access to housing urgently.

Toronto Police Services

The police can make a huge difference in ensuring that newcomers feel safe and are able to thrive, but there is a sense that the Toronto Police Services are untouchable. This is of particular concern to undocumented residents and the organizations that support them, some of whom experience racial profiling, or feel intimidation and fear about being reported by police to federal authorities for deportation.

Possible directions:

- Ensure that Toronto Police Services are well trained on and adhere to the Access T.O. policy.

Public Appointments Process

Possible directions:

- Develop outreach initiatives to encourage newcomers to become engaged through the public appointments process to the City's agencies, boards and corporations. Applicants do not have to be Canadian citizens and international degrees and accreditations are accepted.

City as Employer

Employment within the City and its Agencies

Providing Work Experience at the City

There are multiple benefits to hiring newcomers: they possess talents and skills, speak multiple languages, and understand different cultures. The City has the power to provide and create permanent job opportunities for newcomers and to provide opportunities to make newcomers more competitive within the broader labour market.

Possible directions:

- Provide opportunities – such as paid internships, co-op programs, and job-shadowing – to provide Canadian work experience, ensuring that opportunities lead to a pathway to permanent employment.
- Adapt the Toronto Urban Fellows Program to create a newcomer fellowship program for skilled newcomers to conduct research and policy work.
- Allow graduates of the City's mentorship program to be considered as internal applicants for City jobs for one year.
- Create a support network for newcomer staff.

Outreach and recruitment

Possible directions:

- Arrange more open houses for newcomers looking for work
- Provide sessions to share information in different languages about City employment practices, job opportunities, and how to apply.
- Focus on hiring people representative of the community for senior positions. There will be a lot of turnover due to retirements over the next 2-5 years.

Employment in Long-Term Care

In the Seniors Services and Long-Term Care division, much of the workforce consists of frontline workers, mostly women working as personal support workers and registered practical nurses. They are typically women of colour, many of whom are newcomers. Some are underutilized, overqualified internationally educated health professionals. The division has begun conversations with the Confronting Anti-Black Racism unit about how to better support these workers in a precarious and relatively low-income sector.

Potential directions:

- Target employment strategies to improve working conditions and provide opportunities for growth to frontline workers in City-run long term care facilities.

Diversity & Barrier Removal

The People and Equity Division takes diversity seriously, including the need for identifying targeted strategies for the recruitment of newcomers. At staff levels, the City

is beginning to better reflect the community, but there is still a long way to go in achieving diversity at management levels.

Possible directions:

- Conduct a systems audit on barriers to greater diversity at the senior management level.
- Review job descriptions and human resource policies to ensure they do not act as barriers to newcomer employment with the City.
- Take care in how job descriptions are written. Newcomers with relevant experience may not be familiar with the terminology or how duties are described.
- Provide opportunities for training and career progression for newcomer staff.

Employee Training

The City does not currently have a strong emphasis on employee training. Training on cultural sensitivity and service issues will be essential to provide meaningful access to City services by newcomers, including the implementation of Access T.O.

Possible ideas:

- Invest more in employee training on equity and newcomer issues.
- Support structured training on multiculturalism, cross-culturalism, anti-oppression and cultural sensitivity within the City

External Employment Strategies

Newcomers are discouraged by employers who are hesitant to recognize international experience or to provide Canadian work experience. Stakeholders would like to see proactive engagement with employers and on external employment initiatives to address these persistent barriers. Through its own role as an employer, the City can also signal the value and importance of employing newcomers. The City's involvement in TRIEC's mentorship program has resulted in strong and lasting relationships between mentors and mentees.

Possible directions:

- Engage with employers on ways to connect newcomers to the labour market.
- Bring employers to the table with community partners.
- Help to ensure that newcomers are aware of their rights, such as the Ontario Human Rights Commission's 2012 policy that employers cannot ask for Canadian experience or use it to disqualify candidates.

City as Buyer of Goods and Services

The City's social procurement program could be a lever to strengthen newcomer-led enterprises and professionals since the City spends billions of dollars on contracts. There is little evidence, however, that this is happening.

