

Honoraria for Public Members of Council Advisory Bodies

Date: January 28 2021

To: Budget Committee

From: City Manager

Wards: All

SUMMARY

This report responds to direction from City Council for a model for the City to provide honoraria to public appointees to the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Advisory Committee and other Council Advisory Bodies (CABs) for the remainder of the 2018-2022 Term of Council. Honoraria would recognize the important contributions and lived experience of CAB members to assist City Council and City staff in their decision-making.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Manager recommends that:

1. City Council approve honoraria for Council Advisory Body members for the remainder of this Council term as follows:
 - a. Payments of \$125.00 per public member of Council Advisory Bodies per meeting attended, to the maximum number of meetings specified in the Terms of Reference for each advisory body.
 - b. Honoraria is not intended for members who serve on CABs as representatives of organizations or businesses where they are employed.
 - c. There is no additional honoraria for public members who serve as chair or co-chair.
 - d. Honoraria is not paid for attendance at sub-committee meetings or events.
2. City Council direct the City Manager, in consultation with the City Clerk, to review and consolidate the City's existing Remuneration Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations and the Expense and Travel Reimbursement Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations as appropriate.
3. City Council direct the City Manager, in consultation with the City Clerk, to review the honoraria program at the conclusion of City Council's term, and include any findings and recommendations as required in the City Manager's report on the establishment of Council Advisory Bodies in the next Council term.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

The estimated maximum total cost of \$66,000 gross and net for the honoraria for the Council Advisory Board members will be funded from within the 2021 Operating Budgets of Social Development, Finance & Administration, Economic Development & Culture and the City Manager's Office.

The Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial implication information.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of September 30, October 1 and 2, 2020, City Council established a Confronting Anti-Black Racism Council Advisory Committee and directed the City Manager, in consultation with the City Clerk, to research and establish a fair compensation or honorarium program for the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Council Advisory Committee members and other comparable advisory bodies and to report back with recommendations to establish such a program through the 2021 Budget Process. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2020.EX16.1>.

At its meeting of January 31 and February 1 and 2, 2006, City Council adopted the amended Remuneration Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations and the Expense and Travel Reimbursement Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2006/agendas/council/cc060131/pof1rpt/cl002.pdf>.

COMMENTS

Council Advisory Bodies established by City Council for 2018 to 2022 term.

Council Advisory Bodies (CABs) are established by City Council to provide advice to Council and assist its decision-making. Through CABs, City Council receives advice from the public, various sectors and industries, and stakeholders on key policy matters. CABs do not deliver services, direct City staff or make binding decisions on behalf of the Toronto government. CABs dissolve at the end of each term of City Council, unless required by legislation, or within the Council term if they have completed their mandate.

With the addition of the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Advisory Committee, City Council now has now seven CABs including:

- Aboriginal Affairs Advisory Committee
- Film, Television and Digital Media Board
- Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and Two-Spirit Council Advisory Body
- Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee
- Toronto Francophone Affairs Advisory Committee
- Toronto Music Advisory Committee

The City's Remuneration Policy

The City of Toronto has a *Remuneration Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations* which applies to public appointees to City agencies, boards, commissions, and corporations. The Policy's principles include:

- Public service is implied in any citizen appointment by the City of Toronto and therefore any remuneration that may be paid is not expected to be competitive with the marketplace.
- Where paid, remuneration for citizen appointees to City Agencies, Boards, and Commissions should reflect the level of responsibility, the necessary qualifications, the frequency of meetings, and amount of preparation required.

Historically, the Terms of Reference for CABs have specified that no remuneration would be provided to public members as per principle 8 of the Policy: "No remuneration will be paid to members of advisory committees, task forces, or boards of Business Improvement Areas, Arena Boards and Community Centres".

Proposed honoraria in recognition of lived experience

City staff are recommending an honoraria program for CAB members in recognition of their contributions to the decision-making processes of the City. Honoraria may:

- remove barriers to participation,
- support diverse engagement of equity seeking communities, and
- give recognition to the value of perspective and lived experience to Council's decision-making.

Providing honoraria to CAB members is consistent with recent input received by the Toronto Office of Recovery and Rebuild (TORR) as a means of investing in measures to address historic barriers for of all Toronto residents to provide advice and input in the decision-making processes of City Council and the City

Staff recommend that honoraria should not be paid to CAB members who are participating or appointed as a paid employee of an organization or business. Contributions from these members may be recognized in other ways such as through letters of appreciation, recognition events or public recognition.

