DI TORONTO

REPORT FOR ACTION

46 Spadina Avenue - Notice of Intention to Designate a Property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Date: December 20, 2022
To: Toronto Preservation Board
From: Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning
Wards: Ward 10 - Spadina-Fort York

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council state its intention to designate the property at 46 Spadina Avenue (including entrance addresses at 40, 42, and 44 Spadina Avenue) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value.

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue comprises a four-storey factory building that was constructed in 1907 and designed by the Toronto architectural firm of Horwood and Burke. Commissioned by Business Systems Limited, which manufactured business stationery and operated a business training school, the property served as the company's headquarters and factory for over half a century. In the late 20th century, the property was among the properties in the King-Spadina neighbourhood that became associated with the clothing manufacturing industry in Toronto's Fashion District.

City Council included the subject property on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register in 2016. It is also a contributing property within the King-Spadina Heritage Conservation District (HCD). City Council designated the King-Spadina HCD and adopted the King-Spadina HCD Plan under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act at its meeting of October 2, 2017. The HCD Plan is currently under appeal. Additionally, the subject property is adjacent to the listed property at 374-376 Wellington Street West.

Staff have completed the Research and Evaluation Report for the property at 46 Spadina Avenue and determined that the property meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, on the basis of its design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual values. As such, the property is a significant built heritage resource.

In August 2022, the City received Site Plan Approval, Official Plan Amendment, and Zoning By-law Amendment applications related to proposed redevelopment of the subject property with a 28-storey mixed-use building, comprised of a 24-storey tower atop a 4-storey podium along Spadina Avenue.

In June 2019, the More Homes, More Choice Act, 2019 (Bill 108) received Royal Assent. Schedule 11 of this Act included amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act. The Bill 108 Amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act came into force on July 1, 2021, which included a shift in Part IV designations related to certain Planning Act applications. Section 29(1.2) of the Ontario Heritage Act now restricts City Council's ability to give notice of its intention to designate a property under the Act to within 90 days after the City Clerk gives notice of a complete application.

On November 28, 2022, the More Homes Built Faster Act, 2022 (Bill 23) received Royal Assent. Schedule 6 of the More Homes Built Faster Act amended prescribed event requirements under Section 29 (1.2) of the Ontario Heritage Act and will come into effect on January 1, 2023.

It is anticipated that on or after January 1, 2023, where a prescribed event is triggered, in order to designate a property under Section 29 of the Act, the property must have been included in the heritage register prior to the prescribed event being triggered.

Additionally, the Province has amended O. Reg. 9/06 under the Ontario Heritage Act, which is intended to come into effect on January 1, 2023. The revised regulation establishes nine provincial criteria for determining whether a property is of cultural heritage value or interest. A property may be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, if it meets two or more of the nine criteria.

The City Clerk issued a complete application notice on September 16, 2022. The property owner provided a waiver to extend the 90-day timeline established under Bill 108 through March 31, 2023.

A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) is required for all development applications that affect listed and designated properties and will be considered when determining how a heritage property is to be conserved. Designation also enables City Council to review proposed alterations or demolitions to the property and enforce heritage property standards and maintenance.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning recommends that:

1. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 46 Spadina Avenue (including entrance addresses at 40, 42, and 44 Spadina Avenue) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act in accordance with the Statement of Significance; 46 Spadina Avenue (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 3, to the report, December 20, 2022, from the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning:

2. If there are no objections to the designation, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the Bill in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

46 Spadina Avenue - Notice of Intention to Designate

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

City Council included the subject property at the property at 46 Spadina Avenue (including the addresses at 40, 44 and 50 Spadina Avenue) on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register in March 10, 2016. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/view Agenda Item History.do?item=2016.TE 14.7

The subject property is a contributing property within the King-Spadina Heritage Conservation District (HCD). City Council designated the King-Spadina HCD and adopted the King-Spadina HCD Plan under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act at its meeting of October 2, 2017.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/view AgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.TE26.14

City Council adopted an updated version of the HCD Plan at its meeting of March 9, 2022. The HCD Plan is currently under appeal. http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/view AgendaItemHistory.do?item=2022.CC41.6

BACKGROUND

Heritage Planning Framework

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is an integral component of good planning, contributing to a sense of place, economic prosperity, and healthy and equitable communities. Heritage conservation in Ontario is identified as a provincial interest under the Planning Act. Cultural heritage resources are considered irreplaceable and valuable assets that must be wisely protected and managed as part of planning for future growth under the Provincial Policy Statement (2020) and A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2020). Heritage Conservation is enabled through the Ontario Heritage Act. The City of Toronto's Official Plan implements the provincial policy regime, the Planning Act, the Ontario Heritage Act and provides policies to guide decision making within the city.

