# **Pre-Pandemic Directives Updates**

The following updates (as of April 15, 2021) provide information on a number of prepandemic directives that have been delayed due to the COVID-19 pandemic and are not currently anticipated for report back in 2021 unless otherwise identified. See the accompanying report for information on pre-pandemic directives that have already been completed or will be actioned by staff in 2021.

# A. Licensing and Enforcement Directives

With the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, Municipal Licensing and Standards' (MLS) resources were redirected to urgent COVID-19 enforcement efforts. The following three updates include information on the impact of the pandemic and related delays.

1. Update on Cross-Jurisdictional Action Plan for Bars, Restaurants, and Nightclubs

In December 2019, General Government and Licensing Committee directed the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to report back to the Committee on the progress of the cross-jurisdictional action plan as part of the bars, restaurants, and nightclubs review.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.GL10.14

Given public health related closures and restrictions impacting gatherings and businesses, the context for this item has shifted while these pandemic-related closures continue. When resources are available to address this directive and work resumes, it will need to consider the impact of the pandemic against the pre-pandemic information that was available in December 2019 when the item was adopted.

2. Keeping our Streets Clean from Cigarette Butt Litter

In April 2019, City Council directed the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards (MLS) to review the issue of cigarette butt litter with respect to the implementation and enforcement of regulations that require business owners and operators to ensure that cigarette butt litter is removed from in front of their premises as a condition of the issuance of a business licence as well as regarding the enforcement of regulations requiring the installation and maintenance of cigarette butt litter receptacles in front of restaurants, bars and other business establishments. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.MM6.10

Although this report was planned for March 2020, the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic delayed this report due to changes in the Committee and Council schedule and the diversion of City resources to urgent COVID-19 response. This work will resume in 2021 and a report will come forward at a future date.

3. Addressing Rat Related Complaints in our Communities

In April 2018, City Council requested the City Manager, the Medical Officer of Health, and the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to report on possible improvements to mitigation strategies and rat control education initiatives to assist residents and businesses and the current work being undertaken by the City and its agencies and divisions to incorporate preventative rat mitigation strategies into capital works projects.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.MM39.6

The COVID-19 pandemic has impacted the ability of MLS to complete this work, as resources were redirected to urgent COVID-19 responses. Although staff will not be reporting in 2021, MLS will pursue public education initiatives to support residents and businesses on this matter in the future, informed by research on rat mitigation.

# **B. General Government Directives**

City staff have worked to ensure City operations meet public health requirements throughout the pandemic. While resources such as Corporate Security and the City Clerk's Office have moved to support the functioning of government through the pandemic, work on the following items have been delayed.

4. Review of Enhanced Security Measures at Toronto City Hall

In January 2020, City Council requested the Executive Director, Corporate Real Estate Management to report on using artificial intelligence technology for the development of new security methods and options for the City of Toronto. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.GL11.4

City buildings, including City Hall, were closed to the public when the state of emergency was declared in March 2020. With City buildings closed, Corporate Security was redirected to support other COVID-19 response activities. Work on this item will resume once pandemic-response measures are no longer required.

5. Fleet Services Operational Review

In October 2019, City Council directed the General Manager, Fleet Services to report on an implementation plan for a centralized fleet management model and address the feasibility of the General Manager, Fleet Services providing oversight and approval for all fleet-related assets, goods and services purchased and used by City divisions and agencies. <u>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.AU4.6</u>.

Work on this was delayed with resources redirected to COVID-19 response and recovery. This review and the remaining actions are expected to resume in late 2021 or 2022. In late 2020 Fleet Services began the centralized procurement of all light duty assets for City Divisions, including Fire and Paramedic Services. Toronto Public Library, Toronto Community Housing and Exhibition Place were previously merged into this

approach that includes centralized procurement for a number of commodities such as tires, parts, fuel and fluids.

#### 6. Public Notices – Enhancing Public Engagement

In April 2019, the General Government and Licensing Committee directed the City Clerk and City Manager to report back on updating and improving public notices. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.GL4.15

Work on this directive was impacted by the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic in March 2020. The City Clerk's Office's resources were redirected to support COVID-19 response and the urgent requirements associated with the continuation of government in a remote environment. The City Clerk's Office recognizes that public notices are an important element of public engagement, are essential to the dissemination of information to residents and businesses, and that this is especially true during a pandemic. The City Clerk will identify resources to address this directive and report to the Committee.

#### 7. It's as Easy as ABC

In December 2019, City Council directed the City Clerk to work toward enhancing openness, accountability and transparency in the City's governance process by livestreaming agency and corporation board meetings held at City Hall. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.MM13.2

The onset of the COVID-19 pandemic in March 2020 required the City Clerk's Office to rapidly transform how meetings are hosted and accessed by the public. As a result, all Council and Committee and many Board meetings are now available to the public online as a default practice. This directive will also be addressed in future reports on electronic meetings.

