

This is an Extract from the Minutes of the Public Meeting of the Toronto Police Services Board that was held on July 27, 2023

P2023-0727-3.0. Update on Auditor General Recommendations Implementation

Deputy Chief Rob Johnson introduced this item and the presenter, Ms. Emily Mutch, Project Leader. Ms. Mutch presented to the Board. A copy of the presentation is attached to this Minute.

P2023-0727-3.1. Update on Auditor General Recommendations Implementation

The Board was in receipt of a report dated July 14, 2023 from Myron Demkiw, Chief of Police.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that the Toronto Police Services Board (Board) forward this report to:

- 1) the City of Toronto (City) Council for information; and
- 2) the Office of the Auditor General, City of Toronto (Auditor General) for information

Deputations: Derek Moran (written submission included) (in person)

The Board received the presentation, deputation and approved the foregoing report.

Moved by: L. Kostakis
Seconded by: N. Spencer



PUBLIC REPORT

July 14, 2023

To: Chair and Members
Toronto Police Services Board

From: Myron Demkiw
Chief of Police

Subject: Update on Auditor General Recommendations Implementation

Purpose: Information Purposes Only Seeking Decision

Recommendation(s):

It is recommended that the Toronto Police Services Board (Board):

- 1) receive the following report;
- 2) forward this report to the City of Toronto (City) Council for information;
and
- 3) forward this report to the Office of the Auditor General, City of Toronto (Auditor General) for information.

Financial Implications:

To date, all costs incurred to implement the recommendations made by the Auditor General have been aligned with existing Toronto Police Service (Service) projects, programs and initiatives.

As collaboration continues with our partners in various City agencies, the Service anticipates additional funding requirements related to resources needed to launch required pilots and programs. At this time, the Service is projecting a need for approximately \$250,000 to fund a collaborative advertising campaign in partnership with the City of Toronto.

Any future costs resulting from the implementation of the Auditor General's recommendations, including project resourcing costs, will be tracked, reflected and reported through the annual budget process. Conversely, the Service will ensure that all cost savings realized through the implementation of the Auditor General's recommendations, including those resulting from alternate service delivery, will also be tracked and reported to the Board.

Summary:

The purpose of this report is to provide an update to the Board on implementation progress related to recommendations made by the Auditor General in two reports: *Review of Toronto Police Service – Opportunities to Support More Effective Responses to Calls for Service*; *A Journey of Change: Improving Community Safety and Well-Being Outcomes* and *Toronto Police Service – Audit of 9-1-1 Public Safety Answering Point Operations*; *Better Support for Staff, Improved Information Management and Outcomes*.

Discussion:

Background

In June 2022, the Board received a report and related presentation from the Auditor General on two audits performed by the Auditor General's office [Min. No. P2022-0622-4.0 refers]. The Service tasked the Strategy Management unit with overseeing the implementation of the 51 recommendations made by the Auditor General over the two reports.

In October 2022, the Board received a presentation to advise of the Service's proposed implementation strategy and approach [Min. No. 2022-1027-3.0 refers]. The Service's implementation is centred around the following project goals:

- Fostering a commitment to change, in line with the Service's recent work implementing other police reform measures;
- Building a process that supports achievement thinking;
- Demonstrating momentum and ensuring that implementation work begins immediately; and
- Increasing collaboration and communication with City partners and other external stakeholders.

Collaborative Multi-Section Structure

In July 2022, Toronto City Council considered and adopted, with amendments, items 22-AU13.5 and 22-AU13.6 from the City Audit Committee, in response to the Auditor General's Recommendations. The Service is committed to working with the Board and our City partners collaboratively through the implementation governance structure co-developed with the Board and the Deputy City Manager's office. The City Manager's Office will also be leading much of this implementation work, as several of the Auditor General's recommendations were directed to the City Manager to implement.

A fulsome update on this collaborative approach was approved by the Board in March 2023 [Min. No. P2023-0302-6.0 refers].