Good planning within the provincial and municipal policy framework has at its foundation an understanding and appreciation for places of historic significance, and ensures the conservation of these resources are to be balanced with other provincial interests. Heritage resources may include buildings, structures, monuments, and geographic areas that have cultural heritage value or interest to a community, including an Indigenous community.

The Planning Act establishes the foundation for land use planning in Ontario, describing how land can be controlled and by whom. Section 2 of the Planning Act identifies heritage conservation as a matter of provincial interest and directs that municipalities shall have regard to the conservation of features of significant architectural, historical, archaeological or scientific interest. Heritage conservation contributes to other matters of provincial interest, including the promotion of built form that is well-designed, and that encourages a sense of place.

The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters shall conform to the Growth Plan and shall be consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, both of which position heritage as a key component in supporting key provincial principles and interests.

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/statute/90p13

The Provincial Policy Statement provides policy direction on land use planning in Ontario and is to be used by municipalities in the development of their official plans and to guide and inform decisions on planning matters, which shall be consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement articulates how and why heritage conservation is a component of good planning, explicitly requiring the conservation of cultural heritage and archaeological resources, alongside the pursuit of other provincial interests. The Provincial Policy Statement does so by linking heritage conservation to key policy directives, including building strong healthy communities, the wise use and management of resources, and protecting health and safety.

Section 1.1 Managing and Directing Land Use to Achieve Efficient and Resilient Development states that long-term economic prosperity is supported by, among other considerations, the promotion of well-designed built form and cultural planning, and the conservation of features that help define character. Section 2.6 Cultural Heritage and Archaeology subsequently directs that "significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved". Through the definition of conserved, built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscape and protected heritage property, the Provincial Policy Statement identifies the Ontario Heritage Act as the primary legislation through which heritage conservation will be implemented. https://www.ontario.ca/page/provincial-policy-statement-2020

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2020) builds on the Provincial Policy Statement to establish a land use planning framework that supports complete communities, a thriving economy, a clean and healthy environment and social equity. Section 1.2.1 Guiding Principles states that policies in the plan seek to, among other principles, "conserve and promote cultural heritage resources to support the social, economic, and cultural well-being of all communities, including First Nations and Metis communities". Cultural heritage resources are understood as being irreplaceable, and are significant features that provide people with a sense of place. Section 4.2.7 Cultural Heritage Resources directs that cultural heritage resources will be conserved in order to foster a sense of place and benefit communities, particularly in strategic growth areas.

https://files.ontario.ca/mmah-place-to-grow-office-consolidation-en-2020-08-28.pdf

The Ontario Heritage Act is the key provincial legislation for the conservation of cultural heritage resources in Ontario. It regulates, among other things, how municipal councils can identify and protect heritage resources, including archaeology, within municipal boundaries. This is largely achieved through listing on the City's Heritage Register,

designation of individual properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, or designation of districts under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act gives municipalities the authority to maintain and add to a publicly accessible heritage register. The City of Toronto's Heritage Register includes individual heritage properties that have been designated under Part IV, Section 29, properties in a heritage conservation district designated under Part V, Section 41 of the Act as well as properties that have not been designated but City Council believes to be of "cultural heritage value or interest."

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/statute/90o18

Ontario Regulation 9/06 sets out the criteria for evaluating properties to be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The criteria are based on an evaluation of design/physical value, historical and associative value and contextual value. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009

The Ontario Heritage Toolkit provides guidance on designating properties of municipal significance, including direction on the purpose of designating heritage properties and information about how the Provincial Policy Statement and the Ontario Heritage Act provide a framework for the conservation of heritage properties within the land use planning system. In June 2019, the More Homes, More Choice Act, 2019 (Bill 108) received Royal Assent. Schedule 11 of this Act included amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act. The Bill 108 Amendments to the Act came into force on July 1, 2021, which included, amongst other matters, amendments to the listing and designation processes. Guidance from the Province related to the implementation of Bill 108 Amendments is forthcoming.

http://www.mtc.gov.on.ca/en/heritage/heritage_toolkit.shtml

On November 28, 2022, the More Homes Built Faster Act, 2022 (Bill 23) received Royal Assent. Schedule 6 of the More Homes Built Faster Act amended various sections of the Ontario Heritage Act. It is anticipated that a majority of the key changes to the Act will come into effect on January 1, 2023.

The City of Toronto's Official Plan contains a number of policies related to properties on the City's Heritage Register and properties adjacent to them, as well as the protection of areas of archaeological potential. Indicating the integral role that heritage conservation plays in successful city-building, Section 3.1.6 of the Official Plan states that, "Cultural heritage is an important component of sustainable development and place making. The preservation of our cultural heritage is essential to the character of this urban and liveable City that can contribute to other social, cultural, economic and environmental goals of the City."

