

Review of Visitor Parking Requirements for New Development

Date: June 20, 2022

To: Planning and Housing Committee

From: Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning

Wards: All

SUMMARY

This report responds to City Council direction for staff to review the approach to minimum requirements for visitor parking in new developments in different contexts within the City and in the different policy areas established in the revised Zoning By-law requirements (Zoning By-law 89-2022).

Upon further review, staff are of the opinion that the minimum requirements for visitor parking that City Council adopted in December 2021 are appropriate given the data available and analysis undertaken to date and will be sufficient to meet the minimum needs of the development while being flexible enough to allow for a market-driven approach to parking provision that aligns with City policy objectives. Staff will work with applicants to ensure they have fully considered the need for visitor parking in their developments and considered the local context. Requests for reductions in the visitor parking supply will only be supported in extraordinary cases where the applicant has clearly demonstrated that the demand for visitor trips can be accommodated without creating other issues.

In addition, staff will monitor the impacts of the new parking standards on the amount of visitor parking proposed in new development and report to City Council in Q1 2024 with an assessment of the provision of visitor parking in recent development applications and any proposed amendments to the Zoning By-law that may be warranted. Staff will also explore measures to mitigate parking challenges in areas with limited visitor parking.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning recommends that:

1. Planning and Housing Committee request the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, to report to City Council in Q1 2024 with an analysis of the impacts of the new parking standards on the amount of visitor parking proposed in new development.

2. Planning and Housing Committee request the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, in collaboration with the General Manager, Transportation Services Division to ensure transportation impact studies consider potential issues associated with the proposed amount of visitor parking.

3. Planning and Housing Committee request the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, in collaboration with the General Manager, Transportation Services Division and the Toronto Parking Authority, to explore measures to mitigate parking challenges in areas with limited visitor parking.

EQUITY STATEMENT

The recommendations of this report were reviewed for potential impacts on equity-deserving groups and vulnerable residents of Toronto. The intended outcomes of the recommendation will not negatively impact equity-seeking groups and vulnerable residents.

Requirements for visitor parking ensure that there is sufficient parking in new development for visitors, including vehicles supporting the servicing of the development itself. Requirements for parking above this level imposes costs on residents and users of the development and makes it more difficult for households to avoid the direct and indirect costs of parking to improve housing affordability.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no immediate financial implications arising from the adoption of the recommendations in this report. If there are financial impacts in future budget years, it will be included in the subsequent budget submission for the affected Division/Agency.

DECISION HISTORY

The City-wide Zoning By-law 569-2013 was enacted on May 9, 2013. Among other things, this by-law established new parking standards for newly erected or enlarged buildings (URL:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.PG21.1>). The majority of the regulations for parking spaces, and bicycle parking spaces were approved without modifications as per a Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (LPAT) Order dated October 3, 2019

On October 2, 2019 Council declared a climate emergency and endorsed a target for net zero greenhouse gas emissions by 2050 (URL:

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.MM10.3>).

At its meeting on September 22, 2020, Planning and Housing Committee requested the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to develop options for a review of

the City's parking requirements for new developments in different contexts (URL: <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2020.PH16.12>).

On January 19, 2021, Planning and Housing Committee requested the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to conduct a review of the parking requirements in the Zoning By-law 569-2013 (URL: <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2021.PH20.4>).

On December 15, 2021, Council adopted Item PH29.3 with amendments, to update automobile parking standards in Zoning By-law 569-2013 (URL: <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2021.PH29.3>). In adopting the item, Council directed the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning to report back to City Council on the approach to minimum requirements for visitor parking in new developments in different contexts within the City.

COMMENTS

In December 2021, City Council adopted an amendment to city-wide Zoning By-law 569-2013 which updated the City's parking standards to better manage automobile dependency and achieve a better balance between building too much or too little parking. City Council enacted the amendment at the meeting of February 2 and 3, 2022. The amendment is currently under appeal.

The zoning by-law amendment removed most requirements for new developments to provide a minimum amount of automobile parking on site. Minimum visitor parking requirements were maintained in Zoning By-law 569-2013 to ensure space for vehicles supporting service to a development and to provide a small amount of parking for other visitors in areas of the city with limited access to automobile alternatives. However, concerns were raised about whether the amount of visitor parking that would be provided in new developments would be sufficient, especially given local contexts. The approved rates are viewed by some as too restrictive in areas of the City where access to transit and other sustainable transportation networks is still improving. This report responds to a direction from City Council to review the approach to minimum requirements for visitor parking in new developments in different contexts within the City and in the different policy areas established in the revised Zoning By-law requirements.

