

**Request for Proposals
for
Pro Manager to Manage the Play, Pro Shops,
and Food and Beverage areas for Five City Run
Golf Courses for the Parks, Forestry &
Recreation Division**

Fairness Monitor's Report

June 7, 2023



Table of Contents

1. Project Highlights.....	3
1.1 Introduction and Project Background	3
1.2 Scope of the Fairness Monitor Engagement.....	3
2. Request for Proposals Process.....	5
2.1 Development of the Request for Proposals	5
2.2 RFP Open Period Process.....	5
2.3 Evaluation Preparation	5
2.4 Proposal Receipt.....	5
2.5 Stage 1 – Mandatory Submission Requirements	6
2.6 Stage 2 – Initial Evaluation	6
2.7 Stage 3 – Joint Solution Development.....	6
2.8 Stage 4 – Revised Bid Evaluation and Rankings	7
2.9 Stage 5 – Negotiation and Final Agreement	7
2.10 Debriefing	7
3. Conclusion	8

1. Project Highlights

1.1 Introduction and Project Background

The City of Toronto (City) released a Negotiated Request for Proposals # Doc3703952212 (RFP) on October 12, 2022 to prospective Suppliers to submit Bids for Pro Manager to Manage the Play, Pro Shops, and Food and Beverage areas for Five City Run Golf Courses for the Parks, Forestry & Recreation Division. The City's objectives for the successful Supplier included the following:

- Deliver high-quality golf operations and golf programming at the five sites
- Deliver improved food and beverage offerings at all five sites
- Maintain and manage high rates of play to drive revenue
- Maintain a high standard of customer service and customer satisfaction for the entire customer journey, online and in person
- Source and implement Point of Sale and booking technologies, including an online payment solution
- Make strategic investments in the sites to improve the quality of experience and to deliver modern facilities and amenities
- Grow the game through equitable access to the tee, innovate programming and engagement opportunities for underrepresented groups
- Bring creativity and innovation to serve non-golfers at the properties better
- Provide a frictionless, digital-first customer experience in the areas of registration, booking and payment
- Survey customer satisfaction

1.2 Scope of the Fairness Monitor Engagement

P1 Consulting was retained in September 2022 to perform fairness monitoring services and provide an independent attestation on the RFP procurement process. Our mandate was to review and monitor the bid documents and communications, provide advice on best practices, review and monitor the evaluation and decision-making processes that are associated with the RFP to ensure fairness, equity, objectivity, transparency and adequate documentation throughout the evaluation process. We are also to attend, observe and provide guidance at City meetings, as well as Supplier interactions. In particular, in our role as Fairness Monitor, we ascertained that the following steps were taken to ensure an open, fair and transparent process:

- **Review of the RFP and Addenda:**
P1 Consulting reviewed the RFP and addenda, as required, and all other documents related to the procurement process to ensure that the requirements were met.
- **Review of Questions and Answers (Q&A), Clarification Questions and the Responses:**

P1 Consulting reviewed all Q&As and the responses submitted to the Suppliers. P1 Consulting also reviewed any clarifying questions submitted by City along with their responses.

- **Review of Evaluation Criteria and Procedures:**

P1 Consulting reviewed the evaluation criteria and procedures for the RFP to ensure that the requirements were met.

- **Advice on Best Practices:**

P1 Consulting attended training sessions to ensure that all project team members were provided with briefings on best practices including the principles and duties of fairness, care and protection of confidential information, avoidance and disclosure of conflict of interest, bias and undue influence, scoring procedures and sign-off on individual scoring sheets, preparation, treatment and retention of evaluation documents.

- **Evaluation Meetings:**

P1 Consulting observed and documented evaluation meetings, including the evaluation training session, and the consensus sessions. Additionally, during the evaluation process, we provided verbal and written advice with respect to fairness, objectivity, consistency of process, conflict of interest and confidentiality to ensure strict accordance with the specifications and criteria set out in the RFP documents.

- **Supplier Interaction:**

P1 Consulting attended and monitored all information sessions, site tours, and commercially confidential meetings (CCMs) with Suppliers.

All of the tasks above were completed in a manner that was fair, open and transparent.

2. Request for Proposals Process

2.1 Development of the Request for Proposals

P1 Consulting reviewed the RFP prior to it being posted to the Suppliers and all of our comments related to fairness were satisfactorily addressed by City. We confirm that, from a fairness perspective, the requirements were clear and the RFP provided the Suppliers a fair process.

2.2 RFP Open Period Process

Throughout the RFP open period, the City responded to the questions from the Suppliers and issued addenda to provide greater clarity on the requirements and process. P1 Consulting reviewed all documents that were posted to confirm that they were acceptable from a fairness perspective. The City held a Pre-Bid Information Meeting with Suppliers on October 20, 2022 and on-site meetings that took place between October 21, 2023 and October 27, 2023 at the golf courses. P1 Consulting reviewed and commented on any presentation materials in advance, and monitored the meetings.