Small newcomer businesses find it difficult to compete. The City's tendering process caters to larger businesses. The scope of work is often beyond what a smaller business can handle, such as the ability to serve anywhere in the city rather than at one local facility. And the system is easier to navigate for people who are familiar with it.

It may be difficult to convince divisions to think more broadly about the requirements for the goods or services they need to procure. Is it essential for an applicant to have been in business for a certain number of years, to have a specified type of experience, or to be able to provide services on a city-wide scale? Another challenge is the lack of an organization that certifies newcomer businesses.

Possible directions:

- Train divisions on the benefits of social procurement.
- Proactively provide information sessions to newcomer-owned or run business, ethnic business associations, and informal networks about what the City buys, how the City goes about doing it, and how to best respond to what the City asks for.
- Build the list of newcomer-owned businesses in relevant sectors.
- Consider tendering criteria to make small businesses eligible (e.g., catering for a few organizations rather than all, or in a neighbourhood rather than city-wide).
- Take into account employer hiring practices and workforce representation when buying goods and services for community benefits.
- Collect data on the number of newcomer business engaged in City procurement processes.

City as Collaborator, Convenor, Advocate

General Views on Collaborator, Convenor, Advocate Role

The City is a strong and effective convenor and collaborator on newcomer issues with community and government partners. This is a real strength and important to sustain. Stronger advocacy is needed "to make the lives of newcomer better". At the same time, there is a desire for the City to focus most on what falls within its purview rather than calling on the provincial and federal government to take action.

Specific Types of Engagement

Community Engagement

The City has positive relationships with community leaders, especially in the settlement sector. Among other things, these relationships are of great assistance when considering new City programs and policies. Some community groups have expressed a desire to have a greater voice in City decision-making.

The inter-agency working group on refugee resettlement (established during the Syrian refugee crisis and no longer in place) is an example of a successful initiative that

brought together external stakeholders and City divisions, including divisions that are not typically engaged in immigrant and refugee issues.

Possible directions:

- Continue to convene the Newcomer Leadership Table and to work with the quadrant LIPs.
- Reach out to the University Health Network on issues affecting newcomer health and to post-secondary institutions to provide retraining opportunities and to support international students.

Newcomer Voice

Internal and external consultation participants identified the need for the City to hear directly from newcomers. That is essential to ensure that City policies and programs respond well to their needs. The Toronto Employment & Social Services division engages with clients (including newcomers) through satisfaction surveys and a client advisory committee of social assistance recipients.

Possible ideas:

- Ask newcomers how City strategies, programs and policies can improve their lives.
- Amplify the voices of marginalized groups. Don't speak for them. Create a space for them to tell their truths.
- Connect with newcomers by phone in their own languages.
- Create a specialized ombudsman or complaint mechanism for newcomers.
- Work with community agencies and faith organizations to engage a broader range of newcomers and to understand cultural nuances.

Other Municipalities

Internal comments:

The six biggest municipalities in the country meet on a regular basis. Their discussions help to inform what the Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) and federal government can address. The regional table for municipalities focuses on many issues affecting newcomers, such as transit, housing, broadband, and procurement.

Stakeholder ideas:

- Spark a regional push on newcomer issues with other municipalities, including the recognition of newcomer talent as a unique strength to the GTA.
- Do more as a member of the Big City Caucus at FCM to advocate with other levels of government.

Other orders of government

The municipal government is the level of government closest to its residents. This provides the City with insights into the experiences of newcomers and others. But many policies affecting newcomers do not fall within the City's purview. Collaboration and advocacy with the provincial and federal governments are therefore vitally important,

with expertise provided by the Intergovernmental and Agency Relations Division in collaboration with the Toronto Newcomer Office. Although federal contribution agreements place limitations on advocacy by funding recipients, nothing precludes the City trying to influence change or making suggestions to the federal or provincial levels of government.

