

**CITY DIVISIONS PUBLIC RECOMMENDATIONS NOT FULLY IMPLEMENTED
(Status Determined by the Auditor General)
DECEMBER 30, 2022**

Division: Fleet Services

Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review - Phase One: Lengthy Downtime Requires Immediate Attention

Report Date: 04/26/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management comments as of December 2022	Revised Due Date
12	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to provide additional guidance on the vendor audit process including target coverage, selection method, audit process, and results tracking, to ensure the consistency and effectiveness of the process.</p>	<p>The Vendor Audit form has been updated to include all required criteria to evaluate the vendor's performance. A vendor audit procedure has also been created that includes the vendor selection method, filling of the vendor audit form, results tracking, and retention of the audit form.</p> <p>Training has been provided to all stakeholders and an electronic copy of the training material is available for users' reference internally. Fleet Services will ensure that the process is consistently applied throughout the Division.</p>	6/30/2023
13	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to take steps to maximize warranty claims for parts and labour costs. Steps to be taken should include, but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. setting a performance target for warranty claims and periodically measuring warranty effort against the target;</p> <p>b. allocating appropriate staff resources to adequately review and monitor the parts supplier's administration of aftermarket part and labour warranty claims;</p> <p>c. making sure the warranty data in M5 are accurate and complete;</p> <p>d. providing training to Fleet maintenance staff on policies and procedures pertaining to warranty claims.</p>	<p>Fleet Services Division (FSD) has taken actions to maximize the use of warranties, where applicable, by doing the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. established a target for warranty claims and is measuring the performance monthly. 2. hired and provided training to staff to monitor and claim warranty 3. started using the warranty module in its fleet management system. Additionally, FSD is generating weekly warranty exception report to monitor claims 4. developed warranty claim policies and procedures, and provided the employees the required trainings <p>FSD will provide supporting evidence to demonstrate that it has ensured parts warranty information entered by vendor into the system is accurate and complete.</p>	12/31/2023

	(High Priority Recommendation)	
--	--------------------------------	--

Report Title: Fleet Services Operational Review Phase Two – Stronger Asset Management Needed

Report Date: 10/10/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management comments as of December 2022	Revised Due Date
4	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to take steps to improve the consistency and reliability of its decision-making process for vehicles at or near the end of life, including:</p> <p>a. Supplementing the lifecycle cost analysis with vehicle condition assessments (PMVs); and</p> <p>b. Revising the PMV form, process, timing and frequency of vehicle condition assessments to better inform asset replacement decisions.</p>	<p>Fleet Services Division (FSD) has taken the following steps:</p> <p>A- The Condition assessment / inspection (PMV) frequency has been modified to be conducted two years prior to the end of the asset's projected optimal life or as needed. This will supplement the lifecycle cost analysis and help in the decision-making process for vehicles at or near the end of life.</p> <p>B- The PMV form has been jointly redesigned by the Asset Management and Fleet Maintenance teams and the electronic evaluation record in the system has been streamlined.</p> <p>FSD will ensure the process is consistently followed going forward.</p>	6/30/2023
17	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Fleet Services Division, to establish internal warranty claim submission and success rate targets, and to measure and report actual performance against these targets.</p> <p style="color: red;">(High Priority Recommendation)</p>	<p>Fleet Services Division (FSD) has established Warranty recovery rate targets and also measure and report the actual warranty claims every month. FSD will provide supporting evidence to demonstrate the success rate process of warranty claims is in place.</p>	12/31/2023
20	<p>City Council request the City Manager to consider the appropriate role of Fleet Services in the management and oversight of the City's fleet assets, and provide the Fleet Services Division with authority to act accordingly.</p> <p style="color: red;">(High Priority Recommendation)</p>	<p>Fleet Services Division has completed a plan for a 'centre-led' approach to oversight and leadership of City fleet management and planning. This approach will leverage existing authority, and work in partnership with client divisions to transform and optimize the way City fleets are planned and managed. The centre-led plan will involve the development of a fleet planning framework, working with Financial Planning Division to formalize a model of financial centralization, and further collaboration with clients to provide more value-add services and move towards greater centralization of procurement,</p>	6/30/2024

		maintenance, and fleet management processes.	
--	--	----------------------------------------------	--

Division: Technology Services

Report Title: Software Licenses - Managing the Asset and Related Risks

Report Date: 02/04/2015

No.	Recommendation	Management comments as of December 2022	Revised Due Date
10	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer to ensure software owners perform annual software reconciliations and report the results to the Information and Technology Division.</p> <p>(High Priority Recommendation)</p>	<p>Annual reconciliation process is in place with Software Owners using real-time Software data and financials from IT Asset Management (ITAM) system. Follow-up meetings are held with software owners to address exceptions.</p> <p>Technology Services Division (TSD) is implementing a new technical support solution for IT Asset Management. A vendor has been selected for the implementation which will help in automating the ITAM processes and will strengthen the governance and reporting.</p>	12/31/2023