2.3 Evaluation Preparation

The City developed evaluation procedure documentation in advance of the evaluation process, which was reviewed by the Fairness Monitor. All participants in the evaluation process were required to participate in a training session in preparation for their role in the process, which described roles and responsibilities and the approach to the evaluation. The meeting was not attended by the Fairness Monitor, however the meeting materials were reviewed after the meeting and found to be acceptable from a fairness perspective. Each evaluation participant was required to sign a participant undertaking, which included a continued commitment to the avoidance of conflicts and respect of confidentiality commitments. Project participants were notified of the appointment of a Fairness Monitor. There were no conflicts identified of which we were aware, which prevented a party from participating in the RFP evaluation.

2.4 Proposal Receipt

The RFP Closing Date was December 8, 2022, at 12:00 noon (Local Toronto Time). As per the RFP, bids must have been submitted through the City Online Procurement System prior to the Closing Deadline for them to be compliant. Seven Bids were received in advance of the Closing Deadline through the City Online Procurement System from the following Suppliers:

- City Golf Plus Inc.
- Global Brand Foodservices Inc.
- GolfNorth Management Corp.
- 505707 Ontario Ltd. OBA Grenadier Group
- Group 1111 Business Development, Management and Consulting

- Markham Sports Dome Inc.
- Thistle Golf Limited

The evaluation was conducted according to the following stages:

1. Stage 1 – Mandatory Submission Requirements
2. Stage 2 – Initial Evaluation
3. Stage 3 – Joint Solution Development
4. Stage 4 – Revised Bid Evaluation and Rankings
5. Stage 5 – Negotiation and Final Agreement

2.5 Stage 1 – Mandatory Submission Requirements

Prior to releasing the proposals to the evaluators, the City reviewed each Bid to determine if it complied with the mandatory requirements of the RFP. All seven (7) Suppliers met the mandatory requirements and proceeded to Stage 2 - Technical Proposal, Presentation and Rated Evaluations.

2.6 Stage 2 – Initial Evaluation

As it relates to the Rated Evaluation, the members of the Evaluation Committee each undertook an individual evaluation and scoring of Bids against the criteria described in the RFP. Subsequent to completion of the individual evaluations, a consensus evaluation process was used to evaluate the using the established evaluation criteria. The participants engaged in a fulsome exchange of views leading to evaluation results, which were agreed to by the evaluators for each Supplier. All participants performed their roles diligently throughout the evaluation process.

P1 Consulting attended the meetings and observed that the proceedings were in accordance with the RFP and the City's evaluation procedure documents. P1 confirms that the process was fair, transparent and unbiased.

The following Suppliers met or exceeded the minimum threshold identified in the RFP for Stage 2 and proceeded to Stage 3 – Pricing and Initial Ranking:

- GolfNorth Management Corp.
- Thistle Golf Limited

2.7 Stage 3 – Joint Solution Development

The City reviewed the Pricing Forms submitted from each of the Suppliers who were eligible to participate in Stage 3. P1 Consulting reviewed and validated the results of Stage 3 and confirms that it was undertaken in a fair manner and in accordance with the RFP.

Short listed Suppliers were invited to collaborate with the City by way of Commercially Confidential Meetings, which is a collaborative process that allowed each short-listed Supplier to improve their Proposal in the areas open to resubmission through BAFO. In

advance of participating in CCMs, the Evaluation Committee attended a training session on how to undertake the meetings in a fair and consistent manner. P1 Consulting facilitated the training session and attended the CCMs and confirms that they were conducted fairly and in accordance with the established parameters.

2.8 Stage 4 – Revised Bid Evaluation and Rankings

After CCM period, the Suppliers submitted their BAFO revised Proposal.

The City evaluated the revised Proposals for each of the Suppliers and, in accordance with the RFP identified Thistle Golf Limited was determined to be the top-ranked Supplier, and invited into negotiations with the City to finalize the Agreement.

2.9 Stage 5 – Negotiation and Final Agreement

P1 Consulting was not involved in any activities related to this Stage.

2.10 Debriefing

At the time of this report, no debriefings have been conducted related to this procurement.

3. Conclusion

Our fairness review was conducted without influence and as of the date of this report, we confirm that we are satisfied that, from a fairness perspective, the processes undertaken related to the RFP for the City of Toronto's Pro Manager to Manage the Play, Pro Shops, and Food and Beverage areas for Five City Run Golf Courses have been conducted in a fair, open and transparent manner. As Fairness Monitor for this Project, we are satisfied that City have followed the procedures in accordance with the applicable RFP and policy documentation and that the participants followed the procedures and fairly applied the evaluation criteria.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Stephanie Braithwaite".

Stephanie Braithwaite
Director of Fairness Services, P1 Consulting