

Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism: Year Three Update

Date: April 12, 2022

To: Economic and Community Development Committee

From: Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration

Wards: All

SUMMARY

Ongoing manifestations of anti-Black racism result in real and significant impacts on the lives of Black residents. To respond to these impacts, on December 5, 2017, City Council unanimously adopted the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism. A five-year plan with 80 actions and 22 recommendations, the Action Plan drives transformational systems change to address the pervasive legacy of anti-Black racism in City policies, systems, and institutions.

This report provides an update on the progress to deliver the Action Plan with a focus on the 21 actions prioritized in the Year Three Work Plan, running from June 2020 to December 2021. Since its implementation in 2018, 60 percent of Action Plan recommendations and actions have been implemented, with more than \$25.8 million cumulatively invested by the City of Toronto to dismantle barriers and increase access to opportunities for Black communities. Year Three activities continued to propel significant culture change with more than 50 percent of all City staff being trained on addressing anti-Black racism, including 9,294 senior leaders, managers and frontline staff. There has also been increased representation of Black staff, community, and business leaders at important City decision-making tables, including the establishment of the Black Scientists Task Force on Vaccine Equity to guide the implementation of an equitable COVID-19 response, and combat misinformation related to vaccination. The City also established the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Advisory Committee, the first intergovernmental anti-Black racism advisory body to be embedded into the municipal governance process in Canada.

Year Three also launched a number of impactful initiatives that increased Black leadership, community capacity and organizational resilience, including the City's first Black Youth Fellowship program, the ground-breaking Toronto Black Food Sovereignty Plan and the piloting of the Black-mandated Funding Framework. Year Three activities also catalyzed broader City action to tackle the living legacies of anti-Black racism through large-scale, long-term interdivisional projects, including the kick-off of the Recognition Review and renaming of Dundas Street, and the Little Jamaica and Jane-Finch Initiatives.

Notwithstanding the positive influence of Year Three actions, the COVID-19 pandemic has had a disproportionate impact on Toronto's diverse Black communities. Black residents were overrepresented in not only the rates of COVID-19 infection, but also in exposure to the cascading impacts of the pandemic overall. COVID-19 has heightened the effects of long-standing structural inequities faced by people of African descent, both increasing the urgency for action, and the continued need for ongoing investments to effectively bolster emergency support in times of crisis.

The Year Four Work Plan, identified actions to be fulfilled by multiple City divisions and responds to the disproportionate impacts of the pandemic, while also strategically aligning the remaining Action Plan deliverables with broader City initiatives and emerging community priorities. Year Four introduces and builds long-term legacy initiatives of the Action Plan that will be stewarded by the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit. Enclosed in this report you will find the following:

- An overview of the impacts of COVID-19 on Black communities and the important City interventions and responses to advance recovery and rebuild in African, Caribbean, and Black communities.
- A progress update on the Year Three (June 2020 to December 2021) Work Plan Deliverables.
- The Year Four Work Plan (January to December 2022) Priorities, including an outline of the legacy, training and evaluation initiatives, and an update on the Black Food Sovereignty Plan and the Black-mandated Funding Framework.
- The Partnership and Accountability Circle report, which highlights feedback on the implementation of Year Three actions to inform future activities and work in Year Four.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration recommends that:

1. City Council request the City Manager, in collaboration with the Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration, the General Manager, Children's Services and other relevant divisions and agencies, to engage with the Province to advance actions from the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism related to education (Actions 1.2, 3.1), child welfare (Actions 2.3, 3.2, 3.3), and alternatives to policing (Actions 16.7, 18.3) that will require intergovernmental cooperation from the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

City divisions, agencies and community partners have made significant investments to advance outcomes identified in the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism. Since 2018, more than \$25.8 million has been invested to advance the implementation of the Action Plan. Resources have been provided to community organizations and grassroots groups, with \$15.7 million allocated directly to Black communities. An

additional \$3 million has been delivered to Black-led and Black serving agencies to strengthen Black mental health and leadership capacity in order to better support Black communities during COVID-19 emergency response. Funding has also been provided to strengthen access to social and economic opportunities through the arts, delivering \$7.1 million for Black arts, culture and heritage initiatives.

The 2022 Approved Operating Budgets for Children's Services, Economic Development and Culture, Social Development, Finance and Administration, Housing Secretariat, and Shelter Support and Housing Administration, include new and enhanced investments to support the Year Four deliverables to confront anti-Black racism, as noted in the following table which outlines investments in the 2022 Operating Budget.

Division	Approved Initiatives	Investment
Children's Services	Investment to advance priority actions to support reconciliation and confront anti-Black racism within the early years and the child care system.	\$217, 700
Economic Development and Culture	Investment to advance the Black Food Sovereignty by partnering with not-for-profit organizations to develop start-up food and beverage production programming for Black Torontonians and increase access to community kitchens.	\$250, 000
Shelter Support and Housing Administration	Investment to support the advancement of equitable outcomes for Indigenous and Black service users through enhanced data collection, monitoring, and program analysis.	\$289.900
Social Development, Finance and Administration	Investment to make 4 staff permanent to support coordination and implementation of the Action Plan, and to address the historic underfunding of Black-led community groups with the Black-mandated Funding Framework.	\$954.500
Housing Secretariat	Investment to support the delivery of the Black Food Sovereignty Plan by addressing systematic barriers, while increasing access and opportunities for ownership over their local food systems.	\$150,000

Further details on these investments are available in the Comments Section of this report.