Report Title: IT Infrastructure and IT Asset Management Review: Phase 1: Establishing an Information Technology Roadmap to Guide the Way Forward for Infrastructure and Asset Management

Report Date: 01/30/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management comments as of December 2022	Revised Due Date
1	<p>City Council request the City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, to establish appropriate governance and accountabilities to ensure that divisions with Information Technology services operating independently from the Information and Technology Division follow Corporate Information Technology policies, procedures, and standards in acquiring and managing Information Technology services.</p>	<p>An IT Asset Management Governance Committee has been setup with membership from Divisional IT's, IT Procurement, and led by Technology Services Division (TSD). This committee governs the policies, procedures and standards in managing IT Assets and aligns with the City Asset Management Committee. TSD is implementing a new technical support solution for IT Asset Management. A vendor has been selected for the implementation which will help in automating the ITAM processes and will strengthen the governance process.</p>	12/31/2023
2	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer to:</p>	<p>Actions have been taken to strengthen asset management related to parts a, and c of the</p>	12/31/2023

	<p>a. ensure that the inventory in the Corporate Information Technology asset management system is updated (including assets directly managed by the Information and Technology Division, as well as assets managed by other City divisions);</p> <p>b. perform periodic reviews and reconciliations of data captured within the Corporate Information Technology asset management system to ensure the system is accurate and complete;</p> <p>c. implement available tools and reporting functionality within the Corporate Information Technology asset management system to support ongoing asset monitoring; and</p> <p>d. use the data available within the corporate asset management system to inform strategic technology planning, including maximizing the use of assets and managing the costs to maintain them throughout their lifecycle.</p> <p>(High Priority Recommendation)</p>	<p>recommendation. Parts b and d are still in progress.</p> <p>a. ITAM system is up-to-date, with categorization, ownership, and access granted to Asset Owners from TSD and Divisional IT. A memo was sent to the Divisions reminding them of their responsibilities to ensure data integrity in the ITAM system with periodic validation review process.</p> <p>b. Semi-annual process is in place that enables the periodic review and reconciliation of assets. Asset owners are provided reports and are required to attest to the validity or discrepancy of the report and provide their sign-off and plan for reconciliation.</p> <p>c. Access and Training of the ITAM system functions and reporting were provided to enable Asset Owners in keeping their assets up-to-date, and making decisions.</p> <p>d. Data reporting sourced from ITAM system is provisioned to Asset Owners in support of planning.</p> <p>TSD is implementing a new technical support solution for IT Asset Management. A vendor has been selected for the implementation which will help in automating the ITAM processes and will strengthen the governance process and reporting.</p>	
--	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

Report Title: Information Technology Infrastructure and Asset Management Review: Phase 2: Establishing Processes for Improved Due Diligence, Monitoring and Reporting for Effective IT Projects and Asset Management
Report Date: 06/28/2018

No.	Recommendation	Management comments as of December 2022	Revised Due Date
1	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer to:</p> <p>a. Develop a process to ensure timely synchronization of IT asset purchases recorded in SAP with IT Asset Management (ITAM) System records.</p> <p>b. Expedite reconciliation of network assets and update them in the ITAM System.</p>	<p>Actions have been taken to strengthen asset management related to parts c, and d of the recommendation. Parts a and b are still in progress.</p> <p>a. SAP and IT Asset Management (ITAM) systems have been integrated to synchronize asset purchases with procedures to log assets into the database once purchased.</p> <p>b. ITAM and network management systems have been integrated to reconcile network devices with ongoing exception reporting</p>	12/31/2023

	<p>c. Develop secure communication mechanisms (or an alternate process) to allow for the update of segregated networks' IT assets in the ITAM System.</p> <p>d. Provide ITAM System access to other City divisions (where required) including adequate training to assist them in understanding the system.</p> <p>(High Priority Recommendation)</p>	<p>activities with procedure to log assets into the database once purchased.</p> <p>c. Exception and Restriction processes have been established to update network assets over a secure connection.</p> <p>d. Training has been provided to applicable Divisions per asset type based on their role and responsibility. Fire and Paramedic services are segregated from other City divisions, and a process has now been established for the reporting of these assets.</p> <p>TSD is implementing a new technical support solution for IT Asset Management. A vendor has been selected for the implementation which will help in automating the ITAM processes and will strengthen the governance process and reporting mechanism.</p>	
--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

Report Title: Establishment of City Wide Cyber Security Breach Incident Management Procedures Required
Report Date: 06/19/2019