Policy 3.1.6.4 states that heritage resources on the City's Heritage Register "will be conserved and maintained consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as revised from time to time and adopted by Council."

Policy 3.1.6.6 encourages the adaptive re-use of heritage properties while Policy 3.1.6.26 states that, when new construction on, or adjacent to, a property on the Heritage Register does occur, it will be designed to conserve the cultural heritage values, attributes and character of that property and will mitigate visual and physical impacts on it.

https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/official-planguidelines/official-plan/

https://www.historicplaces.ca/media/18072/81468-parks-s+g-eng-web2.pdf

COMMENTS

City Council included the property located at 46 Spadina Avenue (including the addresses at 40, 42, and 44 Spadina Avenue) on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register in 2016.

The property located at 46 Spadina Avenue (including the addresses at 40, 42, and 44 Spadina Avenue) is also a contributing property within the King-Spadina Heritage Conservation District (HCD). City Council designated the King-Spadina HCD and adopted the King-Spadina HCD Plan under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act at its meeting of October 2, 2017. The HCD Plan is currently under appeal.

The subject property is adjacent to the listed property at 374-376 Wellington Street West.

In August 2022, the City received Site Plan Approval, Official Plan Amendment, and Zoning By-law Amendment applications related to proposed redevelopment of the subject property with a 28-storey mixed-use building, comprised of a 24-storey tower atop a 4-storey podium along Spadina Avenue. Overall, the proposal consists of a total of 38,693 square metres of gross floor area, of which 32,138 square metres would be dedicated to residential uses, 5,908 square metres would be dedicated to office uses and 647 square metres would be dedicated to at-grade retail uses, resulting in an overall density of 10.4 FSI. The proposed building would contain a total of 521 dwelling units.

46 Spadina Avenue

Research and Evaluation according to Ontario Regulation 9/06

While the research and evaluation of the property referenced above is, in staff's determination, sufficient to support the designation of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue, it should be noted that new and additional relevant information on the subject property further expanding on its cultural heritage value following community input and additional access to archival records may be incorporated in the final version of a Part IV designation by-law.



Figure 1: 46 Spadina Avenue, 2022. (Heritage Planning)

1. DESCRIPTION

46 Spadina Avenue - Systems Building		
ADDRESS	46 Spadina Avenue	
WARD	10	
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	PLAN 692 LOTS 5 6 7 & 15	
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	King-Spadina	
HISTORICAL NAME	Systems Building	
CONSTRUCTION DATE	1907	
ORIGINAL OWNER	Harry J. King - Business Systems Limited	
ORIGINAL USE	Manufacturing headquarters and warehouse	
CURRENT USE*	Multi-unit commercial office	
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	Burke and Horwood	
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS	Brick	
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	Edwardian Classical	
ADDITIONS/ALTER ATIONS	1939-1941: two-storey warehouse addition	
	to south	
	1941-1947: third and fourth storeys added to	
	southern addition	
CRITERIA	Design/Physical, Historical/Associative,	
	Contextual	
HERITAGE STATUS	Listed (2016)	
RECORDER	Heritage Planning: Kathryn Anderson,	
	Tatum Taylor Chaubal	
REPORT DATE	December 20, 2022	

2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation section of the report describes the history, architecture and context of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue and applies evaluation criteria as set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06 to determine whether it merits designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest. The application of the criteria is found in Section 3 (Evaluation Checklist). The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in the Conclusion of the report. Maps and Photographs are located in Attachment 1. The archival and contemporary sources for the research are found in Attachment 2. The Statements of Significance are contained in Attachment 3.

Key Date	Historical Event
	The area now known as the City of Toronto is the traditional territory of many nations including the Mississaugas of the Credit, the Anishnabeg, the Chippewa, the Haudenosaunee and the Wendat peoples, and is now home to many diverse First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples. Toronto is covered by Treaty 13 signed with the Mississaugas of the Credit (1805), and the Williams Treaties (1923) signed with multiple Mississaugas and Chippewa bands.
1837	Following the incorporation of the City of Toronto (1834), Bonnycastle's Map showed the subdivision of the Military Reserve, which was originally set aside for the garrison west of the (Old) Town of York.
1858	Boulton's Atlas illustrated wholesale merchant Lewis Moffatt's house and grounds on the west side of Brock Street (present-day Spadina Avenue), north of Wellington Place (present-day Wellington Street West).
1887 June	Part of the Military Reserve was subdivided under Plan 692, placing the Moffatt House on Lot 5.
1903	Goad's Atlas illustrated the former Moffatt House, now adjoined by other house-form buildings.
1905 Sept	Business Systems Limited was founded to manufacture business stationery, including loose-leaf, card, and correspondence systems.
1906 Jan	The city directory recorded the former Moffatt House at "52 Spadina" as vacant.
1906 Aug	According to the tax assessment rolls, William Davies owned the former house form building at "52 Spadina," where Business Systems Limited was the tenant in the upper storey.
1907 Apr	Business Systems Limited was issued a building permit for a four- storey brick warehouse at "50-52 Spadina Avenue" that identified Burke and Horwood as the architects.