Possible directions:

- Pursue an active voice with other orders of government. Be an active player at federal and provincial tables.
- Work with other orders of government to determine who will do what to achieve common goals.
- Be clear with other orders of government about what the problem is, what is the program or idea being pursued, how much it will cost, and who will benefit. Be granular about the ask.
- Encourage the Canada-Ontario-Toronto MOU steering committee to provide an annual report, outlining priorities and what has been done.

Consultation participants proposed a range of issues on which the City could advocate.

Possible federal advocacy issues:

- Access to federal programs for temporary entrants (temporary foreign workers, international students, refugee claimants, undocumented persons)
- Pathways to permanent residence for temporary entrants and undocumented residents
- EI program that works better for the people in Toronto, including newcomers

Possible provincial advocacy issues:

- Increased access to programs the City delivers on behalf of the Province, such as the children's subsidy, including access for people without status
- Enabling non-citizens to vote in municipal elections
- Strengthened human rights protections regarding discrimination in housing and employment

Leadership

City Councillors

Possible directions:

- Consider all City councillors to be newcomer champions.
- Provide more frequent reports to Council on Newcomer issues.
- Provide councillors with information about the role of the Toronto Newcomer Office and City programs and services that impact newcomer success.
- Analyse trends from newcomer calls or visits to councillors' offices. What are the concerns?
- Consider whether the City should have a newcomer advocate or committee of councillors to focus on newcomer issues.

- Bring together local councillors with their provincial and federal counterparts to discuss newcomer needs and how to address them locally.

Toronto Newcomer Office

TNO is highly regarded by stakeholders and by City employees who interact with that office.

The Toronto Newcomer Office (TNO) serves as a city-wide Local Immigration Partnership funded by the federal government and as a City office funded by the City. Both roles are important but the latter role is viewed as severely under-resourced. Because TNO's primary funding is from IRCC, there is little it can do beyond what has been stipulated in its federal contribution agreement. The unit remains very small, staff have tended to be on temporary contracts, and there is high turnover. TNO could provide more internal leadership and support in keeping with the City's commitment to newcomers if it had a more stable structure with proper funding from the City.

There are varying views about where TNO should reside within the City structure. One view is that TNO fits well within the Social Development, Finance & Administration division where other population-based offices reside. Being in the same division is seen as helpful in terms of supporting and facilitating collaboration among equity portfolios. Another view is that TNO would have a higher profile and opportunity for influence if it reported to the City Manager as do the Indigenous Affairs Office and the new Gender Office, with Director level leadership.

Possible directions:

- Clarify TNO's internal role within the corporation, focusing on things within TNO's sphere of influence and jurisdiction, and resource it accordingly.
- Include a role for TNO as a facilitator and advisor for other divisions to ensure the newcomer lens is being considered, including monitoring, evaluation, etc.
- More clearly define TNO's role as a city-wide LIP and its relationship to the other LIPs.

Newcomer Leadership Table

The Newcomer Leadership Table (NLT) is a prime example of the City's convenor role, bringing together multiple sectors and organizations to improve the wellbeing of newcomers and support integration.

The NLT has been invaluable for the City in testing out policy positions and collaborating with the members' respective agencies. Stakeholders appreciate having access to dialogue with representatives from all three orders of government around the table. NLT is seen as most effective when reacting to emerging issues and problem solving in the face of a crisis. At the same time, there is a strong sense that the NLT is not being used to its full potential and spends too much of its time on information sharing. There is an interest in NLT having a clearly defined vision, strategies, and a solutions-oriented approach for greater influence.

The NLT membership is helpful in providing different lenses, experiences, and knowledge. It could be helpful to add representatives of non-status residents, temporary workers, and international students, whether at the NLT table or subcommittees. The value of observers is unclear. While having three co-chairs works well in many respects, that structure can make it hard to chair, provide direction, develop an action plan, make proposals, and drive to solutions. Some have suggested that NLT employ breakout sessions or smaller work groups instead of having over 40 people engage in a single discussion.