“Journey of Change”

Since 2017, the Service has been working through numerous transformational change projects and initiatives in order to modernize and enhance our delivery of services to the public. While not a comprehensive list, the following are some of the projects and initiatives the Service is working on while implementing the Auditor General's recommendations:

- **Police Reform** initiatives, including the Board's 81 Directions on Police Reform, the Missing & Missed Implementation, the Mental Health and Addictions Strategy, the introduction of Service-Based Budgeting, and, in partnership with the City, the Toronto Community Crisis Service;
- **Technology** initiatives, including the I&T Command Benefits Framework, the Digital Officer Program, the Information Management Framework, Next Generation 9-1-1 (N.G.9-1-1), and the Records Management Replacement project;
- **Equity & Inclusion** initiatives, including the Race and Identity-Based Data Collection project, the Gender Diverse and Trans Inclusion Project, advancement of internal support networks, and the Service's forthcoming Equity Strategy;
- **Organizational Culture Change** initiatives, including the Service's People & Culture Plan, Wellness Strategy and updated Recruitment, Promotional and Performance Management processes;
- **Legislative** initiatives including partnership in the City's SafeT.O. Community Safety and Well Being Plan, the Board's legislated responsibility for crafting the forthcoming 2023-2027 Strategic Plan, and
- **Accountability** initiatives, including recommendations directed at the Service as a result of a Coroner's Inquest, such as the Coroner's Inquest into the Death of Mr. Andrew Loku, and actions resulting from legal decisions and settlements, such as McWilliam vs. T.P.S.B.

The cumulative effect of working through these numerous transformational change projects was a foremost consideration in the planning and execution of implementation activities for the A.G. Recommendations. As outlined to the Board in a presentation in October 2022 [Min. No. P2022-10027-3.1 refers], an Implementation Steering Committee has been established to ensure that work on new and existing transformational change projects is aligned with the work required to implement the Auditor General's recommendations.

As noted in the report from the Auditor General last June, "it will be important for the [Board] and the [Service], as well as the City, to consider the findings, recommendations, and key common themes from these reports holistically in order to fully realize possible synergies and the most efficient and effective outcomes possible."

The Service has embarked on an implementation strategy for these recommendations that is based on a principle of integration across and with existing projects and initiatives.

Opportunities & Challenges

Since the release of the Auditor General's recommendations in June 2022, both the City of Toronto and the Provincial Government of Ontario have announced change initiatives to provide support related to some of the issues and opportunities identified by the Auditor General. Some of these opportunities include:

- The Provincial government pledged to invest \$208 million over 3 years to enhance the 9-1-1 emergency response system across Ontario, and support the implementation of a new communications system known as N.G.9-1-1;
- In April 2023, the Provincial government announcement of measures to boost police recruitment, including the elimination of tuition fees and changes to education requirements for potential recruits;
- In March 2023, Toronto Public Health sent an updated submission to Health Canada seeking to decriminalize drugs for personal use in Toronto. The updated submission includes the endorsement of the Service, and the proposed model aiming to strike a balance between public health and public safety needs for

Toronto community members, and advancing equity for those members most impacted by the harms of criminalization; and

- In January 2023; the Board and the City approved a \$48.3 Million (M) increase in funding to the Service in order to address many of the challenges identified by the Auditor General.

As the Service detailed in the Service’s 2023 Operating Budget Request report [Min No. P2023-0109-2.2 refers], “although there has been transformative capacity building efforts over the past several years, the Service’s environment continues to be influenced by evolving demands for policing services and increased workload. The 2023 budget includes a hiring plan to prevent further service degradation and to support improvements to service levels and to work towards achieving organizational priorities and improved public safety outcomes.”

Implementation Update:

Key Common Themes

The Service’s implementation strategy for the recommendations made in both of the Auditor General’s reports has been structured around the 5 key common themes and messages included in the “capstone” report that accompanied the Auditor General’s recommendations, as follows:

1. Improve and Use Data to Enhance Staffing and Operational Strategies, and Ensure Adequate Resources are in Place to Address Priority Areas (Optimizing Resources)
2. Further Explore Call-for-Service Alternative Responses to free up time of Priority Response Unit officers and 9-1-1 Communications Operators and help provide better outcomes for people (Alternative Response)
3. Build Greater Community Education and Awareness to help manage demand on the 9-1-1 line and expectations that a PRU officer response is primarily for emergencies and police matters (Community Education & Awareness)
4. Enhance Response Time Methodology and Improve Emergency Response Times and 9-1-1 Call Answering Times (Timing Methodologies)
5. Recognize that this is a Journey of Collaboration between the City, TPS, and Other Stakeholders to Build Better Outcomes by Moving Forward Together (Stakeholder Collaboration)

Theme 1: Optimizing Resources

While the Service was performing analysis of the recommendations and developing an implementation strategy, it became clear that the primary and most pressing theme the Service needs to address relates to better optimizing our resources. In addition to a focus on building our capacity to better use data and technology to support the current state of resources for the Service, we have also taken numerous steps to address the staffing challenges outlined in the Auditor General’s reports.