i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

1907 Aug	Business Systems Limited's manager, Harry J. King owned the "unfinished" building, according to the tax assessment rolls, and
	the "new Systems Building" was advertised in local newspapers.
1908 Feb	Business Systems Limited was incorporated.
1908 Aug	The Systems Building was valued at \$35,000 in the assessment
	rolls, and the complex also included a commercial school and the
	Dominion Envelope Company, both owned by Harry J. King.
1939-1941	A two-storey warehouse addition was constructed at the south
	end of the subject property, replacing residential fabric.
1941-1947	A third and fourth storey were added to the southern two-storey
4040	addition.
1949	An archival photograph showed the Systems Building during the
	period when King-Spadina was in decline as Toronto's manufacturing centre.
1960	Business Systems Limited was recorded for the last time in the
1900	City Directory (published in 1961 with information dating to the
	previous year).
1961	According to the next City Directory, R. L. Crain Limited, producer
	of business forms, was the new occupant of the Systems
	Building.
1971-2005	The Systems Building was depicted in archival photographs when
	its tenants were associated with Toronto's Fashion District.
2015	The property at 46 Spadina Avenue was within the proposed
	boundaries of the King-Spadina Heritage Conservation District
	Study Area.
2016	City Council included the subject property on the City of Toronto's
0000	Heritage Register.
2022	The City received Site Plan Approval, Official Plan Amendment,
	and Zoning By-law Amendment applications related to proposed
	redevelopment of the subject property.

ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The following section outlines the history and facts related to the properties which are the basis for determining historical or associative value of Criteria 4, 5 or 6 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue is part of the King-Spadina neighbourhood that developed in the early 20th century adjoining the major cross-roads of King Street West and Spadina Avenue. The origin of the area dates to the late 18th century when Toronto was founded as the Town of York and the area west of the townsite was set aside as the Military Reserve. However, the rapid growth of the community led to its westward expansion as New Town where the third Provincial Parliament Buildings (1829) and Upper Canada College (1831) created institutional enclaves around which residential neighbourhoods developed in King-Spadina.

King-Spadina became Toronto's new manufacturing district after the Great Fire of 1904 when large-scale factories and warehouses replaced most of the earlier housing stock. Following World War II when many manufacturers were drawn to the suburbs, buildings

in King-Spadina stood vacant as the area's industrial zoning restricted other uses. During the late 20th century, King-Spadina was primarily identified as Toronto's Fashion District for the number of clothing designers and manufacturers that dominated the area. The revitalization of the area began in the 1960s when famed entrepreneur Edwin "Honest Ed" Mirvish restored the Royal Alexandra Theatre (1906) and converted several of the adjoining early 20th century warehouses to restaurants, forming the nucleus of today's Entertainment District that includes Roy Thomson Hall (1982) and the Princess of Wales Theatre (1993). In 1996, the City of Toronto adopted the King-Spadina Secondary Plan, which encouraged the adaptive reuse of the existing industrial buildings. The transformation of King-Spadina continues in the 21st century as a sought-after residential community.

The subject property is located on Spadina Avenue, which was originally named Brock Street after it was laid out by Dr. William Warren Baldwin as the road to his country estate, "Spadina," on the escarpment north of the city. At the south end of Spadina Avenue, the street was flanked on the east and west by Clarence Square and Victoria Square, respectively, which were connected by an expansive boulevard named Wellington Place (later extended as Wellington Street West). The surrounding neighbourhood attracted high-end residences, one of which was commissioned in the mid-19th century by Lewis Moffatt (c. 1809-92), a successful wholesale merchant and financial director. Moffatt's property was subdivided for additional housing along Spadina Avenue before the end of the 19th century, and by 1906, his residence was converted for commercial uses with Business Systems Limited among the first tenants.