Possible directions:

- Balance the role of NLT in providing advice to the City, supporting the community to know what the federal and provincial governments are doing, and actively working collaboratively on selected issues/targets of change.
- Supplement NLT with expertise regarding international students, temporary foreign workers, and undocumented persons.
- Align meetings with the City budget, policy setting, and Council cycles, with meetings timed to enable input from the NLT to Council meetings.

Local Immigration Partnerships (LIPs)

Toronto's four quadrant LIPs and TNO as a city-wide LIP all do good work but there is some confusion with all the different structures and how they intersect. Further, each LIP seems to operate independently which results in a lack of strategic coherence.

Possible directions:

- Help to create a high-level vision for an integrated approach among the quadrant and city-wide LIPs.
- Continue to collaborate with the quadrant LIPs to address issues such as newcomer health, housing, and labour market integration.
- Clarify the roles of the city-wide LIP, quadrant LIPs, and NLT. The structure is confusing.
- Provide a greater City voice and presence in the quadrant LIPs.

Challenges and Opportunities

Trust

Trust of government is a real issue that many newcomers face. This should be kept in mind when developing policies. Some newcomer communities do not trust government because of experiences in their home countries. As a result, they don't take advantage of services and opportunities to which they are entitled.

Possible directions:

- Fund agencies that newcomers trust, as was done during Covid.
- Build trust by integrating feedback from newcomer resident engagement.

- Establish connections with faith leaders with whom newcomers have deep, trusting relationships.

Diversity and Intersectionality

Newcomers are a diverse population and their needs and challenges intersect with factors such as race, gender, LGTBQ2S, disability, mental health, language, age, income, and homelessness. Special attention should be given to the fact that many newcomers are racialized and that Black and other persons of colour, including racialized women, face special challenges as do persons who identify as LGTBQ2. Cultural sensitivity is important but training to counter racism, sexism, transphobia, etc. should be embedded throughout the strategy. Anti-black racism, anti-oppression, and anti-transphobia should be kept top of mind. It is also important to remember that vulnerable groups include newcomers but not all newcomers are vulnerable.

Possible directions:

- Utilize an intersectional lens when it comes to newcomers.
- Enhance awareness of intersectionality and how newcomers may identify themselves when they engage with local government.
- Tailor services to newcomer subgroups, e.g., Somali youth.
- Adjust services to address the needs of newcomer seniors who are currently underserved by the City, including Black Seniors, LGTBQ2S seniors, etc.

Francophone newcomers:

- Take francophone identity into account in the intersectional approach, e.g., Black Francophones. It is not just a matter of language but culture too.
- Hire more Francophone employees so bilingual capacity is enhanced and needs of Francophones are taken into account.
- Engage more with Francophone partners to systematically structure solutions for Francophone newcomers.
- Link the City's LIPs more effectively with the French LIP (RIF) for southern Ontario, located in Hamilton to coordinate supports for francophone newcomers.

Indigenous Peoples

The City has a role in educating newcomers about Indigenous history, truth and reconciliation. Ultimately it is about building empathy and understanding. To that end, TNO is using federal funding to develop a guide to teach newcomers about Indigenous people and improve Indigenous-Newcomer relations.

Note: First Nations, Indigenous and Metis people should not be referred to as equity seeking groups. They have distinct Indigenous rights including self-determination. It can be difficult for First Nations, Indigenous and Metis people to engage in conversations when they do not see themselves in that space, so that grounding needs to be front and centre and that distinction understood.

Possible directions:

- Expand activities for community connection to raise newcomer awareness of Indigenous issues and to foster understanding, empathy and connection with Indigenous communities

Data

The City lacks data and outcome measurements to indicate how newcomers are engaging with City programs, services, and policies and the impact on their lives. The Data for Equity strategy is a positive development on the employment front.

Possible directions:

- Track data on newcomer access to selected high-impact City services, diversity in employment at all levels of the organization, and retention rates of newcomers in Toronto.
- Collect data on differential outcomes of different groups. Disaggregated data will be necessary to address intersectionality.
- Partner with and leverage the data of other organizations and governments.
- Don't overwhelm people with data collection.
- Capture the voices of newcomers. Quantitative data is not enough. Place the human element at the heart of the services, not statistics.

