## RE: $\quad$ Addendum to HIA in response to revised design for Site Plan Approval, 1951 Yonge Street. GBCA Project No. 17001

Goldsmith Borgal \& Company Ltd. Architects (GBCA) was initially retained by Life Construction Inc. for the purposes of a Rezoning and Official Plan Amendment application to assess the impact on heritage resources arising from a development proposal at 1913-1951 Yonge Street, located on the northeast corner of Yonge Street and Davisville Avenue.

We provided a Heritage Impact Assessment for this application (dated 17 June 2017), which assessed a two-tower development, with a conclusion that the project would protect the integrity of the adjacent heritage resources and reestablish the scale, and perception of a continuous row of commercial buildings along Yonge Street. At this time, heritage impacts were also identified. Following this submission, the application was appealed to the Toronto Local Appeal Body (TLAB) and the design was further reviewed and mitigative measures provided.

We provide herein an HIA Addendum assessing revisions to the two-tower development, and adjustments to the Yonge Street public realm.

The subject site spans the block between Davisville Ave. and Millwood Road, which contains surface level parking and a number of heritage properties, which are identified on the aerial map below and further described in subsequent pages.

## Heritage resources on the site:

The properties at 1913, 1919, 1919 \& 1921/1923 Yonge Street (in red), were identified for inclusion on the City's Heritage Register through a blanket listing (Midtown in Focus) due to their design, associative and contextual values. A summary of these attributes has been taken from the Research And Evaluation Summary for 1913, 1919, 1921 \&1923 Yonge Street produced by Heritage Preservation Services in September 2016. The heritage value of the site is primarily focused on the above mentioned Yonge Street commercial elevations - in terms of scale, and perception of a continuous commercial row. The building at 1915 Yonge Street has not been included in the listing because of alterations that have impacted the integrity of the building's facade, and the structure punctuates the perception of the continuous commercial row.

The subject property is adjacent 1909 Yonge Street (in blue) The Davisville General Store and Post Office, 1894 what has been listed on the City's Heritage Register since 1973.

Historical background information and images can be obtained through the June 2020 HIA.

1)The setback, placement and orientation of the buildings on the east side of Yonge Street between Davisville Avenue and Millwood Road where they are part of a contiguous row
2) The scale, form and massing of the two-storey buildings with the rectangular shaped plans
3) The materials, with the red brick cladding and detailing (the exteriors on the west elevations have been painted)
4) The principal (west) elevations where, above the first (ground)
5) The oriel window in the second storey
6) The pair of flat-headed window openings with brick flat arches and stone sills.
7)The roofline with the corbelled brickwork and piers along the west elevation
8) The materials, with the red brick cladding and the brick and stone detailing

## Overall site context:

The subject site is located on a rectangular shaped assembly occupied by surface level parking, and six extant buildings dating to the early 20th century at 1913, 1915, 1919, 1919A, 1921 \&1923 Yonge Street. The listed Davisville General store at 1909 Yonge Street is at the far right corner of the block below. The built fabric surrounding the site is comprised of various styles of mixed used commercial and residential structures. The proposed development will be situated in a part of Toronto that has experienced several waves of development since it was first settled in the 1840's. Davisville has experienced a considerable amount of commercial growth following the development of the Davisville Yards and Yonge Street subway line in the mid-1950's.

Along Yonge Street, there are mostly modern commercial and residential buildings integrated with a gradient of much smaller scale, early 19th century 2-3 storey commercial buildings. Millwood Road, a residential street, has mostly detached homes.

To the southeast of the site are found numerous apartment towers and residential complexes. They range in height from 17 to 30 storey's and are located between Davisville Avenue and Balliol Street to the east of Yonge Street. Note that half of the subject block is currently used for surface level parking.


## Proposed Revised-Design:

Reviews since the previous submission are noted below.

- Changes to the height of towers proposed on the site: The previous 45 -storey residential tower (south tower) and 30storey residential tower (north) have been revised to 45 -storeys and 32 -storeys, respectively. The 9 -storey podium volume will provide height transitions that relate to the Yonge Street and Davisville Ave. environs.
- Removal of less fabric along Yonge Street: The June 2020 submission proposed the removal of 1913 Yonge Street, a modest Edwardian structure, which was noted as an impact. Following the TLAB mediation, this property has been proposed to be retained and altered, which will maintain character defining attributes visible from Yonge Street. This strategy yields positive effects for the overall development, including the following second-order mitigative outcomes:
- Reduced impact to 1909 Yonge Street: Retaining the two-storey Edwardian structure at 1913 Yonge Street will help tie together the heritage fabric at the northeast corner of Yonge Street and Davisville Ave. This no longer isolates the Davisville General store, and will allow this corner of the intersection to been seen as a more cohesive grouping of main-street heritage properties, with fabric to the north of this referencing this scale.
- Introduction of open space at the ground floor: To the east of the retained structure at 1913 Young Street, a 12.6 -metre setback will be provided from the entrance to newly proposed retail. This will provide a generous open space at Davisville Ave. that will be further defined along Yonge Street by the removal of the modest structures at 1915 and 1919 Yonge Street. Here, an 18 -metre setback and a 6.4-metre setback from each respective property line will be established using the former width of the commercial structures.
- Proposed materials for the podium will remain unchanged, as will setbacks that were conceived as a way to respond to the diverse character of Yonge Street and the adjacent Davisville General Store to the south.