Business Systems Limited was founded in 1905 to manufacture "loose-leaf accounting systems, perpetual ledgers, order, bill and charge systems, auditing and cost systems" with headquarters in Toronto and branches in Montreal, Winnipeg and St. John, New Brunswick.¹ Newspaper accounts in the early 20th century described the success of Business Systems Limited and the expansion of its plant on Spadina Avenue. In 1907, the company's manager, Harry J. King, received a building permit for a four-storey warehouse that housed the stationery factory, as well as King's other enterprises: a commercial school and the Dominion Envelope Company. The Business Systems Limited at the subject property until 1960, after which the building was occupied by tenants identified with Toronto's fashion industry.

Designed by the notable Toronto architectural partnership of Burke and Horwood, the Systems Building was designed in the Edwardian Classical style popular for all architectural types in the early 20th century, including many of the factories and warehouses that represent a prevalent building typology in the King-Spadina neighbourhood. Edwardian Classicism was a reaction to the more elaborate styles of the Victorian era, featuring symmetrically organized elevations and classical detailing that is illustrated on the Systems Building. Later additions to the building, expanding its functional capacity, sustained the symmetry and stylistic details of the principal elevation. In 1939-1942, a two-storey warehouse addition was constructed at the south end of the subject property, replacing residential fabric. In the 1940s, a third and fourth storey were added to that southern two-storey addition.

¹ Toronto Star, September 8, 1905

⁴⁶ Spadina Avenue - Notice of Intention to Designate

iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

The following section outlines the history and facts related to the properties which are the basis for determining historical or associative value of Criteria 4, 5 or 6 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue comprises a four-storey factory building that was constructed in 1907 and designed by the Toronto architectural firm of Horwood and Burke. Representing the Edwardian Classical style, the property features red brick cladding with brick and stone detailing. The principal (east) elevation is symmetrically organized into 11 bays, with frontispieces in the slightly projecting centre and outer bays. Two entrances, at the north and south ends of the principal elevation, are set in Gibbs surrounds with stone quoins. Fenestration on the principal elevation includes flatheaded openings in the base and upper stories, and round-arched openings in the first (ground) storey. Additional details include window detailing with voussoirs and keystones, brick banding and quoins, brick corbelling above the first (ground) storey, and a stone name plate reading "Systems Building" above the north entrance.

iv. CONTEXT

The following section provides contextual information and analysis related to the property which is the basis for determining contextual value of Criteria 7, 8 or 9 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue is located on the west side of the street, midway between Wellington Street West (south) and King Street West (north). It is situated within the King-Spadina neighbourhood, where many former factories and warehouses are included on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register for their cultural heritage value. The subject property is a contributing property within the proposed King-Spadina Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Plan, which has been adopted by City Council and is currently under appeal. In particular, the subject property complements the building at the north end of the block, 425 King Street West, with which it shares a material palette and architectural vocabulary.

Spadina Avenue was originally named Brock Street after it was laid out by Dr. William Warren Baldwin as a road to his country estate "Spadina," located on the escarpment above Davenport Road. At the south end of Spadina Avenue, the street was flanked on the east and west by Clarence Square and Victoria Memorial Square, respectively, which were connected by Wellington Place (later Wellington Street West), surrounding neighbourhood attracting high-end residences in the mid-19th century. North of King Street West, Spadina Avenue developed in the early 20th century as a manufacturing and warehouse corridor that came to be referred to as the "Garment District", owing to the large number of textile manufacturing and distributing operations that were historically located within the area. The built form of the Spadina Avenue is generally defined by Industrial/Commercial properties with large floorplates and in a range of architectural styles. Many of these buildings have side walls visible from the public realm, a tripartite design with defined base, shaft and roofline, and service access through side and rear laneways. The grand avenue design envisioned by Baldwin is still evident in the public realm, defined by the wide right-of-way with trees and centre median (now a streetcar right-of-way). Wide sidewalks with tree planters separating

pedestrians from traffic enhance the pedestrian experience, and support an understanding of the civic design of Spadina Avenue as a major artery within the downtown core.

3. EVALUATION AND APPLICATION OF O.REG 9/06 CRITERIA

The following evaluation applies Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. The criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act, and the City of Toronto is also required to use these criteria when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register. There are a total of nine criteria under O. Reg 9/06. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or " \checkmark " if it is applicable to the property, with explanatory text below.

DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

The property has design value or physical value because it	
1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	
expression, material or construction method.	
2. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit N/A	
3. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement N/	

Rare, unique, representative, or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue has design value as a well-crafted example of an early 20th century factory in the King-Spadina neighbourhood, which was designed with features of Edwardian Classicism, the most popular style for all building types during this era. The Systems Building is particularly distinguished by its elaborate classical detailing that includes the frontispieces with quoins and the twin entrances on the principal (east) elevation.

HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
4. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity,	
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
5. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	
understanding of a community or culture	
6. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

Direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to a community

The Systems Building is valued for its contributions to the development and evolution of the King-Spadina neighbourhood in the early 20th century. During this period, the area changed from an institutional enclave adjoined by residential subdivisions to Toronto's new manufacturing district after the Great Fire of 1904. The property at 46 Spadina Avenue is especially linked to the historical transition of King-Spadina, as Business Systems Limited established its company in one of the former high-end residences that marked the initial development along the street before replacing it with the large-scale warehouse, a building typology that was indicative of the industrial character of the community after 1900.

Demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community

The historical value of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue is also through its connection with the architectural practice of Burke and Horwood. As the successor to the firm founded by his uncle, Henry Langley, Edmund Burke formed a partnership with John Horwood in 1894, and the pair received immediate recognition as the designers of the Robert Simpson Store as the first Chicago-style building in Toronto. Although Horwood and White designed innumerable residential, institutional, and industrial buildings in the city, they accepted few documented commissions in King-Spadina, including the Systems Building and the neighbouring Samuel, Benjamin and Company Building on the southwest corner of King and Spadina, which is included on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
7. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an	\checkmark
area.	
8. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its	\checkmark
surroundings.	
9. a landmark.	N/A

Important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of the area

With respect to contextual value, the property at 46 Spadina Avenue supports the historical character of the King-Spadina neighbourhood, where contributes to an important concentration of former factories and warehouses. These buildings reflect the area's shift from its origins as an institutional and residential district to Toronto's manufacturing centre after the Great Fire of 1904.

Physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings

The Systems Building is historically and visually linked to its setting on Spadina Avenue, south of King Street West, where other large-scale warehouses on Spadina, King, and Wellington streets are among the neighbouring properties that are included on the City's

Heritage Register. In particular, it complements the building at the north end of the block, 425 King Street West, with which it shares a material palette and architectural vocabulary.

CONCLUSION

Staff have completed the Research and Evaluation Report for the property at 46 Spadina Avenue and determined that the property meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, on the basis of its design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual values. As such, the property is a significant built heritage resource.

The Statement of Significance (Attachment 3) for 46 Spadina Avenue comprises the Reasons for Designation, which is the Public Notice of Intention to Designate.

CONTACT

Tamara Anson-Cartwright Program Manager, Policy & Research Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning Tel: 416-338-1083; Fax: 416-392-1973 E-mail: Tamara.Anson-Cartwright@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Mary L. MacDonald, MA, CAHP Senior Manager, Heritage Planning Urban Design, City Planning

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Maps and Photographs Attachment 2 – List of Research Sources Attachment 3 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation)

ATTACHMENT 1

MAPS AND PHOTOGRAPHS 46 SPADINA AVENUE – SYSTEMS BUILDING



Figure 2: Location of 46 Spadina Avenue indicated by the arrow. Note: This location map is for information purposes only; the exact boundaries of the property are not shown. North is located at the top of the map. (City of Toronto mapping.)



Figure 3: 1903 Goad's Atlas of the City of Toronto; future location of 46 Spadina Avenue indicated by the arrow.



Figure 4: 1913 Goad's Atlas of the City of Toronto; location of 46 Spadina Avenue indicated by the arrow.



Figure 5: 1924 Goad's Atlas of the City of Toronto; location of 46 Spadina Avenue indicated by the arrow.



Figure 6: 1965 aerial photograph; location of 46 Spadina Avenue indicated by the arrow.



Figure 7: 2021 aerial photograph; location of 46 Spadina Avenue indicated by the arrow.



Figure 8: East (principal) elevation of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue, 2022. (Heritage Planning)



Figure 9: South elevation of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue, 2022. (Heritage Planning)



Figure 10: Southwest corner of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue, 2022. (Heritage Planning)



Figure 11: West (rear) elevation of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue, 2022. (Heritage Planning)



Figure 12: Northwestward view of the subject property within its streetscape on the west side of Spadina Avenue, with 46 Spadina Avenue at left; 425 King Street West visible at right, 2022. (Heritage Planning)



Figure 13: Detail of the primary entry on the west elevation of the subject property, 2022. Note Gibbs surround and Systems Building name plate. (Heritage Planning)

