BID AWARD PANEL
CONTRACT AWARD

Award of Ariba Document Number 3027475417 to Multiple Successful Suppliers for Real Estate Appraisal Services for Corporate Real Estate Management

Date: February 3, 2022
To: Bid Award Panel
From: Chief Procurement Officer
Wards: All

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chief Procurement Officer recommends that the Bid Award Panel grant authority to award the following contract:

Solicitation Number:
Request for Supplier Qualifications (RFSQ), Ariba Document Number 3027475417

Description:
To establish a rotational roster for the provision of Real Estate Appraisal Services for Corporate Real Estate Management. The term of contract is three (3) years from the date of award, with an option to renew for one (1) additional two (2) year period.

Should the option be exercised, the Division Head or designates of Corporate Real Estate Management will request the Chief Procurement Officer to process the renewals under the same terms and conditions.

Recommended Supplier:
Category 1 - Fee Simple
1. Altus Group Limited
2. Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
3. CBRE Limited
4. CHS Realty Advisors Inc.
5. Cushman and Wakefield ULC
6. GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
7. Janterra Real Estate Advisors Inc.
8. KPMG LLP
9. MPR Advisors Inc.
10. Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited

Category 2 - Market Rents
1. Altus Group Limited
2. Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
3. CBRE Limited
4. GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
5. KPMG LLP
6. Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited

Category 3 - Planning Act
1. Altus Group Limited
2. Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
3. GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
4. Janterra Real Estate Advisors Inc.
5. KPMG LLP
6. MPR Advisors Inc.
7. Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited
8. Robson Associates Inc.

Category 4 - Expropriations Act
1. Altus Group Limited
2. Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
3. Cushman and Wakefield ULC
4. GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc
5. Janterra Real Estate Advisors Inc.
6. KPMG LLP
7. MPR Advisors Inc.
8. Robson Associates Inc.

Contracts Award Value (Per Supplier):

Contract Award Value:
Altus Group Limited
$360,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$406,800 including HST and all applicable charges
$366,336 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$247,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$279,336 including HST and all applicable charges
$251,551 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $607,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $686,136 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$617,887 net of HST recoveries.**

2) Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services
$360,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$406,800 including HST and all applicable charges

$366,336 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$247,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$279,336 including HST and all applicable charges
$251,551 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $607,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $686,136 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$617,887 net of HST recoveries.**

3) CBRE Limited
$120,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$135,600 including HST and all applicable charges
$122,112 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$82,400 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$93,112 including HST and all applicable charges
$83,850 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $202,400 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $228,712 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$205,962 net of HST recoveries.**

4) CHS Realty Advisors Inc.
$90,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$101,700 including HST and all applicable charges
$91,584 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$61,800 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$69,834 including HST and all applicable charges
$62,888 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $151,800 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $171,534 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$154,472 net of HST recoveries.**

5) Cushman and Wakefield ULC
$165,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$186,450 including HST and all applicable charges
$167,904 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$113,300 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$128,029 including HST and all applicable charges
$115,294 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $278,300 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $314,479 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$283,198 net of HST recoveries.**

6) GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
$360,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$406,800 including HST and all applicable charges
$366,336 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$247,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$279,336 including HST and all applicable charges
$251,551 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $607,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $686,136 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$617,887 net of HST recoveries.**

7) Janterra Real Estate Advisors Inc.
$330,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$372,900 including HST and all applicable charges
$335,808 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$226,600 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$256,058 including HST and all applicable charges
$230,588 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $556,600 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $628,958 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$566,396 net of HST recoveries.**

8) KPMG LLP
$360,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$406,800 including HST and all applicable charges
$366,336 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$247,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$279,336 including HST and all applicable charges
$251,551 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $607,200 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $686,136 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$617,887 net of HST recoveries.**

9) MPR Advisors Inc.
$330,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$372,900 including HST and all applicable charges

$335,808 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$226,600 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$256,058 including HST and all applicable charges
$230,588 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $556,600 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $628,958 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$566,396 net of HST recoveries.**

10) Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited
$285,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$322,050 including HST and all applicable charges
$290,016 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$195,700 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$221,141 including HST and all applicable charges
$199,144 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $480,700 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $543,191 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$489,160 net of HST recoveries.**

11) Robson Associates Inc.
$240,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$271,200 including HST and all applicable charges
$244,224 net of HST recoveries

Option Period (December 1, 2024 - November 30, 2026)
$164,800 net of all applicable taxes and charges
$186,224 including HST and all applicable charges
$167,700 net of HST recoveries

The total potential cost including all option years is $404,800 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $457,424 including all applicable taxes and charges, and **$411,924 net of HST recoveries.**

The contract is expected to start from the date of award to November 30, 2024.