Drawings of the Revised design (by CORE Architects), compared with the former 2020 scheme are presented on the following page:


## 2020 submission

In this scenario, none of the extant buildings on the site have been retained, and instead this fabric has been replaced with new retail units.


## Revised 2021 submission

Note the inclusion of 1913 Yonge Street (in red), adjacent the heritage property at 1909 Yonge Street. The public realm (blue) has been redesigned to open up north of the Yonge Street and Davisville Ave. intersection. The retail units to the north of this stitch together what is presently a surface level parking lot, and add fine-grained openings that will be used for commercial shopfronts.


## 2021 submission

The 2020 proposal included 45 -storey residential tower (south tower) and 30-storey residential tower (north). The 2021 submission has revised heights to 45 -storeys and 32 -storeys, for the respective south and north tower volumes. The podium height of 9 -storeys has been maintained. The site is located above mass transit, and buildings between Davisville Avenue and Balliol Street to the east of Yonge Street range in height between 2-10 storeys and 17-30 storeys.

## Assessment of the Proposed Design and Impacts to heritage resources:

The revised design has taken into consideration the heritage context along Yonge Street by continuing to provide a podium massing that references the height and scale of existing 'Main Street' commercial structures, and stitches together currently vacant lands that are used for surface level parking. This will be achieved through introducing a flat roofline, sufficient setbacks, brick masonry, original shopfront entrances, and punched window openings. Overall, the intent is to establish a similar appearance at street level to the one that previously existed. These design moves make the new massing subordinate to and compatible with the heritage property.

Furthermore, with the existing heritage resource at 1909 Yonge Street (Davisville General Store) directly to the south of the site, the addition of new open space around the retained structure at 1913 Yonge Street not only provides legible cues to the original scale of the former commercial row, but also increases the visibility and prominence of heritage resources at this intersection.
An assessment of possible effects of the proposed development on heritage properties is presented on the table on the following page. The table lists possible effects based on the City of Toronto's Heritage Impact Assessment Terms of Reference (2010).
Possible Effect

| Destruction of any, or part of any, significant heritage |
| :--- |
| attributes or features | attributes or features

Alteration that is not sympathetic, or is incompatible, with
the historic fabric and appearance

Shadows created that alter the appearance of a heritage attribute or change the viability of an associated natural feature or plantings, such as a garden

Isolation of a heritage attribute from its surrounding environment, context or a significant relationship

Direct or indirect obstruction of significant views or vistas within, from, or of built and natural features

A change in land use (such as rezoning a church to a multiunit residence) where the change in use negates the property's cultural heritage value

Land disturbances such as a change in grade that alters soils, and drainage patterns that adversely affect a cultural heritage resource, including archaeological resources

## Assessment

Several properties located on the development site have been been identified as having heritage value under the Ontario Heritage Act and would be removed as a part of the proposed development. Changes to the building have reduced this impact, and therefore impacts are considerably lessened due to these changes.


#### Abstract

The new podium level will recreate an existing street wall along Yonge Street, adjacent to the listed heritage property. The podium will help mediate the difference of scale and form between the 2 -storey to 3 storey residential homes, commercial buildings, and more recent condominium developments north of Millwood Road (8-9 storeys.) The retention of 1913 Yonge Street, which is the least altered structure along the row, will help to reference the scale of commercial activity on the thoroughfare, and link it to the adjacent Davisville General store.


Shadow impacts have been prepared for this development and are available in Appendix II of the HIA. Shadows cast by the new development will have incremental impacts on heritage resources in the vicinity (at 63 Millwood Road and 1909 Yonge Street). Transient shadowing on the facades of these buildings will not unduly impact existing heritage attributes.

The prominence of the Davisville General Store will be enhanced with the proposed design changes despite the proximity of the towers. Efforts have been made to maintain the scale along the sidewalk frontage to emphasise the links to the retained heritage structures. Although historically of a different period, the adjacent structure at 1913 Yonge Street will be retained with adjacent open space created, thereby highlighting this group of commercial properties at the north-east intersection of Yonge Street and Davisville Ave.

No significant views or vistas of heritage properties identified in the Official Plan will be blocked.

The land use currently allows for a mix of uses, characterised mainly by commercial and retail. Change of use will not negate cultural heritage values. A portion of the site is currently occupied by a surface parking lot and the new building will pursue a ground level commercial use with additional residential units on the upper floors. The re-introduction of street level commercial at the parking lot will bring back the historical uses of the street frontage.