BUILDING PERMIT	THE ONE OPPORTUNITY OF A LIFETIME
No. 19940 Toronto. APE 190 Permit granied to Nr. Besince System I'ld so-si Spatian of To erect a 4 stray buch exactorize near King St.	Once in a lifetime "OPPORTINGTY" knocks at the door of every thuman being, and if not at once imapped passes so floars with observations to the state of the door and selec- tic to be an another the state of the state of the state to pass by, and it becomes a lifetime regret. Bestman Rystense Commercial School strictly the floar state of the state of the state of the strict of the state state of the state
on 50-56 pabling left Architect Build of Hervised Builder John Alder day Cast at Building, 5 43,000 243,000 Plans and Specifications approved by	OUR PROPOSITION In our new rooms in the new Soulasm Building we can tudest. Ours is a new school we know it. We are builded upon until they have been tind. Our testing tank the control of the school of the school of the school the school of the school of the school of the school of the school of the school of the school of the school model of the school of the school of the school of the school of the school of the school of the school of the model of the school of the school of the school of the model of the school of the school of the school of the model of the school of the school of the school of the model of the school of the
No. of Block Plan	Business Systems Commercial School, Limited, 46-52 Spadina Ave., Toronto, Canada T. F. WRIGHT, Principal.

stems Commercial Limited. Toronto, Canada Principal.

Figure 14: Building Permit No. 6940, April 12, 1907, and Advertisement, Business Systems, September 11, 1907: the building permit issued for the four-storey brick warehouse designed by architects Burke and Horwood is shown on the left, with a newspaper advertisement for the company's commercial school in "the new Systems Building" (not yet constructed) on the right (City of Toronto Archives and The Globe, September 11, 1907).



Figure 15: Archival Photograph, Spadina Avenue north of Wellington Street West, 1949: showing the Systems Building on the west side of the street, with the signage on the south elevation (City of Toronto Archives, Series 372, Item 1947).



1973



1999



2005

Figure 16: Archival Photographs, 46 Spadina Avenue, 1973-2005: view of the principal (east) and north elevations (top), the principal (east) elevation (centre), and the principal (east) and south elevations (bottom) (City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 2043, File 260; Toronto Historical Board, 1991; Heritage Preservation Services, 2005).

RESEARCH SOURCES

46 SPADINA AVENUE – SYSTEMS BUILDING

Archival Sources

- Abstract Index of Deeds, Plan 692, Lots 5-6 and 15
- Aerial photographs, City of Toronto mapping, 1939, 1954, 1965, 1978, 2005, 2015, 2020
- Archival Photographs, City of Toronto Archives and Toronto Historical Board (individual citations in Images)
- Assessment Rolls, Ward 4, Division 1, 1906 ff.
- Boulton Atlas of the City of Toronto and Vicinity, 1858.
- Building Permit #6940, April 12, 1907, City of Toronto Archives
- Goad's Atlas of the City of Toronto, 1880, 1889, 1903, 1913, 1924.
- Toronto City Directories, 1850-1969 (<u>https://www.torontopubliclibrary.ca/history-genealogy/lh-digital-city-directories.jsp</u>), 1970-2000 (Toronto Reference Library).

Secondary Sources

- Advertisement, The Globe, September 11, 1907
- Arthur, Eric, Toronto: No Mean City, 3rd ed., revised by Stephen B. Otto, 1986
- Blumenson, John, Ontario Architecture, 1990
- "Business Systems Limited," Toronto Star, September 8, 1905
- Carr, Angela, Toronto Architect Edmund Burke, 19
- Dendy, William, Lost Toronto, 2nd ed., 1993
- Donegan, Rosemary, Spadina Avenue, 1982
- "Edmund Burke," entry in The Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada, <u>http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/1678</u>
- ERA Architects, "40-62 Spadina Avenue & 376 Wellington Street West, Heritage Impact Assessment," 18 July 2022
- Goad's Atlases, 1884-23
- Maitland, Leslie, Jacqueline Hucker and Shannon Ricketts, A Guide to Canadian Architectural Styles, 1992
- McCalla, Douglas, "Lewis Moffatt," Dictionary of Canadian Biography, http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/moffatt_lewis_12E.html
- McHugh, Patricia, Toronto Architecture: A City Guide, 2nd ed., 1989
- "New Companies," *Toronto Star*, February 22, 1908
- "This Looks Like Prosperity," The Globe, February 5, 1906

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE (REASONS FOR DESIGNATION)

46 SPADINA AVENUE – SYSTEMS BUILDING

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue (including the addresses at 40, 44, and 50 Spadina Avenue) is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation under all three categories of design, associative and contextual value.

Description

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue comprises a four-storey factory building that was constructed in 1907 and designed by the Toronto architectural firm of Horwood and Burke. Commissioned by Business Systems Limited, which manufactured business stationery and operated a business training school, the property served as the company's headquarters and factory for over half a century. In the late 20th century, the property was among the properties in the King-Spadina neighbourhood that became associated with the clothing manufacturing industry in Toronto's Fashion District.

