

Application to Remove a Private Tree – 32 Carondale Crescent

Date: May 2, 2022

To: Scarborough Community Council

From: Acting Director, Urban Forestry, Parks, Forestry and Recreation

Wards: Ward 22 – Scarborough-Agincourt

SUMMARY

This staff report is about a matter that Community Council has delegated authority from City Council to make a final decision.

This report requests that Scarborough Community Council deny the request for a permit to remove one privately owned tree located at 32 Carondale Crescent. The application indicates the reason for removal is due to concerns that the tree is structurally unstable, located too close to the house, and drops needles and cones.

The subject tree is a red pine tree (*Pinus resinosa*), measuring 42 cm in diameter. The Tree By-laws do not support the removal of this tree as it is healthy and maintainable.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Acting Director of Urban Forestry recommends that:

1. Scarborough Community Council deny the request for a permit to remove one privately owned tree located at 32 Carondale Crescent.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

There is no decision history regarding this tree removal permit application.

COMMENTS

Urban Forestry received an application for a permit to remove one privately owned tree located at 32 Carondale Crescent. The subject tree is a red pine tree measuring 42 cm in diameter. The request to remove this tree has been made to address concerns that the tree is structurally unstable given that it is top-heavy; located too close to the dwelling; and that it drops needles and cones on the roof, in the eaves and on the front entrance walkway.

The arborist report that accompanied the application described the tree to be in fair condition with a minor infestation of Diplodia. Needle tips are browning on the south side of the upper canopy.

Urban Forestry staff inspected the tree and at the time of inspection determined that it is healthy and maintainable.

This tree is situated approximately 3 metres from the house. No evidence of the tree impacting the house was observed at the time of inspection. The tree is located such that routine maintenance of the tree and house can be performed.

Concerns regarding a high weight load in the crown can be addressed through pruning to reduce the weight without impacting the tree's structure or health.

Every large growing tree has some degree of maintenance associated with it including removal of leaves, flowers, fruit, twigs and small branches. The benefits that trees afford to a community far outweigh the maintenance inconvenience associated with falling debris. Removal of debris such as needles and cones from eaves troughs and downspouts is considered part of performing regular property maintenance and is a responsibility of all property owners within the City of Toronto.

Through this inspection and review of the arborist report, staff have concluded that the removal of the subject tree is not permissible under the Tree By-law, *City of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 813*. The City's Tree By-laws do not support tree removal to address the perceived nuisance resulting from a tree's natural functions. As a result of the above noted findings and in support of protecting and growing the city's urban forest, a permit to remove the tree was denied by Urban Forestry. The applicant is appealing this decision.

As required under *Section 813-19, of City of Toronto Municipal Code, Chapter 813, Trees, Article III*, a notice of application sign was posted on the subject property for the minimum 14-day period in order to provide an opportunity for comment by the community. Three comments in support of the removal were received in response to the application to remove the tree in question.

The red pine tree at 32 Carondale Crescent is a valuable part of the urban forest that provides numerous aesthetic, social and economic benefits to the property owner and local community. Toronto's urban forest provides \$55 million in environmental benefits every year including improved air quality through pollution removal, lower storm water

management costs by reducing runoff, and carbon sequestration that lessens the impacts of climate change. Through shade and transpiration, increasing urban tree cover can mitigate exposure to extreme heat events. A higher density of trees in a neighbourhood has been shown to significantly improve physical and mental health, such as reducing blood pressure and stress levels and promoting physical activity. Trees also make urban environments aesthetically more pleasing which raises property values.

Protecting the urban forest is a key strategy for building resilience, as it continues to face increasing natural pressures such as storms and invasive pests. The 2013 ice storm resulted in the removal of over 3000 City-owned trees. The Emerald Ash Borer beetle has killed approximately 860,000 ash trees across the city. As a result, if the City aims to reach its canopy target of 40 per cent, it is imperative that the City protect healthy trees from injury and removal whenever possible. The improved condition and size of the urban forest will support the City of Toronto's goals to improve quality of life and well-being that enables a diverse, sustainable, innovative, growing and thriving city.

In accordance with the City Council-approved Strategic Forest Management Plan, Toronto's Official Plan, Toronto's Biodiversity Strategy, and the Private Tree By-law, the red pine tree at 32 Carondale Crescent, as a valuable part of the urban forest, should not be removed.

The Acting Director of Urban Forestry recommends Scarborough Community Council deny the request for a permit to remove a privately owned tree located at 32 Carondale Crescent. Should Scarborough Community Council grant this request for tree removal, the following recommendation may be adopted, in accordance with the City's Tree By-law permit requirements:

- 1) Scarborough Community Council approve the request for a permit to remove a privately owned tree located at 32 Carondale Crescent, and require the applicant to provide five replacement trees which can be achieved in a combination of on-site planting and cash-in-lieu of planting to the satisfaction of the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation.

CONTACT

Janice Allen, Acting Supervisor Tree Protection and Plan Review, Urban Forestry
Tel: 416- 396-5131, Email: Janice.Allen@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Kim Statham
Acting Director, Urban Forestry
Parks, Forestry and Recreation

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Figure 1: Arborist report photograph showing red pine tree located in the front yard of 32 Carondale Crescent; April 27, 2021

Attachment 1 – Figure 1: Arborist report photograph showing red pine tree located in the front yard of 32 Carondale Crescent; April 27, 2021