# **C. Economic Development Directives**

A number of Divisions, led by Economic Development and Culture (EDC), are focussing on economic support and the City's economic recovery from the pandemic. Their work includes a number of Council directions made since the start of the emergency. Updates on the delays to pre-pandemic economic development related directives are provided in this section.

8. Toronto Public Art Strategy

In December 2019, Council directed the General Manager, Economic Development and Culture, the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, and the General Manager, Transportation Services to report back with a detailed implementation plan for the Toronto Public Art Strategy.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EX11.5

The implementation plan is delayed due to the COVID-19 pandemic as staff resources in EDC were redirected to other COVID-19 mitigation and recovery activities. However, many of the recommended actions in the Public Art Strategy will be piloted as part of ArtworxTO, Toronto's Year of Public Art. Staff expect to bring forward a Public Art Strategy implementation plan in 2022.

9. Best Practices for International Metropolitan Agreements

In December 2019, Council directed the General Manager, Economic Development and Culture to undertake a formal review of the International Alliance Program and report back with recommended changes to the program. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EC10.17

The review is delayed due to the COVID-19 pandemic as staff resources in EDC were redirected into other COVID-19 mitigation and recovery activities. Staff intend to resume the review in 2021 and report to Council in 2022.

10. Memorandum of Understanding between the City and the District of Jaffna

In July 2019, City Council confirmed its commitment to an existing Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) of March 19, 2017 between the City of Toronto and the District of Jaffna and directed the General Manager, Economic Development and Culture to investigate the potential for an urban planner from the City of Toronto to participate in an exchange exercise with the District of Jaffna. Council also directed EDC to investigate the potential for a Tamil scholar from Sri Lanka to participate in an exchange exercise with Tamil Studies at the University of Toronto at Scarborough and report on feasibility and next steps.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.MM9.6

Advancing the MOU with Jaffna was paused in March 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic and related restrictions on international travel. Staff anticipate revisiting the commitments made in this MOU in 2022 when the impacts of the pandemic are lessened and the work is deemed feasible to undertake.

11. Protecting LGBTQ2S+ Small Businesses and Cultural Space

In January 2020, Council directed the General Manager, Economic Development and Culture to develop immediate and long-term recommendations to support the retention and growth of independently owned and operated LGBTQ2S+ small businesses and cultural space.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2020.MM14.8

The report is delayed due to the COVID-19 pandemic as staff resources in EDC were redirected into other COVID-19 mitigation and recovery activities. Staff have resumed work to respond to the motion and may coordinate a response with similar initiatives like the work underway in Little Jamaica, and consult with the newly established LGBTQ2S+ Council advisory body.

#### 12. Public Squares

In February 2020, Council directed the General Manager, Economic Development and Culture, in conjunction with the Executive Director, Financial Planning, to report on the use of Yonge-Dundas Square and the City's other two downtown public squares. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.EX13.2

The work on this directive is delayed due to the COVID-19 pandemic as staff resources in EDC were redirected into other COVID-19 mitigation and recovery activities. This work will be re-visited when the impacts of the pandemic subside.

13. Harmonized By-law and Fees for Sidewalk Cafés, Parklets and Marketing Displays

In March 2019, the Economic and Community Development Committee requested the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to report back on compliance with the new Toronto Municipal Code Chapter for sidewalk cafés, public parklets, and marketing displays including compliance with café animation, sidewalk maintenance and the number of permit suspensions issued due to non-compliance with permit conditions and the feasibility of separate seasonal and year round boulevard café permit fees. <a href="http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EC2.3">http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EC2.3</a>

Work on this report was put on hold with the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic. Since that time, the City has introduced the CaféTO program. The introduction of CaféTO paused the continued implementation and enforcement of the new bylaw. In February 2021, City Council instead directed staff to report back on the feasibility of continuing the CaféTO program in 2022 and beyond, and any necessary modifications to Chapter 742, Sidewalk Cafés, Parklets and Marketing Displays, superseding the earlier direction.

14. Noise By-law Review - Proposed Amendments to Chapter 591, Noise

In April 2019, the Economic and Community Development Committee requested the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to report to back on the implementation, success and any outstanding issues from the changes to the Noise By-law. <u>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EC3.6</u>

This report has been delayed due to the redirection of bylaw enforcement services, suspension of noise service requests (in Spring/Summer 2020), and provincial changes in the City's authority to regulate noise, resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic. The Government of Ontario has limited the City's authority to regulate or prohibit noise made in connection to construction and deliveries until October 2021. As well, under the Reopening Ontario Act, 2020, bars, restaurants and retailers (when permitted to be open) are restricted from playing music at a decibel level that exceeds the level at which normal conversation is possible. The evaluation of the new Noise Bylaw is expected at a later date, when the limits on the City's authority have been lifted, and staff have

sufficient noise service request data to evaluate the effectiveness of the new amendments.