As honoraria is not intended to serve as a salary or wages or to cover expenses of members, all CAB members who are eligible for an honorarium will receive the same amount including those who serve as chair or co-chair. Members of CABs are eligible for reimbursement of certain meeting-related expenses under the expense reimbursement policy.

Other City boards, committees, and tribunals

Remuneration is not provided to public members on many City bodies including Arena Boards of Management, the Association of Community Centre, Exhibition Place, Heritage Toronto, Lakeshore Arena Corporation, Legacy Fund Allocations Committee,

TO Live, the Toronto Atmospheric Fund, the Toronto Pan Am Sports Centre, the Toronto Preservation Board, the Toronto Zoo, and Yonge-Dundas Square.

Currently, the City provides remuneration to some Council-appointed public members in one of three categories:

- Services agencies - local boards for agencies such as the Board of Health, the Toronto Parking Authority, the Toronto Public Library, and the Toronto Transit Commission.
- Corporations - boards for City corporations such as Toronto Hydro and the Toronto Community Housing Corporation.
- Tribunals - Quasi-judicial tribunals which make binding decisions including the Committee of Adjustment, Sign Variance Committee, and the Toronto Local Appeal Body.

Council-appointed public members may claim reasonable expenses incurred while undertaking authorized business under the City's Expense and Travel Reimbursement Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations. Any such expenses are reported to Council on an annual basis.

Other Canadian municipalities

A review of other Canadian jurisdictions found that most reimburse expenses incurred by public committee members including:

- the City of Calgary did not provide any compensation or reimbursements for public members volunteering on advisory committees.
- reimbursement for parking or provide parking passes, limited transportation costs and limited dependent care / childcare. (Vancouver, Edmonton, Ottawa)
- refreshments and food for public members during meetings (Halifax, Vancouver)

None of the municipalities reviewed provided honoraria to committee participants in recognition of their contributions to the municipality's decision-making processes. While some interest was expressed in such a program, one city noted that costs related to responding to the current pandemic made it unlikely at this time.

Reviewing related City policies on remuneration

The City's Remuneration Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations and the Expense and Travel Reimbursement Policy for City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations have not been reviewed since 2006. Staff will review and consolidate these two policies for alignment and clarity, and if required, will bring forward any recommend changes in the City Manager's report on the establishment of Council Advisory Bodies in the next Council term.

CONTACT

Meg Shields, Director, Corporate Policy, City Manager's Office, 416-392-0523,
meg.shields@toronto.ca

Kelly McCarthy, Deputy City Clerk, Secretariat, City Clerk's Office, 416-392-8676;
kelly.mccarthy@toronto.ca

SIGNATURES

Chris Murray
City Manager

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A - Proposed Council Advisory Bodies Honoraria Program Costs

Appendix A - Proposed Council Advisory Bodies Honoraria Costs

Council Advisory Body	Meetings per year per Terms of Reference**	Public Members	Maximum annual cost per Member	Maximum total Annual Cost
Aboriginal Affairs Advisory Committee	6	24 representatives of Aboriginal Organizations	\$750	\$18,000
Confronting Anti-Black Racism Advisory Committee†	4	14 members of the public, including 8 representatives of organizations, 3 elder members and 3 youth members	\$500	\$7,000
Film, Television and Digital Media Advisory Board	4	20 members of the public, plus 1 representative each from Film Ontario, the Computer Animation Studios of Ontario, and the Motion Picture Association Canada	\$500	\$11,500
LGBTQ2S+ Advisory Committee*	4	13 members of the public	\$500	\$6,500
Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee	6	12 members of the public	\$750	\$9,000
Toronto Francophone Affairs Advisory Committee	3	4 representatives of Francophone organizations plus 4 members of the public	\$375	\$3,000
Toronto Music Advisory Committee	4	20 Music industry stakeholders, plus 1 representative of the Toronto Association of Business Improvement Areas and 1 representative from Toronto Tourism	\$500	\$11,000
CAB Honoraria Recognitions Annual Totals:	31	116 Public Members		\$66,000

† Confronting Anti-Black Racism Advisory Committee is still being recruited

* LGBTQ2S+ Advisory Committee has not yet started meeting

** CABs' Terms of Reference state that they may hold "up to [specified number] of meetings per year". A CAB may not reach its annual total for a variety of reasons.