This review focuses on the residential visitor parking requirements for automobiles, specifically for a dwelling unit in an Apartment Building, a Mixed Use Building, and/or a Multiple Dwelling Unit Building. City Council's approved visitor requirement for a dwelling unit in an Apartment Building, a Mixed Use Building, and/or a Multiple Dwelling Unit Building is shown in Table 1 below. The table is organized by the approved Parking Zones (PZs), which were created to establish different parking requirements to reflect the relative quality of automobile alternatives in different areas of the City. The PZs are based on the area of influence of transit and automobile ownership rates and are broken into the following areas:

- Areas in PZ A are within a 400 metre walk of frequent higher-order transit (e.g. subway and LRT) and generally also include lands within Policy Areas 1, 2 and 3 of high order transit.
- Areas in PZ B are within a 100 metre walk of stops served by frequent surface transit services and generally also include lands within Policy Area 4.
- All other areas of the City are areas not captured within PZ A or B.

Table 1: Residential Visitor Parking Requirement Adopted by City Council in December 2021

Parking Zone A	Parking Zone B	All Other Areas of the City
Minimum: 2.0 plus 0.01 per dwelling unit Maximum: 1.0 per dwelling unit up to five (5) dwelling units, 0.1 per dwelling unit thereafter	Minimum: 2.0 plus 0.05 per dwelling unit Maximum: 1.0 per dwelling unit up to five (5) dwelling units, 0.1 per dwelling unit thereafter	Minimum: 2.0 plus 0.05 per dwelling unit Maximum: 1.0 per dwelling unit up to five (5) dwelling units, 0.1 per dwelling unit thereafter

The higher visitor parking requirement for developments in Parking Zone B and All Other Areas of the City reflects that automobile alternatives are not as readily available in those areas as in Parking Zone A and anticipates a greater need for visitor parking on site.

The adopted visitor parking rates were supported by a review of the City's Development Pipeline data. Considering a sample of projects with at least one planning approval and known parking requirements active between 2013 and 2019, 46% (473 of 1033) were approved with parking levels below the minimum parking standards in Zoning By-law 569-2013. A further breakdown of the visitor parking rates being approved in applications that had a dwelling unit in an Apartment Building, a Mixed Use Building, and/or a Multiple Dwelling Unit Building showed that 82% (481 out of 582) of applications received approval to provide less visitor parking compared to what was previously required in Zoning By-law 569-2013.

A comparison of the previous visitor parking requirements in Zoning By-law 569-2013, the amount of visitor parking which would be provided if the development provided visitor parking at the average rate recommended by staff and approved by City Council, and the recently adopted visitor parking requirements is shown in Table 2, Table 3 and Table 4 for developments of different sizes. In all cases, the amount of visitor parking consistent with the average rate approved by staff and City Council is within the range of visitor parking permitted under the adopted standards.

Table 2: Comparison of the Amount of Visitor Parking Required and Approved for Developments with 50 Dwelling Units

Parking Zone	Previous Visitor Parking Requirement (2013)	Average Amount Approved by Staff/Council	Recently Adopted Rate (2021) Minimum	Recently Adopted Rate (2021) Maximum
A	5	3	2	9
B	5	4	4	9
All Other Areas	10	5	4	9

Table 3: Comparison of the Amount of Visitor Parking Required and Approved for Developments with 100 Dwelling Units

Parking Zone	Previous Visitor Parking Requirement (2013)	Average Amount Approved by Staff/Council	Recently Adopted Rate (2021) Minimum	Recently Adopted Rate (2021) Maximum
A	10	6	3	14
B	10	9	7	14
All Other Areas	20	11	7	14

Table 4: Comparison of the Amount of Visitor Parking Required and Approved for Developments with 300 Dwelling Units

Parking Zone	Previous Visitor Parking Requirement (2013)	Average Amount Approved by Staff/Council	Recently Adopted Rate (2021) Minimum	Recently Adopted Rate (2021) Maximum
A	30	18	5	34
B	30	27	17	34
All Other Areas	60	33	17	34

A sample of projects from the City's Development Pipeline with at least one planning approval and known parking requirements active between 2013 and 2019 that had a dwelling unit in an Apartment Building, a Mixed Use Building, and/or a Multiple Dwelling Unit Building was used to compare the amount of parking in approved applications against the previous visitor parking standards in Zoning By-law 569-2013 and standards adopted by Council in December 2021. This is shown in Table 5 below. There are no approved applications above the previous 2013 rates because they did not specify a maximum permitted amount of visitor parking.