# **D.** Community Development Directives

The City has put an urgent focus on community development initiatives as part of its COVID-19 response and recovery. Information on the many initiatives that support this work has been reported through standing committees to Council and summarized in the City Manager's reports on COVID-19 response and recovery. Pre-pandemic directives have been advanced or accelerated with many items coming forward to Council in 2021. Two updates are provided on work that is delayed due to the pandemic and will be resumed when public health restrictions are lifted.

15. Equity Based Planning for EarlyON and Family Centres

In October 2019, City Council directed the General Manager, Children's Services to report back on equity based planning for EarlyON Child and Family Centres. <u>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EC8.15</u>

Initial work on this directive had begun but was suspended with the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic in March 2020. Children's Services' resources were redeployed to support COVID-19 response in other divisions. Currently, Toronto's EarlyON centres are only permitted by the Province to operate virtually, and as such, this work has not yet resumed. To proceed would require collaboration with the Toronto District School Board (TDSB); Children's Services will begin those discussions with the TDSB when it is fully able to participate in EarlyON planning, and when EarlyON Child and Family Centres reopen to safe in-person programming.

16. Regent Park Swim Pilot and Engagement

In December 2019, the Economic and Community Development Committee directed the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to report with a year-end progress report on the Regent Park Swim Pilot program and on the feasibility of making the Regent Park Swim Pilot program a permanent program at the Pam McConnell Aquatic Centre. <u>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EC10.5</u>

Aquatic Programs have been closed due to the COVID-19 pandemic since March 2020. One full year of programs is needed to be able to provide a progress report. Once aquatic programs can safely restart, Parks, Forestry and Recreation will report as directed following a full year of programs operating and continue to work with the local Councillor and the Access to Recreation Reference Group.

# E. Planning and Housing Directives

The majority of planning and housing related directives have been advanced or accelerated where urgently required to respond to the pandemic. Some items are

delayed from 2020 but are coming forward in 2021. As a result, no updates are provided in this report in this category.

# F. Infrastructure and Environment Directives

#### 17. Electric Vehicle Strategy

In January 2020, City Council directed the Director, Environment and Energy, in consultation with Transportation Services, Fleet Services and all other relevant City Divisions, to report back on the progress of the Electric Vehicle Strategy including impacts on the personal vehicle fleet size from TransformTO transportation measures and impacts on the electricity grid, and an Electric Vehicle Strategy review every four years aligning with TransformTO's reporting and implementation planning cycles. City Council also requested the Director, Environment and Energy to report on the feasibility of Toronto Hydro offering rebates for Electric Vehicle charging in residential properties during off-peak hours.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.IE11.17

While the report back is delayed, implementation work is ongoing and electric vehicles (EV) are a key component of the TransformTO Net-Zero Strategy that will come forward in Q4 2021. The City continues to add EVs to its corporate fleet as part of the fleet vehicle replacement program and support Environment and Energy Division in developing a workplace EV charging program, and explore making the City's charging infrastructure available to the public, as part of Fleet's EV infrastructure program. A one-year on-street EV charging pilot program was launched in November 2020, allowing the City, with our partner Toronto Hydro to evaluate approaches to on-street charging. The Toronto Green Standard update that will be presented to Council this year considers EV charging requirements for new construction, and TTC recently announced their intent to purchase an additional 300 electric buses following the current 60 bus pilot. A fulsome EV Strategy update will be provided in Q2 2022. Also, a subsequent City Council direction to Toronto Hydro as part of the *Toward Recovery* report now incorporates direction related to EV charging infrastructure with a related report coming forward through this Council cycle.

18. Addressing Flooding Issues in the Rockcliffe Area

In July 2019, City Council requested the Deputy City Manager, Infrastructure and Development Services to investigate flooding issues in the vicinity of Caledonia Road and Bowie Avenue, adjacent to the Canada Goose Plant, and within the Rockcliffe area to identify any possible short and long-term remedies. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.MM9.67

Since that time, the City applied for and received federal funding through the Disaster Mitigation and Adaptation Fund for the Jane St. Crossing Improvements to Mitigate Black Creek Flooding Project including flooding in the Rockcliffe area. The City of Toronto is contributing \$28.5 million to the remaining costs. The project will reduce flooding in the Rockcliffe-Smythe neighbourhood by reconstructing the existing crossing

to allow for increased conveyance capacity of Black Creek flood waters underneath. At this time, given studies are currently underway, there is no new information to report to City Council but reports will come forward once work is completed.