Despite the numerous transformational change and capacity building efforts undertaken since 2017, the Service’s workforce continues to be impacted by increased workload and changing policing service demands. Population increases and the increasing complexity of the policing profession have resulted in growing and differing demands for service than in past years. The Service will continue our significant efforts to modernize

service delivery and respond to the complex needs of a growing city, with a focus on public service, efficiency, effectiveness and innovation.

2023 Service Budget

Work and results to date are as follows:

- To ensure sufficient resources to deliver adequate and effective police services, the Service's 2023 approved operating budget includes an increase of \$48.3 Million (M), or 4.3% above the Service's approved budget in 2022 in order to accomplish various things including the following:
- 162 officers for Priority Response to help meet increased demands, stem further degradation of response times and to address the A.G. findings. This includes 25 officers to support community safety in the downtown core for a strategic presence to address spontaneous and sometimes unpredictable demands;
- 90 General Special Constable vacant positions will be filled and ensure certain community safety functions can be performed effectively and at lower cost, allowing sworn police officers to be deployed more strategically and where a police officer is required; and
- 20 9-1-1 Communications Operators, to improve call answering times and improve compliance with the National Emergency Number Association (N.E.N.A.) standards, taking a step to address the shortcomings highlighted in Auditor General's findings;
- The Service has moved to a service-based budget approach, to allow for an informed discussion that better ensures the impacts of fiscal decisions are central in decision-making. Budgeted costs, including those in the 9-1-1 Response and Patrol service area, are tied to services delivered through the budget and supported by metrics and outcomes;
- Public consultations, including a community survey conducted in September 2022, have become an important component of the Service's modernized budget approach, as the information gathered is critical in helping the Service gauge an understanding of the level of service the public expects, and how to best align the allocation of resources and budget to reflect these priorities.

Next steps are as follows:

- The Service will continue to structure our budget discussions around service delivery, and will ensure the 9-1-1 Response and Patrol service area continues to support the implementation of the Auditor General's recommendations as a component of the budget development;
- Staffing increases beyond 2023 have not yet been determined, and the Service will spend 2023 and 2024 evaluating the impact of its many change and reform initiatives underway to inform future staffing discussions.

Information Management Framework

Work and results to date are as follows:

- Falling under the Service's Information Management pillar, a new unit responsible for developing and implementing data management and governance programs for the Service has been created;
- This new unit has been structured to allow for multi-functional teams to support digital transformation initiatives with specialized data management and governance services that integrate with projects as they arise;
- Pillar and Unit leadership have been supporting the Auditor General project by playing an important role in the project's Steering Committee and Working Groups.

Next steps are as follows:

- Continued work on creating responsive data management and data governance products for the Service, including but not limited to:
 - Records retention schedule;
 - Master data management standards;
 - Enterprise data models;
 - Data risk and control frameworks; and
 - Data quality standards.

N-G-9-1-1

Work and results to date are as follows:

- Since 2019, the Service has invested significant resources and funding into implementing N.G.9-1-1 technology, as mandated by the Canadian Radio-Television and Telecommunications Commission (C.R.T.C.);
- The Service has collaborated with provincial First Responder counterparts as part of the Next Generation 9-1-1 Interagency Advisory Panel to provide expert analysis, advice and recommendations to the Province of Ontario, including:
 - Developing materials to support project implementation,
 - Developing themes to guide project work,
 - Launching a survey across 282 unique organizations (police, fire, paramedic and municipal sectors) to identify areas where respondents felt the Provincial government should set standards, and
 - Developing final project deliverables, including a standards report, governance model and transition guide.

