

Attachment 1

City of Toronto

**Request for Tenders for Highland Creek Treatment Plant
Fluidized Bed Incinerator & South Facility Upgrades Project
No. Doc3320202763**

**Fairness Monitor's Report
June 16, 2022
FINAL**



TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Project Highlights.....	1
1.1 Project Background and Objectives.....	1
1.2 Fairness Engagement Scope of Work.....	1
2. Request for Tender Process	2
2.1 Development of the RFT Documents	2
2.2 RFT Open Period Process.....	2
2.3 RFT Proposal Submission Receipt and Compliance	2
2.4 Final Result	3
2.5 Debriefings.....	3
3. Conclusion.....	4

1. Project Highlights

1.1 Project Background and Objectives

The City of Toronto (the "City") issued the Request for Tenders for Highland Creek Treatment Plant Fluidized Bed Incinerator & South Facility Upgrades Project (the "RFT") which closed on June 3, 2022.

The objective of the RFT was to select the successful Contractor from the pre-qualified shortlist for the performance of the construction services on the Highland Creek Treatment Plant Fluidized Bed Incinerator and South Facility Upgrades project. This is a second-stage process following the completed open competitive request for supplier qualifications (RFSQ) process.

The Highland Creek Treatment Plant South Facility is located at 51 Beechgrove Drive, Scarborough, Ontario, M1E 3Z3, Toronto. The Plant generally utilizes polymer addition, sludge feed pumping, centrifuge operation, centrate pumping, and multiple hearth incineration process for biosolids management requirements at the rated plant capacity of 219 ML/d.

The major works forming the project are the novation of the current contract between the City and SUEZ, the supplier of two new Fluidized Bed Incineration Process trains, as well as phased works as follows:

- Relocation of new auxiliary systems supporting the current centrifuge dewatering process including dry polymer make-up and polymer emulsion addition, sludge feed and sludge recirculation pumping, centrate pumping to the existing Dewatering Building,
- State of good repair and electrical upgrades in the Dewatering Building,
- Demolition of the Heat Treatment Building,
- Construction of the new Fluidized Bed Incineration (FBI) Building including installation, successful placement into service and performance testing of the two SUEZ-supplied new Fluidized Bed Incineration Process trains,
- South Facility site restoration

The performance of the Work will be undertaken whilst the treatment plant remains in operation (24 hours per day/7 days per week). Other large capital improvement projects at the site will be under construction at the same time or a portion of the time of the performance of the Work.

1.2 Fairness Engagement Scope of Work

P1 Consulting was engaged in May 2021, to act as the Fairness Monitor to review and monitor the communications, evaluations and decision-making processes that were associated with the RFSQ and RFT.

In our provision of Fairness Monitor Services, we were responsible for monitoring all aspects of the RFT process in order to confirm it was conducted in a manner consistent with the RFT documents, to review the evaluation guidelines and process, and to confirm that the principles of fairness, openness and transparency were maintained. In our role we confirmed the following steps were taken to support a fair process:

- Ensuring clarity and consistency of the RFT and related documentation;
- Adherence to the processes described in the RFT and evaluation guidelines, including the evaluation process;
- Objectivity and diligence during the procurement process in order to ensure that it was conducted in a transparent manner;
- Compliance of participants with strict requirements of conflict of interest and confidentiality during the procurement and evaluation processes; and
- Oversight to provide a process where the Respondents are treated fairly.

2. Request for Tender Process

2.1 Development of the RFT Documents

P1 Consulting reviewed the RFT documents prior to posting for the pre-qualified Suppliers and all of our comments related to fairness were satisfactorily addressed by the City. We confirm that, from a fairness perspective, the requirements were clear and the RFT provided the Respondents a fair process. The RFT document was posted on January 25, 2022.

2.2 RFT Open Period Process

Throughout the RFT open period, the City responded to the questions from the pre-qualified Suppliers and issued Addenda to provide greater clarity on the requirements and process. P1 Consulting reviewed all documents that were provided to confirm that they were acceptable from a fairness perspective. A site visit process was established with input from the fairness monitor and voluntary site visits were led by a city representative during the open period. Following the site visits the city representative confirmed with the FM the attendees in attendance and that the visits were conducted in accordance with the established process.

2.3 RFT Proposal Submission Receipt and Compliance

The RFT closing date and time was June 3, 2022, at noon. Submissions were received electronically in accordance with the RFT document, via the City's Bidding System. Submissions were received from the following two (2) pre-qualified Suppliers in advance of the closing deadline:

- Kenaidan Contracting Ltd
- Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd.

Representatives from the City's Procurement and Materials Management Division and Engineering and Construction Services Division undertook the assessment of the mandatory submission requirements.

Both submissions met the mandatory requirements in accordance with the RFT.

2.4 Final Result

In accordance with the RFT Evaluation process, the following pre-qualified Supplier had the lowest-priced compliant bid for the City of Toronto's Request for Tender for Contracting Services of Highland Creek Treatment Plant Fluidized Bed Incinerator Project:

- Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd.

2.5 Debriefings

As of the date of this report the City has not undertaken any debriefing meetings with Respondents for the RFT.

3. Conclusion

Our fairness review was conducted without influence and we confirm that we are satisfied that, from a fairness perspective, the processes that we observed related to the RFT have been conducted in a fair, open and transparent manner. As Fairness Monitor for the Request for Tender for Contracting Services of Highland Creek Treatment Plant Fluidized Bed Incinerator & South Facility Upgrades Project, we are satisfied that the evaluation process up to and including the identification of the successful Contractor, the City has followed the procedures in accordance with the applicable RFT documentation and internal policies.



Stephanie Braithwaite,
Director of Fairness, P1 Consulting