#### 19. Textile Waste Diversion and Reduction Initiatives

This item was considered by Infrastructure & Environment Committee in early March 2020 prior to the COVID-19 closures that began mid-March 2020. Council adopted the item in June 2020 when items from Standing Committees from early March 2020 were considered. At that time, City Council directed the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, and the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards, to report back on the feasibility of introducing a new City-branded Clothing Drop Box Program on City-owned property with several considerations. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.IE12.5

The advice from staff on this item was requested prior to the COVID-19 pandemic. Given the redirection of resources to address the urgent needs brought on by the pandemic, work on this report was delayed. Solid Waste Management Services will be reporting on the five-year review of the Long Term Waste Management Strategy in 2022. A review of the textile diversion strategy will provide Council with information about plans and efforts that the City has undertaken including plans to reduce textile waste and considerations for municipal best practices for textile waste diversion and clothing donation bin programs.

## **G.** Governance Directives

Prior to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, the City Manager's Office was advancing work on directives including those from the Special Committee on Governance (SCOG). At the onset of the pandemic, staff from the City Manager's Office were redirected to support COVID-19 response and recovery including coordinating the Toronto Office of Recovery and Rebuild.

The City Manager's Office continues to provide leadership to the organization on behalf of the City Manager on recovery initiatives and reporting, advancing the City's strategic intergovernmental objectives and a renewed engagement and insights strategy. Where possible, the directives that were put on hold or delayed will be considered as part of the City's recovery strategy in the near term. Specific updates are provided below.

20. Special Committee on Governance - Findings

In November 2019, City Council direct the City Manager on a number of matters related to the findings of the SCOG. <u>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.GV5.1</u>

a. At the November 2019 SCOG meeting, City Council directed the City Manager and the City Clerk to identify opportunities for delegation to Community Council so that City Council could focus on City-wide priorities. The City Manager's Office's

preliminary review and findings indicated few opportunities for further delegation, and currently City Council's focus is primarily on the priorities of recovery from COVID-19 including local, city-wide and intergovernmental issues. Future reports on governance matters from the City Manager could include consideration of delegation options where identified by Council requests or directions and opportunities identified through jurisdictional reviews or research, or a review with Members of Council post-pandemic or end of term.

- b. At the same meeting, City Council requested the City Manager, in consultation with the Clerk, to report on a work plan to improve public engagement. City Council also requested the City Manager to report to the Executive Committee on the feasibility of conducting, at the start of each term of Council, a large-scale public consultation on the City's long-term service priorities and financial direction to ensure Council's strategic direction for the four-year term is aligned with and understood by the community it serves. While the City Manager's Office redirected attention to COVID-19 response and recovery, engagement was a key element of the work of the Toronto Office of Recovery and Rebuild, which the City Manager's Office supported. Additionally, when the City Manager reported on COVID-19 recovery opportunities in October 2020, Council directed him to develop a renewed engagement strategy and resources for this work was approved during the 2021 budget process. Work to address this directive will be integrated into the renewed engagement strategy with a focus on advancing equity in the City's engagement approaches.
- c. City Council directed the City Manager to report on the feasibility of conducting an annual, rolling review of local agencies, boards, corporations, and commissions to ensure that each organizations' operations are aligned with the City's strategic priorities and report the outcomes of these reviews.

The City Manager's Office had undertaken a review of Agency Governance as part of earlier direction and was continuing this work when the COVID-19 pandemic began to impact Toronto. In 2020, the focus has been on supporting agencies to weather the impact of the pandemic on their operations. At the same time, scheduled reviews of certain agencies are proceeding and subsequent directions, such as Council directions for police reform, are impacting City boards such as the Toronto Police Services Board.

21. Empowering Toronto: Moving Forward with a City Charter

In November 2019, City Council requested the City Manager to report on options for the City of Toronto to have additional autonomy from senior levels of government, including a City Charter protected through a single-province constitutional amendment, that provides authority over "municipal issues" including, but not limited to, the following: a. municipal elections; b. municipal governance structure; c. local land use and zoning decisions; d. local fiscal matters including the ability to determine revenue sources, set tax rates, borrow funds, and allocate monies; and e. personnel decisions. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.MM12.12

City Council subsequently, at its October 2020 meeting upon consideration of the City Manager's *Towards Recovery* report, which outlined a whole-of-government approach to recovery, did not adopt a motion for a request to "the Government of Canada to provide a mechanism for the City of Toronto and other municipal governments to establish a City Charter that provides authority over specific municipal issues including, but not limited to, the following: a. local public health; b. municipal elections and governance; c. financial matters; and d. land use planning and construction matters." <a href="http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.MM25.15">http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.MM25.15</a>

Intergovernmental collaboration has been a key element of both the response and recovery activities the City has focused on this past year. As directed in October 2020, the City Manager brought forward a renewed Intergovernmental Strategy to City Council in April 2021 as part of the City Manager's Recovery update. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2021.EX22.1.

