Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register - 22 Lytton Boulevard

Date: August 12, 2021  
To: Toronto Preservation Board  
North York Community Council  
From: Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning  
Wards: Eglinton-Lawrence - Ward 8

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council include the property at 22 Lytton Boulevard on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register for its cultural heritage value.

The subject property is west of Yonge Street within the Lytton Park neighbourhood, and is situated prominently on the north side of Lytton Boulevard. It contains a one-and-a-half-storey cross-gable brick house constructed c.1913 for the contractor Albert H. Garrett, and was one of the first houses constructed within the Alexandra Gardens Subdivision. The house is a unique and representative example of the Tudor Revival style, with craftsman elements.

22 Lytton Boulevard represents the first wave of development within the Alexandra Gardens Subdivision, which was registered by Edward Bentley Stockdale in 1910 and included Lytton Boulevard, Alexandra Boulevard and Strathallan Boulevard, west of Yonge Street. It is one of the few surviving pre-World War I houses within the subdivision and the larger Lytton Park Neighbourhood, and along with nearby properties on the Heritage Register, including the Snider House at 744 Duplex Avenue and the Webster house at 42 Lytton Boulevard, the property at 22 Lytton Boulevard plays a significant role in supporting and maintaining the character of the area.

A Committee of Adjustment application was submitted for this property on August 8th proposing demolition of the existing house and a replacement structure.

Properties on the Heritage Register will be conserved and maintained in accordance with the Official Plan Heritage Policies.
RECOMMENDATIONS

The Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning recommends that:

1. City Council include the property at 22 Lytton Boulevard on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register in accordance with the Listing Statement (Reasons for Inclusion), attached as Attachment 3 to the report (August 12, 2021) from the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

There is no decision history.

BACKGROUND

Heritage Planning Framework

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is an integral component of good planning, contributing to a sense of place, economic prosperity, and healthy and equitable communities. Heritage conservation in Ontario is identified as a provincial interest under the Planning Act. Cultural heritage resources are considered irreplaceable and valuable assets that must be wisely protected and managed as part of planning for future growth under the Provincial Policy Statement (2020) and A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2020). Heritage Conservation is enabled through the Ontario Heritage Act. The City of Toronto's Official Plan implements provincial policy regime, the Planning Act, the Ontario Heritage Act and provides policies to guide decision making within the city.

Good planning within the provincial and municipal policy framework has at its foundation an understanding and appreciation for places of historic significance, and ensures the conservation of these resources are to be balanced with other provincial interests. Heritage resources may include buildings, structures, monuments, and geographic areas that have cultural heritage value or interest to a community, including an Indigenous community.

The Planning Act establishes the foundation for land use planning in Ontario, describing how land can be controlled and by whom. Section 2 of the Planning Act identifies heritage conservation as a matter of provincial interest and directs that municipalities shall have regard to the conservation of features of significant architectural, historical,
archaeological or scientific interest. Heritage conservation contributes to other matters of provincial interest, including the promotion of built form that is well-designed, and that encourages a sense of place.

The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters shall conform to the Growth Plan and shall be consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, both of which position heritage as a key component in supporting key provincial principles and interests.

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/statute/90p13

The Provincial Policy Statement provides policy direction on land use planning in Ontario and is to be used by municipalities in the development of their official plans and to guide and inform decisions on planning matters, which shall be consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement articulates how and why heritage conservation is a component of good planning, explicitly requiring the conservation of cultural heritage and archaeological resources, alongside the pursuit of other provincial interests. The Provincial Policy Statement does so by linking heritage conservation to key policy directives, including building strong healthy communities, the wise use and management of resources, and protecting health and safety.

Section 1.1 Managing and Directing Land Use to Achieve Efficient and Resilient Development states that long-term economic prosperity is supported by, among other considerations, the promotion of well-designed built form and cultural planning, and the conservation of features that help define character. Section 2.6 Cultural Heritage and Archaeology subsequently directs that "significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved". Through the definition of conserved, built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscape and protected heritage property, the Provincial Policy Statement identifies the Ontario Heritage Act as the primary legislation through which heritage conservation will be implemented.

https://www.ontario.ca/page/provincial-policy-statement-2020

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2020) builds on the Provincial Policy Statement to establish a land use planning framework that supports complete communities, a thriving economy, a clean and healthy environment and social equity. Section 1.2.1 Guiding Principles states that policies in the plan seek to, among other principles, "conserve and promote cultural heritage resources to support the social, economic, and cultural well-being of all communities, including First Nations and Metis communities". Cultural heritage resources are understood as being irreplaceable, and are significant features that provide people with a sense of place. Section 4.2.7 Cultural Heritage Resources directs that cultural heritage resources will be conserved in order to foster a sense of place and benefit communities, particularly in strategic growth areas.