Across all Parking Zones, the recently adopted visitor parking rates are more consistent with the rates in applications with at least one approval which were subject to the previous rates in Zoning By-law 569-2013. In fact, rates in over 40% of the approved applications are lower than the recently adopted rates.

Table 5: Comparison of Previous Rate (2013) vs Approved Visitor Parking Rates (2021) by Parking Zones

	Below Requirement	Permitted Within Requirement	Above Requirement
PZ A - Former Rate (2013)	93%	7%	0%
PZ A - Approved Rate (2021)	38%	54%	8%
PZ B - Former Rate (2013)	84%	16%	0%
PZ B - Approved Rate (2021)	50%	24%	26%
All other Areas - Former Rate (2013)	63%	37%	0%
All other Areas - Approved Rate (2021)	32%	30%	38%

Staff also examined the impacts to the number of applications providing more visitor parking than the maximum standard or less than the minimum standard under different standards. The effect of amending the maximum visitor parking rates is shown in Table 6. The options considered include the rate approved by Council in December 2021, 0.15 spaces per dwelling unit and 0.2 spaces per dwelling unit. These higher rates would increase the range of parking rates permitted in the Zoning By-law, increasing their flexibility for applications and would be expected to result in fewer applications requiring relief from the parking standards.

Table 6: The Effect of amending the Maximum Visitor Parking Rate using Applications currently in the Development Pipeline

Maximum Parking Rate	Percentage of Applications in Parking Zone B Above the Maximum Parking Rate	Percentage of Applications in All Other Areas of the City Above the Maximum Parking Rate
Council Approved Rate (2021) – 0.1 spaces per dwelling unit	26%	38%
0.15 spaces per dwelling unit	6%	17%
0.20 spaces per dwelling unit	2%	3%

The effect of amending the minimum visitor parking rates is shown in Table 7. Adjusting the minimum visitor rates would likely increase the number of applications seeking relief from the parking standards. The proportion of approved applications with less parking than the minimum standard increases significantly as the minimum standard increases. Any increase in the minimum parking standards would likely result in more applications seeking relief from the standards.

Table 7: The Effect of amending the Minimum Visitor Parking Rate using Applications currently in the Development Pipeline

Minimum Parking Rate	Percentage of Applications in Parking Zone B Below the Minimum Parking Rate	Percentage of Applications in All Other Areas of the City Below the Minimum Parking Rate
Council Approved Rate (2021) – 2 spaces plus 0.05 spaces per dwelling unit	50%	32%
2 spaces plus 0.10 spaces per dwelling unit	64%	49%
2 spaces plus 0.15 spaces per dwelling unit	89%	76%

As another check of the recently adopted visitor parking rates, staff reviewed the residential visitor parking requirements in comparable jurisdictions in North America.

Jurisdictions were selected due to their similarity to Toronto in terms of absolute population, population growth and population density. The results are shown in Table 6. Notably, several cities in North America do not currently require applications to provide a minimum amount of visitor parking on site. In addition, several of the observed cities do not mention visitor or guest parking in their Zoning by-Laws/Ordinances. Toronto's practice of setting minimum visitor parking requirements is not the norm.

Table 8: Visitor Parking Requirements in Comparable Jurisdictions

City	Policy Area	Parking Rate per dwelling unit
Edmonton	Capital City Downtown Area	Maximum of 10 Parking spaces.
Edmonton	All Other Areas of the City	No Requirements to provide Visitor Parking.
Ottawa	Area X, Y, Z on Schedule 1A	Minimum: 0.1 per dwelling unit
Ottawa	Area B, C, D	Minimum: 0.2 per dwelling unit
Vancouver	Downtown	Minimum: 0.05 Maximum: 0.1
Chicago	Entire City	No Requirements to provide Visitor Parking.
Los Angeles	Entire City (Guest parking for Apt Houses with at least 10 units)	1 Space for guests per 4 dwelling units of the total number of dwelling units.
Minneapolis	Entire city	No Requirements to provide Visitor Parking.
New York	Entire City (Where group parking facility is provided).	No Requirements to provide Visitor Parking. Generally, developments can provide parking for up to 100% of total dwelling units. The parking supply can be reduced by no more than 60% of total dwelling units.
San Francisco	Entire City	No Requirements to provide Visitor Parking.
Seattle	Entire City	No Requirements to provide Visitor Parking.