Consideration of federal, provincial and municipal roles will be an ongoing part of discussions on recovery by all governments and regional partners. As resources allow, staff will review the outcomes of these discussions and any related agreements prior to undertaking additional work on mechanisms for additional autonomy from senior levels of government post-pandemic.

22. Common Audit Themes and Issues

City Council considered a February 2020 report from the Audit Committee at the deferred meeting in June 2020. City Council requested the City Manager to establish appropriate systems that will break down silos and ensure coordination, as needed, between all levels of government, partner agencies and corporations, and City divisions to achieve Council's policy objectives on both ad hoc issues and ongoing initiatives. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.AU5.3

In addition to the updated governance model adopted by City Council in December 2018, following the change to Council size, the City governance also includes the City's agencies and corporations, accountability framework and administration headed by the City Manager as part of the systems that ensure coordination.

As part of the City Manager's *Towards Recovery* report, the City Manager outlined a whole-of-government and whole-of-community approach to recovery that is focused on coordination between all levels of government and partner agencies, corporations and community organizations. At that time, City Council directed the City Manager to develop a renewed intergovernmental strategy. This strategy was brought forward to City Council in April 2021 and is focused on collaboration and coordination with other governments. The City Manager and Deputy City Managers and Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer continue to coordinate across the City's administrative structure as a core function of the senior leadership team.

#### 23. Review of Councillor Compensation

At the start of this Council term in December 2018, and in consideration of the City Manager's and City Clerk's report on *Recalibrating City Council's Governance System for 26 Members* (CC1.1), City Council requested the City Manager to review Councillor Compensation and recommend an appropriate level of compensation for Toronto City Councillors to City Council and to obtain advice from one or more third parties. <u>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.CC1.1</u>

The City Manager completed this review and was preparing a report to City Council on this item in early 2020, but it was delayed when the COVID-19 pandemic began to impact Toronto. City Council and the City Manager's focus has been on COVID-19 response and recovery, including addressing the urgent financial impacts faced by the City in the early months of the pandemic including through cost mitigations strategies.

As this report is outstanding, and the information will need to be updated when resources allow, staff are providing the findings of the research conducted in 2019 on councillor compensation in comparable jurisdictions in Appendix 1 to this attachment. These findings were reviewed by third party academics.

### **H.** Financial Directives

The focus of Finance & Treasury Services in 2020 was to manage the multi-year deficits and other financial risks posed by the Covid-19 pandemic. Updates are provided on two items including plans to report on this work.

24. Vacant Storefront Tax and Commercial Parking Levy

In February 2020, City Council requested the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer, in consultation with the General Manager, Economic Development and Culture, to report on the feasibility of implementing a vacant storefront tax. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.MM16.9

Also in February 2020, City Council requested the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer to report on possible approaches to implementing a commercial parking levy, as a dedicated revenue stream for transit, climate initiatives and investment in resilience, providing an analysis of the benefits and risks associated with the potential implementation of the levy.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.EX13.2

Consideration of these two directives will be included as part of the comprehensive analysis of revenue tools with a report planned for later this year.

25. Automated Income Verification for Property Tax, Water, and Solid Waste Relief

In January 2020, Council authorized the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer to enter into a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the Canada Revenue Agency to indirectly collect information from the Canada Revenue Agency to verify income and related information of applicants to City programs for the purposes of determining

eligibility for City programs for which income verification is a requirement for eligibility, beginning with the City's Property Tax, Water, and Solid Waste Relief Programs and adding additional City programs over time.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2020.GL11.3

Further work will be undertaken on this as part of the Human Services Integration project that was successful in receiving funds from the Provincial Audit and Accountability Fund. The aim of this project is to create a single digital access point that reduces barriers to entry for residents applying to needs-tested programs, such as Ontario Works, childcare subsidies, rent-geared-to-income housing, and other city programs. As Automatic Income Verification is extended to other City programs, staff will report back to seek authority, as required.

### I. Other Directives

26. Requests for Facility Renaming and Use for Public Space

The following requests were made by City Council to the City Manager in 2019 related to renaming of facilities and use for public space including:

- a. To investigate the feasibility of naming a significant City park, facility or roadway in honour of the late former Councillor Dr. Gordon Chong, including consultation with the Chong family. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.MM3.21
- b. To investigate the feasibility of naming a significant City park, facility or roadway in honour of the late former Councillor Milton Berger, including consultation with the Berger family.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.MM8.5

c. To work with the East York Hall of Fame Association and identify the feasibility of a public space to be used as the site for the East York Hall of Fame. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.MM9.19

While work was paused or slowed down on these items while the Toronto Office of Partnerships resources were redirected to support COVID-19 response including to enable the donations work group of the COVID-19 taskforce, it is anticipated that these feasibility reviews will be advanced in 2021.