Although there are no immediate financial implications associated with the adoption of the recommendation in this report, should additional resources be required to continue the delivery of the work plan beyond 2022, funding will be requested in the future year budget processes of participating programs for consideration with other City priorities. The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

EC24.9 - Toronto Black Food Sovereignty Plan

At its' October 1, 2021 meeting, City Council adopted the Toronto Black Food Sovereignty Plan, an initiative that prioritizes the City's response to the rising rates of food insecurity among Black residents through a 5-year interdivisional action plan. Staff will report on the progress of the Plan through the annual reporting on the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism.

(<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2021.EC24.9>)

EC17.3 - Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism - Year Two Update

At its meeting on November 25, 2020, City Council adopted the Confronting Anti-Black Racism's Year Two Update. The report also identified priority outcomes for the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit's Year Three Work Plan, and signaled the development of the Black-mandated Funding Framework, alternative responses to policing, and the expansion of Black Mental Week.

(<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2020.EC17.3>)

EX17.1 - Towards Recovery and Building a Renewed Toronto

On October 27, 2020, City Council adopted a report from the Toronto Office of Recovery and Rebuild to guide the City's response to COVID-19. As an integral part of City recovery and rebuilding efforts, the adoption of this report commits the City to ensuring that Black communities: have their unique needs addressed; are engaged and consulted on the City's COVID-19 response efforts; and are provided with employment and training opportunities within the City's growing green local economy.

(<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2020.EX17.1>)

HL18.1 - Toronto Public Health's Response to COVID-19: Context, Status Update, and Next Steps

At its meeting on July 2, 2020, the Board of Health requested that the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit work with various City divisions to explore and report back on the creation of a comprehensive plan to address food access issues. Interventions should consider COVID-19 recovery and planning, and should focus on addressing root causes and barriers to access affordable, healthy and culturally appropriate food for Black residents.

(<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewPublishedReport.do?function=getMinutesReport&meetingId=18761>)

HL17.9 - Addressing Anti-Black Racism as a Public Health Crisis in the City of Toronto

At its meeting on June 8, 2020, the Board of Health approved direction to address anti-Black racism as a public health crisis and affirmed its commitment to action on social determinants of health. This included the reprioritization of the City of Toronto's resources in the 2021 Budget process, and throughout COVID-19 recovery planning to target health responses to tackle health inequities shaped by structural anti-Black racism. (<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2020.HL17.9>)

EC6.13 - Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism - Update

Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism - Year Three Update

On July 16, 2019, City Council adopted the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism – Update, which outlined Year One (May 2018 to April 2019) progress on the Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism. The report highlighted activities to deliver 26 actions and recommendations in Year One of the Action Plan.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.EC6.13>

EX29.11 - The Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism

At its meeting on December 5, 2017, City Council unanimously approved the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism. As the first anti-Black racism plan in Canada, it outlined 22 recommendations and 80 actions across 5 thematic areas.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.EX29.11>

EX9.5 - TO Prosperity - Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy

At its meeting on November 3, 2015, City Council unanimously adopted TO Prosperity: Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy. This 20-year strategy aims to combat poverty and demonstrate the City's commitment to support residents who face disproportionate structural barriers. TO Prosperity highlights the systemic and intergenerational impacts of poverty on racialized Torontonians and the need for interdivisional collaboration.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.EX9.5>

COMMENTS

This report is divided into three sections, including:

1. An overview of the impacts of COVID-19 on Black communities and City interventions and responses to advance recovery and rebuild.
2. A progress update on the Year Three (June 2020 to December 2021) Work Plan Deliverables.
3. The Year Four Work Plan (January to December 2022) Priorities.

1. The Status of Black Communities: A Year in Review with COVID-19

Year Three of the Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism, running from June 2020 to December 2021, saw incredible challenge and opportunity for impact. Many actions in Year Three pivoted to respond to the immediate challenges Black communities were experiencing through the pandemic, working to support both Black City staff and residents, while navigating shifting health and safety protocols.

Throughout this period, the impact of COVID-19 has disproportionately weighed on Black communities. Public health data shows that Black communities represented 79 percent of hospitalizations and were the hardest hit in the first wave of the pandemic – peaking at 33 percent of total monthly case rates in August of 2020¹. This situation considerably affected the mental health of many Black residents, with a survey reporting that approximately 75 percent of respondents rate their mental health as less than ok during this period². This situation is compounded by the experience of racism which has

1 Perspectives on Health and Well-Being in Black Communities in Toronto Experiences through COVID-19. (2021). Black Health Alliance, pg. 3.