The total potential contract award including all option years for all awards is $5,060,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $5,717,800 including all applicable taxes and charges. **The total potential cost to the City including all option years for all awards is $5,149,056 net of HST recoveries.**

FINANCIAL IMPACT

The total potential contract award including all option years for all awards is $5,060,000 net of all applicable taxes and charges, $5,717,800 including all applicable taxes and charges. The total potential cost to the City including all option years for all awards is $5,149,056 net of HST recoveries.

Funding has been included in the 2022 Staff Recommended Operating Budget for Corporate Real Estate Management. Additional funding will be included in the 2023-2024 Operating Budget Submissions for Corporate Real Estate Management. Additional funding details follow in Table 1.

Should the City choose to exercise its option(s) to renew for additional one (1) separate two (2) year period, then appropriate additional funding, if needed, will be included in the 2024-2026 Operating Budget Submissions for Corporate Real Estate Management for consideration as part of the Annual Budget process.

Table 1: Financial Impact Summary of Recommended Contract

ACCT #	Jan. 1 to Dec. 31, 2022 Net of HST Recoveries	Jan. 1 to Dec. 31, 2023 Net of HST Recoveries	Jan. 1 to Nov 30, 2024 Net of HST Recoveries	Option Period#1 Dec 1, 2024 to Nov 30, 2026 Net of HST Recoveries	TOTAL (net of HST Recoveries)
FA200-20.S	$1,102,400	$1,017,600	$932,800	$2,096,256	$5,149,056

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with information included in the Financial Impact section.

SOLICITATION SUMMARY

Solicitation Issued: August 10, 2021 **Solicitation Closed:** September 14, 2021
Number of Addenda Issued: Two (2)
Number of Bids: Twelve (12)

Table 2: Summary of Response Received for Ariba Request for Supplier Qualification (RFSQ) Doc3027475417

Category 1 - Fee Simple
Altus Group Limited
Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
CBRE Limited
CHS Realty Advisors Inc
Cushman and Wakefield ULC
GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
MM and R Valuation Services, Inc. o/a HVS Consulting and Valuation Services **

Janterra Real Estate Advisors
KPMG LLP
MPR Advisors Inc.
Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited

Category 2 - Market Rents
Altus Group Limited
Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
CBRE Limited
GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
KPMG LLP
Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited

Category 3 - Planning Act
Altus Group Limited
Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
Janterra Real Estate Advisors
KPMG LLP
MPR Advisors Inc.
Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited
Robson Associates Inc.

Category 4 - Expropriations Act
Altus Group Limited
Avison Young Valuation and Advisory Services, LP
Cushman and Wakefield ULC
GSI Real Estate and Planning Advisors Inc.
Janterra Real Estate Advisors
KPMG LLP
MPR Advisors Inc.
Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited *
Robson Associates Inc.

Category 5 - Insurance ***
Newmark Knight Frank Canada Limited

* Bidder did not meet the technical evaluation threshold of 62.5% (50 points out of 80).
** Supplier did not make the roster list as it did not fall within 10% of the highest scoring Proponent.
*** Category did not meet the minimum number of Respondents for an award.

Range of Scores:
Category 1 - Fee Simple: 65.27 - 76.69
Category 2 - Market Rents: 69.68 - 82.33
Category 3 - Planning Act: 69.57 - 81
Category 4 - Expropriations Act: 46.33 - 94

DIVISION CONTACTS

Peter Cheng, Manager, Appraisal Advisory, Transaction Services, Corporate Real Estate Management, 416-338-5105, Peter.Cheng@toronto.ca

Jackson Sychingho, Manager, Community and Social Services and City Manager's Office, Purchasing Client Services, Purchasing and Materials Management, 416-392-1492, Jackson.Sychingho@toronto.ca

COMMENTS

For the recommended contract award, the following requirements have been met:

a. The firm recommended for award is the lowest Supplier meeting specifications or to the highest scoring Supplier based on the evaluation criteria included in the Solicitation and meeting the requirements of the solicitation;

b. the appropriate Division has reviewed submissions and found the price to be reasonable, within available budget and concurs with the recommendation;

c. the total contract value is less than $20 million dollars (excluding applicable taxes) and the contract term is:

> 1. for a contract funded by the operating budget, 5 years or less including any option years; or
>
> 2. for a contract funded by the capital budget, within the projected term of the capital funding for the project as set out in the capital budget,

being within the authority of the Bid Award Panel;

d. the Solicitation document was advertised on the City's internet website and bids or proposals were opened publicly; and

e. the Fair Wage Office confirms the recommended firm understands the Fair Wage Policy and Labour Trades requirements and has agreed to comply fully.

Additional details and information for the above Solicitations are on the file in the Purchasing and Materials Management Division.

SIGNATURE

Michael Pacholok
Chief Procurement Officer