-×÷+ gore

June 12,2023

Matthew Green Toronto City Hall 100 Queen Street West Toronto, ON M5H 2N2

Re: Auditor General's Office of the City of Toronto Report on the Results of Applying Specified Auditing Procedures to Financial Information Other Than Financial Statements for the Year Ended December 31, 2022.

To the Audit Committee of the City of Toronto:

This letter has been prepared at the request of Toronto City Council to obtain assurance that expenditures incurred by the Auditor General's Office of the City of Toronto (AGO) are in compliance with the applicable policies and procedures, including appropriate exercise of delegated authorities as set by the City of Toronto.

We have performed the auditing procedures as described below. This agreed-upon procedures engagement was performed in accordance with standards published by Chartered Professional Accountants of Canada. The sufficiency of these policies, procedures and delegated authorities is solely the responsibility of the City of Toronto. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the City of Toronto policies, procedures and delegated authorities described below.

For the purpose of this letter, the financial information to which the auditing procedures were applied was included within the City of Toronto SAP report, "Actual Cost Line Items for Cost Centres for the Year Ending 2022" for the AGO. This report is essentially a General Ledger detailing the transactions that have been posted under the cost elements which in turn comprise the scope of the transactions subject to audit. The report was provided directly to us by staff of the AGO.

To clarify, the Quotation Request identified the following Cost Elements to be tested; those elements are summarized on the following pages.

-×÷+ gore

SALARIES AND BENEFITS	SERVICES AND RENTS (Con't)
 1025 – Permanent – Overtime 	
 1050 – Permanent – Vacation Pay 	 4310 - Training & Development-
	External
MATERIALS AND SUPPLIS	 4340 - Tuition Fees
 2010 - Stationery and Office Supplies 	• 4406 – Contracted Services – Office
• 2020 - Books and Magazine Subscriptions	Equipment
• 2040 - Paper & Print Supplies	 4407 – Contracted Services -
• 2080 - Photographic & Video Supplies	Buildings
• 2082 – Health and Safety Supplies	 4410 – Contracted Services –
• 2090 - Graphic Design Supplies	Electrical
2099 - Other Office Materials/Minor	4414 - Advertising & Promotion
	 4415 – Contracted Services –
Furnishings	Janitorial
• 2260 - Gasoline	 4416 - Transfer, Haulage & Storage
• 2570 - Janitorial Supplies	 4410 - Transler, Tradiage & Storage 4424 - Contracted Services-General
• 2610 - Kitchen Supplies	 4424 - Contracted Services-General 4435 – Contracted Services –
 2650 - Computer and Printer Supplies 	
• 2670 – Uniforms*	Security Systems*
 2710 - General Hardware 	• 4452 - Transportation-Taxis
• 2741 - Food Cost	4465 - Contracted Services-
 2790 - Presentation/Promotional Items 	Monitoring Systems
 2791 – Ribbons, Medals & Trophies 	• 4472 - Computer Hardware
• 2999 - Miscellaneous Materials & Supplies	Maintenance and Support Services
	 4473 – Managed Print Charges
EQUIPMENT	 4474 - Computer Software
 3020 - M & E-Communications 	Maintenance and Support Services
• 3030 - M & E-Office	 4510 - Rental of Vehicles &
• 3032 - M & E-Photographic	Equipment
3033 - M & E-Printing & Binding	 4515 - Rental of Office Equipment
• 3050 - M & E–Kitchen	 4530 - Rental of Property (Other
• 3099 – General Equipment	than Office)
• 3310 – Furnishings	 4555 - Pager/Radio Rentals
• 3320 – Fixtures*	 4590 - Rental-Other
• 3410 - Computers-Hardware	 4699 – Repair & Maintenance –
• 3420 - Computers–Software	Other
• 5420 - Computers-Software	 4755 - Meal Allowances (Non-
SERVICES AND RENTS	Travel)
	• 4760 - Membership Fees
4010 - Professional Services - Legal	• 4770 - Parking Expenses (In town)
• 4038 - Professional & Technical Services	 4775 - Metrage-Operational (In
(IT) 4050 Technical Semicas Sumary and	town)
 4050 – Technical Services – Survey and 	 4804 – Wireless Devices
Mapping	 4805 - Postage
4078 - Consulting Services-Technical	 4808 - Network Equipment, incl.
4079 - Consulting Services-IT	Cabling
 4082 - Photo/Video Services 	4810 - Telephone

$\frac{-x \div +}{0}$

-×÷+ gore

We were provided directly from the City Clerk's Office, the Policy Applicability Matrix (Matrix) that linked each Cost Element above with the applicable City of Toronto policies and procedures below:

- Business Expense Policy
- Vacation
- Kilometrage Reimbursement for use of Personal Vehicle for City business
- Lieu time
- Training and Development
- Attendance Management
- Leave without pay
- Tuition Reimbursement
- Blanket Contract Procedures
- Divisional Purchase Orders (DPOs)
- Long Distance Telephone
- Payment Requisition Procedures
- Petty Cash Policy and Procedures (including Penny Elimination Policy)
- Purchasing Card (PCard) Program
- Selection and Hiring of Consulting Services
- Sole Source or Non-Competitive Procurement Procedures
- Using an Established Roster to Obtain Professional, Consultant or Other Services
- Guidelines for using Presto
- Gift card policy

To further clarify, the Quotation Request identified the delegated authorities as follows:

- Chapter 71, Financial Control
- Chapter 195, Purchasing
- Chapter 217, Records, Corporate (City)
- Chapter 257, Signing Authority (spending authority set at the level of a Division Head)

In addition, the Quotation Request identified the policy framework for the City's Accountability Officers, codified in the Toronto Municipal Code, Chapter 3, "Accountability Officers", which reinforces both their arms-length relationship to the City and their independent status within the City's governance system. As part of the implementation of Chapter 3, Accountability Officers are required to comply with all applicable City by-laws, policies and procedures while maintaining their balance between accountability and independence.

Copies of the above City of Toronto policies and procedures and web-links to the City of Toronto related delegated authorities were provided by the City Clerk's Office.

We selected a statistical sample of transactions to be tested based on the number of entries in each Cost Element and examined those transactions for compliance with the applicable policies and procedures of the Matrix, including appropriate exercise of delegated authorities with underlying supporting documents for adherence to the policies, procedures and delegated authorities noted above.

<u>-×÷</u>+ gore

As a result of applying the above procedures, we found no exceptions to the adherence to the policies, procedures and delegated authorities as they applied to our test sample.

It should be understood that we make no representations as to the sufficiency for your purposes of the procedures as described in the preceding paragraphs. Further we have addressed ourselves solely to the report, which we received directly from the Auditor General's Office of the City of Toronto and make no representations as to whether any material items were omitted. Our procedures do not constitute an audit of the report and therefore we express no opinion on the report.

This letter is provided solely for the purpose of determining compliance with the Section 3-8B of the City of Toronto's Municipal Code and should not be used for any other purpose.

Any use that a third party makes of this letter, or any reliance or decisions made based on it, are the responsibility of such third party. We accept no responsibility for loss or damages, if any, suffered by any third party as a result of decisions made or actions taken based on this letter.

Yours very truly,

Robert Gore & Associates Chartered Professional Accountants Licensed Public Accountants

1238 Kingston Road, Toronto, Ontario M1N 1P3 (416) 699-8070

$\frac{-\times \div +}{gore}$

Appendix

In compliance with section 6.3 b. of the Quotation Request, the following are items set forth in Appendix 3 for the year ended December 31, 2022.

List of Annual Non-Competitive Procurement Activity

The AGO provided us with the list of Annual Non-Competitive Procurement Activity. Certain details have been redacted to comply with Section 181 of the City of Toronto Act in which the Duty of Confidentiality is defined.

Cost Elemen	t Vendor Name	PO/DPO	Net of Tax	HST / GST	Gross Total	Description
3420	ACL SERVICES LTD	6051979	\$14.850.64	\$1,930.58	\$16.781.22	Data Analytics Software
4015	REDACTED	6052951	\$20,000.00			Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4015	REDACTED	6052953	\$15,655.99	\$2,035.28	\$17,691.27	Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4015	REDACTED	3612564	\$2,400.00	\$312.00	\$2,712.00	Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4015	MNP LLP	6051844	\$32,162.00	\$4,181.06	\$36,343.06	IT Audit Services
4015	REDACTED	6053098	\$26,250.00	\$3,412.50	\$29,662.50	Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4015	REDACTED	6053101	\$37,000.00	\$4,810.00	\$41,810.00	Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4015	REDACTED	6049939	\$39,890.17	\$1,994.51	\$41,884.68	Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4474, 4828	WOLTERS KLUWER LIMITED	6048109 / 6053382	\$143,925.33	\$18,710.29	\$162,635.62	Audit Software
4038, 4828	REDACTED	6046813	\$25,960.00	\$3,374.80	\$29,334.80	Confidential - Hotline Complaint Management Software
4015	REDACTED	6053219	\$25,141.04	\$3,268.34	\$28,409.38	Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4015	REDACTED	6053644	\$2,072.50	\$269.43	\$2,341.93	Confidential - Audit / Investigation Services
4310	YELLOWBOOK-CPE LLC	6053929	*	*	\$31,830.53	Specialized Government Performance Audit Training
	* US-based company					

List of Annual Consulting Services Expenditures

During our engagement, we made enquiries to the City Clerk's Office regarding Annual Consulting Services Expenditures incurred by the Accountability Offices. The City Clerk's Office noted there were no such transactions incurred by the AGO.