Data Challenges re Undocumented Persons

Collecting data on the take-up of City services by undocumented residents would contravene the Access T.O. policy. This in turn would create fear and reduce access to City services by undocumented persons.

Possible directions:

- Address challenges in how uptake and outcomes could be safely tracked for undocumented Torontonians. Anonymize data so that it is linked to immigration status but not any individual person.
- Rather than collect data on undocumented residents, ask community organizations that are primarily comprised of migrants or serve them what trends they are noticing and feedback they are receiving about City services.

Newcomer Retention

Toronto attracts a lot of people but many leave if they are unable to thrive in the City due to the lack of affordable housing, employment challenges etc. Toronto risks losing a pool of human capital to other communities or countries if Toronto is not viewed as a viable place to live, work and raise a family.

Stakeholder ideas:

- Focus on housing, jobs and accessible services so that more people will stay in Toronto.

Pandemic

Impact of the Pandemic on Newcomers

Covid-19 has unveiled and exacerbated many of the pre-existing social and economic inequities faced by vulnerable communities in Toronto. Hot spots during the pandemic overlap with communities that are immigrant, racialized and poor. All indicators (employment, health, housing etc.) are showing that newcomers are struggling disproportionately in terms of infection rates, employment loss, food and income insecurity, and overcrowded, unaffordable housing. COVID-19 has also resulted in a slowdown of newcomers coming to Toronto. This has consequences for the economy and the need to be prepared for surges in newcomer arrivals when borders re-open.

The City's Community Coordination Plan, bringing people together in clusters based on geography, is seen as helpful. The City also did a good job in translating materials in several languages to improve access to information about Covid-19. Shortly after the pandemic began, the City recognized that newcomers were highly impacted by the virus and that a newcomer lens had to be utilized.

Possible directions:

- As the economy reopens, prioritize newcomers who have been disproportionately negatively affected by the pandemic.
- Convene key partners, including employers, to address major issues that have resulted from the pandemic.
- Document lessons learned from the pandemic about the disproportionate impact on the health and economic status of newcomers.

Towards a Renewed Newcomer Strategy

Importance of a Newcomer Strategy

Supporting newcomers drives Toronto's prosperity. We need talent and Toronto is a place where people want to come. It is important to invest in newcomers to support their success. If newcomers are not supported to fully participate in the economy, they will continue to struggle and may choose to live elsewhere. According to the recent [Deloitte Catalyst report](#), newcomers and other communities should be leveraged and treated with dignity to support their participation in the economy or cities will be negatively impacted.

Much has changed since the previous Toronto Newcomer Strategy was introduced in 2013. The City has accomplished a lot and shown leadership, but many challenging gaps need to be addressed. As the order of government closest to residents and the provider of key services that residents need in a highly diverse population, it is time to update and refine the City's roadmap on newcomer issues.

Approach to the Strategy

The strategy should focus on what the City can do in a variety of roles to ensure that its programs and services meet newcomer needs and contribute to their overall wellbeing. The City should work with the community to create welcoming and inclusive communities, serve as a role model on supporting newcomer success, and ensure that employees and elected officials are well versed in newcomer issues for equitable access.

The strategy should be clear, focused and concise with identifiable metrics. It is preferable to identify a few impactful bold moves rather than a long list of actions. Articulate where progress has been made and where there is more work to be done. Where do you want to mobilize the energy for change? The ultimate outcome of the strategy should be systemic change involving a cultural and paradigm shift.

The strategy should include principles and an accountability mechanism. It should emphasize the competitive advantage that newcomers bring in terms of talent and skills and the innovation and creativity that come from hyper diversity. Racism should be specifically mentioned, but terms such as “minority” or “vulnerable” should be avoided. Ideally the strategy will be both pragmatic and aspirational, including the flexibility to respond to emerging issues.