No.	Recommendation	Management comments as of December 2022	Revised Due Date
1	<p>City Council request the City Manager, the Chief Information Officer and the City Clerk to coordinate and develop standard incident management procedures including communication protocols to address incidents involving cyber attacks/information breaches. The procedures and protocols should include:</p> <p>(a) Guidelines describing the sequence of actions that should take place as soon as staff become aware of a cyber attack/information breach incident.</p> <p>(b) Communication protocols detailing key contact names, functions and contact information for staff to receive guidance.</p> <p>(c) Reports to be completed by the affected organization, detailing the date of incident, systems affected, information compromised, and other relevant details.</p>	<p>Note: <i>Management updated the status of this recommendation as fully implemented after the Auditor General had completed the current follow-up review. This will be verified in the subsequent follow-up cycle.</i></p> <p>The City's Incident Response Plan and Ransomware Strategy Guidelines have been developed and approved. They address the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sequence of actions to be taken as soon as staff becomes aware of a cyber attack/information breach incident. - Communication protocols detailing key contact names, functions and contact information for staff to receive guidance. - Reports to be completed by the affected organization, detailing the date of incident, systems affected, information compromised, and other relevant details. - Communications to the media/public, where required, including privacy protocols. This has been liaised with agencies and corporations. <p>The CISO completed a City-wide cyber incident response plan to cover all of the City's divisions. The Office consulted with the</p>	2/15/2023

	<p>(d) Communications to the media/public, where required, including privacy protocols. The incident management procedures and communication protocols should be liaised across the City, including agencies and corporations.</p> <p>(High Priority Recommendation)</p>	<p>Technology Services Division (TSD), the Office of Emergency Management (OEM) and City Clerk’s Office and incorporated their feedback as part of developing the plan. The Office of the CISO also customized a cyber incident response plan template for its agencies, boards and corporations to aid them in developing their own internal cyber incident response plans. The template has been released to City agencies, boards and corporations in December 2022.</p>	
--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

Report Title: Information Technology Projects Implementation: Information Privacy and Cybersecurity Review of Human Resource System
Report Date: 02/03/2021

No.	Recommendation	Management comments as of December 2022	Revised Due Date
2	<p>City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to enhance the City's incident response process by:</p> <p>a. ensuring that all incidents are logged in a consistent manner and addressed and communicated to the appropriate stakeholders in a timely manner;</p> <p>b. actively monitoring remediation actions and ensuring that processes are in place to test the post-remediation environment;</p> <p>c. coordinating with the City Clerk to integrate the privacy incident response process with the Office of the Chief Information Security Officer's Cyber Incident Response Plan and the Technology Services Division's Major Incident Management Process; and</p> <p>d. integrating the applicable sections of the Technology Services Division's Major Incident Management Process into the Office of the Chief Information Security Officer's Cyber Incident Response Plan.</p> <p><u>Amendment by Audit Committee</u> City Council request the Chief Technology Officer to consider the</p>	<p>Actions have been taken to strengthen the City's incident response process related to parts a, b and d of the recommendation. Part c is still in progress.</p> <p><u>Office of the CISO</u> The Office of the CISO has developed a cyber incident response process which incorporated feedback from numerous stakeholders, including Technology Services Division (TSD), the Office of Emergency Management (OEM) and the City Clerk’s office. The cyber incident response process leverages TSD’s enterprise IT service management process.</p> <p>The most recent edits to the plan were in response to feedback received from the City Clerk’s office. The City Clerk’s Office is continuing to consult with the CISO to ensure edits incorporate processes for privacy related incidents and ensure legislative accuracy.</p> <p><u>Technology Services Division (TSD)</u> TSD has an Enterprise IT Service Management (ITSM) Process that follows the IT Infrastructure Library (ITIL) framework. This process includes incident and problem management resolution activities that includes cyber-related incidents. The processes were built in collaboration with the Office of the CISO. To further enhance the process, the CTO will ensure: a. Mandatory compliance of critical systems with the ITSM process including (not limited to) incident</p>	06/30/2023

	<p>actions in Part 3 above in addition to the previous recommendation in the supplementary report (June 19, 2019) from the Auditor General headed "Establishment of City Wide Cyber Security Breach Incident Management Procedures Required" (Item 2019.AU3.12a).</p> <p>(High Priority Recommendation)</p>	<p>logging, stakeholder communication, tracking remediation actions, testing post-remediation environment. The City Clerk's privacy incident response plan will be integrated with the Office of the CISO's Cyber incident response plan and Technology Services Division's Major Incident Management process.</p> <p><u>City Clerk's Office</u> The City Clerk's Office has been actively consulting with CISO on development of Cyber Incident Reporting Plan to ensure compliance with relevant legislation, including MFIPPA. The City Clerk's Office has also engaged divisional Health Information Custodian (HIC) contacts to ensure alignment with PHIPA.</p>	
--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--