27. Not Fair in the Air - Excessive Air Traffic Noise Over Don Mills

In June 2019, City Council requested the City Manager to report on the distribution of flight paths across the City of Toronto and the associated noise. <u>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2019.EX6.25</u> Given the changes in air traffic activity due to COVID-19 restrictions, this issue will be reviewed by the City Manager when conditions return to pre-pandemic levels.

#### Appendix - Comparison of Councillor Compensation Jurisdictional Scan

The jurisdiction scan, completed with information available as of the end of 2019, compares Toronto Councillor compensation with the following jurisdictions:

#### GTA municipalities operating in a two-tier model

- York Region Markham and Vaughan, lower-tier municipalities, are the two largest that border Toronto with comparable demographics and service considerations.
- **Peel Region** Brampton and Mississauga, lower-tier municipalities, are the two largest that border Toronto with comparable demographics and service considerations.

For these cities, City Councillors who sit on both the lower tier and upper tier governments, make decisions and oversee services that are comparable to Toronto City Councillors, who oversee a single-tier government. As such, the total compensation for such elected officials in these neighbouring municipalities was used in the scan.

#### Single Tier Municipalities in Ontario

• **Hamilton** and **Ottawa** were used as comparators. These are the two other amalgamated single tier municipalities in Ontario. Though Hamilton is significantly smaller than Toronto, Ottawa is fairly large and as the nation's capital has some unique municipal considerations.

#### Large Cities in Canada

- Data was gathered for medium/large cities across Canada Winnipeg, Edmonton, Calgary, Montreal and Vancouver.
- Edmonton, Winnipeg and Calgary are included in the quantitative comparison, as single tier cities that are more readily comparable. Montreal and Vancouver were analysed separately given both have unique governance models including a tiered model different from most other municipalities.

Data included in the scan included:

- Population
- Operating Budget

Council composition and sizeCompensation for Council Duties

Constituency size

Additional duties

To compare compensation based on scope and scale of responsibilities, compensation (\$) per constituent was calculated and included in various charts. As well, percentiles are included in the scan to demonstrate the range of compensation and other compensation comparisons for the jurisdictions included.

#### **Detailed Analysis**

Toronto has the **lowest compensation per constituent** among the municipal comparators (Table 1).

Toronto Councillor compensation was at the 30<sup>th</sup> percentile of comparators prior to the 2018 election. Following the 2018 election and change in Council size, compensation for Toronto City Councillors dropped to the bottom of the municipal comparators on a

per constituent basis. For example, their compensation is now less than 1/3 of Markham's Councillors on a per constituent basis.

Municipality*	Population	Compensation	Councillor per Constituents	Compensation per constituent	
Markham (Region of York)	328 966	\$135 551	1 : 41 100	\$3.30	90 <sup>th</sup> percentile
Hamilton	536 917	\$97 357	1:36 000	\$2.70	
Ottawa	934 243	\$105 464	1:40 619	\$2.60	75 <sup>th</sup> percentile
Brampton (Region of Peel)	593 638	\$144 562	1 : 59 100	\$2.45	
Vaughan (Region of York)	306 233	\$137 153	1 : 61 250	\$2.24	50 <sup>th</sup> percentile
Mississauga (Region of Peel)	721 599	\$144 209	1 : 65 600	\$2.20	
Winnipeg	753 700	\$93 000	1 : 50 247	\$1.85	
Toronto (2018)	2 731 571	\$114 307	1 : 62 081	\$1.84	30 <sup>th</sup> percentile
Edmonton	932 546	\$113 325	1 : 77 712	\$1.46	
Calgary	1 239 220	\$113 416	1 : 88 516	\$1.28	
Toronto (2019)	2 731 571	\$117 164	1 : 109 000	\$1.07	Below 0 percentile

Table 1: Comparing 10 municipal comparators

\*Values are for the 2018 calendar year unless started otherwise

### Toronto has lowest compensation in the Greater Toronto Area (Table 2).

Toronto City Councillors are paid the least among their local counterparts (GTA Councillors on both lower and upper tier Councils) while having nearly double the number of constituents/Councillor. Toronto Councillors oversee an operating budget of nearly 4 times that of their GTA counterparts while compensation per constituent for Toronto Councillors is less than half, or in some cases 1/3, in comparison.

Municipality	Constituency size	Operating Budget (in billions)	Compensation per constituent	Overall compensation
Brampton	1 : 59 100	\$3.08	\$2.45	\$144 562
(Region of Peel)				
Mississauga	1 : 65 600	\$3.22	\$2.20	\$144 209
(Region of Peel)				
Vaughan	1 : 61 250	\$2.66	\$2.24	\$137 153
(Region of York)				
Markham	1 : 41 100	\$2.42	\$3.30	\$135 551
(Region of York)				
Toronto (2019)	1 : 109 000	\$11.12	\$1.07	\$117 164
Toronto (2018)	1 : 62 081	\$11.12	\$1.84	\$114 307

Table 2: Comparing GTA Municipalities (Combined upper and lower tier)

Toronto has the **lowest compensation per constituent** among single-tier municipalities while overseeing the largest operating budget (Table 3).