Meaningful implementation will require adequate resources and measures to ensure that newcomer policies reach frontline staff who work with clients. Without sufficient resources, expectations will be created that the City cannot deliver. Funding from other orders of government is important and appropriate, but municipalities also have to do their part.

As a City-wide strategy, implementation should be integrated into the work of all divisions and agencies, with advice and support from the Toronto Newcomer Office. The strategy should be linked to other corporate strategies that the City has introduced. Given the wide array of City services, it will be important to focus on high impact services for newcomers, including support for residents in the greatest need due to poverty, mental health, or pandemic scarring. A high priority should be placed on access to things like income support and housing which are essential for everyday life.

Where possible, the City should align with IRCC priorities, such as community connection, recreation, welcoming and inclusive communities, vulnerable groups (visible minorities, LGBTQ, youth, seniors, people with disabilities, those who experienced trauma), francophone newcomers, Indigenous-newcomer relations, visible minority women, anti-racism, innovation in settlement delivery, digital literacy, mental health, and supporting the transition to permanent residency for two-step immigration processes.

Measuring Success

The strategy’s success can be measured through disaggregated data, surveys, exit interviews, case studies, and talking to people affected by the strategy. This is in

consistent with the City's growing emphasis on results-based accountability and outcomes-based measures.

One approach would be to include measures for things that are high impact and municipally led, like recreation, shelters, and public health. Another is to develop regional measures in light of the dynamic flow of newcomers throughout the GTA. In any event, the City should keep sight of the people and stories behind the numbers and not get hung up on the perfect indicator.

Timely reviews can be conducted to learn how the strategy is progressing and a final report can be prepared after the five years to show changes that have occurred during that period. When something doesn't work, the City is encouraged to consider that as a moment for learning and public discussion rather than as a failure.

The City can also learn from experts and evaluation and measurement approaches taken by other jurisdictions, municipalities (e.g., Durham, York Region, Markham), other City strategies (e.g., Seniors Strategy), and the Indigenous Affairs Office (which is planning to hold more community sharing circles to obtain feedback from the community).

Indicators of Success

There are many challenges in defining indicators since success may look different for each newcomer and the City is one player of many who contribute to it. Some participants suggested indicators centring on Toronto as a welcoming city where newcomers have a sense of belonging, well-being, connectedness, feel safe, supported, welcome, are employed, safely housed, and have received training and accreditation, no longer need child subsidy support, have access to education for their children, and have acquired social capital. Related to this would be indicators about whether newcomers remain in Toronto.

Other suggested indicators flow from the City's different roles. In the City's role as a policy maker, an indicator could be whether newcomer policies are being effectively implemented. In the procurement role, an indicator could be the extent to which the City does business with newcomer-led businesses and professionals. In the City's role as an employer, indicators could include: Has the City made demonstrable progress in hiring newcomers as City employees? Do its employees understand barriers newcomers face and how to make the city more accessible?

As a service provider, one could ask: What is the uptake by newcomers in various City services? Have things have improved for newcomers from having received City services? How satisfied are newcomers with the services? In its community and inter-governmental engagement, indicators could include: What results have flowed from the City's convening, collaboration and advocacy? Does the City give a voice to newcomers and reach out to organizations that serve them?

Appendices

Appendix A: Consultation Questions

Questions for Stakeholders and Partners

1. How effectively has the City of Toronto helped newcomers to thrive and contribute to Toronto's success and prosperity? Please refer to specific City policies, programs or activities. What is working well? What needs improvement? What is missing?
2. What priorities regarding newcomers would you recommend for the City in any of the following roles?
 - Policy maker
 - Service provider
 - Employer
 - Buyer of goods and services (procurement)
 - Collaborator, convenor, advocate
3. Can you suggest strategies for achieving the priorities? What would be the implementation challenges?
4. What would indicate the City's success in improving newcomer outcomes? How could success be measured or evaluated?
5. Do you have any other advice or suggestions for the development of a renewed Newcomer Strategy for the City of Toronto?