The Service is on track to meet the C.R.T.C. deadlines for transitioning to N.G.9-1-1.

Next steps are as follows:

- The new N.G.9-1-1 solution is being implemented in 2 phases:
 - Phase 1: deployment between the current Secondary Site and the new Tertiary Site
 - Phase 2: deployment at the Primary Site (post major renovations), with the Tertiary Site switching back to a training room functionality
- The City Manager will be presenting a Report for Action to Executive Committee to seek Council's authority to enter into an agreement with Bell Canada, as required by the C.R.T.C. to enable N.G.9-1-1 technology. The agreement will also be between the City and the Service.
- Provision of training to members of Communications Services to ensure they are conversant with new software and processes prior to go-live.

Staffing & Schedule Analysis – C.O.M.

Work and results to date are as follows:

- The Service has partnered with the Toronto Police Association (T.P.A.) on a project to review current staffing levels and shift deployments at Communications Services (C.O.M.), with a goal of better aligning call demand with resource availability and supporting analysis and review of minimum staffing requirements;
- Both the T.P.A. and the Service have agreed to follow the model developed through the Primary Response Unit Shift Schedule Pilot project, to ensure that the members of C.O.M. can benefit from the best practices jointly developed and honed since 2018;

- Following the release of an Request for Proposal (R.F.P.) by the T.P.A., a 3rd party vendor was selected to conduct a workforce analysis and review of the C.O.M. unit;
- The Service, T.P.A. and vendor have developed a working group and related governance;
- Data analysis activities commenced in Q2 2023.

Next steps are as follows:

- Presenting analysis findings and related potential scheduling options to the members of C.O.M.;
- Conducting a vote of all C.O.M. members to determine if there is a scheduling option that members wish to pilot, or whether they wish to stay with their current schedule;
- If members vote to pilot a new schedule, T.P.A. and the Service will work with S.M.E.s to ensure pilot launch in January 2024.

R.M.S. Replacement

At its meeting on April 28, 2023 (Min. No. P2023-0428-7.0 refers), the Board approved a contract award to Niche Technology Inc. (Niche) for the supply and delivery of software, maintenance and professional services in relation to the acquisition and implementation of a new Records Management System (R.M.S.) Work and results to date are as follows:

- A Request for Pre-Qualification (R.F.P.Q.) was issued in November 2021, and in September 2022 the Board approved Niche as the only pre-qualified vendor for the provision of a new R.M.S. (Min. No. P2022-0913-4.1 refers);
- Product demonstrations were provided to more than 500 members across the Service;
- Project governance has been established, including technical and process tables;
- Analysis work was conducted by the Strategy Management project team and provided for consideration to the Business Relationships Management unit, to ensure that identified recommendations were included in discussions around R.M.S. functionalities and requirements.

Next steps are as follows:

- A Statement of Work with the vendor is near completion;
- The implementation of the project will start in 2023 and conclude in 2025, when a transition to a maintenance/stabilization phase will commence.

Promotional Process

One of the most important components of ensuring we sustain the changes incurred through implementing the Auditor General's recommendations is by reinforcing the change through the next generation of leadership within the Service. The Service's People and Culture (P&C) pillar has created an updated Promotional Process Roadmap to support this leadership transformation. Work and results to date are as follows:

- Review of the process with a diversity lens and to emphasize the importance of professional development and community engagement competencies in our future leaders;
- Retaining of a 3rd party Human Resources consultant to provide guidance on application review processes;
- Redesigned examination process has been approved and launched in May 2023.

Next steps are as follows:

- Competitions for promotion to the rank of Sergeant and Staff Sergeant will be held in Q3 2023;
- Newly promoted Sergeants will be trained to re-inforce behaviours of P.R.U. officers related to improvement areas identified by the Auditor General, including arriving at scene and clearing calls;
- Following a process evaluation post-competition, Service procedures and related governance will be updated to reflect the Service's updated Promotional Process

Theme 2: Alternative Response

The Service is both eager and determined to modernize the role of police in crisis events in a way that ensures we are no longer the default service provider. The cornerstone of our program and model for future pilots is our partnership with the City's Social Development, Finance and Administration Division on the Toronto Community Crisis Service (T.C.C.S.) program.