Toronto Councillors oversee the largest operating budget (2.78 times more than Calgary, which is the second highest) while having a similar absolute compensation amount (much lower on a per constituent basis).

Municipality	Council Composition	Operating Budget (in billions)	Population	Compensation	Compensation per Constituent
Hamilton	16 members	\$0.522	536 917	\$97 357	\$2.70
Ottawa	24 members	\$3.42	934 243	\$105 464	\$2.60
Edmonton	13 members	\$2.00	932 546	\$113 325	\$1.46
Calgary	15 members	\$4.00	1 239 220	\$113 416	\$1.28
Toronto	26 members	\$11.12	2 731 571	\$117 164	\$1.07

 Table 3: Comparing Single-Tier Municipalities (2019)

Toronto is the **only municipality that does not provide additional compensation** to Members of Council for appointments and additional duties (Table 4 and 5).

All comparable municipalities provide some additional compensation for appointments to the Boards of service agencies; this compensation varies.

Municipality	Compensation	Some additional compensation
Brampton (Peel Region)	\$144 562	Yes
Mississauga (Peel Region)	\$144 209	Yes
Vaughan (York Region)	\$137 153	Yes
Markham (York Region)	\$135 551	Yes
Toronto Councillors (2019)	\$117 164	No
Calgary Councillors	\$113 416	Yes
Edmonton Councillors	\$113 325	Yes
Ottawa Councillors	\$105 464	Yes
Hamilton Councillors	\$97 357	Yes
Winnipeg Councillors	\$93 000	Yes

 Table 4: Additional Compensation for Appointments

Toronto Councillors are appointed to the Boards of some of the largest municipal entities in the country (Toronto Transit Commission, Toronto Police Services Board) without additional compensation.

 Table 5: Sample GTA Councillor Compensation for Appointments

Municipality	Roles and Boards	Base Compensation	Additional Compensation	Total
Mississauga	Chair, Peel Police	\$144 209	\$18 011	\$162 220
(Peel Region)	Services Board			
Markham	Chair, Markham District	\$135 551	\$20 200	\$155 751
(York Region)	Energy Inc.			
Vaughan	Member, Vaughan	\$137 153	\$14 000	\$151 153
(York Region)	Holding Inc.			

Municipality	Roles and Boards	Base Compensation	Additional Compensation	Total
Brampton (Peel Region)	Member, Credit Valley Conservation	\$144 562	\$468	\$145 030
Toronto	Chair of Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) Board	\$117 164	\$0	\$117 164

Among Canada's 3 largest municipalities in Canada, Toronto is the **only one that does not compensate** on a variable basis based on additional duties (Table 6).

Toronto has a different governing model and compensation strategy than Canada's two other largest municipalities, Montreal and Vancouver, that includes a tiered government and compensation based on Executive duties.

Table 6: Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver Comparative Analysis

Municipality	Sample Roles	Compensation	Total
Vancouver	Member of Council	\$84 000 +	\$164 921
	Committee Chair	\$1588 +	
	<ul> <li>Board Chair of Greater Vancouver</li> </ul>	\$79 333	
	Regional District Regional Board		
Montreal	Large Borough Mayor	\$109 652 +	\$153 797
	Member of the Executive Committee	\$43 630 +	
	• Chair of the Planning Advisory Committee	\$3 688	
Toronto	Member of Council	\$117 164	\$117 164
	<ul> <li>Member of Executive Committee</li> </ul>		
	Chair of TTC		

# Toronto Councillors and Toronto MPPs have the same geographical constituency base, however MPPs are compensated for additional duties (Table 7).

Although base compensation for Toronto area MPPs is similar to Toronto Councillors, there is additional remuneration for additional duties. For example, a Cabinet Minister with a portfolio, which might be comparable to the Chair of a Standing Committee, makes an addition \$49 301 above the base compensation.

### Table 7: Compensation for Ontario MPPs and additional responsibilities

Positions	Base Salary	Ministerial Salary	Additional Salary	Total
Premier	\$116 550	\$92 424		\$208 974
Leader of Official opposition	\$116 550		\$64 336	\$180 886
Cabinet Ministers with Portfolio	\$116 550	\$49 301		\$165 851
Cabinet Ministers without Portfolio	\$116 550	\$22 378		\$138 928
House Leader of Official Opposition	\$116 550		\$21 329	\$137 879
Parliamentary Assistants	\$116 550	\$16 667		\$133 217
Chairs of Standing and Select	\$116 550		\$16 317	\$132 867
Committees				
Members of the Legislative Assembly	\$116 550			\$116 550

# Comparing compensation between Toronto Councillors and Toronto area MPs, who have the same geographical constituency base, reveals that MP are also compensated at a much higher rate, which grows even more for additional duties (Table 8).