2 McKenzie, K. & Khenti, A. Fundamentals of Black Mental Health, Dalla Lana School of Public Health and Temerty School of Medicine, Fall 2021.

been shown to increase rates of psychosis and depression by 200 to 300 percent in Black communities. Furthermore, structural inequalities like food insecurity is three times more prevalent among Black Canadians (at 29 percent) compared to their white counterparts, and increases the likelihood of contracting a serious case of COVID-19.³

The effect of the pandemic extends far beyond health outcomes, and has impacted vital social, economic and wellbeing indicators for Black children, youth, seniors and families. During the pandemic, Black employees were found to be more likely to lose their employment or to have reduced hours. In April 2021, the unemployment rate among Black Canadians was at 12 percent, about 70 percent higher than the rest of the population (8 percent).⁴ Yet, a disproportionate share of essential workers identify as Black, with 33.8 percent of health care and social service sector workers identified as Black women, many of whom are immigrants living in communities with greater rates of COVID-19.⁵ What's more, many Torontonians did not have access to sick leave, forcing workers to make choices between their jobs and their health. Labour Force data from summer 2020 revealed that only 17 percent of people earning under \$17/hour received sick leave, causing both health and financial stress.⁶ Similarly, research has shown that many Black businesses experienced considerable hardship. For instance, 48 of the 85 Black-owned and operated businesses in Little Jamaica closed their doors, and many more are at risk due to the rising affordability challenges, and inability to access government provided COVID-19 relief grants and supports.

Precarious and uncertain employment and business hardships have also shaped Black housing security. A 2020 Wellesley Institute study revealed that Toronto's Black population is at higher risk of eviction. The report found that census tracts with 36 percent Black renter households had twice the eviction filing rates compared to census tracts with 2 per cent Black households, even after controlling for poverty and other important factors.⁷ Similarly, the 2021 Street Needs Assessment revealed that the largest percentage of the homeless population identified as Black (at 31 percent). Housing affordability during this period negatively shaped Black residents' ability to retain stable housing, impacting their ability to self-isolate safely and meet their basic needs during the pandemic.

Access to digital tools and infrastructure also presented challenges for Black children, families and workers. Internet access continues to be essential to: benefit from government services; access critical health information; participate in post-secondary, high school and primary education; and to apply and retain many jobs and leadership opportunities throughout the pandemic period. Public libraries were the most likely place for people without internet to get online, with 42 percent of individuals without internet accessing libraries in 2020.⁸ As a result, 31 percent of parents in the GTA reported their

3 When it comes to tackling food insecurity, tackling anti-Black racism is an important part of the puzzle. (2021). PROOF, University of Toronto.

4 Social Determinants of Homicide Report. (2021). The Centre for Research and Innovation on the Determinants of Homicide.

5 Black History Month...By the Numbers. (2022). Statistics Canada

6 Study: A Labour Market Snapshot of Black Canadians during the Pandemic. (2021). Government of Canada, Statistics Canada.

7 Forced Out: Evictions, Race and Poverty. (2020). Wellesley Institute.

8 Mapping Toronto's Digital Divide. (2021). Brookfield Institute

Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism - Year Three Update

children were unable to complete all of their school work, a figure representing 45 percent of Black parents nationally.

Targeted Interventions to Support Black Communities

To effectively understand and respond to racialized health equity challenges and curb the disparate effects of COVID-19, Toronto Public Health in collaboration with Social Development, Finance and Administration, and other divisions and health and community partners, led the implementation of a variety of targeted emergency responses and vaccination efforts. These initiatives embodied a targeted universalism approach in the Action Plan which involved targeting the removal of systemic barriers to healthcare and other social services that affected people of African descent. Such targeting also benefits other equity-deserving communities and the city at large. Hyper local interventions targeted individuals and families with a focus on those who were disproportionately impacted by the pandemic, including Indigenous and Black people, those living on a low-income, or in densely populated communities, persons living with disabilities, newcomers, and racialized communities.

Targeted Black community COVID-19 response activities included:

- The establishment of a [Black Scientists Task Force on Vaccine Equity](#) as part of the TO Supports: Targeted Equity Action Plan. This initiative was developed to respond to race-based data indicating that the highest rates of COVID-19 cases and vaccine hesitancy were among Black people of African and Caribbean origins. Developed in partnership with the TAIBU Community Health Centre in November 2020, the Task Force engaged diverse Black communities through town halls to respond to concerns related to the COVID-19 pandemic, testing and vaccine mistrust. The Task Force also presented regular updates to the Board of Health, and delivered [their recommendations](#) in June 2021. Toronto Public Health continued to work collaboratively with Social Development, Finance and Administration and the Task Force to implement report recommendations.
- The [Black Vaccine Engagement Team](#) developed agile, hyper-local and culturally responsive strategies across diverse neighbourhoods to increase COVID-19 testing, vaccine confidence and access among communities. Informed by analyses and recommendations of the Black Scientists' Task Force on Vaccine Equity and the [Black Physicians Association of Ontario \(BPAO\)](#), this initiative has also delivered town halls and workshops on vaccinations and immunized 4358 people at COVID-19 Pop-Ups between May to October 2021.
- COVID-19 Mass Immunization, Pop-up and Mobile Clinics provided Black-focused vaccine clinics in partnership with the Black Physicians Association of Ontario and other community agencies. This included coordination and funding of cluster agencies, community ambassadors, and the assignment of Toronto Public Health staff to Black-focused clinics throughout Toronto.
- Since June 2020, disaggregated race-based data has been integrated into Toronto Public Health's approach to collect, analyze and report publicly on COVID-19 cases. The collection of socio-demographic data has been a critical for both confirming existing disparities and prioritizing initiatives to address them. Prior to this data collection, few analysts understood the scale and scope of COVID-19 on racialized populations. The data has strengthened Public Health planning and service delivery,