The Ontario Heritage Act is the key provincial legislation for the conservation of cultural heritage resources in Ontario. It regulates, among other things, how municipal councils can identify and protect heritage resources, including archaeology, within municipal boundaries. This is largely achieved through listing on the City’s Heritage Register,
designation of individual properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, or designation of districts under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act gives municipalities the authority to maintain and add to a publicly accessible heritage register. The City of Toronto's Heritage Register includes individual heritage properties that have been designated under Part IV, Section 29, properties in a heritage conservation district designated under Part V, Section 41 of the Act as well as properties that have not been designated but City Council believes to be of "cultural heritage value or interest."

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/statute/90o18

Ontario Regulation 9/06 sets out the criteria for evaluating properties to be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The criteria are based on an evaluation of design/physical value, historical and associative value and contextual value.

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009

The Ontario Heritage Toolkit provides guidance on designating properties of municipal significance, including direction on the purpose of designating heritage properties and information about how the Provincial Policy Statement and the Ontario Heritage Act provide a framework for the conservation of heritage properties within the land use planning system. In June 2019, the More Homes, More Choice Act, 2019 (Bill 108) received Royal Assent. Schedule 11 of this Act included amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA). The Bill 108 Amendments to the OHA came into force on July 1, 2021, which included, amongst other matters, amendments to the listing and designation processes. Guidance from the Province related to the implementation of Bill 108 Amendments is forthcoming.

Ontario Heritage Tool Kit (gov.on.ca)

The City of Toronto's Official Plan contains a number of policies related to properties on the City's Heritage Register and properties adjacent to them, as well as the protection of areas of archaeological potential. Indicating the integral role that heritage conservation plays in successful city-building, Section 3.1.5 of the Official Plan states that, “Cultural heritage is an important component of sustainable development and place making. The preservation of our cultural heritage is essential to the character of this urban and liveable City that can contribute to other social, cultural, economic and environmental goals of the City.”

Policy 3.1.5.2 states that properties of potential cultural heritage value or interest "will be identified and evaluated to determine their cultural heritage value or interest consistent with provincial regulations, where applicable, and will include the consideration of cultural heritage values including design or physical value, historical or associative value and contextual value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value of a Heritage Conservation District may also consider social or community value and natural or scientific value. The contributions of Toronto’s diverse cultures will be considered in determining the cultural heritage value of properties on the Heritage Register."

Policy 3.1.5.3 states that heritage properties "will be protected by being designated under the Ontario Heritage Act, and/or included on the Heritage Register". This includes
Policy 3.1.5.4 states that heritage resources on the City's Heritage Register "will be conserved and maintained consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as revised from time to time and adopted by Council."

Policy 3.1.5.6 encourages the adaptive re-use of heritage properties while Policy 3.1.5.26 states that, when new construction on, or adjacent to, a property on the Heritage Register does occur, it will be designed to conserve the cultural heritage values, attributes and character of that property and will mitigate visual and physical impacts on it. Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) are required for development applications that affect listed and designated properties. An HIA shall be considered when determining how a heritage property is to be conserved.

The municipal Heritage Register is an important tool in planning for the conservation of heritage properties. The former City of Toronto began listing properties on the Heritage Inventory in 1973, with the inaugural set of 490 properties found within the old City of Toronto boundaries recognized for architectural, historical and/or contextual reasons. In the following decades, the surrounding municipalities of Scarborough, North York, York and Etobicoke which now form the amalgamated City of Toronto adopted their own lists of heritage properties; following amalgamation, these lists were combined and additional properties have been added over the years.

In 2019 City Council adopted the City-wide Heritage Survey Feasibility Study, and requested that the City Planning Division prioritize outstanding nominations for the inclusion of properties on the Heritage Register in the first phase of the Toronto Heritage Survey. This work is ongoing.

COMMENTS

The property at 22 Lytton Boulevard was included in the North Toronto Historical Society's "Glen Grove Park Walk", revised in 1989. It was nominated by the North York Community Preservation Panel for inclusion on the Heritage Register in early 2021 with the support of the North Toronto Historical Society and the Lytton Park Residents Organization as part of their ongoing Lytton Park Character Initiative.