Representing the Edwardian Classical style, the property features red brick cladding with brick and stone detailing. The principal (east) elevation is symmetrically organized into 11 bays, with frontispieces in the slightly projecting centre and outer bays. Two entrances, at the north and south ends of the principal elevation, are set in Gibbs surrounds with stone quoins. Fenestration on the principal elevation includes flatheaded openings in the base and upper stories, and round-arched openings in the first (ground) storey. Additional details include window detailing with voussoirs and keystones, brick banding and quoins, brick corbelling above the first (ground) storey, and a stone name plate reading "Systems Building" above the north entrance.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property at 46 Spadina Avenue has design value as a well-crafted example of an early 20th century factory in the King-Spadina neighbourhood, which was designed with features of Edwardian Classicism, the most popular style for all building types during this era. The Systems Building is particularly distinguished by its elaborate classical detailing that includes the frontispieces with quoins and the twin entrances on the principal (east) elevation.

The Systems Building is valued for its contributions to the development and evolution of the King-Spadina neighbourhood in the early 20th century. During this period, the area changed from an institutional enclave adjoined by residential subdivisions to Toronto's new manufacturing district after the Great Fire of 1904. The property at 46 Spadina Avenue is especially linked to the historical transition of King-Spadina, as Business Systems Limited established its company in one of the former high-end residences that marked the initial development along the street before replacing it with the large-scale warehouse, a building typology that was indicative of the industrial character of the community after 1900.

The historical value of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue is also through its connection with the architectural practice of Burke and Horwood. As the successor to the firm founded by his uncle, Henry Langley, Edmund Burke formed a partnership with John Horwood in 1894, and the pair received immediate recognition as the designers of the Robert Simpson Store as the first Chicago-style building in Toronto. Although Horwood and White designed many residential, institutional, and industrial buildings in the city, they accepted few documented commissions in King-Spadina, including the Systems Building and the neighbouring Samuel, Benjamin and Company Building on the southwest corner of King and Spadina, which is included on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

With respect to contextual value, the property at 46 Spadina Avenue supports the historical character of the King-Spadina neighbourhood, where it contributes to an important concentration of former factories and warehouses. These buildings reflect the area's shift from its origins as an institutional and residential district to Toronto's manufacturing centre after the Great Fire of 1904. The Systems Building is historically and visually linked to its setting on Spadina Avenue, south of King Street West, where other large-scale warehouses on Spadina, King, and Wellington streets are among the neighbouring properties that are included on the City's Heritage Register. In particular, it complements the building at the north end of the block, 425 King Street West, with which it shares a material palette and architectural vocabulary.

Heritage Attributes

Design and Physical Value

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue as a representative example of an Edwardian Classical-style industrial headquarters and warehouse:

- The scale, form, and massing of the property as a four-storey warehouse above a raised base with window openings
- The flat roofline, which is extended at the south end by a penthouse and has brick chimneys on the west end and southwest corner
- The material palette of brick cladding with brick and stone detailing, including brick banding and quoins, brick corbelling above the first (ground) storey, masonry at the basement level, and stone quoins in Gibbs surrounds
- The symmetrical organization of the principal (east) elevation into 11 bays, with the frontispieces in the slightly projecting centre and outer bays
- The two entrances at the north and south ends of the principal (east) elevation, which are set in Gibbs surrounds with stone quoins
- The fenestration on the principal (east) elevation, with the flat-headed openings in the base and upper stories, and the round-arched openings in the first (ground) storey, including the oversized opening in the third bay from the north end and the diminutive round-arched opening in the north frontispiece
- On the principal (east) elevation, the window detailing with the voussoirs and keystones, and the quoins on the diminutive openings in the centre and north frontispieces

- The north (side) elevation, which continues the decorative brick quoins, banding and quoins from the principal (east) elevation, and has segmental-arched and flatheaded window openings with brick and stone trim
- The south (side) elevation, with the flat-headed openings
- On the rear (west) wall, the brick quoins and the segmental-arched and flat-headed openings with the brick and stone trim
- The name plate reading "Systems Building" above the north entrance

Historic and Associative Value

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue as associated with the evolution of the King-Spadina neighbourhood, and an example of the work of Burke and Horwood:

- The placement, setback, and orientation of the building on the west side of Spadina Avenue between Wellington Street West and King Street West
- The name plate reading "Systems Building" above the north entrance

Contextual Value

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at 46 Spadina Avenue as supporting the historical character of the King-Spadina neighbourhood:

- The placement, setback, and orientation of the building on the west side of Spadina Avenue between Wellington Street West and King Street West
- The scale, form, and massing of the property as a four-storey warehouse above a raised base with window openings
- The materials, with the brick cladding and the brick and stone detailing, including the brick banding and quoins, and the brick corbelling above the first (ground) storey