and significantly enhanced immunization efforts in low uptake, high risk areas. Community leadership has been central to this approach. Partnerships include: the Jamaican Canadian Association, TAIBU and Black Creek Community Health Centres, the Black Physicians Association of Ontario and the Caribbean, and African Canadian Social Services.

- Advocacy to improve Provincial support for paid sick days and other employment supports to adequately isolate and recover from COVID-19 is another key intervention. In particular, the City supported the call from the Black Scientists Task Force for the introduction of pandemic sick days, through a public statement by the Mayor and the Medical Officer of Health on January 11, 2021. This response is also being recommended as a critical element of the Province's future anti-racism strategy.

In addition to these interventions in Year Three, in response to the ongoing impacts of COVID-19, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit is currently stewarding a coordinated, cohesive response to better target existing City strategies and interventions that would have a health impact, to better serve Black residents. This response represents the early work to deliver a Black Health Service Coordination Strategy that will be informed and scaled up in collaboration with Black communities and service providers over the course of 2022. A report on this initiative will be brought to Council in Q2 2023, as part of the annual reporting on the Action Plan.

2. Progress on Year Three Priorities (June 2020 to December 2021)

The Year Three Work Plan identifies 21 actions led by City divisions and Black-led agencies, delivering a \$21.5 million investment to Black communities between June 2020 and December 2021. Overall, 60 percent of all Action Plan recommendations have been implemented. For Year Three, 35 percent of work plan activities are complete. The remaining 64 percent are multi-year actions that will be completed in Year Four as planned, with a small number of initiatives being delivered under an extended timeline due to COVID-19 restrictions and emergency response.

Despite COVID-19 restrictions on in-person engagement, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit:

- Organized and supported 51 community engagements that reached 12,489 people virtually and in person. Engagements included community awareness and partnership events and conferences where the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit presented.
- Developed 46 partnerships with diverse Black-mandated community organizations and public and private sector groups to help promote and advance the Action Plan at community awareness events and initiatives.
- Delivered large scale projects to convene Black leaders and residents, including convening the first Black Mental Health Week, the first annual Black Food Sovereignty Conference, the second Toronto Black Policy Conference, and the first Confronting Anti-Black Racism Community Town Hall.

Year Three Work Plan activities have been categorized and tracked across four themes: (1) Continuing to Create Culture Change at the City of Toronto; (2) Community Capacity Building; (3) Community Safety, Wellbeing and Alternatives to Policing; and (4) Black

Community Resilience. Table 1 below includes a snap shot of progress based on theme.

Table 1: Snap Shot of Year Three Progress

Theme	Progress
Continuing to Create Culture Change at the City of Toronto	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 44 new Black community experts recruited to inform City work plans. - 9,294 City, agency and commission staff received Anti-Black Racism training. - 96 percent of trained staff can now recognize manifestations of anti-Black racism, and 74 percent can now competently apply the Anti-Black Racism Analysis Tool. - Launch of the disaggregated race-based data collection pilot with 11 agencies.
Community Capacity Building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - \$2 million Toronto Arts Council investment to support the Black Arts community. - \$1.8 million in funding delivered to Black artists, comprising 85 percent of the 2021 ArtworxTO: Toronto's Year of Public Art. - Launch of queer and trans needs assessment survey. - 20 new Enhanced Youth Spaces and Youth Hubs opened in neighbourhoods with high proportions of Black residents. - \$1 million from the TO Supports Investment Fund for Black-mandated groups. - \$625,000 from the Black-mandated Funding Framework will be provided to Black-led agencies, with an additional \$509,000 from the 2022 City Budget.
Community Safety, Wellbeing and Alternatives to Policing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Establishment of the new Policing Reforms Unit to lead the development of the Toronto Community Crisis Service to support non-police interventions. - Launch of new Fare Inspector and Special Constable Complaints Office by the Toronto Transit Commission. - Launch of community consultations on the Toronto Transit Commission Use of Force, Body Worn Camera, and Use of Discretion Policies.
Black Community Resilience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 200 Black residents, Black-serving food organizations and nine (9) City Divisions engaged in Toronto's response to Black food insecurity to inform the creation of a Black Food Sovereignty Plan, including delivery of a community-based conference, youth documentary, and community policy papers. - Launch of the Toronto Community Housing Centre for Advancement of the Interests of Black People, with 18 full-time Black staff to support Black residents. - 200 participants engaged in the Black Youth Leadership Program.
Black Community Resilience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 47 youth engaged in the Elevate and B-You Programs in Little Jamaica, with 65 active youth from Oakwood and Vaughan benefiting from counselling, case-management, youth justice education and employment, with 3 youth securing internships with the local Business Improvement Area.
Black Community Resilience continued	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 140 frontline staff, aged 16-29, participated in the Summer Front-line Workers Series. - 1,012 youth aged 14-18 years participated in employment information and readiness programs. - 300 Toronto Public Library Internet Connectivity Kits were provided to Black-mandated organizations and clients, as part of the Digital Canopy Wi-Fi program.