Identifying properties of cultural heritage value or interest is an essential part of a municipality’s role in heritage conservation. Including non-designated properties in the municipal register is a means to identify properties that have cultural heritage value or interest to the community.
Descriptive Listings

Descriptive listings are prepared using a method by which properties are identified and recommended for inclusion on the Heritage Register. This approach to listing provides sufficient information to meet the requirements of Section 27 of the OHA to list a non-designated property on the Heritage Register and satisfies direction found within the City's Official Plan to make use of Provincial criteria when adding properties to the Register.

A statement has been prepared explaining why the property is believed to have cultural heritage value and which includes a description of the property's design and appearance, its primary address, date of construction, and pertinent historical information. The information provided within the Reasons for Inclusion on the City's Heritage Register will help to specify those features and attributes that may warrant conservation should the property be subject to development and/or further evaluated and determined to merit designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

A location map and photographs (Attachment 1) are attached.

Located on the north side of Lytton Boulevard between Yonge Street and Duplex Avenue, the property at 22 Lytton Boulevard is valued as a unique and representative example of the Tudor Revival style with Craftsman elements within the Lytton Park neighbourhood. The property was part of an early subdivision within the area, called Alexandra Gardens, and was one of the first houses to be constructed following the registration of the plan for subdivision in 1910.

The Alexandra Gardens subdivision was created through Registered Plan 1532 filed by Edward Bentley Stockdale, who had purchased the land from Jane and Joseph Sparrow. The Sparrows had bought the land from Edwy William and Margaret Snider in 1880, members of the Snider family who had owned the land since 1811 and after whom the property at 744 Duplex, known as the Snider House, is named¹. Stockdale, originally from Peterborough, moved to Toronto and began work as an accountant with the Trusts and Guarantee Company, quickly rising through the ranks and assuming the position of General Manager in 1912. It was through the Trusts and Guarantee Company that he sold the Alexandra Gardens subdivision.

Advertised as being situated within "the Highlands of Toronto", promotional material for Alexandra Gardens followed a familiar pattern seen in the marketing of subdivisions during the first half of the 20th century in the suburbs of Toronto: emphasis was placed on its rural location that was readily accessed by public transportation (in this case the Yonge Street streetcars), its proximity to ravines and gardens, and existing and planned improvements such as concrete sidewalks, paved roads, water and electricity. The sale and development of lots within the eastern sections of Alexandra Gardens occurred primarily through the 1910s and 1920s – by 1924 most of the lots between Yonge Street and Avenue Road on Alexandra Boulevard were developed, and Lytton Boulevard was substantially built-out.

Today the Alexandra Gardens subdivision is part of the larger Lytton Park
neighbourhood, which is comprised of various early to mid-20th century subdivisions
and contains a number of properties that relate to its formerly rural character. Although
the name of the subdivision is largely confined to history, it remains physically evident
within the neighbourhood, including the Alexandra Boulevard Gates at Yonge Street
(temporarily removed at the time of this report), the greater number of houses built in
the 1910s as compared to neighbouring streets, and the North Toronto Tennis Club and
Lytton (Begg's) Sunken Gardens.

22 Lytton Boulevard is a representative example of the Tudor Revival style and exhibits
Craftsman elements. The Tudor Revival style was one of the most popular revival or
eclectic styles that defined early 20th century domestic architecture across North
America, and was particularly prevalent within streetcar and early automotive suburbs
such as Alexandra Gardens. The style is generally defined by an asymmetrical façade,
brick and stone cladding, applied half timbering, exposed rafters, prominent chimneys,
steeply pitched gable dormers and leaded glass windows. As the style disseminated it
was invariably altered and adapted to local building conditions and economies, resulting
in a wide variety of interpretations and permutations of Tudor Revival within Toronto's
neighbourhoods.

22 Lytton Boulevard is a one-and-a-half-storey cross gable house, located on the north
side of Lytton Boulevard between Yonge Street and Duplex Avenue. The principal
(south) façade of 22 Lytton Boulevard is slightly asymmetrical, comprised of two gabled
bays, one larger than the other, flanking a central entrance covered by a gabled portico.
The two gables both feature applied false half-timbering and wide vergeboards, with
exposed rafters extending from the primary gabled roof protruding below.

The two side facades containing the gable ends feature similar false half-timbering, set
depth within the extended roof eaves. A brick chimney punctures the gable end on the
west façade. The rear portion of the house is punctuated by a large gabled dormer on
the west façade, and what appears to have been a porch or patio that has been
enclosed.

The house at 22 Lytton Boulevard was built for the contractor Albert H. Garrett and his
wife Edna c.1913, following their acquisition of the property the same year. Garrett had
at different times been listed as both a "builder" and an "architect", however no record
of his being the architect for 22 Lytton Boulevard has been found. Garrett maintained
ownership of the property following construction, with the house rented to William
Dickie, an employee of the Sutherland Construction Company.