Questions for Internal City Staff and Officials

Questions for City staff and officials were similar to the external questions, customized for each consultation session.

Questions for Newcomer Focus Group

1. What involvement have you had with services of the City of Toronto or its agencies?
 - How helpful were the services?
 - Were they easy to access?
 - What improvements would you like to see?
2. Are there other things the City should be doing to encourage full participation of newcomers as Toronto residents?
3. Do you have any additional advice for the City of Toronto as it develops a renewed Toronto Newcomer Strategy?

Appendix B: Consultation Participants

TORONTO NEWCOMER STRATEGY - CONSULTATION TOTALS (Jan-March 2021)

Overview	116
Newcomers	34
City employees	35
City councillors	4
External stakeholders & partners	43
Newcomers	34
From Toronto Settlement Collaborative (focus group)	3
From FCJ (in writing)	3
From Butterfly (in writing)	28
City Employees	35
Omo Akintan, Chief People Officer	
Rebekah Bedard, Supervisor reference & Outreach, Toronto Archives (written input)	
Meena Bhardwaj, Management Consultant, Senior Services and Long-Term Care Division	
Susan Brown, Senior Policy Advisor, Policy Development, Economic Development & Culture	
Denise Campbell, Executive Director, Social Development, Finance & Administration Division	
Giuliana Carbone, Deputy City Manager, Community & Social Services	
Sonali Chakraborti, Senior Corporate Management & Policy Consultant, Governance & Corporate Strategy, City Manager's Office	
Wayne Chu, Manager, Poverty Reduction Strategy Office	
Robyn Cook, Committee/Council Administrator, Public Appointments (written input)	
Merona Abbas Estiphanos, Community Development Officer, Toronto Newcomer Office, Social Development, Finance & Administration Division	
Natasha Hinds Fitzsimmins, Acting Senior Communications Coordinator, Strategic Communications	
Marie Greig Committee/Council Administrator, Registry Services (written input)	
Josette Holness, Supervisor, Community Recreation, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division	

Andrew Kerr, Committee/Council Administrator, Registry Services (written input)

Jia Lu, Manager, Business Intelligence and Performance Measurement, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division

Shelley Mckeen-Weaver, Client Liaison Consultant, Children's Services

Anthony Morgan, Manager, Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit, Social Development, Finance & Administration Division

Chris Murray, City Manager

Nisha Nagaratnam, United Way Campaign Manager, Toronto Office of Partnerships

Elsa Ngan, Senior Services Specialist, Multicultural Services, Toronto Public Library

Tobias Novogrodsky, Director, Employment & Social Services Division

Mike Pacholok, Chief Procurement Officer

Jay Paleja, Senior Consultant, Intergovernmental and Agency Relations

Chris Phibbs, Director, Social Policy Analysis & Research, City of Toronto

Waheeda Rahman-White, Director, Equity, Diversity and Human Rights

Sandra Rodriguez, Director, Intergovernmental and Agency Relations

MacKenna Senkiw, Assistant Fair Wage Officer, Purchasing & Materials Management

Alison Stanley, Policy Development Officer, Social Policy, Analysis & Research, Social Development, Finance & Administration Division

Gord Tanner, Director, Shelter Support & Housing Administration

Jordann Thirgood, Senior Policy & Research Officer, Policy & Strategic Support, Municipal Licensing and Standards

Patrick Tobin, Acting General Manager, Economic Development and Culture

Kera Vijayasingham, Community Development Officer, Toronto Newcomer Office, Social Development, Finance & Administration Division

Nicole Watson, Policy Development Officer, Policing Reform, Social Development, Finance & Administration Division

Nicole Welch, Director, Healthy Communities (and COVID-19 Liaison), Public Health Division

