



## Nominating Panel – Administrative Penalty Tribunal

<b>Meeting No.</b>	3	<b>Contact</b>	Kate Carrillo, Administrator
<b>Meeting Date</b>	Tuesday, November 28, 2023 Friday, December 1, 2023	<b>Phone</b>	416-392-7230
<b>Start Time</b>	9:30 AM	<b>E-mail</b>	kate.carrillo@toronto.ca
<b>Location</b>	Committee Room 3, City Hall/Video Conference	<b>Chair</b>	Lilian Ma

NM3.1	ACTION	No Action		Ward: All
-------	--------	-----------	--	-----------

### Appointment of Public Members to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal

**Confidential Attachment - Personal matters about identifiable individuals who are being considered for appointment to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal.**

#### Panel Decision

The Nominating Panel - Administrative Penalty Tribunal recommends that:

1. City Council appoint the following candidates to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal, for a term of office ending on December 15, 2027, and until successors are appointed:

Ashifa Alibhai  
Jennifer Ansell  
Daniel Boyer  
Natasha Bronfman  
Emily Cole  
Joanne Foot  
Suzanne Graves  
Jenny Gumbs  
Mumtaz Jiwan  
Norine Nathanson  
Jeffrey Shapiro  
Harold Tan  
Helen Walsh

#### Decision Advice and Other Information

The Nominating Panel – Administrative Penalty Tribunal:

1. Directed that Confidential Attachments 1, 2, 3, and 4 to revised report (November 21, 2023) from the City Clerk remain confidential in their entirety as they relate to personal matters about

identifiable individuals being considered for appointment to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal.

Candidates' biographies:

Ashifa Alibhai

Ashifa is a dedicated professional with a strong passion for diversity, equity, and inclusion. Her expertise lies in mediation and dispute resolution where she excels in communication, multi-tasking, and maintaining excellence under pressure. Currently, as a Mediator with the Ontario Mandatory Mediation Program, Ashifa facilitates negotiations, upholds confidentiality, and ensures compliance with mediated agreements. Additionally, Ashifa is the founder and operator of AHANSA Mediation Services

Jennifer Ansell

Jennifer R. Ansell holds a Master of Laws, and is an experienced college and university professor, adjudicator, fact-finder, early resolution and dispute resolution professional. Ms. Ansell teaches various legal courses at Humber College and Negotiation for Business at the University of Guelph-Humber. She has been a Hearing Member with the Administrative Penalty Tribunal, City of Toronto, since 2021. Ms. Ansell continues to enjoy assisting some of Canada's largest law firms mediate and settle their matters.

Daniel Boyer

Daniel (Dan) Boyer (he/him) is a queer mediator, arbitrator, and consultant in dispute resolution. Through his company The Capacity Workshop, Dan trains and consults nonprofits and public service organizations on conflict management, board governance, strategic and resiliency planning, and culture creation and shift management. Dan holds a Bachelor of Arts in Global Conflict Studies, and trained in mediation and arbitration at York University.

Natasha Bronfman

Natasha Bronfman is an experienced adjudicator with the Administrative Penalty Tribunal and the Consent and Capacity Board and holds a Certificate in Mental Health Law from Osgoode Hall Law School. She has just completed her 9-year term as Director for the Canadian Mental Health Association, Toronto Branch. She is currently a member of the Downtown Toronto and Anti-Racism Human Service and Justice Coordinating Committees, and is a past Fellow of the Canadian Gemmological Association.

Emily Cole

Emily Cole is an experienced adjudicator and a certified mediator. She is a veteran investigations and trial lawyer with nearly 30 years of experience. Emily resides in Toronto-Danforth. When she is not working for the Tribunal she can often be found in the City of Toronto's parks, ravines and beaches with her dog.

Joanne Foot

Joanne Foot has lived in Toronto form most of her life and is proud of her city. She was called to the Bar of Ontario in 1983, following which she clerked for the Justices of the Court of Appeal of Ontario. Joanne spent most of her professional career in private practice, specializing in corporate law, including as a partner in two major law firms. Joanne enjoys teaching continuing education programs and uses her legal experience as an adjudicator on various tribunals.