Details on the progress of all actions delivered and advanced during this period can be reviewed in Appendix A.

UBUNTU African Assessment of Year Three Impact

In Year Three, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit also piloted a new UBUNTU: African Assessment Model to deepen the monitoring and evaluation of community partnerships. Implementing this model enhanced tracking by deploying a decolonized approach to partnership evaluation that uses community defined metrics to assess impact. The model focuses on shifts, changes and improvements at various spheres of influence, including the individual, group, institutional and societal to assess how partnership projects drive systems change. Examples of these impacts at the individual, group and institutional spheres are outlined below:

Table 2: Year Three Impact on the Individual, Group and Institutional Spheres

Spheres of Influence	Impact
Impact on Individuals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Through the Black Youth Development Program 17 Black youth were supported to secure jobs across 13 City divisions to realize Action 12, which recommends mentorship programs as a pathway to employment and promotion for Black Torontonians. - Prioritizing young people who are typically overlooked for opportunities, this program provided two professional development opportunities to foster valuable work experience and skills for future job opportunities. Post-engagement survey data revealed that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 100 percent of the participants said they felt satisfied with their experience - 82 percent were able to secure long term employment at the City - 12 percent of those employed at the City obtained long-term employment through the City's Business Improvement Area program. - Collaborating with more than 10 community partners, this initiative cultivated and transformed how Black youth participants saw themselves and increased their capacity to market their skills and experience.
Impact on Groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Internal changes within divisions remains a key space for transformation. The Shelter, Support and Housing Administration General Manager's Office advanced Action 11 by developing a Divisional Mentorship Pilot Program for Black staff. - Throughout the 6 month program, Black staff received mentorship and exposure to responsibilities associated with other roles to strengthen professional and leadership skills.
Impact on Groups continued	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Divisional Mentorship Pilot Program benefited 160 staff by fostering closer connections with colleagues across their division. - Participants reported this initiative increased opportunities for information sharing, support, strategizing and collective action. - Currently under evaluation, the program is expected to continue in 2022. - The People and Equity Division and other municipalities also reviewing the program to consider opportunities to expand its implementation in other contexts.

Spheres of Influence	Impact
<p>Impact on Institutions</p>	<p>A number of large scale city-wide initiatives and commitments to dismantle and redress the structural impacts of anti-Black racism advanced in 2021 going beyond the vision of the initial 80 actions in the Action Plan and demonstrate a deep transformation and culture change in City processes. They also showcase the ways the anti-Black racism analysis tools and training, coupled with the integration of Black leadership at municipal decision-making tables are changing how the City supports and responds to the enduring and emerging needs of Black communities. Impacts can be observed across many projects including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Little Jamaica which supports Black businesses and neighbourhoods through culture, planning and economic and social development interventions. This effort addresses decades of under investment and institutional marginalization, and commemorate significant histories and contributions while also resisting pressures of gentrification and Black community displacement. - The Jane-Finch Initiative supports integrated, inclusive community planning, and will be one of the first joint City Planning and social development-led initiatives to first to embed the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit's Growing in Place Framework and the UBUNTU evaluation model. - The Recognition Review project is working to create more accessible and welcoming public spaces and improve the experience of consultation for Black and Indigenous communities. This project will develop a new framework to guide how the City commemorates public figures, place names and other civic assets. - There is also concerted effort to directly target and engage Black leaders, experts and communities. This engagement will strengthen City initiatives to effectively rebuild and recover from the pandemic in a way that centres Black voices, as recommended in the Toronto Office of Rebuild and Recovery Report, adopted by Council at its October 27, 2021 meeting. Efforts include: - New advisory tables, like the Black Scientists Task Force on Vaccine Equity and several new divisional advisory groups, some of which include the new Program Advisory Committee in Economic Development and Culture, the Black-mandated Funding Framework sector advisor table in Social Development, Finance and Administration, and the Centennial Park Advisory Committee in Parks Forestry and Recreation.