Land disturbances as a result of this development will not impact cultural heritage value.

## Preliminary Conservation Strategy: 1913 Yonge Street

A variety of options are typically available for the mitigation of change to historic sites. These range from full restoration to simple commemoration of what previously existed.

The overarching term for protecting historic places in Canada is Conservation, which is described in the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (the Standards and Guidelines) as all actions or processes aimed at safeguarding the character-defining elements of an historic place to retain its heritage value and extend its physical life. There are three primary treatment types for conservation projects: preservation, restoration and rehabilitation. Definitions for all treatment types are derived from the Standards and Guidelines.

Preservation involves the protection, maintenance and stabilization of the existing form, material and integrity of a historic place or of an individual component, while its heritage value is protected. In this instance, the street facing elevation of 1913 Yonge Street will be preserved.

Rehabilitation is the sensitive adaptation of an historic place or of an individual component for a continuing or compatible contemporary use, while protecting its heritage value. In this instance, 1913 Yonge Street will be rehabilitated to pursue a commercial usage at the ground level.

Restoration is the revealing, recovering or representing the state of a historic place or of an individual component as it appeared at a particular period in its history, as accurately as possible, while its heritage value is protected.In this instance, the existing non-original shopfronts will be removed and investigations will be pursued to effectively determine traces and indications of original 20th century shopfront fabric. A series of steps will be completed to this end.

## - Site Investigation

Site investigations related to an assessment of the original facade retention are discussed in the following pages.

## - Site Recording

The first step will be a full recording of the existing building on the site prior to selective demolition. Drawings will be detailed, where necessary, as base documents for recommended interventions.

For 1913 Yonge Street, recording will include the preparation of drawings (plans, sections and/or elevations of the building) where necessary identifying original heritage features - these plans may be the original plans, assuming they are available. In conjunction with the preparation of record drawings and documents, a full set of photographs would be prepared that would include interior images - particularly of original features (if found) prior to the removal of select parts of the building fabric.

## - Facade Retention

The retention of the Yonge Street elevation will contribute in the clear understanding of the original small scale retail shops that were part of the character of Yonge Street. Over time, several modifications have been made to the original exterior walls of the property.

As the existing façades show a variety of conditions the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada are a crucial reference for establishing a proper Conservation Strategy.

At this stage, we can determine that the Conservation Plan will include the following work:

- Existing walls to be cleaned and restored where necessary. Elements found to be a later addition and not character-defining, will be carefully removed (a full condition assessment will be prepared as part of the Conservation Plan).
- All interiors will be removed, including interior partition walls, and all interior floors.
- The overarching restoration strategy will aim to restore the east elevation (Yonge Street) to a single period of significance. This elevation has the most observable, and significant portions of exposed original fabric remaining.
- Existing masonry walls to be preserved and repaired where necessary (a full condition assessment will be prepared as part of the Conservation Plan)
- The Shopfront will be restored to a single period of significance.


## - Conservation Plan

The Conservation Plan will be submitted at a later time. It will be packaged as a report and provide the necessary documentation for the rehabilitation of the buildings.

Interpretation of the site
The principle facade will be retained, and reference to three-dimensional form of the building will also be made. As the significance of the site is largely contextual, the physical structure on its own will commemorate the heritage value of the site. This will be done in a manner that acknowledges the previous use of the building, while also repurposing it to function in the new environment.

## Commemorative Plan

This would consist of illustrated panels of etched metal that would describe in both words and images the evolution of Davisville, leading up to and including the new development. In this case, a suitable location would be the north-wall of 1913 Yonge Street, as it is prominently exposed to a newly created public space to the north of the retained building.

## Exterior Building Lighting and Signage

The general strategy will be to comply with the City of Toronto lighting and signage by-laws and ensure they are complementary to the restoration of the structure and do not cause direct or indirect harm to the building fabric. Lighting and signage will be addressed in more detail at a later stage and under separate cover.

## - Final Documentation

A photographic record of the pre-construction and post-construction appearance of the heritage facades will be prepared and submitted in accordance with City guidelines.

## Conclusion

The revised development maintains our original conclusion, which states that this development will have no significant impacts on the adjacent heritage sites and, by its new design, will improve on the previous designs and help to mitigate heritage impacts. The revised drawings are appended to this Addendum.

We trust this Addendum satisfies HPS' requirements for this resubmission, and remain available should you require any additional information.

## Christopher Borgal OAA FRAIC CAHP



The information and data contained herein represents GBCA's best professional judgment in light of the knowledge and information available to GBCA at the time of preparation. GBCA denies any liability whatsoever to other parties who may obtain access to this report for any injury, loss or damage suffered by such parties arising from their use of, or reliance upon, this report or any of its contents without the express written consent of the GBCA and the client.

## APPENDIX II

Development Drawings (prepared by CORE Architects)