Owing to what appears to be Garrett's defaulting on mortgage payments, 22 Lytton
Boulevard was sold at auction through a power of sale in early 1918, and proceeded to
change hands twice before being purchased by Thomas B. Costain in 1919. The Editor
of Maclean's Magazine, Costain had previously lived nearby at 156 Glencairn Avenue,

2 Toronto City Directories, 1915.
3 Census of Canada, 1911.
4 The Toronto Archives were temporarily closed at the time of this report writing. Additional information
may be found when the Archives re-open.
and before that, briefly, at 16 Lytton Boulevard. In 1919 he moved to 22 Lytton Boulevard, however only resided in the home briefly. In 1920 he was hired as a fiction editor of the Saturday Evening Post and moved to the United States. Following his career as an editor, which included working for Twentieth Century Fox as well as publishing companies, he began to write novels. Costain would go on to become an internationally-acclaimed best-selling author, publishing over 15 books.

In 1920 Costain sold the property to Edward G. Goodwin and his wife, Kate. Goodwin was a Manager at the law firm of Saunders, Kingsmill and Mills, and was later the Secretary Treasurer of F. G. Roberts Awning and Tent Co. Ltd. Goodwin lived in the home with Kate until her passing in 1936. In 1948 he sold the house to his son, John Edward Goodwin (1900-1972) and his daughter-in-law Janet Goodwin (1900-1990), who subsequently moved into the house.

John E. Goodwin served as a Research Associate at the Banting and Best Institute, and was an Associate at the School of Medicine and Associate Professor of Physiological Hygiene. Janet was a notable photographer and ornithologist, and was one of the first twelve members of the Margaret Nice Ornithological Club (1952-1987). The MNOC was founded in response to the gender-based exclusionary policies of the Toronto Ornithological Club, and provided a venue for women ornithologists to "observe bird-life in the field, to record species, numbers and habits observed, and to share observations and experiences at the monthly meetings...held in a spirit of joyous fellowship". In addition to her experience and interest in the study of birds, Janet was recognized as a photographer of "prize-winning calibre". She was an Associate of the Photographic Society of America, and one of the founding members, in 1947, of the Toronto Guild for Colour Photography. She established and ran the Guild's popular "Nature" workshops out of her house at 22 Lytton Boulevard, and was credited with growing the Guild's membership to become the largest colour photography club in Toronto. Janet is recognized for having exhibited and been invited to lecture internationally and was a regular contributor to various photographic clubs and journals, with a specialization in wild flowers and fungi. Following over fifty years of ownership by the Goodwin family and after John's death in 1972, Janet sold the house to William and Jennifer Cook, in 1973.

The property at 22 Lytton Boulevard is important in maintaining and supporting the context of the Lytton Park neighbourhood as an early to mid-20th century streetcar and automobile suburb, and defines and supports the context of the Alexandra Gardens subdivision (comprising Lytton and Alexandra Boulevards). The house is situated on a large lot and setback from Lytton Boulevard, reflecting the original lot pattern and organization of the street. The property at 22 Lytton Boulevard contributes to a sense of place within the Lytton Park neighbourhood, and is valued by the local community as a significant part of the area's history and present-day context.

Following research and evaluation according to Ontario Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the property at 22 Lytton Boulevard (The Goodwin House, c. 1913) is

---

6 ibid
significant due to its being a unique and representative example of the Tudor Revival architectural style with Craftsman elements, as well as its association with Janet Goodwin, a long-time resident celebrated for her contributions to the field of nature photography, and for its contribution to the historic context of the Alexandria Gardens subdivision and the present-day Lytton Park neighbourhood.

CONTACT

Tamara Anson-Cartwright
Program Manager, Heritage Planning
Urban Design, City Planning
Tel: 416-338-1083; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: Tamara.Anson-Cartwright@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Mary L. MacDonald, MA, CAHP
Senior Manager, Heritage Planning
Urban Design, City Planning

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 - Location Map and Photographs
Attachment 2 - List of Research Sources
Attachment 3 - Listing Statement (Reasons for Inclusion) - 22 Lytton Boulevard
Figure 1. This location map is for information purposes only; the exact boundaries of the properties are not shown. The arrow marks the location of the property. City of Toronto mapping.

Figure 2. Advertisement for the Alexandra Gardens Subdivision. May 21, 1910. The Globe and Mail Archives, Toronto Public Library.
Figure 3. Goads Fire Insurance Atlas, 1913, showing the property shortly after construction and one of the first houses built within the subdivision.