The recently adopted visitor parking rates ensure a minimum amount of visitor parking will still be provided on site, mitigating against potential spillover of parking in surrounding areas. A common concern raised during public consultation was that parking demand associated with new developments may not be accommodated on site. This could result in parking spill-over into surrounding areas.

Transportation impact studies, for developments which require them, must consider that the provided parking is consistent with local policies. The Official Plan includes a number of policies that require different types of development to provide "adequate" or "sufficient" parking, including Policies 4.2(2)(d), 4.2(3)(f), 4.5(2)(i), 4.6(6)(f) and 4.8(5)(g). These policies complement Official Plan Policy 2.3.1(3)(f) which supports the City's continued growth while limiting the parking impacts on existing neighbourhoods to protect their residential amenity. Staff will ensure that these policies are considered as part of transportation impact studies and work with applicants to ensure they have provided sufficient visitor parking in their developments.

To ensure that adequate parking is being provided on site, Council also directed new developments be excluded from participating in the on-street permit parking program. Excluding residents of new developments from purchasing a permit for on-street parking ensures that developments need to provide parking on site to limit residents of, visitors to or tradespersons at new development from parking on-street.

Staff recommend maintaining the adopted visitor parking requirements listed in Table 1 above. The minimum requirements for visitor parking are appropriate and will be sufficient to meet the minimum needs of the development while being flexible enough to allow for a market-driven approach to parking provision that aligns with City policy objectives. Lands in Parking Zone A are well served by transit and can function with very low amounts of visitor parking. The slightly higher requirements in Parking Zone B and All Other Areas of the City will ensure a small amount of parking for other visitors, reflecting that these areas have less good access to automobile alternatives. Staff will only support requests for further reductions in the visitor parking supply in extraordinary cases where the applicant has clearly demonstrated that the demand for visitor trips can be accommodated without creating other issues.

As described in PH29.3, the effect of the new visitor parking standards will be monitored and adjustments proposed in the future if they are deemed to be necessary. The monitoring program will collect and aggregate data from a variety of data sources and routinely look for insights across related datasets to better assess the City's parking needs and the impacts of various parking related policy changes in different contexts across the city.

Staff will refine the collection of development application data to preserve more useful information related to parking in the aggregated data. One area of focus of the monitoring program is the supply and demand of visitor parking in all Parking Zones in the City. This includes observing the rates of visitor parking that are being proposed and eventually built in Residential Apartments and Mixed Use buildings across all Parking Zone areas, the rates of parking infractions in various areas related to overnight parking and community complaints related to lack of parking for visitors.

Through the Monitoring Program, data specific to Visitor Parking in Residential Apartments and Mixed Use buildings will be collected and observed on a quarterly basis, over a one year period starting in Q3 2022. Staff expect to receive approximately 100 applications that require visitor parking over this one year period. Staff will report to Council in Q1 2024 with an analysis of the effects of the new visitor parking standards. If

Staff observe undesirable trends in the supply or demand for visitor parking, Staff will present recommendations to address the trends which could include changes to the minimum and maximum Visitor Parking Requirements in ZBL 569-2013 in each of the Parking Zone areas.

In addition, the review also revealed challenges related to visitor parking in existing buildings. The recent changes to the visitor parking rates in the Zoning By-law do not directly impact these challenges but could make related challenges in the surrounding areas worse. Measures to mitigate these challenges in areas of the City where there are concerns can be identified and explored through the Parking Strategy for Toronto, currently under development being led by Transportation Services. The measures to explore will include, but not be limited to:

- Approaches to remove barriers to convert existing residential parking to visitor parking;
- Approaches to increase the availability of on-street parking to visitors;
- Approaches to increase the supply of parking owned and/or managed by the Toronto Parking Authority (TPA);
- Approaches to parking pricing which reflect the supply and demand for public parking;
- Approaches to increase the perceived cost of parking illegally; and
- Strengthening understanding of the relationship between the willingness to drive and the availability of parking for different trip purposes.

CONTACT

James Perttula, Director, Transit and Transportation Planning, City Planning, Tel. No: (416) 392-4744, E-mail: James.Perttula@toronto.ca.

Kyle Knoeck, Director, Zoning and Secretary-Treasurer Committee of Adjustment, City Planning, Tel. No: (416) 392-0871, E-mail: Kyle.Knoeck@toronto.ca.

Michael Hain, Program Manager, Transit and Transportation Planning, City Planning, Tel. No: (416) 392-8698, E-mail: Michael.Hain@toronto.ca.

SIGNATURE

Gregg Lintern, MCIP, RPP
Chief Planner and Executive Director
City Planning