Toronto area MP are required to spend a significant time away from home in their role, however they were compensated at a significantly higher rate for their basic duties. If they have specific roles in government or opposition, their compensation grows even more so the average compensation for a Toronto area MP is significantly higher (~ 175%) than Toronto's City Councillors.

Positions	Base Salary	Additional Salary	Car Allowance	Total
Prime Minister	\$178 900	\$178 900	\$2 000	\$359 800
Leader of Opposition	\$178 900	\$85 500	\$2 000	\$266 400
Minister	\$178 900	\$85, 500	\$2 000	\$266 400
Ministers of State	\$178 900	\$85, 500	\$2 000	\$266 400
Speaker of the House of Commons	\$178 900	\$85 500	\$1 000	\$265 400
Leader – Other parties	\$178 900	\$60 600		\$239 500
Deputy Speaker of House	\$178 900	\$44, 200		\$223 100
Opposition House Leader	\$178 900	\$44, 200		\$223 100
Chief Government Whip	\$178 900	\$31 900		\$210 800
Chief Opposition Whip	\$178 900	\$31 900		\$210 800
Parliamentary Secretary	\$178 900	\$17 500		\$196 400
Chair of Committee	\$178 900	\$12 300		\$191 200
Vice-Chair of Committee	\$178 900	\$6 100		\$185 000
Members of the House of Commons	\$178 900			\$178 900

#### Table 8: Sampling of compensation for Federal MPs

### Vancouver and Montreal – Qualitative Analysis

#### Vancouver

Vancouver was not included in the overall quantitative comparison given Vancouver cannot be appropriately compared to the other jurisdictions examined. Some elements for Metro Vancouver's governance and compensation were noted:

- Metro Vancouver is a political body and corporate entity operating under provincial legislation as a "regional district" and "greater boards".
- Four separate corporate entities each with a different set of members operate as Metro Vancouver.
- Metro Vancouver Regional District is:
  - o governed by a Board of Directors of elected officials from each local authority.
  - a federation of 21 municipalities, one electoral area and one treaty first nation, that collaboratively plans and delivers on a regional-scale: Core services, Plans for the future and Political Forum
- The number of directors appointed to the Board depends on the population of the Municipality, Electoral Area, or First Nation. As well, directors are allowed one vote for every 20,000 people in their Municipality, Electoral Area, or First Nation, up to a

total of five votes. The votes allocated to each director are noted below for each of the four boards.

- Remuneration on these boards and committees range from \$79 333 as a Board Chair to \$397 or \$794 (for meeting up to 4 hours or more than 4 hours respectively) for board and committee members
- The City of Vancouver (within Metro Vancouver) has 10 councillors elected at large (each receive remuneration of \$84 000 per annum).
- Political parties operate at the municipal level (there are currently 5 major parties: Coalition of Progressive Electors (COPE), Green Party of Vancouver, OneCity Vancouver, Vancouver Non-Partisan Association (NPA) and Vision Vancouver)

### Montreal

Montreal was not included in the overall quantitative comparison given the many differences between Montreal's governance and compensation model compared to the jurisdictions that were included. However, some key elements for Montreal's governance and compensation were noted:

- Montreal has 103 elected officials including:
  - 65 Members of the Municipal Council made up of:
    - Mayor of Montreal (voted through a universal ballot in Montreal; is also the Borough Mayor of the Borough Ville-Marie)
    - 46 City councillors (not including Borough Mayors)
    - 18 Borough mayors (19 including the Mayor of Montreal)
  - 38 Borough councillors (who don't have other responsibilities)
- The Agglomeration council of Montreal adds a 3<sup>rd</sup> tier to municipal governance to the Municipal Council and Borough Councils and includes geography beyond the City of Montreal.
- Compensation for Montreal's elected officials varies based on duties (e.g. many roles are appointed such as Chair of Executive Council, Chairs of Boards/Commissions that receive additional remuneration).
  - Thus compensation ranges from as low as \$31 953 for a Borough Councillor in a small borough to as high as \$153,797 for a Borough Mayor of a large area, who by virtue of office sits on City Council and could be a member of Executive Council. There is a cap on compensation.
- Appointment of roles such as Executive Council membership include higher compensation.
- Political parties play a role at the municipal level (there are currently 5 active political parties: Projet Montréal Équipe, Ensemble Montréal, Équipe Barbe Team, Équipe Anjou and Coalition Montréal) which is a key difference in the governance model.