Spheres of Influence	Impact
Impact on Institutions continued	<p>- The Confronting Anti-Black Racism Advisory Committee also represents an important new advisory. A first of its kind in Canada, the Committee represents historic action to permanently embed Black leadership into the City's decision making and governance process. Comprised of 14 public members and one Councillor Co-Chair, the Committee has an intergovernmental mandate to foster collaboration and provide expert advice to City Council on strategic city-wide issues, like education, child-welfare, policing and the justice system, housing, and employment. The Committee also identifies opportunities to mark the UN International Decade for People of African Descent (the Decade) and city-wide strategic action on emerging issues facing Black communities. The Committee has already informed the development of several city wide plans in its first year, including Toronto's Digital Infrastructure Plan, and Cultural District Framework.</p>

Learning from Year Three: Challenges and Opportunities

In the course of Year Three implementation, staff encountered the following four key challenges and four key opportunities:

Table 4: Year Three Challenges

Challenge	Description
Engaging Black Communities Across a Digital Divide	<p>The COVID-19 pandemic has led to a greater dependence on digital infrastructure to participate in City consultation, access opportunities, education, services and programs. A January 2021 study, Mapping Toronto's Digital Divide, revealed that 42 percent of Black families worry about the affordability of internet service. Neighbourhoods with higher Black populations, including Jane and Finch, St. James Town, and Regent Park all reported lower internet connectivity rates than other Toronto neighbourhoods. Digital exclusion also presented significant challenges to successfully engage Black communities, limiting the impacts of increased outreach and interventions during Year Three.</p>
Immediate versus Long-Term Investments in Times of Crisis	<p>Emergency response efforts have been a primary focus of programs, services and recommendations to support Black communities in 2021. The focus on immediate needs and deficits is critical to stabilize communities, but cannot remain the primary focus of interventions. Long term commitments that build on existing community assets, institutions and dreams are imperative to foster thriving Black communities.</p>
Combatting Multiple Crises at Once	<p>Anti-Black racism, COVID-19, climate change and economic inequality are all pressing global issues that require intersectional, collaborative approaches. The threat of disconnected and siloed responses to these intertwined challenges is considerable. As a leader in this work, the City and its' partners will need to be intentional about how they drive solutions that are comprehensive, intersectional and dynamic in their development and implementation.</p>

Challenge	Description
Sustaining Momentum and Capacity for Systems Change	Black City staff, leaders, communities and allies have been navigating the disproportionate effects of COVID-19 and systemic racism at the same time. This reality can lead to burn out and fatigue that can impact momentum for change. Prioritizing recovery and resilience, from institutional, communal and personal perspectives, is vital. The City must use this moment to recommit to long term transformation to strengthen the fabric of our racial landscape in Toronto. Making space for collective healing and care, and positively affirming Black identity will be essential to respond to this challenge.

Table 5: Year Three Opportunities

Opportunity	Description
Investing in Black Communities	The City's Community Funding Unit and the Black Resilience Cluster have reflected on the current challenges Black agencies face in securing funding. In an effort to move away from “extractive” practices to “regenerative” approaches to grant making, community evaluation and reporting. An ecosystem funding approach has been adopted that considers how organizations can complement and strengthen the broader landscape of Black groups and agencies. It will also consider how funding one group can have a collective impact on other organizations and other targeted funding vehicles.
Rethinking Approaches to Funding	The Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit has begun working with funding agencies to shape granting processes by working closely with philanthropic institutions to reimagine how wealth is redistributed, power is democratized and economic control is shifted to communities to make the biggest impact. Working with the Toronto Foundation, and sector leaders, the Unit has been able to contribute to the criteria and design of new targeted funding, benefiting 13 grassroots and established Black mandated organizations through the Black and Indigenous Futures Fund.
Identifying New Levers for Change	The Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit's fee-for-service Multi-Sectoral Anti-Racism Consultative Support Services Program represents a new opportunity to build collective capacity for systems change. This initiative presents a distinct opportunity to grow the City's model of transformative change within municipal institutions, and grow its network of partners committed to embedding anti-Black racism policies and practices. The initiative also demonstrates the societal effect of the Action Plan, with groups taking initiative to shift cultural attitudes about the need for anti-Black racism training, positioning the City of Toronto as a leader in this area of work in only three short years.
Intergovernmental Cooperation and Coordination	Confronting the deep legacies of anti-Black racism requires commitment from all levels of government. Federal and Provincial leadership and cross-government collaboration are essential levers to align changes and leverage action and investments. The recently established Confronting Anti-Black Racism Advisory Committee provides an important mechanism to make intergovernmental connections that strengthen and enhance support for Black communities.

3. Year Four Work Plan (January to December 2022) Priorities

Between July 2021 to January 2022, Black communities, the Partnership and Accountability Circle, the City's Black Staff Network and City divisions and agencies were engaged as part of a four-part process to inform the development of the Year Four Work Plan Priorities for 2022. Phase one included working with City divisions, agencies, commissions and partners to clarify the status of existing priorities and year three deliverables through the quarterly Confronting Anti-Black Racism City Leads Circle meetings. Phase Two focused on the need to hear directly from Black communities through the convening of Confronting Anti-Black Racism's first virtual town hall, which engaged more than 100 Black residents, as part of Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit's Emancipation month activities hosted in August 2021. Feedback gathered during these events highlighted six themes which linked emerging community needs with the remaining Action Plan recommendations.