Selina Young, Director, Indigenous Affairs Office

City Councillors	4
-------------------------	----------

Cynthia Lai, Scarborough North, Councillor

Mike Layton, University-Rosedale, Councillor

Anthony Perruzza, Humber River-Black Creek, Councillor

Michael Thompson, Scarborough Centre, Councillor	
External Stakeholders & Partners	43
<p>Mulugeta Abai, Executive Director, Canadian Centre for Victims of Torture</p> <p>Eno Al Khateb, Mohammad TEQ LIP Manager, Catholic Crosscultural Services</p> <p>Margarita Boody, Manager, Settlement Network, Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada</p> <p>Mario Calla, Executive Director, COSTI Immigrant Services</p> <p>Dr. Paul Caulford, Executive Director, The Canadian Centre for Refugee and Immigrant Healthcare</p> <p>Karen Cecco, Integration Program Officer, Settlement Network, Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada</p> <p>Debroy Chan, Vice President, Programs & Operations, TRIEC</p> <p>Teresa Costa, General Manager, Immigrant Services, YMCA of Greater Toronto</p> <p>Kim Coulter, President & CEO, JVS Toronto</p> <p>Ruth Crammond, Vice President, Community Investment & Development, United Way Greater Toronto</p> <p>Flordeliz Dandal, Executive Director, Kababayan Multicultural Centre</p> <p>Debbie Douglas, Executive Director, OCASI</p> <p>Aleks Dughman-Manzur, Director of LGBTQ+ Refugee Programs, Metropolitan Community Church of Toronto</p> <p>Monika Etzler, Program Manager, Continuing and International Education, Toronto District School Board</p> <p>Yvonne Ferrer, Director, Programs, Citizenship and Immigration and Office of Women's Issues, Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services</p> <p>Fatima Filippi, Executive Director, Rexdale Women's Centre</p> <p>Pamela French-Glaser, Manager, School of Immigrant and Transitional Education, George Brown College</p> <p>Amy Go, President, Chinese Canadian National Council for Social Justice</p> <p>Samya Hassan, Executive Director, Council of Agencies Serving South Asians</p> <p>Sarah Hickman, Policy Advisor, Diversity and Immigration Program, Regional Municipality of Durham</p> <p>Debbie Hill-Corrigan, Executive Director, Sojourn House</p> <p>Larissa Hretchka, Manager, Strategic Policy and Planning Unit, Citizenship and Immigration Division, Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services</p>	

Syed Hussan, Executive Director, Migrant Workers Alliance for Change (also sent written comments)

Ahmed Hussein, Executive Director, TNO-The Neighbourhood Organization

Rodel Imbarlina-Ramos, Director, Peel Newcomer Strategy Group

Axelle Janczur, Executive Director, Access Alliance Multicultural Health and Community Services

Rana Khan, Head of Toronto Office, United Nations High Commissioner of Refugees

Justin Kong, Executive Director and Jessie Tang, Community Organizer, Chinese Canadian National Council – Toronto Chapter

Lam, Alfred Executive Director, Centre for Immigrant and Community Services

Elene Lam, Founder, Butterfly (Asian and Migrant Workers Network) (also sent written comments)

Kaitlin Murray, Manager, Community Development, JVS Toronto (Toronto North LIP)

Jean Claude N'Da, Project Officer, Toronto-Hamilton-Niagara, Réseau, Réseau de soutien à l'immigration francophone du Centre-Sud-Ouest de l'Ontario

Morgan Owen, Director, Ontario Immigrant Nominee Program, Ministry of Labour, Training and Skills Development

Alison Pond, President and CEO, ACCES Employment

Mishaal Qazi, Newcomer Leader, Toronto Youth Cabinet

Lisa Randall, Senior Manager, SEPT Program, CultureLink

Francisco Rico, Co-Director, FCJ Refugee Centre

Prince Sibanda, Policy and Project Development Specialist, LIP, Regional Municipality of York

Bill Sinclair, Chief Executive Officer, The Neighbourhood Group

Agnes Thomas, Executive Director, Catholic Crosscultural Services

Yasmeen Tian, Senior Manager, Programs and Services, JobStart (Toronto West LIP)

Paulina Wyrzykowski, Director, Toronto South LIP Project, The Neighbourhood Group

Shelley Zuckerman, Executive Director, North York Community House