One of the challenges identified through the evaluation of the T.C.C.S. pilot was an unintended impact on certain Communications Services operations. Specifically, for calls that meet the criteria for diversion to T.C.C.S., "talk time" (meaning the duration of time a communications operator spends on an emergency line with a caller) was found to have increased dramatically. The total "talk time" consumed for events diverted to T.C.C.S. per caller on the emergency 9-1-1 line is on average 9:36 (mm:ss). Compared to the monthly average "talk time" for all events on the emergency line, which in 2022 was between 1:49 and 2:00 (mm:ss), this represents an almost 400% increase in talk time for those specific calls. Explaining the T.C.C.S. process to the caller, obtaining consent to release personal health information, and staying on the line to exchange information with the 2-1-1 call taker are all activities that have impacted "talk time" for T.C.C.S. calls.

Unfortunately, this increase in "talk time" for T.C.C.S.-related calls has further impacted Communications Services ability to meet the National Emergency Number Association (N.E.N.A.) standard for answering 9-1-1 calls. In order to help support our Communications Services members, the Service will ensure that impacts to the capacity of the unit are measured and analysed prior to launching any future Alternative Response pilots or programs.

The Service will continue to explore other ways to divert calls, further expand online reporting and civilianize uniform positions, as well as improve processes with a goal of continuing to provide an affordable and value-added public safety service.

Toronto Community Crisis Service

A fulsome update on the Service's contribution to this program was provided at the April 2023 Board meeting [Min. No. P2023-0428-3.0 refers]. Work and results to date are as follows:

- The T.C.C.S. pilot launched on March 31, 2022 and is a goal and priority action of the City of Toronto (City) SafeT.O. Community Safety and Well-Being Plan;
- The pilot has now officially transitioned to a program, and is currently operational in 9 Service divisions;
- The City retained third party evaluators, the Provincial System Support Program (P.S.S.P.) and Shkaabe Makwa at the Centre for Addiction and Mental Health (C.A.M.H.) to conduct an evaluation of the pilot, as reported.

Next steps are as follows:

- Continuing to engage, share information and track progress of the T.C.C.S. program, in partnership with the City's Social Development, Finance and Administration Division;
- Working in partnership with the City of Toronto to implement the recommendations made by the P.S.S.P. review;
- The Service will continue to work towards improvements related to data capture and sharing, including,
 - Creating tools for more automated data collection,
 - Continued meetings between the Service and the T.C.C.S. to identify a solution to enable an electronic push of the Service's event information to the T.C.C.S. service navigator.

9-1-1 Crisis Call Diversion (9-1-1 C.C.D.)

Work and results to date are as follows:

- At its meeting of June 24, 2021, the Board authorized the entering into of a M.O.U. between the Board and Gerstein Crisis Centre (G.C.C.) to establish the 9-1-1 C.C.D. (Min. No. P2021-0624-2.1).
- The 9-1-1 C.C.D. co-locates a G.C.C. crisis worker with specialized training in mental health crisis response in the Service's 911 Communications Services Call Centre, to respond to persons in crisis who call 9-1-1 with primarily mental health needs;
- At the meeting held on September 13, 2022 (Min. No. P2022-0913-2.0 refers), the Board approved extending the pilot until September 30, 2023;
- While the initial pilot catchment area consisted of 3 downtown divisions, the catchment area was expanded city-wide in September 2022 due to the high demand from outside of the catchment area, and the hours of the pilot were expanded to 24 hours per day;

Next steps are as follows:

- Continued monitoring and evaluation of the pilot during the approved extension period.

Theme 3: Community Education and Awareness

The Service supports the Auditor General's sentiment that targeted public education and awareness activities will lead to decreased demands for services. The Service also acknowledges that one of our main priorities for increasing community trust and awareness comes from creating dialogue and opportunities to hear directly from communities we serve in addition to simply providing them information.

The Service's Race & Identity Based Data Collection Strategy has provided an important blueprint to illustrate how to successfully embed continuous community engagement into future Service initiatives. In addition to the creation of a Community Advisory Panel to guide the project, a number of Community Town Halls throughout the city were hosted by community agencies in partnership with the Service. These town halls provided a forum for community members to share perspectives and experiences, as well as providing feedback on action items and outcomes. The combination of providing an educational component to community members and soliciting qualitative feedback in return provides opportunities for true, reciprocal learning and knowledge-sharing.