Figure 4. Goads Fire Insurance Atlas, 1924, showing the property at 22 Lytton Boulevard. Note that the block from Yonge Street to Duplex was substantially built out by this time.
Figure 5. Lytton at Duplex looking east. 22 Lytton Boulevard is obscured by trees, on the left side of the image. City of Toronto Archives.

Figure 6. 22 Lytton Boulevard, 1981. Boris Spremo, Toronto Star Archives. Toronto Public Library.
Figure 7. 22 Lytton Boulevard. Heritage Planning, 2021.

Figure 8. 22 Lytton Boulevard. Heritage Planning, 2021.
List of Research Sources

22 Lytton Boulevard

Archival Sources
- City of Toronto Building Records
- Globe and Mail Archives, Toronto Public Library
- Ontario Land Property Records.
- Toronto Star Archives, Toronto Public Library

Secondary Sources
- North Toronto Historical Society, Glen Grove Park Walk. 1984 (revised)
- Toronto Digital Photography Club, Local Colour Archives.
**22 Lytton Boulevard**

**Description:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADDRESS</th>
<th>22 Lytton Boulevard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WARD</td>
<td>Eglinton-Lawrence - 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEGAL DESCRIPTION</td>
<td>PLAN 1532 LOT 112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY</td>
<td>Lawrence Park South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISTORICAL NAME</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONSTRUCTION DATE</td>
<td>c.1913*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER</td>
<td>Albert H. Garrett*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECORDER</td>
<td>Heritage Planning - A. Corey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REPORT DATE</td>
<td>August 12, 2021</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The exact year of construction and builder may be determined following the re-opening of the Toronto Archives. This information is based upon Land Records, archival mapping and city directories.*
22 Lytton Boulevard - Reasons for Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register:

Located on the north side of Lytton Boulevard between Yonge Street and Duplex Avenue, the property at 22 Lytton Boulevard (The Goodwin House) is valued as a unique and representative example of the Tudor Revival style with Craftsman elements within the Lytton Park neighbourhood. The property was part of an early subdivision within the area, called Alexandra Gardens, and was one of the first houses to be constructed following the registration of the plan for subdivision in 1910. Registered and sold by the financier Edward Bentley Stockdale through the Trusts and Guarantees Company, Alexandra Gardens was a popular and highly-desirable subdivision comprising Lytton, Alexandra and Strathallan Boulevards, and was primarily built out by the 1930s. While most of the original houses in the area are designed in a Classical Revival style, 22 Lytton Boulevard stands out as a unique and early Tudor Revival style house within the neighbourhood.

Designed in the Tudor Revival style, the house at 22 Lytton Boulevard retains architectural elements indicative of this popular period revival style. The principal (south) façade of 22 Lytton Boulevard is slightly asymmetrical, comprised of two gabled bays, one larger than the other, flanking a central entrance covered by a gabled portico. The two gables both feature applied false half-timbering and wide vergeboards, with exposed rafters extending from the primary gabled roof protruding below. The house retains a high degree of integrity, maintaining original features and with minimal exterior alterations since its period of construction.

The property at 22 Lytton Boulevard is associated with the photographer and amateur ornithologist Janet Goodwin, who lived at the house from c.1948 to c.1973. Born in Toronto in 1900 and raised in The Annex neighbourhood, Janet married John Goodwin, and the couple acquired the house from John's father, Edward, in 1948. Janet Goodwin was a celebrated nature photographer in Toronto and internationally, receiving critical acclaim and awards for her work. She was a founding member, in 1947, of the Toronto Guild for Colour Photography, and ran the Guild's popular "Nature" workshops out of her house at 22 Lytton Boulevard. In 1952 she was a founding member of the Margaret Nice Ornithological Club, established in protest to the gender-based exclusionary policies of the Toronto Ornithological Club, and which provided women ornithologists a place to explore and make significant contributions to the field and wildlife conservation. Janet sold the house in 1973, following the passing of her husband John, concluding 50 years of the Goodwin family's ownership of the property.

The property at 22 Lytton Boulevard is important in maintaining and supporting the context of the Lytton Park neighbourhood as an early to mid-20th century streetcar and automobile suburb, and defines and supports the context of the Alexandra Gardens subdivision (comprising Lytton and Alexandra Boulevards). The house is situated on a large lot and setback from Lytton Boulevard, reflecting the original lot pattern and organization of the street. The property at 22 Lytton Boulevard contributes to a sense of place within the Lytton Park neighbourhood, and is valued by the local community as a significant part of the area's history and present-day context.