Suzanne Graves

Ms. Graves holds a law degree from Osgoode Hall Law School, a Master of Public Administration from Queen's University and a Bachelor of Arts from the University of York, United Kingdom. She is a member of the Law Society of Ontario and practiced law at the Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General for over 20 years.

Jenny Gumbs

A graduate of Ryerson University, Jenny has combined an active and successful career with a deep commitment to family and volunteerism. A former diplomat accredited to Canada, she is a certified adjudicator and experienced in adjudication. She proudly serves the community, while fulfilling varied and challenging mandates. She is actively involved in many community organizations, including Tarragon Theatre, After Breast Cancer and the Black Business and Professional Association.

Mumtaz Jiwan

Mumtaz Jiwan has established a consistent track record as a highly competent and effective leader as mediator and adjudicator over 28 years. She is an experienced Hearing Officer. Her superior performance, advanced skills and mature judgement has won her the respect of both her peers and stakeholders. Mumtaz holds a Bachelor of Arts with Honours, and certificates in mediation and advanced alternative dispute resolution. She has served as Board Member and volunteer in various organizations.

Norine Nathanson

Norine Nathanson has been a lawyer for 33 years. Prior to retiring, she served as the Executive Legal Officer to the Chief Justice of the Ontario Superior Court. She is an experienced criminal prosecutor and legal policy advisor. She volunteers with Lawyers Feed The Hungry and Global Medic, an agency providing humanitarian disaster relief.

Jeffrey Shapiro

Jeffrey Shapiro is an experienced mediator, arbitrator, and tribunal adjudicator. He has served as a Vice-Chair at Ontario's Licence Appeal Tribunal and the Human Rights Tribunal, and has conducted arbitration proceedings on behalf of the Financial Services Commission of Ontario (FSCO). He began his career as a lawyer in private practice in the United States, practicing administrative and general law, including conducting arbitrations, by appointment, for Courts in Cleveland and Philadelphia.

Harold Tan

Harold Tan holds a Master of Laws (Alternative Dispute Resolution) from Osgoode Law School, and is a Qualified Mediator (Alternative Dispute Resolution Institute of Ontario and Canada). Additionally, he holds a Certificate in Adjudication for Administrative Agencies, Boards and Tribunals (Society of Ontario Adjudicators and Regulators, Osgoode Professional Development). He is a workplace mediator, investigator and trainer.

Helen Walsh

Helen Walsh has over 25 years experience in civil litigation and employment law. She also has extensive experience in workplace investigations and mediations and has written, taught, and coached in her areas of expertise. She was first appointed to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal in 2019. Ms. Walsh holds a Bachelor of Arts with Honours from the University of Toronto, a Bachelor of Laws and Master of Laws (Alternative Dispute Resolution) from Osgoode Hall Law School, and a Certificate in Adjudication for Administrative Agencies, Boards and Tribunals.

## **Origin**

(November 14, 2023) Report from the City Clerk

## **Summary**

At its meeting on November 28 and December 1, 2023, the Nominating Panel – Administrative Penalty Tribunal considered Item NM3.1 and made recommendations to City Council.

## **Summary from the (November 21, 2023) Report from the City Clerk**

The Nominating Panel – Administrative Penalty Tribunal will conduct interviews and recommend thirteen (13) candidates to City Council for appointment to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal.

## **Background Information**

(November 21, 2023) Revised Report from the City Clerk on Appointment of Public Members to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal

(<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2023/nm/bgrd/backgroundfile-240995.pdf>)

Confidential Attachment 1 - List of Candidates, Qualifications, Confidential Diversity Information Summary, and Applications for Appointment to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal (to be distributed once available)

Confidential Attachment 2 - Diversity Information Summary for Current Public Members of the Administrative Penalty Tribunal (to be distributed once available)

Confidential Attachment 3 - Interview schedule for November 28 and December 1 (to be distributed once available)

Confidential Attachment 4 - Administrative Penalty Tribunal Written Assignment - Completed Assignments (to be distributed once available)

(November 14, 2023) Report from the City Clerk on Appointment of Public Members to the Administrative Penalty Tribunal

(<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2023/nm/bgrd/backgroundfile-240836.pdf>)