The Service's Corporate Communications unit has been meeting with our City of Toronto counterparts to develop a joint implementation strategy related to building community education and awareness around the reporting of emergency and non-emergency events. The focus will be to ensure that the public knows which number is most appropriate to call and when.

Through the harmonization efforts of the Service's Corporate Communications and Strategy Management units, and continued partnership commitments with engaged City agencies, the Service strives to ensure that future community consultation and engagement activities are leveraged to include messaging related to the Auditor General's recommendations where possible.

Theme 4: Timing Methodologies

As indicated earlier in this report, when discussing our updated service-based budgeting approach, the Service has been focusing efforts on better aligning service delivery and resource allocation to key metrics and outcomes. For example, the following chart that was included in our 2023 Operating Budget request outlines the relationship between response times for Priority 1 calls and the number of deployed uniform officers. It illustrates the strong correlation between the increase in average response times and decrease in average deployed uniform strength:



Figure 1 - Source: 2023 Service Operating Budget Request, p. 45

A continued focus on aligning resources with demand will guide the Service's work towards refining and updating required time targets.

Staffing Analysis – P.R.U.

Work and results to date are as follows:

- In April 2022, the Strategy Management unit undertook a project to facilitate a staffing analysis program for the Service with goals to:
 - Determine the appropriate time targets for response times and proactive policing time,
 - Identify the accurate number of Priority Response Unit officers required to achieve the set targets,
 - Foster ongoing monitoring and measurement of performance to demonstrate improvement;

- The project team has incorporated best practices and lessons learned from a similar analysis done in partnership with the T.P.A. to support the joint shift schedule pilots currently being conducted in all Service divisions and several additional units;
- A Staffing Analysis Readiness Assessment report was conducted by a 3rd party consultant and concluded that the Service is indeed in a position to proceed with building a program based on our current data availability;
- Planning is currently underway with a data analytics consulting vendor to perform the required data analysis and build related data models. To ensure project success, the Service will again be partnering with the T.P.A. to complete this work.

Next steps are as follows:

- Analysis and Modelling project work is anticipated to launch in Q3 2023;
- The Service will also be undertaking a business process review to determine how best to support logistical and accountability processes required to support program success;
- At intervals during the project and following completion of the required project work, Strategy Management will be providing the Board with fulsome updates on results and findings.

Theme 5: Collaboration with Stakeholders

One of the cornerstones of the Service's implementation strategy for the Auditor General's recommendations is ensuring that collaboration with stakeholders is embedded across all themes and project activities. A major focus of implementation work through the strategy has been building relationships, systems and structures to foster a robust collaborative approach. Important developments include:

- Leveraging opportunities to partner with external stakeholder agencies, to ensure that the Service is co-leading as opposed to working in silos and secrecy. The T.C.C.S. is an important blueprint for this, as project success is a testament to the Service's productive working relationship with the City's Social Development, Finance and Administration Division;
- The Service's partnership with the T.P.A. on the C.O.M. Staffing and Scheduling Analysis is another example of how this collaborative approach leads to stronger problem solving and assists with building momentum to drive swifter change;
- Creating working groups and focusing on internal communication channels and continuous dialogue has fostered better internal collaboration on implementation activities during the first phase of implementation work;
- Utilizing 3rd party expertise to allow for independent evaluation of project activities allows for the Service and partner agencies to focus on results and outcomes without worrying about potential bias. The joint evaluation of the T.C.C.S. pilot by the P.S.S.P., as recommended by the Auditor General, will now allow the Service to focus on program improvement recommendations while continuing to build a collaborative relationship with the T.C.C.S. team.

Conclusion:

The Service looks forward to continuing to work together with our City partners and other external stakeholders to achieve positive change through implementing the Auditor General's recommendations.

A/Staff Superintendent Joe Matthews will be in attendance to answer any questions that the Board may have regarding this report.

Respectfully submitted,

Myron Demkiw, M.O.M.
Chief of Police

Attachments:

Appendix A – Toronto Police Service Update Re: Recommendations Contained In Opportunities to Support More Effective Response to Calls For Service Report