In October and November 2021, City divisions, agencies and commissions were convened in these smaller thematic groups to determine alignments with broader City priorities to advance an ambitious suite of recommendations that will leverage existing City commitments, investments and capacity to benefit Black communities. Finally, the Partnership and Accountability Circle was consulted to provide community insight to further refine the language, framing and final actions for the 2022 calendar year.

The six guiding themes for the Year Four Action Plan Work Plan are included below. See Appendix B for more information on the six priority areas.

1. Service Targeting and Coordination
2. Inclusive Economic Development
3. Accessible and Equitable Housing
4. Alternative Police Responses, Restorative Justice, and Repair
5. Transformative Culture Change at the City
6. Recognition and Place making

A number of crosscutting themes have also been identified across these six priorities to enhance and target impact. This includes an intentional focus on 2SLGBTQ+ youth, on Black women, on cultivation of increased capacity and opportunities for Black leadership, and support for Black communities to recover and live with, and through, the new persistent reality of COVID-19.

Additionally, the Year Four Work Plan is also framed by the legacy of [the United Nations International Decade for People of African](#). The City officially recognized the UN International Decade in 2019 and was the first, and at that time the only, North American municipality to officially do so. The Decade honours and commemorates the unique historic and present-day contributions of Black Torontonians to the fabric of the city and advances the program themes of recognition, justice and development in support of Caribbean, African and Black-identifying communities, both today, and into the future.

To champion this commitment, the Year Four Work Plan advances a series of multi-year initiatives that respond to emerging needs, and calls for long-term transformational

change spotlighted by the Action Plan. These projects will advance dynamic intersectional interventions to achieve systemic and structural change for Black organizations, businesses, residents and communities for years to come. They position Toronto as a global leader in the movement to reimagine more equitable Black futures and improve outcomes for people of African descent.

Legacy Projects that will continue to be advanced in the Year Four Work Plan include:

The Toronto Black Food Sovereignty Plan:

This intervention seeks to address high rates of Black food insecurity and cultivate Black-led local food systems. The Black Food Sovereignty Plan works to dismantle structural socioeconomic barriers, while increasing access, opportunity and Black community ownership over their local food systems. The implementation of this Plan will not only benefit Black residents, but will embed and accelerate an anti-racism and equity-centred approach to benefit all Torontonians and food work at the City. Since being passed by City Council on October 1, 2021, the Plan has advanced the following activities to support Black communities:

- Launched the Black Food Sovereignty Advisory Circle comprised of ten (10) Black food experts and leaders, including two international members to share knowledge and guide implementation of the Plan;
- Facilitated access to food enterprise below market rent for Black food businesses in North York, through the launch of Flip Kitchen;
- Provided \$100,000 to Black farming organizations to lead land-based youth leadership, urban community-based agriculture initiatives and facilitate access to green space to increase mental health, wellness and community safety for Black youth;
- Delivered \$60,000 in small scale food access grants to increase capacity of grassroots Black-led organizations to deliver emergency food responses initiatives serving Black women, 2SLGBTQ+ youth and seniors;
- Supported Black community farmers and Black food businesses to develop three new and enhanced African, Caribbean farmers markets and Black food hubs to increase access to culturally appropriate food in neighbourhoods with high Black populations and to create safe Black food spaces;
- Dispersed a one-time grant to Black urban farmers to support the purchase of community infrastructure and assets to store fresh, healthy local food to increase local food access; and
- Fostered Black youth storytelling by providing seed funding to develop a Black food documentary on youth leadership in Toronto's Black food sovereignty movement.

The Growing in Place Framework:

This initiative advances an anti-Black racism planning analysis for urban development projects to create city-wide approaches and interventions to address gentrification and Black displacement. The Framework proactively addresses challenges of neighbourhood change and destabilizing forms of local re-development to respond to issues of anti-Black racism that contribute to Black displacement. The approach focuses on areas that have experienced intensified processes of gentrification and mounting affordability challenges that impact access to community space and housing for Black

businesses, residents and local community agencies. Neighbourhoods with a concentration of Black residents, like Jane and Finch, Eglinton West neighbourhoods, Weston Mount Dennis and Lawrence Heights have also been prioritized. Currently being piloted as part of a guiding framework for the City's Jane-Finch Initiative, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit is partnering with Black-led and Black serving organizations, Black subject matter experts and various City divisions, including City Planning to identify opportunities to embed this policy framework to identify appropriate planning tools, interventions and evaluation processes that will support Black communities to grow in place.

The Black-mandated Funding Framework:

This intervention responds to a history of underinvestment in Black-led and Black-serving social service agencies, organizations and grassroots groups. Designed in consultation with Black community leaders, the initiative been designed to achieve three key goals: (1) to increase funding allocations to Black-mandated organizations, resident-led and grassroots groups; (2) to improve granting practice to increase openness and flexibility while addressing historical funding inequities experienced by Black-mandated organizations and groups; and (3) to increase the stability of Black-mandated organizations and groups through increased funding and self-determination in the ways funding is used.

The Framework will be implemented through a reallocation of existing resources and budget enhancement requests. Three types of funding activities are included in the initial pilot phase: (1) capacity building for Black residents, grassroots groups and organizations; (2) prioritized support for Black resident-led grassroots and emerging groups with the support of intermediaries who can also function as trustees; and (3) ongoing support for established Black organizations by providing sustained funding to support core operations and programming. Grants will also seek to use the UBUNTU African Assessment model to embed and test a decolonized evaluation model within City grant processes. See Appendix D for additional information on this initiative.

The Black Health Service Coordination Strategy:

To address poor health outcomes for Black communities and to respond to sector calls for targeted interventions for Black communities, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit is undertaking the development of a Black health service coordination response. The initiative will leverage community leadership, City strategies, and existing City and community infrastructure, including resident and City staff convening tables, as a foundation for a coordinated response to impact health inequities widened considerably by the COVID-19 pandemic. Using an integrated anti-racist social determinants of health approach, the work will focus on disparity reduction across eight intervention areas, including: (1) food security and access; (2) stable housing; (3) income and employment; (4) health access and quality of care; (5) education; (6) community safety; (7) mental health; and (8) the environment.

The Black Health Service Coordination Strategy will strengthen and target intersectional, multi-sectoral action and increase the capacity for leadership in the Black human and social service ecosystem to transform health outcomes and enhance wrap around supports for African, Caribbean and Black residents.

Training and Organizational Learning in Year Four

Each year, a selection of City divisions and agencies are identified to receive mandatory Confronting Anti-Black Racism Training as a part of the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Corporate Learning Strategy. Training increases staff capacity to understand, identify, intervene and apply an anti-Black racism lens in their work. Selection for training is informed by Confronting Anti-Black Racism divisional work plan priorities and feedback from key stakeholders, including the Partnership and Accountability Circle, the Black Resilience Cluster, the Black Staff Network and the City Leads Circle.

This year, five City divisions will be prioritized to receive a minimum four-hour Confronting Anti-Black Racism-led training to bolster outcomes under the transformational culture change theme. Divisions include: The Housing Secretariat; Toronto Employment and Social Services; Senior Services and Long-Term Care; Parks, Forestry and Recreation; and Social Development, Finance and Administration.

A recent [KPMG study](#) noted that allyship is one of the most important and effective ways to reduce racial barriers for Black Canadians in the workplace. To foster learning and continued engagement across the Corporation, Confronting Anti-Black Racism staff will also host several activities to support Black and non-Black staff. Learning opportunities include Unpacking Dialogues, Lunch and Learns and city-wide commemorative events, such as Black History Month and Black Mental Health Week events, and Emancipation Month activities. Additionally, the Unit will continue to deliver fee-for-service training and advice through the Multi-Sectoral Anti-Racism Consultative Support Services Program which builds the capacity of non-profit agencies, institutions, corporations and other municipalities and governments to embed and champion an anti-Black racism lens in their work.

Tracking and Measuring Impact

To track impact, Unit staff will continue to convene quarterly City Leads Circle meetings to connect senior City staff across divisions and agencies to share regular progress updates on actions and problem solve emerging challenges to increase staff capacity to implement deliverables. This year 18 City divisions, agencies and commissions are represented at the City Leads Circle Table.

As in previous years, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit will use the UBUNTU African Assessment Model as the primary evaluation system to measure progress. Success will be assessed based on transformational change at the individual, group, institutional and societal levels. To further expand and strengthen reporting, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit will also be implementing a new internal Black outcomes dashboard to input, store and compare improvements to measure Black wellbeing. Similarly, the Unit will be working closely with the Equity and Human Rights Division with the People and Equity Division to integrate the Unit's Anti-Black Racism Analysis Approach into the City's Equity Lens Tool to standardize measurement across divisions. Staff will also be expanding its 2021 pilot of the UBUNTU African Assessment Model to understand impact across all of the Unit's partnerships.

Next Steps

The Toronto Action Plan to Confront Anti-Black Racism represents a collaborative, targeted and integrated response to address the legacy of anti-Black racism in Toronto and beyond. In addition to continuing to foster and build institutional and community partnerships to spur recovery and rebuild efforts, the 2Year Four (January to December 2022) Work Plan will deepen measurement and evaluation to strengthen the City's assessment of impact.

Working in collaboration with the Partnership and Accountability Circle, City agencies, Boards, Commissions, and a growing number of division-led anti-Black racism advisories, the Confronting Anti-Black Racism Unit will improve, standardize and embed systems and tools to better respond to the shifting needs of Black Torontonians. A report back on the Year Four Work Plan, including the implementation of the Toronto Black Food Sovereignty Plan, will come forward in Q2 2023.

CONTACT

Anthony Morgan, Manager, Confronting Anti-Black Racism, Social Development, Finance and Administration, 416-668-0641, Anthony.Morgan@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Denise Andrea Campbell
Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A: Year Three Action Plan Deliverables Progress Update
Appendix B: Year 4 Work Plan Priorities and Actions
Appendix C: Partnership and Accountability Circle Report
Appendix D: Black-mandated Funding Framework Overview